MR. RICARDO DE PAOLI-ISEPPI (Orcid ID : 0000-0001-7724-9144)

DR. BRUCE E DEAGLE (Orcid ID : 0000-0001-7651-3687)

DR. SIMON N JARMAN (Orcid ID : 0000-0002-0792-9686)

Article type : Resource Article

Age estimation in a long-lived seabird (*Ardenna tenuirostris*) using DNA methylation-based biomarkers

R. De Paoli-Iseppi^{1,2*}, B. E. Deagle², A. M. Polanowski², C. R. McMahon^{1,3}, J. L. Dickinson⁴, M. A. Hindell^{1,5} and S. N. Jarman^{6,7}

¹ Institute for Marine and Antarctic Studies, University of Tasmania, Hobart, Tasmania, Australia.

² Australian Antarctic Division, Hobart, Tasmania, Australia.

³ Sydney Institute of Marine Science, Sydney, New South Wales, Australia.

⁴ Cancer, Genetics and Immunology Group, Menzies Institute for Medical Research Tasmania, Hobart, Tasmania, Australia.

⁵ Antarctic Climate and Ecosystems CRC, Hobart, Tasmania, Australia

⁶ Trace and Environmental DNA Laboratory, Department of Environment and Agriculture, Curtin University, Perth, WA, Australia.

⁷ CSIRO Indian Ocean Marine Research Centre, The University of Western Australia, Perth, WA, Australia.

* Corresponding author

E-mail: ricardo.depaoliiseppi@utas.edu.au

This is the author manuscript accepted for publication and has undergone full peer review but has not been through the copyediting, typesetting, pagination and proofreading process, which may lead to differences between this version and the Version of Record. Please cite this article as [doi: 10.1111/1755-0998.12981](https://doi.org/10.1111/1755-0998.12981)

This article is protected by copyright. All rights reserved

Short title: DNA methylation age estimation in shearwater

Key words: age; birds; DNA methylation; epigenetics; DREAM;

Abstract

Age structure is a fundamental aspect of animal population biology. Age is strongly related to individual physiological condition, reproductive potential and mortality rate. Currently, there are no robust molecular methods for age estimation in birds. Instead, individuals must be ringed as chicks to establish known-age populations, which is a labour intensive and expensive process. The estimation of chronological age using DNA methylation is emerging as a robust approach in mammals including humans, mice and some non-model species. Here we quantified DNA methylation in whole blood samples from a total of 71 known-age Short-tailed shearwaters (*Ardenna tenuirostris*) using digital restriction enzyme analysis of methylation (DREAM). The DREAM method measures DNA methylation levels at thousands of CpG dinucleotides throughout the genome. We identified seven CpG sites with DNA methylation levels that correlated with age. A model based on these relationships estimated age with a mean difference of 2.8 years to known age, based on validation estimates from models created by repeated sampling of training and validation data subsets. Longitudinal observation of individuals re-sampled over 1 or 2 years generally showed an increase in estimated age (6/7 cases). For the first time, we have shown that epigenetic changes with age can be detected in a wild bird. This approach should be of broad interest to researchers studying age biomarkers in non-model species and will allow identification of markers that can be assessed using targeted techniques for accurate age estimation in large population studies.

1 | INTRODUCTION

Understanding the age structure of populations is a key aspect of animal ecology and conservation. Age estimate information can help to determine animal mortality, susceptibility to parasites, reproductive life history and the impact of anthropogenic activities (Froy *et al.* 2013; Gianuca *et al.* 2017; Musick 1999; Scott 1988). However,

measuring the chronological age of many wild animals is a difficult task due to the lack of external changes that reflect age. Some animals have quantifiable physical changes as they increase in age, for example, tooth length in deer (Pérez - Barbería *et al.* 2014) and growth rings in fish otoliths (Buckmeier *et al.* 2002; Campana 2001; Gunn *et al.* 2008). However, few of these can be measured without capturing or even killing the animal. The impact and ethics of these interventions on animals is often the subject of debate (Festa-Bianchet *et al.* 2002; Nelson 2002). Other animals can show general changes with life stage, for example, plumage variation in some seabirds (Weimerskirch *et al.* 1989); or larval stage of arthropods and molluscs (Cobb & Wahle 1994; Ernande *et al.* 2003), but these often only provide age information for immature individuals. This lack of accessible chronological age information limits our understanding of many wild animal species and it is only through long term, expensive tracking or marking studies that age data can be collected and used effectively.

Molecular biomarkers of age have recently been the focus of an increasing number of studies (Ito *et al.* 2018; Maegawa *et al.* 2017; Wright *et al.* 2018). Neither telomere length or DNA damage markers have been successfully used for chronological age estimation in a wild animal population, so there is interest in developing alternative molecular age biomarkers (Dunshea *et al.* 2011; Jarman *et al.* 2015). One promising avenue is measuring epigenetic modification controlling changes in gene expression that occur during animal ageing. Epigenetic regulation of gene expression can occur at several different levels and can include histone modification, non-coding RNA (ncRNA) and DNA methylation (DNAm). DNAm, the addition of a methyl group to a cytosine followed by a guanine (CpG site), has been examined in the most detail and recent evidence supports the use of this epigenetic modification for individual age determination (Hannum *et al.* 2013; Horvath 2013; Vidal-Bralo *et al.* 2016).

Here, we refer to two types of changes in DNAm with age that could be used to estimate age in wild animals. 'Epigenetic drift' generally refers to broad DNAm signals at sites distributed across the genome, which in mammals, birds and fish has been reported to decline with age (Gryzinska *et al.* 2013; Jakubczak *et al.* 2016; Shimoda *et al.* 2014). Drift signals can also be enriched in CpG islands and enhancers

(Slieker *et al.* 2016). ‘Clock-type’ markers are specific CpG sites that show a strong correlation with known chronological age. Correlations observed in this category can be tissue specific and can involve an increase (hypermethylation), or decrease (hypomethylation) with age (Horvath 2013; Slieker *et al.* 2018). Clock-type CpG age markers have recently been referred to as “age-related DNA methylation positions” (aDMPs) (Lowe *et al.* 2018; Slieker *et al.* 2018). aDMPs are generally located within the promoter or first exon of a gene (Bekaert *et al.* 2015; Grönniger *et al.* 2010; Horvath 2013; Sziráki *et al.* 2018; Zbieć-Piekarska *et al.* 2015). Epigenetic drift is thought to occur due to a decline or imperfect replication of DNAm by an epigenetic maintenance system with increasing age (Horvath 2013; Horvath & Raj 2018). However, the mechanisms for specific ‘clock-type’ aDMP change have not yet been characterised.

