Genuine Anguish, Genuine Mind
‘Loyal’ Buddhist Monks, Poetics and Soteriology in Ming-Qing Transition-era Southern China

by
Corey Lee Bell

A THESIS SUBMITTED IN FULL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENT FOR THE DEGREE OF
Doctor of Philosophy

in
The Faculty of Arts
(Asia Institute)
The University of Melbourne

June 2016

0000-0003-4549-7308

Printed on Archive-quality Paper
Abstract

The best known genre of Chinese Buddhist poetry is the ‘nature’ or ‘landscape’ poems, which were seen to have religious value because they promoted ‘detachment’ from society and used the tranquility of a secluded scene to reveal the monastic author’s inner calm. However, during the tumultuous period of dynastic decline and transition in seventeenth-century China, some monks saw religious value in poems that reflected their ‘entanglement’ with a crisis-ridden society, poems that even expressed agitated emotional states prompted by the moral and political disorder of their era. The monks who developed this type of poetry and the literary theory which justified it did so while serving in temples in southern China. These clerics shared an important attribute – they were ‘loyal’ to the ill-fated Ming dynasty (which ruled China until 1644, after which it was replaced by the Manchu Qing), a loyalty that was manifest during the period of the dynasty’s decline and after its fall. A distinctive characteristic of the poems of these monks and of their writings on poetry is that the authors affirmed in different ways the use of poetry to express ‘indignation’ (怨), particularly indignation at political injustice and social and moral disorder. This endorsement of the poetic expression of indignation carried the condition that indignation had to be ‘genuine’, a concept generally conveyed by the word zhen (真) which may be translated as ‘authenticity’ or ‘genuineness’ but which can also imply ‘truth’, ‘reality’ and ‘the real’. I argue that monastic writers loyal to the Ming cause contended that poetry expressing genuine indignation could help Buddhist disciples come to terms with the ‘reality’ of living through tumultuous times, and could enlighten them. ‘Genuine’ poetic indignation could help disciples attain insight into what some of these monks called the ‘genuine mind’ (真心).

This dissertation focuses on the writings and ideas on poetry of three such ‘loyal’ authors: Hanshan Deqing (憨山德清) from the late Ming, Juelang Daosheng (覺浪道盛) from the Ming-Qing transition era and Tianran Hanshi (天然函昰) from the early Qing. It will show how each author developed new Buddhist interpretations of genuineness to bring emotional ‘engagement’ with a troubled world into the purview of Buddhist practice. I suggest that their ideas drew on late-Ming intellectual innovations and on the new forms of socially-engaged Buddhism that emerged at this time. Each of the three writers (and his associates) responded to a different context within the larger historical process of the decline of the Ming and the rise of the Qing. However, we can argue that the common feature in their work was that they took an approach to literature and its place in religious practice which differed from that of
earlier Buddhist thinkers. In shifting from the eremitic ‘ideal’ of detachment and tranquillity to the ‘reality’ of engagement and emotional honesty, their work marked a new turn in monastic discourse on the relationship between poetry and Chan/Buddhism, a significant new development in Buddhist literary practice and a new phase in late imperial Buddhist intellectual history.
Academic Thesis: Declaration Of Authorship

I, Corey Lee Bell, declare that this thesis and the work presented in it are my own and has been generated by me as the result of my own original research.

I confirm that:

1. This work was done wholly or mainly while in candidature for a research degree at this University;
2. Where any part of this thesis has previously been submitted for a degree or any other qualification at this University or any other institution, this has been clearly stated;
3. Where I have consulted the published work of others, this is always clearly attributed;
4. Where I have quoted from the work of others, the source is always given. With the exception of such quotations, this thesis is entirely my own work;
5. I have acknowledged all main sources of help;
6. Where the thesis is based on work done by myself jointly with others, I have made clear exactly what was done by others and what I have contributed myself;
7. None of this work has been published before submission
8. The thesis is fewer than the maximum world limit of 110,000 words as prescribed by my institution (not including tables, maps, bibliographies, appendices, and words in other languages that have been translated into English, where the original has been left to convenience my examiners).

Signed:

Corey Bell
Date: 9 / 06 / 2016
Acknowledgements:

Prof. Liao Chao-heng of Academia Sinica’s Department of Chinese Literature and Philosophy told me on one occasion that studying late imperial Buddhism is oftentimes a fairly lonely endeavour. If this is the case I have been exceptionally lucky for the good company and generous assistance I have received over the duration of this project.

Firstly I would like to thank my primary supervisor, Dr Lewis Mayo, who has been a teacher, mentor and friend of mine for many years. He embodies, and has done his best to impart to me, scholarly virtues which are old school, yet timeless and absolutely commendable. He has been a constant source of encouragement, and supported me in more ways that it would be fit to mention in such a brief statement of acknowledgements. I acknowledge his careful and substantive assistance with the translations.

Prof. Anne McLaren, my secondary supervisor, has been of immense assistance to me as she has counterbalanced Dr Mayo’s encouragement by being forthright when forthrightness was much needed. Her advice has on numerous occasions set me back on the right path when I have diverged from it, and I have been able to feel assured that her kind words on my successes were in all instances sincere.

While my home department, the Asia Institute, provided me excellent support, I would like to acknowledge the assistance of other institutions. Firstly, thanks must go to the University of Hong Kong’s Department of Comparative Literature for offering me a position as a visiting scholar early in my PhD candidature. Special thanks must go to Prof. Gina Marchetti who was most hospitable and who provided me all the resources I needed. Secondly, I would like to thank Associate Prof. Qiu Jiang of Guangzhou’s Sun Yat-sen University, and his associate Dr. Li Fubiao, who warmly assisted me, an gave me many important materials, without which this particular study would not have eventuated. Special thanks must also go to the staff at the Australia National University’s Centre on China in the World, as well as library staff from the University’s Menzies Library, and the National Library of Canberra. The visiting scholar’s fellowship hosted by the Centre on China in the World gave me access to rare materials and allowed me to tap into the expertise of accomplished scholars. The brevity of my stay there was more than compensated by the enthusiasm and kind assistance of staff at the Centre and
the aforementioned libraries. Special thanks must go to Dr. Benjamin Penny for his support and assistance.

Lastly, immense thanks must go to Taiwan’s Ministry of Foreign Affairs, who provided me a half-year long fellowship which gave me an ideal environment and all the resources I needed to expand and strengthen my thesis. Special thanks must go to the Department of Chinese Literature and Philosophy of Academia Sinica, who were my home institution for the duration of this fellowship. The department’s Prof. Liao Chao-heng, whose work was an important source of inspiration for me, and who supported my application, provided invaluable guidance, and his efforts to make this endeavor less ‘lonely’ by organizing and coordinating study groups and presentations were much appreciated by all who attended them. My second institution, the Graduate Institute of East Asian Studies of the National Chengchi University, also on this front needs special mention. Its director, Prof. David Holm, was one of my supervisors and mentors when I began my PhD, and an inspirational teacher to me during my undergraduate years, and his ongoing interest in my work, as well as his assistance and hospitality, have been much appreciated.

Finally, my gratitude goes out to the many people who have looked over my work and offered advice/suggestions. Of these, Dr. Scott Pacey, whom I have known for many years, generously donated some of his valuable time to give my work a reading over, and offered some invaluable suggestions. Special thanks also to my department’s Dr. Du Liping, as well as Ass. Prof. Gao Jia, and my colleague Dr. Anthony Garnaut, as well as Academia Sinica’s Chien Kai-ting and Dr. Shang Haifeng (the latter offered some very valuable suggestions on the translation of some passages). Eternal thanks must go to the person who was my partner throughout much of the duration of this dissertation, Yin, who over an elongated period showed immense patience and supported me selflessly. She endured, for my benefit, more than anyone could ever ask and expect.
# Table of Contents

**Introduction** ............................................................................................................. pg.1

**Chapter 1:**
Background and Doctrine.............................................................................................pg.19

**Chapter 2:**
A Nightmarish Descent into Hell – Hanshan Deqing on Exile, Zhen Poetry and ‘True’
Chan.................................................................................................................................pg.44

**Chapter 3:**
A Winter Furnace of Indignation – Historical and Spiritual Transformation and the Idea of
‘Straightforward’ Poetry in the Work of Juelang Daosheng........................................pg.88

**Chapter 4:**
Real Grievances, Authentic Writing – Tianran Hanshi’s Counsels on Loss, Sincerity
and Truth..........................................................................................................................pg.146

**Epilogue......................................................................................................................pg.204

**Bibliography..............................................................................................................pg.214
Introduction

From Detachment to Genuineness: Anguish, Poetry and Authenticity

Long before being introduced into China, Buddhism had made use of poetry, primarily to inspire devotion and as a mnemonic tool. In early Chinese Buddhism, however, ideas emerged that poetry could enlighten people not only through its capacity to communicate religious doctrines and symbols, but also through the aesthetic qualities of certain types of poems. This view is conventionally traced back to its nascent manifestations in the Buddhist principle (folii 佛理) poems of the Eastern Jin poet-monks Zhi Daolin (支道林 314-366) and Huiyuan (慧遠 334-416), and is regarded as being best embodied in the mountain residence (shanju 山居) poems of famous Chan school monastic poets from the Tang dynasty, such as Jiaoran (皎然 mid 8th to early 9th century), Guanxiu (貫休 823-912), and Qiji (齊己 863-937). Both Buddhist principle poems and mountain residence poems are characterised by the depiction of the bucolic beauty of nature or landscape, and in particular by representations of secluded mountain settings. This poetry reflects monastic ideals relating to the kinds of sites considered conducive to religious practice – secluded, so-called ‘pure and cool’ (qingliang 清涼) realms.¹ The religious value of these poems was often attributed to their capacity to reflect the eremitic mindset and the spiritual attainments that a reclusive life in such realms was deemed to facilitate. The prolific Ming-Qing landscape poet Wang Shizhen (王士禎 1634-1711) – who advocated the principle that ‘Chan and poetry are the same’ (詩禪一致) called this religious and poetic quality ‘purity and distance’ (qingyuan 清遠).² Similarly, the Ming-era critic Tu Long (屠隆 1542-1605), referring to the Tang-era ‘Buddha of poetry’

¹ Sung-peng Hsu’s A Buddhist Leader in Ming China: The Life and Thought of Han-Shan Te-Ch’ing (University Park: Pennsylvania State University Press, 1979) gives a lengthy discussion of the meaning of the term ‘pure and cool’ with reference to the career of Hanshan Deqing (one of the key figures that my thesis discusses). Hsu relates the term to the Buddhist ideal of a wholesome and spiritually fruitful monastic life facilitated by secluded living in a mountain monastery (pgs. 66-75).
² For a discussion on this term, see Richard John Lynn’s ‘Orthodoxy and Enlightenment: Wang Shih-ch’en’s Theory of Poetry and Its Antecedents’ (in Wm. Theodore de Bary (ed.) The Unfolding of Neo-Confucianism. New York: Columbia University Press, 1975), pgs. 248-250. The idea that this term expresses the fusion of spirituality and (in particular landscape) poetry is shown in a passage from Wang’s Remarks on Poetry from the Hall of the Classics (Daijing tang shihua) 《帶經堂詩話》 that is translated on page 248 of Lynn’s ‘Orthodoxy and Enlightenment’.
Wang Wei (王維 699–759), called it ‘purity and repose’ (*qing er shi* 清而適) or ‘mental purity and coolness’ (*xindi qingliang* 心地清涼).³

Yet there have been times in China’s history when the tranquillity of secluded life in the Buddhist monastery was disrupted by the effects of political and historical crises – times when the cool and pure gave way to hellish and defiled scenes of turmoil, suffering and destruction. This was the case in the years extending between the decline of the Ming dynasty and the subsequent violent transition to Qing rule. During this time a number of eminent monks in the southern regions of China did not seek to keep a distance, or detach themselves from a troubled and impure world, as many of their predecessors and contemporaries had done, but saw in these impure and hellish situations a site conducive to spiritual cultivation, believing that ‘the [hells of] swelling fires and mountains of blades’ could, like the ‘pure and cool’ setting of the mountain retreat, serve as ‘*bodhi* *maṇḍala* sites [places of spiritual cultivation] for attaining supreme *nirvāṇa*’.⁴ This correlated with emerging views that ‘heated’ states of emotional turmoil – those engendered by hellish settings – did not necessarily denote a deficiency in meditative repose, but could instead be regarded as an appropriate ecclesiastic response to pervasive human suffering, and could even be taken as a measure of religious merit.

These new ideas about intersections between scene, sentiment and religious attainment not only presented challenges to the prevailing orthodoxy, but also inspired radical new conceptions of the genres and aesthetic qualities of poetry that could be regarded as having religious utility. The expression of detachment and the pure and cool came to be complemented by an affirmation of the religious value of very non-Buddhist expressions of sentimental entanglement or engagement with a defiled world, and even by an affirmation of overt manifestations of emotional anguish, such as the expression of grievances about perceived injustice. When the focus on the ideal of ascetic life and meditative repose came to be replaced by a focus on the reality of the defiled world and defiled emotional responses to it, the idea of aesthetic beauty as the quality that united poetry and Buddhist enlightenment gave way to a new appreciation of authenticity as the quality that poetry and Buddhist

---


⁴ *火聚、刀山無非究竟寂滅道場地* The *Dream Travels Collection of Old Man Hanshan* (*Hanshan laoren mengyou ji*) 《憨山老人夢遊集》, fascicle 13: (CBETA, X73, no. 1456, p. 547, c8-9 // Z 2:32, p. 190, d5-6 // R127, p. 380, b5-6). See the following chapter for a more extensive discussion of this passage.
enlightenment shared. The key term that both the literary criticism and the Buddhist discourse of the late Ming to the early Qing era used to designate authenticity is *zhen* 真: the quality of being true, real, sincere, authentic or ‘genuine.’

**Zhen Poetry as Chan: From Genuineness to Reality to ‘The Genuine’**

The prime advocates of these radical new theories of poetry were monks active in the areas south of the Yangtze who were loyal to the Ming dynasty, both before and after its fall (as were the congregations that they served). Among their leaders were three eminent monks who were deeply affected by the decline of the Ming and later by its replacement by the Qing: Hanshan Deqing (憨山德清 1546-1623), exiled to the south in 1595; the Nanjing-based Juelang Daosheng (覺浪道盛 1592-1659); and Lingnan’s Tianran Hanshi (天然函昰 1608-1585). Engaging with a tradition associated with Qu Yuan (屈原 c. 349-278 BCE), the famous poet and tragic icon of loyalty from southern China, each of these monks read large quantities of non-Buddhist poetry that voiced grievances at injustices and at the intolerable circumstances brought about by political violence, while also producing their own poems on these themes. Seeking to reconcile these ostensibly non-Buddhist poetic forms with their religious mission, they followed contemporary literary theorists in asserting that poetry about social and political grievances which is *zhen* can have moral and/or therapeutic benefits for both writers and readers. They also felt that this *zhen* poetry could be used as a tool to enlighten people, arguing that poetry which was *zhen* could be regarded as being ‘genuine Chan’ 真禪.

This idea that *zhen* poetry could be identified with Buddhist religious values drew in part on the concern with ideas of ‘authenticity’ (*zhen*) that was pervasive so-called loyal monasteries in the Ming-Qing transition era. However, this new conceptualization was also related to shifting ways in which these loyal Buddhist communities experienced and articulated

---

5 A substantial body of modern scholarship (especially Chinese-language scholarship) addresses the issue of *zhen* in Chinese poetics, and I have introduced a number of these works in the content chapters. An excellent work that examines this value in the context of Ming-Qing era literary thought and poetics is Martin W. Huang’s ‘Sentiments of Desire: Thoughts on the Cult of Qing in Ming-Qing Literature’ (*Chinese Literature: Essays, Articles, Reviews*, Vol. 20, Dec. 1998), pgs. 153-184 (see especially pgs. 164-168).

6 *Shi nai zhen chan* 詩乃真禪, *The Dream Travels Collection of Old Man Hanshan*, fascicle 39 (CBETA Ref. - X73n1456_p0745c16(00)). Chapter Two presents a longer discussion of the idea, prevalent in the late Ming / early Qing, that poetry and Chan can be profoundly or directly identified with each other. A brief discussion on Hanshan’s articulation of this idea can be found in Liao Chao-heng [Liao Zhaoheng] (廖肇亨) *Zhong bian, shichan, mengxi: Ming mo Qing chu fojiu wenhua lunshu de chengxian yu kaizhan* 《中邊•詩禪•夢戲: 明末清初佛教文化論述的呈現與開展》 (Taipei: Yunchen wenhua, 2008), pgs. 19-20.
detachment. The historical contingencies of political decline and transition meant that detachment in loyal orders not only took the form of voluntary eremitic seclusion, but was also increasingly experienced through the more sombre reality of forced exile. Exile entailed experiences of dislocation from the exiled individual’s object of political loyalty, in many cases involving what Wai-yee Li has called ‘inner’ exile, marked by rejection of either a barbarian locale or a barbarian political entity, together with a sense of alienation from a previously familiar world that had become foreign, along with feelings of repulsion at an environment of all-pervasive moral turpitude and injustice.7 Reflecting this shift in the orientation of monastic life away from a desired state of disengagement towards a forced alienation, and from a tranquil transcendence to a traumatic dislocation, these monks proposed that soteriological goals would be advanced not so much by greater detachment from mundane experiences, but by drawing upon zhen to initiate reconnections with their inner selves and with the world around them. As a literary value, zhen had strong connotations of reconnection: authentic (zhen) words were those that connected with one’s actual (zhen) emotions; true (zhen) emotions reflected one’s current reality (zhen) or circumstances; and sincerity (zhen) connected with or revealed a person’s true (zhen) nature. By mapping a path to enlightenment in which being true or ‘genuine’ could be a way to reveal true innate nature – what Buddhists called the genuine mind (zhenxin 真心) – or where being real could be a means to realise ultimate reality, monks developed new skilful means (fangbian 方便 upāyakauśalya) appropriate for people who believed that writing honestly about dislocating traumatic experiences was an effective way of coming to terms with the.

By adopting this strategy, monks also created an approach to poetry that was in tune with the humanistic and pragmatist tendencies of Buddhism in the Ming-Qing era. In this period critics often decried the vegetable and bamboo-shoot ambience (shu sun qi 蔬筍氣) surrounding some Chan monks who appeared to be aloofly indifferent to the practical needs and real concerns of human beings,8 and many monks of this era came to see ultimate

---

7 For a brief discussion on these ideas, see Wai-yee Li’s ‘Introduction’ in Wilt L. Idema, Wai-yee Li and Ellen Widmer (eds.) Trauma and Transcendence in Early Qing Literature (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 2006), pgs. 46-49. Li suggests that for many loyalists the Qing conquest had made China seem like a foreign land, such that they felt like exiles in their own country (pg. 48). In Li’s view this type of ‘exile’ involved a degree of inner ‘detachment,’ and could thus be thought of as being to some degree voluntary (albeit also to some degree compelled) – a quality expressed through her use of the term ‘self-imposed exile.’ My own approach to ‘exile’ is somewhat different: I wish to stress the monastic writers’ sense of ‘exile’ as an involuntary state, a condition forced on people by external circumstances – something that starkly contrasted with the idea of living in seclusion in pursuit of the eremitic ideal. I discuss this point in greater detail in the next chapter.

8 See Liao, Zhong-bian, shi-chan, mengxi, pg. 18. A more detailed discussion on this concept and its relation to poetry can be found in Zhou Yukai (周裕鍇) Zhonguo chanzong yu shige 《中國禪宗與詩歌》 (Shanghai:
enlightenment not as a form of transcendence, but as comprehension of the non-duality of ordinary consciousness and supramundane awakening.

In sum, this thesis sets out to articulate how loyal late Ming / early Qing monks based in south China came to contend that non-Buddhist forms of poetry, and especially poetry expressing grievances engendered by engagement with an impure world, could be used to attain enlightenment on the condition that this poetry was *zhen*. It focuses on the Buddhist and Buddho-syncretic doctrines invoked by these monastic authors to establish and legitimise, and also to qualify and on occasion challenge, this controversial proposition. I pay particular attention to the way these doctrines and values were rearticulated through recourse to *zhen* as a foundational ideal and a fundamental organising motif in the writings of these authors. I assert that each of these loyal authors applied a holistic approach to *zhen* which emphasised the union of three key modalities:

1. In the literary domain: Authenticity in expression, a concept strongly linked to the idea that emotions presented in a literary work should be genuine (*zhen* as being ‘genuine’).

2. In the domain of human affairs: Engagement with what might be called real problems occasioned by social and political realities (*zhen* as being ‘real’).

3. In the domain of Buddhism: Real Chan practice (*zhenchan* 真禅), necessary to intuitively realise higher truth (*zhen* as ‘the genuine’ or ‘the real’).

We will see that Buddhist writers brought these three modalities together in the idea that by promoting the prevailing literary value of *zhen*, they could respond to the real situation of both monks and laity living through a period of dynastic upheaval and do so in a way that could lead disciples towards the Buddhist goal of realising truth, or attaining insight into the genuine mind (*zhenxin* 真心). It will also be suggested that these developments were related to a notion that subsequently came to constitute one of the defining tenets of modern Chinese humanistic Buddhism: the idea that engaging with a defiled human world corrupted by politics and injustice is not necessarily antithetical to Buddhist ideals, but can in fact provide a means for cultivating ultimate emancipation.

---

Shanghai renmin chubanshe, 1992), pgs. 45-53.
Buddhist Doctrine and Cultural ‘Intersections’

This thesis sets out from the premise that the new Buddhist writings about secular poetry dating from the late-Ming / Ming-Qing transition era were products of a religious mission formed in response to traumatic experiences of political turmoil and dynastic transition. These writings were not merely a vehicle for monks to pronounce their loyalty to the Ming, as much of the Chinese-language scholarship on them has seen them as being. My argument that the notion of zhen had three different facets – a literary ideal regarding authenticity, a social ideal involving a desire to face up to historical reality, and a religious ideal about realising truth – brings up the possibility of conflict between different methodological approaches, those of literary criticism, social history, and Buddhist studies. Here I should make clear that because this dissertation focuses on ideas that were invoked to reconcile non-Buddhist literary production with Buddhist practice, it is framed as a study of a specific strand of monastic intellectual history in late imperial China. Although it is not primarily intended as a contribution to Chinese social history or literary criticism, if we are to understand how this phenomenon took shape, neither of these scholarly approaches can be ignored. Both literary and historical elements are addressed here, but only to provide a background for my textual study of Buddhist writings about poetry and the religious concepts that underpin these writings.

‘Cultural Intersections’ and Perceptions of the Redundancy of ‘Bedrock’ Buddhist Studies

Even though this thesis is focused on Buddhist intellectual history, it might be grouped with the extensive and diverse body of scholarship examining what Marsha Weidner has called ‘cultural intersections’ between Buddhism and the wider world of Chinese culture in the era

---

9 A substantial body of current and modern scholarship, some of it dating back to the Republican era, emphasises the ‘loyalist’ identity of Buddhist monastic leaders. These figures were strongly committed to the Ming throne during and after its collapse; many of them were also the heads of religious communities that featured a large number of disciples who were loyal to the Ming. Works that emphasise this ‘loyal’ identity include: Hsieh Ming-Yang [Xie Mingyang] (謝明陽) (2004) Ming yimin de ‘yuán,’ ‘qun’ shìxué jīngshēn: cong Juelang Daosheng dao Fang Yizhi, Qian Chengzhi 《明遺民的“怨”, “群” 詩學精神——從覺浪道盛到方以智、錢澄之》 (Taipei: Da’an chubanshe, 2004); Hsieh’s ‘Juelang Daosheng Zhuangzi tīzhēng’ xiezuo Beijing kaobian 《覺浪道盛「莊子提正」寫作背景考辨》 (Qinghua xuebao 《清华學報》, New Series 42, No.1, Mar. 2012, pp. 135-168); Feng Shengnian (豐盛年), ‘Lüelun Tianran heshang Hanshi yu ‘Han’ zhibei zhuren de jiaowang’ 〈略論天然和尚函昰與“函”字輩諸人的交往〉 (in Zhong Dong (鍾東) ed.) Bei zhi chuan xiang: Biechuanshi lishi wenhua yanjiuhui lunwenji 《悲智傳響: 輔傳寺歷史文化研討會論文集》. Beijing: Zhongguo haiguan chubanshe, 2006), pgs. 226-237; Nie Wenli (聶文莉) ‘Hanshi yu Hanke’ 〈函昰與函可〉 in Zhong (ed.) Bei zhi chuan xiang, pp. 247-258; Deng Zhicheng (鄧之誠) Qingshi jishi chuban 《清詩紀事初編》 (Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 1984).
of the late imperial Buddhist revival.\textsuperscript{10} Because the phenomena studied in this dissertation lie at an intersection between Buddhist thought, literature and history, it is important to consider broader debates about the validity of competing approaches or methodologies in what is an increasingly interdisciplinary field. In this regard, it is important to note that the types of writing that are studied in this thesis (and we should point out here that some of the individual texts examined here have not been previously studied in English or in Chinese or Japanese) have hitherto largely been examined primarily by scholars studying literature and/or social history. A good deal of the existing scholarship – particularly the Chinese-language scholarship – that examines Buddhism between the decline of the Ming and the establishment of the Qing focuses on the connections that Buddhist authors and their writings had to Ming loyalism and to the secular world more broadly. Scholarship in this vein has primarily seen the engagement of the writers studied in this dissertation with secular themes as a product of their devotion to the Ming cause or as an expression of their wider sense of Chinese cultural patriotism. As I will discuss below, many scholars have considered Buddhist thought to be largely irrelevant for understanding both the intended meaning of these texts and the significance that these writings had for Buddhist communities in that era.

While this tendency is particularly evident in discussions of so-called loyal monks, it reflects and perhaps draws on the broader trend seen in the cultural intersections scholarship which takes the relationship between late imperial-era Buddhism and the secular realm as the primary factor in religious developments in this period. I would argue that this approach is in some ways a new version of an older ‘biological’ life narrative of Buddhism in China that depicted the religion passing from birth to infancy to adult vigour to senescence. The new narrative replaces the story of Buddhist growth and late imperial decline (now discredited by the consensus on the occurrence of a Buddhist ‘revival’ in the late Ming / early Qing) with one in which Chinese culture is credited with giving new life to the religion and ultimately reclaiming it. This narrative depicts a process in which the ‘living cells’ of the Buddhist tradition (that is. its intellectual/doctrinal traditions), are seen as having been invigorated and nurtured by a rich new cultural ‘oxygen’ up to Buddhism’s peak in the Tang and Song and then decaying as a result of being ‘hyperoxygenated’\textsuperscript{11} by this Sinitic atmosphere in the late imperial era. This notion of decay by cultural ‘hyperoxygenation’ is perhaps best captured in

\textsuperscript{10}The term ‘cultural intersections’ is contained in the title of the 2001 book edited by Weidner: \textit{Cultural Intersections in Later Chinese Buddhism} (Honolulu: University of Hawai‘i Press). I discuss this concept in greater detail later in this introduction.

\textsuperscript{11} This is the technical term for oversupplying oxygen to the body, usually producing metabolic dysfunction.
a critique by Sung-peng Hsu, who cites the pervasive idea that by the late Ming Buddhism ‘had become so popularized, syncretized, and fused with Taoist and Confucian ideas and practices that it had lost the purity and intellectual vitality of the earlier period.’ This perception, Hsu argues, explains the relative lack of modern scholarly interest in the Buddhist thought of that era, at least in the 1970s when Hsu was writing.

Hsu’s own work shows that not all modern scholars accept the idea that Chinese Buddhism had declined intellectually in the late imperial era. However, in more recent studies, especially those focusing on intersections between late imperial Buddhism and the Chinese secular world, the narrative of Buddhist decline remains resilient, even if its articulation has become more subtle. Marsha Weidner’s introduction to Cultural Intersections in Later Chinese Buddhism, for instance, opposes the idea that Buddhism had reached a ‘truly deplorable state by the Ming’ – a judgement she relates to the ‘elite perspectives’ of those who noted ‘a perceived decline in Buddhist leadership, spiritual purity, and intellectual rigour.’ However, while she disputes the image of an overall decline of Buddhism in the Ming, Weidner does not challenge the idea that there was a decline of the religion in these core areas of leadership, spirituality and intellectual attainment. Rather, she emphasises how the religion enjoyed demographic growth in the late imperial era and ‘insinuate[d] itself even more thoroughly into Chinese culture.’ For Weidner, these developments oblige scholars to shift emphasis away from the narrower ‘elite perspectives’ of traditional ‘Buddhological approaches’ to utilise ‘extracanonical sources’ and to use varied and often interdisciplinary methodologies, such as those that ‘explore constructions of power in art and ritual in ways that resonate with Cultural Studies’.

Many other scholars, through use of the terms sinification, secularisation and syncretism, have framed the cultural intersections of the late imperial era as a matter of Buddhism passively receiving cultural, social and intellectual influences from outside its own traditions,

12 Hsu, A Buddhist Leader in Ming China, pg. ix.
13 Cultural Intersections in Later Chinese Buddhism, pg. i.
14 Ibid., pg. ii.
15 Ibid.
16 Ibid.
17 Ibid.
such that a knowledge of Buddhist concepts and practices is seen as being not really necessary for an understanding of late imperial Chinese Buddhism. Kengo Araki (1975) articulated this viewpoint with the observation that Buddhism’s sudden rise in the late Ming ‘is thought to have owed much more to developments in the School of Wang Yang-ming rather than to any internal development in Buddhism itself’. This view was affirmed more recently in Jiang Wu’s *Enlightenment in Dispute: the Reinvention of Chan Buddhism in Seventeenth-century China*, which states: ‘At that time, the Chan craze was only part of the literati culture and Wang Yangming’s intellectual discourse rather than a natural outcome of a monastic movement of Buddhist revival.’ Timothy Brook’s book *Praying for Power* similarly sees Buddhism’s late Ming ‘revival’ as largely an extension of the Buddhist movement amongst the gentry, rather than a development within the monastic orders themselves. While his research goals as a social historian make it understandable that he de-emphasises religious thought (his aim is to show how gentry officials used charities run through temples to raise their status in local communities), his tendency to underplay or negate the significance of Buddhist religious commitments produces a religious ‘desemanticisation,’ a divorcing of religious phenomena from religious meaning. This is especially evident in Brook’s description of the monastery as somewhere approached by the gentry not with regard to its religious functions, but on account of its utility as a ‘limited but valuable space’, ‘site’, or ‘non-state forum’ for the pursuit of gentry social and political agendas.

These analyses of ‘cultural intersections’ between Buddhism and the secular world have led to the study of phenomena that were hitherto largely ignored by scholars interested in Chinese Buddhism primarily from a Buddhological viewpoint. But we should note Charles H. Long’s concerns about an emerging imbalance in religious studies between ‘description[s] of the dynamic, historical and practical sides of religious activity by sociologists, ethnologists and anthropologists’ and traditional methodologies that emphasise ‘phenomenological or morphological descriptions’ of religious phenomena. As Long states, ‘[i]f, for example, one

---

18 ‘Confucianism and Buddhism in the Late Ming,’ in Theodore de Bary (ed.) *The Unfolding of Neo-Confucianism* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1975), pg. 54.
21 Brook, *Praying for Power*, pg. 179.
22 Ibid.
23 Ibid.
24 See Long’s *Significations: Signs, Symbols and Images in the Interpretation of Religion* (Aurora, Col.: Davies
takes the point of view that religion is simply an expression of man’s practical existential response to the world, such expressions might be discussed in economic, social or psychological terms, leaving the word ‘religion’ devoid of any referent. Beliefs about the ‘hyperoxygenation’ or Sinification/secularisation of Buddhism in the late imperial period, can lead scholars taking the cultural intersections approach to run the risk of ‘desemanticising’ religious phenomena, with the study of formal Buddhist thought and concepts being considered largely irrelevant. More importantly, such an approach may prompt misreadings or partial readings of the texts that lie at the ‘intersection’ of religion and culture, texts whose inspiration or intended/received meanings may have been rooted in religious concerns or strongly influenced by Buddhist thought.

Cultural Intersections in Late Imperial Buddhism as a Buddhist Co-optation of Secular Traditions

Fortunately, there have been many studies in recent decades that challenge both the conception of revival-era Buddhism as merely a passive recipient of external cultural influences and the concomitant view that intersections between Buddhism and secular culture have little to do with Buddhist thought. One core idea that has propelled this change is a more positive reappraisal of concepts like syncretism, which are now seen as denoting the reinvigoration, rather than the corrosion, of the integrity, vitality and orthodoxy (the ‘living cells’) of the Buddhist religion. Judith Berling’s *The Syncretic Religion of Lin Chao-en* revisits syncretism from the perspective of the fertile grounds of late Ming religious thought, analysing it in terms of different ‘levels of orthodoxy’, and ascribing its motivation to an attempt to rejuvenate each tradition’s religious ‘essence.’ Berling contrasts syncretism with the more random practice of eclecticism, stating that the former proceeds from ‘a firm basis of religious authority,’ in which external elements are systematically incorporated into a ‘home tradition.’ This viewpoint is articulated even more explicitly in Yü Chün-fang’s *The Renewal of Buddhism in China: Chu-hung and the Late Ming Synthesis.* Yü sees the thought of the eminent late Ming monk Chu-hung (Yunqi Zhuhong 雲棲祩宏 1535-1615) as

---

‘a creative syncretism enterprise,’ rather than as a forced or passive adaptation to other traditions, and states that Zhuhong ‘never ceased to be a Buddhist.’ She sees Zhuhong’s synthesis of the three teachings as being built upon a ‘hierarchical pyramid, with Buddhism at the apex.’ Elsewhere Yū argues that this quality extended to all the most eminent monks of the late Ming, noting that, in spite of the syncretic nature of their thought, each retained ‘allegiance to the fundamental teachings’ of Buddhism. Jonathan Christopher Cleary’s dissertation Zibo Zhenke: A Buddhist leader in Late Ming China likewise concludes that the syncretist thought of Zibo Zhenke was underpinned by a thoroughly Buddhist framework, and asserts that the late Ming witnessed no ‘qualitative decline’ or ‘loss of intellectual vigour’ relative to the Chinese Buddhist tradition’s more celebrated eras.

A more important development in studies of the cultural intersections between Buddhism and other traditions in the late Ming / early Qing – a development that presents an even stronger challenge to the notion of Buddhism being a passive recipient of cultural transfusion – is the idea of Buddhists actively co-opting secular cultural and intellectual phenomena or institutions into their tradition. Yū Chün-fang, for instance, states that in Hanshan Deqing’s engagement with other intellectual traditions, he adopted an ‘aggressive approach’ to appropriating the expressions of other traditions ‘to serve the purposes of Buddhism,’ and that he read ‘Buddhist meanings into Confucian texts…to make them conform to Buddhist teachings about the cultivation of the mind’. This stance contrasts with the position of Pei-yi Wu, who notes the Neo-Confucian flavour of Hanshan’s commentary on the Great Learning. Wu holds that, in his annalistic/chronological autobiography, Deqing’s ‘self identity as a Confucian hero seems to have overshadowed his Buddhist identity.’

Discussing another eminent late Ming monk, Ouyi Zhixu (蕅益智旭 1599-1655), Thomas Cleary’s The Buddhist I Ching – Chih-Hsu Ou-I provides a complete and accurate translation of Ouyi’s commentary on the Book of Changes – a work which Cleary states

---

33 Ibid.
34 ‘Chu-hung and Lay Buddhism in the Late Ming’ (the author given is Kristin Yū-Greenblatt, which is Yū Chün-fang’s former name) in de Bary (ed.) The Unfolding of Neo-Confucianism, pgs. 94-95.
37 Yū, ‘Ming Buddhism,’ pg. 939.
38 Ibid.
40 Ibid., pg. 86.
‘treats the I Ching in a systematic way from the point of view of Buddhist teaching and practice.’

In a similar vein, Jonathan Cleary investigates how Zibo Zhenke (紫柏真可 1543-1603) used the terminology of Neo-Confucianism and Taoism to promote Buddhist concepts and soteriological objectives.

The Buddhist Appropriation of the Poetics of ‘Loyalty’

It is this latter approach, which stresses the deployment of non-Buddhist cultural resources to promote Buddhist concepts and goals, that I feel is most fitting for the study of the distinctive monastic texts on poetry that this thesis examines, texts which were authored by monks renowned for their ‘loyalty’ to the Ming dynasty. Loyalty here means something broader than the ‘loyalism’ of those who remained devoted to the Ming cause after the dynasty had fallen; it refers to a broader sense of commitment to the dynasty as a cultural and political entity, including on the part of someone like Hanshan Deqing who died before the Ming fell but who was famous for his loyal devotion to the Ming throne. Zhong 忠 – loyalty – was a central value in Confucian political morality, affecting not only those who remained committed to a dynasty that had been overthrown, but also anyone devoted to his or her state and its values, particularly someone whose devotion was tested by political misfortune; these misfortunes and the sense of loyalty which was tested by them were a major topic for poetic expression throughout Chinese history. However, what is emphasized in this thesis is how the idea of being loyal was understood by late Ming-early Qing monks in Buddhist terms and was linked with their Buddhist mission. I argue that while the discourses on poetry composed by so-called ‘loyal’ monks appear on the surface to have strong links with ‘Confucian’ poetics, they follow what Yü has identified as a strategy/method of appropriating patently non-Buddhist concepts for Buddhist purposes. These discourses sought to envision how non-Buddhist poetic practices could ‘serve the purposes of Buddhism’ or ‘conform to Buddhist teachings about the cultivation of the mind.’

I would note, moreover, that my approach is not unprecedented in the study of the literary writings of the so-called loyal monks that are the subject of this study. An example is scholarship on the famous annalistic/chronological autobiography (nianpu 年譜) of Hanshan Deqing. As noted, Pei-yi Wu depicted this autobiography as the work of a man ‘deeply immersed in the mainstream of events’ whose ‘self identity as a Confucian hero seems to

42 In Cleary’s ‘Translator’s Introduction,’ pg. viii.
have overshadowed his Buddhist identity.’ However, Lynn Struve has more recently undertaken a thorough re-reading of this text, and has revealed how its narrative structure and prose are framed in a way that resonates with a prominent Buddhist model of spiritual progress, namely the ten stages of the Bodhisattva path (pusa shi di 菩薩十地). Struve’s approach demonstrates that applying knowledge of Buddhist thought can lead to new revelations about literary texts that might on the surface appear to be Confucian in their orientation, and which have previously been regarded as being largely devoid of religious significance. Her arguments also remind the reader that a monk’s commitment to Confucianism, even when it is sincere in itself, need not be seen as being antithetical to Buddhism. This is especially relevant in an intellectual environment marked by a syncretic harmonisation of the three teachings, where monks often emphasised the tenet of the Song monk Dahui Pujue (大慧普覚 1089-1163) that ‘the mind of Bodhi is the mind of loyalty and righteousness’ 菩提心則忠義心也.

However, scholarly work on the poetry or the writings about poetry produced by monks in the late Ming to early Qing period – especially the so-called ‘loyalist’ monks active after the collapse of the Ming proper – has until recently paid very little attention to the relationship that these apparently ‘secular’ texts had with the Buddhist thought and religious mission of their authors. Indeed, most scholarship on this subject – which is primarily in Chinese – proceeds from the premise that these monks were first and foremost Chinese patriots, loyalist leaders of monasteries which were centres of patriotism or even of ‘anti-Qing resistance.’ There is a general view that what makes these authors’ literary writings interesting is their value as a source for the study of loyalist literature and of Ming-Qing social history (especially for the study of ‘loyalist’ communities). A prime example of this is studies on Tianran Hanshi, one of the key subjects of this dissertation, that have generally neglected his Buddhist thought. The Chinese scholars Zhang Hong and Zhang Ling, for example, have noted in their recently-published Chinese-language study ‘An Overview of Recent Research on the Chan Master Tianran’ that even though there is a substantial number of publications

46 This is a core theme in Araki Kengo (荒木見悟), ‘Kin Shōki to Yō Gyozan’ 金正希と熊魚山, in his Min Shin shisō ronkō 《明清思想論考》 (Tokyo: Kenbun shuppansha, 1992), pgs. 129–186.
47 See Cai Hongsheng (蔡鴻生) ‘Qingchu Lingnan fomen shiliao congshu zongxu’ 〈清初嶺南佛門史料叢書總序〉 in Shi Hanshi, (释函昰); Qiu Jiang (仇江) and Li Fubiao (李福標) (collators/eds) Poetry Collection of the Blind Hall (Xiatang shi ji) 《瞎堂詩集》 (Guangzhou: Zhongshan daxue chubanse, 2006), pg. 1.
focusing on Tianran’s poetry and calligraphy, ‘there is still little in the way of research that
delves deeply into his Buddhist works, or which uses his commentaries on the Buddhist
canon to grasp the threads of his thought.’

However, in recent years there have been some attempts to bring Buddhist thought back into
the frame. At the forefront of this has been the highly respected intellectual and social
historian from Taiwan, Liao Chao-heng. In a paper discussing the literary theory of Tianran’s
principal disciple Jinshi Dangui (今釋澹歸 1614-1680), entitled ‘An analysis of Jinshi
Dangui’s Conception of Literature and Art and his Poetic Creation’, Liao notes that Dangui’s
religious views have often been left out of discussions on his ‘secular’ writings, but that in his
view, ‘Whether in terms of his views on literature and the arts, or in his actual literary
creation, from beginning to end Buddhism played an irreplaceable role for Dangui.’

The contention that Buddhist thought should have a prominent place in the interpretation of late
Ming / early Qing monastic literary theory and poetics more generally is a core theme in
Liao’s comprehensive work on what he refers to as monastic ‘cultural discourses’; his
Madhyānta, Poetry-Chan, Dream Play: The Appearance and Development of Late-Ming /
Early-Qing Buddhist Cultural Discourse. In this work, Liao’s arguments about the
importance of understanding Buddhist concepts for the study of monastic poetry are
advanced in his examination of the writings on poetry of the Ming-Qing transition-era monk
Juelang Daosheng, one of the monks studied in this dissertation. Liao’s compatriot Hsieh
Ming-yang has argued that Daosheng’s poetics, which placed a special emphasis on
indignation (怨), reflected his loyalist proclivities, and had foundations in secular
philosophy. Liao, however, asserts that Daosheng’s poetics, although they appear in places
to be Confucian-affiliated, were not simply loyalist in their orientation, but were also

---

49 ‘Jinshi Dangui zhi wenyiguan yu shici chuangzuo xilun’ 《今釋澹歸之文藝觀與詩詞創作析論》 in Yang (ed.) Tianran zhi guang, pgs. 246-247. Liao also states in this passage that Dangui ‘definitely did not fit the traditional definition of ‘loyalist,’ and argues that ‘the practice and verification of Buddhism…[is] manifest in
Dangui’s intuitive understandings of literature and literary expression.’
50 Liao, Zhong-bian, shi-chan, mengxi.
51 See ‘Ming yimin Juelang Daosheng yu Fang Yizhi ‘yuan’ de shixue jingshen’ 〈明遺民覺浪道盛與方以智「怨」的詩學精神〉 (Donghua renwen xuebao 《東華人文學報》No. 3, Jul. 2001), pgs. 433-462. In making this claim regarding Daosheng’s loyalism, Hsieh Ming-Yang asserts that Daosheng’s thought was indistinguishable from that of his disciple, the loyalist figure and tao chan monk Fang Yizhi (方以智), going so far as to say that the ‘ideas of the two men on poetics were mutually interpenetrating (漸) almost to the point that they cannot be directly differentiated and can be seen as an integrated discourse.’ See Hsieh, ‘Ming yimin Juelang Daosheng yu Fang Yizhi ‘yuan’ de shixue jingshen’ pg. 434.
representative of a trend in which ideas about the Chan of poetry (詩禪) had been affected by ‘a concern for society.’ Liao’s mentor Araki Kengo has asserted that for Daosheng the voicing of indignation also had a religious dimension, a view expressed in Araki’s use of the terms ‘Zen method of indignation’ (怨の禅法) or ‘Zen of the raging fire of patriotism’ (憂国烈火禅) to describe Daosheng’s thought. In other words, ways of writing about poetry that appear to follow Confucian models can best be understood as discourses on how non-Buddhist poetry can be co-opted into a mission to enlighten disciples.

The approach taken in this dissertation differs from that of Liao, in that it focuses on a close reading of a specific strand of discourse on poetry produced by a very small number of late Ming / early Qing monastic authors. However, taking my cue from Liao, I treat these texts on poetry as being a site for Buddhist appropriations, co-optations or interpretations of non-Buddhist ideas or literary practices to serve the purposes of Buddhism. Specifically, building on Araki Kengo’s arguments about the religious use of indignation, I elaborate the Buddhist foundations for these monks’ position that poetry which expresses anguished emotions such as feelings of grievance can be an instrument of Chan practice. In particular, I focus on the Buddhist interpretation of poetry associated with Confucian traditions of poetic catharsis. I make another new contribution, in the form of the argument that the key element in this Buddhist appropriation or interpretation was core ideas found in the poetics of the era about the literary value of zhen: genuineness or authenticity.

This returns us to the unique qualities of zhen and, in particular, its status as a point of intersection between, or holistic union of, an approach to literature, a response to historical events, and a stance on religious doctrine. The texts discussed in this thesis were the product of a distinctive historical milieu and of literary trends that reflected the zeitgeist of that era and may in turn tell us something about this historical and literary milieu. However, I would argue that they are fundamentally oriented to advancing the religious mission of their monastic writers. These religious commitments are evident in the fact that some of the texts appear in Buddhist genres such as collections of Chan recorded sayings. They are also evident in hitherto unexplored connections between the poetic discourses on the one hand, and on the other hand in the less-studied religious writings of the same authors and the

---

52 See Liao, Zhong-bian, shi-chan, mengxi, pgs. 51-60.
53 See Araki’s 2000 work Yukoku rekka zen: zenso Kakuro Dosei no tatakai 《憂國烈火禪──禅僧覺浪道盛のたたかい》 (Tokyo: Kenbun shuppansha). ‘Zen method of indignation’ (‘En no zenpō’ ‘怨の禅法’) is the title of chapter 5 (pgs. 79-92). This concept, and the question of ‘indignation’ in the poetics of Daosheng more generally, is the subject of a more detailed discussion in chapter 3.
writings of other religious thinkers with which these authors were affiliated, and the doctrinal trends that prevailed in their times. A core focus of this dissertation lies in exploring and elucidating the previously ignored connections that these writings have with Buddhist thought. The dissertation seeks to unveil previously unexplored ideas about the religious use of poetry in Chinese Buddhism, and to contribute to our knowledge of how monks’ understandings of Buddhist practice and enlightenment were transformed against the background of an intersection between a Buddhist literary revival and a chaotic era of dynastic transition. Moreover, it seeks to reappraise long-held ideas about why Buddhism was popular in periods of political and social turmoil, a subject that has long been dominated by narratives of a religion which indulged escapism by promoting transcendence or ‘detachment’ from an impure world.

Content and Chapters
The main body of this thesis is focused on writings on poetry that are, with a few minor exceptions, the works of three eminent loyal monks of the Ming-Qing transition period: the late Ming monk Hanshan Deqing, Juelang Daosheng from the Southern Ming period, and the early Qing cleric Tianran Hanshi. Each of these clerics lived through, and was profoundly affected by, the chaos and political violence that marked the period stretching between the final decades of the Ming and the consolidation of the Qing. While these authors did not necessarily address this historical context explicitly (even though they were all profoundly affected by it), each of these monks contributed new ideas that reflected not only his individual doctrinal proclivities, but also the historical specificities of his place in the transition process, as society moved from political decline (Hanshan) to war (Daosheng) to a post conflict period (Tianran).

To map this intellectual history to reflect this progression, I have addressed the ideas of each author in separate chapters that have been arranged chronologically. The content of each chapter can be summarised as follows:

1) Chapter Two discusses the ideas on poetry found in Hanshan Deqing's literary collection (and magnum opus), *The Dream Travels Collection of Old Man Hanshan* (*Hanshan laoren mengyou ji*). In an era of Ming decline marked by brutal factional struggles, Hanshan's active engagement with the political sphere caused him to be exiled to Lingnan. His sense of being wronged, as well as his ‘nightmarish’ experience of China's hell-
like tropical south, prompted him to seek solace in the cathartic poetry produced by or about banished loyal officials. Hanshan equated these poems with Chan because they depicted with authenticity two things which, in Buddhist idealist thought, could be a conduit to the realisation of truth: the experience of being in hell, and – more importantly – the perception of the outer world as dream-like (that is, ‘nightmare’-like). Just as the act of closely observing the absurdity of a dream can uncover its unreality as a mere projection of consciousness, Hanshan felt that authenticity (zhen) in recording the hellish ‘nightmare’ of exile could reveal that the mundane world is a dreamlike manifestation of the genuine mind (zhenxin 真心). Hanshan thought that this knowledge could be equated with ‘genuine Chan,’ arguably because it enabled him to discover the cool and pure in the midst of ‘heat and vexation’.

2) Chapter Three discusses the poetry theories of the Jiangnan-based loyalist monk Juelang Daosheng. Daosheng claimed to have been personally influenced by Hanshan's idea that poetry can be identified with Chan, and his theories are presented in a Chan textual genre, the Recorded Sayings of Juelang [Dao]sheng, Chan Master of Tianjie [Temple] (Tianjie Juelang-Sheng chanshi yulu) 《天界覺浪盛禪師語錄》. Daosheng's treatises on poetry often dealt with the problem of alleviating outrage which reflects his experiences of living through a violent era marked by ongoing conflict between the Manchu Qing and Ming resistance, and of suffering imprisonment as a result of political persecution. He argued that poetry that is sincere/authentic/genuine (zhen) or straightforward (zhi 直) in voicing indignation about injustice can relieve anger and promote moral rectitude in dark times, and that by doing so, it can realise Confucius’ tenet that 'poetry can express indignation' (shi ke yi yuan 詩可以怨). Daosheng linked this with Chan through a creative syncretism of his native Caodong school and other Confucian-affiliated Chinese intellectual traditions, in particular innate nature and sentiments (xingqing) theory and yin-yang thought. In particular, he contended that just as the ‘winter’ of direct indignation could prompt the return of 'spring', so too could the 'furnace' of suffering and 'dark' emotions nurture the return of the 'light' of genuine truth, a position with similarities to Hanshan’s idea that the scorching heat from the fires of a hellish scene can also be a source of illuminating light.

3) Chapter Four discusses the ideas about poetry of the early Qing Lingnan loyalist cleric Tianran Hanshi, who led a large congregation of Ming loyalists in the unsettled period of early Qing rule. Tianran wrote many prefaces for the poetry collections of gentry and
monastic authors, some of which were included in his collections of recorded sayings, *The Recorded Sayings of Chan Master Tianran* (*Tianran-Shi chanshi yulu*). By addressing poems that expressed anguished emotions, Tianran's writings followed in Hanshan’s and Daosheng’s traditions, and also deployed concepts derived from Buddhist doctrines such as karma theory, to advance the idea that being ‘genuine’ in voicing grievances could reveal the true mind of the author. However, as Qing rule gradually stabilised, he increasingly felt that some who valorised the expression of indignation had gone too far. Tianran felt that some people had lost sight of their true selves (by implication, their Buddha nature), when they sought to project emotional distress as evidence of the depth of their loyalty. Coinciding with the end of the transition period, his writings mark the movement away from monastic discourses which advocate being ‘genuine’ in expressing anguished emotions such as indignation in poetry.
Chapter 1. Background and Doctrine

Monastic poetry was composed on a truly grand scale in the late Ming / early Qing,\(^1\) and monastic writers of this era also produced a significant quantity of prose writing about poetry. Jiang Wu states that this period was marked by a ‘remarkable textual revival of Chan literature\(^2\) in which Chan transmission genealogies and collections of recorded sayings were

---

\(^1\) The immense scale of the production of monastic poetry in this era is noted by Liao Chao-heng in his Zhongbrian, shi-chan, pgs. 31-32. Jiang Qingbo (江慶柏) in his ‘Qing dai shiseng bieji de diancang ji jiansuo’ (清代詩僧別集的典藏及檢索) (Zhongguo gudian ya wenhua 《中國典籍與文化》, No. 2, 1997) calculated that there are approximately 210 extant collections of literary works by monks that date from the Qing (many of which contain poetry), at least two thirds of which are estimated to have been composed in the early Qing period (see Jiang, ‘Qing dai shiseng bieji de diancang ji jiansuo’, pgs. 15-17). Many of these literary collections either featured a substantial volume of poetry or were exclusively poetry collections. Among the better known examples of works of this kind (including some late Ming works) are the Snow Mountain Draft (Xueshan cao) of Xueshan Fagao (雪山法杲 ?-1609?); the Mountain Residence Poems of Chan Master Sanfeng [Han]zhang (Sanfeng Zang chanshi shanju shi) 《三峰藏禪師山居詩》 by Hanyue Fazang (漢月法藏 1573-1653), The Nanlai Hall Poetry Collection of the Monk Cangxue (Cangxue heshang Nanlaitang shiji) 《蒼雪和尚南來堂詩集》 of Cangxue Nanlai (蒼雪南來 1588-1656), the lengthy Poems of Ancient and Contemporary Monks (Gu jin seng shi) 《古今僧詩》 of Chaoyong (超永) (mentioned in his Complete Works of the Five Lamps (Wu deng quan shu) 《五燈全書》 (CBETA, X81, No.1571), fascicle 100); The Poetry Collection of Qianshan (Qianshan shiji) 《千山詩集》 of Qianshan Hanke (千山涵可 1611-1659); The Unfettered Vihāra Collection (Xiaoyuan ji) 《翛園集》 and Draft from the Monastery of Wooden Offcuts (Jue‘an cao) 《欲庵草》 of Dandang Puhe (擔當普荷 1593-1673); Jinshi Dangui’s substantial Collected Writings of the Hall of All-Pervading Movement (Bianxing tangji) 《偏行堂集》, and the Liliu Hall Collection (Liliu tang ji) 《離六堂集》 of Shilian Dahan (石蓮大汕 1633-1702?). In addition to these, a sizeable volume of poetry was included in ‘recorded sayings’ collections. For instance, the Recorded Sayings of Chan Master Tianran Hanshi (Tianran Hansi chanshi yulu) 《天然和尚詩語錄》 contained – in an appendix – two collections: ‘The Plum Blossom Poems of the Monk Tianran’ (Tianran heshang meihua shi) 《天然和尚梅花詩》, and ‘Snow Poems of Old Man Tian[ran] of Danxia’ (Danzxia Tian laoren xueshi) 《丹霞天老人雪詩》. A number of such texts, such as the Recorded Sayings of the Monk Yishan (Yishan heshang yulu) 《雨山和尚語錄》, featured a combination of secular-style ‘shi’ (詩) (many of which contained the word shi in the title) and more conventional Buddhist gāthā or ‘jì’ 偈, with both types of poem being placed together in one sub-section (titled with the older term shijì 詩偈, which can also simply mean gāthā). Poetry is also found in the Recorded Sayings of Chan Master Boshan Suru Han (Boshan Suru Han chanshi yulu) 《博山粟如瀚禪師語錄》, Recorded Sayings of Chan Master Zhufeng Min (Zhufeng Min chanshi yulu) 《竺峰敏禪師語錄》, Recorded Sayings of Chan Master Zhaojue Zhufeng Xu (Zhaojue Zhufeng Xu chanshi yulu) 《昭覺竹峰續禪師語錄》, and Recorded Sayings of Chan Master Huanzhu Ming (Huanzhu Ming chanshi yulu) 《幻住明禪師語錄》. A discussion of the idea that there is a close relationship between shi poetry and gāthā is found in the Recorded Sayings of the Monk Zhanzhuo of the Bamboo Grove (Zhitulun Zhanzhuo heshang yulu) 《紫竹林善禪和尚語錄》 of Hanshan’s disciple Zhanzhuo Guanheng (顛愚觀恒 1579-1646) (Jiaxing Tripítaka, volume 28, pgs. 697-698). One reason why the number of monastic poets and the number of collections of poetry composed by monks in this period is so large is that many gentry poets who wished to escape Qing persecution and/or avoid serving the Qing joined Buddhist monastic orders at the fall of the Ming often continued to compose poetry. (A substantial portion of the poetry composed by these monks was proscribed in the Qianlong era (1735-1796), so it should be assumed that the lists of collections/authors are very far from complete). The doctoral dissertation of Li Shunchen (李舜臣), ‘Qingchu Lingnan shiseng qun yanjiu’ (清初嶺南詩僧群研究) (PhD dissertation, Sun Yat-sen University, 2003), for instance, lists around 160 ‘loyalist’ or ‘tao chan’ monastic authors from the Lingnan region alone (a list that is probably not exhaustive). I discuss the impact of ‘tao chan’ on the composition of poetry in Buddhist monasteries in more detail in the body of this thesis, especially in the chapter on Tianran, where I introduce sources that give more information on the scale of the production of poetry in monasteries in the early Qing.

\(^2\) Wu, Enlightenment in Dispute, pg. 5.
the predominant genres. However, the monastic poetry that emerged at that time rivalled and may even have surpassed the volume of these Chan writings. Furthermore, as Liao Chao-heng observes, writing about poetry became a pervasive cultural practice in Buddhist monasteries during this time.\(^3\) Late Ming / early Qing Buddhist writings on poetry did not achieve the sophistication of the revered ‘Poetical forms’ (Shi shi 《詩式》) of the Tang monastic theorist Jiaoran (皎然 fl. late 8th century CE), or the Bunkyō Hifuron 《文鏡秘府論》 of Kūkai (空海 774–835). However, unlike these earlier authors, monastic writers on poetry from the late Ming / early Qing did not focus on literary theory, but mainly sought to address poetry’s relationship with Buddhism. These writers included many of the most famous religious thinkers of the revival era – figures such as Zibo Zhenke, Xuelang Hong’en (雪浪洪恩 1545-1608), Xuejiao Yuanxin (雪嶠圓信 1571-1647), Dandang Puhe (擔當普荷 1593-1673), Ouyi Zhixu (1599-1655), Azi Jinwu (阿字今無 1633-1681) and Jifei Ruyi (即非如一 1616-1671, also known by the Japanese version of his name, Sokuhi Nyoitsu).\(^4\) A number of these monks asserted that poetry was not just a useful tool for advancing religious goals, but could in fact be directly identified with Chan. Dandang Puhe, for instance, said that ‘feng [that is, the art of poetry] is Chan’ 風即禪;\(^5\) Jifei Ruyi asserted that ‘poetry is the Chan of the written word’ 詩即文字之禪,\(^6\) and we can argue that these statements point to the central place of poetry in the wider revival of Chan Buddhism and Chan literature that occurred in the late Ming / early Qing. Many monks of this period revered the concept of the ‘Chan of the written word’ or literary Chan (wenzi chan 文字禪) that had originally been proposed by the Song cleric and poet Juefan Huihong (覺範慧洪 1071-1128), and it seems that this concept had significant implications for their view of the religious value of poetry. Overall, we can argue that the Chan of poetry (shi chan 詩禪) had a very important place in revival-era

\(^3\) Liao, Zhong-bian, shi-chan, pg. 32.
\(^4\) While I am not aware of a comprehensive list of monastic poeticians in the late-Ming / early-Qing era, the names of many are included in Liao’s Zhong-bian, shi-chan.
\(^5\) Yu Jiahua (余嘉華), Yang Kaida (楊開達) (coll., eds.), Dandang shiwen quanji 《擔當詩文全集》 (Kunming: Yunnan renmin chubanshe, 2003), pg. 175. For a brief discussion, see Liao’s Zhong-bian, shi-chan, pgs. 20-21.
\(^6\) Complete Records of Chan Master Jifei (Jifei chanshi quan lu) 《即非禪師全録》, fascicle 25 (in Jiaxing Tripitaka, volume 37), pg. 736. The early Qing ‘loyalist’ monk and poet/artist Shilian Dashan (石濂大汕 1633-1702) stated that ‘if you talk about poetry in the context of poetry itself, you can talk about poetry and talk about Chan. If you talk about Chan separately from poetry, you cannot talk about poetry’ 在詩言詩，便可即詩言禪；離詩言禪，不可以言詩. See his Record of Events from Beyond the Seas (Haiwai jishi) 《海外紀事》, in Wan Yi (萬毅) et al. (eds.) Dashan heshang ji 《大汕和尚集》 (Guangzhou: Zhongshan daxue chubanshe, 2007), pg. 381.
Buddhist thought and soteriological practice.\footnote{According to Liao, ‘After Huihong Juefan of the Song era advanced this theme of ‘literary Chan,’ it could be said that the issue of engagement between Chan and poetry came to be completely concentrated in discussions concerning ‘literary Chan.’ (Zhong-bian, shi-chan, pg. 10). A discussion of how Juefan and his model of ‘literary Chan’ came to be widely valorised in the monasteries of the late-Ming / early Qing era, can be found in Liao’s Zhong-bian, shi-chan, pgs. 36-46.}

While the scale of this trend of writing about poetry was distinctive, its advocacy of the merging of poetry and Chan was not unique, as it arose against the background of a longstanding Buddhist tradition of writings that addressed how poetry could be used as an instrument of Chan practice.\footnote{A large number of modern scholars have discussed the theories of the relationship between poetry and Buddhism/Chan that were prevalent prior to the late Ming. Arguably the most significant is Sun Changwu (孫昌武), Chan si yu shi qing 《禪思與詩情》 (Expanded edition, Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 2006). An overview of mainland Chinese scholarship in this field can be found in the introduction composed by Ge Zhaoguang (葛兆光) for Ge’s edited volume Zhongguo zongjiao yu wenxue lunji 《中國宗教與文學論集》 (Beijing: Qinghua daxue chubanshe, 1998).} It also emerged in a time when the relationship between Chan and poetry was one of the most commonly and vigorously debated themes in mainstream literary theory. In the late Ming, intense controversy surrounded the idea of ‘taking Chan as a metaphor for poetry’ (yi Chan yu shi 以禪喻詩), an idea first advanced by the famous Song theorist Yan Yu (嚴羽 1191-1241).\footnote{In the introduction to his Zhong-bian, shi-chan, Liao Chao-heng states that ‘from the Song dynasty to the early Qing, in the field of traditional Chinese poetics, [the relationship between Chan and poetry as advanced] in [Yan Yu’s concept of] ‘poetry as a metaphor for Chan,’ or [in the statement] ‘poetry and Chan are the same’ [which was advanced by Wang Shizhen], was throughout [this period] one of the most important subjects of the entire poetics tradition.’ (pg. 6). For Liao’s discussions of Yan Yu’s influence, see Zhong-bian, shi-chan, pgs. 68-73, 75-78, 89-92, and 92-104.} But while the new monastic poetry trend was connected with earlier Buddhist literary movements\footnote{Liao Chao-heng sees a sharp disconnection between the new ways of writing on poetry that emerged in the late Ming monastery and the writings of monks in previous eras. Pointing to the examples of Shi shi and the Bunkyô Hifuron that are mentioned above, Liao notes that earlier writings were largely concerned with issues of literary technique and ‘setting’ (jing 境) – that is, with questions about the ontological or epistemological status of the visual object, while the later ones were concerned with ‘discussions on the historical environment and the cultural context’ (Zhong-bian, shi-chan, pg. 16). While I accept that there is a definite theoretical and discursive disjuncture between these new writings and those of monks in earlier times, there are definite connections between them. In some ways the new trend can be regarded as partially a development of earlier monastic theories. These connections include ideas found in Jiaoran’s Shi shi, a text whose religious meaning have been the subject of considerable debate in both English and Chinese-language scholarship.} and contemporary mainstream ones, it was different from both.\footnote{Liao Chao-heng points out that from the late Ming / early Qing, poeticians – whether for or against the idea that Chan and poetry were closely interrelated – began to move away from Yan Yu’s model of ‘taking Chan as a metaphor for poetry’ (Liao, Zhong-bian, shi-chan pgs. 92-104). According to Liao, many of those who emphasised a connection between Buddhism and poetry moved towards the Yogacara school (what can be roughly called the strand of idealist thought in Buddhism). See especially pgs. 12-15, 97-104 of Liao, Zhong-bian, shi-chan. Liao argues that monastic theories that emphasised ‘social ethics’ and ‘unveiling the secret codes of the sacred’ were derived in part from Yogacara concepts (see Zhong-bian, shi-chan, pgs. 12-21). In my observation, Yogacara thought, while appearing in the works of monks including Hanshi Deqing and Fang Yizhi (方以智 1611-1671 – who was often known after his ordination as Yaodi Yuzhe (藥地愚者) – was far more}
of this dissertation: that Buddhist enlightenment (‘Chan’) could be attained by writing and reading poems that were authentic in expressing anguished emotional responses to traumatic events. This departed from the tradition that Chan was best realised in poems that expressed the tranquillity and detachment of their authors; it was also seemingly in conflict with a fundamental tenet of Buddhist ethical and soteriological thought, namely the idea that agitated or ‘defiled’ emotional states are one of the largest obstacles or obstructions (zhang 障 āvarana) to spiritual advancement.

I argue that shifts occurring in reform-era Buddhist doctrine and religious values were partly responsible for the upsurge in monastic poetry writing and the radical new ideas about poetry that appeared in the late Ming. However, I also contend that the way in which poetry came to be used (and more specifically the types of poems that came to be composed) in Jiangnan monastic and lay communities was an equally important factor in shaping these new developments. When discussing poetry writing and how it could be aligned or identified with Chan, the monks of this era predominantly sought to explore the impetuses that drove authors to compose poems (in particular those dealing with traumatic experiences) and to examine what effect poems had upon their readers. In other words, the monks’ Buddhist discourses explored the roles and meaning that poems had in the lives of the people in the communities they served. To better understand the motivations of the writers and readers of poetry, monks drew from a broader corpus of mainly Confucian (or Confucian-affiliated) ideas about poetry. Liao Chao-heng sees these monastic poetry writings not so much as poetic texts, but as ‘cultural discourses’ (文化論述). This term recognises the connection of these texts with, and their contribution to, the creation of the new bonds between the gentry and monastic worlds that emerged in this period. Liao believes that the late Ming / early Qing upsurge in monastic poetry writing was caused not by the prevalence of ideas about the relationship between Chan and poetry, or by the rise of Buddhist-Confucian syncretism as an abstract prevalent in the poetics of lay Buddhist disciples than it was in that of monastic authors. Another key factor that Liao perhaps does not adequately address is the influence of Gongan thought on monastic poetics, in particular the influence of the Gongan tenet of ‘genuineness’. Of particular importance is the possibility that monks’ understanding of ‘genuineness’ as the quality of being ‘down to earth’ and located in the ‘here and now’ might in some ways have been a rejection of the idea of ‘unveiling the secret codes of the sacred’. For a more lengthy discussion of some of the different understandings of the relationship between poetry and Chan that were circulating in the late Ming / early Qing see Liao’s ‘Minmatsu Shinsho no bungei shicho to bukkyō’ (明末清初の文藝思潮と仏教) (PhD dissertation, Tokyo University, 2001), chapters 3 and 4.