Very little is known about DNAm in most non-model species, especially birds. Available studies have mostly focused on model species such as the Red junglefowl (*Gallus gallus*) (Gryzinska *et al.* 2013; Hu *et al.* 2013; Li *et al.* 2011) and Japanese quail (*Coturnix japonica*) (Andraszek *et al.* 2014). These studies show a distribution of DNAm in the genome similar to that observed in mammals. Epigenetic drift is the only age-related DNAm change that has been reported in birds. Gryzinska *et al.* (2013) observed DNAm changes between chickens aged between 1 day and 32 weeks using a colorimetric immunoenzymatic based protocol. We have previously reported that the DNAm status of several mammalian clock-type age-related genes were not conserved in homologous regions of a seabird (De Paoli-Iseppi *et al.* 2017).

Here, we used known age individuals from a long-term study of Short-tailed shearwater (*Ardenna tenuirostris*) to investigate age related changes. The shearwater has high breeding site and partner fidelity and is long-lived, making it an ideal species in which to study population status and chronological ageing in a seabird population. Fisher Island (Tasmania, Australia), is the site of a long-term banding study of this species and as such can be used to collect known age blood and feather samples for the investigation of DNAm and chronological age (Bradley *et al.* 1991). Epigenetic age estimates of seabirds would be particularly valuable for use in population viability analyses and could further our understanding of environmental effects on animal performance or foraging (Velarde & Ezcurra 2018). For the first time, we have used

digital restriction enzyme analysis of methylation (DREAM) to assess DNAm in a non-model vertebrate. We identified seven aDMPs in DNA extracted from 71 whole blood samples. A model relating methylation at these aDMPs to age was made and the precision evaluated using the mean absolute difference (MAD) between the estimated and known chronological ages. Our study is the first to identify DNAm changes with chronological age in a wild seabird and will provide a foundation for further study of age-related DNAm in non-mammalian vertebrates.

2 | METHODS

2.1 | Samples and DNA extraction

In sampling trips between 2015 – 2018, blood samples were collected from adult (November – December) and chick (March) *A. tenuirostris* from Fisher Island (40°13'00.7"S 148°14'20.7"E) Tasmania, under Department of Primary Industries, Parks, Water and Environment (DPIPWE) permit: FA15230 and University of Tasmania (UTAS) Animal Ethics Committee permits: A14277 and A0016107. Blood was collected onto Whatman FTA® Micro (WB120210) cards and stored as previously described (De Paoli-Iseppi *et al.* 2017). DNA was extracted from a 3 mm punch of immobilised blood using an Epicentre MasterPure™ (MCD85201) DNA Purification Kit according to the manufacturer's instructions. We examined blood DNA in two high-throughput sequencing runs of a total of $N = 71$ known-age individuals. Age was determined by recording the band number of birds first marked as chicks, and was rounded to whole years as all sampling occurred in a short time window each year. Run 1 consisted of 35 known-age animals (5 – 21 years old, mean = 12.14 years). Two individuals aged 8 and 14 years old were replicated within this run. Run 2 consisted of DNA from 36 additional known-age samples (6 – 21 years old, mean = 14.18 years). Run 2 contained three technical replicates from Run 1 (6, 12 and 21 years old) and three within-run replicates aged 8, 14 and 21 years old. Several birds were recaptured in sampling trips in different years allowing us to perform some limited longitudinal observations (Run 2: $N = 3 \times 2$ samples and $N = 4 \times 2$ samples at 1 and 2 year resights respectively). In total, $N = 63$ known-age

shearwater were used to calibrate the model following removal of replicates. Bird sex was determined by *CHD-1* gene amplification in blood DNA using a previously described method (Faux *et al.* 2014). Sample details for each age group and known age distribution are shown in Table 1 and Supplementary Figure 1 respectively.

2.2 | Analysis of genome-wide ‘CCCGGG’ methylation

We examined DNAm at CpG sites throughout the genome using digital restriction enzyme analysis of methylation (DREAM) of 71 Short-tailed shearwater whole blood DNA samples (Jelinek & Madzo 2016). Briefly, genomic DNA (1 µg) extracted from shearwater blood FTA samples was sequentially cut with two enzymes that recognise the ‘CCCGGG’ sequence motif in DNA (Figure 1). Methyl-sensitive *SmaI* first cuts only unmethylated sites leaving blunt 5’-GGG ends. Then, *XmaI* cleaves the remaining methylated sites leaving 5’-CCGGG ends. Thus, unique sequences are made for methylated or unmethylated CpG sites. Following this sequential digest, DNA was used to create sequencing libraries using NEBNext Multiplex Oligos for Illumina Index Primer Sets 1 – 3 and standard Illumina protocols. Blunt-end ligation is done using NEBNext adaptor (10 µm) and T4 DNA ligase with hairpin loop cleavage with USER enzyme. Dual size selection for 250 – 450 bp fragments was done using AMPure XP beads. Unique barcodes were then added to DNA from individual samples with 12x rounds of PCR using AmpliTaq Gold DNA Polymerase (see Supplementary Table 1). Individual barcoded samples were analysed for correct library size distribution (250 – 450 bp) using high sensitivity DNA 1000 kits on the Bioanalyzer 2100. Two microliters of each sample was also quantified using a Qubit 2.0 to ensure equal volumes were pooled in the final library. Libraries were run at 2 – 4 ng/uL on the Illumina NextSeq 500 platform with a 15 – 25% PhiX control at the Ramaciotti Centre for Genomics (UNSW, Sydney, AUS).

2.3 | Statistical analysis and construction of an age prediction model

Sequencing data analysis pipeline

Raw DNA sequence reads were run through an in-house data analysis pipeline in the following steps.

1. *Quality filtering.* Demultiplexed Fastq sequences were filtered with a maximum expected error (maxee) rate of 0.5 and converted to Fasta format (Edgar & Flyvbjerg 2015).
2. *Dereplication.* A database of unique reads from all samples was generated (dereplication) using trimmed sequences and the USEARCH10 command 'fastx_uniques' (Edgar 2010), with a min_unique size = 150.
3. *Methylated and non-methylated motif databases.* These dereplicated sequences were duplicated to contain the unique sequence with either the 5'-GGG or 5'-CCGGG motif, in separate databases (GG or CC databases).
4. *Motif database hits.* Each sample was then compared to each database using the 'usearch-global' command with 97% identity and required an exact match to the first 2 bp of the relevant motif (id_prefix = 2). Hits for each sequence against both methylation databases were recorded.
5. *DNAm level calculation.* The methylation level for each sample was then calculated as the count of the methylated signature divided by the total number of hits for a specific CpG marker and the value was recorded between 0 and 1. A value of 0 is unmethylated (i.e. all sequences from that site match the GG sequence generated by methyl-sensitive *SmaI*) and 1 is methylated (i.e. all sequences from that site match the CC sequence generated by *XmaI*).

Methylation scores were retained for read depths between 20 and 2000 reads. Scores that were calculated outside of this range were converted to a 'NA'. To retain potentially informative markers in the final analysis, markers with less than seven NA values across all samples were imputed using the mean of the remaining non-NA values for the marker. This method ensured that potential age-related markers would not be omitted based on missing scores and that imputed values would have a relatively small effect on any correlations observed. Since variation is required to find correlations with age, we removed markers that had a DNAm standard deviation of less than 5% across all samples. A small run effect was observed, so the mean DNAm difference between run 1 and 2 replicates was used to adjust the score of each marker in run 2.

Predictor selection and age estimation model

Markers that passed filtering were then used to fit penalised lasso regularisation paths to each predictor using the R package ‘glmnet’ (Friedman *et al.* 2010). The penalty value used to select coefficients, lambda 1 standard error ($\lambda 1se$), was calculated after repeated runs (100x) of the default k-fold cross validation function of glmnet (cv.glmnet, 10-fold) with an alpha = 1 (lasso). This method randomly subsets the data each cycle and assesses the linear relationship between age and DNAm. Following repeated runs of this function a mean $\lambda 1se$ value was generated. The $\lambda 1se$ value generally selects CpG sites for the simplest model with an error similar to the best model (λ minimum), given the cross-validation uncertainty.

Individual markers that passed the $\lambda 1se$ cut-off were inspected visually using simple linear regression and markers that had an $R^2 < 0.2$ or showed small changes in DNAm range ($< 15\%$) were removed from further analysis. Remaining age-related CpG sites were then incorporated into a multiple linear regression model. To test the selected markers, the original data set was randomly split into 75/25% training ($N = 47$) and test ($N = 16$) data sets respectively. Training set DNAm values for each aDMP were used to create a multiple linear regression model. The model was then tested with remaining samples in the test set. This random sub-sampling method was run for 100 iterations. By substituting the calculated methylation values for each of the individual shearwaters used in the training and test sets into the equation, we obtained the predicted epigenetic age. Mean absolute difference (MAD), the uncertainty of age estimates expressed in years, between the known and estimated age was then calculated. The 77 bp sequence following the CG motif was analysed by BLASTn searches of bird genomes available on the NCBI database to identify any regions conserved between species (Altschul *et al.* 1990).

2.4 | Global DNA methylation analyses

Global analysis of 2338 CpG sites using DREAM

The mean DNAm of 2338 CpG sites identified using DREAM were analysed by age group in years as follows: Chicks: 0.12 – 0.15 ($N = 2$), Young breeder: 5 – 9 ($N = 16$), Middle: 10 – 18 ($N = 39$), Old: 19+ ($N = 6$). CpGs were analysed using a one-way ANOVA followed by post-test for multiple comparisons (Tukey’s HSD). Mean DNAm differences were calculated in both the chick and young breeder context and analysed as above. Significance was set at $P < 0.05$.

Colorimetric DNA methylation analysis

We also measured epigenetic drift in global DNAm using a commercially available methylated DNA quantification assay for relative 5-mC content (Abcam, Colorimetric, ab117128). Briefly, 42 shearwater blood DNA samples (chicks, 5 – 21 years old, mean = 10.9 years) were analysed in duplicate, alongside the supplied positive (5 ng) and negative controls. Methylated DNA was captured and detected using diluted (1:1000, 1:2000) 5-mC antibodies. Following the addition of a developing solution, colour change was monitored and quantified at 450 nm (Tecan Spark). Using the mean absorbance values of the duplicates, relative 5-mC for each sample was calculated as follows: $\frac{((\text{Sample OD} - \text{Negative control OD}) / \text{DNA input (ng)})}{((\text{Positive control OD} - \text{Negative control OD}) \times 2) / \text{Positive control input (5 ng)}} \times 100$. Analysis of duplicate colorimetric data was done using a one-way ANOVA with Šidák correction for multiple comparisons for each age group in years as above.

3 | RESULTS

3.1 | Sequencing metrics

Quality analysis of DREAM libraries showed bands in the expected post clean-up range, (range = 194 – 974 bp, mean = 451 bp; Bioanalyzer gel and electropherogram traces are shown in Supplementary Figure 2A – D). A total of 125 million sequences (mean of 1761622 per sample) passed initial bioinformatic QC (maxee = 0.5 and matched restriction site motif; Supplementary Table 2). The sum of reads from sequences with a mean high read depth (> 2000x) represented approximately 6% (mean = 84518 reads) of the total mean sequences per sample. Following filtering and dereplication, we identified 93884 unique sequences that were used to create a database of reference sequences (i.e. markers for specific CpG sites) for sample matching (Supplementary Figure 3). Following the pipeline filtering described, a total of 2338 unique CpGs were used for lasso analysis (glmnet).

3.2 | Development and testing of an age prediction model in the Short-tailed shearwater

DNAm data from seven CpG sites obtained using DREAM were included in the age prediction model based on our selection criteria (Figure 2A – G). Information on removed CpG sites with weaker age correlations is provided in Supplementary Table 3 (e.g. just below our mean λ 1se cut-off of 1.2; see Supplementary Figure 4). To investigate potential sex-related DNAm effects in the seven aDMPs used in the age prediction model, separate linear regressions were done for each sex (Supplementary Figure 5A-G). Sex had a significant effect on DNAm age correlation in a single aDMP in isolation (M1801, $P = 0.0031$, Bonferroni corrected), with males driving the association (Supplementary Figure 5C). However, there was no sex-specific effect when the methylation scores for all seven aDMPs were then used to create the age estimation model (Figure 3, sex regression slopes and diagnostics are shown in Supplementary Figures 5H and 6 respectively). Read depth had a mean of 51x for these CpG sites (Supplementary Figure 7). The MAD between the known and estimated age reports the uncertainty in age estimates expressed in years. Following repeated cross-validation, the seven aDMP age assay provided epigenetic age estimates in training subsamples with a MAD of 2.34 ± 1.73 (SD) years (mean $R^2 = .605$, range: 0.46 – 0.72) (Supplementary Figure 8A). In the validation test subsamples, the age estimates had an increased error; across all age estimates MAD = 2.81 ± 2.08 years (mean $R^2 = .404$, range: 0.03 – 0.80) (Supplementary Figure 8B). The significant y-intercept of 5.13 indicated that the predicted ages were overestimated for chicks and young birds and underestimated for older individuals, and may indicate a non-linear relationship. The training set MAD ranged from 1.17 – 6.25 years, whilst in the test set MAD ranged from 1.58 – 7.86 years. The MADs for each year and grouped age, as described in the methods, are shown in Figure 4. Between run replicates for seven age-related CpG sites showed a mean DNAm score difference of 11.29% (range: 3.79 – 12.80%) and 6.83% (range: 4.21 – 11.04%) pre- and post-run adjustment respectively (Supplementary Table 4). Within run replicates showed a mean absolute difference in DNAm of 8.65% (range: 5.18 – 11.91%) for the age-related markers.