12 The choice of the term ‘cultural discourses’ or ‘cultural discussions’ shows not only the fact that Liao is not exclusively interested in poetics (the main focus of his Zhong-bian, shi-chan), but also that writings on poetry from this era included ‘discussions of the historical environment and cultural context’ (Liao, Zhong-bian, shi-chan, pg. 16).
intellectual enterprise, but by new ways in which monks participated in gentry culture. Citing the late Ming scholar Zhong Xing (鍾惺 1574-1624), Liao contends that the distinctive new ways of thinking about poetry emerging in the Buddhist monasteries at this time had their roots in ‘the marrying of the gentry and the saṅgha’.13

Clerical-Gentry Relations from the Late Ming to the Early Qing – the Case of Loyal Monks

What was this marrying between monks and the gentry and what relationship did it have with the new ideas about Buddhism and poetry that emerged in the late Ming? It should be first noted that poetry had long been used by monks to promote literary interaction with gentry officials, and, in particular, to cultivate relations with gentry elites and strengthen connections to elite culture. Since early times, this strategy had included exchanging knowledge of, and reflections upon, poetic technique and theory.14 However, the distinctive Buddhist theories of poetry that emerged in the late Ming were products of the new and very different ways that monks and officials (and monastic and gentry culture) came together in this period. A critical aspect of these changes was political and social upheaval – specifically, the process that began with the gradual decline of the Ming dynasty and extended into the prolonged and chaotic transition to Manchu Qing rule.

13 See Liao, Zhong-bian, shi-chan, pg. 32. Liao asserts that the new trend of theorising in poetry was part of a wider ‘social movement.’
14 Scholars often focus on the Tang as the period in which highly skilled monastic poeticians discussed poetry with gentry literary theorists – the most famous examples being the monks Guanxiu (貫休 823-912), Qiji (齊己 863-937) (who composed ‘The Fundamental Tenets and Formal Rules of Feng and Sao’ (Feng sao zhi ge)《風騷旨格》, and the above-mentioned Jiaoran and Kūkai. However, there is evidence that the phenomenon of monks discussing poetics with gentry literati was established much earlier in Chinese Buddhist history. In his Chan si yu shi qing, Sun Changwu provides a detailed account of the extent to which famous poet-monks of the Eastern Jin era – especially Huiyuan (慧遠 334-416) and Zhi Daolin (支道林 314-366) – interacted with well-known gentry/literati, who included Wang Xizhi (王羲之 303-361), Sun Chuo (孫绰 314—371), Xie Anshi (謝安石 320-385), Wang Qia (王洽 323-358), and Xie Lingyu (謝靈運 385-433), the patriarch of the ‘Mountain and Water’ genre (see Sun, Chan si yu shi qing, pgs. 65-67). In addition, a biographical account of Dao’an (道安 312-385) contained in the Liang dynasty texts Collection of Notes from Beyond the Tripitaka (Chu sanzang ji ji)《出三藏記集》 (composed by the well-known Liang Dynasty monk Seng You (僧祐 445-518)) states that ‘The sons and younger brothers of the gentry of Chang’an who could compose poetry all deferred and paid homage to him. He discussed the Airs (feng) and Elegantiae (ya) of the Book of Odes with the scholar Yang Hongzhong; all [his expositions] were intriguing’ 長安中衣冠子弟為詩賦者，皆依附致譽。與學生[士]楊弘仲論詩風雅，皆有理致 (Fascicle 15 (CBETA, T55, no. 2145, p. 108, c5-6). For a discussion on this, see also Tso Sze-bong [曹仕邦] Zhongguo shamen waixue yanjiu: Hanmo zhi Wudai 《中國沙門外學的研究:漢末至五代》 (Taipei: Dongchu chubanshe, 1994), pgs. 251-252.
The relationship between the Buddhist clergy and the gentry that unfolded in the period of Ming decline and fall had an important precursor in the Wanli period (1572-1620). This has been the subject of an extensive study by Timothy Brook, whose 1993 book *Praying for Power: Buddhism and the Formation of Gentry Society in Late Ming China* focuses on how gentry officials organised benevolent activities in association with Buddhist temples. In the late Ming, the leaders of well-established monasteries in the Jiangnan region shifted from being objects of gentry benefaction to being partners with the gentry in addressing problems that affected the common people. Furthermore, when social and political order began to break down later in the Ming, this shared emphasis on material welfare came to be complemented by monks following their gentry brethren in expressing a greater concern with, and a stronger intellectual interest in, social ethics and public morality. Araki Kengo’s 1992 work ‘Kin Shōki to Yō Gyozan’ 〈金正希と熊魚山〉 ['Jin Zhengxi [1598-1645] and Xiong Yushan [1600-1676]'], which discusses this trend, shows how monks sought to reconcile this concern for social ethics with their core religious beliefs, primarily by attempts to link new ideas on innate moral knowledge that were promoted by the Wang Yangming ‘School of Mind’ with the tenet of the Song dynasty monk Dahui Pujue (1089-1163) that ‘the mind of Bodhi is the mind of loyalty and righteousness’ 菩提心則忠義心也. This development and its ramifications for monastic culture have been comprehensively studied in Liao Chao-heng’s *Zhongxiao puti* 《忠孝菩提》 [Loyalty, Filial Piety and Bodhi], which notes the prominence from the late Ming onwards of a class of eminent monks renowned for their ‘loyalty and filial piety.’ Liao has noted elsewhere that the new focus on social ethics in the writings of these loyal monks made its way into the discussions on the poetry-Chan

---

16 The wide range of benevolent activities undertaken by monasteries during that period is also briefly discussed in Chün-Fang Yü’s *The Renewal of Buddhism*, pg. 25.
17 See Araki, *Min Shin shiso ronko*, pgs. 129–186. Araki sees a relationship between growth of interest in social ethics in the monastery and historical events connected with the decline of the Ming – including ‘tao chan,’ or the phenomena of loyalists joining the Buddhist order to avoid serving the Qing. The relation between this trend and the monastery’s reaction to political chaos and transition is also addressed by Liao in *Zhong-bian, shi-chan*, pgs. 51-52.
18 See previous footnote.
19 This class of monks and their ideas on this matter are the core subject of Liao’s 2013 work *Zhongxiao puti: Wan Ming Qingchu kongmen yimin ji qi jieyi lunshu lanxi* 《忠孝菩提: 晚明清初空門遺民及其節義論述探析》 (Taipei: Zhongyang yanjiuyuan Zhongguo wenzhesuo), which provides a social and intellectual history of ‘loyal’ monks in the Ming-Qing era.
relationship that were taking place in the monasteries of that time. One reflection of the cultural shifts cited by Liao is the fact that the monastic poetry of the Song era came to replace Tang monastic poetry as the model for late Ming monastic poets. Of particular importance in this development was the so-called 'Chan of the written word' of Huihong Juefan – a monk who was subsequently reinvented as an exemplar of ‘loyalty, righteousness and moral integrity in the Chan tradition’

Monks as Persecuted Officials – Poetry and Writing on Exile

At the same time that these social and cultural changes were occurring, there were new intersections between the lives of officials and monks in the sphere of politics. These intersections were especially evident in the case of the growing number of eminent ‘loyal’ monks who were directly exposed to the political violence that became prevalent in the last decades of the Ming. This development occurred in two phases. Firstly, as the brutal factional intrigue symptomatic of dynastic decline accelerated from the last decades of the sixteenth century onwards, monks who remained engaged with the political sphere increasingly found themselves the subject of political violence and persecution, much as many of their gentry brethren did. This phenomenon has been addressed by Dewei Zhang's dissertation 'A Fragile Revival: Chinese Buddhism Under the Political Shadow, 1522-1620,' which explores how a number of well-connected monks at the forefront of the late Ming revival came to experience political persecution. These monks included a vocal advocate of the literary Chan of Huihong, Zibo Zhenke, and Hanshan Deqing, whose writings on poetry are the subject of the following chapter. As we shall see, Hanshan’s experience of persecution led him to engage with the poetry that was associated with the archetype of the exiled ‘loyal’ Confucian official.

Gentry as Objects of Compassion – Tao Chan and the Poetics of ‘Indignation’

The second phase in the transformation of the dangers and discontents experienced by ‘loyal’ gentry and monks occurred when the period of Ming dynastic decline was superseded by the era of the brutal campaign of the Manchu Qing dynasty to establish its rule in Jiangnan. In

---

20 Liao, Zhong-bian, shi-chan, pg. 53.
21 Ibid., pg. 18.
22 PhD dissertation, University of British Columbia, 2010. The example of Zibo Zhenke is discussed on pgs. 150-157. The issue of monks drawing parallels between their fate and that of ‘loyal’ officials of antiquity is discussed by Zhang in detail in the first chapter of his dissertation.
this period, eminent monks linked with the Ming ceased to be simply loyal and became instead adherents of a fallen dynasty, or loyalists. These loyalist monks shared with associates from the Ming gentry a deep sense of grief at the loss of the state that was the common object of their loyalty. In this context, monks who were vocal in their opposition to Qing rule, such as the poet-monk Qianshan Hanke (千山函可 1611-1659), became, like their gentry peers, victims of political persecution at the hands of the incoming dynasty.23

The merging of loyal (or loyalist) monks with the gentry occurred on a greater scale and took a very different form from what had obtained earlier in the Ming, as many loyalist officials flocked to Buddhist orders to escape persecution or to avoid serving the Qing.24 This phenomenon occurred principally in Jiangnan, which was a site of refuge for gentry in the north escaping first of all from the chaos of the rebellion led by Li Zicheng (李自成 1606-1645) and then from the southward expansion of the Qing. The numbers taking refuge in monasteries at this time appear to have been very large; Lynn Struve has stated that the Ming-Qing transition saw Ming loyalists and refugees escape to Buddhist monasteries (tao chan 逃禅) ‘on a scale unprecedented in any previous transition,’25 while the poet He Gongdao (何鞏道 1642-1676), an affiliate of Tianran Hanshi’s Haiyun order (海雲系), went so far as to state that in the Lingnan region, ‘in the last ten years, half the members of the distinguished families have become monks’ 十年王謝半為僧.26 Many of these tao chan figures converged on the so-called 'loyalist' Buddhist orders – that is, those headed by 'loyal’ monastic leaders. Many of these orders were based in southern regions, such as Guizhou and Yunnan, and in Jiangnan, Fujian, and Lingnan (Guangdong) in particular. A number of the leaders of these ‘loyal’ orders wrote texts about poetry. Two of them – Juelang Daosheng from Tianjie temple in Nanjing and Lingnan’s Tianran Hanshi, monks who led what Chinese scholars consider to

23 An excellent work on Hanke which emphasises his struggles as an exiled ‘loyalist’ poet after the fall of the Ming is Lawrence C. H. Yim’s chapter ‘Loyalism, Exile, Poetry: Revising the Monk Hanke’ (in Idema et al. (eds.) Trauma and Transcendence), pgs. 149-198.
24 Lawrence Yim’s The Poet-historian Qian Qianyi (London; New York: Routledge, 2009), for example, states that the policies of the Qing ‘caused considerable distress to those eminent Chinese who wished to remain non-committal to the new dynasty’ (pg. 46).
26 In ‘Reminiscing while Sitting in a Thatched Cottage on Mount Xi on the Fifteenth Day of the First Lunar Month.’ (‘Yuanxi zuo zai Xicao tang ganjiu’) (元夕坐西山草堂感舊) (in Yuechao shi ji 《邀巢詩集》, fascicle 4 (cited in Qu Longlin (璩龍林) ‘Xiatang shifeng qiantan – jian yu Qianshan shi bijiao’ (瞎堂詩風淺探—兼與千山詩比較) (in Yang (ed.), Tianran zhi guang, pg. 180)). The term Wang Xie 王謝 in the quote is a literary trope used to refer to distinguished families.
be the largest tao chan orders – are studied in this thesis.27

The tao chan phenomenon in the Ming-Qing transition, as noted, differed from preceding historical examples not only in scale but also in the forms that it took. The scholar Shao Tingcai (邵廷采 1648-1711) declares in his Record of What is Known of the Remnant Subjects of the Fallen Ming Dynasty (Ming yimin suozhi zhuan) 《明遺民所知傳》 that ‘in the last years of the Ming, former officials and righteous gentlemen often sought refuge in Buddhist monasteries in order to remain faithful to their ideals….The phenomenon of there being many ‘remnant subjects’ (yimin) in the community of monks started with the end of the Ming.’28 This statement is presented in a passage which compares the predicament of Ming loyalists to loyal adherents of the Southern Song dynasty (1127-1279), which had been replaced by the Yuan dynasty (1271-1368) – which, like the Qing, was led by conquerors from Inner Asia. The key point that Lawrence Yim draws from this passage is that while the Yuan allowed many loyal officials to live out the remainder (or part of the remainder) of their lives in eremitic retirement, very soon after coming to power the Manchu regime issued a demand that Ming adherents should serve the Qing dynasty. According to Yim, this ‘caused considerable distress to those eminent Chinese who wished to remain non-committal [sic] to the new dynasty.’29 As a result, the wave of tao chan that occurred in the early Qing was, in the estimations of many, substantially larger than that in the early Yuan. This, in turn, meant that many of those loyal to the fallen dynasty who joined Buddhist orders in the early Qing were people who would not have done so had circumstances been the same...

---

27 In his preface to Jiang Boqin (姜伯勤) Shilian Dashan yu Aomen Chan shi 《石濂大汕與澳門禪史》 (Shanghai: Xuelin chubanshe, 1999), Jao Tsung-i [Rao Zongyi] (饒宗頤), discusses the composition of the different Buddhist orders in this period. See chapter 4 of this thesis for details). Cai Hongsheng (蔡鴻生) in ‘Qingchu Lingnan fomen shiliao congkan zongxu’ (清初嶺南佛門史料叢刊總序) lists three main leaders – Tianran, Hongchu (弘儲 1605-1673) from Lingyan temple in Suzhou in Jiangnan, and Dandang [Puhe] from Mount Jixu in southern Yunnan, in Tianran (Qi Jiang (仇江), Li Fubiao (李福標) (eds)) Xiaotang shi ji 《瞎堂詩集》 (Reprint, Guangzhou: Zhongshan daxue chubanshe, 2006), pg. i). A survey with an accompanying discussion of ‘loyalist’ monks in Yunnan and Guizhou can be found in Chen Yuan (陳垣), Mingji Dian Qian Fojiao kao 《明季滇黔佛教考》 (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, Rpt. 1962).

28 Cited in CaiHongsheng (蔡鴻生), Qingchu Lingnan fomen shilüe 《清初嶺南佛門事略》 (Guangzhou: Guangdong gaodeng jiaoyu chubanshe, 1997), pg. 17. An alternative translation and discussion of this passage can be found in Lawrence Yim’s The Poet-historian Qian Qianyi (London; New York, Routledge, 2009), pgs. 46-48.

29 The Poet-Historian Qian Qianyi, pg. 47. The importance of the analogy with the Song is not only discussed extensively in The Poet-historian Qian Qianyi, but is mentioned also by Wai-yee Li in her introduction to Idema et al. (eds.) Trauma and Transcendence. As Li succinctly states, for Ming loyalists who were seeking to frame their predicament and the events of dynastic transition, ‘the favoured historical analogy…was the fall of the Song dynasty, probably because both of these debacles involved foreign conquests’ (pg. 40).
as they were in the early Yuan (that is, when loyalists could, in the words of Zhao, ‘still enjoy freedom in cliffs and valleys’). The loyalists who entered the monastery in the Ming-Qing transition were thus of a very different type from those in previous periods of dynastic transition (especially in transitions that involved ‘barbarian’ conquest), who had become monks largely as a matter of their own choice, and not because they lacked alternatives.

Who were these loyalists, and how were they different from their predecessors? Before addressing this question I will note the distinction, elaborated by Wai-yee Li, between two types of loyalists: eremitic subjects (yimin 逸民) who can be considered to have been loyalists only in a broad sense, and remnant subjects, (yimin 遺民) who were more quintessentially loyalist.

The term eremitic subject refers to those who were loyal to a vanquished regime and who withdrew into eremitic seclusion after that regime had perished rather than continuing to covet the advantages of office-holding (that is, to serve in the new administration of the conquerors). According to Wai-yee Li, the term designates those for whom ‘withdrawal from the world’ – the decision to ‘leave the world and stand alone’ (yishi duli 遺世獨立) – was an ideal or unproblematic choice in response to dynastic change. For Li, it ‘implies equanimity, conscious choice, and a context that accepts this behaviour as reasonable.’ The loyalists who entered Buddhist orders in earlier eras of dynastic transition can be seen as ‘eremitic subjects’. Their attitudes and way of living could easily be reconciled with conventional Buddhist monastic ideals – in particular the notion that becoming a monk requires a commitment to ‘enter into the gate of emptiness’ (ru kongmen 入空門), that is, to depart from the (political) world.

Remnant subjects are described by Wai-yee Li as those ‘left behind by the former dynasty’ (qianchao zhi suo yi 前朝之所遺). Remnant subjects were quintessentially loyalist, in that they were people who retained overt loyalty to, or at least a longing for, the fallen regime. For Li, the term thus implies ‘a fate suffered when one is ‘left behind by the former dynasty’, leading to an ‘unappeased longing for a lost world, as well as irrevocable alienation from the

30 Translation in Yim’s The Poet-historian Qian Qianyi, pg. 46.
31 See Idema et al. (eds) Trauma and Transcendence, pg. 8.
32 Ibid.
33 Ibid.
new order and inevitable tension with it.’ Accordingly, remnant subjects often did not embrace the eremitic ideal, but remained ‘deeply engaged with moral, social, and political issues’ – an engagement marked often by inner conflict or dissatisfaction. In other words, they maintained values and ways of thinking that were in many respects not fully compatible with the eremitic flavour and religious ideals associated with conventional models of Chinese Buddhist monastic life and practice. However, these values were arguably ones that the Buddhist orders of engaged and 'loyal' monks that had burgeoned in the late Ming period would have accommodated more easily – or at least viewed more sympathetically – than their counterparts in earlier times would have.

In sum, the available evidence suggests that upon the fall of the Ming a great many remnant subjects entered into (or took up residence in) monasteries. Some of them took refuge temporarily as lay devotees. Others were formally ordained but maintained Confucian values and a Confucian worldview, and celebrated their position as remnant subjects in spite of their status as monks (Wai-yee Li calls this 'new styles of monasticism'). Others, such as Jinshi Dangui, embraced their monastic identity but made engagement with the world a distinguishing characteristic of their religious practice, and even on occasions called the cloistered model of monastic life into question. It would appear that Shao Tingcai was referring to these types of people when he stated that ‘former officials and righteous gentlemen’ had entered into the Buddhist monastery in great numbers for the first time at the end of the Ming dynasty. The new and distinctive intersection between monastic and gentry worlds that resulted from this influx is what set the scene for the new writings on poetry that emerged from the 'loyal' monasteries in the Ming-Qing transition.

34 Ibid.
35 Wai-yee Li states: ‘in other words, eremitism implies the rejection of politics and history, whereas being a remnant subject is by definition a political stance responding to a historical situation.’ Ibid.
36 According to Li, as a result of the coerced ‘conversion’ of remnant subjects to Buddhism, ‘some monks continued their political activism covertly…Others cultivated social connections,… avowed Confucian connections, made a point of ‘being neither a monk nor laity’… or advertised their ambivalence, entering Buddhist orders only to leave them again’ (Idema et al. (eds.) Trauma and Transcendence, pg. 10-11). Li also lists Tianran’s disciple Jinshi Dangui as a monk who remained committed to a secular ‘Confucian' identity. The idea that Dangui remained a ‘loyalist in a monk’s garb’ has, however, been rebutted by Liao Chao-heng (see chapter 4 of this dissertation).
37 The example of Dangui is discussed in Liao’s Zhongxiao puti. According to Liao, ‘Dangui felt deeply dissatisfied with those loyalists who merely spoke vainly about principles of righteousness, yet did not have any concrete measures for saving the masses.’ (pg. 40). Liao also quotes a passage from Dangui’s Recorded sayings collection in which, in a pointed criticism of his dharma brother and fellow tao chan loyalist Qu Dajun (屈大君 1630-1696), he states that ‘today if someone carrying a stone were to jump into a river [that is, were to attempt to commit suicide], monks would not only ignore him, they would even give him a push.’ (Cited in Liao, Zhongxiao puti, pg 40.)
'Married' in Indignation – Changing Gentry-Clerical Relations and the Poetics of Indignation

The coming together of monks and gentry in the monasteries of the Ming-Qing transition era made evident a shared ethos of loyalty, shared fears and experiences of victimisation arising from political violence, and a shared disapproval of contemporary political developments. These shared sentiments and frustrations were expressed in the writings of both 'loyal' monks and gentry loyalists, above all in poetry derived from the long tradition in Chinese literature of depicting the plight of loyal subjects who had experienced loss and separation from the objects of their loyalty. As noted in the introduction, the key literary symbol of the suffering loyalist was Qu Yuan (c. 340-278 BCE), the ill-fated southern poet-official of the Warring States Period (476-221 BCE). Poems in this ‘anguished loyal official’ genre stressed the righteous condemnation of political injustice – the voicing of a sense of indignation either at the unconscionable acts of political violence to which their authors had been subjected or at intolerable political circumstances.

As noted, what was distinctive about the cultural discourses produced by ‘loyal’ monks in the late Ming / early Qing is that they affirmed the religious merit of poetry that expressed emotions that a conventional Buddhist perspective would regard as being negative or even defiled. These monks explored and drew upon prevailing Confucian moral ideas about poetry, ideas that were often seen as part of a tradition which was traced back to Confucius’ editing of the Book of Odes. After the collapse of the Ming proper, Confucian discourse on poetry was subject to new elaborations in what Lawrence Yim has called the ‘poetics of Ming loyalism.’ Yim asserts that this new approach to poetry was first and foremost the product of a political disposition, and only secondarily the product of a distinct set of literary ideas. Through the marrying between the gentry and 'loyal' clergy that took place in monasteries of the Ming-Qing transition era, the ideas and texts of this Confucian loyalist poetics were co-

38 Wai-yee Li notes that the ‘Chuci corpus and the figure of the poet Qu Yuan, canonical symbols of loyalty, political integrity, and hopeless longing, were frequently invoked for their southern associations in early Qing writings.’ See Idema et al. (eds) Trauma and Transcendence, pg. 51.
39 This is a core concept presented in Yim’s The Poet-historian Qian Qianyi. Yim states that this term can be used to ‘characterise the poetry of the Ming-Qing transition that verbalises loyalty to and memory of the Ming.’ (pg. 3). A central concept in this poetics – as captured in Yim’s title – is an emphasis on history, an emphasis intended to give credence to ‘unofficial’ and alternative histories written not by the conquerors but by ‘loyal’ (Ming) subjects. I discuss this in detail later in this chapter.
40 For example, Lawrence Yim states with reference to the designation ‘poetics of Ming loyalism’ that loyalty ‘is primarily a political concept, and only by extension a literary one.’ (The Poet-historian Qian Qianyi pg. 2).
opted by monks into their Buddhist mission.

In this dissertation I suggest that the poetry of Confucian moral and political indignation was co-opted by ‘loyal’ monks’ into their Buddhist mission because they recognised the important role that this poetry played in the lives of the loyal/loyalist gentry subjects who were the objects of their mission of pastoral care. These monks were not primarily concerned with the literary qualities of this poetry, but rather with the deeper motivations that people had for writing it and with the effects that it was expected to have upon those who read and wrote it. Confucian poetics had always emphasised the moral benefits of poetry that expressed ethical concerns, but in this era there was growing emphasis on the therapeutic benefits of poetic catharsis. As Wai-yee Li notes, loyalists in the Ming-Qing transition era found that writing about the experiences that they had endured could 'extend the affective and intellectual space for coping with traumatic historical events.' In the words of Lawrence Yim, this writing could provide 'a means for the traumatically torn survivors to persevere without giving way to utter despair.' As we shall see in the case of Hanshan, the poetry of Confucian indignation appealed to monks who had themselves been politically persecuted and who were struggling to find resources within the Buddhist tradition that would enable them to deal with the distinctive problems associated with their own experiences of being righteous victims of political violence. With the fall of the Ming, monks who were the spiritual leaders of traumatised communities of 'remnant subjects' arguably came to see that the poetry of indignation was useful for providing both moral guidance and a cathartic outlet for those in their care. Monks saw that this poetry could be used to advance their religious mission, a mission which, by the late Ming, had already become deeply preoccupied with moral, material, and psychological problems.

These social, cultural and political developments were complemented by new ideas on the unity of Chan and poetry. It could be argued that when monks were thinking about what types of poems could be identified with Chan (and how these poems could be identified with Chan),

---

41 Lynn Struve has suggested, however, that it is more likely that ‘the overwhelming motivation for writing down personal experiences in those trying times... was self-justification or self-vindication’ (Struve, Voices from the Ming-Qing Cataclysm: China in Tigers' Jaw (New Haven: Yale, 1993), pg. 5.)
42 Ibid., pg. 37.
43 See Yim, The Poet-Historian Qian Qianyi, pg. 4. 'The act of writing could allow the writer to reflect on the painful and confounding experiences of the political changeover, to confess his shame and guilt, or to reaffirm his integrity, dignity and belief. The pangs of conscience compelled a generation of eyewitnesses to speak for the deceased, to fix the facts, to reckon and to mourn losses.'Ibid.
the most important issue was how poetry could help them address the needs of their religious communities. The theories of poetry which emerged during the Ming-Qing transition were distinctive for taking a holistic approach to pastoral/ameliorative and soteriological goals. The leading 'loyal' monks of that era held that poetry could simultaneously help people to deal with personal and/or collective malaises and bring them to enlightenment.

A core argument in this thesis is that an emphasis on the therapeutic dimensions of the poetry of indignation – combined with core Confucian ideas about poetry's moral role – provided new parameters for theories about how poetry could be identified with Chan. I also argue that this new conceptualization of the poetry-Chan relationship had an influence on the types of Buddhist doctrines/ideas that monks used as the religious foundation for their poetic theories. Specifically, new ideas in Buddhist psychology were used to complement concepts relating to innate moral knowledge that derived from the syncretic intellectual traditions of the Ming era. As a result, writings by monks on poetry came to pay greater attention to the different motivations that different writers had for composing poetry and to the different types of effects that the medium could have upon its readers. Liao Chao-heng has described the core theme of these theorisations as ‘the process of stimulation and response and acceptance and transformation stemming from interaction between the ‘inner [mind]’ and the ‘outer [world]’’.

**New Monastic Poetry and New Chan – Doctrinal Foundations**

The theoretical reflection on the relationship between the inner and outer, to which Liao Chao-heng refers above, relates to the fact that the new idea that cathartic poetry could lead people to enlightenment still faced a number of problems from a Buddhist doctrinal perspective. The virtues of being 'socially engaged' and of expressing indignation at social and political injustices that were affirmed in the ‘loyal’ monasteries of the late Ming / Ming-Qing transition eras were diametrically opposed to the values of detachment and tranquillity that had hitherto been regarded (and to a degree, were at that time still regarded) as the qualities that imbued poetry with religious power.

The centre of these doctrinal issues was a particular articulation of Buddhist mind and innate

---

nature (xinxing 心性) theory. This articulation emphasised that the core impediment to realising true Buddha nature was that Buddha nature was veiled by phenomenal thought. In other words, to see innate nature required the non-exertion (or ‘tranquillity’) of mind. In relation to poetry, the founder of the Buddhist-influenced Jiangxi school, Huang Tingjian (黃庭堅 1045-1105), saw this principle as being manifest in an artistic process in which the scene depicted is not distorted by the observer’s consciousness – a process in which one ‘observes phenomena with an open mind’ (虛心觀物). The poet Lü Wen (呂温 772-811) had provided an analogy for the ideal state of the phenomenal mind through the metaphor of a calm and clear body of water, which, like a mirror, reflects images that are projected onto it. Sun Changwu’s Chan si yu shi qing 《禪思與詩情》 [Chan Thought and Poetic Sentiment] notes that this ‘mind-as-mirror’ analogy was a common feature in Buddhist discussions of nature poetry in the centuries leading up to the late Ming era, particularly in the Tang and Song dynasties. Sun cites authors including Wang Changling (王昌齡 698-756), Meng Jiao (孟郊 751-814), Liu Yuxi (劉禹錫 772-842), Bao Rong (包融 8th C), the Song dynasty Jiangxi school exponents Zeng Ji (曾畿 1085-1166), Xie Yi (謝逸 1066-1113) and Xie Ke (謝薖 1074-1116) who used this imagery to explain how nature poetry depicting calm scenes could be conceived as having religious benefits. Like a deep body of undisturbed water, the tranquil mind can act like a mirror, and the coolness and purity of the mountain scene depicted in poetry can reflect – or provide a means to gain perception of – the ‘cool and pure’ qualities of the author’s innate nature. Sun describes this as follows: ‘since the mind is empty and pure (xujing 虛淨) like a bright and clear mirror, it can, via reflection, manifest a clear and still scene (jing 境); this pure and tranquil scene can in turn ‘reflect the mind’s clear purity’.

Nature poetry thus enlightens people because it reflects the mirror-like quality of the author's mind. Lü Wen’s analogy of a still pond invokes the image of a body of water that is not stirred up by inner currents or disturbed by ripples on the surface. A situation where the

46 Sun Changwu, Chan si yu shi qing, pg. 207.
47 Lü Wen, for instance, replaces the mirror analogy with reference to the reflective water of a pond – see Sun, Chan si yu shi qing, pg. 205.
48 Ibid.
49 See ibid., pgs. 205-208.
50 Ibid., pgs. 204-205.
51 Ibid.
‘water’ of the mind is agitated either by the ‘inner’ currents of tumultuous emotions or thoughts, or by the ripples and waves caused by the impact of a disruptive object (that is, an object that is not cool and pure), constitutes an impediment to self realisation. This is exactly what occurs when, in Liao Chao-heng’s words, there is a clash between inner mood and outer society, and when there is a ‘process of [inner] stimulation…and transformation’. This opposition between the calm and the agitated was a major doctrinal sticking point for the new theories of poetry circulating in the ‘loyal’ monasteries of the Ming-Qing era.

However, late Ming and early Qing Buddhist thought did provide a remedy for this sticking point. Authors in the late imperial era had at their disposal a position – indeed, quite a popular one – that was an alternative to the conventional ‘mind as mirror’ mind-nature model used in older theorisations of the spiritual power of nature poetry. Where older ideas stressed the term mind and innate nature, the alternative model referred to xingqing (性情), whose literal meaning is ‘innate nature and sentiment’. Xingqing was a term that had a particularly strong relationship with poetic thought, being used in literary theory and poetics to express the idea that literary writings such as poems reveal the author’s sentiments and character or innate nature. A manifestation of these ideas in late Ming monastic literature can be found in the writings of the eminent late Ming monk and strong advocate of literary Chan, Zibo Zhenke. While Zhenke was an advocate of the mind-as-mirror analogy and held the conventional mind and innate nature view that ‘innate nature (xing) returns when sentiments (qing) have dissipated’ (情消則性復),52 when addressing the theme of xingqing – in particular in his theory that ‘the mind integrates innate nature and sentiments’ (心統性情)53 – he advocated the position that the stirred-up ‘waves’ (bo 波) – which represent phenomenal sentiments (qing) – and also the ‘currents’ (liu 流) of the mind (xin 心) that impel them are to be identified with innate natures (that is, ‘water’ itself). Zhenke argued that ‘sentiment is the mind’ (情即心), and ‘innate nature is also sentiment’ (性亦情),54 asserting that ‘there are three names [qing, xin and xing] but there are not three [distinct] actualities (有三名而無三

52 The Complete Collection of the Venerable Zibo (Zibo zunzhe quan ji) 《紫柏尊者全集》, fascicle 23: (CBETA, X73, no. 1452, p. 346, b7 // Z 2:31, p. 520, c17 // R126, p. 1040, a17).
53 Daosheng borrowed this term from the Song neo-Confucian Zhu Xi (朱熹 1130-1200), and his own theories could be understood as a Buddhist revision of Zhu Xi’s ideas. I discuss this topic in depth in Chapter 3.
The notion that the moving waves of sentiment (and the active current of the mind) could be identified with perpetually tranquil innate nature facilitated the idea that the expressions of a mind stirred or ‘rippled’ by emotion can also be a conduit for gaining insight into pure innate nature. This position was shared (albeit with different articulations) by each of the three authors that this dissertation discusses.

This notion that sentiments (qing) could be a conduit for the realisation of innate nature (xing) arguably gained further support and new meaning from the theories about innate moral sense that flourished in the late Ming / early Qing monastery, theories which were influenced to varying degrees by the concepts of the Wang Yangming School of Mind. A common denominator of these theories was the notion that because the innate nature of mind was innately and fundamentally moral, traces of this nature would be ‘reflected’ in the morally-exemplary phenomenal sentiments that emanated from it. This theory was most clearly applied to literature in the writings of Ouyi Zhixu. Zhixu advocated the idea of ‘revering virtuous innate nature’ (zun dexing 尊德性, alternatively translated as ‘revering moral character’ or ‘revering the innate nature of virtue’) regarding ‘virtuous innate nature’ or ‘moral character’ as being both a substantive moral force and a dimension of the universal tathāgatagarbha (‘womb of suchness’) or Buddha nature. Zhixu stated that ‘the great dao is led by innate nature (xing), and completely condenses itself in virtue (de), and so it is called ‘virtuous innate nature’ (or ‘moral character’, or ‘innate nature of virtue’) (dexing)’ – it is the same as what Buddhism calls ‘the innate nature of tathāgatagarbha’ 大道全率於性,全凝於德,故名之曰德性.猶之釋稱如來藏性. He also held that traces of the tathāgatagarbha or this virtuous innate nature could be found in literary expression – that is, in literary expression that had its foundation in the xing/xingqing of the author. By placing the revering of moral character alongside ‘revering written words’ (zun wenzi 尊文字), Zhixu held that the act of revering written words could convey a ‘contemplative reflection’ (guanzhao 觀照) of absolute reality (shixiang 實相, that is, the tathāgatagarbha) – one that did not occur through the non-manifestation of phenomenal mind, but through literature’s capacity to reveal the

---


‘shadow of the mind’ (xinying 心影). He held that this phenomenal mind was not a defiled mind at all, but was instead a manifest expression of the tathāgatagarbha as a source of innate moral knowledge, that is, a ‘transformed manifestation of innately endowed knowledge of goodness’ 從良知變現. 58

Zhixu’s theory was that poems which expressed moral sentiments could produce enlightenment because these sentiments were connected with Buddha nature. Moral thoughts could thus plausibly be seen as an outflow of moral innate nature. However, it was more problematic to assert that defiled thoughts could emanate directly from, or be a conduit to realising, the pure tathāgatagarbha, since this would make redundant the dichotomy in Buddhist ethics and soteriology between what was ‘skilful’ (that is, good) and ‘unskilful’ (that is, evil). ‘Loyal’ monks thus had doctrinal obstacles to overcome when they used innate nature and sentiment theory to affirm the spiritual value of poems that expressed indignation about political and social happenings. Above all, when monastic writers on poetry argued that defiled sentiments (qing) can conditionally lead to the realisation of pure innate nature (xing), they needed to create a standard by which to distinguish expressions of defiled emotions that could be regarded as legitimate from a Buddhist perspective (and were thus conducive to enlightenment) from those which offended Buddhist principles and which could do moral or spiritual harm to the author or his readers. Furthermore, when dealing with the impact of catastrophic events on the mind, a standard was needed for judging what criteria would make the cathartic expression of agitated emotions useful as a therapeutic or ameliorative measure. In searching for this new standard for judging the religious value of poetry, the leaders of the ‘loyal’ monasteries expressed the commitment to engagement that brought together the ‘loyal’ monk and the exiled/remnant subject – a commitment that paralleled but contrasted with the detachment that had been the core criterion for judging the religious benefits of poetry in the era when monastic practice was built around the eremitic ideal. This new value or standard was zhen - ‘genuineness’ or authenticity.

While the above-mentioned ideas represented shifts in doctrinal thought that occurred in the late Ming, they did have foundations in earlier Buddhist doctrines or texts; to say that they


58 Ibid.
did not would give weight to criticisms that late Ming Buddhism had been diluted or corrupted by intellectual eclecticism. However, I would reiterate that what was truly unique in the new body of monastic discourses on poetry was their collective promotion of the idea that poems expressing anguished emotions like indignation could have therapeutic and religious benefits – especially to those living through chaotic times – provided that they fulfilled the condition of being authentic or zhen. It is this emphasis on zhen, I argue, that best reveals the distinctive historical, literary and the Buddhist doctrinal milieus of the late Ming / early Qing-era ‘loyal’ monasteries of South China in which this new approach to Buddhism and poetry emerged.

**Truth, Reality and Authenticity – The Buddhist Poetics of Being Zhen**

There are a number of reasons why zhen was chosen as a core value in the writings of the monks of this era. Discourses on zhen were a useful instrument for helping monks 1) to use literature to establish solidarity with loyal gentry brethren; 2) to deal with, or provide pastoral assistance to, loyal subjects dealing with, traumatic historical events, and 3) to enlighten disciples (expressed in the idea that poetry and Chan are one).

**Zhen as Sincerity and the 'Marrying' of the Clergy and Gentry**

As noted, poetry had long been used by monks as a tool for establishing a rapport with gentry patrons. There were obvious advantages to be gained from promoting the idea that the sentiments expressed in poetry written by monks were zhen in the sense of being ‘sincere’, since this would suggest that sincerity underpinned the affective relationship between clergy and gentry. However, zhen in the sense of emotional authenticity was already a central literary value in Jiangnan literati communities during the late Ming period. In particular, it was a core concern of the thought of the influential Gongan literary school associated with Yuan Hongdao (袁宏道 1568-1610) and his brothers59 – a school which, as I discuss in the following chapter, had an important influence on one of the initiators of the late Ming monastic poetry revival, Hanshan Deqing. The ideal of literary zhen as it was articulated by the Gongan school had advantages for monks who wanted to use literary writing as a means to establish a rapport with gentry elites, because the Gongan school’s conception of literary

zhen placed a strong emphasis on using simple and/or colloquial language. This arguably put monks on a more equal footing with gentry authors who often had superior literary skill or erudition, attributes that advocates of zhen belittled as artifice. Martin Huang states that disenfranchised non-elite individuals in the late Ming had ‘appropriated’ ‘concepts such as ‘genuine feelings’…as a means to reassert their elite status as shi.’60 On this point, it is worth noting that the language used to valorise the zhen of the poetry of monks during this period was on occasion very similar to that used to promote the writings of other non-elite authors, such as female poets.61

Dealing with the 'Reality' of a Tumultuous Era

Zhen was a pre-eminent literary and moral value in the communities of loyalist writers with whom 'loyal' monks associated in the years after the fall of the Ming. It was a core concept in the above-mentioned ‘poetics of Ming loyalism’ associated with figures such as the Buddhist-affiliated writer Qian Qianyi (錢謙益 1582-1664) who was associated with the idea of the ‘poet-historian’, which emphasized historicity and emotional verisimilitude in literary

60 Desire and Fictional Narrative in Late Imperial China (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Asia Centre 2001), pg. 40.
61 See for instance the statement of Li Kaixian (李開先 1502-1568) (later paraphrased by Feng Menglong (馮夢龍 1574-1645)), stating that ‘true poetry can only be found among the common people’ ‘真詩在民間 ’ (Shijin yanci xu ‘市井艷詞序’, in Li Kaixian ji 《李開先集》, volume 1 (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1959), p. 321). Quoting a late Ming anthology, Grace Fong has made a similar point, drawing attention to the judgement that women’s poems ‘have always originated from their feelings (發於情) and are rooted in their own nature (根於性)’ – contrasting this with those who ‘talk about laws and rules (法律) before even touching a piece of paper’ and that ‘love to assert that this person follows a particular style or this work belongs to this particular school (某派).’ (Translation in Grace Fong’s ‘Gender and the Failure of Canonization: Anthologizing Women’s Poetry in the Late Ming’ (Chinese Literature: Essays, Articles, Reviews; Vol. 26, Dec. 2004), pg. 144). As noted, very similar arguments were made to promote monastic poetry in the early Qing. The early Qing jinshi Xiong Yixiao (熊一瀟 1664), for instance, stated that the poetry of the afore-mentioned artist/poet-monk Dashan expressed his own voice, and that his poems ‘cannot be pointed to as [imitating the style of] any artist of any reign in the three periods of the Tang and the two periods of the Song’ and up to the Tang and the two periods of the Song and up to the Tang. (Dashan Collection, pg. 5). Similarly, the official and Buddhist devotee Fan Zeda (樊澤達 1685) stated in relation to Dashan’s poetry that: ‘The sage [Confucius] made deletions from the 3000 ancient poems and retained 300 [the 300 poems of The Book of Songs] – for the most part those that [remained] were composed by righteous officials and filial sons, pining wives and careworn people who each sought to express the rectitude of their innate natures and their sentiments. The Venerable Master’s poems have their basis in their innate natures and their sentiments’ 古詩三千，聖人刪存三百，大抵貞臣孝子，思婦勞人各言其性情之正而作也…和上之詩本於性情 (pgs. 13-14). Dangui, who was also a relatively accomplished poet, spoke similarly in his preface to his own Collection from the Hall of All-Pervading Movement. He refers to the liberation of not having to pay too much attention to formal tonal rules, and contrasts this with those who composed poetry for the purpose of passing imperial exams. (Duan Xiaohua (段曉華) (ed.) Collection of the Hall of All-Pervading Movement (Bianxing tang ji) 《徧行堂集》 (Guangzhou: Guangdong liyou chubanshe, Rpt. 2008,) pg. 9.
However, it is more pertinent that writers in these communities saw *zhen* as the quality that made poetry efficacious as a therapeutic tool in dealing with their traumatic experiences. As Wai-yee Li has noted, ‘early Qing writings that purport to bear witness to and remember the traumatic dynastic transition and to represent how selves and identities were shattered and reconstituted obsessively insist on the genuineness of experience and expression’.63

*Poetry and Chan as Buddhist ‘Truth’*

By the late Ming, the idea that there was spiritual meaning in literature that was *zhen* had already been articulated. It emerged in the above-mentioned Gongan school, and had theoretical foundations in the concepts of the syncretic Mind studies tradition affiliated with both Wang Yangming and with Buddhism. Concepts from these sources were widespread in 'loyal' and 'loyalist' monasteries, and their influence is evident in the afore-mentioned poetry theories of Ouyi Zhixu. However, the idea that genuineness is something that gives poetry religious value – which contrasted with Zhixu’s emphasis on expressions of moral rightness – stemmed from the significant influence on the Gongan school of Li Zhi (李贄 1527-1602), a neo-Confucian thinker heavily influenced by the Wang Yangming school. In a famous work titled ‘Theory of the Childlike Mind’ (*tongxin shuo* 〈童心說〉), Li Zhi affirmed that a state of innocence and an absence of artifice and pretension was the ideal to be expressed in literature, and was the means for uncovering the genuine mind (*zhenxin* 真心) and the ‘genuine person’ (*zhenren* 真人). He also famously proposed that this quality of *zhen* in the sense of authenticity or ‘genuineness’ is inseparable from the higher, spiritual *zhen* of the Buddhas, arguing that ‘there are “genuine people” [*zhenren* 真人] because there is genuine Buddha; the fact that there is genuine Buddha becomes known because there are genuine people.’64 The Gongan school, which Sun Tseng-Chung regards as being nothing less than a ‘development in aesthetics of Yangming Mind studies,’65 and which had a close affiliation

---

62 See Yim, *The Poet-historian Qian Qianyi*. As Yim notes, ‘this mode of writing develops a public narrative out of the mediated history of the perished Ming and Southern Ming resistance (1644-62) through the power of personal memory in its vicissitudes. Its chief material is the recollection of individual and cultural loss.’ (pg. 1)
63 Idema et al. (eds.), *Trauma and Transcendence*, pg. 59.
65 See Tseng-Chung Sun [孙中曾], ‘Mingmo Zhedong ru fo hudong dui wenxue de yingxiang – yi Tao Wangling de wenxue zhuzhang wei lie’ （明末浙東儒佛互動對文學的影響- 以陶望齡的文學主張為例）, in Zhongguo gudian wenxue yanjiu hui (中國古典文學研究會) (eds.) *Wenxue yu foxue*
with late imperial Buddhist thought, elaborated these ideas and brought them into the mainstream of late Ming literary theory. A core notion, one that will be discussed further in chapter four of this thesis, is the idea of genuineness stemming from the childlike mind. Yuan Zongdao (遠宗道 1560-1600), largely quoting from Li Zhi, stated that ‘All of the literature in the world which has attained perfection has come out of the childlike mind’ 天下之至文未有不出於童心焉者也.66

We will see in the subsequent chapters of this dissertation that the notion that poetic zhen can reflect ‘the’ zhen, and even, in some articulations, specifically the zhen mind, is a fundamental concept in the theories of how poetry can enlighten people (that is, the theories of ‘poetry and Chan being one’) that were advanced by the ‘loyal’ monks of the Ming-Qing transition era who are studied here. We can argue that the strong emphasis on zhen that is found in the writings of these ‘loyal’ monks was partly a rearticulation, in a Buddhist context, of Li Zhi’s concern with distinguishing the qualities of genuine people from the falseness and sophistry of those who tried to impress people with their erudition, or who claimed to be ‘profound.’ Literature, as Li Zhi affirmed, was supposed to project genuine moral qualities and not artifice. This view of genuineness in literature and in moral conduct, it can be argued, resonated with a broad emphasis on genuineness in Buddhist practice that was stressed by the monastic writers that this dissertation studies, a number of whom were critical of people they considered to be religious charlatans (see chapter 4).

From Detachment and Tranquillity to Engagement and Emotional Turmoil – Being Real, Facing Reality, Realising The Real

We have seen how the act of valorising zhen as a literary standard for cathartic poetry that

---

66 In Yuan’s The Classified Collection of the Baisu Study (First Section) (Baisuzhai leiji – shang) 《白蘇齋類集》（上）, under the subtitle ‘Classified Miscellaneous Sayings’ (‘Zashuolei’) 〈雜說類〉, (in Siku Banned Books (Siku jinhui shu congkan) 《四庫禁燬書叢刊》, volume 48. Beijing: Beijing chubanshe, 2000), pgs. 693-696.
expresses indignation enabled monks to write about poetry in a way that emphasised its potential 1) to raise their standing in, and establish rapport with, gentry society; 2) to deal with, or help loyal gentry officials deal with, the political chaos and violence of their era; and 3) to enlighten disciples. Yet the most striking characteristic of these new discourses was not that they addressed these three factors concurrently, but that they merged the three dimensions of *zhen* associated with these goals into a new paradigm for asserting the unity of Chan and poetry. These ‘loyal’ monks held that when poetry is sincere or authentic (*zhen*) in expressing anguished emotions, it can help people to come to terms and cope with the reality (*zhen*) of living through chaotic times, and can as a result lead followers to liberation and religious truth (‘the’ *zhen*). In other words, monks asserted that *zhen* poetry which brings to the fore the emotional turmoil caused by engagement with society can be spiritually beneficial.

The emphasis on indignation and social engagement found in the writings of this era could easily be attributed to the loyalty, or secular/Confucian virtues of the ‘loyal’ monks. However, when looked at through the prism of the value of *zhen*, an alternative perspective – one more connected with religious imperatives – emerges. Firstly, by moving away from detachment, one could reflect upon how monastic life had to some extent moved away from the pursuit of an eremitic ideal, confronting the reality of forced or coerced detachment via exile. On this count, the writings that were produced not only affirmed loyalty as a value uniting these monks and remnant subjects, but, more specifically, addressed the malaise that loyal subjects experienced when dislocated from the objects of their loyalty, and, by extension, from their identity as loyal subjects of the disappearing, vanquished entity, the Ming dynasty. It was this broader malaise of traumatic dislocation experienced through emotions that were no longer controllable, that I suggest underlay the desire of these monks to move away from detachment as the core motif in monastic poetry. It could similarly be argued that this concept also underpinned ‘loyal’ monks’ movement away from the Yan Yu-affiliated ideas on the relationship between Chan and poetry that were popular in secular writings at that time – ideas such as ‘meaning beyond words’ (*yan wai zhi yi* 言外之意) or silent transmission (*mochuan* 默傳, sometimes translated as ‘wordless transmission’), marvellous enlightenment (*miaowu* 妙悟) or purity and distance (*qingyuan* 清遠). Each of these ideas, in showcasing authorial profundity, connoted a sense of detachment – detachment of meaning from language, detachment of enlightenment from ordinary consciousness, and, perhaps most
importantly, the detachment of enlightened people from the mundane world.

It could be argued that the intersection that each of these ideas had with the notion of being detached brings to the fore the value of *zhen* not only for marking the abandoning of artifice or false profundity, but also as a remedy for the malaise of dislocation. To be or to become *zhen* – to be real, genuine, authentic or truthful – connoted, at one level, the creation of actual or figurative connections between two nodes. For example, being real (*zhen*) or facing reality connoted a connection between one’s circumstances and one’s emotions; being authentic (*zhen*) in acknowledging states that are not ideal (that is, states of mental anguish) connotes connectedness between actual sentiments and language; genuineness (*zhen*) connotes a connection between words and self-understanding; and truth (*zhen*) connotes a connection between an ideation and actuality – *the* actual, *the* real, or the genuine (mind). The soteriology of *zhen*, in other words, spoke to loyal subjects whose exile was the source of an existential crisis; it defined the dissatisfaction at the forefront of their experience of the *samsāric* condition. A Buddhist response to this *samsāric* condition would speak best to people who, as a result of trauma or other circumstances, might see dislocation as the source of spiritual deficiency or of *samsāric* sufferings that impede spiritual liberation.

**Zhen and Doctrine**

The mapping of these ideas – ideas that need to be understood in the context of the Buddhist identity and the religious mission of the so-called ‘loyal’ monks – is the core research task undertaken in this dissertation. It is also what differentiates this dissertation from other academic studies of these authors’ writings and from studies of similar late Ming / early Qing writings on poetry. In a narrow sense, the approach I have taken views these writings as a repository of new and radically different ideas on how non-Buddhist poetry could be identified with Chan. However, I also assert that these texts were an integral part of a larger reform-era project – an attempt to find foundations in Buddhist doctrine for affirming a monastic culture and a new soteriology that emphasised the value of being ‘genuine’ and engaged with the *samsāric* world.

Each chapter, accordingly, will focus on the distinctive Buddhist doctrines that each author invoked to give religious meaning to the idea that being genuine in expressing indignation
can lead to the genuine [mind]. We will see, for instance, that Hanshan invoked Buddhist idealist (that is, ‘mind only’ cittamātra) philosophy to deal with the problem of exile; that Daosheng drew from Tiantai, Caodong and syncretic innate nature and sentiments and yin-yang thought; and that Tianran adapted a mixture of these and core ideas of karma theory and the southern patriarch Chan tradition. The chapter that follows discusses the ideas on poetry of perhaps the most ardent advocate of Buddhist zhen, and one of the leading advocates of zhen in the field of literature – the late-Ming monk Hanshan Deqing.
Chapter 2: A Nightmarish Descent into Hell – Hanshan Deqing on Exile, Zhen Poetry and ‘True’ Chan

Introduction

Hanshan Deqing (1546-1623) is famed as one of the ‘four great eminent monks of the late Ming.’ He had an illustrious career and was one of the main instigators of the late-Ming Buddhist revival. However, his career and his life were by no means without setbacks. Famous as a ‘loyal’ monk, Hanshan enjoyed great renown, exceptional privilege and high-level patronage from the Ming court, but his political affiliations exposed him to the brutal factional struggles that were associated with the decline of the Ming. As a consequence, when Hanshan was in middle age and at the height of his eminence, he suffered the ignominy and deprivations of banishment to a frontier garrison.

As is not uncommon in hagiographical accounts of eminent Chinese monks, this experience has been depicted as a testing one that deepened Hanshan’s faith. Yet an important (but largely unexplored) dimension of this change in his circumstances was its influence on his ideas about the religious value of literature. Advocating the principle that ‘poetry is genuine Chan’ (shi nai zhen chan 詩乃真禪), Hanshan came to explore – and to find deeper religious meaning in – the tradition of cathartic poetry associated with exiled loyal subjects, a genre that he came to regard as able to exemplify the literary ideals of ‘genuineness and authenticity’ (zhenshi 真實), which could lead to the revelation of the genuine mind (zhenxin

---

These new ideas were in stark contrast with conventional Buddhist approaches, and were to have a great impact on early Qing ‘loyalist’ monastic theorists – that is, on other monks who also experienced persecution and/or distress as a result of political violence.

This chapter seeks to outline the distinctive theories on poetry that Hanshan developed during and after his exile. Hanshan held that poems which are authentic (zhēn 真) in the depiction of real (zhēn) and traumatic experiences of political persecution can awaken people to their genuine mind (zhēn xīn 真心). Pivotal to his understanding, as we shall see, is that ‘authenticity’ here involved the experience of exile being recorded accurately by someone who had personally suffered it, and that these recordings captured the emotional impact that the hellish and nightmarish qualities of this experience engendered. Hanshan felt that by vividly capturing the ‘hellish nightmare’ that is exile, poetry could, like one’s memories of an unpleasant dream, prompt one to reflect on the idea that subjective consciousness and the objects that have been perceived are of one substance – that they are all mind-only (cittamātra).

Poetry of this type could hence lead to the intuitive verification of the ‘unadulterated’ genuine mind (yiwei zhēn xīn 一味真心), which represented for Hanshan the un-bifurcated ideal substratum of all mental and perceptual reality – the tathāgatagarbha, or the Buddha nature. Thus for Hanshan, this poetry represented ‘genuine Chan’ or ‘genuine practice’ (zhēncān 真参); it advanced a means to understand the true nature of mind, and to attain a ‘cool mind’ while in the midst of a hellish setting, in contradistinction to an inner cool that is not born of insight but is merely reliant upon the coolness and purity of a secluded mountain setting.

From Eminence to Exile to Enlightenment: The Trials and Triumph of Hanshan

Hanshan’s Rise to Prominence

Hanshan Deqing, whose secular surname was Cai (蔡), was born in Quanjiao county (in today’s Anhui province) in the 24th year of the reign of the Jiajing emperor of the Ming

---

2 ‘Mind-only’ is sometimes translated as ‘mere-mind’.
3 eka-rasa, literally ‘one-flavoured’.
4 Hanshan’s chronological autobiography presents a rich source for information on his life. It can be found in fascicles 53-54 of Old Man Hanshan’s Dream Travels Collection (Hanshan laoren mengyou ji) 《憨山老人夢遊集》 (hereafter referred to as Dream Travels; Sung-Peng Hsu in A Buddhist Leader in Ming China translates
dynasty (1546). Raised by a devoutly Buddhist mother, he entered Bao'en Temple in Nanjing at the tender age of 12, studying under the tutelage of Xilin Yongning (西林永寧 1483-1565). He received full ordination at the young age of 19. At the age of 26, Hanshan left the temple and began travelling through the north of China. Some sources state that he reached enlightenment at the age of 30 while sojourning at Wutaishan (in Shanxi province, west of Beijing) in the course of his travels.\(^5\) In 1583, Hanshan moved to Mount Lao (牢山) in Donghai (東海, in today's Shandong province), where he enjoyed the patronage of the Empress Dowager Cisheng (慈聖 1545-1614). In 1586, the empress dowager sent one of the four copies of the newly printed *Tripitaka* to Laoshan and built the grand Haiyin temple (海印寺) for Hanshan to house this extensive collection. Hanshan was the abbot of Haiyin for more than a decade, and was largely content with his success in realising his monastic vision – having, in his own appraisal, transformed Donghai from a place of the *mleccha* (mieliche 萬戾車, roughly meaning those that do not believe in or know the orthodox teachings of the dharma) to a place where ‘even children of three years of age know how to recite the name of the Buddha, and in every village and household there are people who have abandoned evil and returned to righteousness; my vows have been fulfilled’ 今予教化十二年。三歲赤子，皆知念佛；至若捨邪歸正者，比鄉比戶也。予願足矣。\(^6\)

Early in the last decade of the sixteenth century, Hanshan was given a purple robe by the eminent monk and his close friend this title as *Collection of Old Man Hanshan’s Dream Roamings* – which is in Vol. 73 (No. 1456) of the *Zokuzōkyō*, and has been printed independently (Taipei: Xin-wen-feng chuban gongsi, 1973). The biography itself (*True Record of the Self-Narrated Chronological Autobiography of Old Man Hanshan* (*Hanshan laoren nianpu zixu shilu*) was recorded by Hanshan’s disciple Fushan (福善 1587?-1623?) during Hanshan’s lifetime, and was printed for wider circulation in 1658. Annotations for the biography were first printed by Hanshan’s disciple Fuzheng (福徵 1590-1665/1657?) in 1651, but were not included in the *Jiaxing Canon*. They appear in the *Annotated Chronological Biography of Grand Master Hanshan* (*Hanshan Dashi Nianpu Shuzhu* 《憨山大師年譜疏註》 (Taipei: Xinwenfeng chuban gongsi, 1987), also known as the *Hanshan laoren nianpu zixu shilu shu* 《憨山老人年譜自敘實錄疏》), which can also be found in *Beijing tushuguan congzheng nianpu congkan* 《北京圖書館藏珍年譜叢刊》 1990, Vol. 5, pgs. 589-732; Vol. 53, pgs. 1-118. The first section of Hanshan’s autobiography appears in English translation in Garma Chang’s *Practice of Zen* (New York: Harper and Row Publishers Inc., 1959), pgs. 118-142, while a non-scholarly and incomplete English translation of this text (both the chronological autobiography and annotations) is provided in Charles Luk’s *Practical Buddhism* (London: Rider & Company, 1971), pgs. 57-162. Independent translations of selected passages are also contained in secondary sources on Hanshan, many of which are listed in the first footnote in this chapter. Translations of the autobiography here are my own unless otherwise stated, and are based on the *Zokuzōkyō* (I have on occasions changed or shifted punctuation marks in the Chinese text).

\(^5\) Dewei Zhang’s ‘A Fragile Revival’ reveals that Hanshan held the opinion that he did not achieve ultimate enlightenment until a much later date, some time after his exile to Leiyang. I discuss this point in greater detail later in this chapter.

Zibo Zhenke. In a rare honour, in 1594 the Empress Dowager Cisheng had her son, the Wanli emperor (萬曆 1563-1620), personally pay homage to Hanshan’s picture.

Hanshan’s Trials: Political Intrigue and Exile

Only a year after reaching what many would have regarded as the summit of a successful monastic career, Hanshan saw his fortunes take a dramatic turn for the worse. In 1595, he was accused of impropriety in the management of donations given by the treasury of the inner court, and of illegally appropriating the temple lands of a Daoist order. Both charges (especially the first) were likely to have been in part triggered by a rift that had emerged between the emperor and the empress dowager, and this rift was closely related to a factional struggle between officials close to the emperor on the one side and some of the empress dowager’s emissaries (who had had regular contact with Hanshan) on the other. Hanshan was arrested and brutally interrogated in an attempt to force a confession. He steadfastly maintained his innocence and was eventually acquitted of the first offence; however, the charge of ‘illegally establishing a monastery’ (私創寺院) – which arose from an older dispute with a local Daoist associate over land acquisition – was upheld. As a result, Hanshan was sentenced to exile in an army garrison. The garrison was located in Lingnan’s tropical Leizhou (雷州) prefecture (also known as Leiyang 雷陽), not far from Hainan island and close to the southern-most point in the empire. In addition to being a desolate outpost,

7 The bestowal of a purple robe by a member of the imperial family (a tradition which began with the Tang empress Wu Zetian (武則天 624-705)), or by a great monk that had himself been a recipient (as was the case here), was intended to mark an authoritative acknowledgement of the recipient’s great religious merit, and brought with it considerable prestige in monastic and in gentry society. A brief account of the symbolic and social meaning of this practice and its historical origins can be found in John Kieshnick’s ‘The Symbolism of the Monk’s Robe in China’ (Asia Major (Third Series), Vol. 12, Issue 1, Jan, 1999), pgs. 23-27. The exact year in which the robe was bestowed on Hanshan is the subject of continuing debate; however, each account dates this event in the early 1590s. A brief summary of these dates and the sources which assert them is given in Zhang, ‘A Fragile Revival,’ pg. 142.

8 See ibid.

9 Noting Hanshan’s later reflection that ‘a disaster comes from good fortune,’ Zhang’s ‘A Fragile Revival’ reveals that in Hanshan’s own account his fall from grace was sudden, and the contrast between his previous privileged existence and the deprivations and sufferings he subsequently endured could not have been greater. One of the causes of Hanshan’s sufferings was the sudden change in the attitude of the emperor Wanli. Hanshan stated that the emperor’s ‘rage was like a thunderclap,’ and that Hanshan was forced to endure various forms of torture and deprivation in prison before being ‘mercifully’ exiled. See pg. 142.

10 Hsu’s A Buddhist Leader argues that Hanshan’s entanglement in ‘the power struggle between the emperor and his mother’ had its initial roots in Hanshan’s decision that a dharma assembly be held during a ceremony offering prayers for the birth of the emperor’s first son, wherein Hanshan ‘had not acted according to the advice of the court officials who, though sent by the dowager, were more loyal to the emperor’ (pg. 75). For a more thorough analysis on the court struggles that lay behind Hanshan’s persecution, including a discussion on this assembly, see Zhang ‘A Fragile Revival,’ pgs. 134-149 (especially pgs. 134-139, 142-147).
Leiyang had, just prior to Hanshan’s arrival, been devastated by climatic anomalies, resulting in widespread famine, rampant plagues, unchecked banditry, and intermittent outbreaks of civil unrest. The horror of these scenes, and the intense emotional suffering that exposure to them engendered in Hanshan, are core themes in Hanshan’s “Poems on Serving in the Army” (*Congjun shi*) 《從軍詩》 (hereafter referred to as ‘Army Poems’), which were composed shortly after he arrived in Leiyang and are contained in the *Dream Travels* collection (discussed below). According to Hanshan’s own accounts of the early period of his exile, he was afflicted by deep despair; he even intimated that execution, as opposed to exile, would have been the more merciful punishment.12

*From Trial to Triumph: Post Exile Rise and Legacy*

After finding solace and strength in his faith, Hanshan gathered the fortitude to recover from this setback. Not long after settling in Lingnan, he began to play an active role in providing disaster relief, proselytising in the local community, and interacting with influential local gentry-officials. These activities helped Hanshan to quickly overcome the stigma of his exile and also raised his profile in Lingnan. In 1600 he resumed his career as an eminent Buddhist leader and fulfilled a long-held career aspiration by becoming the abbot of the renowned Baolin temple (寶林寺) at Caoxi (漕溪) – famous as the temple of the Venerable Huineng (慧能 638-713), the 6th Chan Patriarch.13 In his mid-60s, Hanshan finally received a belated exoneration for his ‘crimes’ and was officially released from exile. He subsequently spent several years travelling, wrote prodigiously, and became the abbot of the famous Fayun (‘Dharma-cloud’) temple (法雲寺) at Mount Lu (廬山) – one of the most venerable Buddhist temples in Chinese Buddhism. In his late 70s, Hanshan returned to Caoxi. During the second year of the reign of the Tianqi emperor (1623), he died there at the age of 78.

---

11 This collection, which features only eight poems and a brief explanatory note, appears in fascicle 47 of Hanshan’s *Dream Travels*. Several passages from this collection that address this theme are presented later in this chapter.

12 See, for instance, ‘Army Poems’, in *Dream Travels*, fascicle 47: (CBETA, X73, no. 1456, p. 792, a13-16 // Z 2:32, p. 435, a10-13 // R127, p. 869, a10-13) (this passage is quoted later in this chapter). Daosheng mentions the emperor’s ‘mercy’ (that is, for not executing him) on a number of occasions; however, it is apparent that, in this and one or two other sources composed soon after his exile, Hanshan was being sarcastic. I discuss this point in greater detail later in this chapter.

13 Hsu’s *A Buddhist Leader in Ming China* mentions that in a meeting between Hanshan and Zibo Zhengke in 1592, the two had already discussed plans to go to Caoxi to ‘revive the succession of the Ch’an patriarch, Huineng.’ (pg. 79).
As noted, Hanshan is celebrated as one of the prime movers of the Buddhist renewal in his era, especially in the Lingnan area.\(^{14}\) A man of many talents, he is regarded as having been an erudite Buddhist scholar,\(^{15}\) an innovative syncretist, a key instigator of the revival of monastic poetry in the Jiangnan region,\(^{16}\) and a model ‘loyal’ monastic subject. In appraisals of his legacy, his achievements prior to his exile are seen to be at least as significant as his later ones. However, his religious thought continued to evolve in significant ways in his exile and post-exile period, and a substantial number of the religious and literary writings for which he is most famous were composed at that time. These writings include a large portion of his most famous literary work, a work that contains many of his reflections on his life and religious thought during and after his exile: his highly eclectic 55-fascicle literary anthology *The Dream Travels Collection of Old Man Hanshan* (*Hanshan laoren mengyou ji* 《憨山老人夢遊集》), hereafter *Dream Travels*.

**Exile, Poetry and Enlightenment – Hanshan’s New Ideas on the Radical Identification of Secular Poetry with ‘Genuine Chan’**

What, then, was the significance and impact of Hanshan’s experience of exile? At first sight, his exile would appear to have been a notable but not major interlude in an otherwise successful monastic career. However, a closer reading of his *Dream Travels* reveals that this

\(^{14}\) Hanshan is given the epithet ‘dharma-inheritor of the Caoxi restoration’ (曹溪中興嗣法) in an epitaph etched on a memorial pagoda that was composed by the late-Ming thinker Wu Yingbin (吳應賓 1564-1635) – the maternal grandfather of the famous philosopher, and disciple of Juelang Daosheng, Fang Yizhi (方以智 1611-1671). The contents of this inscription are contained in the appendices of *Dream Travels*, fascicle 55: (CBETA, X73, no. 1456, p. 847, a10-11 // Z 2:32, p. 489, d4-5 // R127, p. 978, b4-5). Hanshan’s legacy and influence on subsequent developments of Buddhism in the Lingnan region is discussed briefly in Jiang Boqin’s *Shilian Dashan yu Aomen Chanshi*, pgs. 8-9.

\(^{15}\) Hanshan’s commentaries mainly focused on the *Saddharmapundarīka Sūtra* (Lotus Sūtra), *Avatamsaka Sūtra* (*Lanākāvatāra Sūtra*) and *Śūraṅgama Sūtra*. A selective outline and brief discussions on some of these works, are provided in Hsu’s *A Buddhist Leader in Ming China*, pgs. 4-10.

\(^{16}\) In an analysis of the origin and early transformation of this trend, Liao Chao-heng asserts that Hanshan and his dharma brother Xuelang Hongen were ‘the initiators (推動者) of the late-Ming monastic custom of discussing poetry.’ See Liao’s *Zhong-bian, shi-chan*, pgs. 30, 31. As noted by Liao, Hanshan himself stated that during his time monastic poetry ‘had not been well known… In Jiangnan, Xue and I initiated [it]’ 後則無聞焉…江南則予與雪浪創起 (*Dream Travels*, fascicle 47 (CBETA, X73, no. 1456, p. 786, a16-19 // Z 2:32, p. 429, a13-16 // R127, p. 857, a13-16). Support for this assertion was advanced by the famous poet and thinker Qian Qianyi (錢謙益 1582-1664), who observed that ‘in the Wanli era [1573-1620], many of the Jiangnan monks were broadly conversant with the arts of brush and ink – the esteemed gentleman (Xue) and the Grand Venerable Han[shan] were [their] guides’ 萬曆中，江南開士多博通翰墨者，亦公與憨山大師為導師也 (Biographies [of Authors Included in the Work] Collected Poetry Ordered by Reign (*Liechao shiji xiaozhuan*) 《列朝詩集小傳》 (Taipei: Shijie shuju, Rpt. 1985), pg. 704). Brief mention of the pioneering role of Hanshan is also presented in Yang Yuqing (楊遇青) ‘Mingmo Qingchu zhu gaoseng de wenxue sixiang yu chuanguzuo’ 〈明末清初諸高僧的文學思想與創作〉 (*Wu-Yue fofiao* 《吳越佛教》, No. 5, 2010), pgs. 125-128.
bitter experience had an enormous transformative effect upon his religious thought. This has been pointed out in Dewei Zhang’s PhD dissertation ‘A Fragile Revival: Chinese Buddhism under the Political Shadow.’ Based mainly on readings of selected passages from Hanshan’s *Dream Travels*, Zhang notes that Hanshan saw his exile as a trial that helped him to make substantial spiritual progress\(^\text{17}\) and even went so far as to state that he had ‘entered the law [that is, *dharma* 法] of the Buddha through the law of the King’ 因王法而入佛法.\(^\text{18}\) As I shall elaborate upon later, Hanshan’s *Record of Contemplation of the Laṅkāvatāra Sūtra* *(Guan Lengqie jing ji)* 《觀楞伽經記》\(^\text{19}\) (hereafter *Contemplation of the Laṅkāvatāra*) states explicitly that his experience of exile prompted the new insights into the teachings that were the main theme of this text.

These transformations in Hanshan’s religious thought were complemented by significant changes in his approach to literature during and after his exile. As is evident in his *Dream Travels*, soon after he was exiled Hanshan began to read widely in, and to appraise positively, the body of prose and poetry writings in which gentry-officials of antiquity recounted their personal experiences of being exiled. He also began to write prose and poems that were not dissimilar in style to these texts. These writings were very different from the types of prose and poems usually composed by monks, especially in their expression of emotional anguish and veiled critiques of contemporary politics, yet according to Hanshan himself, the poems of this type that he composed were widely read and highly praised. Hanshan seems to have had few problems in his exile and post-exile period with the possibility that such ‘secular’ poems would be viewed as conflicting with his clerical identity.

The overall significance of Hanshan’s exile in his life and religious thought is an important issue that I feel needs to be reappraised, but it is beyond the purview of this chapter.\(^\text{20}\) What is most pertinent in relation to this study is that certain developments in Hanshan’s religious

---

\(^{17}\) See, for instance, Liao Chao-heng’s *Zhong-bian, Shi-chan*.

\(^{18}\) *Dream Travels*, fascicle 14: (CBETA, X73, no. 1456, p. 554, a14 // Z 2:32, p. 197, a17 // R127, p. 393, a17).

\(^{19}\) *Xuzangjing*, Vol. 17, No. 326.

\(^{20}\) Hsu and Araki Kengo have advanced different paradigms for the division of Hanshan’s life and monastic career. The former, in his *A Buddhist Leader in Ming China*, divided it into 9 stages, and the latter – focusing on Hanshan’s life from the start of his monastic career – divides it into 4 stages (see his *Yōmeigaku no kaiten to Bukkyō*, chapter 6, ‘Kansan Tokusei no shōgai to sono shisō,’ pg. 151). Both of these paradigms mark Hanshan’s exile as a key juncture in both his life and his monastic career. My division of his life into two stages of before exile and after exile (or during and after exile) does not challenge these existing periodisations, but is a pragmatic measure to establish a historical context for discussing his later thought on poetry. I do, however, recognise Dewei Zhang’s findings (‘A Fragile Revival’) that Hanshan’s exile precipitated, in both his own estimation and those of some of his contemporaries, a breakthrough in terms of his spiritual progress. Drawing upon Zhang’s findings, I discuss this position in more detail later in this chapter.
thought during and after his exile appear to have directly influenced his approach to poetry, and, by the same token, the changes in his approach to poetry appear to have also influenced his approach to Buddhist practice. This mutual influence is most evident in the ideas that he formed after his exile period regarding how ‘secular’ poetry can serve to enlighten people – or how, in his own words, ‘poetry is genuine Chan’ 詩乃真禪也. However, a more important point where the two connected with each other was in a newly emerged view that the ‘hellish’ and ‘nightmarish’ experience of exile had literary and religious value. It presented, respectively, a scene to be depicted in the ‘genuine’ poem, and a site conducive to ‘genuine’ Buddhist training. Firstly, we may note that in reference to his experience of exile, Hanshan once stated that ‘the [hells of] swirling fires and mountains of blades are all ultimately bodhimandala sites [places of enlightenment] for attaining supreme nirvāṇa’ 火聚、刀山無非究竟寂滅道場地. Secondly, this corresponded with the idea that the type of poetry that best exemplifies ‘Chan’ is not that which recounts the ‘purity and coolness’ (qingliang 清涼) of the mountain retreat, but rather that which brings attention to the ‘hellish’ qualities of the desolate, tropical setting in which he was exiled. This idea is most explicitly presented in the postscript to his ‘Army Poems’ collection, which described his early experiences of exile.

**Recounting the ‘Nightmare’ – Hanshan’s ‘Postscript to Poems on Serving in the Army’**

Hanshan’s ‘Postscript to Poems on Serving in the Army’ 〈題從軍詩後〉 discusses some of the main reasons why he wrote a poetry collection that primarily describes his experiences. It reads as follows:

Leiyang [Leizhou] is right at the southernmost point of the country. Su Dongpo’s inscription declares it to be ‘the first of the ten thousand mountains.’ It is what is 21

---

called a place where the waters and mountains reach their furthest extent. Geomancers say that it is ‘The End of the Dragon.’ For this reason, many loyal officials and righteous gentlemen of antiquity were exiled here; its ethers dictated that this be so.

Although Squire Kou did not reside here for very long, up till now elders still talk about him excessively. Long ago, Su Dongpo was sent down to Dan [Hainan] and [his brother] Ziyou was also moved here. And it is the case that among the relics of the West Lake, there is a memorial temple for Squire Kou and a pavilion for Squire Su; the landscape is beautiful and the surrounding vistas are still there. This contrasts with those [other] monks who came to the frontier garrisons. Long ago during the Song, Dahui [Zonggao (1089-1163)] was sent to Meiyang, and [Huihong] Juefan was condemned to military service in Zhuya. Ah! The two old ones preceded me by 500 years! The fact that I have now been granted mercy and sent here is a miraculous event that happens perhaps once every one thousand years. Among the monks exiled to the garrisons in our Holy Dynasty only our founding patriarch, Chan Master Qia of Nanzhou, was convicted for his defence of the Emperor Jianwen. Chengzu pardoned him. His disciple Delu was sent to the garrison here, but was soon set free to return. Then there was someone two hundred or more years later who was convicted of the crime of praying for blessings for the state and came here. How insignificant! When I arrived, I became abbot of the old temple in the west of the town. In Squire Su Dongpo’s pavilion, gentleman scholars were vying to talk of Squire Po as if it was only yesterday. Yet when I enquired about the old matters relating to Juefan, there was not a trace.

Lingnan’s climate is significantly different from that of the central region. The ethers (qi 氣) of each of the four seasons are not in accordance with [the natural patterns of] heaven and earth. It is like the pure yang of the trigram qian (乾) transforming to become the li trigram (離).’ Li denotes the quadrant of fire and [through it] the ten thousand things can all be seen. A stifling density creates sweltering heat, while an open luxuriance creates variegated brightness. People only see the stifling density of the scene, not the wonder of openness and comprehension. Hence in prose and poetry the subtleties of creation cannot be exhausted.

When I first arrived here, I suffered a seasonal illness. Consequently, during this time I wrote a commentary on the Laṅkāvatāra Sūtra. I had thought that I had deep insight into the profundities of the Buddha and the Patriarchs; hence this experience was of assistance to this.26 I have never sought to excel in poetry, but since [being

---

25 Leiyang, whose likely meaning came from its geographical location ‘north of the Lei River’ (雷水之陽), commonly referred to Leizhou prefecture. A discussion on the origin and relationship between the two terms Leizhou and Leiyang can be found in Tang Youbo (唐有伯) ‘Leizhou’ ji qi bieming ‘Leiyang’ kaoshi’ 〈雷州及其別名‘雷陽’考釋〉 (in Zhejiang shifan xueyuan xuebao 《浙江師範學院學報》, Vol. 5, 2012), pgs. 117-121.

26 ‘自謂深窺佛祖之奧,蓋實有資於是也.’ This line is somewhat ambiguous. It could be read as implying that Hanshan’s deeper understanding of the Laṅkāvatāra was the thing that was ‘assisted’ by Hanshan’s bitter experience of exile in ‘hot’ Lingnan. This interpretation is supported by the fact that in many letters Hanshan stated that the experience of exile was fruitful for his spiritual development. Furthermore, this explanation agrees with what is said above about the climate of Lingnan, in particular the point that ‘stifling heat’ (hence the seasonal illness) could be a catalyst to enlightenment. However, in a letter to his disciple Miaofeng Fudeng (妙峰福登 1540-1612) that has been examined by Dewei Zhang in his ‘A Fragile Revival’ (pg. 147), Hanshan states the following: ‘When not shouldering a lance, I dedicated myself to delving into the mind-seal of the
forced to serve in the army and come here, my poetry has spread across the country. The wise all view it as ‘Chan’; it can demonstrate that mind (心) and setting (境) are merged without one being aware that this is so. Because of this, one knows that the marvel of the poetry of the ancients lies in the fact that the sentiments are genuine and the settings are authentic.

雷陽正當南極。東坡題曰「萬山第一」，所謂水窮山盡處也。形家稱為盡龍,故古之忠臣義士，被謫者多在於此，氣使然也。寇公居之未久，至今父老侈談。昔東坡謫儋耳;子由亦遷至。而西湖遺事,寇公有祠,蘇公有亭。山川之勝,景物依然。然僧來戍者,昔宋之大慧徙梅陽,覺範戍珠厓。噫!二百餘年矣!今余蒙恩遣至此,蓋亦上下千載奇事。惟我聖朝僧戍者,獨我始祖南洲洽禪師,為護建文駕獲罪，成祖赦之;以其弟子德錄戍於此，尋即放還，及某二百餘年矣，頃亦為國祝釐，獲罪而至此，豈無謂哉!余至,主於城西古寺。坡公亭中,士子爭談坡公如昨日。及訪覺範故事,則杳然矣。天南風物迥異中洲;四時之氣亦不與天地準,如「乾」之純陽變而為「離」。「離」火方也:萬物皆相見。鬱為炎熱;鬯為文明。人但見景物之鬱,不見通暢之妙,故於文章詞賦,不能盡其造化之微。余初至時遭歲厲,遂於此中註楞伽經;自謂深窺佛祖之奧,蓋實有資於是也。向不求工於詩。自從軍來此,詩傳之海內;智者皆以禪目之,是足以徵心境混融，有不自知其然者。由是亦知古人之詩，妙在於情真境實耳。28

Hanshan’s ‘Army Poems’ is a sequence of 8 poems (consisting of a combined total of 700 characters) 29 that, almost in their entirety, take as their theme the ‘hellish’ scenes and sufferings that confronted him during the initial period of his banishment in Leiyang. These poems were originally composed very soon after Hanshan’s exile (in 1596), and were printed some time subsequent to this by a gentry associate whom he has identified as ‘Ziyuan’ (紫垣).
The poems, which are included in the *Dream Travels* collection, are accompanied by a short descriptive introductory note composed by Hanshan, that discusses how being confronted by the horrors of exile provided the impetus for this work and asserts the poems’ ‘authenticity’ (*zhen*). The ‘postscript’ that is translated above and is the focus of my analysis below was evidently written some time later than the poems themselves and the introductory note which accompanied them, apparently upon Ziyuan’s request, and it appears in a different section of *Dream Travels* (fascicle 32) from the ‘Army Poems.’ It is in this postscript that Hanshan’s ideas about the religious value of these poems are first elaborated in some detail.

The postscript can be divided into four sections. The first section talks about Leiyang’s long-standing status in dynastic history as a site of exile and describes the geomantic foundations for this: its topography resembles ‘the end’ of the ‘dragon,’ which both symbolises and effects the end of the exiled subject’s prospects for high office. The second section talks about the long history of renowned scholar-officials being exiled to Leiyang, and notes the richness and easy accessibility of written materials that discuss their experiences – in contrast with the scarcity of information about the few monks who had been sent to army garrisons (and to Leiyang in particular) in the past and the scarcity of poetry in which monks recounted such experiences. The third section, invoking *yin-yang* theory, discusses the suffering that Lingnan engendered as an oppressively hot place, and asserts that this quality made it an ideal site for attaining spiritual awakening. Hanshan continues by noting that this was something that was often not appreciated by exiled scholar-officials who composed ‘prose and poetry’ that recorded their experiences of being banished to such a place. The fourth and final paragraph, which makes vague references to the *Laṅkāvatāra Sūtra*, asserts that the poetry that Hanshan composed during the early stages of his exile can enlighten readers who are...

---

30 Extant versions can be found in fascicle 47 of Hanshan’s *Dream Travels* (X73, no. 1456, p. 792, a1–b10). Part of it – 3 poems – is recorded in Qian Qianyi’s *Collection of Poems from Different Reigns* (*Liechao Shiji*) (《列朝詩集》 (Beijing: Beijing chubanshe, 2000). In this work these poems were collectively titled ‘Three Poems on Serving in the Army: Composed in the Bingshen Year (1596) when entering Wuyang [Lingnan] during the Second Month of Spring, [and] on the Tenth Day of the Third Month when Arriving in Leiyang’ (从軍詩三首丙申春二月入五羊三月十日抵雷陽所作). These poems are featured in the third fascicle of the last section of Qian Qianyi’s anthology, titled the ‘*Run* Collection’ (‘Run ji’) (《閏集》 (featuring the works of monks, women and other ‘non-mainstream’ or non-gentry-literati authors). As I shall discuss later in this chapter, Qian Qianyi regarded himself as a disciple of Hanshan, and a total of 46 of Hanshan’s poems can be found in this collection. It is possible that Ziyuan could refer to the high-ranking late Ming official Li Ruoxing (李若星: *jinshi* 1604), whose courtesy name was Ziyuan. However, I have been unable to find concrete evidence supporting this conclusion.

31 “the phraseology is crude… but the sentiments and setting are lifelike. I believe they are not adorned words.” 其辭鄙俚,殊不成章。而情境逼真,諒非綺語. *Dream Travels*, fascicle 47: (CBETA: X73, no. 1456, p. 791, c23).

32 In Chinese divination systems, especially in the *Book of Changes*, the dragon is a symbol of ambition and success in high office.
sufficiently cultivated to understand its messages (he appears to extend this view of the value of poetry about exile to that written by elevated gentry poets). He states that these poems can be identified with Chan because of their qualities of being zhen (genuine) with regard to the setting that is depicted as well as to the author’s sentiments.

This structure, I suggest, presents an argument that Hanshan’s composition of this markedly ‘non-Buddhist’ poetry collection should not be regarded as being inappropriate in the light of his monastic identity. Hanshan appears to have advanced two reasons to support this proposition. First, it was acceptable for him to draw upon a non-Buddhist or ‘secular’ tradition of cathartic poetry to come to terms with the predicament of being exiled in an army garrison, because the Buddhist canon – which monks should seek to draw upon first and foremost – had few resources that could be of assistance in this regard. Second, Hanshan proposed that poetry of this kind can, in spite of its ‘secular’ identity, be identified with ‘Chan.’ These two reasons may help us explain why Hanshan came to form the idea that zhen exile poetry, as opposed to more conventional Buddhist poems, could have religious value, and how his original impetus for writing poems of this type may have shaped his understanding of their religious meaning. We will explore these two arguments, and textual evidence that may support them, in greater depth below.

Exile Poetry – a Skilful Means for a Banished ‘Loyal’ Monk

We will first address Hanshan’s apparent belief that it was excusable (even if not ideal) for him to draw upon a ‘secular’ tradition of cathartic poetry associated with exiled gentry-officials to deal with his experience of banishment in Leifeng. 33 This argument was also put forward, and articulated very similarly, in Hanshan’s preface to the Dream Travels Poetry Collection (Mengyou shiji zixu) 《夢遊詩集自序》, a text that introduces a poetry collection produced after his exile. In both these texts Hanshan drew attention to the fact that few monks had been exiled to army garrisons in the past, and that, to his knowledge, none of those that were had written anything substantial about their experiences. 34 It is intimated that

33 The idea that Hanshan’s ‘Army Poems’ were composed for therapeutic reasons is advanced in Wu Hwang-chang’s ‘Mingmo gaoseng de shiwen yu qi texing zaixian.’ According to Wu: ‘the bitter experience of joining the army in Lingnan was what initially prompted his composition [of ‘Army Poems’]. These sad and bitter feelings had to be spat out in poetry’ (pg 232). He also stated that ‘Army Poems’ ‘is an example of how an eminent monk faced up to feelings of disconsolateness’ (pg. 225). See also pgs. 233-237.

34 Hanshan’s ‘Preface to Dream Travels Poetry Collection’ states: ‘In the past and in the present one has rarely seen monks serving in the frontier garrisons. In the late Tang there was Guquan, and in the Song there were two people: Dahui, Juefan. In the Ming, however, I myself am the only one. Guquan died in the army camp. All that remains is a gāthā composed at the time of his death... Dahui was moved to Meiyang; however, he expressed
there were few resources in the Buddhist canon, or in the literary collections of monks, that Hanshan could draw from to help him come to terms with this distinctive predicament. Hence it was understandable that he would find solace and inspiration in the cathartic poetry written by eminent officials of antiquity who were exiled in army garrisons, especially given the richness and accessibility of these sources and the fact that the post-exile triumphs of these eminent officials were often discussed by locals (for example, those of Su Dongpo (蘇東坡 1037-1101)).

Hanshan appears to suggest that for him to imitate the style of these poems was a case of adopting special measures to deal with a specific kind of malaise. This idea that poetry can serve as a ‘skilful means’ to deal with a specific kind of malaise is stated more clearly in Hanshan’s ‘Preface to the Dream Travels Poetry Collection’ (《夢遊詩集自序》) (discussed later in this chapter). However, in drawing upon a tradition of cathartic poetry associated with eminent ‘loyal’ subjects of antiquity who were similarly exiled to army garrisons, it was not Hanshan’s intention (as Pei-yi Wu claims in regard to Hanshan’s chronological autobiography) to assert his ‘self identity as a Confucian hero,’ or that this would ‘overshadow’ his Buddhist identity.  

However, there are reasons to believe that Hanshan’s attempts to draw inspiration from the writings of banished gentry-officials may not have been as reluctant as he claimed. Perhaps the most important one is that it is clear from Hanshan’s autobiographic writings that he saw close parallels between his own situation as an ‘exiled’ subject and that of the ‘righteous’ exiled officials of antiquity. These similarities extended far beyond the basic fact that both he and many gentry officials had been banished to frontier garrisons. Hanshan felt that they shared a similar narrative; he too was a politically active ‘loyal’ subject who had been deprived of the affections of his lord due to the actions of jealous factional enemies, and had been wrongly persecuted, so he perceived a connection between the way he felt and the emotions expressed or alluded to by exiled ‘gentry’ authors. This is particularly apparent himself [only] in Chan sayings, having [composed] the Armory of the Gate of the [Chan] School. Juefan was demoted to Zhuya, and had the Summit Commentary on the Śūraṅgama Sūtra. Records of his poetry collections are also scarce. 且僧之從戍者,古今不多見。在唐末則谷泉,而宋則大慧、覺範二人。在明則唯予一人而已。谷泉卒於軍中;所傳者唯臨終一偈,曰:「今朝六月六。谷泉受罪足。不是上天堂。便是入地獄」;言訖而化。大慧徙梅陽,則發於禪語,有宗門武庫。覺範貶珠厓,則有楞嚴頂論. In Dream Travels, fascicle 47: (CBETA, X73, no. 1456, p. 786, b1-7 // Z 2:32, p. 429, b4-10 // R127, p. 857, b4-10).

35 In his ‘Preface to Dream Travels Poetry Collection’, Hanshan stated: ‘[in regard to the experience of exile] those of my path [that is, monks] are shamed before the virtuous people of the past. What they suffered surpasses our sufferings and their time in exile was longer. What we have endured cannot be compared with the case [of exiled officials] in the past either’. 顧予道愧先德:所遭過之,而時且久,所遇亦非昔比也. In Dream Travels, fascicle 47: (CBETA, X73, no. 1456, p. 786, a24-b8 // Z 2:32, p. 429, b3-11 // R127, p. 857, b3-11).

36 See Wu, ‘The Spiritual Autobiography of Te-Ch’ing,’’ pg. 86.
when we read his own interpretation of the events leading to his exile in his two-fascicle autobiography, the ‘Self-narrated chronological biography’ Zixu nianpu 《自敘年譜》.\textsuperscript{37}

Hanshan’s own understanding of the events leading to his exile – a topic well discussed in Dewei Zhang’s ‘A Fragile Revival’\textsuperscript{38} – can be summarised as follows. In 1595 the emperor, encouraged by senior officials, was angry at the financial burden of his mother’s profligacy in supporting Buddhism, and in particular took issue at the transfer of state treasury resources to monks by palace emissaries under his mother’s command. As the object of the empress dowager’s deepest devotion at that time, Hanshan was, in all likelihood, the key beneficiary of this arrangement. Hanshan became aware that there was also a factional conspiracy in the inner court targeting the emissary who was responsible for transporting sutras to his temple. For these reasons, although Hanshan maintained that he was innocent of any serious wrongdoing, conditions beyond his control had conspired to drag him into the brutal vortex of court intrigue.

Both of these issues came to a head when – according to Hanshan – officials wishing to harm the said emissary had soldiers dress as Daoist priests and deliver a petition to the emperor claiming that Hanshan’s temple had encroached on land that was rightfully theirs. As a result, Hanshan was arrested and tortured in an attempt to extract a confession. He resisted, cleverly proposing that admitting guilt would not be the act of a ‘loyal subject’, because to do so would implicate the empress dowager and create discord between the emperor and his mother, exposing the former to charges of being un-filial.\textsuperscript{39} These pleas thwarted his captors and eventually led to the emperor conducting his own investigation, in which he ordered the examination of both the records of inner court disbursement account books and those of Shandong relief loans. When no evidence of significant impropriety was found, the emperor softened his position. Hanshan was instead charged with the lesser crime of ‘illegally establishing a monastery,’ and on these grounds was condemned to exile.

Like the righteous and ‘loyal’ exiled officials of the past, Hanshan saw in his exile not only the tragedy of political marginalisation and an unwarranted threat to his life’s work, but also a

\textsuperscript{37} Contained in fascicles 53 and 54 of Dream Travels.
\textsuperscript{38} See Zhang, ‘A Fragile Revival’, pgs. 142-146.
narrative of a ‘loyal’ subject becoming the undeserving and unwitting victim of jealousy, intrigue, and factionalism involving rivalry between the inner and the outer courts. This narrative obviously fits the archetype of the ‘Confucian Hero’ that Pei-yi Wu sees as being present in Hanshan’s autobiography.\(^40\) Notably, as pointed out by Dewei Zhang, some of Hanshan’s gentry associates appear to have viewed Hanshan in this way,\(^41\) and this appears to be in line with Hanshan’s assertion that he ‘was convicted of the crime of praying for blessings for the state.’ What is more, Hanshan’s downfall occurred in a time when political intrigue was rife and many (self-proclaimed) ‘loyal’ subjects were subjected to exile; indeed, Hanshan became acquainted with some of them in Lingnan. It is thus not without reason that former ‘loyal’ officials’ writings on exile would have resonated with Hanshan. According to Wu Hwang-chang, Hanshan’s writings appear to have shared with these authors’ works the ancillary function of expressing grievances and protesting innocence – something that Wu has interpreted as being the hidden meaning of the last line of the ‘Army Poems’ postscript.\(^42\)

\(\textit{The Religious Utility of Exile Poetry: Leifeng as ‘Hell-like,’ and the Principle of Suffering as a Crucible for Enlightenment}\)

We have seen why Hanshan might have sought solace in reading the poems of exiled ‘loyal’ officials of antiquity, and in writing poems that were similar to theirs. He appeared to have similar sentimental responses to both the predicament of being exiled and to Leizhou as the site of his exile, marked by impassioned and anguish ed emotions that one would regard as ‘unenlightened’ and would not normally associate with eminent monastic practitioners.

How could this be reconciled with Hanshan’s identity as an eminent monk and his claims that the ‘wise’ should view these poems not merely as literary works, but as ‘Chan’? The answer appears to be that Hanshan felt that the ‘hellish’ or ‘burning’ experience of exile in tropical Leifeng could be the very quality that imbued \textit{zhen} exile poetry with spiritual power. As he implied in his ‘Army Poems’ postscript, the untamed \textit{yang} energy that is the source of ‘fire’

\(^{40}\) See Wu, ‘The Spiritual Autobiography of Te-Ch’ing.’

\(^{41}\) See Zhang, ‘A Fragile Revival,’ pgs. 149, 166-167. Zhang also states: ‘when Deqing was exiled, scholar-officials saw him off in a way that they did to officials who were demoted or exiled for their criticism of the emperor’ (pg. 167)

\(^{42}\) Wu’s interpretation revolves around his reading of the pejorative term 覆瓿 from the second last line of this preface (as this line is not relevant to understanding Hanshan’s poetic thought, I have not included it in English in the above translation). See ‘Mingmo gaoseng de shiwen yu qi texing zaixian,’ pg. 237.
and its capacity for producing ‘sweltering heat’ can also become the source of fire’s capacity for illuminating ‘brightness’ and ‘comprehension.’

We may consider the ways in which the experience of exile in Leifeng was ‘hell-like’ for the unenlightened gentry author that had been banished there. As noted, for exiled officials, Leizhou represented the ‘end of the dragon’, a place that they associated with eternal political purgatory; as a tropical region, it was also likely to be seen by those who had formerly lived nearer to the centres of Ming power in the ‘cooler’ climate of China’s north as oppressively hot. In other words, Leizhou was a personal ‘hell’ for the ‘loyal’ official who was banished there. This ‘hellish’ quality was a product of the coming together or ‘mixing’ of the sentiments (that is, the mind) of the banished or marginalised ‘loyal’ official and Leizhou as the (oppressively hot) site of exile (that is, the setting/scene). The experience of being in ‘hell’ was very ‘real’ for the banished official who served his exile in Leifeng, and the realness of this experience could be communicated when the scene and the sentiments that he experienced during his exile are recorded ‘authentically.’

How would the ‘authentic’ poetic depiction of the ‘hell-like’ nature of an unenlightened exiled official’s lived experience help others to ‘exhaust’ the ‘subtleties of creation’ and become enlightened? One explanation might be that reading the poems could help people to realise that the world they lived in was nothing other than the ‘burning house’ huo zhai 火宅 of samsāra. Recounting the ‘hellish’ experience of exile could help others to break down the false allure of the samsaric world and see its true nature. This idea appears to underlie Hanshan’s invocation of the yin-yang theory that the pure yang force of the qian trigram was capable of transforming into the li trigram (an important symbol of ‘ultimate enlightenment’ in the Chan school).44 The hellish ‘fire’ not only burns and engenders suffering; it can also project an illuminating light which can reveal ‘truth’. Through reflecting on one’s suffering in

43Another work which makes reference to the ‘burning house’ is the poem that precedes the ‘Army Poems’ in the Dream Travels Poetry Collection, which is titled ‘An Ode Sent to Shen Langqu [that I Composed upon] Hearing that He is Practicing in Solitude in the Walled City of Gusu’ (‘Wen Shen Langqu yanguan Gusu cheng zhong ge yi ji zhi’〈聞沈朗臞掩關姑蘇城中歌以寄之〉). See Dream Travels, fascicle 47 (CBETA, X73, no. 1456, p. 791, c7-8 // Z 2:32, p. 434, c16-17 // R127, p. 868, a16-17).

44The li trigram was often valorised by the Chan school (in particular the Caodong lineage), as mainstream interpretations of it were seen to be compatible with Buddhist ideas about cultivation and enlightenment. This included interpreting the trigram: a) as fire, representing spiritual advancement, b) as the ‘sun,’ shining light on the ten thousand things (that is, ‘illuminating’ truth), and c) as an ‘eye,’ investigating into the subtleties of things and having lucid understanding. For a discussion on this, see Sung-pai Chen [Chen Rongbo] 陳榮波 Yijing ligua yu Caodong chan 〈易經離卦與曹洞禪〉, (Huagang foxue xuebao 《華崗佛學學報》, No. 04, 1985), pgs. 224-244. The above analogies are provided on pgs. 226-227.
the furnace of searing fire and ‘stifling density,’ one can gain a more lucid comprehension of the phenomenal world (that is, the ‘subtleties of creation’ (zaohua zhi wei 造化之微)).

This point was arguably alluded to in several letters written by Hanshan in which he noted that the experience of exile served as a crucible for forging awakening.\textsuperscript{45} Dewei Zhang has noted that the Chongzhen Emperor (崇禎, r. 1627-1644) apologetically stated several decades after Hanshan’s exile that the Wanli Emperor had exiled him to Leiyang in order to ‘try him spiritually.’\textsuperscript{46} Regardless of what intentions Hanshan himself imputed to Wanli, it is clear that he agreed that the experience of this ‘trial’ was beneficial to him in terms of his spiritual progress. As noted, he spoke of ‘entering the law of the Buddha through the law of the King’, and stated that the suffering that exile brought about had inspired him to ‘urge myself forward intensively, daring not to be lazy even a little bit.’\textsuperscript{47} These efforts were – by his own account at least – not only inspired, but also fruitful. In letters to several monastic disciples and associates, he states that the experience of exile had facilitated significant spiritual progress.\textsuperscript{48}

There are a number of places in his writings on ‘Army Poems’ and \textit{The Dream Travels Poetry Collection} where Hanshan emphasised that his poetry sought to bring out the ‘hellish’ qualities of Leizhou. For instance, his preface to the \textit{Dream Travels Poetry Collection} states that when he first arrived there, he felt as though he was ‘dreaming of falling into [one of the three] perilous realms’ 夢墮險道\textsuperscript{49} (that is, the realms of hell, hungry ghosts and animals). The preface also records that when he first arrived, ‘exposed bones covered the fields. It was as though I was sitting in the midst of a cemetery…’ 白骨蔽野。予即如坐屍陀林中\textsuperscript{50} Hanshan’s brief introductory note for his ‘Army Poems’ similarly states: ‘the corpses of those who had starved to death could be seen littering the streets. Fighting filled my sight, plagues

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{45} See Zhang’s ‘A Fragile Revival.’
\item \textsuperscript{46} See \textit{ibid}, pg 147. The term used by the Chongzhen emperor to imply that Hanshan had been ‘subjected to trial’ was ‘鉗錘’ (qianchui) which can here be read to have a double meaning: 1) The two characters can denote shaving the hair and the beatings endured by monks – metaphors for the rigors of monastic training; and 2) a strict teaching or a harsh lesson more generally.
\item \textsuperscript{47} See Zhang, ‘A Fragile Revival,’ pg. 147. This passage has been rendered by Zhang in English as follows: ‘Fifteen years have quickly elapsed since our parting. I really endured great hardships and urged myself forward intensively, daring not be lazy even a little bit.’ 爰自離析以來，忽十五年，實已臥薪嘗膽，痛自策勵，未敢少惰.
\item \textsuperscript{48} For a more detailed account, see \textit{ibid}, pgs. 147-149.
\item \textsuperscript{49} Preface to \textit{Dream Travels Poetry Collection}, \textit{Dream Travels}, fascicle 47: (CBETA, X73, no. 1456, p. 786, a24 // Z 2:32, p. 429, b3 // R127, p. 857, b3).
\end{itemize}
were rampant and the dead and wounded covered the fields. Words cannot convey the pitifulness of this scene. This ‘hellish’ quality is even more evident in the ‘Army Poems’ themselves. One passage, for instance, states: ‘Pestilent mist – the thousand mountain ranges are black;…People mock, and ferocious ghosts have supernatural powers;…Smoked by toxic fog, one’s mind is drunk; Penetrated by hot winds, one’s bones are steamed’ 瘟疫千嶂黑…人靜厲鬼靈…毒霧熏心醉；炎風透骨蒸Another passage states: ‘I once lived in the realm of refreshing cool [lit. ‘pure and cool’]; Now I have ascended to the ‘heaven’ of heat and vexation. The warm and cold winds are different; Uneven are the landforms of north and south.’ 昔住清涼界，今登熱惱天；燠寒風氣別，南北地形偏

These passages, like others in the ‘Army Poems,’ describe the ‘hell-like’ qualities of Lingnan by emphasising the region’s ‘stifling heat.’ In the latter passage, the contrast between the ‘season-less’ heat of Lingnan and the ‘refreshing cool’ of Hanshan’s previous existence in Shandong presents a clear analogy between a more pleasant heavenly realm and a hellish one (‘heat and vexation’ (renao 熱惱) refers to a Buddhist hell and not a ‘heaven’). The comparison exemplifies the idea tacitly presented in Hanshan’s postscript that his personal experience of exile inspired him to feel that the ‘hot and vexatious’, ‘hellish’ realm had some advantages over the ‘pure and cool’ as a site of religious practice. We can argue that this inspired him to feel that zhen exile poetry – poetry that he may have originally turned to for therapeutic purposes to cope with being banished – can be identified with Chan.

As noted in the ‘Introduction’ and ‘Background and Doctrine’ chapters, the religious power of landscape poetry – poetry that portrayed the ‘pure and cool’ of the scene and the author’s mind – was closely related to monastic ideals about ideal sites for spiritual cultivation. Hanshan’s affirmation of the religious value of zhen exile poetry is related here to the view he developed after being exiled that ‘the [hells of] swelling fires and mountains of blades are all ultimately bodhimaṇḍala sites [places of enlightenment] for attaining supreme nirvāṇa.’

Hanshan appears to have spoken about this more explicitly after his exile. At the end of the

preface to his *Dream Travels Poetry Collection*, he revealed that he was reluctant to show others, or to print, poetry whose composition was inspired by what he called the ‘pure realms’ (*qing jing jie 清淨界*) that he had travelled to and resided in previously. He felt that poems inspired by the ‘purity’ of this environment would taint this purity, stating: ‘If we try to capture it with words it would be like flowers in the void that dazzle the eyes: in the final analysis one could not avoid speaking about a dream from within a dream’ 若以文字語言求之則瞥目空華，終不免為夢中說夢也.54 Pleasant or ‘pure’ scenes beguile the observer as they increase the allure of *samsāra* as the object of our fantasy, a ‘dream’ realm. They evoke a desire for the intoxicating comfort of the phenomenal world rather than a wish to attain relief from the ‘burning house.’ Recording a ‘dream’ about ‘falling into the perilous realms’ can be a powerful tool to shatter the allure of the ‘dream’ and to end the perpetuation of its false epistemology. Writing about the ‘nightmarish’ quality of exile in ‘hellish’ Leizhou could be a means to – in Hanshan’s words – ‘call awake people who are idling within the great dream’ 喚醒人間大夢中.55 It could transform the scorching heat of Leifeng into a light that illuminates the ‘subtleties of creation’ and lead to ‘departure from’ (*li 離*) *samsāric* existence. (The word that means ‘departure’ (*li 離*) is the same word as the *li* trigram which, as noted above, the Caodong school revered as the symbol of enlightenment.)

**Awakening from the Dream in Exile: Poetry, Chan and Dream-Speech**

*Literature, Poetry, and ‘Dreams’ – Hanshan’s ‘Preface to the Dream Travels Poetry Collection’*

In addition to the ‘hellish’ qualities of Leifeng, another core characteristic of Hanshan’s portrayal of his experience of being exiled in Lingnan was its ‘surrealness’ – a quality which, like the region’s hellishness, arguably contributed to its value as a site for religious cultivation. Numerous depictions of a surreal or dream-like quality can be found in ‘Army Poems’; for instance, in the lines ‘The ten thousand mountains and the hillside haze merge’ 萬山嵐氣合.56

---

56 ‘Army Poems,’ *Dream Travels*, fascicle 47: (CBETA, X73, no. 1456, p. 792, b5).
‘Pestilent mist – the thousand mountain ranges are black’ 瘴瘟千嶂黑, and in several references to ‘haze,’ ‘miasmic mist’ 瘴烟 and ‘toxic fog’ 毒霧, Hanshan even intimated in his preface to the *Dream Travels Poetry Collection* that the ‘surreal’ or ‘dream-like’ experience of exile was what inspired him to call this collection ‘Dream Travels’: ‘I was granted the emperor’s mercy and banished to Lingnan; I thought I was dreaming that I had fallen into one of the three perilous realms, and, as a result, this theory [about dreams] first came into being’ 蒙恩放嶺海；予以是為夢墮險道也；故其說始存. This preface, like the ‘Army Poems,’ affirmed that the poetry in the collection had religious value for Buddhist disciples.

Why did Hanshan make these assertions? What doctrinal foundations did Hanshan invoke to support this proposition? To answer these questions, we may look at the following passage from his ‘Author’s Preface to the *Dream Travels Poetry Collection*’ 《夢遊詩集自序》:

This collection is called *Dream Travels*. Why choose such a name? The three realms are an abode of dreams. Floating, ephemeral life is like a dream. Going against the flow and going with it, suffering and happiness, prosperity and decay, gain and loss – these are all moments from the events in a dream. Words record the settings [or ‘realms’] (jing 境) that are passed through in dreams; poetry, furthermore, has an intimate closeness with [these] settings. To sum up, all of it is dream-speech (mengyu 夢語). It is sometimes said that Buddhism prohibits adorned language (qiyu 綺語). This is already very much the case with the language of prose; poetry is an even more extreme example of adorned language. What is more, poetry is grounded in sentiment (qing 情), while Chan is a method of transcending sentiment. If it is like this, how could one not then descend into sentiment-based thoughts?

I say that it is not like this. The Buddha said that *saṃsāra* and *nirvāṇa* are like yesterday’s dreams, so the Buddha and the Patriarchs are also people within a dream. Of the one thousand seven hundred parts of the Tripitaka, there is nothing that is not words uttered in sleep (yi yu 寱語).

57 ‘Army Poems,’ *Dream Travels*, fascicle 47: (CBETA, X73, no. 1456, p. 792, a1).
59 The three realms are the world of sensuous desire, the world of form and the formless world of pure spirit.
Hanshan’s ‘Author’s Preface to the Dream Travels Poetry Collection’ was composed very late in his life, in 1621, while he was residing at Kumu Convent (枯木庵) at Mount Xuefeng in Fujian. As such, this arguably represents a more mature development of the ideas on poetry that had begun to germinate in the initial stages of his exile. Like Hanshan’s ‘Army Poems’ postscript, which was also written well after the ‘Army Poems,’ this passage sets out to defend the religious legitimacy of his ‘secular’ poetry. To this end, it introduces two interrelated terms to describe literary language: ‘adorned speech’ (qiyu 綺語) and ‘dream speech’ (mengyu 夢語). These terms (and other terms very similar to them) are typically used pejoratively in Buddhist literature; however, Hanshan appears to be arguing that since Buddhist sutras are also ‘words uttered in sleep’ (yiyu 寢語) and contain adorned language, Buddhists should not reject non-Buddhist poetry on the grounds of it being ‘adorned speech’ or ‘dream speech.’

‘Dream speech’ (夢言說 svapna- √vac?) is one of the four kinds of ‘delusional language’ (妄想語言 vikalpa- √vac?) listed in the Laṅkāvatāra Sūtra. According to a commentary on this sutra written by Hanshan’s friend Zeng Fengyi (曾鳳儀), the term denotes speech that has ‘arisen from the supporting basis of an object (jing 境) [the word that has been generally translated as ‘setting’ in this chapter] that has no actuality’ 依不實境生. An example of this would be speech that expresses reflections on ‘realms’ (or ‘settings’) passed through’ 在先前所經境界 in earlier dreams. If the domains of saṃsāra and nirvāṇa are like ‘yesterday’s dream,’ they are not ontologically different from the illusory ‘realms travelled through’ that are recorded in poetry; hence for Hanshan, the fact that non-Buddhist poetry is ‘dream speech’ should not in itself warrant its proscription.

---

61 Kumu was a small monastic residence approximately 200 metres from the famous Xuefeng Temple (雪峰寺).
62 This preface is found at the beginning of fascicle 47 of Dream Travels. Much of the poetry contained in this collection was composed after Hanshan’s initial exile in Lingnan, although there may be additions from earlier writings.
63 Zeng Fengyi (曾鳳儀 jinshi 1583) mentions Hanshan in his introductory discussion on the inspiration for his ‘Thorough Comprehension of the Fundamental Tenets of the Laṅkāvatāra’ (Lengqie jing zongtong) 《楞伽經宗通》. In this he states ‘I am regarded by Hanshan as an intimate friend’ 我於憨山稱莫逆 (CBETA, X17, no. 330, p. 602, a14 // Z 1:26, p. 167, a11 // R26, p. 333, a11).
64 See Zeng Fengyi’s Thorough Comprehension of the Fundamental Tenets of the Laṅkāvatāra, fascicle 3: ‘It is called the theory of dream-speech because the 6th consciousness remembers a past setting [or object realm] and speech arises from that, just as when one has already awoken after dreaming of a setting that one has previously passed through, and one remembers [what one has dreamt], one’s words and speech arise on the basis of a setting that was not actual.’ 夢言說謂六識憶念過去境界,而言說生焉。如夢先所經境,既已醒覺,乃從而追憶,言說依不實境生 (CBETA, X17, no. 330, p. 670, a8-10 // Z 1.26, p. 234, d14-16 // R26, p. 468, b14-16).
However, we may infer from Hanshan’s choice of the name ‘Dream Travels’ that there is more to his use of this term ‘dream speech’ than first appears. Firstly, it should be noted that while Buddhist sutras purport to reveal to us the dream-like nature of the phenomenal world in order to help us ‘awaken’ from our ‘dream,’ poetry (as Hanshan describes it) only aims to provide an ‘intimate’ and vivid ‘record’ of the dream-like realms we have experienced. That distinction is arguably emphasised in another line from this preface, where Hanshan states that ‘Dharma discourses (dharma vādin), gāthā and stotra are predominantly concerned with supramundane dharmas (paramārthasatya), while poetry is specifically speech that accords with mundane convention (saṃvṛti’)法語偈讚，多出世法，而詩則專為隨俗說也.65

However, this does not appear to imply that poetry is problematic from a Buddhist perspective. Soon after this line, Hanshan states, with regard to poetry: ‘nonetheless [while] dwelling in the defiled world (kleśa) one can mix in conventional truths (saṃvṛtisatya), [and through this] suddenly enter the dharma gate of non-duality [that is, of paramārthasatya and saṃvṛtisatya]’而處塵勞，混俗諦，頓入不二法門’.66

Thus while Buddhist literature approaches the ‘dreamlike’ from the perspective of paramārthasatya, poetry takes the ‘dreamlike’ as its object; it depicts ‘constructed’ or ‘conventional’ reality, or mundane truth (saṃvṛtisatya) as it is experienced by ordinary people. Why would the ‘constructed’ or ‘mundane’ object of ‘dream speech’ have spiritual efficacy? Why would it not have been something that strengthens the ‘false ontology’ or ‘false epistemology' of the figurative ‘dream’?

This question is answered elsewhere in Hanshan’s Dream Travels. In a highly unorthodox understanding of the concept of ‘dream-speech,’ Hanshan describes the steps of ‘intimately’ engaging with ‘dreamscapes’ and ‘authentically’ recollecting them as playing nothing less than a key role in the soteriological process. This understanding is articulated in a text which takes as its core theme the maxim ‘Life is like a floating dream’ (rensēng ru fú mèng 人生浮夢), a maxim which Hanshan stated had influenced his decision to name his poetry collection

---

‘Dream Travels.’ ⁶⁷ We may note the following passage from a letter he composed in reply to ‘Supreme Commander’ Yang Yuanru (楊元孺):

Actually there is nothing too mysterious in this. As for the first step, one is not without a prescribed method. For dealing with the phenomenal world, one first needs to take phenomena (artha 事) from within the dream, and raise them in front of one’s eyes, and carefully observe them in minute detail. One must see them clearly and distinctly, to the point where one unwittingly (不覺) bursts into great laughter. When one arrives at this [point], one suddenly realizes that ordinary speech is like the speech of dreams, and so what was absolutely different [i.e. dream-speech and ordinary speech] will henceforth be treated as the same. One should then, in the moment of a single thought, change tack to take the setting before one’s eyes and place it within a dream and observe it in great detail. When one looks until [the scene is revealed as being] murky (昏沉), burdensome and topsy-turvy (顛倒 viparīta), one will suddenly and fiercely awaken. If one recollects one’s entire life in such a manner and truly searches for the various realms that one has previously passed through, [one will find that] they are utterly unobtainable (了不可得 / 不可得 anupalabha?). ‘Unobtainability’ is the first gate [through which] the Buddha and patriarchs escaped samsāra.

其實就中無甚玄妙, 至於最初一步, 不無其方。吾人處世, 先要將夢中事, 試舉向目前, 細細觀察, 定要的的看到, 不覺發一大笑處, 到此則頓覺尋常說如夢話頭, 迥然不同, 即將一同處, 一念轉將目前境界置向夢中細細觀察,看到昏沉沉重顛倒實, 忽然猛覺來, 如此則回觀平生, 向來歷過一切種種境界, 諦實求之, 了不可得, 了不可得處即是諸佛祖師出生死第一關也.

In other words, one can see the true reality of life when one recognises that the phenomenal world is in many ways the same as our ‘dreamscapes.’ One can achieve this understanding, firstly, by doing what some Buddhist texts caution against: one should ‘intimately’ recount the ‘objects’ (the ‘settings’ or ‘realms’ 境) observed in our dreams. However, this should not be done to make claims that objects that do not exist actually exist (‘dream-speech’ in the pejorative sense). Rather, it should be done to make clear the absurdity of the idea that the objects we see in a dream could actually be real. This can be done by doing nothing other than authentically describing the dreamscape observed (‘dream-speech’ in a non-pejorative sense). Secondly, one should apply the same process to actual objects perceived in the real

---

⁶⁷ Here Hanshan conspicuously drew from, and even ascribed a positive religious value to, the ‘dream-speech’ theory that was presented (pejoratively) in Chinese commentarial works on the Lankāvatāra Sūtra – including his own Contemplation of the Lankāvatāra.

world. As a result, one will become suddenly awakened; one will finally see that the so-called ‘real world’ is just like an unreal dreamscape. One will see that both are ‘mucky, burdensome and topsy-turvy’, and one will see that the objects we have encountered in the so-called ‘real world’ were never ‘real’ to begin with. By extending this method to memories of ‘the realms passed through’ earlier in life, one will understand that ‘life is like a floating dream.’ At this point, one enters into the path of true awakening.

We may conclude that for Hanshan, through this process of comparing our recollections of fresh reality with our ‘dream-speech,’ we can reach a stage when we realise that apparent reality is no more real than a dream, and we can break away from the false epistemology that characterises unenlightened experience. This method appears to provide a concrete guide for how, in Hanshan's words, ‘the student of dao... penetrate[s] the real nature of all phenomenal realms so that he will not be pushed around by illusory causal conditions.’ Or, as Sung-peng Hsu encapsulates it: ‘Man is caught in the illusory net of karma, but he can use the illusory power to realize the nominal nature so that he will no longer be subject to it.’

Thus Hanshan’s position that poetry as ‘dream speech’ can lead to enlightenment is shown to have had a clear doctrinal foundation. Through its focus on an authentic depiction of a false ‘reality,’ and by not taking recourse to direct explications of Buddhist truth (liyu 理語), poetry corresponds with ‘mundane truth’ (saṃvṛtisatya). Yet ultimately, through the investigation of ‘mundane truth’, ‘ultimate truth’ (paramārthasatya) – that is, truth that phenomenal forms have a 'false' or conditioned nature – is revealed. This resonates with the Huayan School theory of the union of the two truths. When we realise the ‘constructed’ nature of apparent reality (the domain of the ‘marks’ or ‘characteristics’ (xiang 相, lakṣana) of dharmas), the reality or true 'nature' of apparent reality, that is, its unreality (the true, empty ‘innate nature’ (xing 性, svabhāva) of dharmas) manifests itself. As such, saṃvṛtisatya

---

69 As noted, Hanshan states that we should take what we see and place it ‘within’ a ‘dream.’ I would argue that ‘dream’ here implies the Buddhist concept of the 6th consciousness. The 6th consciousness is the consciousness that involves ‘thought’ (manovijñāna), and is typically associated with recollection (smṛti) as well as ‘dreaming.’ It takes as its object only mental representations or ‘dharmas,’ and not the (relatively speaking) ‘real’ sensory data of the external world (sights, sounds, smells, etc). It should be noted that in Buddhist psychology, experiences must be recalled as dharmas (that is, as mental objects) if they are to be the object of interrogation, because the mind can only have a mental object.

70 ‘Topsy-turvy’ – viparītā, in its Chinese translation diandao 頭倒 – is perhaps the most significant of these three qualities in that it often refers to a state in which what is untrue is held to be true, such as the state of holding what is constructed and impermanent to be permanent or unconditioned.

71 Translation from Hsu’s A Buddhist Leader in Ming China, pg. 122.

72 Ibid.
and paramārthasatya need not be seen as antithetical to each other. As this principle implies that poetry as 'dream-speech' has the power to transmit paramārthasatya without recourse to any direct discussion on paramārthasatya, poetry abides by the tenet of a 'wordless transmission' of the essence of the teachings. It is thus ‘genuine Chan.’

Thus we can perhaps appreciate why, for Hanshan, poems which described the traumatic experience of exile (particularly in ‘hellish’ Lingnan) could exemplify his tenet that ‘poetry is genuine Chan.’ Poems that freshly and authentically captured the sense of surreality that follows traumatic experience, and the nightmarish surreality, murkiness and alienness of ‘hellish’ Leifeng, were perhaps the ideal materials for demonstrating to the reader the principle that the ‘outer’ world as perceived by human consciousness can be as ‘murky’ and ‘absurd’ as our dreamscapes, and this experience of exile perhaps demonstrates the ‘dream-like’ nature of our experience of the world in a more apparent and compelling way than anything we can find in literature that depicts a world that is more ordinary and familiar to us. Hanshan’s personal experience of exile allowed him to appreciate the extent to which these poetic depictions of ‘surreal’ experiences of exile were ‘genuine’ and ‘authentic’ in capturing their authors’ subjective experiences and perceptions of the world, and he was thus able to appreciate their value as a form of ‘dream-speech’ that brought to the fore the ‘murky, burdensome and topsy-turvy’ nature of experienced reality, and thus also as mundane truth that awakens us to ultimate truth.

From the ‘Unreality’ of the Dream to the ‘Subjective’ Nature of the Dreamscape – Poetry and Contemplating the Mansion of the Laṅkāvatāra Sūtra

One could imagine that these theories helped Hanshan to reconcile the use of poetry as a therapeutic tool for dealing with ‘worldly’ suffering with his religious mission, and we can infer that Hanshan saw the ability to realise the ultimate falsity or ‘non-reality’ of perceptual experiences as a means to nullify the psychic impact of his ‘hellish’ experience of being exiled in Lingnan, and as a way to realise ultimate ‘truth.’

---

73 For a discussion on Hanshan’s understanding of this tenet, see Hsu, A Buddhist Leader, pgs. 107-108.
74 The passage in which Hanshan made the statement ‘poetry is genuine Chan’ states: 'Among the people of Tang times, only the words of Li Taibai are a spontaneously-created profound wonder. This is because he was able to achieve enlightened understanding without knowing Chan. In the case of Wang Wei, his works contain many Buddhist terms, and people in later times vied to laud his mastery of Chan. But overall this is perhaps not Chan, but only ‘a Chan of words.’ It does not compare with Tao Yuanming and Li Bai who advanced beyond words’ 唐人獨李太白語自造玄妙，在不知禅而能道耳。若王維多佛語，後人爭誇善禪，要之豈非禅耶，特文字禪耳。非若陶李，造乎文字之外‘Miscellaneous Disquisitions,’ Dream Travels, fascicle 39: (CBETA, X73, no. 1456, p. 745, c20-22).
But what did ultimate truth, or ‘genuine Chan,’ mean for Hanshan? The conventional view is that phenomenal reality is ‘dreamlike’ in the sense that it is ‘unreal’ or ‘empty.’ However, if we carefully review both Hanshan’s ‘Army Poems’ postscript and his Dream Travels Poetry Collection preface, it appears that there is more to it than this. Both texts mention that Hanshan, during the earlier period of his exile, composed a commentary on the Laṅkāvatāra Sūtra. This is significant, because after his exile Hanshan considered the Laṅkāvatāra to be one of the most important sutras, if not the most important sutra, in the Buddhist canon. Hanshan felt that it was important because it contained the highest expression of the core tenet of the cittamātra or ‘mind-only’ school that ‘the three realms are mind-only’ 三界唯心.75 Hanshan was a strong advocate of the principles of Buddhist idealism, that is, the idea that ‘the three realms are mind-only’ and that ‘the ten thousand dharmas are consciousness-only’ 三界唯心, 萬法唯識. These beliefs played a key role in much of his ontological, metaphysical and soteriological thought.76 We may tentatively surmise that Hanshan’s invocation of ‘dream-speech’ was not only intended to point out that zhen poetry on exile can reveal that apparent reality is dream-like in that it is ‘unreal’; it could also reveal that apparent reality is but a projection of consciousness, and is thus ‘mind-only’. This may be what he implied when he emphasised poetry’s capacity to express the ‘merging of mind and scene’, reflecting the reality that the scene is not something that exists independent of the ‘mind.’

On this account, we should perhaps reconsider what Hanshan meant when he implied that the religious power of zhen exile poetry rested on its capacity to reveal the ‘burning’ or ‘hellish’ and ‘nightmarish’ qualities of this experience. In particular, we should note that ‘hell’ as a realm that engenders the suffering of its occupants, and the idea of the ‘dream’ as a realm that appears real to the sleeper, were often invoked in the mind-only tradition, and in the older

75 We may note, for example, the following passage from Dream Travels, fascicle 46: ‘The Buddha emerged in the world and spoke of the dharma for forty years… From start to finish he only spoke eight words: these were ‘[the] three realms [are] mind only; [the] ten-thousand dharmas [are] consciousness only.’ Only after 40 years did he finally thoroughly reveal the meaning of the sentence ‘the ten thousand dharmas are only consciousness.’ Yet it seems he had not dared to reveal the purport of ‘mind-only,’ for ‘mind-only’ is the ultimate law of the ten thousand things. Up to that point, the great disciples had heard of the dharma gate of ‘consciousness-only.’ After that point, he spoke of the Laṅkāvatāra Sūtra, revealing the dharma gate of ‘The three realms are ‘mind-only.’ 佛出世說法四十九年…始終只說了八箇字: 所謂「三界唯心，萬法唯識」。從初至此已經四十年，才說破「萬法唯識」一句之義，然猶未敢顯示唯心之旨，以唯心乃萬法之極則也。從上以來，諸大弟子已聞唯識法門，故此以後，乃說《楞伽經》，顯示「三界唯心」法門. (CBETA, X73, no. 1456, p. 782, b24-c5 // Z 2:32, p. 425, c8-13 // R127, p. 850, a8-13). I will discuss Hanshan’s view on the status of the Laṅkāvatāra in the Chan school later in this chapter.

76 See, for instance, Hsu, A Buddhist Leader, pgs. 108, 109, pgs. 118-120. This is a pervasive theme in Hsu’s analysis of Hanshan’s soteriological and metaphysical thought.
‘consciousness-only’\(^ {77} \) (vijñaptimātra or, more commonly, Yogācāra) school from which it was in part derived, to ‘prove’ the doctrine of ‘mind-only’ or ‘consciousness-only.’

The pedagogical use of ‘hell’ in the Yogācāra school has its most important source in the Viṃśatikāvijñaptimātratāsiddhi (Twenty Verses on Consciousness-Only), composed by Vasubandhu (400-480), who was a key figure in the development of the Yogācāra school. This text was the subject of exegesis in what is arguably the most important ‘idealistic’ text in Chinese Buddhism, the Vijñaptimātratāsiddhi-śāstra* (Cheng weishi lun 《成唯識論》).

For Indian Yogācāra (or vijñaptimātra) adherents such as Vasubandhu it was absurd to claim that a realm existed merely to engender the suffering of its occupants, and equally absurd to claim that this site could objectively exist when it could only be seen or experienced by condemned sentient beings.\(^ {78} \) For Vasubandhu, such a realm could only be a product of the evil karma of its occupants – that is, a product of their ‘minds.’ The fact that numerous occupants could perceive the same hell (a projection of ‘inter-subjectivity’) was not a problem for Vasubandhu, as this could be explained by its being the product of their shared karma (gongye 共業),\(^ {79} \) karma that is shared between sentient beings, on account of which the shared perception of a unitary external realm or ‘world’ arises.\(^ {80} \) Vasubandhu thus felt that reflecting on the absurdity of hell’s existence (as well as the idea of collective karma) could be a potent instrument for challenging the idea that ‘inter-subjectivity’ – the fact that an object could be seen by a number of sentient beings – was a basis for asserting that the external world constituted any form of absolute reality.\(^ {81} \)

There are similarities between Vasubandhu's ideas and the depictions of 'hellish' scenes found in Hanshan's ‘Army Poems’ and their postscript. For Hanshan, the geomantic qualities of Leizhou (that is, the ‘end of the dragon’) made it the place of purgatory of exiled officials. As noted, its ‘hot’ climate made it particularly inhospitable to those who had long resided close

---

77 This can also be translated as ‘cognition-only’.
78 See, for instance, verse 3b-c of Vasubandhu’s Viṃśatikāvijñaptimātratāsiddhi (Twenty Verses on Consciousness Only), and the commentary of this verse (Kārikā). An excellent English translation of the Viṃśatikāvijñaptimātratāsiddhi is provided in Stephen Anacker’s Seven Works of Vasubandhu: The Buddhist Psychological Doctor (Dehli: Motilal Barnarsidass Publishers, 1984). For the discussion on hell see Seven Works of Vasubandhu, pgs. 160-176 (translations of 3b-c are found on pg. 162).
79 This can also be translated as ‘collective karma’.
81 For a brief discussion on this, see Dan Lusthaus, Buddhist Phenomenology: A Philosophical Investigation of Yogācāra Buddhism and the Ch’eng Wei-shih lun (New York: Routledge, 2013), pgs. 29-30.
to the centres of Ming power in China's 'cool' north. The suffering that it engendered in the scholar-officials exiled there would have been to do with its being a site of 'purgatory' in their eyes; it might not have had the same kind of effect upon those who were there without being exiled (that is, those with different karma). Whatever the case, after he was exiled to the 'hell' of Leifeng, Hanshan found himself able to connect with the depictions of sites of exile in the writings of banished scholar-officials. He shared with them a form of 'common karma,' and was thus able to appreciate their 'authenticity.' Hence Lingnan, a place of 'purgatory' for the loyal subject, could be regarded by Hanshan as a conducive environment for reflection upon the 'subtleties of creation' from a Yogācāra or cittamātra perspective. Indeed, Lingnan may have presented Hanshan with the perfect opportunity to reflect on the theory that the external world is but the product of collective karma, and thus a projection of consciousness.

Yogācāra/Vijñaptimātra and the Nature of Apparent External Reality as the ‘Dreamscape’

The dream metaphor was commonly invoked in Buddhist literature to show how the ‘dreamscape’ is not an independent reality but is only the projection of the consciousness of the ‘dreamer’. We have seen in Hanshan’s passage on the maxim ‘life is like a floating dream’ that observing the ‘dreamlike’ nature of apparent reality can reveal its unreality. He also addressed this notion in other writings. Talking of a previous dream, Hanshan stated: ‘speaking subsequently of the scene (jing 境) [of the dream], I knew that body and mind were infused together into [what was] visibly manifest before my eyes’ 隨說其境，即現覩於目前，自知身心交參涉入.82 Following this reasoning, ‘life is like a floating dream’ could be interpreted in line with Hanshan’s idea, outlined by Hsu, that one can make spiritual progress by tracing the origin of the ‘characteristics’ or ‘marks’ (xiang 相) of dharmas (that is, the ‘dreamscape’) to ‘innate nature’ (xing 性 ) in the sense of the ‘mind’ (xin 心) (that is, the ‘dreamer’).83

83 Hsu, A Buddhist Leader, pg. 109. The coming together of these two tropes of the ‘dream-like’ – the notion of emptiness, and the assertion of the purely mental nature of the dream’s ‘scenes’ – appears in several texts affiliated to the Yogācāra school. On occasion there are similarities between these accounts and Hanshan’s ideas about the ‘true’ meaning of the maxim that ‘life is like a floating dream.’ We may note, for instance, the following passage from the Vijñaptimātratāsiddhi-śāstra* (Cheng weishi lun) 《成唯識論》: ‘Objects of (visible) form [rūpa; i.e. the object of the visual sense] and so forth [that is, sensory objects] are not form but appear to be form and are not external but appear to be external. Like the case of the ālambana [i.e. objects of perception] of a dream, one cannot obstinately insist (執 abhinivesa) that they are real external forms. If [one can see that] the forms from one’s waking times are all just like the objects [or settings] of dreams and cannot be
This lends some weight to an idea that Hanshan advanced in both his ‘Army Poems’ postscript and his Dream Travels Poetry Collection preface: that zhen exile poetry can enlighten people because the ‘hellish’ and ‘dream-like’ qualities they portray can awaken people to the doctrine of ‘mind-only’ (cittamātra). More evidence of this can be found in the commentary on the Laṅkāvatāra that is mentioned in both these texts, the Contemplations of the Laṅkāvatāra. I should note that both the idea that the ‘hellish’ qualities of Lingnan make it a site conducive to ‘genuine’ enlightenment and the idea that reality should be understood as ‘dreamlike’ are prominent themes in this text. The former point is evident when we look at Hanshan’s ‘Brief Note on Contemplating the Mansion of the Laṅkāvatāra Sūtra’ 四執迦寶經閣筆記, a text, dated 1619, that is contained in the beginning of his Contemplation of the Laṅkāvatāra and which discusses what inspired Hanshan to write this commentary:

On the 10th day of the 3rd lunar month of that year I arrived at the garrison. On the first day of the 4th lunar month I set pen to paper [on this commentary]. At that time the place was beset with famine and pestilence; the dead and injured covered the fields. I sat amid the toxic fog and in a ‘forest of corpses’ (屍陀林84) and during the day studied this sutra to the point where I neglected to eat or sleep. I was awakened [so that it was] like residing in a ‘country of purity and coolness.’