3.3 | Biomarker sequence and gene conservation

The seven aDMPs we identified were used to search for conserved regions in available bird genomes and scaffolds using BLASTn. Of these seven markers, four had low E values and > 50% query cover indicating a reasonable match with a known sequence in the available avian databases (Table 2). Marker 1071 matched with the *G3BP1* region in the Zebra finch (*Taeniopygia guttata*) genome, however the query cover was only slightly above 50%. Marker 1934 had a 100% query cover match with an uncharacterised locus in the Mallard (*Anas platyrhynchos*) genome. Marker 2083 matched against scaffold 4695 in the North Island brown kiwi (*Apteryx australis mantelli*) genome. Finally, marker 3169 had a 100% query cover match to the *DHH* gene in several species with the top hit to the Eurasian blue tit (*Cyanistes caeruleus*) genome.

3.4 | Longitudinal observations of DNA methylation in resighted individuals

We observed that 6/7 (85%) age estimates for resighted individuals sampled 1 or 2 years apart showed the expected positive increase in predicted age relative to their known age from leg bands (Figure 5). At many individual aDMPs the longitudinal samples did not follow the expected DNAm trend (Supplementary Figure 9A-B). However, when combined into the model, only one individual showed a negative change in estimated age from two samples taken at 15 and 17 years of age. The mean absolute difference between estimated and known age for 2-year resights was 0.74 years ($N = 8$) and 0.87 years ($N = 6$) for 1-year resights.

3.5 | DNA methylation of 2338 CpGs using DREAM assay

We show that a large proportion of the 2338 CpG sites that passed the filtering cut off are highly methylated, with 50.2% of CpGs showing DNAm levels greater than 80% across all ages (Figure 6A). We also observed a small, but non-significant linear change in DNAm from young animals to old. The mean DNAm was .712, .724, .725 and .729, for chicks, young breeders, middle and old birds respectively (Figure 6B). The difference in mean DNAm, relative to chick levels, for each individual CpG site is shown in Figure 6C. This shows that relative to older birds, chicks are less methylated at low DNAm levels (approximately < 10%) and more methylated at high DNAm levels (approximately > 90%).

3.6 | Global 5-mC using colorimetric assay

Relative 5-mC was quantified against the supplied 5 ng positive control. Global blood DNAm levels of the Short-tailed shearwater were combined into age groups as described in the methods. Chicks and young breeders showed similar relative 5-mC levels, (mean = 0.725, $N = 4$ and mean = 0.727, $N = 15$ respectively). Both of these groups had slightly higher relative 5-mC than that observed in middle-aged birds (mean = 0.614, $N = 17$) and old birds (mean = 0.498, $N = 5$). Following adjustment for multiple comparisons, no significant differences were observed between the age groups (Figure 7).

4 | DISCUSSION

Seabirds exhibit little or no external physical changes with age and there are currently no reliable biomarkers of chronological age in most long-lived seabirds beyond fledging. The identification of an accurate age biomarker would be a substantial advance in our ability to understand seabird age-related demographics. Seabird age estimation using molecular methods is currently not possible. DNAm changes with age have been reported for both wild and model mammalian species in several tissues, indicating that DNAm age biomarkers may be useful in birds. In this study, we quantified the DNAm profile of known-age Short-tailed shearwaters using digital restriction enzyme analysis of methylation (DREAM). We present evidence for DNAm changes with chronological age in seven CpG sites.

4.1 | Age related biomarkers in birds

Previous bird ageing research has focused primarily on telomere length assays and pentosidine accumulation in collagen. Studies of terminal telomere restriction fragments (TRFs) have shown that telomere length can shorten with increasing age and that the rate of change corresponds to lifespan in several species (Bize *et al.* 2009; Juola *et al.* 2006; Tricola *et al.* 2018). However, this trend is not consistent amongst all birds, with some species showing increases in TRF with age, as in the Leach's storm-petrel (*Oceanodroma leucorhoa*) (Hausmann *et al.* 2003), and no decline in length, or both as reported for the Magellanic penguin (*Spheniscus magellanicus*)

(Cerchiara *et al.* 2017). For individuals in some avian species, change in telomere length can be tracked longitudinally and correlate with reproductive timing, however the use of TRF for cross-sectional analysis of age has yet to be demonstrated (Bauer *et al.* 2018).

Pentosidine is a less frequently studied age biomarker for birds. It forms cross-links between amino acid residues in collagen and accumulates with age in birds (Fallon *et al.* 2006; Iqbal *et al.* 1999). Pentosidine has been shown to accumulate in a linear fashion in terrestrial birds and some seabirds including California gulls (*Larus californicus*) (Chaney Jr *et al.* 2003) and Double-crested cormorants (*Phalacrocorax auritus*) (Fallon *et al.* 2006). This technique has yielded age estimates with a precision of 2 – 4 years in wild birds (Chaney Jr *et al.* 2003; Fallon *et al.* 2006; Rattiste *et al.* 2015). However, in a study of another long-lived seabird, the Bridled tern (*Onychoprion anaethetus*), no correlation between pentosidine levels and age was found (Labbé 2017). It is not known how pentosidine levels may respond to the effects of changing biological age or environmental stressors. As a result of the limited success in age estimation by these methods, our research aimed to build upon recent successes in mammals by assessing DNAm estimates of age in the Short-tailed shearwater.

We previously established that specific aDMPs from mammals were not conserved in the shearwater (De Paoli-Iseppi *et al.* 2017). We therefore sought to identify bird-specific aDMPs or a global DNAm signature associated with age using DREAM of whole blood samples. This is the first epigenetic age assay developed for use in a seabird, and one of the few used in a wild species. Using the DREAM method, we identified seven novel aDMPs in shearwaters. Following repeated cross-validation of our known-age samples to train and test the age-estimation model, we reported a test-set MAD for all ages of 2.81 ± 2.08 years. The linear relationship with age in these CpG sites is not as strong as those reported for whales (Polanowski *et al.* 2014) or dogs (Thompson *et al.* 2017), but was similar to that reported for a bat species (Wright *et al.* 2018). We also observed variation in MAD for different age classes, with birds aged 5 – 9 years and 19+ providing less accurate age estimates compared to other groups (Figure 4A). Additionally, the significant Y-intercept in our model (Figure 3) causes an overestimation of age in younger individuals. A single marker

(M1801) showed evidence for male driven DNAm age correlation. Due to the reduced sample size when comparing by sex only, more known-age samples would be required to confirm the lack of association in females and ideally, whole genome information could determine if this marker is located on a sex chromosome.