This passage echoes, almost verbatim, lines contained in Hanshan’s introductions to Dream Travels and ‘Army Poems’ about his arrival in Leiyang which show that the ‘hell-like’ scene of Hanshan’s exile inspired him to study the Laṅkāvatāra. As a result of these studies, he became ‘awakened.’ Thus the hellish ‘heat’ of Leifeng had led to the ‘illumination’ of ultimate truth as cittamātra, cittamātra being seen by Hanshan as the core doctrinal tenet of this sutra. The illumination of this ‘truth’ led to Hanshan’s capacity to find ‘purity and coolness’ in the midst of the ‘defilement’ and ‘heat’ of the ‘hellish’ site. Thus the ‘hell’ setting of Leifeng as a site of exile shared a special relationship with the doctrine of cittamātra. We may note a brief encounter dialogue that Hanshan had with an exiled official
taken as being separate from one’s consciousness, then one will know – just as when one wakes from a dream – that they are mind-only.’ 色等境非色似色，非外似外，如夢所緣，不可執為是實外色。若覺時，色皆如夢境不離識者，如從夢覺知彼唯心. Fascicle 7: (CBETA, T31, no. 1585, p. 39, c2-4).
84 shi tuo lin 尸陀林. In his Dream Travels preface Hanshan uses the exact same term, which I translated above as ‘cemetery’ in line with its Buddhist meaning. Here, however, it is clear that the word is being used figuratively; I have used a more literal translation to convey that Hanshan was not actually in a graveyard, but was trying to describe his location as ‘hellish’ or ‘nightmarish’ (a point which is made apparent in the earlier passage).
85 Contemplation of the Laṅkāvatāra, fascicle 8: (CBETA, X17, no. 326, p. 470, c10-13 // Z 1:26, p. 36, b10-13 // R26, p. 71, b10-13).
called Fan Youxuan (樊友軒). When the latter was travelling to Leiyang, he asked Hanshan if he could describe the scenery there (公問予雷陽風景何如). In response, Hanshan held up his *Contemplation of the Laṅkāvatāra* and stated ‘This is the scenery of Leiyang’ 此雷陽風景也. 86

Hanshan’s *Contemplation of the Laṅkāvatāra* places further emphasis on the notion of ‘dreams’ and the ‘dreamlike’ nature of apparent reality. It is notable that his appended ‘Brief Note on Contemplation of the Mansion of the Laṅkāvatāra Sūtra’ describes the inspiration for the title of this commentary in language that resonates with his comments on ‘dream-speech’ in his preface to *Dream Travels*: ‘I have not now called it a Commentary, but have called it a ‘Record of Contemplation’ (guan 觀 of the Sutra, because through contemplation [or ‘observation’] (觀) I thought deeply [lit. ‘travelled through the mind’] (youxin 游心), and what it records is the settings encountered in the process of these contemplations [or ‘observations’] 今不曰注疏而曰觀經記。蓋以觀游心，所記觀中之境耳. 87 It is important to recognise that the terms guan and youxin have connotations that would link them with Hanshan’s religious conception of the activity he is describing. In the main body of the commentary ‘dreams’ are often mentioned – the word ‘dream’ (meng 夢) itself appears almost 110 times. Moreover, in many sections of the text, Hanshan uses the analogy of dreams to explain that the objects or settings that one perceives (that is, the figurative ‘dreamscape’) cannot be viewed as separate from the ‘consciousness’ or ‘mind’ of the ‘observer’ (that is, the dreamer). Fascicle 1, for instance, contains the statement ‘like what one sees in a dream, [the perceived object] is not separate from one’s own mind’ 如夢所見，不離自心, 88 while in fascicle 3 we see the lines ‘heretics do not know that what is manifested in one’s own mind is like the setting [or realm] of a dream’ 外道不知自心所現如夢境界 89 and ‘now [if one] observes that all realms [or settings] are unreal like an illusion or dream, the act of treating all dharmas as substance does not come into being. Because they are only manifestations of the mind, they do not arise [in actuality]. Since they are only manifestations

87 *Contemplation of the Laṅkāvatāra*, fascicle 8: (CBETA, X17, no. 326, p. 470, b8-13 // Z 1:26, p. 36, a2-7 // R26, p. 71, a2-7).
88 *Contemplation of the Laṅkāvatāra*, fascicle 8: (CBETA, X17, no. 326, p. 342, b14 // Z 1:25, p. 380, b17 // R25, p. 759, b17).
89 *Contemplation of the Laṅkāvatāra*, fascicle 8: (CBETA, X17, no. 326, p. 373, c15-16 // Z 1:25, p. 412, c9-10 // R25, p. 824, a9-10).
of the mind, external objects are immediately [seen as being] empty.’ 今觀一切境界如幻夢不實，則諸法當體不生。以唯心現故不生。既唯心現，則外境頓空. 90

With this in mind, we may note that in Hanshan’s preface to the Dream Travels Poetry Collection, he brings together the ‘hellish’ quality of the experience of exile in Leifeng, his impetus for studying the Laṅkāvatāra and composing the Contemplation of the Laṅkāvatāra while there and the idea of the ‘dreamlike’ as a soteriological tool.. The passage reads as follows:

I first arrived at the garrison in the second month of spring of the bingshen year (1596). There had been pestilence and famine for three years and exposed bones covered the fields. It was as though I was sitting in the midst of a cemetery. I feared I would die and never be heard of. Subsequently, I completed the Contemplation of the Laṅkāvatāra. I carried a halberd at the outer gate of the residence of the great general and resided in the garrison. I wanted to put into practice Dahui’s principle of preaching the dharma while in the clothes of a layperson. I constructed a cubic room [like that of Vimalakīrti] in a round tent. I performed dream versions of Buddhist rituals with disciples who came to see me – I treated the marching gong and the war drums as the bells and stone-chimes [in temples]; I took the garrison’s banners as dhvaja…and took the ‘demons’ (māra) as my retinue (parivāra). Suddenly it became a great bodhimanda. 丙申春二月，初至戍所。癘飢三年，白骨蔽野，予即如坐屍陀林中。懼其死而無聞也；遂成楞伽筆記。執戟大將軍轅門，居壘壁間。思效大慧冠巾說法，搆丈室於穹廬，時與諸來弟子，作夢幻佛事；乃以金皷為鐘磬、以旗幟為幡幢…以諸魔為眷屬，居然一大道場也. 91

According to this passage, the ‘hellish’ qualities of the site of Hanshan’s exile prompted him to complete his Contemplation of the Laṅkāvatāra. Subsequent to this, Hanshan set about performing ‘dream versions of Buddhist rituals.’ This helped him transform the ‘hellish’ environment of the garrison at Leifeng into a ‘great bodhimanda’, a site for Buddhist practice. In other words, the ‘hellish’ experience of being exiled in Leifeng prompted Hanshan to study the sutra which perfects the doctrine that all phenomena are ‘mind-only’, and studying this sutra prompted him to see the experience of exile as being ‘dreamlike.’ This helped to make a hellish environment conducive to enlightening people – it made ‘sweltering heat’ transform into ‘variegated brightness.’ This is one of the reasons why Hanshan called

---
91 ‘Authors Preface to the Dream Travels Poetry Collection’, Dream Travels, fascicle 47: (CBETA, X73, no. 1456, p. 786, b9-b15).
his poetry collection ‘Dream Travels’, and is arguably one of the reasons why he thought his poetry should be viewed as ‘Chan.’

‘Merging Mind and Scene,’ the Laṅkāvatāra and ‘Genuine Chan’

The idea that poetry is ‘Chan’ because it awakens people to the ultimate truth of cittamātra brings us back to the phrase that appears in the ‘Army Poems’ postscript immediately after the assertion that ‘the wise all view it [i.e., this poetry collection] as ‘Chan’’ – the phrase asserts that Hanshan’s poetry (and perhaps poetry in general) ‘can demonstrate that mind and setting [or ’object realm’] are merged (xin jing hunrong 心境混融) without one being aware that this is so.’

The phrase ‘merging mind and setting’ is very similar to the phrase ‘blending sentiment and scene’ (qing jing jiaorong 情景交融) which was popularised by the late-Ming / early-Qing scholar and loyalist Wang Fuzhi (王夫之 1619-1692) not long after Hanshan’s time, and which came to have enormous currency in late imperial-era literary theory (interestingly, Wang drew upon vijñaptimātra thought to explain this principle). The notion that sentiment and scene merge together in poetry (or in some types of poetry) was already widespread in discussions on literary theory before Hanshan’s day, and was often expressed in similar language. An early and well known precedent was the Source of Words (Ci yuan 《詞源》), composed by the Song literatus Zhang Yan (張炎 1248-1320), which talks of ‘melding sentiment and scene’ ‘情景交煉’. However, the concept also appears in many treatises on poetics and literary theory composed from the Ming to the early Qing. For instance, the renowned affiliate of the Archaist school Xie Zhen (謝榛 1495-1575) stated that ‘The scene is the matchmaker of a poem, while sentiment is a poem’s embryo. Binding them together, we make a poem; using a few words it can encompass the ten thousand forms’ 景乃詩之媒,情乃詩之胚;合而為詩,以數言而統萬形. The scholar Zhu Chengjue (朱承爵 1480-1527)

---

92 Wang’s understanding of the relationship between vijñaptimātra, poetics, and the theory of ‘blending scene and sentiments’ is the core theme in Xiao Chi (蕭剋), ‘Chuanshan shixue zhong ‘xianliang’ yihan de zai tantao: jianlun chuantong qing jing jiaorong lilun yanjiu de yi ge wuqu’ (船山詩學中現量意涵的在探討:兼論傳統「情景交融」理論研究的一個誤區) (in Hanxue yanjiu 《漢學研究》, fascicle 18, Issue 2, Dec. 2000), pgs. 369-396. A brief discussion on this can also be found in Zhang Shaokang (張少康), Zhongguo wenxue liliun piping jianshi 《中國文學理論批評簡史》 (Hong Kong: Xianggang Zhongwen daxue chubanshe, 1999), pgs. 299-301.

93 Shanghai: Shangwu yinshuguan, 1937, fascicle 2.

94 Remarks on Poetry [from Across the Great Land Bounded by] the Four Seas (Siming shihua) 《四冥詩話》, fascicle 3, in Ding Fubiao (丁福保 comp., ed.) Lidai shihua xuan bian 《歷代詩話續編》, volume 2, Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1983), pg. 1180. The renowned Order of Ya (Ya lun) 《雅倫》of the late-Ming / early-Qing
similarly said, ‘The marvel in composing poetry resides entirely in the complete merging of idea and setting – [this is] something that transcends tones and sounds, and captures the ‘genuine flavour’ 作詩之妙,全在意境融徹,出音聲之外,乃得真味.’ We may note the similarity of this last line to the line in Hanshan’s ‘Army Poems’ postscript ‘it can bear witness to the fact that mind and setting are merged... Because of this, one knows that the marvel of the poetry of the ancients lies in the fact that the sentiments are genuine and the settings are authentic.’

In view of this, it could be proposed that the phrase ‘merging of mind and setting’ (xin jing hunrong) restates, in Buddhist vernacular, the literary theory of ‘blending of sentiment and scene’ (qing jing jiaorong). However, I would argue that this is not the case, or not completely the case. Rather, I would argue that xin jing hunrong invokes religious doctrine, and in particular cittamātra doctrine. There are a number of reasons for this. Firstly, the four characters in this phrase (xin, jing and the two character word hunrong) appear together on several occasions in Hanshan’s religious writings. What is more, they appear in discussions that primarily deal with the Laṅkāvatāra or cittamātra thought. In fact, the idea that ‘mind’ and ‘scene’ should be ‘merged’ (hunrong) or are ‘one’ (yiru 一如) appears often in Chinese commentaries on the Laṅkāvatāra Sūtra, and can be found in Hanshan’s own early-exile Contemplations of the Laṅkāvatāra.96 In the latter, it is used in the context of a discussion which begins: ‘this means that one transforms defilement to make it become purity, and samsāra is nirvāṇa; one transforms delusion to make it become enlightenment, and suffering is Bodhi’ 譬轉染令淨, 生死即涅槃; 轉迷令悟, 煩惱即菩提.97 This arguably has parallels with Hanshan’s idea of transforming hellish ‘heat’ to illuminating ‘light.’ The same passage also states, ‘If the viewpoint that ‘all is mind-only’ has been successfully attained, then soon after, one will be able to level the distinction between defilements and purity, and

---

96 We may note the following passage: ‘And so it is said: ‘Do not be preoccupied with causes and conditions’; mind and setting are as one. And so it is said: ‘Keep a distance from inner and outer realms’; all is the one genuine mind only. Outside of this mind, nothing can be obtained.’ 故云:「不勤因緣」, 心境一如; 故云: 「遠離內外境界」; 唯一真心。除此心外, 無片事可得. Contemplation of the Laṅkāvatāra, fascicle 1: (CBETA, X17, no. 326, p. 343, a3-12).
97 Contemplation of the Laṅkāvatāra, fascicle 1: (CBETA, X17, no. 326, p. 343, a3-5).
emancipate sentient beings through great compassion, skilful means, and non-volitional action. 若唯心觀成就，不久當得染淨平等，則以大悲、方便、無功用行度諸眾生。98 (I would argue that this resonates with the line ‘[while] dwelling in the defiled world one can mix in conventional truths, [and through this] suddenly enter the dharma gate of non-duality.’)

But the greater significance of the concept of ‘merging mind and setting’ in Hanshan’s religious writings is that it plays a pivotal role in describing why the realisation of the doctrinal tenet of ‘mind only’ constitutes ‘true’ religious attainment, or ‘genuine’ Chan. It does so in two ways. Firstly, ‘the merging of mind and setting’ marks for Hanshan the distinction between the attainment of vijñaptimātra (‘consciousness only’) – which Hanshan felt was merely mundane truth (saṃvṛti) – and the higher attainment of ultimate truth (paramārtha) as ‘mind only’ (cittamātra). Secondly, it marks the difference between ‘enlightenment by intellectual understanding’ (jiewu 解悟) and ‘authentic practice’ (真參) that leads to ‘intuitive verification’ (zhengwu 證悟) – that is, ‘true Chan.’ In both domains, ‘merging mind and setting’ is understood to be the essential condition for attaining intuitive insight into what he called the ‘genuine mind’ (zhenxin 真心), which marks, for Hanshan, ultimate enlightenment as the true attainment of the ‘gate of non-duality’ or the ‘gate of union’. In other words, it could be argued that for Hanshan, zhen exile poetry’s capacity to exemplify the literary tenet of ‘merging mind and scene’ is the reason why it leads to ‘genuine Chan’. Being ‘authentic and genuine’ in poetry leads to the ‘authentic’ realisation of ‘the genuine.’

Merging Mind and Scene - From the Conventional Truth of Vījñaptimātra to ‘Genuine Truth’ as Cittamātra

How does the ‘merging of mind and scene’ mark progress from ‘consciousness only’ (vijñaptimātra) to ‘mind only’ (cittamātra), or ‘mundane truth’ (saṃvṛti) to ‘ultimate truth’ (paramārtha)? And what does this have to do with the distinctive qualities of zhen exile poetry? To answer this, we may note the following passage from a letter that Hanshan addressed to his friend, an obscure monk called Guyu (古愚):

98 Contemplation of the Laṅkāvatāra, fascicle 1: (CBETA, X17, no. 326, p. 343, a6-8).
When performing contemplative meditation (vipaśyanā) one appears to be oblivious to the setting [or ‘object realm’] (jing 境). But on encountering an object (yuan 綠, ālambana), one still discriminates (vikalpayati), and in this way the external world generates the [defiled] mind. If one states unbendingly that “there is only the mind”, then in the end, one will be unable to obtain real proof [of this principle]. Even if one has successfully become oblivious to the former setting, if one is attached to [the idea that] “there is only the mind”, then one cannot become oblivious to the mind; this constitutes the state of being oblivious to perceived objects but not yet being oblivious to the perceiving agency. Because of this, mind and setting [or ‘object realm’] are unable to merge. This is called ‘knowledge being obstructed’ (jñeyāvarana).

若作觀時，似乎忘境，逢緣依然分別。逐境生心。如此捺硬說唯心，終是不得實證。縱是忘得前境，若執著唯心，則是不能忘心，乃忘所未忘能。故心境不得混融，是名智礙。

We have seen how poetry’s capacity to authentically record the ‘hellish nightmare’ that is exile makes it a powerful tool for revealing that phenomenal reality (the dreamscape) is not real, but is merely a projection of consciousness (that is, the mind of the dreamer). This, for Hanshan, was related to the understanding that ‘the ten thousand dharmas are consciousness-only’ 萬法唯識. However, for Hanshan, this merely reflects the understanding of ‘consciousness only’ (vijñaptimāra), which he likened to ‘mundane truth’ (samvrtī). It did not convey the true understanding of ‘mind only’ as it is articulated in the Lāṅkāvatāra (i.e., that ‘the three realms are mind-only’ 三界唯心), and which he likened to ‘ultimate truth’ (paramārtha). For Hanshan, the latter is only achieved when one understands that just as ‘perceived’ phenomenal objects are ‘false’ because they are dependent on the ‘mind’ for their existence, the perceiving mind is also ‘false’ because its own existence (as the ‘perceiver’) is dependent on the setting or object that it perceives. As Hanshan’s friend Zeng Fengyi stated in a discussion on the concept of ‘[mere] mentation’ (xinliang 心量) in his own commentary on the Lāṅkāvatāra, ‘There are no dharmas outside the mind and there is no mind outside of dharmas: the mind and the setting [or object] merge together, and they are equal with each other.’

99 As has been noted and will be explained in more depth later in this chapter, Hanshan used ‘jing’ to denote both the object of an instance of sense perception and also the external world, scene or setting more generally. This is a very important point for understanding how Hanshan’s ideas on poetry were able to be brought together with his ideas on Buddhist idealism.


101 As I have noted earlier, Hanshan stated in his Dream Travels: ‘Only after 40 years did he finally thoroughly reveal the meaning of the sentence ‘the ten thousand dharmas are only consciousness.’ Yet it seems he had not dared to reveal the purport of ‘mind-only,’ for ‘mind-only’ is the ultimate law of the ten thousand things…After that point, he spoke of the Lāṅkāvatāra Sūtra, revealing the dharma gate of ‘The three realms are ‘mind-only.’”
This transforms the five consciousnesses [i.e. the consciousnesses pertaining to the five senses] into the all-encompassing wisdom (kṛtyānusthānajñānam)’心外無法，法外無心。心境雙融，即相平等。此轉前五識為成所作智也.102

What is the connection between this conception of the pivotal role of ‘merging mind and setting’ as a condition for realising ‘mind only’, and the special qualities of zhen exile poetry? The answer, arguably, returns us to Hanshan’s post-exile assessment of the difference between his Buddhist practice in the ‘pure and cool’ realms of secluded mountain settings (which he felt was like a ‘dream within a dream’) and the progress he made when exposed to the ‘hellish,’ ‘nightmarish’ realm of Leifeng. In a ‘pure’ setting one can become oblivious to the setting, and thus the setting does not have a strong evocative impact on the meditator. When one who calms his mind carefully discerns (vipaśyanā) this ‘pure’ setting, he may see that it is a projection of his ‘pure’ mind – it is like a ‘dreamscape.’ The nightmare, however, invokes the idea of a ‘dreamscape’ that also has a powerful evocative effect upon the ‘mind,’ or sentimental state, of the dreamer himself – just as Hanshan’s description of Lingnan as being ‘hell-like’ did. When a ‘nightmarish’ experience renders one unable to block out external objects (that is, when the mind ‘encounters’ an object) the mind is ‘defiled’ by the setting, even if the subject knows that the object is merely a projection of consciousness (whose evocative effect can continue after the dreamer wakes up). Arguably this ‘nightmarish’ quality is evident in the ‘surreal’ and ‘hellish’ scenes that Hanshan encountered in exile and recorded in his poems. Through the depiction of the nightmare, one may notice that the ‘perceived’ dreamscape shapes the consciousness of the ‘perceiving’ dreamer, just as the dreamer’s mind shapes the form of the dreamscape. One may see that the mind is as much dependent on the object as the object is dependent on the mind. When one realises that the ‘mind’ that dreamed the dreamscape is as false as that dreamscape, one can overcome the lingering impact of a disturbing nightmare.

However, the idea of the ‘merging of mind and scene’ has a more specific connection with the subjective experience of ‘exile.’ The indignity and anguish of being banished would undoubtedly influence the exiled person’s perception of the locale (that is, the ‘scene’ or ‘setting’) into which he is exile, and the alien setting of the place to which he has been

---

banished is likely to serve as a perpetual source of despair. In other words, the ‘emotional anguish’ of exile engenders the ‘defiled’ scene, and the ‘hellish’ scene in turn perpetually produces a ‘defiled’ mind. Because of this two-way interaction between locale and mood, ‘surreal’ exile poetry that is zhen would best exhibit the quality of the ‘melding of sentiment and scene’ (in Zhang Yan’s words). This poetry would be best at assisting the author and the reader to realise the ‘oneness’ of the mind/sentiments of the author and the setting/scene that he has perceived.

This brings us back to Hanshan’s idea about the religious power of zhen exile poetry and its connection with cittamātra. We have seen that exile poetry reveals that the hellish ‘defiled’ setting of exile is not real and is nothing other than a projection of consciousness. It also shows that the ‘defiled’ and unenlightened mind of the author is not his true identity, because this mind is itself a product of this setting. With the illusions of the independence of the subjective-aspect (ālambaka – that is, the consciousness of the dreamer) and the objective-aspect (ālambana – that is, the dreamscape) both broken down, the false epistemology that drives and is the foundation of the discrimination of the five senses is disempowered. As such, the senses ‘transform’ into ‘all-encompassing wisdom (kṛtyānusthānajñānam)’, the wisdom that is capable of utilising the phenomenal realm for the purpose of enlightening sentient beings through skilful means. This resonates with Hanshan’s claims that he used his understanding of the ‘dreamlike’ nature of reality to ‘transform’ the ‘hellish’ setting of the garrison to a bodhimandala. It also invokes his idea that poetry as ‘dream-speech’ communicates ultimate truth (paramārtha) through skilful means that respond to circumstances (mundane truth (saṃvṛti)).

**Merging Mind and Scene and ‘Genuine Chan’**

As well as enabling the subject to see that the ‘external’ scene (the dreamscape) is a product of the internal mind (the dreamer), the ‘merging of mind and setting’ also helped him to overcome his identification with the ‘false’ ‘dreaming’ mind. For Hanshan, this enabled the true attainment of ‘mind only’, because overcoming attachment to the false mind removes all impediments to the revelation of the ‘true’ mind, which he called the ‘true’ or ‘genuine’ mind (zhenxin 真心). Because the ‘true mind’ marks the ‘true identity’ of the subject, Hanshan also felt that this process marked ‘genuine Chan’. It marked an ‘illumination of mind and seeing into nature’ that was achieved intuitively and without recourse to the ‘teachings.’ These ideas came together in a passage that builds upon Hanshan’s view of the Lankāvatāra as the
leading authority for both the Chan school and cittamātra orthodoxy. This passage, which comes from a letter to the official Zheng Kunyan, draws heavily from the commentary of the Tang monk Weishan Lingyou (鴻山靈祐 771-853) on the roots, in the Laṅkāvatāra, of the Chan doctrine of ‘sudden enlightenment and gradual practice.’

Hanshan’s passage reads as follows:

There is a distinction between enlightenment by intellectual understanding and enlightenment by intuitive verification. The case of clearly comprehending mind by relying on the words and teachings of the Buddha and patriarchs is enlightenment by intellectual understanding. Often [this] descends into [defiled] knowledge and views, and when encountering some object, it generally has no effect, and as the mind and object are dichotomously opposed, they cannot be merged. In each case [the continuation of this dichotomy] becomes an obstruction, often functioning as a hindrance [to enlightenment] (āvaraṇa/āvṛti). This is named ‘pseudo prajñā (xiangsi bore 相似般若); it is not genuine practice. In the case of enlightenment by intuitive verification, one sets out from the purity and reality in one’s own mind, and presses on to the point “where the rivers come to an end and mountains reach their limit.” Suddenly one’s thoughts are stopped in an instant, with the result that one thoroughly comprehends one’s own mind. It is like seeing one’s own grandfather at a crossroads; there can be no further doubt. It is like someone drinking water; they themselves know if it is cold or warm, but they cannot communicate this to others. This is ‘genuine practice and true realisation.’ Afterwards, one uses the point of realisation to merge mind and setting. One purifies and removes manifest karma and the flow of consciousness; all delusions, sentiments and vexations coalesce with the unadulterated ‘genuine mind’. This is ‘enlightenment by intuitive verification.’

This passage is both closely aligned with and faithful to the content of several discourses discussing Weishan Lingyou’s theories that are contained in Hanshan’s Notes from Contemplation of the Laṅkāvatāra, and as such was most probably composed during or after Hanshan’s exile. It presents one interpretation of the Buddhist differentiation between

---

103 The influence of Weishan’s theories of ‘sudden and gradual enlightenment’ on Hanshan is discussed very briefly in Araki Kengo’s ‘Kansen Tokusei no shōgai to sono shisō,’ pgs. 158-159.


105 See, for instance, Contemplation of the Laṅkāvatāra, fascicle 2: (CBETA, X17, no. 326, p. 352, b13-17 // Z 1:25, p. 391, a17-b3 // R25, p. 781, a17-b3).
an intellectual understanding of the teachings and practice that lead to ‘genuine’ attainment, or ‘genuine Chan’ in the sense of intuitive insight into one’s primordial nature. It can be placed under the rubric of ‘sudden realisation, gradual cultivation’ as it advances the premise that although Buddhist truths as conceptual entities can be grasped intellectually in an instant, true intuitive ‘verification’ of them requires a subsequent process of cultivation to remove latent obstructions.106 Further, it emphasises that these doctrines should not be grasped at as ‘views,’ but should be ‘applied’ in practice through introspection on the operation of the ‘mind’ during the perceptual process wherein subjective consciousness interacts with sense objects. Hanshan calls this ‘genuine practice.’ Only through the consummation of this ‘genuine practice’ can one achieve ‘the merging of mind and setting,’ because it is only at this stage that one overcomes the two hindrances of: 1) ‘defilements’ (kleśa), which, according to the Yogācāra school, have their basis in the false view that things have self-identity and are connected to transmigration (and are associated with the defiled ‘mind’); and 2) ‘objects of knowing’ (jñeya), which are related to the belief that external dharmas (that is, ‘setting’) have substantial self-identity. Overcoming these two hindrances marks the process in which the defiled states – in both their subjective and objective aspects – are expunged and purified. These defiled states are associated, in Hanshan’s reproduction of Weishan’s gloss on the Laṅkāvatāra term ‘manifest flow’ (xianliu 現流) as ‘manifest karma’ (xianye 現業), with the notion of the perpetual manifestation of perceptual objects (jing 境, which has generally been translated above as ‘setting’) and ‘the flow consciousness’ (liushi 流識) (akin to xin 心 as ‘the defiled mind’). Hanshan’s Notes from Contemplation of the Laṅkāvatāra provides a similar but more detailed elaboration of this process.107 Impediments having been removed through ‘genuine practice,’ one reaches the ‘true’ or ‘genuine’ state of enlightenment, marked by the intuitive verification that the perceiving mind and the perceived settings are nothing other than the manifestation of an un-cognizable, primordial and universal ‘genuine mind.’

We should note that just as the Laṅkāvatāra was, in Hanshan’s view, the ultimate authority in both the Chan school and mind-only orthodoxy, the notion of the ‘genuine mind’ (zhênxin 真心) played a pivotal role in his religious thought and in his attempts to bring together mind-

106 See the preceding footnote.
107 The role of the two obstructions in the process of moving from ‘sudden’ to ‘gradual’ enlightenment (that is, the merging of mind and object-realm) is discussed in greater detail in Hanshan’s Contemplation of the Laṅkāvatāra, which places more emphasis on Weishan’s theories. Herein, the ‘two obstructions’ are related explicitly with ‘manifest karma and the flow consciousness.’ (CBETA, X17, no. 326, p. 343, b18-c7 // Z 1:25, p. 381, c3-16 // R25, p. 762, a3-16).
only and Chan soteriologies. Following the tenets of the ‘mind-only’ school, Hanshan held that the phenomenal universe, as well as the ‘inner’ realm of mentation and perception, were manifestations of a unitary, universal and unvarying substratum – what the *Laṅkāvatāra Sūtra* called the 一心 (yixin, eka-citta). Recognising the idealist and absolute attributes of this entity, he called it ‘the zhen 真 [genuine or true] mind,’ and also the ‘one genuine mind’ (yi zhen xin 一真心), or the ‘unadulterated’ or, more literally, ‘one-flavoured’ (eka-rasa) genuine mind’ (yiwei zhenxin 一味真心). He identified this ‘genuine mind’ also with the Buddha-Embryo or the *tathāgatagarbha* (rulai zang 如來藏), and ‘Buddha nature’ (*foxing* 佛性). The ‘genuine mind’ can thus be differentiated from the ‘delusional mind’ or ‘false mind’ (wangxin 妄心) or ‘karmic consciousness’ (*yeshi* 業識), which is the unenlightened mental continuum bound by the notion of the self (*ātman*) and which is subject to the karmic vagaries of *samsāra*. Hanshan followed others in understanding the constitution of this delusional mind in terms of the Consciousness-only school’s elaborate psychology of the ‘eight consciousnesses,’ which describes the role of these consciousnesses in the creation of the ‘illusory phenomenal world’ (*qishi* 器世 *bhājana*). For Hanshan, enlightenment is the point when the eight consciousnesses identified in the *Yogācāra* schema are ‘transformed’ (zhuan 轉) into wisdom (that is, the ‘four wisdoms’ *sizhi* 四智 *catvāri-jñāni*), a transformation that coincides with becoming aware that the ultimate ontological source of the eight consciousnesses and of their identity – as well as those of the external world onto which they are projected – is nothing other than the unadulterated, pure, universal and unitary ‘genuine mind.’ Recognising the identity of this ‘genuine mind’ (through understanding the oneness of mind and setting) was thus, for Hanshan, the ‘ultimate truth’ of *cittamātra* – and to do so required an intuitive insight that could only be achieved by someone who put aside the ‘words’ of the Buddha’s teachings and focused on observing the inner workings of his mind in action. This was marked by the achievement of ‘merging mind and scene’ and ‘illuminating mind and seeing into nature.’

Thus we see how the ‘merging of mind and setting’ emerges in Hanshan’s soteriology as being integrally related to the notion of ‘genuine practice’ and ‘genuine enlightenment’ (or what in reference to poetry he called ‘genuine Chan’). By revealing the ‘dreamlike’ qualities

---

108 Hanshan’s philosophy of ‘mind’ and idealist thought is outlined in significant detail in Hsu’s *A Buddhist Leader in Ming China*, and is briefly addressed in Sheng-yen’s ‘Mingmo de weishi xuezhe,’ pgs. 10-11.

109 A preliminary investigation of Hanshan’s understanding of the points of delineation and identity between the false and ‘Buddha’ minds is presented in Hsu’s *A Buddhist Leader in Ming China*, pgs. 106-107.
of the author’s actual experience of the sentiments and scenes in previous real-life predicaments, poetry provides a tool for the reader to have an intuitive verification of the fact that the ‘inner’ mind and the apparent ‘outer’ realm are nothing other than the ‘genuine mind.’ The authentic depiction of ‘sentiment’ and ‘scene’ may have nothing to do with Buddhist theory, and may have been shaped in response to circumstances (something that pertains to saṃvṛti) by one who ‘dwells’ in the defiled world – but ultimately, the verification that it facilitates (that ‘mind’ and ‘scene’ are in fact ‘merged’) is superior to that gained from any scholastic explication of this doctrinal principle in the Buddhist teachings. As such, the truth derived from ‘genuine practice’ of this kind is ‘ultimate truth’ or ‘genuine Chan.’ By relying on ‘secular’ poetry and not on the teachings, one can attain insight into the workings of one’s ‘true’ mind, realise intuitively that that ‘the three realms are all [this] mind,’ and bring mundane truth into perfect harmony with ultimate truth. This resonates with the statement of the Ming poet Zhu Chengjue (cited above) that ‘The marvel in composing poetry resides entirely in the complete merging of mind and scene, something that transcends tones and sounds, and captures the ‘genuine flavour.’

The religious attainment that can come from writing or reading zhen exile poetry was ‘genuine Chan’ in yet another way that was very important to Hanshan. It was a form of ‘authentic practice,’ because it assisted him to attain inner calm in an environment that was not conducive to cultivating a calm mind; furthermore, it did so when his prior training proved incapable of doing so. His prior attainments were thus proved to be ‘false’ in that they were a product of his environment, whereas his achievements in Leifeng were products of insight, and thus ‘genuine.’ We may note, in this regard, the following passage from Hanshan’s afore-mentioned letter in reply to Yang Yuanru:

It is hard to achieve cool detachment within a tumultuous [‘hot and chaotic’ reluan 熱亂] scene. As the three realms are without peace, they are like a house on fire; all that pass through it are burned. To find a piece of cool land within raging flames – no one but a person with cool detachment can attain [this]. If one can, at the present moment, within the space of a single thought [attain] coolness, and suddenly see that the great realm is all ice, from this point on, one will not take the body, the mind or the world as a place of refuge.

熱亂場中難當冷眼。以三界無安, 猶如火宅, 出入其中者, 勢不為其燒煑。若從烈燄中覓得一片清涼地, 非冷眼人不能得。苟能當下一念清涼, 頓見大地皆冰, 自不在身心世界中作歸宿也。110

110 *Reply to Supreme Commander Yang Yuanru’ Dream Travels, fascicle 15: (CBETA, X73, no. 1456, p. 571,
By his own account, before his exile Hanshan felt that he was an accomplished practitioner. However, as a result of being thrown into the nightmarish hell that was his exile in Leifeng, ‘I dedicated myself to delving into the mind-seal of the Buddha and patriarchs by reading the *Laṅkāvatāra*, [upon which] I finally knew that [the knowledge I had attained] beforehand had fallen into the gate of light and shadows, and was not of genuine *jñānadarśanabala.*’ 唯對楞伽究佛祖心印，始知從前皆墮光影門頭，非真知見力.111 After he realised that *samsāra* is the ‘burning house’ and is not real, he no longer took refuge in it. And after realising that the ‘pure’ mind he had earlier cultivated was the product of the ‘purity’ of his environment and was therefore ‘false,’ he was able to cut all identification with the ‘defiled’ mind and sentiments that were the product of his ‘defiled’ setting. No longer bound to his world and his self-identity, he identified himself with the universal ‘genuine mind’ that is, wherever it is found, immutably ‘cool and pure.’ As Hanshan noted in his *Essentials of the Avatamsaka*, when one truly attains the ‘mind of Bodhi’ (i.e. the ‘Buddha mind’ or ‘genuine mind’), ‘the fires of *samsāra* and all defilements cannot burn it; they cannot cause it to be hot’ 菩提之心亦復如是。一切生死諸煩惱火不能燒然不能令熱.112 One has then achieved ‘true’ or unconditional emancipation.

**Political Violence, Zhen Poetry and Enlightenment – The Legacy of Hanshan’s ‘Poetry is Genuine Chan’**

In this chapter I have presented what I see as Hanshan’s model wherein being ‘authentic’ in poetic expression that dealt with the ‘real’ and traumatic experience of political persecution could be a means to awaken to ultimate ‘truth’ (the ‘genuine mind’). By employing *zhen* as an organizing motif, Hanshan created a distinctive rubric that contrasted starkly with the more conventional Buddhist view of poetry: that poetry and Buddhist enlightenment intersected in the ‘ideals’ of inner ‘purity’ and ‘detachment’ from an impure world. This was possible arguably because Hanshan saw poetry against the background of the socially-

---

engaged tendencies of the Buddhist monastery in that era. The space he created for ‘secular’ literary practices addressed the difficult task that ‘loyal’ monks had in dealing with the secular world of politics and in bringing these domains into the fold of Buddhist practice. In advocating a connection between literary ‘zhen’ and the zhen mind, Hanshan may have been at first inspired by non-monastic ‘secular’ thinkers such as Li Zhi and Gongan thinkers.\footnote{As noted, Hanshan was a close associate of Gongan school founders Yuan Zongdao and (to a lesser extent) his brother Yuan Hongdao and in 1588 hosted a society for the study of Chan and other teachings that Yuan Zongdao had instigated. This relationship has been briefly dealt with in He Zongmei (何宗美) Gonganpai jieshe kaolun《公安派結社考論》 (Chongqing: Chongqing chubanshe, 2005), pg. 4 (see also the ‘Preface,’ pg. 4).} However, the theoretical articulation of this connection was fundamentally Buddhist, the product of an arduous attempt to make his ideas about the religious value of poetry consistent with his soteriological thought.

We shall see in the remainder of this dissertation that Hanshan’s underlying approach – that being ‘genuine’ in portraying emotional anguish can help one to deal with the ‘reality’ of political persecution and chaos, and can be a means to realise ‘the genuine’ – became an influential paradigm in monastic poetics. Moreover, we shall see that it became most influential in communities who had suffered most as a result of political violence and dynastic transition, namely Buddhist communities in China’s south, and especially its Southeast (that is, Lingnan/Guangdong, Fujian and Jiangnan), that contained many monks and/or devotees who were ‘loyal’ to the Ming regime. Perhaps assisted by the propagation of Hanshan’s teachings by his eminent disciple Qian Qianyi,\footnote{Qian Qianyi is said to have taken it upon himself to carry out the unfinished work of Hanshan and Zibo. See Lien Jui-chih [Lian Ruizhi] 连瑞枝 ‘Qian Qianyi de fojiao shengya yu linian’ 〈錢謙益的佛教生涯與理念〉 (in Zhonghua foxue xuebao 《中華佛學學報》, No. 7, 1994), pgs. 318, 322-24.} two important Caodong Chan lineages in particular were to carry on the legacy of his Buddhist poetics of zhen. These were Juelang Daosheng’s Tianjie lineage (discussed in Chapter 3),\footnote{An account of the significance of the relationship between Qian and Daosheng is provided in Lien, ‘Qian Qianyi de fojiao shengya yu linian,’ pgs. 338, 338, 367.} and the lineage of Tianran Hanshi, the dharma descendant of Hanshan’s dharma cousin Zongbao Daodu (宗寶道獨 1600-1661).\footnote{Accounts of the interactions between Qian Qianyi and Tianran, his teacher Zongbao Daodu (宗寶道獨 1600-1661), and his disciple Jinshi Dangui, are also given in Lien, ‘Qian Qianyi de fojiao shengya yu linian,’ pgs. 338-240, 362, 365. Dangui’s order played a pivotal role in the storage of Hanshan’s manuscripts, and the printing of Dream Travels.}

In the next chapter I will discuss the writings on poetry of an early Qing 'loyalist' monk who explicitly stated that his understanding of the union of Chan and poetry was inspired by the
writings of Hanshan. This was the Tianjie lineage founder and ‘loyalist’ monk Juelang Daosheng.
Chapter 3: A Winter Furnace of Indignation – Historical and Spiritual Transformation and the Idea of ‘Straightforward’ Poetry in the Work of Juelang Daosheng

Introduction

The Ming-Qing transition-era monk Juelang Daosheng (覺浪道盛 1592-1659) did not reach the heights of eminence attained by Hanshan Deqing, and unlike the latter, has received little attention from Anglophone scholars. However, there are many similarities between Daosheng and Hanshan in terms of their intellectual achievements and the trajectories of their careers. Daosheng had extensive connections with the social elites of the late Ming and was renowned for his loyalty to the dynasty. As was also the case with Hanshan, engagement with politics caused Daosheng to suffer incarceration and the threat of execution when in late middle age. A further connection between them is that Daosheng subscribed to Hanshan’s idea that non-Buddhist poetry can be an instrument for Chan cultivation. Daosheng placed considerable emphasis on the poetic expression of indignation – an emotion which he felt was especially prevalent and problematic in times of political chaos. He felt that being ‘straightforward’ (zhì 直) in the poetic expression of ‘indignation’ (yuàn 怨) could alleviate outrage (nu 怒, a word I sometimes translate as ‘animus’ to reflect the fact that Daosheng does not always see this quality as a negative force) and could also address injustice in an era of chaos and moral turpitude. The ‘thunderous’ effects of indignation could produce a flash of insight in a figurative dark ‘winter’, a process that is equivalent to awakening to the ‘genuine truth’ (zhēndì 真諦) and opening the gate of unity between mundane truth (sāṃvṛtisatya) and genuine truth (paramārthasatya).

The argument of this chapter is that we can draw a set of connections between Daosheng’s ideas about indignation, his ideas about poetry, his ideas about the relationship between Buddhist and non-Buddhist moral and mental cultivation, his ideas about temporal cycles and his ideas about enlightenment, and that these ideas form an interlocking system. Through a close reading of Daosheng’s ‘Discourse on Poetry’ (shì lún 〈詩論〉) and by linking this ‘Discourse’ with other texts by Daosheng, the chapter discusses the idea that being ‘straightforward’ meant being able to express indignation without fear or reservation when
this was warranted. Being straightforward also meant being ‘upright,’ which would prevent outrage from degenerating into ‘wanton hatred’ (chen 財, dveṣa). Anger and hatred could be ‘constrained’ (jie 節) and ameliorated by the ‘voicing’ (xuan 宣) of ‘genuine’ (zhèn 真) indignation. An important related tenet of Daosheng’s syncretic thought was the idea that righteous sentiments could prompt the ‘cessation’ (zhì 止, śamatha) of defiled thoughts and that this could bring the movement (dōng 動) of the Human Mind (renxin 人心) into harmony with the stillness (jīng 靜) of the Dao Mind (daoxin 道心). On the grounds that heaven’s will is synonymous with Buddha nature, expressing indignation at injustice could help to awaken people to the transcendental truth, instigating the state of union between the ‘Relative’ and the ‘Absolute’ that marked ultimate enlightenment in the soteriology of the Caodong school to which Daosheng belonged. Daosheng’s conceptual scheme was based on correlations between Buddhist concepts and the contents of the Chinese Classics, in particular the trigrams and hexagrams in the Book of Changes. By reading his texts comparatively we can articulate the connections in Daosheng’s thought between poetry, strong emotion, moral and political order and religious cultivation – between being genuine in poetic expression, confronting and transforming a dark reality and realizing ultimate truth.

Salvaging the Dharma amidst the Dveṣa of War: The Life, Times and Religious Mission of the ‘Loyalist’ Monk Juelang Daosheng

The Life¹ and Legacy of Daosheng

Surnamed Zhang (張), Daosheng (1592-1659) was born into a devoutly Buddhist household in Zhepu Village (柘浦村) in northern Fujian during the reign of the Wanli Emperor (r. 1572-1620). As a child he diligently studied the eight-legged essay form, mastery of which was indispensable for success in the imperial exams. However, probably because of a decline in his family’s circumstances, Daosheng was compelled at the age of 15 to put aside his personal aspirations and enter an uxorilocal marriage. Daosheng first tried unsuccessfully to enter a Buddhist order under the tutelage of a monk called Guzhou (孤舟) when he was 19. He eventually succeeded in being secretly tonsured by the monk Ruiyan Shigong (瑞巖識公).

Daosheng then sought the tutelage of Boshan Yuanlai (博山元來 1576-1630) – the master of Zongbao Daodu (宗寶道獨 1600-1661), who was the teacher of Tianran (the subject of the next chapter) – and then studied under Boshan’s brother Haiyun Yuanjing (晦臺元鏡 1577-1630), who recognised him as his dharma-heir. In 1635, Daosheng began his career as an eminent religious leader, when he was chosen to teach the dharma at Fuchuan Temple (福船).
寺) in Jiangxi. He then travelled to a number of monasteries before settling for a period in Nanjing’s Tianjie Temple (天界寺). In 1655 Daosheng returned to Jiangxi to serve as the abbot of Boshan Temple (博山寺). His spent his final months, and reached nirvāṇa, at Tianjie – a temple which achieved some prominence under his leadership and which is the source of the name of his Tianjie lineage. The latter decades of Daosheng’s life coincided with the fall of the Ming dynasty and the establishment and expansion of Qing power.

Living during a chaotic era of dynastic transition, Daosheng became known both as an exemplary ‘loyalist’ monk who tacitly supported those who resisted Qing rule, and as an erudite religious thinker who shaped his teachings to address the problems of his times. Daosheng attracted into his order a number of tao chan monks, and forged personal relationships with several prominent Ming loyalists, including Huang Duanbo (黃端伯 1585-1645), Qian Chengzhi (錢澄之 1612-1693), the temperamental Qu Dajun (屈大均 1630-1696) and, most famously, the renowned materialist philosopher and yin-yang thinker Fang Yizhi (方以智 1611-1671) (who entered Daosheng’s order and became one of his key disciples).

Daosheng produced a highly eclectic collection of writings which, aside from orthodox Chan recorded sayings, included prefaces, poems and sophisticated syncretic essays, the most influential of which were those discussing his views on the Zhuangzi and yin-yang theory, reflecting the breadth and intimacy of his relationships with secular thinkers. Much of his work was collected together in the Complete Records of Chan Master Juelang [Dao]sheng of Tianjie [Temple] (Tianjie Juelang [Dao]sheng chanshi quanlu) 《天界覺浪盛禪師全錄》, in 33 fascicles, which, along with a ‘recorded sayings’ collection, was included in the Jiaxing Canon. The Complete Records, which was compiled and printed posthumously, is the only source that documents Daosheng’s views on poetry, and in particular his advocacy of Confucius’ idea that ‘poetry can express indignation’ 詩可以怨. Because these views on

---

3 A brief discussion on relationships between Daosheng and some of these ‘loyalist’ disciples (especially Fang, Qian and Qu) can be found in Hsieh Ming-Yang ’s Ming yimin de Zhuangzi dingwei wenti 《明遺民的莊子定位論題》 (Taipei: Taiwan daxue chuban weiyuanhui, 2001), pgs. 6-11.
5 Recorded Sayings of Chan Master Juelang [Dao]sheng of Tianjie [Temple], Jiaxing C. Vol 25, no. B174. This 12-fascicle version was compiled by Daosheng’s disciples Zhu’an Dacheng (竺菴大成 1610-1666) and Guantao Daqi (觀濤大奇 1625-1678), and contains a preface composed by Qian Qianyi that is dated 1658. The Jiaxing Canon also contains a shorter one-fascicle collection: The Recorded Sayings of the Auspicious Grain of Juelang Daosheng of Tianjie [Temple] (Tianjie Juelang-sheng jiahe yálu) 《天界覺浪盛禪師嘉禾語錄》 (Vol. 34, no. B312).
poetry cannot be found in earlier printed collections of Daosheng’s recorded sayings, it is likely that these ideas were formulated late in his life.

**Imprisonment and the Threat of Execution – Daosheng’s Middle Way between ‘Detachment’ and ‘Engagement,’ ‘Stillness’ and ‘Movement’**

Why, in the later part of his life, would Daosheng have developed views on poetry that would be regarded as radical from the perspective of his monastic vocation? A plausible explanation is that, like Hanshan, the politically active Daosheng suffered persecution in late middle age. In 1648, not long after the fall of Nanjing to the Manchus, political tensions heightened as a number of ill-fated rebellions, instigated by Jin Shenghuan (金聲桓 ?-1649) and Wang Deren (王得仁 ?-1649), threatened the stability of the newly-constituted and still fragile Qing empire. At this sensitive juncture, the loyalist-affiliated Daosheng, who was then serving as the abbot of Wuxiang Temple (無相寺) at Mount Ling (靈山) in Taiping Prefecture (太平府) (located in what is now Anhui), was arrested and imprisoned. The ostensible grounds for Daosheng’s arrest was that a Qing official had noticed the words ‘Ming Taizu’ (明太祖) – the honorary posthumous title of the first emperor of the Ming – in Daosheng’s *Seven Discourses on the Probing the Source of the Dao (Yuandao qi lun)* 《原道七論》. This offence was considered grave enough for local officials to have wanted to execute him. However, about a year later the threat of rebellion has faded, and, upon review of the case by

---

6. An early account of Daosheng’s imprisonment can be found in fascicle 32 of the *Chronological History of the Chan Lineage (Zongtong piannian)* 《宗統編年》, composed by the early Qing monk Shuangyu Jiyin (湘雨紀陰) (CBETA, X86, no. 1600, p. 304, a14-b15 // Z 2B:20, p. 243, a11-b18 // R147, p. 485, a11-b18). A detailed modern scholarly account of the events surrounding Daosheng’s imprisonment can be found in Hsieh Ming-Yang ‘s ‘Juelang Daosheng ‘Zhuangzi tizheng’ xiezuo beijing kaobian,’ 〈覺浪道盛「莊子提正」寫作背景考辨〉 《清華學報》 New Series 42, No. 1, Mar. 2012), pgs. 146-150.

7. The seven discourses discuss both Buddhist and mainstream secular thought. Their titles are: ‘Discourse on [the Notion that] ‘Each should be Content to Pursue the Vocation and Lifestyle [that Befits Them]’ (‘Ge an shengli lun’) （各安生理論）, ‘Discourse on [the Notion that] the Scholar-Official is the Foundation of Order’ (‘Shi wei zhiben lun’) （士為治本論）, ‘Discourse on [the Notion that] the Law is the Foundation of the State’ (‘Fa wei guoben lun’) （法為國本論）, ‘Discourse on [the Notion that] the Dao Orders the Core Truth of Doctrinal Orthodoxy’ (‘Dao zhi zongzhi lun’) （道治宗旨論）, ‘Discourse on Transcending the Weightiness of Samsāra’ (‘Shengsi zhongchao lun’) （生死重超論）, ‘Discourse on the [Principle that] the Sage Master Ought to Promote both Mundane and Supramundane Dharmas’ (‘Shengzhu dang xing shi/chushifa lun’） （聖主當興世出世法論） and ‘Discourse on the Meeting of the Three Teachings’ (‘Sanjiao huitong lun’) （三教會同論）. All of them are contained in fascicle 12 of Daosheng’s *Complete Records*. 

8. The ‘Biography of Chan Master Juelang [Dao]sheng of the Reigning Dynasty’ states: ‘they sentenced the master to prison and intended to have him executed’ 坐師獄中, 擬以大辟. See Chen Yi’s *Sheshan zhi*, fascicle 3: ‘Lüshi’ 〈律師〉 [‘Vinaya-dhara’ or ‘Vinaya Master’], pg. 68.
a higher official, Daosheng was found to have done nothing untoward and was promptly released.\(^9\)

Accounts of Daosheng’s response to this situation contain features that are commonly found in Chinese Buddhist hagiography. As an accomplished Buddhist practitioner, he is portrayed as being unperturbed by, and even completely indifferent to, the deprivations and dangers that confronted him. For example, on the occasion of a visit from a sympathetic Qing official, Daosheng is recorded as having expressed his detachment from the world by writing out a famous Li Bai poem that claims that the author resides in ‘another world not of mortal men’.\(^{10}\) According to Daosheng’s student Zhu’an Dacheng (竺菴大成 1610-1666), Li Ripeng, the Qing official responsible for Daosheng’s release, praised him for being unmoved by his perilous situation, reportedly stating that Daosheng was ‘not resentful when incarcerated, nor was he joyful when released. This is a genuine man of the dao’ 禁之無慍，釋之無喜，此真道人也.\(^{11}\)

However, when we review some of the writings that Daosheng composed while he was in prison, a picture emerges that is perhaps at odds with this vision of a monk detached from the

---

\(^9\) The review of Daosheng’s case was undertaken by the Provincial Governor in Charge of River Control (操江巡撫) Li Ripeng (李日芃, Governor 1647-1655). According to Daosheng’s disciple Zhu’an Dacheng (竺菴大成 1610-1666), Li stated in the review: ‘This is a book that discusses the Dao. How can we not allow people to praise the first emperor of the Ming? During the Ming, people praised the founding emperor of the Yuan. Furthermore, the book was printed in the Ming Chongzhen era!’ 此論道書也，明太祖豈可不許人稱耶？明亦稱元世祖也。況其書刻在明崇禎時耶

\(^{10}\) The full poem, recorded in ‘Discourse on the Meeting of the Three Teachings,’ Complete Records, fascicle 20: (CBETA, J34, no. B311, p. 710, a29-b1). A similar account can be found in the Xudeng zhengtong version of ‘The Dharma Heir of Chan Master Huitai—jing of Dongyuan: Chan Master Juelang Daosheng’ (fascicle 40: CBETA, X84, no. 1583, p. 638, c5-6 // Z 2B:17, p. 481, c13-14 // R144, p. 962, a13-14). However, Hsieh Ming-Yang argues in his ‘Zhuangzi tizheng’ xiezuo beijing kaobian that a more likely reason for Daosheng’s prompt release was his cordial relations with influential Qing officials; see pgs. 147-150.

\(^{11}\) ‘Discourse on the Meeting of the Three Teachings,’ Complete Records, fascicle 20: (CBETA, J34, no. B311, p. 710, a17-18), is ‘Dialogue in the Mountains’ (‘Shanzhong wenda’) 〈山中問答〉 composed by the famous Tang poet Li Bai (李白 701-762) (the version in the Complete Records has minor differences from the original version of the poem). The full poem has been rendered by Stephen Owen as follows: ‘You ask me why I lodge in these emerald hills; I laugh, don’t answer – my heart is at peace. Peach blossoms and flowing waters go off to mysterious dark, And there is another world, not of mortal men.’ See Owen, An Anthology of Chinese Literature: Beginnings to 1911 (New York: W.W Norton, 1996), pg. 403. The eminent Chinese scholar Wei Daoru (魏道儒) has asserted that the ‘other world’ referred to by Daosheng here was a world apart from that controlled by the Manchu Qing. See Du Jiwen (杜繼文), Wei Daoru, Zhongguo chanzong tongshi 《中國禪宗通史》 (Nanjing: Jiangsu guji chubanshe, 2008), pgs. 612-613. Quoting Wei, Hsieh Ming-Yang says that Daosheng’s invocation of this poem was ‘in actuality an expression of profound longing for the old state, expressing his identity as a loyalist.’ (Hsieh, ‘Ming yimin de ‘Zhuangzi dingwei,’ pg. 83). However, in view of the content of this poem and Daosheng’s situation at the time of writing, I would argue that it is more likely that Daosheng invoked this poem in order to give others the impression that he was not concerned about either politics or his own fate.
world and unperturbed by crisis. This is especially the case when we look at Daosheng’s introduction to his ‘Diagrams of the Three Treasures of Confucian Doctrine [based on] Derived Meanings, [composed while I was] in Prison’ (‘Huanzhong yanyi Ruzong sanbao tu’ 〈圜中衍義儒宗三寶圖〉). Rather than expressing the author’s detachment from ‘the world of mortal man,’ this text affirms a link between Daosheng’s own time and the moral and political order of Chinese antiquity. Daosheng implied that self-cultivation could enable people to attain the mental equilibrium of the ancient sages and could awaken them to universal moral ideals, so that they would ‘follow their innate nature and return to the will of heaven’ (shuai xing yi gui tian ming 率性以歸天命). In other words, by calming one’s passions, one could attain intuitive insight into one’s primordial ‘true’ self.

‘Poetry can express Indignation’ - ‘Straightforwardness’ in Indignation and the idea that ‘Poetry and Chan are One’

Daosheng lived out the latter period of his life in an era of social and political upheaval (his death roughly coincided with the end of the Southern Ming), and I argue that the core ideas formed in this historical context became the kernel of many subsequent developments in his syncretic thought. This is particularly evident in a number of texts composed later in his life that discuss an emotion symptomatic of and prevalent during a troubled age: ‘indignation’ (yuan 怨), the emotion that arises from ‘injury’ or ‘grievance’ (one of the other resonances of the word yuan 怨). A key example of these writings is a short text (a paragraph of approximately 500 words) that Daosheng most probably composed in the final years of his life, entitled ‘Chapter on Repaying Injury with Kindness’ (‘Yi de bao yuan zhang’ 〈以德報怨章〉).

Daosheng’s ‘Chapter on Repaying Injury with Kindness’ discusses Confucius’ principle that while one should repay kindness with kindness, one should not repay ‘injury’ with kindness,

---

12 *Complete Records*, fascicle 33: (CBETA, J34, no. B311, p. 786, c11-p. 787, b20). During his imprisonment Daosheng wrote a large number of texts, including commentaries on the Heart Sutra and Diamond Sutra, as well as a study on the Derived Meanings of the Zhou Book of Changes (Zhouyi yanyi) 《周易衍義》 (see ‘Discourse on the Meeting of the Three Teachings,’ *Complete Records*, fascicle 20: CBETA, J34, no. B311, p.710, a14-b02). An important study on the writings Daosheng composed while in prison is found in Araki Kengo’s *Yukoku rekka zen*, chapter 9: ‘Gokuchū no shisaku’ 〈獄中の思索〉, pgs. 151-169.


14 Note that I have chosen to translate de 德 as ‘kindness’ rather than ‘virtue’, as I feel that this translation more accurately captures the resonances of the term as Daosheng uses it in this text. Yuan 怨 has been translated here as ‘injury’, rather than as ‘indignation’, because here Daosheng is writing about acts or events and not about states of mind.
but should instead ‘repay injury with straightforwardness’ (yi zhi bao yuan 以直報怨). The true value of ‘straightforwardness’ is that it can help people who feel wronged both to transform their outrage and to suppress more pernicious emotions – in particular ‘wanton hatred’ or ‘dveṣa (chen 瞋),’ one of the ‘three poisons’ (san du 三毒, tri-viṣa*), or cardinal defilements, in Buddhist ethical thought. For Daosheng, we can argue, ‘straightforwardness’ (zhi 直) – something which resonates with the notion of being ‘truthful’ or zhen – meant two things: it meant being ‘straight’ in the sense of being ‘direct’, and ‘straight’ in the sense of remaining ‘upright.’ ‘Straightforwardness’ entailed expressing pent-up feelings of indignation, which was legitimate because it could ‘cause the unrighteous to know righteousness’ (使不義者知有義也). Moreover, being straightforward made people ‘upright,’ because it militated against the possibility of intense outrage devolving into illegitimate feelings of hostility towards others – it impelled people to ‘direct indignation at themselves’ so as to ‘cure’ themselves of the impulse to do wrong.

In the ‘Chapter on Repaying Injury with Kindness’ Daosheng refers to ‘straightforwardness’ as ‘the innate endowment (shengxing) of our minds with heavenly principle (tianli)’ (wu xin zhi tianli shengxing). We can suggest that this conception is somewhat similar to the idea of innate moral knowing propounded by the Wang Yangming school of Neo-Confucian thought, in which innate moral knowing is seen as a point of junction between the moral will of the cosmos and the innate nature of Mind. In other writings, Daosheng defines ‘straightforwardness’ as ‘following one’s innate nature’ (shuai xing 率性). The term shuai xing appears in the above-mentioned ‘Diagrams of the Three Treasures of Confucian Doctrine’ composed when Daosheng was in prison. As in the earlier work of Zibo Zhenke, shuai xing is contrasted with the folly of ‘following one’s sentiments’ (shuai

---

15 The other two are, in some translations, desire (tan 貪, rāga) and ignorance (chi 痴, moha).
17 ‘Repaying Injury with Kindness,’ Complete Records, fascicle 33: (CBETA, J34, no. B311, p. 795, a7-8).
18 Daosheng’s understanding of the relationship between zhi and shuai xing is outlined in the following line: ‘What is innate (sheng 生) in people is straightforwardness (zhi); straightforwardness is what is called following one’s innate nature (shuai xing).’ 人之生也直。直者率性之謂 ‘Who Says that Wei Shenggao is Upright?’, Complete Records, fascicle 33, CBETA, J34, no. B311, p. 794, a25-26). This indicates that for Daosheng, being ‘straightforward’ (zhi) and following one’s innate nature (shuai xing) were essentially the same. It should be noted, in this regard, that shuai, which I have translated as ‘to follow,’ can also imply ‘to give free reign to.’
19 ‘Master Han said that Poetry and Chan are one; our school uses this to transmit its animating principle.’ 憑公曰: 「詩禪一也」。吾宗以之接機. ‘Discourse on Poetry,’ Complete Records, fascicle 19: (CBETA, J34, no. B311, p. 701, b25).
"qing 率情 or jing qing 經情"), that is, giving free rein to one’s emotions.\(^{20}\) Understanding and cultivating one’s innate nature and integrating oneself into the moral order of the cosmos were linked undertakings. If one understands that the ‘heavenly principle’, the ‘nature of Mind’, ‘the will of Heaven’ and the yearnings of one’s ‘true’ self are one and the same, then ‘directness’ and ‘uprightness’ can reawaken one to one’s mind’s natural endowment with heavenly principle. This idea offered a model for bringing about a perfect union between the moral tenets of Confucianism and the religious goals of Buddhism in a troubled age.\(^{21}\)

Much of the remainder of this chapter will discuss the idea that emerges from a comparative reading of a range of Daosheng’s texts that being ‘straightforward’ in expressing indignation (especially in poetic writing) can help one combat a ‘reality’ that is characterised by rampant immorality, and that this in turn can facilitate the realisation of religious ‘truth’. The doctrinal and philosophical instruments that Daosheng used in this theoretical project were diverse, involving poetics, yin-yang thought, Doctrine of the Mean philosophy, and Buddhist soteriology. However, his fundamental unifying idea was that of finding a ‘middle’ or ‘dual’ path between the extremes of suppressing emotions and letting them run out of control and that Buddhist and non-Buddhist approaches to morality and mental cultivation could be connected. This was especially evident in his views on how ‘high’ poetry, which was

---

\(^{20}\) For instance, ‘Who Says that Wei Shenggao is Upright?’ in fascicle 33 of Daosheng’s Complete Records contains the statement that ‘straightforwardness does not lie in doing what one pleases (jing qing)’ “…直不在徑情 (CBETA, J34, no. B311, p. 794, a25-27). Zibo Zhenke discusses the distinction between ‘following innate nature’ (shuai xing) and ‘following sentiments’ (shuai qing) in some detail, emphasising the need both to follow one’s ‘innate nature’ and to avoid the temptation to follow one’s ‘sentiments’ (succinctly stated in his ‘Dharma Sermons’ in fascicle 4 of his Complete Collection: ‘follow one’s innate nature and control one’s sentiments’ 率性治情 (CBETA, X73, no. 1452, p. 180, c2 // Z 2:31, p. 355, b9 // R126, p. 709, b9)). One of the ‘Dharma Sermons’ in fascicle 2 of Zhenke’s Complete Collection also states: ‘When one is enlightened, one’s joy and anger only follow one’s innate nature. By following one’s innate nature, one can comprehend all conditions in the world…If one cannot follow one’s innate nature and instead follows one’s feelings, then the life of a person in the midst of delusion will be doubly pitiable’ 悟則喜怒唯率性,率性能通天下情…不能率性而率情,迷中倍人可憐生 (CBETA, X73, no. 1452, p. 157, a13-15 // Z 2:31, p. 331, d7-9 // R126, p. 662, b7-9).

\(^{21}\) This is roughly, the view that Araki Kengo takes of Daosheng’s response to his era in his Yukoku rekka zen, especially pgs. 80-90 (in Chapter 5 ‘En no zenpō ‘怨の禅法’). We may note the following passage from Daosheng’s Complete Records: ‘People of the world make greed (rāga) their true nature, and then covet worldly possessions, reputation, power, wealth and affection, and create all kinds of unwholesome karma, resulting in them harming themselves and harming others. They compel many ordinary people to kill others and commit arson to satisfy their rage (fen 情).’ 世人以貪欲而正性命,復以貪欲世間貨財、功名、勢位、富貴、恩愛,造種種業,以致自害害人,遂迫出許多平民,殺人放火,以快其憤 (in ‘Separate Records of Xiling,’ Complete Records, fascicle 29: CBETA, J34, no. B311, p. 766, c21-24). The implication here is that the greed and rage of those that seek power directly affects the character and behaviour of the ‘masses.’ However, Daosheng’s point about rage may have referred more specifically to loyalist communities. Loyalists often directed their ‘rage’ at the Qing, but were also often afflicted by infighting, betrayals and petty bickering. The prevalence of infighting within Southern Ming regimes is a core theme in Lynn Struve’s The Southern Ming: 1644-1662 (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1984).
traditionally associated with Confucian tenets of moral rectitude, could be identified with Chan. On this count, we may turn to Daosheng’s ‘Discourse on Poetry’ 《詩論》.

**Indignation ‘Without Evil Thoughts’ – ‘Voicing’ (xuan) and ‘Constraining’ (jie) in Daosheng’s ‘Discourse on Poetry’**

Daosheng argued that Confucius’ statement that ‘poetry can express indignation’, showed that poetic indignation could have therapeutic, moral and soteriological benefits for the poet as long as it was understood correctly and put into practice appropriately. Why did poetry have a special role in moral and religious cultivation? The following passage from Daosheng’s ‘Discourse on Poetry’ 《詩論》 perhaps provides some answers:

Poetry is where the intent of the mind goes; it holds fast; it aligns properly with the times. Master Zhuang says, “The mind holds fast but it does not understand what it holds fast and cannot hold fast.” Guan Yin once said: “the Dao lodges itself [in analogies].” One puts words into song and puts one’s intent into words. When one gives expression to the inner thoughts of the mind, one deploys analogies: This is profound. Now closing and now opening, now orthodox and now transformed, now direct and now circumlocutory, now simple and now ornate – tones harmonize themselves and rhythms balance themselves. Is it not the case that, in following correct rules, one holds fast to that to which one cannot hold fast and that, in aligning properly with the times, one constrains or voices where it [i.e. the intent of the mind] goes?...

Jiaoran said that, as a form of the Dao, the Book of Poetry occupies the foremost position among the Six Classics. It presides over the gate of manifold wonders and it penetrates the mysteries of the Buddha. But it was the fear that people “learn only to wield the axe and lack true substance” that caused Bo Ya to sigh deeply. Master Han [Hanshan] said that Poetry and Chan are one; our school uses this to transmit its animating principle. The mountains and rivers, the mists and the clouds, the grasses and the waters, soaring and leaping, transforming things and creating beginnings: all of these are harmonized within it, without there being any arriving or any departing. So how is it that I seem only to do violence to the sounds and rhymes of Wang Wei, Meng Haoran, Li Bai and Du Fu? Wang, Meng, Li and Du were able to achieve harmony in their tones and balance in their rhythms; they accorded with heavenly order in regard to the needs of the times and to orthodoxy and transformation. Furthermore, they never failed to promote what is worthy and discard what is worthless, in line with the principle of ‘having no evil thoughts’.

詩者，志之所之也；持也，時也。莊生曰：靈臺者，有持而不知其所持，而不可持者也。關尹嘗言：道寓，永言、言志，發其心苗，其寓興也，深矣。
一闔一闢、一正一變、一直一曲、一平一奇,其音自諧,其節自中:殆以法持其不可持者,以時而節宣其所之也…

皎然曰:詩之為道,居六經之先司,眾玅之門,徹空王之奧。但恐徒揮斧斤而無其質,則伯牙所太息也。憨公曰:詩禪一也;吾宗以之接機。山川煙雲,艸水飛躍,感物造耑,不即不離,而協在其中矣。區區與王、孟、李、杜、磨戛聲律而已乎!然王、孟、李、杜諸人諧音中節,時宜正變,適其天然,亦未嘗非「思無邪」之陶鑄糠秕也。22

Summary Overview – Poetry, Self-Expression and Moral Rectitude

The above passage provides a concise explanation of what ‘high’ poetry is and outlines some of its core functions.23 The first section states that poetry expresses the author’s ‘intent.’ Poetry is ideally characterised by ‘holding fast’ (chi) to this intent, and by the alignment between this intent and the (moral) needs of the day (one’s ‘times’ shì 時). However, when emotions are stirred by the events (shì 事) of one’s times, the author’s intent cannot be held to (chi) consciously or explicitly (that is, it cannot be described in plain prosaic language). Rather, intense sub-conscious yearnings prompted by unfolding events form a source of spontaneous artistic creation, and one’s ‘intent’ is ‘held fast’ (chi) or expressed through the use of allusions or analogies that derive from these yearnings. Because the formal features of high poetry are a natural product of innate human yearnings (I will elaborate on this point later), the spontaneous and un-selfconscious expression of one’s intent naturally aligns one’s poems with the medium’s formal prescriptions. In this way, spontaneous poetry that abides by formal prescriptions without self-conscious effort will be conducive to ‘holding fast’ to the ‘intent’ (an entity to which it is difficult to hold fast in a conscious way).

In the second cited paragraph, Daosheng states that poetry that is faithful to the above prescriptions – for example, the poetry of the great poets of the High Tang, such as Wang Wei and Li Bai – can also be identified with Chan. He asserts that the poems of these authors follow the principles outlined above, and that the observance of formal rules and stylistic standards in these poems does not arise from a conscious preoccupation with literary effects.