However, the biggest limitation in developing our model was the low number of young non-breeding bird samples that we could capture in the field, which hinders our understanding of the rate of DNAm change between chicks and early breeders (5 – 9 years), and with more samples, this may be correctable in future. The shearwaters studied here typically do not return to their island of birth until their first year of breeding at age five (Bradley *et al.* 1991; Bradley *et al.* 1989). However, for unknown reasons we did not recover many individuals in the 5 – 9 early breeder age range. The larger DNAm variability in these young animals could be due to the stressful effects of the first year of breeding. Shearwaters lay one of the largest eggs relative to body mass of all seabirds, and individuals face challenges including incubatory fasting and intermittent foraging (Wooller *et al.* 1990). Additionally, both migration and parenthood can reduce body condition, and evidence suggests that these birds may undergo intermittent breeding if an individual determines its body condition is too low (Bradley *et al.* 2000).

Despite some uncertainty in ages estimated with our model, this approach could discriminate between relevant age classes (e.g. young and old adults). These epigenetic age estimates, in combination with other parameters including sex and weight, could be used to examine the effect of climate change on population viability (Lee 2017). Recent studies also highlight other areas in which estimated age data could be informative, including post-pest eradication monitoring of island-breeding seabird populations (Brooke *et al.* 2018), parasite load in the Blue tit (Aguilar *et al.* 2016) and modelling the impacts of longline fisheries on effective population size (Cortés *et al.* 2018; Mills & Ryan 2005).

Obtaining a broad age range of samples from long-lived, known-age birds is difficult as extensive banding studies are rare. Whilst the Fisher Island shearwater population has been followed for several decades, the youngest and oldest adult individuals we recovered were 5 and 21 years old respectively. The oldest individual, at 21 years old,

represents a little over half of the maximum reported lifespan for this species of 39 years. However, research on age dependent survival on Fisher Island birds shows few animals living beyond 25 years post first breeding, which would place our oldest individual at closer to 70% of the expected lifespan of approximately 30 years (Baylis *et al.* 2018; Bradley *et al.* 1989). The relationship we have observed with age should be investigated further for older individuals, however previous studies in mammals have primarily shown linear correlations with age (Maegawa *et al.* 2010; Polanowski *et al.* 2014; Spiers *et al.* 2016). Although no recaptures were made within the 1 – 4 year age range, as these non-breeding birds are not at the nesting sites, the relationship of adults to the DNAm level of the chicks suggest birds at these ages will have a similar trend to the rest of the calibration range.

We quantified ‘epigenetic drift’ in DNAm levels observed across all 2338 CpG sites included in our analysis. We did not identify a significant trend with chronological age. However, we did observe some interesting differences between young and old age groups at the lower and upper limits of DNAm. In contrast to mammalian and the only other bird study, we found no clear trend of DNA hypomethylation in older animals compared to that in younger individuals (Gaudet *et al.* 2003; Gryzinska *et al.* 2016; Portela & Esteller 2010). The lack of statistical significance could be due to the analysis of this relatively small subset of total CpGs in the bird genome.

Immunoenzymatic analyses of chicken 5-mC levels have shown decreased global methylation with age (Gryzinska *et al.* 2013). Using the same method, we found no relationship between relative 5-mC levels and age in 42 known-age shearwater whole bloods. However, we observed a non-significant trend towards decreasing methylation across age groups. Our study of age-related global DNAm in shearwaters is only the second of this phenomenon in birds and further work will be required to determine if this approach could be suitable for age estimation in other bird species.

4.2 | Measuring methylation in non-model organisms

Despite the identification of several thousand unique CpG sites using the DREAM method, the 20x read depth requirement for DNAm calculation resulted in the exclusion of many sites from further analysis. A small percentage of the total reads was also lost to repetitive elements. There is little doubt that as technologies improve

sequencing depths will increase, and direct analysis of CpG DNAm will be possible, (Rand *et al.* 2017; Slatko *et al.* 2018). Improvements in bioinformatics will also help to validate DNAm markers and predict age in large data sets (Vidaki *et al.* 2017). The DREAM technique has been used previously to identify DNAm changes following compound exposure in zebrafish embryos (Bouwmeester *et al.* 2016) and caloric restriction in mice (Maegawa *et al.* 2017). A similar method, EpiRADSeq, also uses a methylation sensitive restriction enzyme (*HpaII*) and NGS to quantify DNAm in CpG sites (Schield *et al.* 2016). This technique differs from DREAM in that only a single methylation sensitive enzyme is used in combination with a frequent cutter (*PstI*). *HpaII* recognises a 'CCGG' motif, which is likely to lead to higher genomic coverage of CpG sites due to increased cut frequency. However, DNAm scores generated using this method are relative to the count of unmethylated EpiRADSeq reads only. This is avoided when using a dual methylation sensitive digest as in DREAM, as reads are generated for both methylated and unmethylated CpGs (Jelinek & Madzo 2016). Reduced representation bisulphite sequencing (RRBS) can also be used to quantify CpG DNAm, but does require a higher quantity of initial genomic DNA (Meissner *et al.* 2005). The output of these various techniques depends upon several molecular, platform and bioinformatic factors and choices, which is discussed in detail elsewhere (O'Leary *et al.* 2018). Our results now show that the DREAM method can also be used to quantify global DNAm and screen for aDMPs in non-model animals. The primary limitation in applying this method is the high read depth required per CpG site, particularly in organisms with relatively high quantities of repetitive DNA. This makes it cost-prohibitive as a method for applying to population-wide samples, but certainly effective as a screening method for identifying aDMPs. Once aDMPs are identified by DREAM, targeted DNAm scoring assays could be developed to reduce costs for high-throughput applications.

An additional limitation to the simple analysis of shearwater DREAM and indeed most non-model NGS data, is the limited genomic resources available for further analyses. Multiplex restriction site PCR (mRS-PCR) could be used to obtain both up and downstream sequence around an aDMP of interest (Sarkar *et al.* 1993; Weber *et al.* 1998). This method can generate larger reference sequences for use in targeted bisulphite assays such as EpiTYPER, pyrosequencing or other NGS based techniques (Ehrich *et al.* 2005). More sequence information may also result in more accurate

comparative genomic analyses against bird genomes that are currently undergoing scaffold alignment. The genes *DHH* and *G3BP1* were identified as conserved age-related sequences from our data and these could be used in future as part of a targeted gene assay in shearwater (Table 2, M1071 and M3169). Whilst we cannot comment on any potential functional effects of DNAm, *DHH* and *G3BP1* encode for signalling molecules in cell morphogenesis and a DNA-unwinding enzyme, respectively. Two other markers also showed high conservation with other bird species, however these hits were either unassigned (M2083) or uncharacterised (M1934). These factors limit our ability to identify biomarkers that have the potential to be used in closely related species, and design a cost-effective, targeted age assay.