22 ‘Discourse on Poetry,’ Complete Records, fascicle 19: (CBETA, J34, no. B311, p. 701, b1-29). Liao Chao-heng suspects that this passage may have been written by by Fang Yizhi, because it discusses matters – such as tone and rhythm – that are often seen as concerns of the so-called Archaist school. Liao feels that it would have been improper for a monk to discuss such matters (See Liao, Zhong-bian, shi-chan, pg. 17). However, a number of early Qing monks engaged intellectually with supporters of the Archaists, even directly criticising the core poetic ideas of the school.

23 An excellent discussion on this passage can be found in Hsieh’s ‘Ming yimin Juelang Daosheng yu Fang Yizhi ‘yuan‘ de shixue jingshen,’ pgs. 443-449. Shorter analyses can be found in Liao’s Zhong-bian, shi-chan, pgs. 16-18, 56-60.
Furthermore, Daosheng suggests that identifying poetry with Chan did not mean that the artistic quality of the poetry needed to be compromised to suit religious imperatives. The ‘enlightening’ poems of Wang Wei, Meng Haoran and others, for instance, are exemplary in their observance of formal rules and stylistic conventions, and in their adherence to the essence of the high tradition, while also adapting and responding appropriately to the needs of their times. As the ‘intent’ of these poets was exemplary, they were aligned with the will of heaven and with the doctrines of Chan, and they expressed thoughts that are without ‘evil’. The movement of the ‘intent’ of the author is expressed in poetry that is appropriate to unfolding circumstances, and abides by formal rules, even though it is written spontaneously.

‘Setting out from Sentiments and Abiding in the ‘Rites’ –‘Directness’ in Expressing the ‘Intent of the Mind,’ and ‘Uprightness’ in ‘Having No Evil Thoughts’

The views that Daosheng expresses in his ‘Discourse on Poetry’ are broadly consistent with orthodox Confucian ideas about poetry that were circulating in his era. This is particularly the case with regard to the idea that poetry was both a medium for self-expression and a means to promote moral rectitude. The first line – ‘poetry is where the intent of the mind goes’ – connects with the statement in the Book of Documents that ‘poetry states the intent of the mind’ (shi yan zhi 詩言志), and is also a quote from the ‘Great Preface’ in the Mao version of the Book of Poetry. It declares that poetry is first and foremost a vehicle through which the author voices his aspirations, aims and emotions. However, Daosheng emphasises later

24 The link between ‘poetry’ and ‘where the intent of the mind goes ’ (zhi zhi suo zhi 志之所之) draws on perceived phonetic and pictographic connections between the characters zhi 志 ‘intent’ and zhi 之 ‘to go’ and the character for ‘poem’ (shi 詩). An excellent discussion on these connections can be found in James Liu’s Chinese Theories of Literature (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1975), pg. 67-70.

25 Hsieh, ‘Ming yimin Juelang Daosheng yu Fang Yizhi,’ pgs. 443-444. For the original quote, see Correct Meaning of the Mao version of the Classic of Poetry: (Maoshi Zhengyi) 《毛詩正義》 (1.1.1c), in Ruan Yuan (阮元 1764-1839), The Thirteen Classics with Annotations and Subcommentaries (Shisan jing zhu疏）《十三經注疏》 (Taipei: Yiwen yinshu guan, Rpt. 1960), pg. 271. Daosheng’s ‘Discourse on Poetry’ draws many points from the ‘Great Preface.’ Generally, I have used my own translations of passages from the ‘Great Preface’ in order to highlight my argument that Daosheng’s interpretations of these passages were distinctive. For an excellent recent translation and discussion on the ‘Great Preface,’ see Steven Van Zoeren’s Poetry and Personality: Reading, Exegesis and Hermeneutics in Traditional China (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1991) pgs. 80-115. See also Jack Wei Chen’s The Poetics of Sovereignty: On Emperor Taizong of the Tang Dynasty (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Asia Center, 2010.), pgs. 110-114; and Haun Saussy’s Problems of a Chinese Aesthetic (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1993), pgs. 75-79.

26 For an in-depth discussion, see Van Zoeren’s Poetry and Personality. Van Zoeren renders zhi as ‘aim,’ but notes that ‘the term also covers some of the same ground as “intention,” “ambition,” “disposition,” or even the Heideggerian “projection.” The zhi symbolized or rather exemplified the whole thrust of a person’s being… If you knew an individual’s zhi, you knew who that person was’ (pg. 57). Poetry can thus be seen as a tool of ‘self-revelation of zhi through speech,’ which could include ‘involuntary’ or indirect revelations expressed in discussions on contemporary issues or events (see pg. 57). Van Zoeren observes of Mengzi’s discussions of zhi that ‘zhi was an integral element of the personality, connected to and “leading” the emotional nature’ (pg. 57).
in the ‘Discourse on Poetry’ and in the explanatory note that follows it that this self-expression must not deviate from moral ‘orthodoxy’ and must demonstrate the attribute of ‘having no evil thoughts’ – a characterization of the Book of Poetry in Confucius’ Analects. 27 By starting with ‘intent,’ and ending with ‘having no evil thoughts,’ the structure of Daosheng’s ‘Discourse on Poetry’ resonates with the quote in the ‘Great Preface’ that poetry ‘emanates (or ‘sets out’) from one’s sentiments (fa hu qing 發乎情) and abides in (or ‘stops at’) [observance of] the rites’ (zhi hu li 止乎禮).” 28 Poetry should express heartfelt sentiments and suppress deviant feelings; it should promote normative Confucian values and reflect the ‘innate nature’ of the author.

How can poetry be ‘direct’ and ‘upright’ at the same time? Departing somewhat from orthodox Confucian approaches to this question, Daosheng suggested that poetry would be both heartfelt and morally restrained if there was skillfulness in (chi) ‘holding fast’ (which related both to the ‘intent’ of the author and to the formal rules of poetry) and in (shi) ‘aligning with the times’ (which related both to the author’s zeitgeist and to the provision of political and/or social criticism through satire and the use of analogy).

Poetry as ‘Holding Fast’—Abiding by the Rules and Regulating Zhi

I would argue that for Daosheng the core idea involved in the concept of ‘holding fast’ in poetry is that of creating a balance between emotional expression and moral restraint. As with the equation between the characters for ‘going’ (zhi 之) and ‘intent of the mind’ (zhi 志), the character ‘chi’ (持) – translated above as ‘to hold fast’— was traditionally linked to poetry on the basis of perceived pictographic and phonetic connections between the character ‘chi’ (持) and the character for ‘poetry’ (shi 詩). 29 Chi, however, can mean different things. Vincent Yu-chung Shih’s translation of Liu Xie’s influential 6th-century text The Literary Mind and the

27 The idea of ‘deviating’ from orthodoxy is captured in D. C. Lau’s translation of this phrase from the Analects; he renders xie (‘evil’) as ‘swerving’ (See Lau (trans.), The Analects, London: Penguin Books, pg. 62). I have used ‘having no evil thoughts’ to reflect the general use of xie in Daosheng’s Complete Records, where it is used, in several instances, in direct contrast with shan (‘goodness’), or in a compound with shan (for example, ‘How can it not contain evil and good?’其不可藏邪善乎 Complete Records fascicle 30, in CBETA, J34, no. B311, p. 774, a27).


29 See the earlier footnote relating to James Liu’s discussion on the link between ‘poetry’ (shi), and zhi (‘intent of the mind’) and zhi (‘to go’).
Carving of Dragons\textsuperscript{30} renders \textit{chi} as ‘to discipline,’ and its object is stated to be the ‘xingqing’ (the ‘innate nature and sentiments’) of the author – a concept which is not unrelated to the notion of the ‘intent’ of the mind (\textit{chi}).\textsuperscript{31} Daosheng’s ‘Discourse on Poetry’ discusses \textit{chi} through a quote from the \textit{Zhuangzi},\textsuperscript{32} and he does not make explicit the object to which poetry ‘holds fast’. What he might have meant in invoking this short line has, however, been briefly discussed by the Taiwan scholar Hsieh Ming-Yang. His interpretation is as follows:

‘…The essential character of poetry lies in emotions (qingzhi 情志). When emotions turn to indignation and anger cannot be held in check (\textit{chi}), the poet holds fast (\textit{chi}) to these things that cannot be held in check and which are beyond his ability to hold in check, and he can only follow the contraction and release of sentiments of joy and sorrow in order to bring the composition of poetry to completion; this is what is called ‘the method of poetry.’

Hsieh advances this interpretation on the basis of a short passage in the writings of Daosheng’s disciple Fang Yizhi, which begins by stating that ‘the intent of the mind is expressed when one is unable to hold something in check (\textit{chi}) and when one holds fast (\textit{chi}) the thing which one is unable to hold in check’志發于不及持，持其不及持.\textsuperscript{34} In Hsieh’s understanding, Fang Yizhi is describing an ideal of poetry as naturally expressing the spontaneous ‘contracting’ (or ‘withholding’) and releasing (shoufang 收放), or the ‘constraining and voicing’ (jiexuan 節宣), of emotional responses in relation to events or predicaments. As one’s writing stems directly from one’s intent, there should be no discord

\begin{itemize}
\item 30 See Liu Xie (劉勰), Vincent Yu-chung Shih (trans.) \textit{The Literary Mind and the Carving of Dragons} (Hong Kong: The Chinese University Press), 1983, pg. 32. Shih’s translation of the key line about poetry and \textit{chi} 持 reads: ‘Poetry means discipline (\textit{chi}), disciplined human emotion.’ The line in \textit{The Literary Mind} where poetry is identified with ‘\textit{chi}’ first appears in the section titled ‘Poetry Harbours the Mist of the Spirit’ (‘Shi han shenwu’) 〈詩含神霧〉of \textit{The West [Book] on Poetry (Shi Wei) 《詩緯》}, a text which dates from the Han dynasty. The line in question states: ‘poetry is \textit{chi}’詩者，持也.’ See Huang Shi (黃奭), \textit{Shi Wei《詩緯}} Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, Rpt. 1993, fascicle 2, pg. 2).
\item 31 The close relation between \textit{chi} and ‘xingqing’ (rendered by Vincent Shih as ‘human emotion’) is discussed in Van Zorren’s \textit{Poetry and Personality}. However, I do not feel that ‘human emotion’ is an appropriate translation for \textit{xingqing} in this particular context. I argue that Daosheng’s concept of \textit{xingqing} involved the union of two distinct but interrelated elements: (Buddha) ‘nature’ (xing) and human ‘sentiment’ (qing).
\item 32 In \textit{The Complete Works of Zhuangzi} (New York: Columbia University Press, 2013) Burton Watson translates this line as follows: “The Spirit Tower has its guardian, but unless it understands who its guardian is, it cannot be guarded.” (pg. 255). Here, \textit{chi} 持 is rendered as ‘guardian.’ I do not disagree with Watson’s translation, but have provided a version which I feel better reflects Daosheng and Fang’s use of ‘\textit{chi}’.
\item 33 See Hsieh, ‘Ming yimin Juelang Daosheng yu Fang Yizhi ‘yuan’ de shixue jingshen,’ pg. 445.
\item 34 Fushan Literary Collection (Last Volume) \textit{(Fushanwenji (houbian))《浮山文集 (後編), in Siku Banned Books (Siku jinhui shu congkan)《四庫禁毀書叢刊》, ‘Collected Works Section’ (jibu 〈集部〉), Volume 113, fascicle 1 (Beijing: Beijing chubanshe, 2000), pg. 663.}
\end{itemize}
between the poetic style or technique (fa) of one’s composition, and the ‘intent’ of one’s ‘mind’ (xin) at the time of writing; one should reach a state where ‘the [distinction between] the mind and poetic rules [or methods] vanishes’ 心與法泯矣.35 Fang elaborated this as follows: ‘When poetic rules [or methods] are perfected, one can truly accept all rules [and methods] and one need not [be bound by any] single method, because the poetic method (fa) emanates from one’s xingqing and alone exhausts its variations’ 法至于詩，真能收一切法，而不必一法，以詩法出于性情，而獨盡其變也.36 This clearly resonates with Daosheng’s point that “One puts words into song and puts one’s intent into words. When one gives expression to the inner thoughts of the mind, one deploys analogies… now direct and now circumlocutory, now simple and now ornate – tones harmonize themselves and rhythms balance themselves.’

However, Daosheng’s and Fang’s concepts differed. While Fang’s ‘fa’ refers to the ‘method’ and ‘technique’ of poetry in a general sense, Daosheng’s ‘Discourse on Poetry’ places special emphasis on ‘musical’ fa – that is, ‘rules’ in relation to tone and rhythm.37 This is particularly evident in the line ‘tones harmonize themselves and rhythms balance themselves,’ and in his statement that the great Tang poets ‘achieved harmony in their tones (yin 音) and balance in their rhythms (jie 節).’ ‘Holding fast’ (chi) to musical ‘rules’ is a defining feature of ‘poetry.’

On this point, we may consider the following passage from the Discourse on Music (Yue lun) 《樂論》by the Confucian scholar Xunzi (312-230 BCE):

So men cannot but feel joy, and joy cannot but manifest itself [in music]. If, however, it is manifested and [is not in harmony] with the Way, then there must be disorder. The Former Kings abhorred this kind of disorder, and so they made the sounds of the Elegantiae and Lauds in order to lead and control it [dao zhi]. They made these sounds so that they were sufficient [to incite] joy, which did not, however, get out of hand… They made the directness, the complexity, the intensity, and the rhythms of [these sounds] such that they were able to move the good people’s hearts [gandong ren zhi shanxin] and such that the filthy and depraved energies [qi] would be rejected. This was the way in which the Former Kings established the music. (Translation in Van Zoeren, Poetry and Personality).38

35 Ibid.
36 Ibid.
37 This point is very briefly made by Liao in Zhong-bian, shi-chan, pg. 17.
38 Pg. 78.
Abiding by the orthodox or formal rules for the ‘sounds’ and ‘rhythms’ of music can help one to *chi* in both senses: to ‘hold fast’ (that is, to express truthfully) and to ‘discipline’ (that is, to ‘hold in check’ or control) the *zhi* of the author. In other words, by following the rules of music, poetry can help one balance the need to vent emotions and the need to suppress them.\(^{39}\)

Poetry as ‘Aligning with the Times’ – Being ‘Appropriate’ through ‘Constraining’ and ‘Voicing’

As noted above, Daosheng also saw poetry as a form of literature that reflects upon or responds to the spirit of its author’s ‘times’ (*shi* 時). Like the character *chi*, the character *shi* was perceived as having pictographic and phonetic connections with the character *shi* ‘poetry’ (詩).\(^{40}\) Just as he used a line from the Zhuangzi to explain *chi*, Daosheng elaborates the meaning of *shi* by quoting another Daoist-affiliated figure, Guan Yinzi (關尹子):\(^{41}\) “the Dao lodges itself [in analogies].”\(^{42}\) Like the quote from the Zhuangzi, this is a somewhat cryptic phrase lifted from a passage that had nothing to do with poetics. However, Daosheng gives an indication of why he uses the quote in a postscript to the ‘Discourse on Poetry’:

---

\(^{39}\) The idea that Daosheng’s discourse proposes that following ‘rules’ in regard to tone and rhythm can help one temper (‘constrain’ 節制) emotional excesses has been advanced briefly in Liao’s *Zhong-bian, shi-chan*, pg. 57.

\(^{40}\) Unlike the well-established tradition of asserting etymological links between *chi* and *shi* which I discussed earlier, I am not aware of any widely known precedents of *時* being linked with 詩.

\(^{41}\) Guan Yin, a semi-mythical figure, was a guard at the western gate of the Zhou capital Chengzhou. According to Daoist folklore, Guan asked Laozi to write a text before allowing him to leave the gates. The text in question is the *Laozi* or *Daode jing*. Daoist writers in later years reimagined Guan as the recipient of a ‘transmission’ of the *Laozi*. Livia Kohn has provided a summary of the location of extant fragments of the *Essential Biography of [Guan Yin – the Master of] The Beginning of the Scripture (Wenshi Neizhuan)* 《文始內傳》 – the earliest extensive hagiography of this mythical figure (see *Daoism Handbook* (of which Kohn is chief editor – Leiden; Boston: Brill, 2000), Chapter 11 ‘The Northern Celestial Masters,’ pg. 294). Kohn has also written a study of this hagiography – ‘Yin Xi: The Master at the Beginning of the Scripture’ (in *Journal of Chinese Religions*, No. 25, 1997), pgs. 83-139.

\(^{42}\) The original quote can be found in the *Guan Yinzi* or *True Scripture of the [Master] of the Beginning of Scripture (Wenshi zhenjing)* (also known by other names including the *Guan Yinzi wenshi zhen jing* 《關尹子文始真經》) – a forgery likely composed in the Song dynasty, if not earlier. The quote appears in chapter 2 (*er zhupian* (二柱篇)), in the context of a discussion on prognostication and appears to have no direct relation to Daosheng’s reading of it. For the original version, see Chen Xianwei (陳顯微), *Guan Yinzi wenshi zhen jing* 《關尹子文始真經》 (in the *Xu xiu siku quan shu* bianzuan weiuyuanhui (續修四庫全書編纂委員會) (ed.) *Xu xiu siku quanshu* 《續修四庫全書》, Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 1995), volume 1292 (‘zi’ (子) section, ‘Religious texts’ (宗教類)), pgs. 20-21. An extensive study on the probable origins of the *Guan Yinzi*, and the commentaries on it, can be found in the doctoral dissertation of Zhang Lijuan (張麗娟): ‘*Guan Yinzi* ji qi zhushu yanjiu’ (Faculty of Humanities, Xiamen University, 2012). Hsieh Ming-Yang discusses the *Guan Yinzi* quote in ‘Ming yimin Juelang Daosheng yu Fang Yizhi,’ pg. 449.
Chen Dan[zhong]⁴³ said that when Confucius taught how to study poetry and touched upon ‘birds, beasts, grasses and wood,’ his analogies were profound... To use objects as analogies and not to dare to speak overtly is what is fitting for a minister. Later, scribes writing on behalf of others made use of oddities and obscure allusions, and this also passed on the ‘birds, beasts, grasses and water’ of antiquity.... Who knew that analogies of our master [Confucius] were all directed towards following the teachings and transforming customs (feng 風)?

陳丹裏曰:孔子教學詩而及鳥獸艸木，其寓深矣...夫寓物而不敢正言，臣子之誼也。後來以奇聞僻事捧硯捉刀；是又下古之鳥獸艸水也...誰知吾師之寓一切以隨風轉風也乎。⁴⁴

Here Daosheng asserts that a distinctive quality of poetry is that it expresses social or political commentary on events, and that it does this indirectly through the use of allusion and analogy. Poetry differs from prose in that it does not state its intended theme or the subject or substance of its critiques in a clear or transparent manner. A poem may appear to be depicting natural phenomena such as animals or landscape, but if it is worthy of being called ‘poetry,’ its true aim must be to provide social or political commentary, and what it overtly depicts must be understood as being metaphor or analogy.⁴⁵ Metaphor and analogy allow the loyal and righteous subject to use poetry to advocate the restoration of the ‘rites’ or the implementation of policies that adhere to Confucian principles without criticizing the monarch (which could question his authority and thereby exhibit ‘disloyalty’).

This throws light on why Daosheng seems to suggest that shì 時 (the ‘times’ or the zeitgeist of the author) and yù 寓 (‘analogies’ and ‘metaphors’ as literary devices) were closely related to each other. One needs to understand the ‘times’ of the author if one is to know the true meaning of his metaphors. Only by doing so can one uncover the true intent of his poems and, by extension, the intent of his mind. Because of this, poetry that is ‘aligned with the times’ combines a desire to express the ‘movement’ (zhì 志) of the author’s intent (zhì 志) (something that responds to unfolding events) with the desire to promote Confucian moral principles (providing moral commentary while exercising restraint). Thus poetry is a vehicle

---

⁴³ In the Jiaxing Canon his name is recorded as 陳丹裏. This is clearly an error, probably due to similarities between the character lǐ 裏 (the character recorded in the Jiaxing C.) and zhōng 忠 (the correct character). Chen, a Ming official who did not serve the Qing, came from Jinling (Nanjing), and was a disciple and close associate of Daosheng. His interactions with Daosheng’s order are mentioned on a number of occasions in Hsieh Ming-Yang’s ‘Juelang Daosheng Zhuangzi tizheng xiezuo beijing kaobian’ (see pgs. 144-149, 158).
⁴⁵ This is different from many conventional interpretations of this line from the Analects. Typically, it is interpreted as meaning that poetry can educate the reader about the names for different ‘birds, beasts, grasses’ and so on (things which were not normally discussed in Confucian classics).
for effectively managing true feelings that ‘cannot be held fast’ (or ‘held onto’) yet ‘cannot be held back.’

Poetry as the Coming Together of zhi, chi and shi

Poetry, for Daosheng, is fundamentally an aesthetic, rather than simply didactic, medium. It is defined, especially in contrast to prose, by the observance (chi) of formal or musical rules and by the use of analogy and metaphor which are to be interpreted with reference to the times (shi) in which the author is writing. Furthermore, the aesthetics of a poem are an outward expression of the inner beauty that can be found in the author’s mind, that is, in his intent (zhi). The expression of this zhi is, fundamentally, both what poetry is, and why it involves chi and shi. In high poetry, zhi, chi and shi always interact and stay in alignment with each other. These core principles are expressed in the ‘Great Preface’ to the Mao version of the Book of Poetry, but they are expressed in more detail in a passage from the Record of Music, which has been rendered by James Legge as follows (I have inserted Chinese characters into his text to draw attention to some key concepts, and added translations, in square brackets, of sections that are missing from Legge’s version):

All modulations of the voice [yin 音] spring from the minds of men. When the feelings are moved within, they are manifested in the sounds of the voice; and when those sounds are combined so as to form compositions, we have what are called airs [yin 音]. Hence, the airs of an age of good order indicate composure and enjoyment. [Its governance is harmonious (qi zheng he 其政和)]. The airs of an age of disorder indicate dissatisfaction and anger [yuan yi nu 怨以怒], and its government is perversely bad. The airs of a state going to ruin are expressive of sorrow and (troubled) thought. [Its people are hard pressed (qi min kun 其民困)] (N.B.: this last phrase is not in Legge’s translation).36

This passage states that the properties of music differ in different eras: what is distinctive about each era’s music is a product of that era’s ‘airs’ (that is, its tunes). ‘Airs’ convey the spirit of one’s ‘times’; in conventional Confucian historical and political thinking this

---

primarily denoted the degree to which the rites are being observed and society is in a state of
harmony, or, conversely, the degree to which the observance of the rites and moral standards
have declined and society is in a state of chaos and disorder. Poetry needs to be ‘aligned with
the times’ in the sense that it needs to differ over time – ‘now closing and now opening, now
orthodox and now transformed, now direct and now circumlocutory, now simple and now
ornate’.

Perhaps the most important of these pairings is ‘orthodox’ (zheng 正) and ‘transformed’ (bian
變), a common pair in the poetics of the late imperial era. This pairing is normally used to
describe how the highly varied corpus of ‘high’ poetry from the Book of Poetry to the Han
and Tang could be seen as a continuous lineage. ‘Orthodoxy’ usually referred to abiding by
the principle of ‘having no evil thoughts,’ the defining quality of the Book of Poetry.47
‘Transformation’ typically referred to differences in stylistic features or formal rules in
different eras. If high poetry was to give poets the facility to express a correct or appropriate
moral response to the times, it had to permit different techniques and set different formal rules.
Only by expressing an appropriate moral response and by following the formal rules and
conventions appropriate to the day (that is, by ‘voicing’ and ‘constraining’, and expressing
this response in a measured way) could a poem express the sincere feelings and intent of the
author and have ‘no evil thoughts’ at the same time. Poems composed in an ‘age of disorder’
could express ‘indignation’ (yuan) and even ‘outrage’ (nu) – ‘the ‘airs’ of an age of disorder
are characterized by yuan and nu, and its government is bad’. Thanks to the observance of the
‘constraints’ of formal and musical rules, these poems and emotions would not degenerate
into harmful sentiments such as ‘resentment’ or ‘wanton hatred.’

Constraint and Voicing – The Theories of Fang Yizhi

The pairing of ‘constraining and voicing’ (jiexuan 節宣) was touched upon above. It
correlates with the duality of following nature and suppressing feeling, and arguably has
special significance. It is given particular emphasis in a short explanatory note that follows the

47 One contemporary of Daosheng who promoted this theory was the early Qing poeticist Ye Xie (葉燮 1627-
1703). His theory that the ‘high’ tradition is unified in being faithful to Confucius’ fundamental tenet that poetry
should have ‘no evil thought’ is outlined in Karl-Heinz Pohl’s ‘Ye Xie’s On the Origin of Poetry (Yuan Shi). A
Poetic of the Early Qing,’ (in Young Pao, LXXVIII, 1992, pg. 4). Zong-qi Cai’s Configurations of Comparative
Poetics: Three Perspectives on Western and Chinese Literary Criticism (Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press,
2002) notes that Ye Xie proposed a ‘dynamic interplay between wen and the cosmological Dao’ (pg. 66): wen
(文) ‘literature’ follows or manifests wen (文) ‘patterns’ (i.e. cosmological patterns).
‘Discourse on Poetry’ and is explained as follows: ‘now limpidly still and now flowing, now retracting and now releasing – [this] is the dao of ‘constraining and voicing’ —澄、一流、一收、一放，節宣之道也.48 States associated with water are here used as metaphors to distinguish two mental states: the mind in stillness, and the mind affected by phenomenal movement. This follows a convention common in both Chan Buddhist and neo-Confucian literature: ‘limpid stillness’ refers to the state of the mind when it is not agitated and defiled by emotion, just as water is limpid and still when mud at its base is not stirred. ‘Flow’ describes the mind in motion – a state where thoughts and emotions are represented, in the common Buddhist use of this metaphor, as running in an intermingled flow like a river or stream.49

However, Daosheng’s conception of ‘constraining’ and ‘voicing’ differs from the traditional Buddhist dualism of ‘limpid stillness’ and ‘flow.’ ‘Limpid stillness’ is traditionally viewed as an ideal in Buddhism, and ‘flow’ is viewed as something pernicious or defiled. Daosheng, however, appears to imply that constraining and voicing should be balanced with each other.50 The dualism of ‘constraining and voicing’ does not appear to derive from Buddhist sources, but instead comes from Fang Yizhi’s earlier teacher Wang Xuan (王宣).51 Fang placed significant emphasis on this dualism, and – unlike his teacher – left behind a substantial number of writings which addressed it, many of which were highly syncretic (Buddho-Confucian) texts. It seems likely that Daosheng’s ideas about ‘constraining and voicing’ shared some elements with Fang’s understandings. As Daosheng wrote little on ‘constraining and voicing’ beyond what is contained in the explanatory note to the ‘Discourse on Poetry’ it is worth investigating what Fang had to say about this pairing.

48 Complete Records, fascicle 19 (CBETA, J34, no. B311, p. 701, c5). These dualisms are mentioned in Liao’s Zhong-bian, shi chan, pg. 17.
49 There are numerous examples of this. One is from the Thorough Comprehension of the Core Doctrines of the Lankāvatāra (Lenggie jing zongtong) 《楞伽經宗通》, fascicle 2: ‘All consciousness and thoughts are produced by the transmission of cause and effect; they have no inherent nature. They are like the rushing waters in a river, vying until they disappear, without knowing each other. 彼諸識展轉相因而生，本無自性。譬如河中水湍流競奔逝。各各不相知 (CBETA, X17, no. 330, p. 637, b1-3 // Z 1:26, p. 202, a16-18 // R26, p. 403, a16-18).
50 In Buddhist literature, the Chinese word for ‘flow’ (liu 流) often denotes the Buddhist concept of āsrava or ‘outflow,’ which refers to – very roughly speaking – the impurities or views which bind people to samsāra. This pejorative meaning is not implied in Daosheng’s use of the word liu here, as he was inspired by neo-Confucian uses of the term.
Fang Yizhi’s late writings on poetry provide a very thorough elaboration of the concepts of ‘constraining’ and ‘voicing’. In many places in Fang’s work the terms appear to designate opposing mental states that arise during the creative process and have an impact on the constitution of the poem. However, Fang relates them more specifically to the dualism of self-expression and self-censorship: to uttering ‘words’ (yan 言) or ‘sounds’ (sheng 聲), or remaining silent.52 Like Daosheng, Fang did not divorce the choice of ‘constraining’ or ‘voicing’ one’s zhi from aesthetic considerations; the determining factor for Daosheng and Fang was ethics. In Fang’s view ‘voicing’ one’s zhi defined what poetry essentially is, while ‘constraint’ was related to observing the ‘rites’; one had to ensure that one did not transgress the boundaries of propriety.53 Through the balancing of constraining and voicing, poetry both ‘emanates from sentiment and abides in [observance of] the rites’ 發乎情止乎禮. Equally, it is ‘used to voice [the inner feelings] of people and to constrain people’ 詩以宣人即以節人.54 As Hsieh Ming-Yang has explained: ‘Although the aim of composing poetry and songs is to express sentiments (which inclines towards ‘voicing’), if sentiments are poured out without any restraint, one cannot but fall into intemperance…By ‘voicing’ qing in accordance with the rites, one can subject the sentiments expressed in poems and songs to appropriate control.’55

‘‘Constraining’/‘Voicing’, Confucian Cultivation and Buddhist Practice

For Fang Yizhi, the mastering of ‘constraining and voicing’ that the writing of high poetry involved made the medium a powerful instrument for the cultivation of character – that is, for bringing one’s mind into alignment with the ‘rites’.56 The Taiwan scholar Chiang Shu-ch’iin has elaborated the close relationship between Fang’s ideas about ‘constraining’ and ‘voicing’ and his understanding of the concepts of ‘equilibrium’ (zhong 中) – or being rated the

---

52 The dualism of ‘words’ and ‘wordlessness’ and its relation to the pair ‘constraining and voicing’ (jiexuan) is discussed in Fang’s ‘Hall of Poetry’ (‘Shitang’) (詩堂), in his Abridged Gazetteer of Qingyuan (Qingyuan zhi lue) 《青原志略》 (in Zhongguo fosi shi zhi huikan 《中國佛寺史志彙刊》, Vol. 14, Taipei: Danqing tushu gongsi, 1985), pg. 699. This is discussed in more detail below. The related dichotomy of ‘sounds’ and ‘soundlessness’ is found, amongst other places, in Fang’s ‘Correctness and Harmony’ (‘Zheng xie’) 正葉, which can be found in his Fushan wenji hou bian (in Siku Banned Books, fascicle 2), pg. 672.


54 Fang Yizhi quanshu, pg. 57.

55 ‘Ming yimin Juelang Daosheng yu Fang Yizhi ‘yuan’ de shixue jingshen,’ pg. 444. Liao, similarly, relates ‘constraint’ not only to observing the ‘rites,’ but also to ‘adherence to principle’. He stated: ‘only when rationality and sentimentality attain complete complementarity can one attain the [Confucian poetic] ideal of ‘mildness and sincerity.’ See ‘Taochan yimin wenxue zhuzhang zhi yi,’ pg. 135.

56 In his ‘Yaodi Yuzhe dashi zhi shixue’, Liao Chao-heng states, with reference to Fang’s theories on constraining and voicing, that ‘poetry is almost always identified with the Dao; more precisely, ‘poetry’ is an expression of the dao, and at the same time it is the most important entry point into intuitively verifying the true nature of human life’ (pg. 278).
clos‘centred’) and ‘harmony’ (he 和) as these concepts were articulated in neo-Confucian accounts of the ‘Doctrine of the Mean.’

57 Equilibrium is the state of equipoise that precedes the emanation of sentiments. Harmony denotes the concordance between sentiments and the prescriptions of the rites.

58 Hsieh Ming-Yang states that Fang’s model ‘pays attention to how the poet expresses and restrains his sentiments in the creation of poetry, and brings his xingqing into a state of equilibrium and harmony,’ while Chiang observes that, ‘the problem addressed by the theory of constraining and voicing is that of how poetry can enable one’s xingqing to abide in a state of harmony.’

59 By cultivating constraining and voicing in poetry, the poet can attain the mindset of the sages; he can reach the state of inner purity and refine the mind’s ability to respond appropriately to external stimuli. This is a very important point, because realizing the Doctrine of the Mean in practice was identified in Daosheng’s ‘Diagrams of the Three Treasures’ as the goal of his middle way of giving free rein to one’s feelings while also exercising emotional restraint.

Fang Yizhi saw constraining and voicing not simply as opposites, but as two forces that were intimately interrelated, describing this as ‘the reciprocal interpenetration of constraining and voicing’ 節宣廻互.

61 Reciprocal interpenetration is a very important doctrine in Huayan Buddhism and in the Caodong school to which both Fang and Daosheng belonged. It denotes an ideal state of harmony or unity between phenomenal reality and transcendent truth.

Fang held that perfecting the ‘equilibrium’ and ‘harmony’ of ‘voicing’ and ‘constraining’ could be a means through which ‘words’ (mundane truth) and ‘wordlessness’ (supramundane truth) can return to ‘oneness.’

62 The ideal of perfecting harmony between constraining and voicing, and the harmony of ‘words’ and ‘wordlessness’, appears to be linked with the ideal of achieving the unity of the two truths, which is the highest attainment in the soteriologies of


58 A good introduction in English to ‘Doctrine of the Mean’ thought (particularly aspects that were to later inform later imperial era neo-Confucianism) can be found in Shu-hsien Liu’s Understanding Confucian Philosophy: Classical and Sung-Ming (Westport: Greenwood Press, 1998), Section 1, Chapter 4 – ‘The Great Learning and the Doctrine of the Mean,’ pgs. 57-73.

59 In ‘Fang Yizhi yu Mingdai fugu shixue de chengbian guanxi kaolun,’ pg. 93.

60 Chiang, ‘Fang Yizhi zhong-he shixue sixiang yanjiu’, pg. 148.


62 Fang and Daosheng also paralleled ‘constraining and voicing’ with the Madhyānta dualism of ‘the centre and the periphery’ (Zhong-bian). This is a core theme in Liao Chao-heng’s ‘Yaodi Yuzhe dashi shixue yuanliu ji zhiiyao lungkao,’ pgs. 257-293 (an almost identical discussion can be found in Liao’s Zhong-bian, shi-chan, pgs. 151-200).

63 See Chiang, ‘Fang Yizhi ‘zhonghe’ shixue sixiang yanjiu,’ pg. 150. Fang stated: ‘words voice the wordless; the wordless constrains words’ 言宣無言，無言節言 (‘Hall of Poetry,’ pg. 699).
the Huayan and Caodong schools. ‘Constraining’ and ‘voicing,’ therefore, were for Fang not only a meeting point between poetry and Confucian mental cultivation, but also between Confucian cultivation and core tenets of Caodong Buddhist practice.

For Daosheng himself, the theme of releasing and restraining emotions was important in his ideas about the Doctrine of the Mean and Confucian-Buddhist syncretic thought more generally. In his Complete Records, Daosheng speaks at length about the need to adopt a balanced approach to releasing and restraining emotions, and also on numerous occasions discusses the duality of stillness (jing 靜) and movement (dong 動) of the mind (a duality linked with that between ‘limpid stillness’ and ‘flow’). Daosheng held that the states of emotionality (‘movement’) and of being without emotions (‘stillness’) should be brought into ‘union’. This union could be aligned with the notion of the unity of the two truths (mundane and supramundane). Daosheng believed that this could be a means to realizing both the ‘Mean’ and the ‘Supreme Truth’ (diyi yidi 第一義諦, paramārtha-satya) – a syncretism between neo-Confucian principles of cultivation and Chan practice. Thus we return to Daosheng’s position that ‘poetry and Chan are one,’ and its relation to his argument that being both ‘direct’ and ‘upright’ in the expression of intense emotion (‘straightforwardness’ in expressing ‘indignation’) can lead to enlightenment.

To understand what Daosheng meant when he stated that ‘poetry and Chan are one,’ it is helpful to look at texts he composed that address these ideas, particularly the notion of a ‘middle way’ that encompasses both restraining emotions and releasing them. One text that advances these ideas in a systematic way is his ‘Disquisition on bringing together Confucianism and Buddhism’ (Ru-Shi cantong shuo 儒釋參同說).

‘Equilibrium and Harmony’ in ‘Constraining and Voicing’ and the ‘Dual Cultivation of Cessation and Contemplation’

The ‘Disquisition on bringing together Confucianism and Buddhism’ is a short text that syncretises Daosheng’s thought on the Doctrine of the Mean and Buddhism. I translate excerpts from the text below:

The Confucian scholar said: “Taking refuge in the Buddhist precepts encompasses the tenets of our Confucianism, and opens the eyes of humanity and heaven. Can the mind dharma – that extending from Yao and Shun to Confucius – be cultivated and verified by means of the Buddha dharma?” The Master said:
“There is no greater merit than establishing the teachings. There is no teaching greater than illuminating xingqing.” If one can illuminate the primordial movement (dong 動) and stillness (jing 靜) of xingqing, then one will not be confused by evil and delusion. The skill of mastering movement and stillness lies in maintaining the sincerity and rightness that is originally there. By guarding against the delusion and evil that is not originally there, the movement and stillness of xingqing is unimpeded, and the words and actions of one’s body and mind are not in error...

The Human Mind (renxin 人心) is the mind’s animating principle for movement. Because it is manifest and observable, it is ‘exposed’ (wei 危); it is mundane truth. The Dao Mind (dao xin 道心) is the mind’s animating principle for stillness. Because it is latent and abstruse, it is ‘subtle’ (wei 微); it is supramundane truth.

As for the animating principles for movement and stillness, there is movement and stillness stemming from natural causes, movement and stillness stemming from appropriateness, movement and stillness stemming from the ripening of karmic seeds during emotional responses to sensory contact (感觸薰習), movement and stillness stemming from forced attachment (勉強執著), and movement and stillness stemming from the arousal of delusion and vexation (妄慮激發). Overall, movement and stillness are due to the evil or the rightness of joy, anger, grief and delight.

Thus, the power of the Learning of the Sages [Confucianism] resides entirely in the two words ‘vitality’ and ‘focus’ (jing-yi 精一); the power of Buddhism resides entirely in the two words ‘cessation’ and ‘contemplation’ (zhi-guan 止觀). Contemplation (guan) is derived from vitality (jing); cessation (zhi) is derived from focus (yi). When joy, anger, grief and delight have arisen, they may be lost to defilement, so one needs the ‘cessation’ (zhi) of ‘vitality’ (jing) in order to still them. The mundane truth of the Human Mind will then of its own accord be transformed into the Dao Mind, and so responsiveness and tranquility will permanently abide within the Mean.

The subtlety of the Dao Mind is [the state of the mind that exists] before joy, anger, grief and delight have arisen. It may be lost to atrophy, so one needs the contemplation (guan) of focus (yi) to awaken it, and the supramundane truth of the Dao Mind will of its own accord merge into the Human Mind, and openness-mindedness and perceptiveness will permanently abide within the Mean’.

Through the unity of vitality and focus (jing-yi) which is the power of the Sages and through the mutual effect of cessation and contemplation (zhi-guan), one can be conscientious when one is alone, one can attain the equilibrium and harmony (zhong-he 中和) of xingqing, and one can verify the principle of the Supreme Ultimate (taiji 太極). As the ‘unity of vitality and focus’ becomes ‘the blending of cessation and contemplation’, one can control oneself so as to bring together the unity of heaven and humanity. Only [in] this unity of vitality-focus and cessation-contemplation is there the supreme truth (diyi yidi 第一義諦) of ‘sincerely
holding to the Mean’ (yunzhi juezhong 允執厥中), with the supramundane and mundane truths being always present within.

士曰:皈戒攝吾儒之旨,誠開人天眼目也。祇如堯舜至孔子,其心法有可以佛法參證者乎。師曰:功莫大於立教; 教莫大於明性情。能明性情本有之動靜,則不為邪妄所淆。其御動靜之功全在存本,有之誠正。閑其本無之妄邪,則性情之動靜自如,而身心之言行無悖。其於家國天下。。。

人心即心之動機，其顯見昭著故惟危，即俗諦也。道心即心之靜機，其隱微幽密，故惟微即真諦也。

是故，聖學之功全在「精一」二字；佛教之功全在「止觀」二字。「觀」自精也；「止」自一也。喜怒哀樂之已發,或失之垢染,故須惟精之止以靜之,則人心之俗諦自化為道心,而感應寂然常在厥中也。

道心之微為喜怒哀樂之未發。或失之斷滅; 故須惟一之觀以惺之,則道心之真諦自融其人心,而虛靈不昧,常在厥中也。

惟聖功之精一不二，止觀互用，則能慎獨，以至性情之中和，而證太極之理。惟此精一不二為止觀雙融，則能克己以合天人之一貫。

以合天人之一貫惟此精一止觀之不二是為允執厥中之第一義諦,而真俗二諦亦無時不中也。64

Structure and Core Theme

The stated aim of the ‘Disquisition on bringing together Confucianism and Buddhism’ is to reveal how Buddhist teachings and practices can enable one to achieve intuitive verification of the ‘esoteric’ meaning of the Confucian ‘Sixteen-Word Dictum.’ This dictum, taken from a passage in the ‘Counsels of the Great Yu’ (大禹謨) section of the Book of Documents (Shangshu) 《尚書}, was depicted by neo-Confucians as encapsulating the core tenets of the Confucian teachings, and was also seen as a vehicle for the ‘mind to mind transmission’ (a core concept in Chan pedagogy) that linked the ancient sage rulers (such as Yao and Shun) with the eminent Confucians of later ages (above all Confucius).65 In addressing this dictum,
‘The Disquisition on bringing together Confucianism and Buddhism’ can thus be seen as outlining some of the most fundamental principles of Daosheng’s syncretic thought.

The ‘Disquisition’ is structured according to the sequence of the four four-character lines in the ‘Sixteen-Word Dictum’. To capture what I consider to be Daosheng’s distinctive interpretations of these lines, I have rendered them as follows: 1.) ‘the Human Mind is exposed’ (*renxin wei wei* 人心惟危), 2.) ‘the Dao Mind is ‘subtle’ (*daoxin wei wei* 道心惟微). 3.) ‘[the first] is ‘vitality’ [ and the second] is ‘focus’ (*wei jing wei yi* 惟精惟一), 4.) ‘[as a result] one always adheres to the ‘Mean’ (*yun zhi jue zhong* 允執厥中).

Daosheng’s ‘Disquisition’ is essentially an extended commentary on the Sixteen-Word Dictum. After an introductory section, it sets about defining *renxin* – the ‘Human Mind’ – and why it is described in the first line as being ‘exposed’. It then addresses the meaning of *daoxin* – the ‘Dao Mind’ – and its quality of ‘subtlety’. The fourth paragraph shows Daosheng’s interpretation of the terms ‘vitality’ (*jing* 精) and ‘focus’ (*yi* 一), with ‘vitality’ being associated by Daosheng with the ‘movement’ of the Human Mind and ‘focus’ with the ‘stillness’ of the Dao Mind. We are then shown how this pair can be equated with other dualisms, especially the Buddhist duality of *vipaśyanā* and *śamatha* (止 - meditative ‘cessation’). Finally, the text discusses how, by correctly understanding the connections between these pairs and by applying this understanding to the cultivation of mental discipline (arguably associated here with observance of Buddhist precepts), one can realise both the principle of the ‘Mean’ (realising the Mean is roughly what is meant by the words *yun zhi jue zhong* in the Sixteen-Word Dictum), and the Buddhist principle of the non-duality or union of the two truths.

Daosheng’s interpretation of the Sixteen-Word Dictum was unorthodox. His statement that the core tenet of the Confucian teachings is the ‘elucidation of *xingqing*’ (*ming xingqing* 明性情) reflects this point. *Xingqing* (or ‘innate nature and sentiment’) theory was both a prominent element in late imperial Confucian writings and the subject of considerable

hardly be overemphasised. It was inseparable from the orthodox tradition of the way as understood by the Tao-hsüeh school.’ See ‘Genealogy of the Way: Representing the Confucian Tradition in Neo-Confucian Anthologies.’ (PhD dissertation, University of Chicago, 1988), pg. 46. Wilson has translated the ‘Sixteen-Word Dictum’ as follows: ‘The human mind is precarious, the mind of Tao is barely perceptible. Be discerning and single-minded. Hold fast to the mean’ (Wilson, *Genealogy of the Way: The Construction and Uses of the Confucian Tradition in Late Imperial China* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1995), pg. 86). The translation I have provided is different, not because I disagree with Wilson’s translation, but because I argue that Daosheng’s interpretation of the Dictum is not conventional.
attention in Buddhist writings in the late Ming / early Qing. In Buddhist writing, *xingqing* theory was often contrasted with the older and more established convention of *xinxing*, or ‘mind and innate nature’ theory, which emphasised the capacity of the stillness or mirror-like quality of the mind to reflect the purity of innate nature, while *qing* – sentiment or mental ‘movement’ – was often depicted as disrupting mental calm. However, monastic *xingqing* theorists from the late Ming / early Qing took a less negative stance on the status of *qing* than their predecessors had done. We can argue that by emphasising *xingqing* and not mentioning *xinxing*, Daosheng’s ‘Disquisition on bringing together Confucianism and Buddhism’ opened a space for finding common ground between neo-Confucian thought and Buddhist thought on mental cultivation (even though the two traditions had often been contrasted with each other due to the former’s emphasis on moral action and the latter’s emphasis on the calming of sentiments and the cultivation of mental stillness).

I would contend that Daosheng’s ‘Disquisition’ can be connected with his ideas about the spiritual and moral benefits that can be derived both from ‘following innate nature’ in order to ‘return to the will of heaven’ (something that can arguably be linked to ‘voicing’ emotions in poetry) and from ‘opposing sentiments in order to return to innate nature’ (something that can arguably be linked to ‘constraining’ emotions in poetry). The balancing of voicing and constraining can militate against excessive indulgence in either stillness or movement, and by doing so it can lead to the realisation of the Mean and the unity of the two truths. The foundation of this syncretism is threefold: the congruity between stillness and movement; the congruity between the pairings in the Confucian ‘Sixteen-Word Dictum’ (the ‘focus’ of the subtle Dao Mind and the ‘vitality’ of the exposed Human Mind’); and the congruity between two types of Buddhist mental cultivation, namely *vipaśyanā* and *śamatha*. The links between these different elements are shown in tabular form below.67

---

66 Discussions on *xingqing* became relatively common in Buddhist writings during the late Ming / early Qing. In some cases, *xingqing* was associated with a more positive affirmation of (or at least a more ambivalent position towards) ‘*qing*’ (sentiment), something that Buddhists normally regarded as being ‘defiled.’ Zibo Zhenke and Ouyi Zhixu – who were discussed in the background and doctrine section of this thesis – at times affirmed the religious value of *qing*. Daosheng was strongly focused on *qing*, and was one of the most prolific users of the term; it appears over 70 times in his *Complete Records*. The only other author of Daosheng’s era to come close to this number was Shengke Deyu (聖可徳玉 1628-1701), who flourished shortly after Daosheng, and who mentions *qing* a large number of times in his *Poring Over the Words of the Treasure Forest of the Chan Teachings* (*Chanlin baoshun shunzhu* 《禪林寶訓順硃》 (CBETA X64 no. 1265)).

67 Some of my translations of terms differ from common renderings, because I argue that Daosheng’s approach was unorthodox, and I seek to differentiate Daosheng’s use/understanding of well-known terms from conventional or orthodox Confucian understandings.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Aspect</th>
<th>Stillness (yin/kun#)</th>
<th>Activity (yang/qian*)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Confucian psychology</strong>&lt;br&gt;(Sixteen-Word Dictum.)</td>
<td>Dao Mind (daoxin 道心)</td>
<td>Human Mind (renxin 人心)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Buddhist division of truth</strong></td>
<td>Supramundane (‘genuine’)&lt;br&gt;Truth (zhendi 真諦)</td>
<td>Mundane (‘commonplace’)&lt;br&gt;Truth (sudi 俗諦)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Quality</strong>&lt;br&gt;(Sixteen-Word Dictum.)</td>
<td>Subtle (wei 微) – defined as ‘latent and abstruse’ (yinwei youmi 隱微幽密)</td>
<td>Exposed (wei 危) – defined as ‘evident and [phenomenally] manifest’ (xianjian zhaozhu 顯見照著)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Mental Cultivation</strong>&lt;br&gt;(Sixteen-Word Dictum)</td>
<td>Focus (yi 一) – associated with ‘Restraining oneself through ritual’ (yue wo yi li 約我以禮)</td>
<td>Vitality (jing 精) – associated with ‘Expanding oneself through literature’ (bo wo yi wen 博我以文)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Buddhist Cultivation</strong></td>
<td>Zhi (‘cessation.’ The cessation of delusional mental activity that arises from meditation upon a unitary object, often translated as ‘calm abiding.’)</td>
<td>Guan (‘contemplation’ Manifest wisdom and discrimination that arises from meditative contemplation. Also translated as: ‘analysis,’ ‘clear contemplation.’)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Moral Action</strong></td>
<td>Constraining (jie 節)</td>
<td>Voicing (xuan 宣)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The links between each of these dualisms can be summarised as follows: the Dao Mind is the mind or mindset marked by intuitive insight into the Dao, that is, into the noumenal and transcendental principles of the cosmos (corresponding with ‘supramundane truth’). As the object of this ‘mind’ is the ‘noumenal’ Dao rather than phenomenal data, it cannot and does
not operate by means of perceptual discrimination or intellectual knowledge. As a result, its operation appears subtle, both in the sense of being profound and of being imperceptible. (‘Profound’ and ‘imperceptible’ are both possible translations of *wei* 微). For this reason, the Dao Mind is associated with the stillness or cessation of phenomenal mentation (or the cessation of sentimental activity). According to Daosheng’s logic, the subtlety of the Dao Mind can be linked to the state of mental imperturbability that can be achieved by bringing the sentimental mind to cessation by ‘focusing’ or concentrating on a ‘single’ (*yi* 一) object; in Chan theories this mental state derives from meditative concentration (*samādhi*) and introspection into innate nature.

In contrast to this stillness is the concept of the movement, activity, or ‘motion’ (*dong* 動) of the Human Mind (*renxin*). The Human Mind is ‘exposed’, or manifest and observable, and is associated with mental activity or ‘vitality’, examples of which would include the contemplation of phenomenal objects and emotional responses to stimuli (*ganying* 感應). By responding to phenomena in a normal manner, the movement – and the emotion – of the Human Mind is not opposed to mundane truth. When the Human Mind observes mundane truth (which can be seen as denoting the prescriptions of Confucian moral rectitude), it achieves a state of harmony (*和*).

Before moving to a further explication of Daosheng’s ideas of the Human Mind and the Dao Mind, I will clarify the definitions of some terms. The character *wei* (危), which I have translated as ‘exposed,’ was often used by Buddhist writers to refer to the unsettled nature of ‘active’ mental states such as uncontrolled emotions or intense desire. However, Daosheng’s use of the word *wei* in the ‘Disquisition on bringing together Confucianism and Buddhism’ arguably primarily denotes the manifest and observable nature of phenomenal mental activity, that is, the operations of the Human Mind (in contradistinction to the ‘unseen and unheard’ [budubuwen 不睹不聞] nature of the subtle Dao Mind). Daosheng states this

---

68 In Chinese Buddhist texts, the character often appears as part of a compound with ‘*xian*’ (險 ‘dangerous’), to emphasise the parlous or insalubrious qualities of *samsāra*. See, for instance, the expression ‘the three evil realms are extremely parlous’ 三惡趣極危險 (in *Abhidharmamahāvibhāṣā-sūtra* 阿毘達磨大毘婆沙論, fascicle 125: (CBETA, T27, no. 1545, p. 653, c15)). Other examples of this use of ‘*xian*’ can be found in *Mahāprajñāpāramitā-sūtra* (Daborechuloumiduo jing) 《大般若波羅蜜多經》, fascicle 568: ‘Life and death are dangerous and difficult’ 生死險難 (CBETA, T07, no. 220, p. 933, a8), and in the *Bddhāvatajsaka-mahāvaipulya-sūtra* (Dafangguang Fo huayan jing) 《大方廣佛華嚴経》, fascicle 24: ‘to enter onto the great risky path of life and death’ 入於生死大險道中 (CBETA, T09, no. 278, p. 549u, c8).

69 See, for instance, Daosheng’s ‘Concise Records on the Five Platforms,’ ‘*Wu tai ji lüe*五臺紀略 contained in fascicle 31 of his *Complete Records* which features the passage: ‘The point from which the Dao is projected is
more clearly in another text: ‘The exposed is the manifest and observable Human Mind; it is the traces (ji 几) of what has already arisen and already taken form’ 危者即顯見昭著之人心，為己發、己形之幾也.70 ‘The exposed’ refers to the mental movements that have developed from latent or subtle traces of thought, which have taken shape in the more coarse form of phenomenal activity. I suggest that the translation exposed captures these connotations of perceptibility, while also retaining the sense of a state of vulnerability to the ‘dangers’ of moral transgression (wei 危 in the sense of being ‘precarious’).

Movement and Stillness, Jing and Yi, Contemplation and Cessation

The second dualism in Daosheng’s disquisition is that of jing (‘vitality’) and yi (‘focus’), a dualism that is given special emphasis in the ‘Sixteen-Word Dictum.’ In orthodox Chinese exegesis the meanings of these two characters are not always strictly separated. Daosheng, however, deploys the two terms in such a way that they correspond to his dualism of the moving Human Mind, and the still Dao Mind. Most importantly, vitality and focus are linked with the Tiantai pairing of contemplation (觀 vipaśyanā, manifest wisdom or meditative contemplation) – which denotes meditative practices for cultivating insight and wisdom – and ‘cessation’ (止 śamatha, cessation of delusional mental activity, often translated as ‘calm abiding’) – which denotes meditative practices for cultivating concentration, often by focusing upon a single (yi 一) point (such as the breath). In light of this, I have rendered jing as ‘vitality’ and yi as ‘focus’. My translations differ from conventional interpretations of jing

70 ‘Discourse on the Meeting of the Core Doctrines of the Three Masters,’ Complete Records, fascicle 19: (CBETA, J34, no. B311, p. 780, a3-4). In Daosheng’s thought, the realm of the ‘unseen and unheard’ is to be equated with the state of ‘solitude’ involved in Confucius’ tenet of being conscientious when one is alone shen du 慎獨. For Daosheng, ‘conscientiousness when one is alone’ means that one becomes aware of defilements and proceeds to counter them before they can be seen or heard.

not in the seen or the heard, but rather in the unseen and the unheard’ ‘道之發端,不在睹聞而在不睹不聞’(CBETA, J34, no. B311, p. 699, b18-19). Daosheng describes (ji 几) as the initial ‘subtlety (wei 微) of movement’ 几者動之微也 (‘Public Lecture on Mount Ling,’ Complete Records, fascicle 33: (CBETA, J34, no. B311, p. 789, c19-20)); ‘Subtlety is the trace of what is manifestly observable’ (微者顯之幾) ‘Concise Record of the Five Platforms,’ fascicle 31: (CBETA, J34, no. B311, p. 780, a5-6)). This understanding of ji is not dissimilar to that presented in the interpretation of this character in the Book of Changes which states: ‘‘Traces’ (ji) denotes the subtlety of activity and the first manifestations of the auspicious…’ 几者，動之微，吉之先見者，while the Sui/Tang Confucian Kong Yingda (孔穎達 574-648) stated in his commentary to the Book of Changes that ‘Traces’ (ji) are ‘subtlety’ (wei), the subtlety that is already moving. ‘Movement’ means movement of the mind, and the movement of affairs. At the time of initial movement, its principle (li 理) is yet to be clearly observable and is but subtle. ’幾，微也，是已動之微。動，謂心動、事動，初動之時，其理未著，唯纖微而已。A full discussion on ji and its meaning in Kong’s commentary, as well as its meaning in the Book of Changes, can be found in Pan Zhongwei (潘忠偉) ‘Cong ‘Zhouyi zhengyi’ kan guiwu, chongyou, duhua san shuo zhi ronghe shilun Kong Yin’gda xuepai yu xuanxue de guanxi wenti’〈從《周易正義》看貴無、崇有、獨化三說之融合—試論孔穎達學派與玄學的關係問題〉 (Zhexue yanjiu 《哲學研究》. Vol. 3, 2007, pgs. 28–35. (Kong’s quote is provided and discussed on pgs. 34-35.)
and *wei* in the ‘Sixteen-Word Dictum’ because, I argue, my renderings reflect Daosheng’s pairing of *jing* and *yi* with movement and stillness, as well as with the states of being exposed and being subtle. These states are linked with modes of moral, social and personal cultivation. As Daosheng states: ‘‘Expanding oneself through literature’ – this is the capacity that the exposed Human Mind has for vitality. ‘Restraining oneself through ritual’ – this is the capacity that the subtle Dao Mind has for focus’ 博我以文，此人心惟危之能精也。約我以禮，此道心惟微之能一也.71 Here Daosheng associates the exposed Human Mind with literature, and associates the subtle Dao Mind with ritual/the rites. We can argue that this is similar to the connection that Daosheng and Fang drew between poetry as an expression of voicing and words, and ritual as an expression of constraining and wordlessness.

*Vitality (Jing) and Focus (Yi) and the Theory of the ‘Dual Cultivation of Cessation and Contemplation’*

Daosheng suggests that attaining harmony between the transition from movement to stillness (through constraining) on the one hand, and the transition from stillness to movement (through voicing) on the other, could bring to fruition both the Confucian concept of abiding in the Mean and the Buddhist concept of the unity of the two truths. At the centre of this belief, as we have seen, was Daosheng’s articulation of two ideas: the ‘cessation of vitality,’ and the ‘contemplation of focus.’

We can argue that what Daosheng essentially meant by cessation of vitality and contemplation of focus was that being emotional and being tranquil need not be mutually exclusive. He suggests that the animating principle (*ji* 機) of movement will ‘counter’ (duizhi 對治) the animating principle of stillness when the latter becomes excessively dominant; this will ensure that movement of the mind does not morph into defiled emotions (excessive activity) and the stillness of the mind does not morph into mental atrophy (excessive passivity). In this way, one can stay faithful to the doctrine of the Mean and can balance the voicing of pent up emotions with the constraining of deleterious ones.

The ‘contemplation (*guan*) of focus (*yi*)’ (一之觀) and the ‘cessation (*zhi*) of vitality (*jing*)’ (精之止) are processes in which the animating principle of movement counters excessive

71 ‘Disquisition on bringing together Confucianism and Buddhism,’ *Complete Records*, fascicle 26: (CBETA, J34, no. B311, p. 744, a27-28).
stillness (yi focus) by means of observation (guan), and the animating principle of stillness counters excessive movement (jing vitality) by means of cessation (zhi). We can argue that ‘the unity of jing and yi, cessation and contemplation’ (jingyi zhi guan zhi bu-er 精一止觀之不二) stood at the centre of Daosheng’s syncretism between the Mean of the Confucian ‘Sixteen-Word Dictum’ and the Buddhist doctrine of the union of the two truths.

One source for Daosheng’s ideas on these issues is Zhu Xi’s concepts of ‘stillness within movement’ (dong zhong zhi jing 動中之靜) and ‘movement within stillness’ (jing zhong zhi zhong 靜中之動), which are outlined in Zhu’s third ‘Letter in Reply to Zhang Yinfu.’73 However, a more important source was Hanshan Deqing, who had himself proposed a link between the ‘unity of movement and stillness’ (動靜不二) and the ‘unity of contemplation and cessation’ (止觀不二), arguing that the ‘contemplation of cessation’ and ‘the cessation of contemplation’ should alternate with each other.74 Hanshan’s idea of the ‘dual cultivation of cessation and contemplation’ (zhiguan shuang xiu 止觀雙修) seems very similar to the ‘blending of cessation and contemplation’ (zhiguan shuangrong 止觀雙融) referred to in Daosheng’s ‘Disquisition’. Hanshan’s ideas can be found in his Direct Explication of the Mahāyāna Awakening of Faith (Dacheng Qixinlun zhijie 《大乘起信論直解》):

Thinking solely about the non-arising of the self-nature (svabhāva) of all dharmas is ‘cessation’ (śamatha). Contemplating the fact that good and evil causes and conditions and karmic fruits are not destroyed and then broadly cultivating goodness and bringing salvation to sentient beings is ‘contemplation of cessation.’ Thinking solely about causes, conditions and karmic retribution is ‘contemplation’ (vipaśyanā). Reflecting on the fact that innate nature is unattainable is ‘cessation of contemplation’. By means of this, one resides in sūnyatā but does not abandon the ten thousand forms; one engages with ‘existence’ and yet the universal innate nature is clear. This is the ‘dual cultivation of cessation and contemplation’…

72 ‘Disquisition on bringing together Confucianism and Buddhism’ Complete Records, fascicle 26: (CBETA, J34, no. B311, p. 744, a19).
73 See Wang Maohong (王懋竑, 1668-1708) (compiler/ed.), Chronological Biography of Master Zhu of the Song (Song Zhuzi nianpu 《宋朱子年譜》) (Taipei: Taiwan zhangxu yinshu guan, 1982), fascicle 1, pgs. 38-40.
74 See Hanshan, “動靜不二，平等安心，即末後太沖莫勝，止觀不二也. When there is the non-duality of movement and stillness there is equality and equanimity; it is the final unsurpassable great emptiness, the non-duality of zhi and guan’, ‘Responding to Emperors and Kings,’ Ying di wang 應帝王. Annotated Commentary on the Inner Chapters of the Zhuangzi (Zhuangzi neipian zhu 《莊子內篇註》, fascicle 4: (CBETA, L153, no. 1636, p. 451, a6-10).
75 In the ‘Responding to Emperors and Kings’ section of his Annotated Commentary on the Inner Chapters of the Zhuangzi, Hanshan also calls this the ‘dual operation of cessation and contemplation’ 止觀雙運 (CBETA, L153, no. 1636, p. 451, a4).
We can argue that Daosheng’s concept of cessation of vitality fuses Hanshan’s idea of cessation of contemplation with Zhu Xi’s notion of stillness within movement, while Daosheng’s concept of contemplation of focus fuses Hanshan’s idea of contemplation of cessation and Zhu Xi’s idea of movement within stillness. Daosheng drew from Hanshan the idea that these forms of mental cultivation were transformative processes. He also brought together Zhu Xi’s concept of the balance between movement and stillness as an expression of the Doctrine of the Mean (articulated in the values of equilibrium and harmony) and Hanshan’s understanding of this union as a manifestation of the unity of the two truths.

However, although Daosheng’s concepts of cessation of vitality and contemplation of focus drew on the ideas of Zhu Xi and Hanshan, they had their own distinctive features. Zhu Xi described stillness within movement as the calming of the mind that occurs during ‘investigation’ (cha 察), an activity that Buddhists might see as involving phenomenal thought. In Daosheng’s formulation, the cessation of vitality is undertaken when an emotional response shifts from being appropriate or morally right to being inappropriate or excessive (as in the case of ordinary people whose emotional expressions are uncontrolled), making it necessary for that response to be constrained. In such a case, the ‘animating principle of stillness’ (jingji 靜機) that is associated with cessation (or calm abiding) exerts itself and acts as a counteragent to the animating principle of movement, turning the Human Mind back towards the Dao Mind and reuniting the phenomenal mind and transcendental reality, thereby merging mundane truth and supramundane truth. While being responsive to stimuli (ganying 感應), one is at the same time able to remain in a deeper state of inner tranquillity (ji 寂).

Parallel to the cessation of vitality is the idea of the contemplation of focus. This concept describes the ideal state of the mind in relative stillness; it is similar to Zhu Xi’s description of the state in which ‘thoughts are yet to germinate, yet one’s awareness is not dull’ (思慮未萌，而知覺不昧). In Daosheng’s paradigm, when the mind shifts from being in equilibrium through stillness to the more pernicious state of atrophy (as in the case of the detached ascetic unable to generate feelings of compassion), contemplation is activated as the

76 Direct Explication of the Mahāyāna Awakening of Faith, fascicle 2: (CBETA, X45, no. 766, p. 514, b19-c3 // Z 1:72, p. 107, b18-c8 // R72, p. 213, b18-p. 214, a8).
77 Wang (comp./ed.), Chronological Biography of Master Zhu, fascicle 1, pg. 40
animating principle of mental invigoration, rescuing the Dao Mind from excessive stillness. When this is done, phenomenal thought can arise without obstruction when appropriate, and supramundane truth, when fused with the Human Mind, can find expression in mundane truth.

We can suggest that this is perhaps what Daosheng had in mind when he invoked the ideas of constraining and voicing in his ‘Discourse on Poetry.’ Constraining would relate to the countering of defiled or excessive emotions by the cessation of contemplation and, crucially, by the constraints of poetic form. Voicing would relate to the countering of atrophy by the contemplation of cessation, shifting from stillness to the movement of the exposed Human Mind, crucially, through the poetic expression of the author’s intent (which amplifies the subtle Dao Mind). As Daosheng states in his ‘Discourse on the Meeting of the Core Doctrines of the Three Masters’ (a text that will be discussed in the next section below): “Heavenly Principle easily descends into atrophy. Only by giving it vitality can one attain equilibrium. The Human Mind easily descends into wantonness. Only by focusing it can one attain harmony.” This statement directly correlates with the ideas outlined in Daosheng’s ‘Disquisition on bringing together Confucianism and Buddhism’. Through constraining and voicing, the principles of the Mean can be adhered to, and one can avoid two extremes. On the one hand, one’s mind does not atrophy when it is still; one is in a state of balance or equilibrium and is not inclined towards stillness. On the other hand, one can respond to one’s times without emotional excessss. One can express one’s intent without evil thoughts, be ‘straightforward’ and realise the union of the two truths in the supreme expression of the Doctrine of the Mean.

‘Poetry can Express Indignation’ and the ‘Cessation of Vitality’ of the ‘Human Mind’

The ‘Harmony’ of the Human Mind’ and the Yuan Poetry of Qu Yuan

I have suggested that Daosheng’s ‘Disquisition on bringing Together Confucianism and Buddhism’ implies links between his syncretic xingqing theory (and the xingqing theory of Fang Yizhi) and his ideas about poetry. These connections are more directly expressed in one of Daosheng’s other texts, the ‘Discourse on the Meeting of the Core Doctrines of the Three Masters’ (‘San zi huizong lun’ 《三子會宗論》. This text contains many expressions that are

either found in the Daosheng texts discussed above or which strongly resonate with other writing by Daosheng.

Zhuangzi, ‘the son of an unfavoured concubine’, who [exemplified the principle that] “The Dao Mind is Subtle”, was a disciple of heaven. He put heaven first but did not go against his humanity. Quzi (Qu Yuan), ‘a minister without supporters,’ who [exemplified the principle that] “The Human Mind is Exposed”, was a disciple of humanity. He put humanity first, yet was still able to obey heaven...