5 | CONCLUSIONS

This study demonstrates that seabird age estimates can be generated from a DNA methylation age assay. This minimally invasive method could be used to produce age estimates for Short-tailed shearwaters from chicks to 21 years old. This is the first time an epigenetic assay has been applied to a wild seabird and could be used in future to estimate population age structure. Further refinement of this method could result in the identification, validation and use of target genes, similar to that in mammals, for related seabird species and see wider use for monitoring and conservation.

Data and code availability

DREAM count data, adjusted DNAm values for 2338 CpGs, fasta pipeline and variable selection R scripts used in this publication have been deposited in the Dryad Digital Repository at [doi: 10.5061/dryad.n4h3672]. Sample details and raw Illumina sequence data (FASTQ) are available from NCBI/SRA using accession: PRJNA507458, <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/bioproject/PRJNA507458>.

Acknowledgements

The authors would like to acknowledge the financial support through the Australian Government Research Training Program, the Holsworth Wildlife Research Endowment – ANZ Trustees Foundation and the Joyce W. Vickery Scientific Research Fund – The Linnean Society of New South Wales. We also thank James Marthick, Cassandra Price, Fernando Gonzalez, WILDCARE Friends of Fisher Island, Ross Monash, DPIPWE field volunteers (2015 – 2018) and Tasmania Parks and Wildlife Service Rangers.

Author contributions

All authors conceived the ideas and designed methodology; RDP, AMP, CRM and MAH collected samples; RDP and AMP did the genetics laboratory work; RDP, BED and SNJ analysed the data; RDP led manuscript writing. All authors contributed to drafts and gave final approval for publication.

References

- Aguilar JRd, Westerdahl H, Puente JMdl, *et al.* (2016) MHC - I provides both quantitative resistance and susceptibility to blood parasites in blue tits in the wild. *Journal of Avian Biology* **47**, 669-677.
- Altschul SF, Gish W, Miller W, Myers EW, Lipman DJ (1990) Basic local alignment search tool. *Journal of Molecular Biology* **215**, 403-410.
- Andraszek K, Gryzińska M, Wójcik E, Knaga S, Smalec E (2014) Age-dependent change in the morphology of nucleoli and methylation of genes of the nucleolar organizer region in Japanese quail (*Coturnix japonica*) model (Temminck and Schlegel, 1849)(Galliformes: Aves). *Folia Biologica* **62**, 293-300.
- Bauer CM, Graham JL, Abolins-Abols M, *et al.* (2018) Chronological and Biological Age Predict Seasonal Reproductive Timing: An Investigation of Clutch Initiation and Telomeres in Birds of Known Age. *The American Naturalist* **191**, 777-782.
- Baylis SM, Sunnucks P, Clarke R (2018) A model for first - estimates of species - specific, age - specific mortality from centralized band - recovery databases. *Ecosphere* **9**, e02136.

597 Bekaert B, Kamalandua A, Zapico SC, Van de Voorde W, Decorte R (2015)
 598 Improved age determination of blood and teeth samples using a selected
 599 set of DNA methylation markers. *Epigenetics* **10**, 922-930.
 600 Bize P, Criscuolo F, Metcalfe NB, Nasir L, Monaghan P (2009) Telomere dynamics
 601 rather than age predict life expectancy in the wild. *Proceedings of the*
 602 *Royal Society of London B: Biological Sciences* **276**, 1679-1683.
 603 Bouwmeester MC, Ruiter S, Lommelaars T, *et al.* (2016) Zebrafish embryos as a
 604 screen for DNA methylation modifications after compound exposure.
 605 *Toxicology and Applied Pharmacology* **291**, 84-96.
 606 Bradley J, Skira I, Wooller R (1991) A long - term study of Short - tailed
 607 Shearwaters (*Puffinus tenuirostris*) on Fisher Island, Australia. *Ibis* **133**,
 608 55-61.
 609 Bradley J, Wooller R, Skira I (2000) Intermittent breeding in the short - tailed
 610 shearwater *Puffinus tenuirostris*. *Journal of Animal Ecology* **69**, 639-650.
 611 Bradley J, Wooller R, Skira I, Serventy D (1989) Age-dependent survival of
 612 breeding Short-tailed Shearwaters (*Puffinus tenuirostris*). *The Journal of*
 613 *Animal Ecology*, 175-188.
 614 Brooke MdL, Bonnaud E, Dilley B, *et al.* (2018) Seabird population changes
 615 following mammal eradications on islands. *Animal Conservation* **21**, 3-12.
 616 Buckmeier DL, Irwin ER, Betsill RK, Prentice JA (2002) Validity of otoliths and
 617 pectoral spines for estimating ages of channel catfish. *North American*
 618 *Journal of Fisheries Management* **22**, 934-942.
 619 Campana S (2001) Accuracy, precision and quality control in age determination,
 620 including a review of the use and abuse of age validation methods. *Journal*
 621 *of Fish Biology* **59**, 197-242.
 622 Cerchiara JA, Risques RA, Prunkard D, *et al.* (2017) Telomeres shorten and then
 623 lengthen before fledging in Magellanic penguins (*Spheniscus*
 624 *magellanicus*). *Aging (Albany NY)* **9**, 487.
 625 Chaney Jr RC, Blemings KP, Bonner J, Klandorf H (2003) Pentosidine as a
 626 measure of chronological age in wild birds. *The Auk* **120**, 394-399.
 627 Cobb JS, Wahle RA (1994) Early life history and recruitment processes of clawed
 628 lobsters. *Crustaceana* **67**, 1-25.

629 Cortés V, García-Barcelona S, González-Solís J (2018) Sex-and age-biased
630 mortality of three shearwater species in longline fisheries of the
631 Mediterranean. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* **588**, 229-241.

632 De Paoli-Iseppi R, Polanowski AM, McMahon C, *et al.* (2017) DNA methylation
633 levels in candidate genes associated with chronological age in mammals
634 are not conserved in a long-lived seabird. *PLoS One* **12**, e0189181.

635 Dunshea G, Duffield D, Gales N, *et al.* (2011) Telomeres as age markers in
636 vertebrate molecular ecology. *Molecular Ecology Resources* **11**, 225-235.

637 Edgar RC (2010) Search and clustering orders of magnitude faster than BLAST.
638 *Bioinformatics* **26**, 2460-2461.

639 Edgar RC, Flyvbjerg H (2015) Error filtering, pair assembly and error correction
640 for next-generation sequencing reads. *Bioinformatics* **31**, 3476-3482.

641 Ehrich M, Nelson MR, Stanssens P, *et al.* (2005) Quantitative high-throughput
642 analysis of DNA methylation patterns by base-specific cleavage and mass
643 spectrometry. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* **102**,
644 15785-15790.

645 Ernande B, Clobert J, McCombie H, Boudry P (2003) Genetic polymorphism and
646 trade - offs in the early life - history strategy of the Pacific oyster,
647 *Crassostrea gigas* (Thunberg, 1795): a quantitative genetic study. *Journal*
648 *of Evolutionary Biology* **16**, 399-414.