Because of Zhuangzi’s ‘vitality (jing) in equilbrium (zhong)’ he stood firm and was impartial; if there was any partiality, it would [still] remain in equilibrium. It is like [the statement of Mencius that]: ‘Zimo grasps the centre, but leaves no room for the exigency of circumstance’. …Because of Quzi’s ‘focusing (yi) within harmony (he)’ there was candour but not abandonment. When there is abandonment (‘flow’ liu), one will nevertheless be submerged in ‘harmony.’ It is like Gaozi’s [stance]; if one follows sentiment, one loses innate nature. 

In Daosheng’s depiction, Zhuangzi exemplifies the subtle nature of the Dao Mind and Qu Yuan exemplifies the exposed nature of the Human Mind (Daosheng also discusses Mengzi in this text). Both figures were regarded as being distinguished for their shared dedication to principle and for not enjoying official favour in an age of political disorder. Comparisons between them were common in Ming loyalist literature.

---

79. A minister without supporters and the son of an unfavoured concubine’ guchen niezi 孤臣孽子 is a common literary expression for the supporters of doomed dynasties. It was used extensively in the discourse of the Ming-Qing transition era.
80. This quote comes from book 7A of Mengzi. (Jin xin – shang, 《盡心》(上)). My translation of this quote differs from that of Bryan Van Norden on pg. 178 of Mengzi:with selections from traditional commentaries (Indianapolis: Hackett Publishing House, 2008) I have have changed it slightly to reflect my view that Daosheng’s interpretation of the passage differed from the conventional reading.
81. Gaozi was well known for his debates with Mengzi, and his name is in the title of two books in the Mengzi. Gaozi famously held that human nature is neither good or bad, and that people can change in either direction (i.e. towards goodness or evil), just as water moves east when directed so by a channel, or west when directed so. For a translation of the Gaozi chapters of Mengzi, see Van Norden, Mengzi, pgs.:143-170; the passage which discusses the analogy of the movement of water can be found on page 144. (For the Chinese original see Zhao Qi 趙岐, Sun Shi (孫奭) (comp.), Li Xueqin 李學勤 (ed.) Mengzi with Annotations and Subcommentaries, Mengzi zhushu (xia) 《孟子注疏》(下) (Taipei: Taiwan guji chubanshe, 2001), pg. 347.
82. ‘Discourse on the Meeting of the Core Doctrines of the Three Masters,’ Complete Records, fascicle 19, (CBETA, J34, no. B311, p. 698, c4-6; p. 699, b21-25).
83. Daosheng’s ‘Three Masters’ is discussed in detail in Hsieh’s ‘Ming yimin de ‘Zhuangzi dingwei, pgs. 159-194. The passage I have translated is addressed on pgs. 161-166.
84. An early text which briefly discusses Zhuangzi and Qu Yuan together is ‘Preface to ‘Sending off Meng Dongye’ (Song Meng Dongye xu) by Han Yu (韓愈 768-824). This text addressed their
Daosheng depicts Zhuangzi as practicing ‘vitality within equilibrium’, while Qu Yuan is held to have achieved ‘focus within harmony’. Zhuangzi’s identification with the Dao Mind fits his status as a Daoist thinker, while Qu Yuan’s status as an exemplar of the Human Mind can be assumed to be related to his reputation as a poet known for ‘voicing’ intense emotions by ‘crying aloud to the heavens’.86

Daosheng’s praise for Qu Yuan undoubtedly reflects Qu Yuan’s status as model poet for Ming loyalists, something I have mentioned earlier in this thesis. Daosheng himself stated that Qu was distinguished for his ‘skill in using the word ‘indignation’ (屈原善「怨」字), identifying him as one of the great historical examplars of the practice of voicing dissatisfaction with political injustice. However, Daosheng’s depiction of Qu Yuan arguably goes beyond tacitly affirming that it was permissible for loyalists to express ‘indignation’ at events surrounding the fall of the Ming and praising Qu Yuan for his ‘straightforwardness’. Daosheng praises Qu Yuan’s poetry for having ‘candour but not abandonment.’ Qu Yuan was a model of the perfection of the Human Mind because he balanced giving free rein to emotions with the constraining of emotional excesses. In other words, he was both direct and upright. Daosheng stated elsewhere that Qu Yuan’s poetry demonstrated ‘self-directed indignation’.87 His overall appraisal was that ‘Qu Yuan was indignant but not resentful’ (Quzi yuan er bu yuan 屈子怨而不怨).88

Perfecting ‘Harmony’ by Combining the Moral Power of Indignation and Poetry

Daosheng’s praise for the ‘indignation without resentment’ that was displayed by Qu Yuan links directly with ideas about indigation expressed by Daosheng in ‘The Chapter on Repaying Injury with Kindness’ and elsewhere, and with ideas on poetry expressed in the ‘Discourse on Poetry.’ We can argue that because expressing indignation and writing poetry both emphasise the act of voicing emotions, they exemplify the Human Mind. The bringing together of indignation and poetry helps one to perfect the harmony of the Human Mind. On this count we may note the middle section of Daosheng’s ‘Discourse on Poetry’, a passage...
which discusses the moral and spiritual power of indignation and poetry together. In this section of the ‘Discourse on Poetry’, which is both a commentary on two hexagrams in the *Book of Changes* and an explication of the relationship between poetry and ‘wind’, Daosheng argues as follows:

**Thunder-Wind – Duration (feng-lei heng 雷風恒). Wind-Thunder – Increase (lei-feng yi 風雷益).** Things which have form decay, but sounds and ethers (*qi* 氣) do not decay. The power of the wind is of superlative magnitude; it is adept at getting in everywhere and it changes people. Movement and stillness are caused by the wind, through which things are changed. The “winds” of the teachings and the “winds” of custom get their names from this. As a result, we say that the force of the wind and sounds and ethers transmit the light of the mind. Minds cannot be seen by minds; it is through analogies that they are made manifest. For this reason, the *Book of Poetry* begins with the ‘Airs’ [literally the ‘Winds’]. And so it is said: “The voice of the mind gives rise to poetry and is the point of origin for ceremonies [li, that is, the ‘rites’] and music.” From the chanting of the *zhuo* music of King Wu of Zhou (yongzhuo 詠勺) through to “Meeting Together when One is Old”, one can know the intent of the mind, speak reasonably and spontaneously and never be detached from a state of miraculous harmony.

Poetry can inspire; it can make observations; it can bring people together; and it can express indignation. This is the thread that connects what is distant and what is near at hand, and what is singular and what is manifold. Where there is inspiration, there is observation; where there is observation, people are brought together; where people are brought together, there is indignation. Some might ask, “How can indignation be eliminated?” I say: do not worry. Indignation cannot but become inspiration – just as winter cannot but become spring, just as terminal *zhen* 貞 (renunciation) gives rise to initial *yuan* 元 (germination), and just as lofty *kang* 亢 lies within submerged *qian* 潛. Those who speak out commit no crime, and those who listen are admonished by it. When one expresses one’s pent-up distress, even though it is ‘indignation’ it is not ‘resentment’. When one connects with the way of *zhen-yuan* (renunciation-germination) and *kang-qian* (loftiness-submergence) and knows this, then outrage (*nu* 怒) and indignation (*yuan* 怨) arrive at equilibrium and harmony. The four seasons move therein; the six dragons ride thereon.

雷風恒、風雷益，有形者壞，而聲氣不壞，其明徵也。風力最大，隨處善入以轉 人。動靜歸風，有轉之者，風教風俗以是稱焉；故曰風力聲氣兼傳心光。心不見，心以寓而顯。故詩以風始，是曰心聲興詩，為禮樂之端，自詠勺以至白首相見、喻志衝口，妙協未嘗離也…

可以興、可以觀、可以群、可以怨也。是遠近、一多之貫也。惟興乃觀、惟觀乃群、惟群乃怨。或謂怨則何以消之？予曰：勿憂也！怨不得已而興，猶冬不得已而春也。貞之起元也，亢之于潛也。言者無罪，聞者以戒。據其鬱
This passage builds on the idea presented in the first section of the ‘Discourse on Poetry’ that poetry has special power because it represents the coming together of holding fast (chi) and responding appropriately to the times (shi). Here Daosheng discusses ‘sounds’ (sheng 聲) and ‘ethers’ (qi 氣). When he states that ‘sounds’ and ‘ethers’ cannot decay as physical matter does, he is perhaps referring to poetry’s capacity to be passed down through the ages and to become ‘immortalised’; when he states that ‘wind’ is adept at getting in everywhere, he is arguably implying that beautiful ‘sounds’ which convey morally wholesome ‘ethers’ are able to reach people, to touch them emotionally and transform them.

Daosheng appears to link ‘ether’ (qi) with ‘wind’ (feng 風). The two are connected in terms of their identity as natural forces: a ‘wind’ is ‘moving ether’. The word feng, moreover, refers to things other than the ‘wind’. It designates the orthodox (moral) teachings of the sages (the ‘winds’ of the teachings) and prevailing mores (the ‘winds’ of custom). It is also the first of the six ‘forms’ (yi 義) of poetic writing outlined in the ‘Great Preface’ to the Book of Poetry, and is sometimes translated into English as ‘Airs’. Feng denotes poetry’s capacity to express a moral appraisal or critique of customs or, in Daosheng’s words, to ‘follow and transform customs’. In this sense, just as the presence or absence of wind determines the ‘movement and stillness’ of things such as trees, and the presence or absence of moving ether in the throat

---


90 See Fang’s ‘Sounds and Ethers do not Decay – A Disquisition’ (‘Sheng qi bu huai shuo’) (聲氣不壞說), which appears in the Suoiyì （所以） chapter of his Uniting the Opposites (Dongxi jun) 《東西均》 (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, Rpt. 1962), pgs. 110-111! The title of this text can be translated more literally as Uniting East and West. I have used Qiong Zhang’s translation because, as he notes, this ‘prevent[s] any geographical or cultural connotations associated with these two terms [i.e. East and West].’ See Qiong Zhang, Making the New World Their Own: Chinese Encounters with Jesuit Science in the Age of Discovery (Leiden: Brill, 2015), pg. 181. These concepts, and their meaning in Daosheng’s poetics, are discussed in Hsieh Ming-Yang’s ‘Ming yimin Juelang Daosheng yu Fang Yizhi’. However, Hsieh’s study primarily focuses on Fang and does not extensively consult Daosheng’s Complete Records, so I have only addressed his analysis briefly.

91 See Liao Chao-heng, Zhong-bian shi chan, pgs. 57-58.

92 This line clearly draws from the line in the ‘Great Preface’ which reads: ‘The term ‘airs’ (feng ‘Wind’) means ‘customs’ (feng) and ‘the teachings.’ ‘Wind’ serves to move people and the teachings serve to transform them’ 風，風也，教也，風以動之，教以化之 (see Mao Heng (毛亨), Kong Yingda (孔穎達), Zheng Xuan (鄭玄), (Li Xueqin (李學勤) (ed.)), Correct Meaning of the Mao version of the Book of Poetry: Airs (First Section) (Maoshi Zhengyi, Feng (shang)) 《毛詩正義》(風 (上)), Taipei: Taihei guji chuban youxian gongsī, 2001), fascicle 1, pg. 6).
determines whether or not there is voice, \(^93\) feng should guide the ‘constraining’ and ‘voicing’ of the sounds of a poem.

This section of the ‘Discourse on Poetry’ develops Daosheng’s points made earlier in the text: that the qualities of ‘holding fast’ and ‘adherence to the times’ reveal the mind or intent of the author and also help poetry to transform others morally. However, Daosheng draws particular attention to the question of the poetry of indignation and affirms its moral value, asserting that when voicing heartfelt indignation, ‘he who speaks commits no crime, and he who hears it is admonished by it.’\(^94\) While this line is similar to a line that appears in Daosheng’s ‘Repaying Injury’, it is in fact a quote from the ‘Great Preface,’ and it originally refers to the moral rightness and impact of poetry as feng. Daosheng describes indignation and anger as being ‘thunder-like’,\(^95\) and I would argue that the nexus of thunder, poetic indignation and moral and spiritual renewal constitute an important set of linked concepts in Daosheng’s thought. In the ‘Discourse on Poetry’ it is implied that the most powerful expression of the union of sound and ethers in poetry can be symbolized by the union of feng (‘wind’) and thunder (lei). These are the two elements that combine to form the hexagrams ‘Thunder-Wind’ (leifeng) and ‘Wind-Thunder’ (fenglei).

_Awakening ‘Thunder’ Emerging from the ‘Winter Air’ – Fenglei (Heng)_

I would argue that the two hexagrams that are referred to in Daosheng’s ‘Discourse on Poetry’ leifeng (heng) – Thunder-Wind (‘Duration’ or ‘enduring’) – and fenglei (yi) – Wind-Thunder (‘Increase’ or ‘beneficial’)\(^96\) – symbolise or explain the moral power of the poetry of indignation in Daosheng’s thought. This is because these two hexagrams played a pivotal role in transforming ‘winter’ into ‘spring’, which symbolised the process of a ‘dark’ age being replaced by the dawn of an enlightened age. This argument has been made by Hsieh Ming-

---

\(^{93}\) The notion that ‘movement’ and ‘stillness’ stem from feng also appears to invoke a passage from Zhuangzi’s ‘Adjustment of Controversies’ – which states that the impetus for the wind blowing or not blowing is the ‘sound of heaven. For an English translation of the relevant passage, see Burton Watson, The Complete Works of Zhuangzi (New York: Columbia University Press, 2013) pg. 7-8 – Watson’s translation of the title of this chapter is ‘Discussion on Making All Things Equal.’

\(^{94}\) Correct Meaning of the Mao version of the Book of Poetry, fascicle 1, pg. 30.

\(^{95}\) See the examples quoted in ‘Ming yimin Juelang Daosheng yu Fang Yizhi,’ pgs. 445-447.

\(^{96}\) ‘Increase’ is Baynes’ English rendering of Wilhelm’s translation of the term in the Book of Changes; Baynes/Wilhelm also translate yi as ‘addition’ and ‘advantage’. See Richard Wilhelm, Cary F. Baynes, I Ching, or, Book of Changes (Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, Repr. 1989) pgs. 149-150. I would suggest that ‘Beneficial’ (or ‘to benefit’) captures some of the resonances that the word has for Daosheng.
Yang, and in discussing these hexagrams, I will draw upon Hsieh’s elaboration of them and on how they are used in Daosheng’s ‘Discourse on Poetry.’

In the leifeng hexagram, the yang trigram zhen (震) ☳, representing ‘Thunder’, is above the yin trigram xun (巽) ☴ representing ‘Wind’. Hsieh Ming-Yang states that this juxtaposition depicts friction in the movement of yin qi (ethers that are cold and moist) causing the bursting out of thunder (the yang force associated with light and warmth). The ‘image biography’ for the leifeng hexagram in the Book of Changes contains the following lines (in the Baynes/Wilhelm translation): ‘the seasons of the year follow a fixed law of change and transformation, hence can produce effects that endure…In that which gives things their duration, we can come to understand the nature of all beings in heaven and on earth.’ This thunder brings about the re-emergence of warmth-bearing yang after the dominance of deathly, cold-bearing yin, and the potential for all life and transformation re-emerges. Transformation becomes possible only when there is both yin and yang; only then can one create the 64 different hexagrams which represent all phenomena in their myriad forms. There is no potential for transformation if there are only yin lines.

For Daosheng, the first burst of thunder in winter marks the point where there is an initial insight into nature, and where the latent conditions for the appearance of the other three seasons first re-emerge, and with them the potential for transformation. It is a stage where, in a flash of insight, one can see the ‘ten thousand things [that are] yet to be born,’ and ‘enjoy the season of no winter and no summer’ 享無冬無夏之天. The literary and soteriological correlate of this burst of winter thunder, I would argue, is the crashing sound of indignation emanating from a powerful poem composed during an age of disorder.

Thunder’s Warmth Carried by the Wind – Leifeng (yi)

In the ‘winter’ stage, the forces of transformation are still only in latent form. For the initial emergence of yang energy to propel the turning of the seasons and the return of spring, another process has to occur. After the initial release of the yang vital energy during the stage of fenglei, in leifeng the wind cooperates with thunder: it shifts from bringing about or facilitating thunder to ‘carrying’ the sound of thunder, and with it the vital warm yang energy

---

98 Ibid, pgs. 446.
99 Baynes/Wilhelm, I Ching, pg. 127.
it releases into the ‘air’ across the land, giving life to and nurturing the ten thousand things. ‘Winter’ thus gives way to spring; and ‘terminal zhen (renunciation) gives rise to initial yuan (germination)’. A ‘dark’ time has come to an end, and the cyclic process of the change of the seasons has begun to turn.

‘Winter’ as a Crucible for Nurturing ‘Thunder’

We can now begin to examine the connections between ideas about winter, thunder, indignation, poetry, and moral and spiritual cultivation that are found in different parts of Daosheng’s writing, and how they relate to his soteriological thinking. The hexagram connections between thunder, winter and the return of yang in the depths of ‘dark’ times have been outlined above. There are good grounds for saying that Daosheng placed particular emphasis on the value of winter as a moment for spiritual cultivation, and that this can be linked with his ideas about indignation. Daosheng is quoted as having said that ‘winter’ is the most important of the four seasons. Citing Daosheng, Xing’ao Zhaoyuan (興翱趙巖), a disciple of Fang Yizhi, states: ‘Winter forges the [other] three seasons’ 冬煉三時.

This argument about winter forging the other seasons parallels the idea that the poetry of indignation – the poetry that, according to the ‘Great Preface’ to the Book of Poetry, is produced in an age of disorder – brings forth the poetry of inspiration, and arguably has greater moral and spiritual power than poems that express the sounds and ethers of other ‘times.’ Daosheng’s belief that the poetry of indignation is the most important form of poetry and that it correlates with the last of the four seasons (zhen 貞) is quite explicitly stated in the opening of ‘On Indignation’. It can be argued that just as the dense and cold airs of winter create conditions for powerful thunder storms that can awaken and invigorate, the horror of confronting unbearable circumstances and intolerable injustices can produce a powerful desire to restore righteousness. This in turn may foster deeply sincere and profoundly inspirational calls to abandon unrighteousness.

This idea that powerful yang is nurtured and developed by the crucible of winter was expressed in Daosheng’s yin-yang thought. In ‘On Indignation’ (Lun yuan 讨怨), Daosheng affirms the importance of the hexagram dilei (fu) (地雷 (復)) – Earth-Thunder (Return). This hexagram is associated with the Winter Solstice (the point in the annual cycle when yin

---

101 Other than his having composed a preface for Fang’s Records of the Ashes of Winter (Donghui lu) 《冬灰錄》, there is little reliable biographical information on the identity of this monk.

reaches its apogee and yang begins to re-emerge). The same text also connects the dilei hexagram with the thunderous power of ‘outrage’ or ‘animus’ (nu 怒). Dilei features a yin ‘earth’ trigram ☻ above a yang ‘thunder’ trigram ☢. It symbolises the vital warm life-force hiding beneath the earth, the state of hibernation. This hexagram has only one yang line, at the very bottom. In his ‘Discourse on Venerating Fire as the Cardinal Principle’, Daosheng draws attention to the importance of the yang line that lies between the two outer yin lines in the kan (坎) trigram ☸ (the trigram associated with the element water, which conventional Five Elements theory correlates with the north and with winter); the yang line, he says, is ‘like the dragon palace being beneath the sea and the divine dragon being submerged (qian) deep within the water – it is the state that is called ‘Yang is lying below and does not [yet] function’ 龍宮之在海藏、神龍之潛九淵；所謂「陽在下而勿用’.

Dilei and kan mark the point where the ‘lofty’ dragon – the yang force that was dominant in the warmer months – has ‘returned’ to the ‘submerged state’ qian, which can be paralleled with ‘terminal’ zhen (‘renunciation’) transforming into ‘initial’ yuan (‘germination’ or the ‘Primal Origin’). Hsieh Ming-Yang observes that ‘winter’s kan trigram is not morbid atrophy, but rather represents the yin wind which carries yang ethers during the three winter months of hai 亥, zi 子 and chou 丑. [This state continues] up until the yang ether emerges [and remains manifest] in the other nine months.’ Representing the middle of zi (the second winter month), dilei (fu) marks the pivotal moment when yin power has just reached its zenith during the ‘darkest’ and shortest day of the year, and yang power has re-emerged but ‘does not [yet] function’ – it marks the end and the beginning of the seasonal cycle. Cary Baynes and Richard Wilhelm, who translate ‘fu’as ‘Return,’ and thus see it as marking a turning point, note: ‘The idea of a turning point arises from the idea that after the dark [yin] lines have pushed all the light [yang] lines upward and out of the hexagram, another light line enters the hexagram from below.

See for example the following lines from ‘On Indignation’: ‘Just as the great Book of Changes takes dilei(fu) – Earth-Thunder (‘Return’) as the manifestation of the mind of heaven and earth, there is no form of ‘animus’ (nu) equal to thunder... The emperor comes forth from thunder. 如大易以地雷 (復)為見天地之心,怒莫若雷...帝出乎震. ‘On Indignation’ Complete Records, fascicle 33 (CBETA, J34, no. B311, p. 795, c13-15).

‘Discourse on Venerating Fire as the Cardinal Principle’ Complete Records, fascicle 19: (CBETA, J34, no. B311, p. 697, a1-2).

This is a point emphasised in some earlier Buddhist sources. The Yuanjuejing shu chao 《圓覺經略疏鈔》 of the Tang Huayan sect monk GuiFeng Zongmi (圭峰宗密 784-841) states: ‘Although the ten thousand things each have their own place of birth, if one goes back and analyzes exhaustively up to the very beginning, it is qian-yang (Heaven-yang) that is the root of Primordial Birth. As a result, qian (Heaven) here obtains the name yuan (Primal Origin), and so it is known that ‘yuan is pre-eminent with regard to goodness.’ 然萬物雖各有所生之處，展轉推窮至於最初，是「乾陽」為始生之本。故「乾」於此得名為「元」，即知：「元者，善之長也」 (fascicle 1: CBETA, X09, no. 248, p. 822, b1-2 // Z 1:15, p. 90, d10-11 // R15, p. 180, b10-11).

‘Ming yimin Juelang Daosheng yu Fang Yizhi,’ pg. 447.
The time of darkness is past. The winter solstice brings the victory of \([yang]\) light.\(^{107}\) This initial latent \(yang\) force has immeasurable power as it is the seed or source of all \(yang\) power, or all the \(yang\) lines in the 64 hexagrams.\(^{108}\) *Dilei (fu)* manifests the ‘mind of heaven and earth’ 天地之心, whose will brings into existence and transforms all phenomena. A site of awakening (when the ‘ten thousand things are yet to be born’ but their potential is manifest) and of ‘nurturing’ and ‘benefiting’ all life, it marks a meeting point of the powers of *leifeng* and *fenglei*, the powers that are emphasised in Daosheng’s ‘Discourse on Poetry’.

*From Winter Thunder to a Spring Dawn – ‘Harmonising with the ‘Will of Heaven’ in a Dark Age*

How does this idea that ‘winter’ prompts the return of ‘spring’ link with theories of moral and historical change? The answer lies in the fact that the warming ‘\(yang\)’ that re-emerges as a result of this process of seasonal transformation arguably has quite a specific referent; we can contend that it denotes *zhényang* (真陽) or ‘Genuine Yang’, which connotes the will of heaven. Politically, the ‘will of heaven’ refers above all to the concept of the heavenly mandate (tianmìng 天命), the notion that heaven passes a ‘mandate’ to rule the world to a person who is morally worthy (the ‘son of heaven’) and who will follow its ‘will’; heaven can also withdraw this mandate from a ruler who is tyrannical and who goes against its will.\(^ {109}\) The turning of history can be likened to the cyclic ‘seasonal’ shift between ‘dark’ times when heaven’s will is neglected and ‘enlightened’ times in which heaven’s will is followed. There are indications that Daosheng’s work implies that ‘indignation’ at injustice forms one part of the process of people gaining insight into heaven’s will (the heavenly mandate) and then abiding by that will by removing a ruler that has lost the mandate. As Daosheng states in his ‘Repaying Injury’ text: ‘In accordance with heaven their mandate was rescinded, which was the direct retribution that they deserved.’ 順天休命，方當得直.\(^ {110}\) The idea of directness that is invoked in this quote is the direct analogy of the directness that is expressed in righteous outrage and indignation. For Daosheng, ‘outrage’ (nu) in the pairing yuan-nu meant


\(^{108}\) Thunder shakes across 100 li with majestic force. All of the 64 hexagrams project – from thunder – the animating principle of ‘outrage’. This great *Book of Changes* is a repository of indignation and animus.’ 震驚百里摩蕩。八八六十四卦。皆從震發怒機。此大易又為一部怨怒之府 *On Indignation,* Complete Records, fascicle 33 (CBETA, J34, no. B311, p. 795, c14-15).


something like ‘animus’: it is an invigorating force that brings ‘benefit’ to the world by inspiring people to install a leader who is worthy. This was shown in antiquity by the sage king Yao selecting Shun (who was not his son) as heir to the throne, something Daosheng attributes to the force of outrage and indignation.\footnote{111}

These moral and political cycles were conceived of as intimately related to the movement and interchange between \textit{yin} and \textit{yang} elements in the cosmic cycle, with principles of earth, heaven, wind, water, fire, thunder and so on linking with states of harmony and disturbance in the human world. Daosheng’s statement in the ‘Discourse on Venerating Fire as the Cardinal Principle’ that \textit{zhényáng} was ‘the mind of heaven and earth’\footnote{112} parallels his statement in ‘On Indignation’ that the “great Book of Changes takes \textit{dilei(fu)} – Earth-Thunder (‘Return’) as the manifestation of the mind of heaven and earth 大易以地雷(復)為天地之心”. Indignation “is able to use the ‘ethers’ (\textit{qi}) of disquiet in heaven, earth, humans and things to protect the great harmony between the \textit{xìngqìng} of heaven and humanity 乃能以天地人物不平之氣, 保合天人性情之太和;\footnote{113} indignation thus marks the alignment of the yearnings of humankind with the ‘will of heaven’. ‘Thunderous’ indignation facilitates and usually comes before the restoration of order. Just as ‘indignation’ gives way to ‘inspiration’ in the poetic cycle of ‘inspiration, observation, bringing people together and indignation,’ winter facilitates the ‘return’ of spring and terminal \textit{zhèn} brings about a new beginning (\textit{yuán}).\footnote{114}

\footnote{111} ‘Yao was not content with his sons and elevated Shun to be his successor. Without indignation and outrage how could he have been so profound and far sighted?’ 堯不得其子而舉於舜; 非怨怒而何能如此神遠哉. See ‘On Indignation,’ \textit{Complete Records}, fascicle 33: (CBETA, J34, no. B311, p. 795, c15-16).

\footnote{112} ‘Discourse on Venerating Fire as the Cardinal Principle,’ \textit{Complete Records}, fascicle 19 (CBETA J34, B311, p. 696, b06).


\footnote{114} This point is made explicitly in the opening lines of ‘On Indignation’. These lines, some of which have been quoted in the main text and reflect sentiments expressed in the ‘Discourse on Poetry’, read as follows: Although ‘inspiration’, ‘observation’, ‘bringing people together’ and ‘indignation’ were all presented together when Confucius discussed poetry, the mysterious secret is hidden in and wholly returns to the one word ‘indignation’. This ‘indignation’ is able to use the ‘ethers’ (\textit{qi}) of disquiet in heaven, earth, humans and things to project the great harmony between the \textit{xìngqìng} of heaven and humanity. The word ‘indignation’ is analogous to the word ‘renunciation’ (\textit{zhèn}) in the sequence ‘germination’ (\textit{yuán}), ‘expansion’ (\textit{hèng}), ‘fulfilment’ (\textit{li}) and ‘renunciation’ (\textit{zhèn}), and it illuminates the ethers which flow naturally through the innate nature of Heaven. This word ‘indignation’ reveals the secret of human sentiment (\textit{rénqìng}) and Posterior Heaven (\textit{hòutian}). Without reaching the point of ‘indignation’, there cannot be ‘inspiration’, there cannot be ‘observation’ and there cannot be ‘bringing people together’. When one has reached the point of ‘bringing people together’, there cannot but be ‘indignation’. If there is no ‘indignation’ one cannot return to the root and recover life through rebirth after extinction, and one cannot cause ‘germination’ to arise from beneath ‘renunciation’ so that there can be ‘inspiration and there can be ‘observation’ 孔子言詩，詩興、觀、群、怨並發，其秘密藏而純歸於一字，此「怨」字乃能以天地人物不平之氣，保合天人性情之太和。則「怨」字又愈於「元亨利貞」.}
The Spiritual Power of ‘Thunderous’ Indignation: From ‘Harmonising with the Will of Heaven’ to ‘Opposing Sentiments in order to Return to Buddha Nature’

We can argue further that, for Daosheng, ‘dark’ times were not only a point which preceded the re-emergence of a proper moral order in society and politics: they also offered a crucial opportunity for spiritual awakening. This idea is expressed in Daosheng’s comments on the hexagram xikan (習坎) ‘kan Repeated’. Xikan is made up of two kan trigrams ☽ ☾ – the trigram whose name is translated by Baynes/Wilhelm as ‘The Abysmal’, and which is the trigram for the element water. The Taiwan scholar Ts’ai Chen-fong has suggested that Daosheng thought that xikan expressed the idea that spiritual ‘practice’ or ‘cultivation’ (xi 習) – in particular the cultivation of the ‘light’ or ‘the enlightening power’ of zhenyang – is most potent when undertaken while one is beset by negative yin forces (represented by the kan trigram). Daosheng states that: ‘It is inevitably the case that one first encounters difficulties and then reaps rewards; it is inevitably the case that one reaches lofty heights and will then be able to have regrets but still does not lose one’s rectitude’ 必先難而後獲也; 必於亢而能有悔,而不失其正. Daosheng thus suggests that difficult times can lead to moral and spiritual development. This is precisely because difficult times engender anguished emotions of great intensity. The following passage explicitly articulates the connection between anguished feelings, religious attainment and difficult circumstances:

All of the patriarchs simply gave people help to obtain a trigger for the Animating Principle. It is like firing a large gun or canon; if your gut doesn’t contain a lot of explosive gunpowder, how can you set off a force that will startle the heavens and shake the earth, even when you have a fuse? If you have intense anger and wounded feelings like those that the ancients had, you can yourself ignite complete enlightenment. Only this intense fury and these wounded feelings


constitute the true method for dispelling chaos and causing order to return and bringing peace to the country and stability to the state!

諸祖只是與人助得發機。如放大銃砲相似, 你腹中無許多猛烈火藥, 我雖有意引, 如何點發其驚天動地之勢？你果有古人如此痛憤傷感，自能觸發得大徹大悟也。只此一箇痛憤感傷，便是撥亂反正、定國安邦之真作略也！

Horrific circumstances nurture an intense inner ‘fire’, a burning outrage that cuts through the ‘darkness’ or ignorance and apathy. This virulent inner fire aligns with *zhenyang* – the source of all *yang* power, including that of insight and transformation. I would argue that this idea of using a dark age as a ‘furnace’ to intensify the ‘inner fires’ of *zhenyang* is a core underpinning of Daosheng’s ‘Chan of the Red Furnace of the Great Blacksmith’ (*daye honglu chan* 大冶紅爐禪). But most importantly, this method is connected with the power of ‘winter’ and with the Winter Solstice (associated with the Hexagram *dilei* (fu)) and its role in ‘nurturing’ *zhenyang*. We may note the following passage from Daosheng’s ‘Discourse on Venerating Fire as the Cardinal Principle’:

The Winter Solstice [*子之半*] is the *zhenyang* in the middle of the *kan* [water] trigram; it is the root of heaven, the cardinal principle of ‘fire’. The state of *yang* hidden within *yin* is that of the dragon palace hidden beneath the sea and of the divine dragon submerged deep within the water; it is the state which is called ‘*Yang* is beneath and is not [yet] functioning.’ It is the core truth of illuminating mind and seeing nature that the Buddha and the patriarchs taught to people, which is the cardinal principle of ‘tranquillity and no movement’ in the Book of Changes.

...子之半，正是坎中一畫真陽，坎中一畫真陽，為天之根、火之宗也。陽藏陰中，即龍宮之在海藏、神龍之潛九淵；所謂「陽在下而勿用」。是佛祖教人明心見性之旨，即大易寂然不動之宗也。

This passage suggests a connection between Daosheng’s ideas on the ‘thunderous’ power of indignation, ‘winter’ as a site favourable to religious cultivation, and his conception of Buddhist practice. When mental turmoil brought about by unendurable circumstances reaches its zenith, it fosters a sudden, intense burst of emotion directed at ending suffering and righting wrongs that can no longer be ‘held back’ or controlled. This ‘dark’ emotion should not be ‘held’ onto because it is anguished and agitated. However, within this outrage is the

---

latent ‘seed’ of an understanding and an impulse to action that can empower the will of heaven in the world. These emotions can thus be described as ‘outer’ yin that is infused with latent, ‘inner’ yang, and as the merging of the dao of heaven and the emotionality of humankind. On account of this merging, their expression in ‘sound’ has immense spiritual power; it can serve as a One-Word Dharma Gate’ (yi zi famen 一字法門) which can prompt someone with ‘great vigour’ – one whose mind is not ‘dissipated’ – to unite vitality (jing) and focus (yi). By collecting together the energies that have their source in this great vitality (jing), the mind can become powerfully focused (yi), prompting the ‘cessation’ of spiritually dissipated mental activity. As a result of the movement of the Human Mind, the ‘tranquility and non-movement’ of the dao mind returns; thus one can perfect the ‘cessation of observation’, which is the ideal state of the ‘exposed’ Human Mind.

Poetry and ‘Truth’ – Straightforward Indignation and ‘The Absolute within the Relative’

Zhenyang Emerging in ‘Winter’ and ‘Arriving from within the Relative’

Why did Daosheng choose to place special emphasis on the enlightening capacity of one specific direction of interchange between yang and yin (that of the ‘re-emergence’ of the yang force from the dominance of yin) and stress the particular importance of winter to the attainment of spiritual progress?

One explanation would be that this stance reflected Daosheng’s identity as a ‘loyalist’ and his historical milieu. Daosheng lived in a figurative ‘winter’ marked by political decline and turmoil, and may therefore have felt that directing ‘indignation’ at current wrongs through poetry had therapeutic value for traumatised individuals and also that it could help to bring about a reemergence of the yang ‘light’ of civilization (‘Ming’ 明) from the yin world of war and chaos; thus it could prompt rediscovery or reconnection with the ‘Will of Heaven’

---

120 ‘[Outrage and indignation] …are words that come created from within one’s own mind, and they transform the heavens, earth, people and things. A single word can be regarded as a sharp sword, a drum smeared with poison, the roar of a lion, and an elixir of immortality…People down the ages who were unable to achieve great things simply did not have ‘Vitality and Focus’ and were disordered in the application of their minds. As a result, these words that can kill only with an inch of steel, need a person of great vigour to obtain them’ …皆是自心中創出造化來, 變易天地人物。即此一字為吹毛劍也可、為塗毒鼓也可、為獅子吼也可、為九轉丹也可…千古人不能成大事者，只是不精一，鍾用心。故寸鐵殺人之説也，須是大猛烈漢子始得. The title of this passage is ‘The One-Word Dharma Gate.’ Yi zi famen,一字法門. See Complete Records, fascicle 33: (CBETA, J34, no. B311, p. 792, c11-23).
(correlated with zhenyang). At the same time, the idea that this dark (yin) era could be an ideal site for cultivating Chan enlightenment (also correlated with zhenyang) arguably gave religious meaning to the misfortune of living in a chaotic era.

However, I suggest that there is also a correlation between Daosheng’s views on indignation and the soteriology of the Caodong school to which he belonged, and especially its well-known system of the ‘Five Ranks’ (wu wei 五位). This system, which depicts five stages of Buddhist realization that involve the interaction between the Absolute (zheng 正) and the Relative (pian 偏), was strongly infused with yin-yang thought and notions of ‘seasonality.’ Specifically, I would contend that Daosheng’s conception of the religious value of indignation in poetry closely matches his understanding of the process that occurs in the penultimate Fourth Rank of the Five Ranks paradigm. This Rank, which marks the entry point to enlightenment in Caodong soteriology, is known as ‘Arriving from within the Relative’ (pian zhong zhi 偏中至).’

At one level, the idea of the ‘Absolute’ (which the Caodong school associated with supramundane truth) correlates with the state of ‘zhenyang’ re-arising within dominant ‘yin’. However, even though Daosheng follows the Caodong tradition of using the Four yin-yang Images (si xiang 四象) to represent the first four of the Five Ranks, he uses a different sequence from that of earlier thinkers. Daosheng equated the Fourth (and penultimate) Rank (which in his system was ‘Arriving from within the Relative’) not with ‘great yang’ (which is associated with Fire and the Absolute) but with ‘great yin’ (taiyin 太陰), the image that is associated with Water and the Relative. 122

121 The Four yin-yang Images, which correlate with the cardinal directions and with the seasons, and which are composed of pairs of divided yin and undivided yang lines, are: shaoyang 少陽, taiyang 太陽, haoyin 少陰 and taiyin 太陰. 122 ‘Revealing the Correctness of the Core Doctrines of [the Cao]Dong School’ Complete Records, Fascicle 10: ‘The circle on the ‘north’ side is the ‘Great Yin’ in ‘Arriving from within the Relative.’ [1] 北方一圈,即太陰之偏中至也 (CBETA, J34, no. B311, p. 649, c29-30). Yongjue Yuanxian, following Huihong, represented the Fourth Rank with the hexagram Wind-Marsh (Inner Truth) (fengze zhongfu 風澤中孚), represened the Fourth Rank with the hexagram Wind-Marsh (Inner Truth) (fengze zhongfu 風澤中孚). See ‘Commentary on the ‘Song of the Precious Mirror Samādhi,’ in fascicle 27 of Extensive Records of Chan Master Yongjue Yuanxian (Yongjue Yuanxian chanshi guanglu 永覺元賢禪師廣錄): ‘The fire-water weiji hexagram is the ‘Absolute within the Relative’… It changes and then becomes the wind-thunder yi hexagram, which is ‘Arriving from within Mutual Integration’ 火水〈未濟〉卦象: 偏中正…變則成風雷〈益〉卦象: 偏中至 (CBETA, X72, no. 1437, p. 537, c13-15 // Z 2:30, p. 354, b8-10 // R125, p. 707, b8-10). In Yuanxian’s account the Fourth Rank is ‘Arriving from within Mutual Integration’ (jianzhongzhi), and not ‘Arriving from within the Relative’ (pianzhongzhi), as it is for Daosheng. Daosheng’s use of ‘Arriving from within the Relative’ as the Fourth Rank arguably reflects his emphasis on movement from the Relative towards Mutual Integration (jian 兼) as the
In Caodong orthodoxy, the Fourth Rank is linked with yin in another way. It is associated with the fifth ‘yin’ line (or movement to the fifth line) of the li or chongli (double fire) hexagram 离. The chongli hexagram was highly esteemed in the Caodong school, where it symbolized both the highest of the Five Ranks and also the ‘Five Ranks’ collectively. Its lines (or more precisely the movements from one line to the next, making five ‘pairs’) were often used to represent spiritual progression through the Five Ranks. The Fourth Rank – the fourth stage in the movement between the lines of the hexagram – involved a movement back to a yin line. This point – and the system of correspondences between the Five Ranks and the li Hexagram more generally – has been elaborated in an article by Ch’en Sung-pai, ‘The li Hexagram of the Book of Changes and Caodong Chan’.123 Ch’en suggests that the Caodong conceptualization of the Fourth Rank draws upon the traditional Book of Changes interpretation of the fifth line of the chongli hexagram as symbolising ‘lament’ or ‘regret’ and a ‘change of heart’ – something which arguably correlates with the ‘self-directed indignation’ that Daosheng speaks of in ‘On Indignation’. In this regard, we may note Baynes’ translation of Wilhelm’s rendering of the commentary on this Hexagram line that appears in the Book of Changes:

Tears in floods, sighing and lamenting. Good fortune.’

Here the zenith of life has been reached. Were there no warning, one would at this point consume oneself like a flame. Instead, understanding the vanity of all things, one may put aside both hope and fear, and sigh and lament: if one is intent on retaining his [sic] clarity of mind, good fortune will come from this grief. For here we are dealing not with a passing mood… but with a real change of heart.”124 Ch’en interprets this yin line as representing the ‘spirit of unselfishness and [of working] for the benefit of the many and planning for the welfare of the people’. He understands its Caodong interpretation as ‘giving expression to the wondrous heart of compassion and pity, saving many sentient beings,’125 and as ‘universal pity and compassion in the spirit of wishing to save the world.’ Both of these notions appear to resonate with Daosheng’s ideas about the

precondition for Attainment (dao 到). The Fifth Rank is Attainment from within Mutual Integration (jianzhongdao 兼中到). For a comparison between the paradigm of Daosheng and those of Huihong and Yongjue for correlating yin-yang hexagrams and the Caodong Five Ranks, see Ts’ai, ‘Zhujia chanseng quanshi Caodong zong ‘Baojing sanmei’ shiliu zi ji zhi jiantao, pgs. 24-32.
123[Chen Rongbo] 陳榮波, ‘Yijing li gua yu Caodong chan’ 〈易經離卦與曹洞禪〉 (Huagang foxue xuebao 《華岡佛學學報》, Vol. 4, 1980), pgs. 224-244
transformative processes that can occur as a result of ‘voicing’ indignation. They emphasise a change of heart and introspection, and I suggest there may be a resonance with the orthodox Book of Changes interpretation of kang 亢 (‘Arrogant dragons will have cause to repent’) in the description of the lines in the qian Hexagram. This change of heart or lament can bring back one’s ‘clarity of mind,’ something that would parallel the idea of moving from the excesses or arrogance of lofty kang back to submerged qian, an analogue to the process of ‘the cessation of vitality.’

At first glance, the chongli hexagram (and the spiritual processes it is seen as representing) would not seem to be associated with ‘winter’. My suggestion is not that Daosheng directly associated chongli with Winter, but that the processes of yin-yang movement which were seen as operating between the fourth yang and fifth yin lines within the chongli hexagram (which were used by Caodong thinkers to symbolise the transformative process that marks the fourth rank) were analogous to the process of transition towards rebirth taking place within ‘Winter’ and in the yin-yang and movement between Absolute and Relative in the Five Ranks system. This was dependent in part on the distinctive way in which the Caodong school conceptualised yin-yang relationships. In his text on the Core Doctrines of Caodong Chan, just after he has described the Fifth Rank, Daosheng states:

‘The Book of Changes regards yang as the single line, the Absolute, the ‘Lord’ and White;’ and regards yin as the dual lines, the Relative, the Lord’s Subject and Black. My school, however, deploys the single line as yin, the Absolute, the Lord and Black and it deploys the dual lines as yang, the Relative, the Lord’s Subject and White’

This passage shows that Caodong understandings of ‘yin’ and ‘yang’ are in key respects a complete inversion of what is found in the Book of Changes or in yin-yang scholarship more generally. The Fourth Rank – Arriving from with the Relative – involves a process where the phenomenal or manifest element – the ‘exposed’ Human Mind and the great yin in the Book of Changes – is dominant. However, this domination does not last; the Relative gives way, and even ‘assists,’ the initial re-emergence of the noumenal ‘greater yang’ (equivalent to zhenyang, correlated with the Dao Mind). This resonates strongly with the process that occurs

in ‘winter’ where there is movement from the near-complete dominance of yin (darkness and cold) to the re-emergence of yang (light and warmth). It parallels the depiction in Daosheng’s ‘Disquisition on bringing together Confucianism and Buddhism’ of the movement from the dominance of the ‘Human Mind’ to the re-emergence of the ‘Dao Mind.’ On this count, we may note the following more detailed description of what occurs in the Fourth Rank:

Through the act of shifting the full ‘Function’ (yōng) of concrete affairs (shì) and of ideal principle (lì) within the Relative so as to arrive towards full ‘Substance’, concrete affairs and ideal principle will not subjugate (duó) each other as a matter of course, and one can arrive at Great Awakening (zhengjüe 正覺, abhisaṃbodhi) in order to bring the power of the Great Transformation to completion.

回偏中事理之全用, 而至向全體, 則事理俱不必奪, 而可即正覺以成大化權也

In this statement about the Fourth Rank, Daosheng discusses some fundamental issues, namely the relationships between Substance and Function, Ideal Principle and Concrete Affairs and the Absolute and the Relative. In Daosheng’s formulation, one is first immersed in the ‘function’ of concrete affairs (shì) and ideal principle (lì) in the domain of the Relative – that is, of ‘mundane phenomena’ (here expressed as shì – equivalent to samsāra), and ‘mundane truth’ (here expressed as lì – arguably equivalent to the Buddhist concept of ‘skilful means’). From this, one begins to comprehend the true ‘substance’ of shì and lì, namely, supramundane truth, the universal, unitary substratum underling lì (that is, ‘Buddha nature,’ the Absolute/zhenyang/the dao of heaven’). The effect of this process is explained in two parts – which are arguably parallel to Daosheng’s use of the terms heng...
Duration (or ‘the enduring’) and yi Increase (or ‘the beneficent’) in the hexagrams fenglei (heng) and leifeng (yi) that are discussed in the ‘Discourse on Poetry.’ First, one gains insight into what is enduring (heng). Secondly, through subsequent contemplations one comes to be infused with transcendental wisdom, enabling one to ‘transform’ (hua 化) all sentient beings and ultimately bring them benefit (yi 益).

Arriving from within the Relative as Attainment through Mutual Integration – From Mutual ‘Subjugation’ to ‘Harmony’ and ‘Integration’

Finally, we can suggest that ‘Arriving from within the Relative’ resonates with another core characteristic of Daosheng’s xingqing theory – the idea that expressing ‘straightforward’ indignation can be a means to bring the Human Mind and the Will of Heaven (equivalent to the Dao Mind) into harmony and to perfect the ‘union of the two truths.’ In Daosheng’s thought, a core characteristic of ‘Arriving from within the Relative’ was that it marked an initial state of ‘harmony’ between the ‘Absolute’ and the ‘Relative.’ Daosheng contrasted this ‘harmony’ or ‘cooperation’ with the ‘subjugation’ of Ideal Principle and Concrete Affairs (correlating with the Absolute and the Relative) that occurs in the first three ranks. This understanding drew from the traditional (and more common) designation of the Fourth Rank as ‘Arriving from within Mutual Integration’; the state in which there is an initial integration between the Relative and Absolute that paves the way for the greater harmonious unity that is achieved in Attainment from within Mutual Integration (jianzhongdao 兼中到) – the highest Rank in the Caodong sequence of the Five Ranks, and the Rank which marks ultimate enlightenment. Daosheng felt that the Fourth Rank had special significance because it marked the state of Arriving at spiritual understanding from within the domain of the Relative, a precursor to the state of Attainment achieved through the Mutual Integration of the Absolute and the Relative. We can argue that this view of the importance of the Fourth Rank correlated with Daosheng’s concep­tion that ‘voicing indignation’ in poetry – an exemplary form of the ‘cessation of vitality’ – played a pivotal role in moral and spiritual development, and was

---

129 We may, for instance, compare the Fourth Rank with the Second. Daosheng describes the second stage as follows: ‘When shifting from the Relative towards the Absolute, concrete affairs subjugate ideal principle, there is no ideal principle and no engaging with concrete affairs, and so one can subjugate the mind of śūnyatā[-drṣṭi] in order to illuminate dharmas 回偏向正以事奪理。則無理而不事。可奪空心以明法也 ‘Revealing the Correctness of the Core Doctrines of [the Caodong School],’ Complete Records, fascicle 10: CBETA, J34, B111, p650, a8). Duo 奴, translated here as ‘subjugate’, has a meaning somewhat akin to ‘cause to abate’ in its second occurrence in the sentence.
linked through a series of correspondences with different elements in Daosheng’s religious and ethical system with progress towards enlightenment.

On this count we will briefly look into Daosheng’s understanding of the way that Arriving from within the Relative paved the way for Attainment from within Mutual Integration. From within the Relative, one ‘arrives’ at the initial ‘integration’ of the Relative and the Absolute, paving the way for ‘attainment’, the realisation of their perfect unity. But before we do this, we must understand Daosheng’s conception of the Fifth Rank, the final stage of Attainment, expressed in the following passage:

兼中到者: 以全放全收其黑白而混融之，不可以黑、白表顯名跡。\(^\text{130}\)

As a result of having passed through the stage of the Fourth Rank, the pattern of mutual ‘subjugation’ between concrete affairs and ideal principle, and the division the Absolute and the Relative ends. One reaches a state where neither suppresses the other, each ‘assists’ with the re-emergence of the other and neither becomes excessively dominant. This occurs through the processes where both ‘dark’ yin and ‘light’ yang naturally ‘release’ and ‘withhold’ themselves, a dynamic that is the same as ‘voicing’ and ‘constraining’.

How the achievement of the Fifth Rank (Attainment from within Mutual Integration) is facilitated by reaching the Fourth Rank (Arriving from within the Relative) can perhaps be illuminated by looking into Daosheng’s ‘Disquisition on ‘Adhering’ and ‘Transforming’’ (Li-hua shuo) 〈麗化說〉, a text that explicates the relationships between the trigrams and hexagrams in the Book of Changes, cosmic processes and stages of mental cultivation. A relevant passage reads:

\[Qian\] Heaven and \[kun\] Earth are fixed in their position by Anterior Heaven 先天; the animating principle of change resides completely in the \[kan\] Water and \[li\] Fire of Posterior Heaven 後天. The two sets of lines in the hexagrams ‘Return’ (\[fu\]) and ‘Coming to Meet’ (\[gou\]) are the Primal Origin (\[yuan\] 元) of the roots of heaven and earth; they are the Initiation Point (\[chu\] 初) of the nine and the six [i.e.

\(^{130}\) Complete Records, fascicle 10: (CBETA, J34, no. B111, p. 650, b9-10).\]
the undivided yang lines and the divided yin lines in the hexagrams]. These things are the animating principle for conscientiousness when one is alone, the secret of ‘vitality and focus’, the key to heaven and humankind, the cardinal principle for ‘equilibrium and harmony,’ and the foundation for things finding their proper place and developing felicitously. By being able to use nine, one can seek the source of the beginning and go out into life. By being able use six, one can return to the end and enter death. What is called seeking the source of the beginning and returning to the end is knowing the causes of birth and death… If one knows this [principle], then using the initial nine is using the nine of all the lines of the sixty-four hexagrams, and using the initial six is using the six of all of the lines of the sixty-four hexagrams. The interchange between the odd and the even requires hardness and softness assisting each other, so that one can begin to bring to completion the equilibrium and harmony of Attainment from within Mutual Integration.

In this description we see that the pure yin and pure yang trigrams – kun Earth and qian Heaven – are the key points fixed by Anterior Heaven (the sequence of the 8 trigrams attributed to the culture hero Fu Xi), the animating principle of transformation is the mixed yin and and yang trigrams, kan Water and li Fire, the key trigrams in the Posterior Heaven sequence of the 8 trigrams attributed to King Wen of the Zhou. Attainment comes through observing states where either yin or yang is dominant in its operation but in which the other element is not completely subjugated. These are the two poles of the trigram kan The Abysmal/water (where an inner undivided yang line is enclosed within two yin lines), and li Adhesion/fire (where an inner divided yin line is enclosed within two yang lines). What occurs with zhongli/li/summer is essentially the opposite of what occurs with xikan/kan/winter. What occurs with the fu hexagram associated with the middle month of winter is essentially the opposite of what occurs with the gou hexagram associated with middle month of summer. As Ts’ai elaborates, the yang line in kan is associated with the yang line which sits beneath the five yin lines in the fu hexagram, marking both the initial re-emergence of yang after the dominance of yin and its desire to move ‘upwards’ and become active. The yin line in li is associated with the yin line that lies beneath five yang lines in the gou hexagram. The emergence of yang in winter marks a new beginning and the gradual movement towards the

---

apogee or dominance of yang (the middle of summer — represented by the gou hexagram). After the yang life force reaches its apogee in the middle of summer, the yin force then re-appears marking the gradual movement towards ‘death’ (the apogee of the yin force in the middle of winter — represented by the fu hexagram, which is also the moment of the return of yang).\textsuperscript{132}

In other words, there is a cyclic process in which the water trigram kan and the fire trigram li morph into each other through the outward movement of their inner yin/yang lines (‘When yang comes out, six becomes nine. When yin goes in, nine becomes six’ 陽之出即六為九，陰之入即九為六).\textsuperscript{133} This process is the embodiment of the symbol of the Supreme Ultimate (taiji), in which the dominant white sphere contains a black ‘seed’ (yin within yang in li), and the dominant black sphere contains the white ‘seed’ (yang within yin in kan). There is no complete subjugation of yang (as there is in qian) or of yin (as there is in kun). The dominant element gives way or assists the re-emergence of the other. Yin and yang can at all times coexist with each other, which creates the necessary condition for the continual transformation of the sixty-four hexagrams. One moves from ‘winter’ to ‘a season of no winter and no summer.’ As Daosheng explains in his ‘Discourse on Poetry’, ‘When one is aligned with the way of zhen-yuan (renunciation-germination) and kang-qian (loftiness-submergence) and knows this, then outrage and indignation arrive at equilibrium and harmony. The four seasons move therein and the six dragons ride thereon.’ At this stage, one has attained the Fifth Rank of Attainment from within Mutual Integration, and has achieved ultimate enlightenment as this is depicted in the Caodong Five Ranks schema.

On this note, we may return to the xingqing theory in Daosheng’s ‘Disquisition on bringing together Confucianism and Buddhism’. In particular, we may note the following passage from the end of the ‘Disquisition’ (a part of this translation overlaps with the passage that appears earlier):

This unity of vitality-focus and cessation-contemplation is the supreme truth (diyi yidi 第一義諦) of ‘sincerely holding to the Mean’ (yunzhi juezhong 允執厥中), with the supramundane and mundane truths being always present within it. The qian hexagram of the Book of Changes designates the Dao Mind’s purity, refinement and vitality; the kun hexagram of the Book of Changes designates the Human Mind’s straightforwardness, rightness and grandeur. The ten-thousand

\textsuperscript{132} See Ts’ai, ‘Zhujia chanseng quanshi Caodong zong ‘Baojing sanmei’.’
\textsuperscript{133} ‘Disquisition on Adhering and Transforming’, Complete Records, fascicle 25: (CBETA, J34, no. B311, p. 736, b14).
things support \textit{yin} and embrace \textit{yang}. The Human Mind resides in stillness and gives free rein to responsiveness to stimuli. Not one of the hexagrams and lines in the group of 64 ever departs from the ‘exposure’ and the ‘subtlety’ of the Human Mind and the Dao Mind, or from the changes and transformations of the single \textit{yin} and the single \textit{yang}.

The relationship between Daosheng’s syncretic \textit{xingqing} theory, Caodong soteriology and \textit{yin-yang} thought, becomes clearer when we note the parallel made here between Daosheng’s descriptions of the movement between the water trigram ‘\textit{kan}’ and the fire trigram ‘\textit{li},’ and the pairing of the Human Mind and the Dao Mind.’ The ‘stillness’ of the Dao Mind is associated with the all-\textit{yang} \textit{qian} hexagram and ‘tranquillity and no movement’ (the latter being a quality of \textit{zhenyang} as outlined in Daosheng’s ‘Discourse on Venerating Fire as the Cardinal Principle’), and it can thus be regarded as being representative of ‘the Absolute’ or \textit{yang}. By comparison, the ‘movement’ of the Human Mind in its \textit{ordinary} state is associated with ‘mundane truth’ and \textit{samsara}, and can thus be regarded as being representative of the Relative, or \textit{yin}. However, the \textit{ideal} state of the Human Mind is one of ‘stillness within movement’ 動中之靜 where ‘there is ‘feeling but never without calm’ 感而未嘗不寂\textsuperscript{135} – something that Daosheng parallels with the \textit{kan} trigram, in which ‘[\textit{yang} is] encompassed by \textit{yin} and [\textit{yin}] embraces \textit{yang}.’ The ideal state of the ‘Human Mind’, that of ‘cessation in contemplation’, can, on this account, be represented by the hexagram \textit{kan} The Abysmal (water), while ‘contemplation in cessation’ can be linked with the hexagram \textit{li} Adhesion (fire).

Daosheng’s concept of the ideal state of the Human Mind thus shares key features with his depiction of the Fourth Rank ‘Arriving from within the Relative’. In the ‘Disquisition on bringing together Confucianism and Buddhism’ we first see a process where the ‘phenomenal’ emotions of the Human Mind accommodate the re-arising of ‘cessation’, paving the way to the Dao Mind. The arising of ‘cessation’ from within ‘contemplation’ matches the process where the ‘full functioning’ (\textit{quan yong} 全用) of ‘greater \textit{yin}’ accommodates, and assists the emergence of, ‘greater \textit{yang}’ (equivalent to \textit{zhenyang}). Just as the movement of \textit{yin} changes \textit{kan} into \textit{li} (and the movement of \textit{yang} changes \textit{fu} into \textit{gou}), the process of meditative

\textsuperscript{134} ‘Disquisition on bringing together Confucianism and Buddhism,’ \textit{Complete Records}, fascicle 26: (CBETA, J34, B311, p. 744, a19-23).
\textsuperscript{135} Wang (comp./ed.) \textit{Biography of Master Zhu}, fascicle 1, pg. 39.
development, when it reaches its zenith, turns into its opposite – becoming a process where, dwelling in the Dao Mind, the latent potential of the Human Mind re-arises (‘yin becomes encompassed by yang’). As such, just as the second month of ‘winter’ – the moment of fu Return – is the site where the seasonal flow is re-instigated, the ‘cessation of contemplation’ of the Human Mind, the transformation that occurs in the Caodong stage of Arrival from within the Relative, triggers a perpetual seasonal interchange between ‘winter’ and ‘summer,’ involving the ‘cessation of contemplation’ and the ‘contemplation of cessation.’ As Zhu Xi stated, ‘Tranquil and always feeling, feeling and always tranquil – this is how the mind ceaselessly alternates in a cycle without a single moment of non-benevolence.’ One has at this stage perfected the ‘Mean’ and achieved enlightenment – the state of Attainment from within Integration.

*Daosheng, Hanshan and their Legacy*

Having explicated Daosheng’s ideas about poetry and enlightenment, we can return to the relationship between his poetics and those of Hanshan. As mentioned above, Daosheng stated that his theorising on poetry received its ‘animating principle’ from Hanshan’s statement that ‘poetry and Chan are one’ (*shi chan yi ye* 詩禪一也). While Daosheng does not state clearly what elements of Hanshan’s thought on poetry (other than this fundamental principle) he inherited from Hanshan, several of his fundamental ideas correspond with those of his eminent predecessor. Like Hanshan, Daosheng saw poetry as a form of ‘conventional’ or mundane truth that was a means to arrive at the union of the ‘mundane’ and ‘supramundane’ by using function (mundane truth) to illuminate substance (supramundane truth). Moreover, Daosheng, like Hanshan, emphasised the spiritual power of ‘fire’ and the chongli hexagram, and his ‘Chan of the Red Furnace of the Great Blacksmith’ depicts the ‘furnace’ of living through chaotic times as an ideal site for ‘illuminating’ one’s innate nature. These points merge in the bringing together of three forms of zhen – ‘authenticity’ in the poetic expression of anguished emotions enabling one to confront and transform a defiled ‘reality’ and realise transcendental ‘truth.’ As Daosheng stated: ‘As with the Red Furnace of the Great Blacksmith, it is possible to hammer out all ‘false’ phenomena and forge every kind of ‘genuine’ xingqing, ‘genuine’ literary composition, ‘genuine’ endeavours’ ‘genuine’ achievement, fame and virtue,
‘genuine’ Chan and the ‘genuine’ Buddha.’ 如「大冶紅爐」乃能煆去一切假物，煉出一切真性情、真文章、真事業、真功名道德、真禪、道佛。\textsuperscript{136}

In the next chapter we will look at the writings of a figure whose ideas on poetry were profoundly influenced by Daosheng and Hanshan: the Caodong monk Tianran Hanshi. Like that of Daosheng, Tianran’s career coincided with the Ming-Qing transition. However, he continued to be active after the figurative ‘middle of winter’ that came with the fall of the Ming and his career extended into the period where the trajectory towards decline had halted, that is, when the Qing began to consolidate its control over China’s south. We shall see that shifting historical circumstances resulted in Tianran taking a different approach to the religious value of non-Buddhist poetry which expressed anguished emotions, even though his approach remained heavily indebted to the stances of Hanshan, Daosheng and those influenced by them, such as Fang Yizhi.

\textsuperscript{136}‘Disquisition on the bringing together [of doctrines]’\textit{Cantong shuo 參同說}, \textit{Complete Records}, fascicle 25: (CBETA, J34, no. B311, p. 742, b6-7).
Introduction

The Lingnan Caodong monk Tianran Hanshi (天然函昰, 1608-1685) is perhaps best known to Anglophone scholars as the dharma-brother of the renowned ‘loyalist’ poet-monk Qianshan Hanke (千山涵可). Tianran was himself an influential ‘loyalist’ monk, and has been the object of considerable attention in modern Chinese scholarship. His order became one of the largest in southern China in the mid to late seventeenth century – a time when the Qing had replaced the Ming, but did not exert full control over China’s south. Tianran had to confront the loss of the Ming state and the social and political instabilities of his era, and we can argue that he followed Hanshan and Daosheng in endorsing the moral and spiritual value of poetry which expressed personal and collective distress. He wrote a significant number of poems expressing his anguish at the upheavals of his times, and was arguably more overt in his poetic descriptions of political and historical turmoil than either Hanshan or Daosheng, producing poems that directly discussed war and violence. However, he also felt that some authors in the past who had been wronged by the political forces of their day had perhaps been overwhelmed by their own sentiments, and these sentiments had to be moderated and brought back to conformity with the dao. While he promoted being honest, Tianran held that poets needed to avoid exaggerating their feelings of anguish and harming themselves. Poetic expression had to be authentic and it had to deal with real situations and express real sentiments, but Buddhists had to cultivate themselves so as to reach genuine enlightenment.

This chapter examines a number of Tianran’s writings on religious matters and on literature, focusing on a number of prefaces that he wrote to the literary collections of his associates, both monks and laypeople. Like his predecessors, Tianran emphasized the need for literature

---
1 Hanke’s loyalmess and poetry are discussed in Lawrence C. H. Yim’s ‘Loyalism, Exile, Poetry: Revising the Monk Hanke’ (in Idema et al. (eds.) Trauma and Transcendence, pgs. 149-198, as well as in his ‘Political Exile and the Chan Buddhist Master: A Lingnan Monk in Manchuria during the Ming-Qing Transition’ (Journal of Chinese Religions, Vol. 33, Issue 1, Sept. 2005, pgs. 77-124). A brief discussion on Hanke’s standing and exile can be found in Jiang Wu’s Enlightenment in Dispute, pgs. 98, 373 (a short list of sources which discuss the events surrounding Hanke’s exile is provided on pg. 173). The relationship between Tianran and Hanke is the focus of Nie Wenli (聶文莉) ‘Hanshi yu Hanke’ (函昰與函可) (in Zhong Dong (鍾東) (ed.) Bei zhi chuan xiang: Haiyun si ya Biechuans si lishi wenhua yantaohui lunwenji 《悲智傳響:海雲寺與別傳寺歷史文化研討會論文集》. Beijing: Zhongguo haiguan chubanshe, 2006, hereafter Bei zhi chuan xiang), pgs. 247-258.
and religious practice to be genuine and to respond to real situations. He also gave great weight to the relationship between writing and the mind of the author, stressing that literary and religious writing should be ‘real’ in the sense that they project the true moral and spiritual state of the person who had produced it. Like proponents of zhen in that era, he was critical of archaism and excessive intellectualism in writing (and in religious practice), even advocating ‘Chan Intoxication’, in which the sentiments of the author were communicated directly. However, he also counseled against emotional excess, warning those who had encountered difficulties and setbacks (particularly when these were caused by political misfortune) not to lose control of themselves and fall into negative sentiments. It can be argued that Tianran’s position on the spiritual benefits of poetry that articulated strong emotions (such as a sense of indig...
Tianran, dharma name Hanshi, birth name Zeng Qixin (曾起莘), was born into a prominent local family in Jiejing Village (遠徑村) in Panyu county (番禺县) in Lingnan. He harboured aspirations for high office in his youth, becoming a juren (Provincial Graduate) in his 25th year. However, he failed to attain a higher rank in his first attempt at the imperial examinations the next year. While travelling to re-sit the examination in 1640, Tianran decided to take monastic vows. He received his tonsure under the tutelage of the renowned Caodong monk and 'dharma-cousin' of Daosheng, Changqing Daodu (長慶道獨 1600-1661).

Recognised as a monk of considerable talent, Tianran was invited by a high ranking official (Chen Zizhuang (陳子壯 1596-1647, who later became a ‘loyalist’) to became the abbot of the famous Guangxiao temple (光孝寺, also known as Helin 荷林), a mere two years after taking his vows as a monk. This began a prominent ecclesiastic career: a group of unusually distinguished individuals congregated around Tianran, and he became the head of a number

---

2007).