649 Fallon JA, Cochrane RL, Dorr B, Klandorf H (2006) Interspecies comparison of
650 pentosidine accumulation and its correlation with age in birds. *The Auk*
651 **123**, 870-876.

652 Faux CE, McInnes JC, Jarman SN (2014) High-throughput real-time PCR and melt
653 curve analysis for sexing Southern Ocean seabirds using fecal samples.
654 *Theriogenology* **81**, 870-874.

655 Festa-Bianchet M, Blanchard P, Gaillard J-M, Hewison AM (2002) Tooth
656 extraction is not an acceptable technique to age live ungulates. *Wildlife*
657 *Society Bulletin* **30**, 282-283.

658 Friedman J, Hastie T, Tibshirani R (2010) Regularization paths for generalized
659 linear models via coordinate descent. *Journal of Statistical Software* **33**, 1.

- Froy H, Phillips RA, Wood AG, Nussey DH, Lewis S (2013) Age - related variation in reproductive traits in the wandering albatross: evidence for terminal improvement following senescence. *Ecology Letters* **16**, 642-649.
- Gaudet F, Hodgson JG, Eden A, *et al.* (2003) Induction of tumors in mice by genomic hypomethylation. *Science* **300**, 489-492.
- Gianuca D, Phillips RA, Townley S, Votier SC (2017) Global patterns of sex-and age-specific variation in seabird bycatch. *Biological Conservation* **205**, 60-76.
- Grönniger E, Weber B, Heil O, *et al.* (2010) Aging and chronic sun exposure cause distinct epigenetic changes in human skin. *PLoS Genet* **6**, e1000971.
- Gryzinska M, Blaszczyk E, Strachecka A, Jezewska-Witkowska G (2013) Analysis of age-related global DNA methylation in chicken. *Biochemical Genetics* **51**, 554-563.
- Gryzinska M, Jakubczak A, Listos P, *et al.* (2016) Association between body weight and age of dogs and global DNA methylation. *Medycyna Weterynaryjna* **72**, 64-67.
- Gunn JS, Clear NP, Carter TI, *et al.* (2008) Age and growth in southern bluefin tuna, *Thunnus maccoyii* (Castelnau): direct estimation from otoliths, scales and vertebrae. *Fisheries Research* **92**, 207-220.
- Hannum G, Guinney J, Zhao L, *et al.* (2013) Genome-wide methylation profiles reveal quantitative views of human aging rates. *Molecular Cell* **49**, 359-367.
- Hausmann MF, Winkler DW, O'Reilly KM, *et al.* (2003) Telomeres shorten more slowly in long-lived birds and mammals than in short-lived ones. *Proceedings of the Royal Society of London B: Biological Sciences* **270**, 1387-1392.
- Horvath S (2013) DNA methylation age of human tissues and cell types. *Genome Biology* **14**, R115.
- Horvath S, Raj K (2018) DNA methylation-based biomarkers and the epigenetic clock theory of ageing. *Nature Reviews Genetics*, 1.
- Hu Y, Xu H, Li Z, *et al.* (2013) Comparison of the genome-wide DNA methylation profiles between fast-growing and slow-growing broilers. *PLoS One* **8**, e56411.

- Iqbal M, Probert LL, Alhumadi NH, Klandorf H (1999) Protein glycosylation and advanced glycosylated endproducts (AGEs) accumulation: an avian solution? *Journals of Gerontology Series A: Biomedical Sciences and Medical Sciences* **54**, B171-B176.
- Ito H, Udono T, Hirata S, Inoue-Murayama M (2018) Estimation of chimpanzee age based on DNA methylation. *Scientific Reports* **8**, 9998.
- Jakubczak A, Listos P, Dudko P, Abramowicz K, Jeżewska-Witkowska G (2016) Association between body weight and age of dogs and global DNA methylation. *Medycyna Weterynaryjna* **72**, 64-67.
- Jarman SN, Polanowski AM, Faux CE, *et al.* (2015) Molecular biomarkers for chronological age in animal ecology. *Molecular Ecology* **24**, 4826-4847.
- Jelinek J, Liang S, Lu Y, *et al.* (2012) Conserved DNA methylation patterns in healthy blood cells and extensive changes in leukemia measured by a new quantitative technique. *Epigenetics* **7**, 1368-1378.
- Jelinek J, Madzo J (2016) DREAM: A Simple Method for DNA Methylation Profiling by High-throughput Sequencing. *Chronic Myeloid Leukemia: Methods and Protocols*, 111-127.
- Juola FA, Haussmann MF, Dearborn DC, Vleck CM (2006) Telomere shortening in a long-lived marine bird: cross-sectional analysis and test of an aging tool. *The Auk* **123**, 775-783.
- Labbé A (2017) *Effects of age on reproduction and chick rearing in bridled terns (Onychoprion anaethetus) at Penguin Island, Western Australia*, Murdoch University.
- Lee CT (2017) Elasticity of population growth with respect to the intensity of biotic or abiotic driving factors. *Ecology* **98**, 1016-1025.
- Li Q, Li N, Hu X, *et al.* (2011) Genome-wide mapping of DNA methylation in chicken. *PLoS One* **6**, e19428.
- Lowe R, Barton C, Jenkins CA, *et al.* (2018) Ageing-associated DNA methylation dynamics are a molecular readout of lifespan variation among mammalian species. *Genome Biology* **19**, 22.
- Maegawa S, Hinkal G, Kim HS, *et al.* (2010) Widespread and tissue specific age-related DNA methylation changes in mice. *Genome Research* **20**, 332-340.

725 Maegawa S, Lu Y, Tahara T, *et al.* (2017) Caloric restriction delays age-related
 726 methylation drift. *Nature Communications* **8**, 539.

727 Meissner A, Gnirke A, Bell GW, *et al.* (2005) Reduced representation bisulfite
 728 sequencing for comparative high-resolution DNA methylation analysis.
 729 *Nucleic Acids Research* **33**, 5868-5877.

730 Mills MS, Ryan PG (2005) Modelling impacts of long-line fishing: what are the
 731 effects of pair-bond disruption and sex-biased mortality on albatross
 732 fecundity? *Animal Conservation* **8**, 359-367.

733 Musick JA (1999) Ecology and conservation of long-lived marine animals **23**, 1-
 734 10.

735 Nelson ME (2002) The science, ethics, and philosophy of tooth extractions from
 736 live-captured white-tailed deer: a response to Festa-Bianchet *et al.* (2002).
 737 *Wildlife Society Bulletin (1973-2006)* **30**, 284-288.

738 O'Leary SJ, Puritz JB, Willis SC, Hollenbeck CM, Portnoy DS (2018) These aren't
 739 the loci you're looking for: Principles of effective SNP filtering for
 740 molecular ecologists. *Molecular Ecology*.