3 Many modern works address the life, poetry, thought and the Buddhist order of Tianran. These include the chronological biography composed by Wang Zongyan in the Republican era that is mentioned in the preceding footnote. There is also a lesser-known chronological biography (also entitled Tianran heshang nianpu) by the Republican-era scholar Wang Zaimin (王在民). References to Tianran and his Haiyun order appear in the early Republican-era work Chongxiu danxia shan zhi (重修丹霞山志) by Sun Jimin (孫翼民). Another important Republican-era source on Tianran and his order is Chen Botao (陳伯陶) Shengchao Yueyong yimin lu (《盛朝粵東遺民錄》, ( Qingdai zhuanyi congkan (清代傳記叢刊), Vol. 070; ‘Yi yi lei’ (遺逸類); (Taipei: Mingwen shuju, 1985) – a historical survey focused on Lingnan Ming loyalists (pgs. 070-431 – 070-450). Direct and indirect references to Tianran and the Haiyun order can be found in a number of works by the historian Chen Yuan (陳垣), including Shishi yinyan lu (《釋氏疑年錄》 (1938, Shanghai: Shanghai shudian chubanshe, Rpt. 1990, Mingqi Dian-Qian fojiar kao (《明季滇黔佛教考》 (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, Rpt. 1962) and Qingchu sengzheng ji (《清初僧詣記》 (originally published in 1940, Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, Rpt. 1985). Wang Hanzhang (王漢章) compiled a chronological biography of Tianran’s disciple Dangui - Dangui dashi nianpu (《淡歸大師年譜》 (1946 – publisher unknown). These works are, however, somewhat lacking in detail, most likely on account of the unavailability of primary sources at the time these works were produced. (For a discussion on this, see ‘Xian Yuqing dui Lingnan fojiao wenxian yanjiu de gongxian —以對海雲系文獻的著録考釋為例’ which can be found in Zhang Hong (張紅) and Zhang Ling (張玲) ‘Jinian lai Tianran Hanshi chanshi yanjiu zongshu’ (近年來天然函昰禪師研究綜述) (in Yang (ed.) Tianran zhi guang, pgs. 340-358).
of well-known southern Chinese monasteries including Huashou (華首), Haichuang (海幢), Biechuan (別傳) and Haiyun (海雲). He died at Haiyun, where he had spent a considerable portion of his career, and which is the source of the name of his ‘Haiyun’ order. By the time of his death he had established one of the most extensive networks of temples in his era, and had assembled what was perhaps the largest order of poet monks in China’s history. Tianran’s own disciples credited him with reinvigorating the orthodox teachings in the Lingnan region, much as Hanshan had done earlier. He left behind a considerable quantity of religious writings that display his competence in Buddhist scholarship. However, Tianran’s

---

4 A relatively comprehensive list of the monasteries associated with Tianran’s Haiyun order and the leading monks associated with each of them is found in Zhang Hong (張紅) and Qiu Jiang (仇江) ‘Caodong zong Panyu Leifeng Tianran heshang faxi chu gao’ (曹洞宗潘嶺雷峰天然和尚法系初稿) (Yang (ed.), Tianran zhi guang, pgs. 6-53) (see, especially, pgs. 6-24). This text lists 15 temples, including that in which Tianran undertook much of his monastic training, Daodu’s Changqing temple (長慶寺). Short biographical information on Tianran and a number of his disciples can also be found in Li Junming (李君明), Nie Wenli (聶文莉) ‘Mingmo Qingchu Tianran Hanshi heshang ji qi fashu he zhuan’ (明末清初天然和尚及其法屬合傳) in Yang (ed.) Tianran zhi guang, pgs. 110-134. More detailed information on eminent monks in Tianran’s order (including three generations of his disciples), especially those associated with Biechuan temple, can be found in Qiu Jiang’s ‘Qingchu Caodong zong Danxia faxi chu tan’ (清初曹洞宗丹霞法系初探) (in Zhong (ed.) Bei zhi chuan xiang, pgs. 16-30).

5 Tan Zhaowen (覃召文), in his Lingnan chan wenhua 《嶺南禪文化》 (Guangzhou: Guangdong renmin chubanshe, 1996), states that Tianran’s order harboured ‘the largest assembly of poet-monks in China’s history.’ (pg. 141 – see also page 34). However, as information on the number of ‘poet-monks’ in earlier orders is incomplete (leaving aside the murkier issue of how to define a ‘poet monk’), this statement is almost impossible to verify. Li Fubiao and Qiu Jiang’s preface to Tianran’s Taishan’s Pagoda’ (leaving aside the murkier issue of how to define a ‘poet monk’), this statement is almost impossible to verify. Li Fubiao and Qiu Jiang’s preface to Tianran’s ‘Biographical Obituary of My Teacher Venerable Tianran Shi’ states that ‘In the past in our Yue [Lingnan], faith in the orthodox school was rare. Since the Master began to guide people to strive towards enlightenment, the gentry officials paying ritual obeisance to the Master began to guide people to strive toward the dharma, the number of people paying obeisance to him as disciples and enquiring about the dao have not numbered fewer than several thousand’ (吾粵向來罕信宗乘，自師提持向上，縉紳縫腋執弟子禮問道不下數千人). See Tianran, Recorded Sayings fascicle 12: (CBETA, J38, no. B406, p. 198, c11-13). This should not be read as meaning that there was little faith in Buddhism in Guangzhou before the rise of Tianran. In late imperial Chan texts, ‘orthodox school’ (zongcheng ‘宗乘, which could be more literally translated as ‘the vehicle of the core doctrines’) denoted the higher teachings of Chan vis-à-vis those of ‘inferior’ schools. Tang Laihe’s ‘Epitaph Inscription for Venerable Tianran Hanshi’s Pagoda’ (appended to Tianran’s Recorded Sayings) also states that ‘several thousand’ 数千 lay disciples and monks personally paid obeisance to him, Recorded Sayings, fascicle 12: (CBETA, J38, no. B406, p. 199, b12-13). Several later Qing sources also emphasise the size of Tianran’s order. The early 19th-century official Zhang Weiping (張維屏 1780-1859), for instance, stated in a panegyrical inspired by a painting of Tianran (‘Tianran heshang xiang zan’ 天然和尚像贊) that his ‘disciples were the most numerous (see Blind Hall, np.). A recent scholarly work that outlines the scale of the religious influence of Tianran’s Haiyun order on early Qing Lingnan society (as well as its cultural and ‘political’ influence) is Zhang Yan (張燕) ‘Yi Tianran wei xin de sengtuan yu Lingnan wenhua de guanxi’ 《以天然為核心的僧團與嶺南文化的關係》 (in Yang (ed.) Tianran zhi guang, pgs. 98-109).

6 Tianran’s disciple Leshuo Jinbian (張維屏) 1637-1695), in his ‘Biographical Obituary of My Teacher Venerable Tianran Shi’ states that ‘In the past in our Yue [Lingnan], faith in the orthodox school was rare. Since the Master began to guide people to strive towards enlightenment, the gentry officials paying ritual obeisance to him as disciples and enquiring about the dao have not numbered fewer than several thousand’ (吾粵向來罕信宗乘，自師提持向上，縉紳縫腋執弟子禮問道不下數千人). See Tianran, Recorded Sayings fascicle 12: (CBETA, J38, no. B406, p. 198, c11-13). This should not be read as meaning that there was little faith in Buddhism in Guangzhou before the rise of Tianran. In late imperial Chan texts, ‘orthodox school’ (zongcheng ‘宗乘, which could be more literally translated as ‘the vehicle of the core doctrines’) denoted the higher teachings of Chan vis-à-vis those of ‘inferior’ schools. Tang Laihe’s ‘Epitaph Inscription for Venerable Tianran Hanshi’s Pagoda’ (appended to Tianran’s Recorded Sayings) also states that ‘several thousand’ 数千 lay disciples and monks personally paid obeisance to him, Recorded Sayings, fascicle 12: (CBETA, J38, no. B406, p. 199, b12-13). Several later Qing sources also emphasise the size of Tianran’s order. The early 19th-century official Zhang Weiping (張維屏 1780-1859), for instance, stated in a panegyrical inspired by a painting of Tianran (‘Tianran heshang xiang zan’ 天然和尚像贊) that his ‘disciples were the most numerous (see Blind Hall, np.). A recent scholarly work that outlines the scale of the religious influence of Tianran’s Haiyun order on early Qing Lingnan society (as well as its cultural and ‘political’ influence) is Zhang Yan (張燕) ‘Yi Tianran wei xin de sengtuan yu Lingnan wenhua de guanxi’ 《以天然為核心的僧團與嶺南文化的關係》 (in Yang (ed.) Tianran zhi guang, pgs. 98-109).

7 His religious writings include the posthumously compiled Recorded Sayings, several sutra commentaries that were included in the Jiaxing Canon (the most substantial being his Mind Seal of the Lankāvatāra-sūtra (Lenggie jin xin yin) 《楞伽經心印》 in 8 fascicles and his 10-fascicle Direct Pointing at the Sūrayogamā (Shou Lengyan zhizhi) 《首楞嚴直指》), and a guide to his order’s vinaya, the one fascicle The Monk Tianran’s Essential Disciplinary Teachings for Monastic Co-Residents (Tianran heshang tongzhu xunlu) 《天然和尚同住訓略》.
best-known legacy is his poetry, the vast majority of which is contained in the 20-fascicle anthology of his writings, the *Blind Hall Poetry Collection* (*Xiatang shiji*)，《瞎堂詩集》，which was compiled and published after his death.

Political Violence, Loyalism and Emotional Anguish – the ‘Historical Poetry’ of Tianran

As noted, Tianran’s life began in the era of Ming decline and ended when the Qing had consolidated its control over South China. He was strongly connected with the Ming dynasty cause, and witnessed the destruction of the Southern Ming regime in Guangzhou in the 1640s and the ‘Three Feudatories’ revolt against the Qing in the 1670s. Tianran was renowned for upholding ‘loyalty’ and ‘righteousness’ in his order, and is regarded by modern Chinese scholars as a ‘loyalist’ spiritual leader who rivalled Daosheng in terms of the size and pedigree of his loyalist following. Like Daosheng, Tianran had become a monk before the fall of the Ming, but he continued to be active as a religious leader many decades afterwards. There were differences between his ‘loyalty’ and his response to the chaotic events of his

---

8 Tang Laihe’s ‘Epitaph Inscription for Venerable Tianran Hanshi’s Pagoda’ states that: ‘Although the master dwelt beyond this world, he still taught his disciples loyalty, filial piety, honesty and integrity’ 師雖處方外，仍以忠孝廉節垂示及門 Recorded Sayings, fascicle 12: (CBETA, J38, no. B406, p. 199, b16-17). In a letter addressed to Tianran ‘To My Master the Monk Tianran [Han]shi’ 〈上本師天然昰和尚〉, Tianran’s disciple Dangui also revealed the degree to which his order not only tolerated, but even stressed the importance of ‘secular’ learning in, for instance, neo-Confucian thought : ‘the teaching of our school used everything from the natural and the high and mysterious to the ‘pure talk’ of the Jin Dynasty to Song Dynasty Neo-Confucianism - hereby referred to as *Hall of All-Pervading Movement* - we also needed to read the books of the pre-Qin era and the two Han dynasties; only then could we remedy defects and correct errors. (‘吾家門風, 自然高妙，宋人理學，兼而有之，卻須更讀些先秦兩漢書，方足以補偏就幣’ – in *Collection of the Hall of All-Pervading Movement* - (II), pg. 94).

9 Jao Tsung-I [Rao Zongyi] (饒宗頤), in his preface to Jiang Boqin’s *Shilian Dashan yu Aomen Chan shi*, states that ‘loyalists from the declining years of the Ming escaped into the empty gate – talented and prominent types inclined as one to take refuge in Buddhism. Their activities extended from Jiangnan down to Lingnan. [In terms of the degree to which the numbers of their] disciples flourished, in actuality the order of Juelang [Daosheng] of the Tianjie Monastery of Jinling and the order of the monk Tianran of the Haiyun Monastery of Panyu were the greatest strongholds.’ (pg. 1). Chen Botao (陳伯陶) in his *Shengchao Yuedong yimin lu* 《勝朝粵東遺民錄》 devoted considerable space to Tianran and his order, and revealed that from around the time of the reign of the Shunzhi emperor (1643-1661) to the start of the succeeding Kangxi period, several thousand loyalists entered Tianran’s order. (Chen’s text is contained in Chow Tsin-fu [周駿富] *Qingdai zhuanji congkan*，《清代傳記叢刊》, Taipei: Mingwen shuju, 1985. For Chen’s discussion on Tianran and his order, see pgs. 070-430 – 070-450). Chen’s text is a veritable ‘who’s who’ of the most eminent and well-known loyalists of southern China, as well as some from northern China. Tianran’s monastic and lay disciples included Qu Dajun, Cheng Keze (程可則), Jin Bao (Dangui), Wang Bangji (王邦畿, dharma name Jinhong), Wang Yinghua (王應華), and a great many other eminent and accomplished figures. Some of these (such as Cheng Keze and Qu Dajun) entered Tianran’s order and then returned to secular life when it was safe to do so; however, many others (such as Jin Bao, Wang Bangji) were to remain loyal disciples for the rest of their lives For a discussion of Tianran’s links with loyalism and loyalists, see Yang Quan ‘Zuowei Ming yimin jingshen lingxiu de Hanshi chanshi’ 〈作為明遺民精神領袖的函昰禪師〉 (in Zhong (ed.), *Bei zhi chuan xiang*, pgs. 307-317).
times and those of the bona-fide ‘loyalists’ he associated with. But unlike Daosheng, and very much like the Ming loyalists of his day, Tianran was given to expressing intense emotional anguish in his own poems. This included writings which, conforming with the description of loyalist ‘historical poetry’ given by Wai-Yee Li, ‘aspired to bear witness to, keep a true record of, and articulate emotional responses to, the Ming-Qing transition.’

When Manchu forces entered Nanjing in 1645, for instance, Tianran composed a poem lamenting the death of the loyalist Huang Duanbo (黄端伯 1585-1645), titled ‘The martyrdom of Squire Huang of the Board of Judicial Review’ (‘Huang sili Yuan Gong xunyi’) 《黃司李元公殉義》. After the fall of Huizhou and the death of Jin Sheng (金聲, jinshi 1628) he wrote ‘The martyrdom of the Grand Scribe Jin Zhengxi’ (‘Jin taishi Zhengxi xunyi’) 《金太史正希殉義》. When Guangzhou fell to the Qing in 1647, he produced ‘Two poems on the martyr’s death of Liang Weiyang’ (‘Liang Weiyang sinan er shou’) 《梁未央死難二首》 and ‘Two Poems on the Martyr’s deaths of Huo Jueshang and his Three Sons’ (‘Huo Jueshang fuzi si ren sinan er shou’) 《霍覺商父子四人死難二首》. When Lingnan was struck by famine in 1648, he composed several poems lamenting the suffering of the people in the manner of his ‘Sharing Congee with the Hungry’ (‘Fen shou yu jizhe’) 《分粥與饑者》. In 1650 he composed ‘Happenings in Leifeng during the Second Lunar Month of the Gengyin Year’ (‘Gengyin er yue Leifeng jishi’) 《庚寅二月雷峰即事》 in which he

10 Tianran was a devout Buddhist and should not be regarded as the same as loyalists who felt compelled to join the Buddhist monastery as a result of the fall of the Ming. Recorded Sayings, fascicle 12: (CBETA, J38, no. B406, p. 200, a3). Jiang Boqin states in numerous places in his Shilian Dashan yu Aomen Chanshi that Tianran was a conservative monk with a strong sense of his sectarian identity.

11 Idema et al. (eds.) Trauma and Transcendence, pg. 14. In The Poet Historian Qian Qianyi, Lawrence C. H. Yim, attempting to delineate the key characteristics of the ‘poet-historian,’ describes this form of loyalist poetry as being marked by the expression of ‘a personal experience of significant (usually traumatic) historical events.’ (pg. 80).

12 Poems of this type – perhaps on account of their perceived ‘loyalist’ character – have been a popular subject in Chinese studies on the Blind Hall. See Liang Shouzhong 梁守中 ‘Hanshi yu Xiatang shiji’ 〈函昰與《瞎堂詩集》〉 (in Zhong (ed.) Bei zhi chuan xiang, pgs. 133-141); Qu Longlin’s ‘Xiatang shifeng qiantan,’ pgs. 184-185; Wang Fupeng (王富鵬) ‘Qibu huai kuangji, tianyun dang ruhe- lun Tianranchanshi de anrang kuangji qinghuai yu tongtuo de yingshi fangshi,’ 〈「豈不懷匡濟,天運當何如」──論天然禪師的安攘匡濟情懷與通脫的應世方式〉 (Yang (ed.) Tianran zhi guang, pp. 73-78), and to a lesser extent, Shi Cunde (釋存德) ‘Lun Tianranchanshi yu Muchen Daomin de chuantong jiazhiguan’ 〈論天然函昰與木陳道忞的傳統價值觀----以亡國與亡天下的思想視域為中心〉 (in Yang (ed.) Tianran zhi guang, pgs. 61-62).

13 Blind Hall, fascicle 17, pg. 194.

14 Ibid, fascicle 17, pg. 193. In addition to being a loyalist, Jin Zhengxi was a patron of Buddhism who was instrumental in developing the study of neo-Confucian / Wang Yangming ideas in the monastery. For a discussion on his relationship with Buddhism, see Araki Kengo’s ‘Kin Shōki to Yō Gyozan’ (in his Min Shin shisō ronkō, pgs. 129-186).

15 Blind Hall, fascicle 7, pg. 57.

16 Ibid, fascicle 7, pg. 67.
mourned the loss of the Ming state to which he was loyal. Between 1655 and 1659, the recapture of Guangzhou from the Southern Ming by the Qing prompted the composition of ‘Three Poems on Guangzhou’ (‘Guangzhou er shou’) which contained the lines ‘ten thousand li of sorrowful tunes from Tartar flutes, the ethers of disorder are profound’ 萬里悲笳逆氣深. Recording the tragic economic and human cost of the 1661 prohibition on dwelling within 50 li of the sea in Guangzhou and Fujian, Tianran composed ‘Three Poems on the Edict to Reclaim the Seaboard [Resulting in] the Movement of People from their Former Properties’ (‘Zhao fu binhai qian min guye san shou’) 《詔復濱海遷民故業三首》. And the first verse of his ‘Autumn Meditations in Eight Poems’ (‘Qiu xing ba shou’) 《秋興八首》 contains the lines ‘The tears of the new pavilion have run dry, yet the rivers and mountains remain. The songs of the old country have been destroyed, and the millet cries in lamentation’ 新亭淚盡江山在,故國歌殘禾黍哀.

From ‘Looking at the Moon’ to Confronting Tragedy – ‘Defiled’ Emotions and ‘Real’ Chan

We can see that Tianran, in response to the chaos of his times, often wrote poems that appeared to be ‘non-Buddhist,’ in that they expressed what Buddhists might regard as being ‘defiled’ forms of emotional anguish and discussed troubled and traumatic events, especially those associated with the political upheavals of the Ming-Qing transition. What is more, Tianran appears to have tolerated – within limits – the composition of this type of poetry by individuals living in his order. How did Tianran reconcile poems which expressed anguish and even, on occasions, ‘resentment’ at the Manchu Qing dynasty, with his religious

17 Ibid, fascicle 10, pgs. 104-105.
18 Ibid, fascicle 11, pg. 118.
19 Ibid, fascicle 13, pg. 144.
20 Ibid, fascicle 15, pg. 171. The poem ‘The Cuckoo’ (Zigui) 《子規》 contains the line ‘I know that fragrant grass grows at the palace gate; I harbour a troubled heart and weep for the setting sun’ 已知宮闕生芳草,猶抱愁心泣夕陽 (ibid, fascicle 12, pg. 133).
21 In his account of the Haiyun Chan Literature Collection (Haiyun chan zao) 《海雲禪藻》, which contains 1010 works composed by 128 monastic and lay authors who belonged to (or were close associates of) Tianran’s ‘Haiyun’ order, the late Qing scholar He Jialin (何佳林) states that ‘After Tianran preached the dharma in Lingnan, the Haiyun Chan Literature anthology – which selected the collected writings of more than 120 authors of the ilk of Azi – greatly opened up the teachings of the orthodox doctrine. 自天然之聞[開]法嶺南,所采阿字輩一百二十餘人之集編而為《海雲禪藻》, 大啟宗風’ (This passage is from He’s preface to the Lianxi Poetry Anthology (Lianxi shicun) 《蓮西詩存》, compiled by the late Qing monk Bao Fa (寶筏). See Beijing Shifandaxue tushuguan cong xijian Qingren bieji congkan 《北京師範大學圖書館藏稀見清人別集叢刊》, Vol. 30. (Guilin: Guangxi Shifandaxue chubanshe, 2007), pg. 365.
22 See Shi Cunde ‘Lun Tianran Hanshi yu Muchen Daomin de chuantong jiazhi guan,’ (in Yang (ed.) Tianran zhi guang), pg. 61. Shi asserts that this resentment is reflected in Tianran’s use of words such as ‘tigers, wolves’ and
identity and mission?

One possible explanation for Tianran’s willingness to permit such poetry to be written and to write it himself is that he believed that Buddhist practitioners should be honest about anguished feelings and should even be willing to express them openly. In this regard, we may note the following passage, addressed to an obscure official by the name of Ling Shizuo (凌世作), from The Recorded Sayings of Chan Master Tianran of Mount Lu (Lushan Tianran chanshi yulu) 《廬山天然禪師語錄》:

You haven’t come to the mountain for quite some time. When someone came from Renhua, I made inquiries and learnt for the first time that your grandson had died unexpectedly. It is unavoidable that you have not been able to leave behind your feelings of love and affection. Isn’t this precisely the time to try to apply the Chan that you normally practice to this? If you try and it’s not effective, then why not straighten your back and go into battle with the ‘three pounds of hemp’ [huatou], or perhaps suddenly blunder into having faith for the first time that all on the earth are your children and grandchildren? In the streets, countless people live and countless people die. Why shouldn’t you open those two pieces of skin [your lips] and laugh a little and cry a little? But instead you came to the peak of Mount Danxia to enjoy looking at the moon along with the crowd, asking about marks of the crescent moon and marks of the full moon’, or some such, to see how I would respond. You should not just confine yourself in your library, letting your vexations pile up, and, after wiping away a few warm tears, pick up a brush and quote something about Yangshan and Shishi enjoying looking at the moon, hoping that I will reply with a Chan saying to relieve your depression. I won’t imitate the vain labours of some old bald fellows who say that it is the crescent moon (jian 尖) or say that it is the full moon (yuan 圓) or who say that it is concealed or say that it is manifest. If you have a white staff and treat dealing with the world as coming to the mountain, then you will see that it is both crescent moon and the full moon and that it also isn’t the crescent moon and isn’t the full moon. When we cannot get along with each other (道不來時), do not blame me for my bluntness. I have received your donation, and thank you…

公多時不入山。有人從仁化來。詢及始知令孫之變。未免恩愛未得脫然。何不正與麼時。把平日參得底禪向者裏試試看。若試不靈驗。不妨把麻三觔話挺著脊梁一回廝併。或者忽然麤來。始信盡大地是兒孫。十字街頭活人無數。死人無數。不妨張開兩塊皮。笑了一回。又哭了一回。卻來丹霞頂[寧*頁]與大眾翫月。問什麼尖相圓相。看老漢如何打發。莫只閉著書房。堆堆地懊

‘weever fish’ as metaphors for the Qing. The main poem in which these terms are used is ‘Autumn Reflections in Eight Poems’ (‘Qiu xing ba shou’) 《秋興八首》 (Blind Hall, fascicle 15, pg. 171)). As Shi notes, the same poem also uses the term ‘massed bandits’ (群盜), 《盲堂, 孤冊 15, 頁 171).

23 Lit. ‘intersecting streets.’ This common expression in Chan literature denotes the secular world of human beings. It is often used in passages which advocate the idea that Chan should be practiced in the ‘real world,’ or in daily life.
In the passage Tianran appears to be saying that a disciple who has just lost a beloved grandson should allow himself to grieve, and that excessive preoccupation with Chan texts and their word games does not lead to real cultivation. Tianran seems to have believed that confronting ‘real world’ tragedies and the emotional anguish these tragedies precipitate, and even expressing such anguish outwardly (‘opening up those two pieces of skin… and crying for a moment’), was not only a natural way to come to terms with tragedy, but could also be a form of Buddhist practice.

Tianran asserts that he himself treats ‘dealing with the world’ as being the same as ‘coming to the mountain’, and declares that engaging with reality is the core part of his Buddhist mission. This approach is contrasted with the vanity of engaging with Buddhist teachings on a purely intellectual level in a manner disconnected from life experiences. It is also contrasted explicitly with Chan practices such as ‘enjoying looking at the moon’, activities designed to express the purity and detachment, or ‘bamboo shoot’ flavour that characterises much Chan literature, and in particular the poetry of many ‘ancient bald fellows’ – the monks of antiquity such as Yangshan and Shishi, whose paradox of whether there were signs of the crescent moon in the full moon or of the full moon in the crescent moon is mentioned in the letter.

From ‘Authentic’ Emotions to the ‘Genuine Mind’ – The ‘Union of the Two Truths’

In the above letter, Tianran appears to be arguing that expressing genuine feeling could have a greater religious value than engaging in Buddhist intellectual and literary games. We can perhaps find a doctrinal justification for this stance in Tianran’s Direct Pointing at the Śūraṅgama (Shou Lengyan zhizhi) 《首楞嚴直指》, a 10-fascicle text which he purportedly wrote in only three months in the 7th year of the reign of Kangxi (1668). The following short extract gives an example of his arguments:

24 ‘Reply to the Official from the Court of Judicial Review, Ling Shizuo’ (II), Recorded Sayings, fascicle 10: (CBETA, J38, no. B406, p. 184, a2-13).
25 Direct Pointing at the Śūraṅgama (Shou Lengyan zhizhi) 《首楞嚴直指》 (CBETA, X12, no. 279, p. 532-662). Zhizhi, which could also be translated as ‘direct explication’, was also used in the title of Tianran’s Direct Pointing at the Heart Sutra (Bore xinjing zhi shuo) 《般若心經直說》 (CBETA, X26, no. 542). The use of ‘directness’ (zhī) might be seen as linked to the idea of zhen.
The *Records of the Mirror of Orthodox Doctrine* says: ‘The discernment of the perceiving subject represents the false mind. It has the function of intellectual discrimination (緣慮), but it is not the genuine mind (真心).’ It also says that ‘The deluded mind is a shadow image on top of the genuine mind (真心上影像).’ I say that this describes the situation where, in the midst of confusion, one has not yet achieved full comprehension. It is called ‘intellectual discrimination,’ and is seen as a ‘shadow image’. It is not the case that the ‘genuine mind’ is present separately before there is intellectual discrimination or beyond the shadow image… We may observe that the [Śīraṅgama] sutra goes on to state: ‘I am not commanding you to cling on to generating the false mind.’ More and more we come to know that ignorance is regarding one’s own child as a thief, and enlightenment is regarding the thief as one’s own child – there is no second person.’

宗鏡云:「能推是妄心,皆有緣慮之用,然非真心」。又云:「妄心是真心上影像」。愚謂此皆形容其迷中未能當下覺了。號之緣慮,目為影像,而非別有真心在緣慮之先,影像之外耳…觀下經云:「我非勅汝執為非心」。益知迷則即子為賊，悟則即賊為子，無第二人也。

In this commentary, Tianran attempts to clear up confusion about the relationship between the false mind, the ‘discernment of the perceiving subject’ and the ‘genuine mind’ or ‘Buddha Mind’, with Tianran’s critique of the discernment of the perceiving subject echoing the negative comments about indulgence in Buddhist intellectual games made in the letter to Ling Shizuo. Like ‘intellectual discrimination’, the discernment of the perceiving subject is not the ‘genuine mind’真心. The statement ‘enlightenment is regarding the thief as one’s own child’ resonates with the broader claims in Tianran’s work that access to the genuine mind comes from engaging with emotional turmoil brought about by exposure to the difficulties of real situations, and that one should not seek to avoid defiled settings. This also affirms the unity of the mundane and supramundane truths, a concept which, as we have seen in the preceding chapters, was consistently emphasised by both Hanshan and Daosheng.

This emphasis on the importance of engagement with the defiled world is overtly stated in the

---

26 This is roughly the same as the original passage from the *Records of the Mirror of Orthodox Doctrine*, which, in fascicle 3, states: ‘The discernment of the perceiving subject is the deluded mind. Each has the function of intellectual discrimination. It can also be called ‘mind,’ but it is not the genuine mind’ 能推者，即是妄心，皆有緣慮之用。亦得名心，然非真心。（CBETA, T48, no. 2016, p. 431, a28-b1).

27 This is the same as the original, except that zhi 之 has been elided.

28 Fascicle 1, (CBETA, X14, no. 291, p. 472, a2-9 // Z 1:22, p. 333, d11-18 // R22, p. 666, b11-18). This is roughly the same as the original passage as it appears in the *Records of the Source-mirror*, which, in fascicle 3, states: 古釋云:‘能推者，即是妄心，皆有緣慮之用。亦得名心，然不是真心。（CBETA, T48, no. 2016, p. 431, a28-b1).
writings of Tianran’s associates and disciples. Dangui’s introduction to *Direct Pointing at the Śūraṅgama*, for instance, succinctly states that ‘aside from the defiled objects [of the external world] there is no [transcendental] ‘substance’ 離塵無體. The connection between these ideas and literature was directly stated by Tianran’s disciple Leshuo Jinbian (樂說今辯 1637-1695). Jinbian praised the decision to print Dangui’s non-Buddhist prose and poetry in the latter’s recorded sayings collection (*Recorded Sayings of Chan Master Dangui of Danxia* (Danxia Dangui chanshi yulu) 《丹霞澹歸禪師語錄》29), noting that Dangui ‘takes joy in what is joyous, is outraged at what is outrageous, grieves at what incites grief and takes delight in what is delightful. He does not have different sentiments from other people; he does not have the same function as other people’ 喜而喜之，怒而怒之，哀而哀之，樂而樂之，不與人異情，不與人同用, and that on account of this, ‘there is no function (yong 用) that is not contained, no animating principle (ji 機) that is not encompassed; and there are no dichotomies.’ 無用不攝，無機不被，亦非有二致也. The fact that Dangui’s writing has the above-mentioned positive attributes makes it religiously beneficial for those who are ‘unable to rely on the continued dispensation of the dharma, and have no means to see him in person’ 不因法施流通，且無由見其人.30

**Poetry, Being Genuine, and Communicating The Genuine**

This brings us to Tianran’s approach to the religious value of being ‘authentic’ in poetic expression. Tianran asserted that progress in spiritual practice meant seeing ‘the thief as one’s own child’. In other words, one had to acknowledge and look into one’s ‘false mind’ – one’s defilements – in order to attain insight into the ‘genuine mind.’ Similarly, one needed to be ‘real,’ in the sense of dealing with the false phenomenal world, in order to realise the truth. The expression of ‘defiled’ emotional responses to ‘real’ world events in literary writing, including poetry, could make visible the moral and spiritual qualities of the author. This line of reasoning perhaps made it possible for the writing and reading of poetry that expressed emotional anguish and discussed violent events to be something that Tianran could reconcile with his religious commitments.

It has been stated several times in previous chapters that authenticity was a highly valued

---

29 Jiaxing C., J38, no. B409.
30 *Hall of All-Pervading Movement* (I), pgs. 7-8.
quality in non-Buddhist poetics in Tianran’s times. The core element in the concept of poetic authenticity was the belief that poetry should honestly express the author’s sentiments in language devoid of artifice. Scholars writing on the culture of the loyalist communities in the Ming-Qing transition era have emphasised the importance that loyalists gave to poems which documented their own traumatic experiences, poems that were seen as exemplifying the value of authenticity. The poems composed by Tianran and many of his disciples were roughly of this mould in that they purported to recount ‘real’ tragic events and express ‘real’ anguished sentiments.

Tianran’s emphasis on literary authenticity should also be approached in the light of his ideas about religious genuineness. Tianran placed substantial emphasis on genuineness (zhen) in his religious writings. The term ‘genuineness and authenticity’ (zhenshi 真實), features around 100 times in Tianran’s 8-fascicle Mind Seal of the Lankāvatāra-sūtra, roughly 35 times in his 10-fascicle Direct Pointing at the Śūraṅgama, and another 26 times in the Recorded Sayings of Chan Master Tianran. Accompanying these is the use of the words zhen or shi independently, and in compounds including ‘genuine cultivation’ (zhen xiu 真修 or zhen can 真參) and ‘genuine realisation’ (zhenuwu 真悟). In one passage, for example, Tianran emphasises the importance of ‘genuine and authentic (zhenshi) people speaking genuine and authentic (zhenshi) words’ 真實人說真實話. Such people are ‘authentic’ in dealing with their...
‘false’ mind; they are people that ‘reflect on their shortcomings’ 点简.\textsuperscript{33}

I will suggest below that there are parallels between some of Tianran’s statements about what was desirable in religious practice and in poetry, and ideas about genuineness prevalent in Gongan and loyalist poetics (ideas that arguably had their origins in Wang Yangming thought). The idea of avoiding literary artifice can be seen as correlating with the idea of being ‘honest’ in dealing with, and even in expressing, ‘defiled’ emotions. But while Tianran valued honesty in self-expression, he emphasised a contrast between those that ‘reflect on their shortcomings’ and religious charlatans of ‘crazed intelligence’ (\textit{kuanghui} 狂慧)\textsuperscript{34} who ‘cheated themselves and cheated others’ 自欺欺人.\textsuperscript{35} These charlatans included those who mimicked the enigmatic language and behaviour attributed to the eminent Chan masters of earlier times, in particular the trend then known as ‘crazed Chan’ (\textit{kuang chan} 狂禪). Tianran was critical of those whose attempts to emulate the poets of antiquity led them to overindulge in expressions of emotional anguish. As later sections of this thesis will discuss, this seems to have been linked to broader reservations on Tianran’s part about those in the loyalist communities of the early Qing era who behaved in an ‘intoxicated’ or ‘crazed’ manner, and who wrote poetry which expressed this.

These ideas were not free from internal conflicts or contradictions. There was a contradiction in Tianran’s writings between the idea that one should express emotions without reservation, and the idea that emotional excess should be tempered (a contradiction that was satisfactorily addressed by Daosheng’s theories on ‘straightforwardness’). Tianran’s view may have reflected attempts on his part to adapt to changing circumstances. While Hanshan died before the collapse of the Ming, and Daosheng’s career as an eminent monk occurred in a period of ongoing chaos and resistance to Qing rule, Tianran’s career spanned a period where ongoing resistance was beginning to give way to an increasing certainty that the Ming would never return. As the need to leave behind old grudges, to develop a ‘sober’ assessment of one’s

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{33} \textit{Recorded Sayings}, fascicle 5: (CBETA, J38, no. B406, p. 154, c3-4).
\item \textsuperscript{34} \textit{Ibid}, fascicle 5: \textit{kuanghui} ‘狂慧’ (CBETA, J38, no. B406, p. 154, c5) \textit{Kuanghui} is a Chan term that refers to intelligence that has no basis in meditative concentration (\textit{samādhi})
\item \textsuperscript{35} \textit{Ibid}, fascicle 5: (CBETA, J38, no. B406, p. 154, c4). The passage in question – part of which was quoted earlier in this chapter – reads as follows: ‘For genuine and authentic (\textit{zhenshi}) people to speak words that are genuine and authentic (\textit{zhenshi}) only requires that those sharing the same ideals each reflect on their own shortcomings – not like those nowadays who cheat themselves and cheat others. In the world, those of crazed intelligence are indeed many; the ones who are earnest are also not few. 真實人說真實話，祇要同道各自點簡，不如今時自欺欺人。天下狂慧固多；老實底亦不少。’ (p. 154, c3-5).
\end{itemize}
times, and to come to terms with a new a political reality became more evident, Tianran increasingly opposed the practice of using poetry to express agitated emotions such as feelings of indignation, and appeared to challenge (albeit indirectly) the positions of his eminent predecessors on this issue.

**Getting Drunk and Speaking One’s ‘True Mind’ – Tianran’s ‘Preface to the Orthodox Songs of Qingyuan’**

Above I have asserted that Tianran felt that poetry which exhibited literary authenticity – marked by an absence of ‘artifice’ in terms of language use – could be a tool for realising therapeutic goals and religious *zhēn*. One text composed by Tianran that addresses different types of religious and literary authenticity is his ‘Preface to the Orthodox Songs of Qingyuan’ 〈青原嫡唱序〉. It reads as follows:

> In ‘singing the praises of antiquity’ (*songgu* 頌古) and in ‘threading together pearls’ (*lianzhu* 聯珠), the learned ones of past ages borrowed other people’s wine cups to wash away their own grievances. In the same intoxicated state, people talk incoherently like an infant (*popohehe* 婆婆和和); each one stammers and stutters, and although their words do not form a coherent text, onlookers can grasp the intended meaning. Overall, the difference between poetry and Buddhist *gāthā* is that in poetry the sentiments are made visible in the words, while *gātha* project an enlightenment beyond the words. [In the case of poetry,] if the wording is not excellent it is difficult for the sentiments to be visible, [while in *gāthā*,] if the words are not clever, the enlightenment is not genuine. I sigh that nowadays teachings on the dharma are mostly obstructed by wording; this is especially the case with the ‘singing of praise’…

> I say that it is through the singing of praise that people of talent can be seen. There would have been no songs of praise in antiquity if people of talent could not be seen. By the same token, it not the case that today we do not have songs of praise because people of talent cannot be seen. This is not to say that in antiquity they [people of talent] could be seen and today they cannot be seen. In both antiquity and today they [people of talent] can both be seen and not be seen. Is it not the case that we find them through the singing of praise? So why should we not share in this intoxication?

頌古聯珠，歷代知識借他人酒杯，洗自己壘塊。同一醉態而婆婆和和，各為吞吐；雖語不成文，傍觀者亦自可以意得。故詩與偈不同者，詩見情乎辭中，偈發悟於言外。辭不妙則情難見；言弗巧則悟不真。予□歎今時說法多；以辭障頌尤甚焉…予曰：「頌可以見人乎!不可見人則古當無頌；遂可見人則今非無頌。非謂古可見而今不可見也。非謂古可見而今不可見也。
This preface was composed not for a collection of ‘secular’ or non-Buddhist poems, but for a collection of *songgu* (頌古, Jap. *juko*) that two of Tianran’s dharma-brothers had compiled.\(^{37}\) *Songgu* – literally ‘songs of praise for the past’ – refers to a religious genre of verse commentaries on old Chan ‘public cases’ (*gongan* 公案, Jap. *kōan*). Drawing upon the root meaning of *song* as ‘song of praise’ and in reference to the point that *songgu* are normally as enigmatic as the *kōan* they discuss or respond to, Tianran is perhaps suggesting that the religious benefit of *songgu* lay not so much in their relation to *kōan*, but rather in their capacity to ‘manifest,’ or enable the reader to ‘see,’ the individual whom they praise – or in other words, the ‘authenticity’ of their expression. Tianran suggests that it is not the case that there were only praiseworthy people in the past and that there are no such people in the present; rather, it is the act of singing praises that makes it possible to see the person of talent, be it in the past or the present.

Tianran’s statement that the past is not intrinsically superior to the present correlates with the critique of the Archaist literary school’s veneration of and attempts to imitate ‘ancient’ poems – a critique that was often made by proponents of literary *zhēn* in the late Ming. His comments that ‘nowadays teachings on the dharma are mostly obstructed by wording’ and that ‘this is especially the case with the ‘singing of praise’ also stress the importance of direct communication and the avoidance of rhetorical embellishment in the communication of religious ideas. While Tianran acknowledges the importance of the skilful use of words in both secular poetry and in Buddhist *gāthā*, his emphasis is on the underlying message, not the form. As noted above, the Chan genre of *songgu* (‘songs of praise for the past’) is understood as being interpretations of, or commentaries or reflections upon, or replies to, Chan *kōan*. They were seen as tools for cutting away at the practitioner’s over-reliance on intellectual understanding. Likening them to the incoherent words uttered by people in a drunken state, Tianran, suggests that their meaning can be understood even though they do not form a coherent text, and he invites readers ‘to share in the intoxication’.

\(^{36}\) *Recorded Sayings*, fascicle 12 (CBETA, J38, no. B406, p. 197, a18-29).

\(^{37}\) The compilers referred to in this preface are Chaoming (巢鳴) and Angong (安公). I have been unable to identify the two individuals in question. Tianran later in this preface notes that Chaoming was a senior Caodong monk of the same order (that is, a disciple of Daodu), and that ‘Angong’ was also a disciple of this order.
I suggest that the references to intoxication in the Qingyuan preface are part of a wider trope in Tianran’s writing. The line in the beginning of the preface about using wine to ‘wash away grievances,’ it should be conceded, drew from a long-established literary idiom, and could well be regarded as a cosmetic embellishment. However, the suggestion that Chan practitioners could be (figuratively) ‘intoxicated,’ and that their ‘intoxication’ had both therapeutic effects and religious benefits, can be found elsewhere in Tianran’s religious writings. This idea is particularly evident in his writings on ‘Chan intoxication’ (chan zui 禪醉), or being ‘intoxicated with Chan’ (zui yu chan 醉于禪). A brief discussion of what this concept means can be found in the following passage from Tianran’s Recorded Sayings:

What is ‘Chan intoxication’? Zhou of Meng [Zhuangzi] states: ‘If an intoxicated person falls from a cart, even though there is suffering he does not die. His bones and joints are the same as those of other people, but the harm done is different. This is because heaven has protected him. Being intoxicated with Chan and talking in one’s sleep is like falling from the cart. Talking in one’s sleep and not realising that you are intoxicated is like the situation referred to by the statement ‘the bones and joints are the same as those of other people, however the harm done is different.’ If I can use sleep talk to make the people of the world understand [my] ‘intoxication’, then the full heaven (全乎天) that I have obtained will be the heaven of the whole of humanity (全乎人之天). If, on the other hand, I were to snore on and not awaken them, thinking this acceptable, how would they become aware of what we call suffering?

禪醉者，何謂也? 蒙周曰：「醉者之墜車，雖疾弗死。骨節與人同，而犯害與人異。其天全也。」予醉于禪而寱，是猶墜車者矣。寱而無解乎醉，殆所謂「骨節與人同，而犯害與人異」歟。使天下之人因其寱而識其醉，則予之得全乎天者，亦將以全乎人之天也。反而齁齁然，鼾而弗之醒，至足矣，又安知其所謂「疾」歟!38

The above passage is found at the beginning of Tianran’s ‘Chan Intoxication’ – a small and eclectic assemblage of discourses (ten in total) included in his Recorded Sayings collection which discuss Confucian and Buddhist thought.39 Few passages in ‘Chan Intoxication’ apart from the opening section discuss the topic of ‘intoxication’ explicitly. However, ‘Chan

---

39 Recorded Sayings, fascicle 11: (CBETA, J38, no. B406, p. 187, c14-p. 191, b12). It is mentioned as an independent work in Leshuo Jinbian’s ‘Biographical Obituary of My Teacher, Venerable Tianran Shi’ and in Tang Laihe’s ‘Epitaph Inscription for Venerable Tianran Hanshi’s Pagoda’. We can assume that it was at one time printed as an individual text.
Intoxication’ does include a brief discussion on historical events that perhaps helps to explain what inspired Tianran’s concept of Chan intoxication. The discourses in ‘Chan Intoxication’ are said to have been spoken in 1648, when Tianran was in Haiyun temple in Guangzhou. Following the Qing massacres in the city in the previous year, the region faced an acute famine. The second passage of ‘Chan Intoxication’ reveals that Tianran’s disciples were exposed to the threat of starvation. This passage details Tianran’s instructions to monks on how they should respond to famine and then respond to abundance when the supply of food was restored. The beginning of this passage states: ‘In the summer of wuzi (1648), people in the Haiyun temple were starving. The disciples lacked food and caused an uproar.’ Tianran sighed and said: ‘How can our dao be lost on account of Humanity?’ On another day, they indulged in eating. Tianran sighed and said: ‘How can our dao be lost on account of Heaven?’ Here Tianran warns against the extremes of being unable to trust in the protection of heaven in times of difficulty and taking that protection for granted in times of ease.

It appears that when Tianran invokes Zhuangzi’s image of the drunken man being kept safe by heaven when he falls from the cart, he is depicting Chan intoxication as something that enables one to anaesthetise oneself against ‘afflictions,’ and as something which can protect one’s person from danger or death. Intoxicated ‘sleep talk’ can protect both one’s person and one’s religious ideals in a tumultuous world that presents pressing dangers for both. In addition, the religious practitioner can use ‘sleep talk’ to help those who are in difficulties. However, Tianran also argues that one cannot ‘snore on’; one must awaken those who have fallen from the cart to the reality of their own suffering.

Intoxicated Speech and Poetry – Tianran’s ‘Not Drinking Wine’

The notion of ‘intoxication’ was not only addressed in Tianran’s Recorded Sayings and in the afore-mentioned preface; it can also be found in a number of places in his Blind Hall.

Tianran composed two collections of poems on ‘intoxication’ that explicitly drew inspiration

---

40 rang 讓 –here likely to be rang 嚷, “to cause an uproar”.
41 Recorded Sayings, fascicle 11: (CBETA, J38, no. B406, p. 188, a23-25).
42 A rare exception is Qian Bangqi (錢邦芑 ?-1673), a loyalist who continued writing about drinking after he joined the Buddhist monastery. See Qin Guangyu (秦光玉) Mingji Diannan yimin lu 《明季滇南遺民錄》 (Lanzhou: Lanzhou daxue chubanshe, 2003), pgs. 88-91.
from the poems of the famous ‘drunken’ poet-recluse Tao Yuanming (陶淵明 365-427). In these collections, which he composed in the 1670s, the idea of ‘Chan intoxication’ is implied when Tianran affirms the therapeutic benefits of being ‘intoxicated’, but rejects the idea that ‘intoxication’ should be attained through ‘drinking.’ In his prefaces to a verse collection called ‘Poems on Not Drinking Wine’ (Bu yinjiu shi) 《不飲酒詩》, a collection which follows the style and structure of Tao’s ‘Poems on Drinking Wine’ (Yinjiu shi) 《飲酒詩》, he states (borrowing the words of an unnamed attendant): ‘Worldly people drink wine to be happy; yet how can they know that not drinking wine brings even more happiness?’ 世人以飲酒為樂，又安知不飲酒為樂更夥？ And in his ‘Not Despising Wine’ (Bu yanjiu) 《不厭酒》 – inspired by Tao’s ‘Stopping Wine’ (Zhi jiu) 《止酒》 – he states that ‘Yuanming composed poems about drinking wine in order to abstain from wine, but in the end stated that his habit of drinking wine could not be stopped. I have composed poems about not drinking wine, knowing moreover that the true appeal in being ‘intoxicated’ is not something that those that drink can obtain.’ 潛明作飲酒詩以止酒，終焉謂飲酒之不可終也。 In these poems, Tianran asserts that the ‘intoxication’ that is attained without drinking is superior to that which comes from wine, as it does not have deleterious side effects, which, he noted, had afflicted many formerly ‘awakened’ people who indulged in drinking. Reflecting his point about ‘snoring away’ he suggested that only those who become intoxicated without drinking have no need to fear ever becoming sober: ‘there is no time when one sobers up from this intoxication – it is not like what is the case for people of the mundane world’ 此醉無醒時，不如世間人。 But perhaps

43 In their study on the ancient-style poems in the Blind Hall collection, He Zetang (何澤棠) and Wu Xiaoman Wu (吳曉蔓) state that ‘Among his poems in Han, Wei and Jin style … works in which Tianran mimicked Tao were the most numerous and their attainment was the highest.’ (See ‘Xiatang wugu yu Han, Wei, Liang Jin shi’ 〈瞎堂》五古與漢魏兩晉詩〉 (in Yang (ed.) Tianran zhi guang 《天然函昰禪師傳記》 pg. 196. A discussion on Tianran’s poems that drew their inspiration from Tao Yuanming is contained in pgs. 196-201, and is the major theme in Sun Guozhu (孫國柱): ‘Ming-Qing ji yiminseng ‘hetaoshi’ lunxi – yi Tianran Hanshi chanshi wei lie’ 〈明清之際遺民僧「和陶詩」論析—以天然函昰禪師為例〉 (unpublished article, 2013 International Conference of Buddhist Thought and Culture, Taipei, Nov, 2013).
45 Burton Watson’s translation can be found in The Columbia Book of Chinese Poetry, pgs. 139-140.
46 Blind Hall, fascicle 4, pg. 30.
47 The passage in question states: ‘In the past, many of the sober became the same as drunkards because of wine. The drunk mind can still change. Sobriety is not of the same type, because drunken people can become sober. I have been stared at angrily by drunken people; in these angry stares there is much confusion. The more they are wounded, the more intoxicated they become. 往昔多醒者，被酒同醉人。醉心尚可易，醒亦非其倫。因醉乃有醒，嘗為醉人瞋。瞋中多雜亂，益傷人醉深，ibid, fascicle 4, pgs. 27-28.
48 Blind Hall, fascicle 4, pg. 30.
more tellingly, Tianran also links this ‘intoxication’ with Buddhist figures and Buddhist enlightenment. For instance, in one of his ‘Intoxicated Poems,’ Tianran makes the following implicit reference to the trance-like or ‘intoxicated’ detachment of the Song monastic ascetic-poet Shiwu Qinggong (石屋清珙 1272-1352/3):

In the case of the intoxicated person who falls from a cart,
How is not dying sufficient to atone for his transgressions?
A bitter mist builds up in the cold forest,
A light fragrance covers a stone hut
Hiding his head deep in the worn patchwork robe,
Not of transcendental truth, nor of the secular world;
This gentlemen has crossed over the land of dreams,
The smell of the wind is like that of India

醉者之墮車，不死焉足贖
苦霧積寒林，微香泛石屋。
破衲深蒙頭，不真亦不俗。
此士過華胥，風味似天竺。49

Shiwu – whose name means ‘Stone Hut’, and is thus alluded to in the text of the poem – was well known in the late-imperial era as an exemplary symbol of the dedicated Chan practitioner who lived an austere and solitary life of ascetic cultivation. Tianran seems to imply that Shiwu was in a state of ‘Chan intoxication’, which explains how he was able to be unaffected by his poverty and the austerity of his surroundings. Though living in a ‘cold’ forest (austere scenes being a feature of his poems), Shiwu, as though in a dream state, felt the winds of India – the ‘winds’ of the Buddha dharma. Shiwu could survive the rigours of his ascetic life, which arguably represent the mundane world, and was also able to transcend mundane existence. Tianran’s non-drinking ‘drinking’ poems promote the idea that being ‘Chan-intoxicated’ has both therapeutic and spiritual benefits for those dealing with difficult or trying circumstances. Furthermore, Chan intoxication could serve as a substitute for drinking alcohol – something that was both against the Buddhist precepts, and a habit which had harmful side effects for those not bound by Buddhist vows.50

However, there is perhaps additional significance in Tianran’s decision to express these ideas in poetry that imitated the famous ‘drunken poet’ Tao Yuanming. Given that Tao was a

49 Ibid, fascicle 4, pg. 28.
50 A discussion on this point has been made in He and Wu’s ‘Xiatang wugu yu Han, Wei, Liang Jin shi.’ See especially pg. 194, pgs. 200-201.
highly esteemed poet in loyalist communities, Tianran may have been trying to counter the role that the celebrated ‘drunken’ authors of antiquity may have had in increasing the allure of drunkenness and legitimising it. As Tianran stated in his preface to his ‘Not Drinking Wine’ poems, ‘When reading Tao Yuanming’s poems about drinking wine, I looked at the attendant monk and said: ‘Exalted gentleman-scholars of the secular world use wine to let their feelings out... How should we change this?’ 讀陶元亮飲酒時，顧侍僧曰：「世之高士，酒以陶情...當何易此？」.51 Similarly, in his preface to ‘Not Despising Wine,’ Tianran reinterprets a famous encounter dialogue between Tao and the renowned Eastern Jin poet-monk Huiyuan (惠遠 334-416). In this encounter dialogue, Tao asks Huiyuan if he could join an Amitabha recitation group while continuing to break the precept of not drinking. When Huiyuan agreed, Tao subsequently refused on principle. In Tianran’s retelling of this story, it is implied that what Huiyuan actually implied was that ‘intoxication’ was permissible, but this did not require the consumption of alcohol. Tao had not outwitted Huiyuan; he had simply not been able to comprehend the profound meaning of Huiyuan’s ‘intoxication’.

It should be noted that while Tianran had some sympathy for Tao – who had famously tried and failed to give up drinking – he was far less tolerant of many of the other famous ‘drunken’ poets of antiquity. As discussed in an analysis of Tianran’s ‘ancient form’ poems by He Zetang (何澤棠) and Wu Zeman (吳澤蔓), Tianran’s harshest criticisms were reserved for the earlier exponents of drinking poems, Ruan Ji (阮籍 210-263), Ji Kang (嵇康 223-263) and Song Rongzi (宋榮子), and he was also critical of a famous set of drinking poems – the so-called ‘Nineteen Ancient Poems’ (‘Gushi shijiu shou’) 〈古詩十九首〉 which Tianran himself imitated.52 These poetic ‘drunkards’ and this ‘drunken verse’ were in no way ‘profound’; they only promoted habits that were harmful.

In regard to Tianran’s reference to ‘exalted gentleman-scholars’, it is worth noting that both drinking with the aim of getting drunk and extolling this by reading or composing ‘drinking’ poems, were particularly prevalent in Ming loyalist communities. In Chinese literati culture, drinking and writing poetry were of course closely intertwined activities, but the fall of the Ming seems to have intensified these tendencies. The Records of Yunnan loyalists in the Declining Years of the Ming (Mingji Diannan yimin lu) 《明季滇南遺民錄》 (composed by

51 Blind Hall, fascicle 4, pg. 27.
52 ‘Xiatang wugu yu Han, Wei, Liang Jin shi.’ See especially pgs. 192-194, pg. 196, pgs. 200-201.
the late Qing/republican era scholar Qin Guangyu (秦光玉 1869-1948) claims that roughly half of the approximately 130 loyalists it examines had been inspired to write poetry about drinking and drunkenness or to write poetry when intoxicated. Qin also contends that in many cases the drunkenness of loyalists was inspired by their despair at the loss of their dynasty. 53

As noted, Tao Yuanming was highly revered in loyalist circles, where his status was matched only by Qu Yuan and perhaps by the Tang poet Du Fu. 54 It can be suggested that Tianran’s invocation of the notion of ‘Chan-intoxication’ may have stemmed from an attempt to influence ‘unhealthy’ poetic practices and the problems of alcohol abuse that were prevalent in loyalist communities. Tianran may have been attempting to provide a less deleterious alternative to drinking as part of a mission to provide pastoral care to loyalist communities in the chaos of the Ming-Qing transition.


Tianran’s ideas of ‘Chan intoxication’ appear to have implicitly drawn on an idea that Chinese poets had long promoted, that ‘intoxication’ could prompt spiritual insight and be a source of divine inspiration. 55 However, I would suggest that there was more to the idea of Chan intoxication than a form of spiritual ‘drunkenness’ that did not involve alcohol (which was against Buddhist precepts). I suggest that the references in the ‘Qingyuan Preface’ to ‘sleep talk,’ and the phrase I have rendered as ‘talking incoherently like an infant’ (popohehe 婆婆和和), give indications of some of the underlying concepts that Chan Intoxication entailed. There would appear to be parallels between the reference to ‘sleep talk’ and

---

53 Lanzhou: Lanzhou daxue chubanshe, 2003
54 Tao Yuanming’s high status in and influence on Ming loyalist communities is the theme of Li Jianfeng (李劍鋒) ‘Ming yimin dui Tao Yuanming de jieshou 〈明遺民對陶淵明的接受〉(Shandong daxue xuebao (Zhixue shehuikexue ban) 《山東大學學報（哲學社會科學版）》, Issue 1, 2010), pgs. 145-150. His reception amongst loyalists is also discussed in chapter 5 of Wendy Swartz’s Reading Tao Yuanming: Shifting Paradigms of Historical Reception (427-1900) (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 2008), pgs. 212-260. The loyalist reception of Tao, Du Fu and Qu Yuan is discussed briefly in Zhang Bing (張兵) ‘Ming-Qing yidai yu Qingchu yimin shi’ 〈明清易代與清初遺民詩〉, (Jianghai xuekan 《江海學刊》, Vol. 2, 2000, pgs. 149-154). The special status of Tao and Qu Yuan as models for many loyalist communities, especially the loyalist Jingyin Poetry Society, is the subject of the Master’s thesis of Hsieh Chung-hsi [謝崇熙]: ‘Qingchu Mingmo yimin de Qu-Tao lunshu’ 〈清初明末遺民的屈陶論述〉 (MA thesis, National Taiwan Normal University, 2008)
55 See, for instance, Tian Mingyang (田明揚) Jiu shi yu jiu shi 〈酒史與酒詩〉 (Taipei: Changchun shufang, 1984), and Liu Yang-chung [劉揚忠] Shi yu jiu 〈詩與酒〉 (Taipei: Wenjin chubanshe, 1994) and also the interesting discussion on pages 266-268 of Michael Fishlen ‘Wine, Poetry and History: Du Mu’s “Pouring Alone in the Prefectural Residence.”’ T’oung Pao, Vol. 80, Iss. 4/5, 1994), pgs.260-297.
Hanshan’s idea of ‘dream speech,’ a concept that, as we have noted previously, Liao Chao-heng has identified as a prominent theme in writings on literature and art in monasteries of the Ming-Qing era.\(^56\) I would also suggest that Tianran’s ‘Qingyuan preface’ shows signs of having been influenced by the poetics of the late-Ming Gongan school, in particular the idea that one should speak like – and be like – a child.

In this chapter and in earlier parts of the thesis, I have noted that the Gongan school had close affiliations with Buddhism and that it was famous for advocating that poetry should be authentic (i.e., \(zhen\)). It was also known for its critiques of the Ming school of poetics pejoratively known as the ‘archaists’ (\(fugu\) 復古派) or ‘formalists’ (\(gediaopai\) 格調派), a school which was criticised by its rivals for promoting ‘falsity’ by putting excessive emphasis on literary embellishment, and on mimicking the style of ‘ancient’ poets (especially poets from the late Han and the high Tang). We can argue that the claim in the ‘Qingyuan Preface’ that the difference between the present and the past was not that the present lacks people of talent who might be the object of songs of praise, but that such talent is made visible by the singing of praise, implicitly refutes the claim of the archaists that antiquity was superior to later times both in morality and in terms of literary quality. Hanshan’s associate Yuan Zongdao, for instance, once stated that ‘there is a distinction between antiquity and today in terms of time, and there is a distinction between antiquity and today in terms of language. How do we know that what people today admiringly refer to as marvellous words and profound sentences were not the common street-talk of antiquity?’夫時有古今，語言亦有古今。今人所詫謂奇字奧句，安知非古之街談巷語耶？\(^57\) For the Gongan school, the problem of mimicking the ancients, like the problem of excessive literary embellishment, was that it was not \(zhen\), and it did not express the ‘true’ or ‘genuine mind’ of the author.’ Tianran’s statement in the ‘Qingyuan Preface’ that the speech of those who are intoxicated – and, by inference, those who are ‘Chan intoxicated’ – is like the speech of a child, can perhaps be seen as echoing the Gongan school idea that \(zhen\) speech stemmed from the ‘childlike mind’ (\(tongxin\) 童心). The idea of the childlike mind is explained by Yuan Zongdao, quoting the famous \textit{Book to be Burned} of Li Zhi, who is often categorised by modern


\(^{57}\) ‘Discourses’ (\textit{Lunwen: (shang)}) (論文(上)) (in \textit{Classified Collection of the Baisu Study} (Bai Suzhai lei ji) 《白蘇齋類集》 (Siku Banned Books Series (Siku jinhui shu congkan) 《四庫禁燬書叢刊》, Vol. 1, (Beijing: Beijing chuban she, 2000), fascicle 20).
scholars as an adherent of the radical branch of the Wang Yangming School of Mind:

The childlike mind is the genuine mind (zhenxin)... Pure zhen that brings falsehood to an end, it is the original mind of the very first thought. If one loses one’s childlike mind, then one loses one’s genuine mind; losing one’s genuine mind, one loses the genuine person (zhenren)... In all cases the greatest literature under heaven comes out of the childlike mind.

夫童心者，真心也...絕假純真，最初一念之本心也。若失卻童心變失卻真心也，失卻真心則失卻真人...天下之至文未有不出於童心焉者也. 58

The concept of the ‘childlike mind’ was one of the most famous of Li Zhi’s ideas. (It was perhaps itself inspired by Mengzi’s idea of the ‘mind of the infant’ (赤子之心)). In Yuan Hongdao’s deployment of Li Zhi’s concept, the ‘childlike mind’ is not only the basis of zhen poetry, but can also be equated directly with the ‘genuine mind’ – the ‘original mind of the very first thought’ – and with the ‘genuine person’, which Li Zhi related to the idea of the ‘genuine Buddha.’ Li stated that the ‘Buddha is a bundle of zhen, so when a zhen person exists in the world we know that the zhen Buddha exists, and because there is the zhen Buddha, one naturally loves this zhen person’ 佛是真者，故世有真人，然後知有真佛；有真佛，故自然愛此真人也. 59 The ‘mundane’ genuineness of the ‘authentic’ zhen person and the ‘transcendental’ or ‘religious’ zhen of the Buddhas are inextricably bound to each other.

This line of thinking seems to be one endorsed by Tianran and his school. In the ‘Preface to the Poetry Collection of Zhou Yongfu’ (‘Zhou Yongfu shiji xu’ 〈周庸夫詩集序〉), Tianran’s principal disciple Jinshi Dangui 60 criticises those in the present who ‘use the clothes and hats

58 See Li’s ‘Disquisition on the Child-like Mind’ (‘Tongxin shuo’), in Book to be Burned, pgs. 97-99. Both Li and Yuan’s literary theories are introduced in James J. Y. Liu’s Chinese Theories of Literature, pgs. 78-83.
59 In Book to be Burnt (Fenshu), fascicle 4 – ‘The Meaning of the Three Great Events’ (‘San da shixiang yi’) 〈三大事像議〉.
60 The most important sources for information on Dangui’s life are Wu Tianren (吳天任) Dangui chanshi nianpu 《澹歸禪師年譜》 (Hong Kong: Zhilian jingshe, Rpt. 1991); and Duan (ed.) Hall of All-Pervading Movement. Dangui is briefly discussed in a number of works on early Qing ‘loyalist’ monks, notably Chen Yuan (陳垣) Qingchu seng zheng ji, pgs. 90-91. Dangui’s exploits, and the controversies surrounding his life, are discussed by Xian Yuqing (冼玉清) in her article ‘Tan Dangui heshang’ 〈談澹歸和尚〉 (Yilin cong lu 《藝林叢錄》, No. 9, Sept. 1973), cited in Liao Chao-heng’s ‘Jinshi Dangui zhi wenyiguan yu shici chuangzuo xilun: jian tan ji wai shiwen lian pian’ 〈今釋澹歸之文藝觀與詩詞創作析論: 兼探集外佚文兩篇〉 (in Yang (ed.) Tianran zhi guang), pgs. 228 (see below). Recent articles include: Li Fubiao (李福標) (2006) ‘Cong Bianxing tang ji kan seng Dangui de shiwen pipping’ 〈從〈徧行堂集〉看僧澹歸的詩文批評〉 (in Zhong (ed.) Bei zhi chuan xiang, pgs. 183-197); Li Shunchen (李舜臣) ‘Shi Dangui ji qi shiwen’ 〈釋澹歸及其詩文〉 (in Zhong (ed.) Bei zhi chuan xiang, pp. 166-182); Liao Chao-heng’s ‘Jinshi Dangui zhi wenyiguan yu shici chuangzuo xilun,’
of the ancients to conceal their own faces, and then go further by borrowing the faces of the ancients and adding clothes and hats to them.' 世乃有以古人之衣冠自掩其面目，復借古人之面目加以衣冠。 Dangui argues that the author should be motivated primarily by the desire to reveal his own thoughts honestly and spontaneously and should not bother about whether he appears ‘contemporary’ or ‘ancient’ in doing so. For Dangui, this capacity to use poetry as a tool for ‘manifesting’ the person finds a theoretical foundation in a radical identification between poetry and the author – that ‘the face of a poem is used to create a likeness of one’s own face’詩之面目適以自肖其面目。 Dangui later in this preface stated that because Zhou Yongfu did not try to appear either ‘contemporary’ or ‘ancient,’ his poems were ‘genuine poems’ (zhenshi 真詩) that revealed his ‘genuine face’ (真面目). This arguably has religious meaning. Only by being truly zhen, by composing zhen poetry, can one reveal, and even communicate, one’s ‘zhen face’ or one’s ‘genuine mind.’

‘Words’ and the ‘Mind’: Tianran’s Preface to Dangui’s Collection from the Hall of All-Pervading Movement

Dangui’s ideas on the religious value of poetry as a manifestation of the mind and the ‘face’ of the author seem to have resonated strongly with those of Tianran. Some of Tianran’s own views of these questions can be seen in his preface to Dangui’s Collection from the Hall of All-Pervading Movement, which discusses how an author’s words are related to his mind. This preface (which, unlike the other prefaces discussed in this chapter, does not appear in Tianran’s Recorded Sayings collection) was composed in or soon after 1674. Its full title (which was given to the piece by its editors and not by Tianran himself) is ‘Preface [Composed by] the Thirty-fourth Caodong [Patriarch] and Abbot of the Guizong [Temple] of Lushan The Monk Tianran [Han]shi’ 〈曹洞三十四世住盧山歸宗天然昰和尚序〉. As its title perhaps indicates, this preface is not literary

61 Hall of All-Pervading Movement (II), pgs. 200-201.
62 Ibid.
63 Ibid, pg. 201.
64 Dangui in his ‘Causes and Conditions for The Collection of the Hall of All-Pervading Movement’ states: ‘my attendants edited and recorded [my writings] up to jiayin (1674). Altogether there are 40 fascicles. The title is The Collection of the Hall of All-Pervading Movement ‘門人編輯，迄於甲寅。凡四十卷，目曰《徧行堂集》 (Hall of All-Pervading Movement (I), pg. 8).
criticism in the strict sense, but serves to convey a perspective on literature that comes from Tianran’s position as a cleric.

Tianran begins the preface by noting that when he first read the manuscript of the *Collection of the Hall of All-Pervading Movement*, which Dangui submitted to him when it was about to be published, he was particularly struck by the idea that:

A person has words in the same way that he has a mind. One’s mind cannot hide from one’s words in the same way that one’s words cannot hide from one’s mind. Because there can be no hiding from words, the world’s words are considered valuable. Because there can be no hiding from the mind, the minds of the world are considered valuable.