741 Pérez - Barbería F, Duff E, Brewer M, Guinness F (2014) Evaluation of methods
 742 to age Scottish red deer: the balance between accuracy and practicality.
 743 *Journal of Zoology* **294**, 180-189.

744 Polanowski AM, Robbins J, Chandler D, Jarman SN (2014) Epigenetic estimation
 745 of age in humpback whales. *Molecular Ecology Resources* **14**, 976-987.

746 Portela A, Esteller M (2010) Epigenetic modifications and human disease. *Nature*
 747 *Biotechnology* **28**, 1057.

748 Rand AC, Jain M, Eizenga JM, *et al.* (2017) Mapping DNA methylation with high-
 749 throughput nanopore sequencing. *Nature Methods*.

750 Rattiste K, Klandorf H, Urvik J, *et al.* (2015) Skin pentosidine and telomere length
 751 do not covary with age in a long-lived seabird. *Biogerontology* **16**, 435-
 752 441.

753 Sarkar G, Turner RT, Bolander ME (1993) Restriction-site PCR: a direct method
 754 of unknown sequence retrieval adjacent to a known locus by using
 755 universal primers. *Genome Research* **2**, 318-322.

756 Schield DR, Walsh MR, Card DC, *et al.* (2016) EpiRADseq: scalable analysis of
757 genomewide patterns of methylation using next - generation sequencing.
758 *Methods in Ecology and Evolution* **7**, 60-69.

759 Scott ME (1988) The impact of infection and disease on animal populations:
760 implications for conservation biology. *Conservation Biology* **2**, 40-56.

761 Shimoda N, Izawa T, Yoshizawa A, *et al.* (2014) Decrease in cytosine methylation
762 at CpG island shores and increase in DNA fragmentation during zebrafish
763 aging. *Age* **36**, 103-115.

764 Slatko BE, Gardner AF, Ausubel FM (2018) Overview of Next - Generation
765 Sequencing Technologies. *Current Protocols in Molecular Biology* **122**,
766 e59.

767 Slieker RC, Relton CL, Gaunt TR, Slagboom PE, Heijmans BT (2018) Age-related
768 DNA methylation changes are tissue-specific with ELOVL2 promoter
769 methylation as exception. *Epigenetics & Chromatin* **11**, 25.

770 Slieker RC, van Iterson M, Luijk R, *et al.* (2016) Age-related accrual of
771 methylomic variability is linked to fundamental ageing mechanisms.
772 *Genome Biology* **17**, 191.

773 Spiers H, Hannon E, Wells S, *et al.* (2016) Age-associated changes in DNA
774 methylation across multiple tissues in an inbred mouse model.
775 *Mechanisms of Ageing and Development* **154**, 20-23.

776 Sziráki A, Tyshkovskiy A, Gladyshev VN (2018) Global remodeling of the mouse
777 DNA methylome during aging and in response to calorie restriction. *Aging*
778 *Cell* **17**, e12738.

779 Thompson MJ, vonHoldt B, Horvath S, Pellegrini M (2017) An epigenetic aging
780 clock for dogs and wolves. *Aging (Albany NY)* **9**, 1055.

781 Tricola GM, Simons MJ, Atema E, *et al.* (2018) The rate of telomere loss is related
782 to maximum lifespan in birds. *Phil. Trans. R. Soc. B* **373**, 20160445.

783 Velarde E, Ezcurra E (2018) Are seabirds' life history traits maladaptive under
784 present oceanographic variability? The case of Heermann's Gull (*Larus*
785 *heermanni*). *The Condor* **120**, 388-401.

786 Vidaki A, Ballard D, Aliferi A, Miller TH, Barron LP (2017) DNA methylation-
787 based forensic age prediction using artificial neural networks and next

788 generation sequencing. *Forensic Science International: Genetics* **28**, 225-
789 236.

790 Vidal-Bralo L, Lopez-Golan Y, Gonzalez A (2016) Simplified Assay for Epigenetic
791 Age Estimation in Whole Blood of Adults. *Frontiers in Genetics* **7**.

792 Weber KL, Bolander ME, Sarkab G (1998) Rapid acquisition of unknown DNA
793 sequence adjacent to a known segment by multiplex restriction site PCR.
794 *Biotechniques* **25**, 415-419.

795 Weimerskirch H, Lequette B, Jouventin P (1989) Development and maturation of
796 plumage in the wandering albatross (*Diomedea exulans*). *Journal of*
797 *Zoology* **219**, 411-421.

798 Wooller R, Bradley J, Skira I, Serventy D (1990) Reproductive success of short-
799 tailed shearwaters (*Puffinus tenuirostris*) in relation to their age and
800 breeding experience. *The Journal of Animal Ecology*, 161-170.

801 Wright PG, Mathews F, Schofield H, *et al.* (2018) Application of a novel molecular
802 method to age free - living wild Bechstein's bats. *Molecular Ecology*
803 *Resources*.

804 Zbieć-Piekarska R, Spólnicka M, Kupiec T, *et al.* (2015) Examination of DNA
805 methylation status of the ELOVL2 marker may be useful for human age
806 prediction in forensic science. *Forensic Science International: Genetics* **14**,
807 161-167.

This article is protected by copyright. All rights reserved.

DNA methylation score

$$\frac{6 \times \text{CCGGG}}{10 \times \text{reads}} = 0.60$$

men_12981_f2a.tif

M_001158_Seq1158

men_12981_f2b.tif

men_12981_f2c.tif

men_12981_f2d.tif

men_12981_f2e.tif

men_12981_f2f.tif

M_003784_Seq3784

Adj R2 = 0.2105 Range = 0.361

men_12981_f2g.tif

men_12981_f3.tif

men_12981_f4a.eps

men_12981_f4b.eps

men_12981_f5.eps

men_12981_f6b.eps

men_12981_f6c.eps

men_12981_f7.eps

Minerva Access is the Institutional Repository of The University of Melbourne

Author/s:

De Paoli-Iseppi, R;Deagle, BE;Polanowski, AM;McMahon, CR;Dickinson, JL;Hindell, MA;Jarman, SN

Title:

Age estimation in a long-lived seabird (*Ardenna tenuirostris*) using DNA methylation-based biomarkers

Date:

2019-03-01

Citation:

De Paoli-Iseppi, R., Deagle, B. E., Polanowski, A. M., McMahon, C. R., Dickinson, J. L., Hindell, M. A. & Jarman, S. N. (2019). Age estimation in a long-lived seabird (*Ardenna tenuirostris*) using DNA methylation-based biomarkers. *MOLECULAR ECOLOGY RESOURCES*, 19 (2), pp.411-425. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1755-0998.12981>.

Persistent Link:

<http://hdl.handle.net/11343/285418>