人之有言, 如其有心也。夫心之不能遯於其言, 亦猶言不能遯於其心也。不能遯於其言, 故天下之言為可貴; 不能遯於其心, 故天下之心為可貴也。66

Tianran proceeds to state that because of the value that is attached to words, writers strive to outdo each other in displays of rhetorical skill, and they follow many different paths in pursuit of this goal. Particular categories of writers produce works that express particular types of virtue. The writings of loyal ministers, for example, are ‘melancholy and far reaching’ 憂而遠, those of righteous people are ‘honest and uninhibited’ 方以捨, while ‘the words of one who has had misfortune are sorrowful’ 失運者其詞悲, and the writing of someone ‘who has entered deeply into principles is sincere to the greatest possible degree and is never slanderous’ 入理深者盡曲款[敘]而弗誣.67 Next, Tianran highlights the relationship between plain writing and the enlightened mind, stating that the works of those ‘who have obtained true awakening are extremely plain and easy to understand and surpass others, dealing with matters without leaving an imprint’ 獲真悟者極淺易而絕人以無行地.68

In the next section of the preface, Tianran asserts that the value of words is determined by whether or not the mind that produces them is valuable. Where emotions and attainments are forced or feigned, the writings that are produced by them are inevitably corrupted. The appearance of melancholy (supposedly the characteristic attribute of a loyal minister) might ‘arise from seeking a name for oneself’ 念起于近名; equally one ‘may force oneself to be

66 *Hall of All-Pervading Movement* (I), pg. 2.
full of familial yearning, but one’s sentiments are produced by following fixed literary rules 勉為慕而情生于循理; a lack of inhibition (supposedly the characteristic attribute of a righteous person) might result from impulsiveness 捨以任氣, while sorrowfulness – the quality of one who has met with misfortune – can be damaged by feelings of resentment 悲而傷于怨. The sincerity of such writings will be minimal and their rigidity (板滯) will not be recognised. Authors will think that they have ‘passed beyond other people and their earthly traces’, but they will be unaware that this is because ‘their own feet are not planted on the ground’ 以為絕人行地而不知脚板已弗底于四楞. These works, Tianran states, are ‘profoundly unvaluable’ 甚不可貴.69

Tianran declares that wise and virtuous people regard the cultivation of the mind as being more important than the refinement of literary skill, stating that ‘all the genuine sages and people of great distinction and those with genuine talent and wisdom put aside considerations of rhetorical ingenuity, and seek the person of talent in a place of profound stillness and introspection’ 天下真聖賢、真才智, 遂有置文章機穎而求人于淵嘿自存之地.70 This principle will not be grasped by those who ‘have separated words and the mind into two different entities’ 言與心乃判然分為二致 and those who do not understand that the mind and words ‘cannot hide from each other’ 不知實有不能相遁.71 Such people are only concerned about the impression their words leave upon others, and are not concerned with the mental cultivation of the writer – they ‘have for a long time not only been silent about the minds of those who make the words, but have also been noisily ebullient about the minds of those who contemplate the words’ 悄然于為言者之心, 亦自釐然于觀言者之心抑已久矣.72

Tianran then explains the statements ‘one’s mind cannot hide from one’s words’ and ‘one’s words cannot hide from one’s mind’, invoking Buddhist concepts to do so. When someone who is without phenomenal thought suddenly engages in phenomenal thought (忽有念) the goodness or badness of this thought will be reflected in the goodness or badness of the words that express it. However, it can happen that thoughts that are good are expressed in words that appear to be bad or thoughts that are bad are expressed in words that appear to be good. What

69 Ibid.
70 Ibid.
71 Ibid.
72 Ibid.
is decisive is the nature of the underlying thoughts, not the words that express those thoughts. Tianran states that ‘the mind cannot deceive itself’ 心皆不能自昧 and this is what is meant by the statement that words are ‘unable to hide from the mind’ 此所謂言之不能遯於其心者也. With regard to the idea that the mind is ‘unable to hide from words,’ Tianran states that even when one is deceived about the nature of one’s own thoughts, the words one speaks can be relied upon to reveal the goodness or evil of those thoughts (苟其昧于善與惡而不能自覺,則亦無所掩著于為言之日矣). By the same token, someone who is not deceived about the nature of his inner thoughts ‘will look at himself as if he were ‘seeing his lungs and liver’ 若果不能自昧, 人之視己如見肺肝. Tianran states that his strong desire to read Dangui’s work comes from the fact that ‘Dangui is certainly one who values the minds of the world, and this, together with the world, is visible in his words’ 澹歸固貴天下之心者，而與天下共相見于其言.

After he has praised Dangui in these terms, Tianran cautions that it is not always a straightforward task to discern the mind of the author from his words: ‘The words might be obscure, but the mind is actually not obscure. The words might appear to be clear, but the mind is actually not clear. The words might be morally correct, but the mind is actually not morally correct. The words might be irregular, but the mind is actually not irregular.’ 言而幽,心固匪幽. 言面顯, 心固匪顯. 言而正, 心固匪正. 言而旁, 心固匪旁. Tianran then asks the following questions: ‘If the mind is not irregular, then how do the words get to be irregular?’ 心匪旁, 言豈得旁? ‘If the mind is not obscure, then how do the words get to be obscure?’ 心匪幽, 言豈得幽? Having posed these questions, Tianran raises the more profound issue of whether the sounds that emanate from nature can reveal the minds of sentient and non-sentient natural phenomena. He asks:

If we broaden this and push it further, birds and beasts also have minds; so what do their calls and cries say? Heaven and earth also have minds; so of what do the sun, moon, stars and planets speak? Of what do the mountains, rivers, hills

---

73 Ibid.
74 Ibid. pg. 2-3.
75 Ibid. pg. 3.
76 Ibid.
77 Ibid.
78 Ibid.
and valleys speak?

又曠而推之，鳥獸亦有心，啼號何云？天地亦有心，日月星辰何說？山川陵谷何說？

Tianran wonders if there is a more profound dimension underlying Dangui’s collection: To what extent are Dangui’s words similar to ‘those things that ‘radiate by day and by night without the slightest pause’? Do Dangui’s writings pertain to the realm of existence, or the realm of non-existence? – Tianran suggests that only Dangui knows the precise answer to these questions. 熾然于晝與夜而略無間歇者，寘置此集于其中，孰多孰少，為有為無，此自澹歸事。 Tianran concludes the preface by saying that it is clear to others and to Tianran himself that Dangui’s attainments have surpassed Tianran’s own. 老人與天下後世且得瞠然觀勝拙矣.

Tianran’s key implicit message in this preface is that non-Buddhist literature (including poetry) composed by a cultivated monk, and especially the literary works of someone like his eminent disciple Dangui, has special moral and soteriological benefits. Because the thoughts and sentiments of the eminent monk are morally and spiritually wholesome, his ‘words’ must necessarily be wholesome, even if they might be deficient in literary refinement, and even if they appear to be not ‘wholesome’ at all, and even if they seem to be addressing matters far removed from the proper concerns of monks. Valuable words are valuable because they convey the spiritual quality of the mind that utters them. These valuable words can be contrasted with the valueless words of those who try to cover over deficiencies in character or spiritual cultivation by manipulating language for rhetorical effect or by giving a false impression of goodness.

The ideas Tianran expresses in this preface resonate with concepts that were widespread in his day, especially those commonly expressed by secular advocates of literary authenticity. Firstly, Tianran advises against both imitation and placing too much attention upon rhetorical skill, a stance which seems to echo literary critiques of the works of the Archaists. In addition, he argues that poetry of genuine value must necessarily stem from a cultivated mind – an idea that was a core tenet of the literary thought of Qian

---

79 Ibid. 
80 Ibid. 
81 Ibid.
Qianyi, a theorist of *xingqing* (‘innate nature and sentiments’ or ‘character and feeling’), an advocate of poetic ‘genuineness,’ and an associate of Tianran and his lineage. This idea of the importance of the mind accords with ideals found in the literary theories of Fang Yizhi and Daosheng, and in particular with their use of Doctrine of the Mean theory. Tianran’s reference to the importance of ‘seeking the person of talent in a place of profound stillness and introspection’, seems to echo Daosheng’s idea that the voicing of ‘indignation’ without the tempering effects of ‘cessation’ and ‘stillness’ can readily descend into ‘resentment’ or ‘wanton hatred.’ The cultivation of the mind is what is required for the production of genuine writing. In this regard, I would suggest that Tianran’s ideas are not so much derived from literary theory as from Buddhist doctrine. In particular, I would argue that he draws from a core notion in karma theory: the idea of the karmic classification of ‘thought’ and ‘speech’.

*Wholesome Cetanā, Wholesome Vāk-karman and Goodness in Words and in the Mind*

My contention that karma theory plays a central role in Tianran’s ideas about the moral and spiritual power of ‘genuine’ literary works is based on a reading of the passage in this preface which explains Tianran’s principle that ‘one’s mind cannot hide from one’s words in the same way that one’s words cannot hide from one’s mind.’ The full text of this section of the preface reads as follows:

> When a person who has been without phenomenal thought (無念) suddenly engages in phenomenal thought (忽有念), one simply knows that it cannot but be very clear. When the thought is good, it is expressed in words that are good and cannot be hidden. When the thought is not good, but is expressed in words that are good, or when the thought is good, but is called into question as a result of words that are not good, or it begins by being good, but ends up not being good, or begins by not being good, but ends up being good, the mind cannot deceive itself. This is what is meant by words not being able to hide from the mind.

> If one is deceived about goodness or evil, and is unable to awaken oneself, this cannot be concealed at the times when one speaks. If a person cannot deceive himself, then he will look at himself as if he were ‘seeing his lungs and liver’; this is precisely ‘the mind being unable to hide from words’, and it can be

---

83 For a comprehensive study of Qian Qianyi’s poetics see Yim The Poet Historian Qian Qianyi, in particular Part 1: ‘Qian Qianyi’s Theories of Shishi and Historical Contexts,’ pgs. 13-78. For a more thorough discussion on Qian Qianyi’s *xingqing* theory, its emphasis on *zhēn*, and its contrast with contemporary ideas emphasising ‘orthodoxy’ of innate nature and sentiments through poetic imitation, or through an emphasis on poetic form, see Chen Li-chun [Chen Lichun] (陳麗純) ‘Mingmo Qingchu *xingqing* shilun yanjiu – yì Chen Zilong, Qian Qianyi wei kaocha duixiang’ 〈明末清初性情詩論研究－－以陳子龍、錢謙益為考察對象〉 (MA thesis, National Sun Yat-sen University, 2003), especially pgs. 163-169, 186-191, 226-228.
In this passage, Tianran suggests that even if one is not clear about the moral status of one’s thoughts, the goodness or badness in one’s thinking at the moment of writing will necessarily be projected in one’s words. The speaker (or writer) must strive to produce ‘good’ thoughts, and must also be aware of the ‘goodness’ or ‘evil’ of his thoughts, because this is a precondition for ensuring that he produces only ‘good words.’ Words are to be valued in part because they provide a window into the goodness or badness of one’s mind. They can serve as a tool for self-reflection, and can also serve as a tool for conveying one’s inner state to others.

At first glance, these ideas appear to be self-evident truths. However, I would suggest that in this part of the text Tianran is subtly invoking Buddhist styles of argumentation – something that would doubtless have been clearly discernible to a learned Buddhist disciple reading the text. Where the early parts of the text identify literature with the character of the author and with Confucian virtues, when Tianran starts to discuss the situation in which ‘a person who has been without phenomenal thought (無念) suddenly engages in phenomenal thought (忽有念)’ he shifts to questions that correlate with Buddhist karma theory, and in particular the doctrine that the karma of ‘speech’ (kouye 口業, vāk-karman) is based on the karma of the ‘thought’ – or more precisely the ‘intention’ (si 思, cetanā) – that instigates the speech. Whether speech is deemed to be karmically good, bad or netural depends on the status of the thought that inspires or accompanies it.

These arguments are common in the Chinese Buddhist canon. We can find an example of the underlying concepts in the following passage from the encyclopaedic *Record of the Mirror of...* 

---

84 *Collection of the Hall of All-Pervading Movement (I),* pgs. 2-3
The mind is the foundation of phenomena. The mind is paramount and the mind is the instigator; if the mind’s thoughts are evil, it affects words and it affects actions. Evil and suffering naturally follow, like the wheel of a cart grinding pebbles in a rut…If the mind’s thoughts are good, it affects words and it affects actions. Good fortune and happiness naturally follow, just as the shadow follows the body. In this way, the profound gate points directly to the base of the mind (bodhicitta). It is like a treasure within a sack; if one does not explore and reveal it, who can know about it?

This passage emphasises the importance of observing and cultivating the mind. It states that the karma created by speech or action is determined by the karmic classification of the ‘thought’ that instigates the speech that follows from it. In most places in this text Yanshou uses ordinary Chinese words rather than Buddhist technical vocabulary, and I would suggest that the words ‘mind’ (xin 心) and ‘thought’ (nian 念) that are used in Tianran’s preface and in Yanshou’s passage can be read as corresponding with the more precise term ‘intention’ (si 思, cetanā) found in older Buddhist sources, while the term translated as ‘words’ or ‘speech’ (yan 言) used by Yanshou and Tianran conveys much the same idea as the Buddhist scholastic term kouye 口業 or yuye 語業 (vāk-karman, ‘karma of speech’). Similarly, I would suggest that Tianran’s and Yanshou’s terms ‘good’ (shan 善) and ‘evil’ (e 惡) are equivalent to the dualism between dharmas that are kuśala, often translated as ‘wholesome’ or ‘skilful’ (shan 善) and those that are akuśala, often translated as ‘unwholesome’ or ‘unskilful’ (bushan 不善). However, we can also contend that there is not a precise correspondence between the

---

85 Dharmapada Sutra (Fa ju jing)《法句經》, fascicle 1: (CBETA, T04, no. 210, p. 562, a13-16); ‘Chapter on the Guide to [Achieving] Intuitive Verification – Part 3,’ Record of the Mirror of Orthodoxy (Zongjing lu)《宗鏡錄》fascicle 94: (CBETA, T48, no. 2016, p. 929, a15-17); The Mysterious Pivot of Contemplating the Mind (Guan xin xuan-ou) 《觀心玄樞》fascicle 1, (CBETA, X65, no. 1290, p. 429, e20-22 // Z 2:19, p. 426, d8-10 // R114, p. 852, b8-10). We may note also the Chinese translation by Kumārajiva (344-413 CE) of a passage from the ‘Chapter on the Relative Weight of the Three Karmas (199)’ by Harivarman (4th C. CE) Satyasiddhi-śāstra (Cheng shi lun) 《成實論》: ‘You say that the karma of the body and of the mouth is weighty, but the karma of thought is not. That is not the case. Why is this? In the sutras, the Buddha said: ‘The mind is the foundation of phenomena. The mind is paramount; the mind is the guide. The mind’s thoughts are good or evil and this affects words and affects actions. Thus it should be known that the weightier is the karma of thought.’” 原言身口業重，非意業者。是事不然。所以者何？經中佛說：‘心為法本，心尊心導，心念善惡，即言即行’。故知意業為重。Fascicle 9: (CBETA, T32, no. 1646, p. 307, b7-10).
traditional concepts of the karmic classification of thoughts and speech and the vaguer and broader terms used by Tianran and Yanshou, and this has implications for Tianran’s arguments in the passage. ‘Mind’ and ‘intention’ are not fully identical with each other.

In judging the value of an author’s writing, great emphasis needs be placed on that author’s mental cultivation. This is because the goodness or otherwise of an author’s intention can in some cases be disconnected from, or even the inverse of, the sentiments or aspirations that his writings appear to advertise. ‘Secular’ poetry that conveys sentiments or aspirations that appear plebeian or defiled – those that express negative emotions, immorality or worldly attachment or which are not expressed in a refined way – may in fact emanate from the purest ‘intention’. We can suggest that Tianran implies that such seemingly defiled poetry can be considered genuine because it is not devised to create a flattering impression of the author, so it truly conveys the goodness of his ‘mind.’ What this means is that if the author’s mind is pure or ‘good,’ his writings must also be good, even if what is written appears on the surface to be ‘impure’ or ‘bad.’ By extension, the ‘goodness’ of the good person’s words will influence readers and will come to have a positive moral effect upon, or make good or pure, the ‘minds’ of other people. We can also argue that valuing the impact that one’s words can have on the mind of others has a connection to the author valuing the state of his own mind. Furthermore, the need that people have to protect and value their own minds should lead them to value the (non-Buddhist or secular) poetry of monks, since this poetry conveys purity of mind, even though it may express itself in words that appear defiled.

Identifying ‘Words’ of the Enlightened with the ‘Buddha Mind’: Genuine Poetry

Tianran’s arguments about the power of poetry to lead people to enlightenment were not restricted to its capacity to communicate the moral state of its author. There was another, deeper level through which poetry communicated its message: this is arguably what is conveyed by the section of the text that asks about what is communicated by non-human entities:

Heaven and earth also have minds; so of what do the sun, moon, stars and planets speak? Of what do the mountains, rivers, hills and valleys speak? If we place this collection by Dangui among those things that ‘radiate by day and by night without the slightest pause’, then the questions of ‘what has the most and what has the least’, and of whether it is in the realm of existence or of non-existence will be
matters for Dangui himself.

天地亦有心，日月星辰何說？山川陵谷何說？熾然于晝與夜而略無間歇者，寘[置]澹歸此集于其中，孰多孰少，為有為無，此自澹歸事。87

Here Tianran appears to invoke a doctrine that is commonplace in the Chan tradition: the theory that ‘non-sentient phenomena speak the dharma’ (無情說法). For instance, we can see similarities between this passage and the *Extensive Records of Chan Master Yunmen Kuangzhen* (Yunmen Kuangzhen chanshi guanglu) 《雲門匡真禪師廣錄》, which states: ‘suddenly he heard a sound within and was awakened. What transgression have any of the mountains, rivers, the great earth, sun, moon and stars committed?’ 忽然者裏聞聲悟了。一切山河大地日月星辰有什麼過？88 Furthermore, the line referring ‘to things that radiate by day and by night without the slightest pause’ (熾然于晝與夜而略無間歇者) is a paraphrase of the statement ‘speak continuously and speak radiantly without the slightest pause’ 常說、熾然說、無間歇, which appears in numerous places in the Chan canon. The saying is typically attributed to the Tang monk Nanyang Huizhong (南陽慧忠？-775). Tianran’s understanding of what this meant may have been informed by a well known passage that appears in both the *Extensive Records of the Monk Yongjue* (Yongjue heshang guang lu) 《永覺和尚廣錄》 (published during Tianran’s times, in 1657),89 and the *Jade Forest Primer of the Chan Monastery* (Chan yuan mengqiu yaolin) 《禪苑蒙求瑤林》 (1225).90 Both these sources quote Huizhong’s statement as follows:

A monk asked the Preceptor of State Huizhong: ‘What is the mind of the ancient Buddhas like?’ The Preceptor of State said: ‘Walls and Tiles.’ The monk said: ‘Do they also speak of the dharma?’ The Preceptor of State said: ‘they speak continuously; they speak radiantly and without the slightest pause.’

僧問忠國師：「如何是古佛心？」國師云：「墙壁、瓦礫」。僧云：「還說法也無？」國師云：「常說、熾然說、無間歇」。91

By invoking this reference Tianran is implying that the ‘words’ of the elevated monk not only communicate his mind, but, like the ‘sounds’ of natural and other (inanimate) physical

---

87 *Collection of the Hall of All-Pervading Movement* (I), pg. 3.
91 See Footnote 521.
phenomena, are capable of conveying the universal ‘mind’ – the ‘Buddha nature’ that pervades all things. The implicit assertion is that such words express moments where the mind of the author achieves union with the universal ‘Buddha mind’.

This sense of a higher religious meaning being communicated in Dangui’s writing and in his non-Buddhist poetry in particular, a communication that involved things that did not on the surface appear to be ‘speaking the dharma’, was arguably linked to the mission of Dangui (and Tianran) to minister to people who did not have conventional Buddhist backgrounds. Dangui was the leader of a large religious community and was required to dedicate a significant amount of poetry to potential donors to his order. In his Hall of All-Pervading Movement, he claimed that the title of ‘poet-monk’ was derogatory for an authentic monastic practitioner, and in several places Dangui casts doubt on the religious value of his own writings. It may be that Tianran wanted to assure his disciple that his literary collection both had religious merit and fitted with his clerical identity. We can argue that this was part of a broader concern on Tianran’s part to bring ‘secular’ poetry into the realm of Buddhist cultivation, whether it was written by monks or by lay people.

From Intensity of Sentiment to the Stillness of Nature – ‘Preface to the Poems of the

92 Lin Zixiong states that poems expressing personal appreciation and reciprocal courtesy works constitute the majority of the poems in Dangui’s Hall of All-Pervading Movement, and that Dangui probably used writing as a means or a medium for interacting with people (‘Tianran yu Dangui,’ in Yang (ed.) Tianran zhi guang, pg. 87 – For a similar account, see Zhong Dong (鍾東) ‘Qingchu Biechuan si shiseng jianshu’ (清初別傳寺詩僧簡述), (in Zhong (ed.) Bei zhi chuan xiang), pg. 153). Similarly, Li Shunchen (李舜臣) states that around 70% of Dangui’s poems were ‘courtesy and matching responses (酬答/次韻),’ which ‘clearly reflects the breadth of Dangui’s acquaintances’ (‘Shi Dangui ji qi shiwen,’ (釋澹歸及其詩文), (in Zhong (ed.) Bei zhi chuan xiang), pg. 178). Many poems of this type, as noted by Yang Quan, are addressed to people with relatively senior ranks in the military or the civil service, such as ‘General’ 将軍, ‘Prefect’ 太守, ‘Regional Commander’ 總戎, ‘Vice Censor-in-chief’ 中丞, ‘Provincial Governor’ 撫軍, and ‘Provincial Administration Commissioner’ 方伯 (see ‘Lun Jinzhong’ (論今種) (unpublished working paper contained in the ‘Jinian Tianran chanshi danchen sihai zhounian xueshu yantaohui’, conference proceedings from the ‘Conference Held in Commemoration of the 400th Anniversary of the Birth of Chan Master Tianran,’ pg. 105). See also Liao’s Zhongxiao puti, pg. 20.

93 In his ‘Causes and Conditions for the Collection of the Hall of All-Pervading Movement’ (‘Bianxingtang ji yuanqi’ (徧行堂集緣起), Dangui compares his situation to that of the Tang-dynasty poet Han Yu (韓愈 768-825), whose substantial literary talents were put to work in the lowly vocation of composing tombstone inscriptions. Dangui stated further that ‘literature relating to stories of cause and effect are the lowest forms for the sangha; those who read this compendium in later times should take me as a warning’ 因緣文字, 僧中之下流也, 後之閱是集者, 當以予為戒. See Hall of All-Pervading Movement (I), pg. 9.
Three Eminent Scholars of Wuzhong

It seems that Tianran not only believed that the ‘secular’ poetry of a cultivated monk like Dangui had religious meaning but that the poetic writings of ‘secular’ authors could also contain content that was of spiritual benefit. This applied even to poetry by lay-people that expressed feelings of great intensity. Tianran’s ‘Preface to the “Poems of the Three Eminent Scholars of Wuzhong”’ (‘Wuzhong sanzi shi xu’ 〈吳中三子詩序〉) can serve as an example of this. This preface is contained in Tianran’s Recorded Sayings collection. It cannot be dated because the full names of the ‘gentlemen’ whose work this preface introduces have not been given, and no detailed information has been provided on the location or date of Tianran’s meeting with them.

In the first section of the preface Tianran discusses the relationship between sentiments, the dao and poetry. He states that sentiments of great intensity can return to the dao, and that the dao can be infused in sentiments: ‘The dao is something to which sentiments revert when they have reached their utmost point 道也者，情之至而歸焉者也. Sentiments are something in which the dao resides when it turns back to itself’ 情也者，道之反而寄焉者. Poetry, Tianran argues, is something that ‘begins in sentiment and ends in the dao’ 詩也者，始乎情而終乎道者也; moreover, it is only when sentiments have reached their ‘ultimate extent’ that they can be expressed in words 情不極則不能言. When words are exhausted, one ‘falls mute and loses oneself’ 追言窮情盡，啞然自喪. In such a silent state the self becomes at one with the world – ‘one then begins to be aware of the sounds of trees and the notes of birds and the movement of wind and the rising of clouds; one encounters them as if they were an old acquaintance, meeting and mixing like water and milk’ 始知樹聲禽韻，風動雲起，相遇如故知；相合若水乳. Poets and other noble people can attain a state in which they ‘become of one mind with the dao and do not know it of themselves’ 高人韻士往往與道冥合而不自知. In this state, according to Tianran, ‘perfection’ can perhaps be attained 其或至

95 Recorded Sayings, fascicle 12: (CBETA, J38, no. B406, p. 192, b22).
Having set out these principles, Tianran then proceeds to discuss the impression he gained after meeting and reading the poetry of the ‘three scholars’ – identified as Squire Cao of Wuzhong (吴中曹公), Squire Xu of Kuangshi (匡石許公) and Squire Gong of Shenye (深野龔公). He states that the three scholars passed their poems to him and asked him to compose a preface for them while they were travelling together through Guangdong. He observes that their poems bring out the distinctive areas of strength of each author: the poems of Squire Cao display ‘purity and antique dignity’ 清古, those of Squire Xu are characterised by ‘splendour and singularity’ 豔異 and those of Squire Gong exhibit ‘glory and majesty’ 壯麗. He praises them collectively as ‘great examples of boldness and lack of inhibition’ 慷慨淋漓之致.\textsuperscript{101}

In the last section, Tianran brings together his positive appraisal of the abilities of these poets with the ideas stated earlier in the preface about the relationship between sentiment, the language of poetry and the dao. With regard to the capacity of poetry to express the feelings of the author, he states that that as a monk he does not know by what events these writers are moved or ‘what the mind is that is wounded’ 予世外人,終不知其所感何事，所傷何心.\textsuperscript{102} However, he recognises that men of letters, being ‘intelligent and unpretentious’ people, cannot help but have strong sentiments 文人慧業，未免有情.\textsuperscript{103} Tianran observes that when these people have intense emotions pent up within them, these emotions often burst out through words in a manner that is abrupt and powerful like a violent storm: ‘their abrupt movement is like thunder and their sudden downpour is like rain’ 其忽動也如雷；其[雨/浸]霪也如雨.\textsuperscript{104} Tianran then remarks that thunder and rain ‘come from nowhere’ when they arise 雷轟雨霪，無所從 and ‘go to nowhere’ when they cease. 雷收雨歇，去無所至,\textsuperscript{105} and he intimates that poets likewise do not appear to know themselves from where these sentiments and words come and where they go to rest. Nonetheless, when the ‘words are used up and sentiments come to rest’ 言盡情歇, a calm arises after the storm, a state where ‘the sun and

\textsuperscript{100} Recorded Sayings, fascicle 12: (CBETA, J38, no. B406, p. 192, b25).
\textsuperscript{101} Recorded Sayings, fascicle 12: (CBETA, J38, no. B406, p. 192, b27-29).
\textsuperscript{102} Recorded Sayings, fascicle 12: (CBETA, J38, no. B406, p. 192, b29).
\textsuperscript{103} Recorded Sayings, fascicle 12: (CBETA, J38, no. B406, p. 192, b30).
\textsuperscript{104} Recorded Sayings, fascicle 12: (CBETA, J38, no. B406, p. 192, b30-c01).
\textsuperscript{105} Recorded Sayings, fascicle 12: (CBETA, J38, no. B406, p. 192, c01-2).
stars shine clearly’日星郎然. In this calm people experience a sense of commingling with others – ‘when we look at each other it is as if it were in a mirror; is it not like meeting an old friend or like water and milk blending?’面面相覷，如在鏡中，將為故知遇乎，將為水乳合乎? For Tianran this demonstrates that poetry ‘begins in sentiment and ends in the dao’詩也者，始乎情而終乎道者也. Echoing what he states earlier in the preface, Tianran opines that the three scholars are people who are continuously in the dao and are not aware that this is the case 三公日在道而不自知. This, he suggests, perhaps marks the attainment of perfection 其或至也.

The contents of this preface and its ideas about poetic authenticity and its religious benefits resonate with the views expressed in Tianran’s preface for Dangui’s Hall of All-Pervading Movement. Tianran praises the three authors for expressing their own inner qualities and for writing in an authentic manner. However, the view that poetry can reveal the mind of the author is presented differently from what is found in Tianran’s preface to Dangui’s collection. Rather than focusing on the author’s capacity to express his inner ‘goodness,’ Tianran focuses on the the idea of the sentiments that are expressed in poetry ‘reaching their utmost point’; he states that when sentiments (including those which might appear on the surface to be ‘defiled’) reach their utmost point they revert to the dao.

There seem to be marked similarities between Tianran’s ideas in this preface and the poetic theories of Daosheng and Fang Yizhi. The text may be seen as alluding to the common maxim that high poetry ‘emanates from sentiment’ and ‘comes to rest’ in ‘the rites’, though Tianran speaks of the dao rather than the ‘rites’. This reference to the dao resonates with the language used by Daosheng. The idea that when sentiments have reached their utmost point they return to the dao (that is, to a state marked by inner tranquillity, self-knowing and clarity) echoes the developmental sequence outlined by Daosheng. As Tianran says in the preface, thunder and rain burst out and then cease, leaving calm.

106 Recorded Sayings, fascicle 12: (CBETA, J38, no. B406, p. 192, c02-3).
110 Recorded Sayings, fascicle 12: (CBETA, J38, no. B406, p. 192, c05-6).
112 ‘In terms of poetry, each of them excels in his own area of strength. If we savour the finer points, they are all great examples of boldness and lack of inhibition.’ 以詩而論，各擅其長。而細而味，皆不能無慷慨淋漓之致 Recorded Sayings, fascicle 12: (CBETA, J38, no. B406, p. 192, b27-29).
The idea expressed at the beginning of the preface of the *dao* being ‘something to which sentiments revert when they have reached their utmost point’ and of sentiments being ‘something in which the *dao* resides when it turns back to itself’ correlates with the state of spiritual attainment that is affirmed by Buddhist doctrine, in particular the well-known *prajñā*-school dyad ‘no coming’ and ‘no going’ (a quality also often associated, in Buddhist literature, with *popohehe* (‘child-like’ speech) – a term used in Tianran’s ‘Qingyuan’ preface). A late Ming work, *The Exegetical Commentary on the Diamond Samādhi Sūtra* (*Jing’an Sanmei jìng zhujie* 《金剛三昧經注解》), annotated by the well-known Caodong school monk Zhanran Yuancheng (湛然圆澄 1561-1626), states that ‘not coming and not arriving is the fundamental principle of the *dharmakāya*’ 不來不至則法身之理. The *dharmakāya* (fashen 法身), or ‘dharma (or ‘truth’) body,’ is a synonym for universal ‘Buddha nature’ in the Mahāyāna school. In sum, giving expression in poetry to intense ‘wounded feelings’ can be a means to reveal one’s Buddha nature.

We can suggest that when Tianran speaks of intense feelings arriving at their utmost point he is using a framework that has strong analogues to that entailed in the idea of the attainment of the Fourth Rank in the Caodong system of Five Ranks as explicated by Daosheng: *zhi*, the word that has been translated as ‘reaching the utmost point’ and ‘attaining perfection’, is the same as that translated as ‘arriving’ in ‘Arriving from within the Relative’ (the Fourth Rank in the Caodong system). However, Tianran’s views on sentiment and poetry appear to differ from those advanced by Daosheng and Fang Yizhi. For Tianran, the process of returning to the *dao* is not expressed as an effect of the *Dao* Mind’s animating principle of ‘stillness’. Rather, returning to stillness occurs when sentiments are ‘used up’. This can occur when they are expressed in their full intensity in poetry. In this light, poetry brings people into the *dao* through catharsis.

In this regard, we can perhaps note similarities between Tianran’s reference to ‘thunder’ and ‘rain’ in this preface and a passage from the great Han historian Sima Qian’s famous letter to his associate Ren An (任安), which is quoted by Tianran’s contemporary Peng Shiwang (彭士望 1610-1683). Peng’s passage reads as follows (in Wai-yee Li’s translation):

---

113 *Exegetical Commentary on the Diamond Samādhi Sūtra* (*Jing’an Sanmei jìng zhujie*) 《金剛三昧經注解》, fascicle 2: (CBETA, X35, no. 651, p. 230, a12-13 // Z 1:55, p. 199, a6-7 // R55, p. 397, a6-7)
For the age has come to this, and writing changes accordingly. The intent and purpose of those who write become even more unrelenting and thus ever more bent, ever more bent and thus ever more forceful. This is like heaven and earth belching out breath that is pent up and is not allowed to be let out – it is roused as wrathful thunder; condensed as anomalous hail; stirred and swept away as floodwater; crushed and shattered as collapsing mountains. For why would one not wish to be auspicious clouds, morning sun, sweet rain, and gentle wind? This is the irreversible momentum of extreme distress – it cannot be helped.¹¹⁴

Peng suggests that the writing of a chaotic age will inevitably bring out the intense emotional anguish that such an age engenders; it is the ‘irreversible momentum of extreme distress’ and ‘cannot be helped.’ Tianran’s preface also seems to suggest that intense ‘wounded feelings’ are difficult to suppress. Rather, pent up emotions need to be ‘released’ in their fullest intensity. Only when the ‘thunder’ and ‘rain’ of anguished emotions exhaust themselves will calm return. Tianran argues that expressing wounded emotions through poetry could allow this momentum to run its full course and eventually to run out. However, this does not simply facilitate psychological amelioration: it also leads to a state of ‘stillness’ or tranquillity where one achieves insight into innate nature. Tianran’s statement in the preface that when ‘one falls mute and loses oneself, one then begins to be aware of the sounds of trees and the notes of birds and the movement of wind and the rising of clouds’, attaining a state of unity with the world and other people, reflects statements in Buddhist writings that connect the enlightened state with an awareness of the natural world: we may note a comparable passage in the Extensive Records of Chan Master Yongjue Yuanxian (Yongjue Yuanxian chanshi guanglu)《永覺元賢禪師廣錄》 which states that ‘the calls of ducks and the chirps of sparrows, the movement of wind and the rising of clouds, are nothing other than paramārtha’鴉鳴雀噪，風動雲起，無非第一義.¹¹⁵

The preface’s invocation of the calming of sentiments which have reached their utmost point might be seen as correlating with a shift in the political environment in which Tianran was writing. In the early years of his life, Tianran expressed sympathies with people like Hou Xing (候性, also known as Hou Ruohai 候若孩)¹¹⁶ and his ‘vehemence and fervour in

¹¹⁴ See Wai-yee Li’s ‘Confronting History and Its Alternatives in Early Qing Poetry: An Introduction,’ in Idema et al. (eds.) Trauma and Transcendence, pg. 77. In this text it is cited in a discussion of the therapeutic effect of loyalist forms of cathartic poetry during the Ming-Qing transition, and in particular what Lawrence Yim calls historical poetry.


¹¹⁶ Hou Ruohai was an active and eminent Ming loyalist. Records of Hou, and of his engagement with other
aspiring to serve the age’ 志務當世而慷慨激烈. However, later in his life, at the very time when resistance against the Qing had been dealt a fatal blow, Tianran began to feel that some poets had taken the expression of emotional anguish too far. We can see this in another preface which, while drawing from very similar ideas about ‘innate nature’ and ‘sentiments’, proposed that poems expressing intense emotional anguish can in some cases do spiritual and moral harm to their authors and their readers. This preface, composed several years before Tianran’s death, was entitled ‘Preface for the prefect Lun Xuanming’s Interpretations of Sao’ (‘Lun Xuanming shi jun shi Sao xu’) 〈倫宣明使君釋騷序〉.117

**Turning Sentiments around to Harmonise with the Dao – Tianran’s ‘Preface to Prefect Lun Xuanming’s Interpretations of Sao’**

Tianran’s preface to Lun’s Interpretations of Sao was composed during or just after 1680, soon after the turning point of the ‘Rebellion of the Three Feudatories’ (1673-1681). It is ostensibly an introduction to a work of commentary on the writings of Qu Yuan. However, it can also be read as a critique of the extended tradition of cathartic writing – that of voicing indignation prompted by political injustice – of which Qu Yuan was the preeminent symbol.

The preface begins with a discussion of *xingqing* – innate nature and sentiment. This discussion is directed towards identifying the necessary conditions an author needs to fulfill in order to produce a literary text that attains perfection (*zhi wen* 至文). He states that when ‘there are sentiments that have attained perfection, there will be writing that attains perfection’

loyalists, are contained in *Concise Records of Events in Fujian* (Min shi ji lüe) 《閩事紀略》, composed by the scholar-official Hua Tingxian (華廷獻 juren 1627) See Hou, Min shi ji lüe 《閩事紀略》(Beijing: Beijing tushuguan chubanshe, Rpt. 1997). This text records Hou’s plea for competing factions to unite in resistance to the Qing: ‘At this time we should be preparing our weapons in expectation and uniting our spirits. Yet while danger gathers, we cultivate resentment in our writings and speech; we forget to proclaim the rage of the heavens, and turn our weapons against each other. How can I remedy this?’ 此時宜枕戈待旦，戮力一心。乃處累卵之危，而修筆舌之怨；忘敷天之憤，而操同室之戈:吾其濟乎. Yuaxian’s account of Hou’s attempt to unify the different groups is cited in the *Concise Records on the South in the Declining Years of the Ming* (Ming ji nan lüe) 《明季南略》, Taipei: Datong shuju, 1987, pg. 321), attributed to Ji Liuqi (計六奇 1622-?). In obvious sympathy with Hou, Tianran’s ‘Sending off the marquis of Shangqiu Hou Ruohai – Two Poems’ (‘Song Shangqiu bohou Ruohai er shou’) 表送商丘伯侯若孩二首 express Tianran’s passionate loyalty to, and longing for the restoration of, the Ming throne. For a discussion of these poems, see Qi bu hu, pgs. 74-75. Information on Hou’s life in retirement after the fall of the Ming can be found in Liu Dechang (劉德昌), *Shangqiu County Gazetteer* (Shangqiu xian zhi) 《商丘縣志》 (44th year of Kangxi (1705) – Taipei: Chengwen chubanshe, Rpt. 1976).

有至情然後有至文.\(^{119}\)

Tianran then goes on to say that writing is a means to reach the heights of one’s sentiments, and that sentiments are a means to reach the full potential of one’s innate nature 文所以達其情者也, 情所以極乎性者也.\(^{120}\) No-one, Tianran declares, is without an innate nature and no innate nature is without sentiments 天下未有人而無性者也, 亦未有性而無情者也.\(^{121}\) Writing, being born of sentiments which have their foundation in one’s innate nature, can be a conduit for seeing this innate nature and these sentiments, or xingqing 依性達情而文生焉; 故文所以自見其性情者.\(^{122}\) A person may not be able to see his own innate nature and sentiments, but he cannot possibly be without them 人生當世, 終身而不得見其性情之事, 夫豈獨無性情哉.\(^{123}\) If people cannot perfect their innate nature they cannot perfect their sentiments, and, not having perfected their sentiments, they will be unable to produce literature which is perfected 性不至則情亦不至也; 情不至則文亦不至.\(^{124}\)

Expanding on this point in the next section of this preface, Tianran points out a distinction between two different aspects of perfection – perfection relating to the dao of Heaven and perfection relating to the dao of Humanity 所謂至者, 有天道焉, 有人道焉.\(^{125}\) The dao of Heaven ‘refers to the original endowment of basic talent’ 天者言乎其本具也.\(^{126}\) Tianran states that ‘this original endowment is originally incomplete; although it is an original endowment it cannot operate on its own’ 本具本不具, 本具而不能自徹.\(^{127}\) For the original endowment to operate one must follow a ‘principle’ (理) which makes the ‘substance’ (體) manifest 理徹而體現.\(^{128}\) After the substance is made manifest, its ‘functioning’ (用) will be expansive 體現而用廓.\(^{129}\) Tianran states that this functioning ‘can be projected out to the four seas, and pulled back into a single square inch of the heart’ 放乎四海, 收之方.\(^{130}\) He

\(^{119}\) Recorded Sayings, fascicle 12: (CBETA, J38, no. B406, p. 196, b12).
\(^{120}\) Recorded Sayings, fascicle 12: (CBETA, J38, no. B406, p. 196, b12-13).
\(^{121}\) Recorded Sayings, fascicle 12: (CBETA, J38, no. B406, p. 196, b13-14).
\(^{124}\) Recorded Sayings, fascicle 12: (CBETA, J38, no. B406, p. 196, b16-17).
\(^{126}\) Recorded Sayings, fascicle 12: (CBETA, J38, no. B406, p. 196, b18).
\(^{127}\) Recorded Sayings, fascicle 12: (CBETA, J38, no. B406, p. 196, b18-19).
\(^{130}\) Recorded Sayings, fascicle 12: (CBETA, J38, no. B406, p. 196, b20).
goes on to relate this to the *dao* of Humanity, stating that ‘to know hardness and to know softness; to know how to advance and to know how to retreat; to be moved by phenomena and to obtain the utmost appropriateness (*zhi dang* 至當) – this is what is called ‘the *dao* of Humanity’知剛知柔，知進知退，感乎物而得其至當，所謂人道也.’\(^{131}\)

In the next section Tianran discusses how great sages and people of distinction from antiquity ‘used the *dao* of Humanity to unite with the utmost appropriateness of Heaven’古之聖賢皆以人道而合乎天之至當.\(^{132}\) This unity was embodied in the persons of the sages and people of distinction and enacted in their own times, being manifested in sincerity in the fulfilment of the key social roles (備諸一身，行乎當世，使君臣父子，兄弟朋友皆惇然，有至性行乎其間).\(^{133}\) The sages and people of distinction from antiquity gained the ‘ability to use sentiments skillfully’, projecting this in literary works ‘that turn heaven and earth upside down and whose radiance can compete with the sun and the moon’能善用其情，發為文章，冠履天地，爭光日月.\(^{134}\)

Tianran presents this as the reason why Confucius was ‘the exemplar for a thousand generations’此孔仲尼所為萬世師表者也.\(^{135}\) Confucius served the state of Lu, but when that state no longer used his talents, he did not become resentful, but instead used his sentiments skillfully, which resulted in him compiling and editing some of the most important of the Chinese classics – the *Spring and Autumn Annals*, *The Book of Changes*, and the *Elegantiae and the Lauds in the Book of Poetry* (仲尼事魯，魯之君臣不能用其道，退而作〈春秋〉，傳〈周易〉，正雅頌).\(^{136}\) For Tianran, this embodies the principle of ‘turning one’s sentiments around to harmonise with the *dao*’所謂反其情以合道者也.\(^{137}\) Confucius’ actions can be contrasted with the actions of other talented officials of later times who, when confronted with disappointments in their careers, indulged in sorrow and melancholy 後之君子師其周流列國，不遑寧處出而筮仕，一不見用則悲涼淒惋.\(^{138}\) Tianran sees it as lamentable that some of these men tragically lost their lives because they could not control

---


\(^{133}\) *Recorded Sayings*, fascicle 12: (CBETA, J38, no. B406, p. 196, b22-23).


\(^{135}\) *Recorded Sayings*, fascicle 12: (CBETA, J38, no. B406, p. 196, b24-25).


Tianran presents Qu Yuan – the author whose works Lun’s *Interpretations of Sao* addresses – as one such example. He sees Qu Yuan as also being an exceptionally loyal official whose career suffered setbacks, someone who also ended up not being given an official post by those to whom he had pledged his loyalty. In stark contrast with Confucius, Qu Yuan responded to this predicament by feeling ‘aggrieved and enraged’ and by ending his own life 憂憤自絕.”140 The primary cause of Qu Yuan’s fall, Tianran opined, was that he used the innate nature with which he had been originally endowed ‘as an instrument for his sentiments’ 此率其本具之性, 以為情用.141 This produced a state of inner turmoil which could not be presented to the world. These sentiments were projected in his poetry, whose wording was ‘sorrowful, wounded, aggrieved and enraged’ 情窮則中亂, 中亂則無以自托於世, 宜乎其為辭悲傷憂憤.142 Qu Yuan ‘thought about the past and the present and cried out with tears to the gods and spirits’ 俯仰古今 號泣鬼神.143 Qu Yuan’s writing was highly influential and had a lasting effect throughout the ages – especially among ministers in later times that suffered similar fates. As Tianran notes: ‘Even a thousand years later, readers still lament this, lamenting that these sentiments had nowhere where they could be expressed’ 千載而下讀者傷之，傷乎情之無所抒也.144

Discussing the influence that Qu Yuan had upon later generations, Tianran proceeds in the next section of the preface to cite the examples of two ministers – Jia Yi and Liu Zhanqing – who, like Lun Xuanming, had written about Qu Yuan. He laments that what they drew from Qu Yuan’s example was wrong in that they appeared to think that the circumstances Qu Yuan was confronted with made his emotional response inevitable, and they did not appreciate that Qu Yuan could have averted tragedy by reining in his emotions (they were ‘moved by the fact that he [Qu Yuan] could not escape his predicament’ rather than regretting ‘that his sentiments could not be brought back to what is proper’ 志士感其遇之不可逃，聖賢惜其情之不能反). Tianran states that in his writings about Qu Yuan, Jia Yi ‘links his own experiences to

---

that of the ancients – his words are sorrowful. In turn, Liu Zhangqing wrote about Jia Yi and Qu Yuan after he passed by the old residence of Jia Yi – ‘he saw the traces the ancients had left, creating a new path for wounded feelings – his rhymes were bitter’. Tianran concludes that in both cases the authors’ ‘sentiments went to extremes and they felt wounded; feeling wounded, they could not control themselves and died’.

He laments that in these and other similar cases, worthy people with a perfected innate nature bestowed by heaven and brought to completion by humanity often ‘end up treading the path of the minister without supporters and that of the child of an unfavoured concubine’ is人之至性，稟乎天，成乎人 … 遂終為孤臣孽子之行. Tianran laments that in such cases ‘the principle of turning one’s sentiments around to harmonise with the dao goes unheard’ 反情合道之理無聞焉.

In the last section of the preface, Tianran offers his appraisal of Lun’s Interpretations of Sao – and is critical of Qu Yuan. He presents Lun, like the aforementioned figures, as a talented and loyal minister whose career has been unjustly cut short. Tianran states that Lun was the prefect of Nankang when the region suffered destruction due to an insurrection. He recounts that at the time this occurred Lun had taken leave to go into formal mourning for a recently deceased parent, but because Lun had talent that could suppress the disorder, his mourning leave was terminated so that so that he might bring the situation under control (上官以其才能戡亂疏於朝廷, 被檄, 無以自白). After returning to office, Lun diligently set about repairing the defences of the region (‘For four or five years Lun recruited people to repair the defences, and what had been neglected was restored’). Yet in spite of these efforts and all that he had achieved, Lun was slandered and formally denounced, and had no means to defend himself. Lun, according to Tianran, ‘shut himself indoors and read sao poems,
uttering sentiments of lament like the neglected and enraged people of ancient times’ 閉戶讀騷，咄咄發言，有類乎古之孤憤者。\(^{155}\) It was after this event that Lun completed his *Interpretations of Sao* and asked Tianran to write a preface for it. Tianran states that he had praised Lun in person for the literary achievements of this work, declaring that it was the equal of the writings of many talented authors of antiquity. However, Tianran qualifies his praise by drawing a comparison between Confucius’ response to being removed from office and the way that figures such as Qu Yuan and Jia Yi responded when faced with similar predicaments. His comments read as follows:

‘My lord’s sentiments and writing are not inferior to those of the ancients!’ However, beyond Qu Ping and Jia Yi, there was the great thoroughfare and the wide avenue of ‘the teacher of ten thousand generations’ and there is what we call ‘retiring and doing as one sees fit’, and there is the state of being skilled at using one’s sentiments so that they do not fall into vehemence, so as to align oneself with the great sage who turned sentiments around so that they harmonised with the *dao*.

「公之情與文無遜古人」。然屈平賈誼而上，尚有師表萬世之康衢廣轍;所謂退而自為，善用其情而不流於激烈，以附於反情合道之大聖人。\(^{156}\)

With reference to these observations, Tianran states of Lun’s work – ‘I tentatively consider it to be the grievances of one time, what Han Yu (韓愈) meant when he said ‘when beings are not at peace they cry out’ 聊當一時壘塊，韓昌黎謂物不平則鳴。\(^{157}\) Tianran asserts that Lun had the right to feel pride in what he had accomplished 吾宣明夫固有以自命也夫。\(^{158}\)

*Preface or Sermon?*

The fact that this preface appeared in Tianran’s *Recorded Sayings* collection might suggest that it was understood as a Buddhist teaching, rather than as a work of literary criticism in the conventional sense. Tianran seems to be suggesting here that literary writings such as poetry expressing intense emotional anguish prompted by political violence should not automatically be considered to be spiritually beneficial. Such works can go against the tenets of both Buddhism and Confucian teachings, and can bring

\(^{155}\) *Recorded Sayings*, fascicle 12: (CBETA, J38, no. B406, p. 196, c15)


harm to both the author and his readers.

This appears to be very much at odds with the approach to poetry that Tianran outlines in his ‘Three Scholars’ preface, ‘The Three Scholars’ preface affirms that one should cherish sentiments that have ‘gone to the utmost extent’ (zhì 至, which has generally been translated in my rendering of the Lun preface as ‘having attained perfection’). In the Lun preface, however, Tianran emphasises that the author’s innate nature and sentiments should not be allowed to devolve into excessive emotional anguish. Secondly, while he suggests that poetry expressing intense emotional anguish may have its source in innate natures bestowed by heaven (something that seems to have parallels with the ideas of Daosheng), the preface argues that such poetry is not unequivocally good. This shift in Tianran’s approach to poetry might be seen as reflecting broader historical transformations that occurred later in Tianran’s life (something that will be discussed later on in this chapter). However, it may also have been inspired by reservations about the literary reverence for Qu Yuan that was pervasive in the loyalist communities of Tianran’s day.

*The Tradition of Commenting on Sao and on Qu Yuan*

Earlier sections of this thesis have discussed Qu Yuan’s status as a model official and literary figure in Ming loyalist communities, and monks and laypeople in Tianran’s order also revered him. We can note, furthermore, that one of the means through which this admiration was expressed was in the tradition of commentaries on Qu Yuan’s poetry. The strong propensity of loyalists to compose commentaries on the *sao* poetry of Qu Yuan, or to mimic Qu Yuan’s poems, reflects the conviction of loyalists that their position as marginalised and ill-fated ‘loyal’ officials was something they shared with Qu Yuan, an attitude that had extensive historical precedents.

---

160 One of the most eminent loyalists who was a monk in Tianran’s order who highly valued Qu Yuan and his writing was Qu Dajun. A discussion on Qu Dajun’s esteem for and promotion of Qu Yuan can be found in chapter 2 ‘Qu Dajun hongyang de lisaol jingshen’ 〈屈大君弘揚的離騷精神〉 (‘The Li-Sao Spirit Promoted by Qu Dajun’) in the 2008 MA thesis of Hsieh Chung-hsi: ‘Qingchu Mingmo yimin de ‘Qu-Tao’ lunshu.’ See in particular, pgs. 44-51.
The ‘Grievances’ of Lun Xuanming

Lun Xuanming, the author of the Interpretations of Sao to which Tianran’s preface is devoted, was not a loyalist like Huang Wenhuai and Wang Fuzhi, but rather a Qing official. In terms of what gave rise to Lun’s misfortunes and his claims of unrewarded ‘loyalty’ and his ‘indignation,’ his predicament was not, however, completely dissimilar to those of Ming loyalists after the fall of the Ming.

An official who had enjoyed relatively high rank, Lun Xuanming was a close associate of Tianran. At least 15 poems in the Blind Hall Collection were addressed to him. Many of these poems were written between 1679 and 1682, and commented directly on the events that surrounded Lun’s fall from grace during that period. Tianran’s account of this fall from grace is presented in the later part of this preface, and parts of it were repeated almost verbatim in his brief foreword to ‘Writing A Letter to Prefect Lun’ (‘Jian Lun taishou’) 《柬倫太守》.

In these accounts, Tianran suggests that Lun had loyally served the empire to assist in the suppression of the ‘Revolt of the Three Feudatories,’ the last loyalist-led challenge to Qing rule in China’s south. Rather than being rewarded for his success, Lun was investigated and eventually forced to resign because of false allegations made by (purportedly) jealous officials. Lun’s now non-extant commentary was likely a paean to Qu Yuan, probably

163 In the Blind Hall, the first time Tianran makes mention of the topic of Lun’s fall from grace is in the poem entitled ‘The Prefect Lun Xuanming and Xu Mingfu retreated to the forest and prayed at Kuanglu, and then stated that [Lun] had been accused of a transgression’ (‘Lun Taishou Xuanming, Xu Mingfu Yilin qi Kuanglu, bian dao jianguo’) (倫太守宣明、許明府逸林祀匡廬,便道見過) (fascicle 15, pg. 166). If we follow the general chronology of Blind Hall, this poem was written in 1679. This fits the statement in the Lun preface that Lun’s dismissal from office occurred ‘four or five years’ after the beginning of the revolt. Dated just after the ‘closing of the Year Jiwei (1679)己未歲晏 is the poem ‘The Prefect Of Nankang Lun Xuanming stands accused of a transgression’ (‘Nankang taishou Lun Xuanming jianguo’) (南康太守倫宣明見過) (Blind Hall fascicle 15, pg. 169), The introduction of this poem states: ‘at this time Lun has been charged and is awaiting orders’ 《此时伦被论待命. Also composed between 1681 and 1682 are ‘Mid-Autumn – Prefect Lun stands accused of a transgression’ (‘Zhongqiu Lun taishou jianguo’) (中秋倫太守見過) (Blind Hall fascicle 15, pg. 170), ‘Sending Prefect Lun to his hometown’ (‘Song Lun taishou guili’) 《送倫太守歸里》 and ‘Squire Lun narrates in thorough detail his departure from office. I cannot but feel moved, and again compose two poems’ (‘Lun Gong beishu tu zhi, weimian you huai, zai fu er zhang’) (倫公備述去志,未免有懷,再賦二章). The last document addressing Lun seems to be ‘To the longevity of Prefect Lun’ (‘Shou Lun taishou’) (壽倫太守), possibly composed in 1682. It can thus be estimated that the preface to Lun’s Interpretations of Sao was composed between 1680 and 1682 (perhaps 1680-1681, on account of the fact that the preface only mentions Lun’s ‘being denounced’).

However, as mentioned above, the wording of Tianran’s preface very closely matches ‘Writing a letter to Prefect Lun,’ which states in its introduction ‘After the alarm from Nankang, the ‘Two Censorates’(兩臺) [i.e. the Governor], on account of [Lun’s] abilities, submitted a memorial requesting that he be ordered to cancel his leave of filial mourning to defend against the rebels. When the affair was settled, and before Lin had made an expository report, he was attacked out of jealousy’ 南康之警,兩臺以其能疏請奪情禦寇，事定論叙弗及，且竊銜之. 164 Blind Hall, fascicle 15, pg. 173.
intended to bring attention to the injustice of his own persecution and marginalisation and to legitimise his own ‘indignation.’

As noted, there are two famous wronged officials other than Qu Yuan whom Tianran discusses in the preface. The first of these is the Western Han poet and political theorist Jia Yi (200-168), who was demoted from his post and exiled as a result of charges raised by jealous officials, and whose composition ‘Rhapsody of Lament for Qu Yuan’ (‘Diao Qu Yuan fu’) 《吊屈原賦》 was written to reflect his own predicament and sense of indignation.\textsuperscript{165} Jia Yi was famous for having died at the age of 33, apparently as a result of his lasting grief. The second figure that Tianran mentions is the Tang poet Liu Zhangqing (劉長卿 8th century). Liu composed a famous melancholic poem on the fate of Jia Yi, called ‘Passing the Residence of Jia Yi at Changsha’ (‘Changsha guo Jia Yi zhai’) 《長沙過賈誼宅》.\textsuperscript{166} Liu, known as an upright but belligerent official, was demoted and transferred several times on account of his outspokenness, and wrote many poems about his distress at the state of his political career and at politics in general, as well as lamenting the destruction and suffering brought about by the An Lushan rebellion (755-763).

Comparing Lun to these revered figures would ordinarily be a compliment in Confucian literary circles. However, Tianran expresses concern at the negative psychological impact that poetry can have when it expresses its author’s indulgence in melancholy. Because of the talents of distinguished authors, many others over the ages have been moved by their writings to indulge in melancholy, and might in some cases have even been inspired to commit suicide. In other words, their rare talent could intensify the emotional and psychological harm that their writings might inflict on others. Tianran compares this with the positive example provided by Confucius. Tianran sees Confucius as someone who cherishes the ‘mind of the world’, and on account of this exemplifies the discipline of ‘turning sentiments around to harmonise with the dao.’

\textsuperscript{165} For a discussion on this practice in the Han, see Xu Youfang (許又方) Zhu ti shu xing de zhui xun yu chong gou: Qu Yuan de shen fen ren tong ji Han ren dui ta de yue du yu shu xie 《主體屬性的追尋與重構：屈原的身分認同及漢人對他的閱讀與書寫》 (Taipei: Da’an chubanshe 2011).
\textsuperscript{166} In Peng Dingqiu (彭定求) et al. (colls., eds.) Quan Tang shi 《全唐詩》 (I) (Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 1986), pg. 365.
From ‘Following Nature’ to ‘Turning Sentiments Around to Harmonise with the Dao’ – Tianran’s New ‘Middle Way’ Xingqing Theory and Implicit Critiques of Daosheng

Tianran’s preface to Lun’s Interpretations of Sao takes a down-to-earth approach to addressing the moral and spiritual hazards of poetry which expresses agitated emotions. However, in his discussions of ‘turning sentiments around to harmonise with the dao’, Tianran provides a theoretical foundation for his approach to poetry – one which invokes the language of the theory of ‘innate nature and sentiments’ (xingqing). Many elements of this resonate with ideas presented earlier in this chapter: the exhortation not to blindly imitate past masters, the idea of ‘utilising’ heavenly endowments, the dualism of function and substance, the valorisation of sentiments that have ‘reached their utmost extent’ and so on. However, what is most notable is that this preface presents what I would suggest is a Doctrine of the Mean approach to innate nature and sentiments theory that in many respects appears similar to the writings of Tianran’s eminent predecessors Daosheng and Fang Yizhi. However, unlike Daosheng and Fang, Tianran suggests that work must be done to ensure that sentiments (and their poetic expression) are harmonised with the dao and that they do not degenerate into excess.

Tianran emphasises the importance of sentiments ‘attaining perfection’ (zhi 至). Tianran’s concern is not with the intensity of sentiments (as it was in the preface to the Poems of the Three Eminent Scholars of Wuzhong) but rather with their ‘attaining perfection’ or reaching ‘utmost appropriateness’ (至當), that is, their alignment with the dictates of Confucian principles of moral rectitude. Similarly, I would suggest that for Tianran zhixing does not refer simply to ‘attaining perfection of character’, but rather relates to the idea of achieving true self-knowing of one’s innate nature to enable one to connect with transcendental ‘substance’. Here there are arguably traces of the ideas of Zhu Xi that were also drawn on by Daosheng. As Zhu Xi states: ‘equilibrium is the mind in its capacity as substance, while harmony – as the state where the seven sentiments ‘each abide by the guiding principle’ – is the mind in its capacity as function’.167

Tianran’s depiction in this preface of the development of innate nature and sentiments and its relationship with writing has some parallels with the ideas of Daosheng about the interaction

---

between the heavenly and the human. When one’s innate nature attains perfection, it provides the means to make one’s sentiments attain perfection (zhī). The literary works to which ‘sentiments that have attained perfection’ give rise can be a ‘mirror’ that reveals innate natures that have attained perfection. This is the result of the endowment bestowed by heaven (the author’s talent) being brought into proper operation through principle (helping to create a substance whose functioning would be projected out across the four seas and able to be brought back into the single square inch of the heart). Perfection is attained through the proper use by humans of what heaven has bestowed.

Tianran contrasts those whose innate natures have attained perfection and whose sentiments and writings project that perfection with those whose innate nature (xing) is deployed in the service of their sentiments (qing). This is visible in the passage in which Tianran critiques Jia Yi and Liu Zhangqing:

Both cases involved sentiments inspired as a result of writers being moved by objects; their sentiments went to extremes and they felt wounded; feeling wounded, they could not control themselves and died. What is there to love about death? While the innate natures of people which have attained perfection have been bestowed by heaven and brought to completion by humanity, a substance (ti) that is refined, pure, vital and focused can be confronted with unpredicted circumstances and end up treading the path of the minister without supporters and that of the child of an unfavoured concubine, where the principle of turning one’s sentiments around to harmonise with the dao goes unheard. This is why sages and men of distinction sigh deeply.

When sentiments are no longer balanced, one loses one’s inner tranquility or equilibrium; one is ‘de-centred.’ As a result of losing one’s centre, sentiments become disassociated from one’s innate nature, and one loses mastery of one’s emotions. Sentiments and responses to events no longer accord with the dao. The writings of a person in this situation will not only exceed the bounds of what is morally appropriate, but will also do psychological and spiritual harm to both the author and his readers. Such writings can no longer be a conduit for seeing one’s true innate nature and

sentiments.

Tianran’s ideas about innate nature and sentiments outlined in this preface are in no way as rigorous or sophisticated as those outlined by Daosheng, but there is broad similarity between some of Tianran’s views and those of Daosheng. We can argue that Tianran’s stance accords broadly with the ‘Doctrine of the Mean’ theories outlined in Zhu Xi’s letter to Zhang Yinfu, which Daosheng also cites. Tianran’s line that ‘in the world there has never been a person who does not have an innate nature and there has never been an innate nature that does not have sentiments’ resonates with Zhu Xi’s statement that ‘no one is without a primordial mind and innate nature, and no mind is without primordial movement and stillness’. We may note also that Tianran’s pairings of ‘hardness’ and ‘softness,’ ‘advancing’ and ‘retreating’ are terms used to describe processes of transformation in the Book of Changes; this also echoes Daosheng’s emphasis on this text. Furthermore, Tianran’s reference to ‘the refined and pure vitality and focus’ of eminent authors, and of Qu Yuan in particular, also echoes Daosheng’s concern with the categories of vitality and focus in his account of the ‘Sixteen-Word Dictum’.

However, there are important points of difference between Tianran and Daosheng. It appears that Tianran intended to use this preface to communicate a religious message (as mentioned, it appeared in his Recorded Sayings). I suggest that his key concern was to argue that there should be caution in affirming the work of those whose poetry expressed states of emotional distress. Unlike Daosheng, Tianran opposes the valorisation of Qu Yuan as a model poet. He also opposes taking as a model ‘the children of unfavoured concubines’ and ‘ministers without supporters’—terms that Daosheng used approvingly in his ‘Three Masters’ text. At least in the case of Qu Yuan, Tianran appears also to have had a different idea of following innate nature (shuai xing 率性) from that advanced by Daosheng. Daosheng suggested that ‘following’ (shuai) or giving ‘free rein’ to one’s innate nature means that sentiments (qing) will follow innate nature (xing). In Tianran’s depiction of Qu Yuan’s ‘following the innate nature with which he had been originally endowed’ (率其本具之性), emotions become too strong, leading Qu into a state of inner turmoil. Tianran may have thought that shuai xing ought not to be understood in terms of ‘following’ or ‘giving free rein’ to innate nature but rather as ‘controlling innate nature’.

169 Complete Records, fascicle 26: (CBETA, J34, no. B311, p. 744, a4-5).
given that shuai can mean to ‘control’ as well as ‘to follow’. This resonates with Tianran’s emphasis on ‘turning sentiments around to harmonise with the dao’, something that is arguably different from Daosheng’s idea of ‘following one’s innate nature in order to return to the will of heaven’ 率性以歸天命, in that it places greater emphasis on control of the emotions, and perhaps on controlling innate nature itself.

These ideas are given a very clear formulation in the Preface to the Ancient-Form Poems of the Old Monk Tian[ran] of Danxia (Danxia Tian lao heshang gu shi xu) 〈丹霞天老和尚古詩序〉, which was composed by Tianran’s disciple Jinbian in 1668:¹⁷⁰

In the case of the strongest sentiments, unrestrained agitation follows in their wake. This causes setbacks or evil to be given voice in sound and brought to completion in writing. The gracefulness and forcefulness of such writing, its lack of inhibition and its indirectness and its reiteration, elongation and repetition inspires people to ponder deeply. With sickly frame and melancholic appearance and rumbling thunder across the Three Gorges, there are likely to be those who are unable to restrain themselves. For the tunes of the Great Elegantiae are valued on account of their calm tranquillity, and so by guarding against sentiment, one is very close to the dao. The dao is victorious over sentiment. This is how people of the dao can bring the sound [of their poetry] to completeness.

This passage suggests that excelling in the aesthetic qualities and techniques of the poetic medium will not – as Daosheng suggested – serve as a means to ‘regulate’ one’s emotions and bring them into ‘harmony.’ Rather, when the sentiments that motivate poetry are agitated and not restrained, one’s ‘heavenly endowed’ talents might still be employed to create poetry that is of a high literary standard, but it will lead to anguished emotions having an even greater evocative power and harmful impact upon readers than would otherwise be the case. The poetry of monks should thus avoid expressing ‘defiled’ sentiments of emotional agitation and seek instead to exhibit the quality of ‘calm tranquillity.’

Interestingly, this idea that one should have reservations about the religious value of poems which are a product of ‘heavenly endowed’ literary talent and that express agitated emotions

¹⁷⁰ See Wang Zongyan, Tianran heshang nianpu, pg. 46.
such as indignation was expressed in another preface that Tianran composed for a bona fide loyalist author and that can be found in his *Recorded Sayings* – his ‘Preface to the ‘Poetry of Hou Ruohai’” (‘Hou Ruohai xu’) 〈侯若孩詩序〉.\(^{171}\) This preface also appears to direct a veiled critique at some of Hanshan Deqing’s ideas about the relationship between poetry and Chan. The author of this poetry collection, Hou Xing (候性 fl. Mid 17th C.), who was more commonly known by his courtesy name Hou Rouhai 候若孩,\(^{172}\) was well known for his poems that express his feelings without reservation. Tianran in this preface remarks that Hou’s poetry expresses his ‘aspiration to serve the world and vehement sentiments of righteousness’ 侯子若孩志務當世而慷慨激烈,\(^{173}\) and states that in terms of literary talent, the author can be compared to the eminent Tang poet Li Bai (李白 701-762), whose poems were ‘obtained from the heavens’ 得之天, and who ‘forms his own words and sentences, forms his own patterns, causing humanity to know of their wondrousness, but not to know why they are wondrous’ 別成字句, 別成法脈; 使人知其妙而不知其所以妙.\(^{174}\) However in the case of Li Bai, the ‘[wondrousness] comes entirely from the heavens, yet [he] is without the [ability to] utilise the heavens’全乎天而不用天也.\(^{175}\) Tianran later in this preface compares Li Bai to the the Tang ‘Buddhist’ landscape poet Wang Wei (王維 699-759), who Tianran felt was ‘capable of utilising heaven’ 能用天者, and who composed sentences whose religious sentiments were explicit and which ‘could serve to give rise to spiritual realisation’ 可以起悟.\(^{176}\) This comparison between the religious merits of the poetry of Li Bai and Wang Wei stands in contradistinction to a comparison made in the passage composed by Hanshan in which he stated his position that ‘poetry is zhen Chan.’ According to Hanshan,


\(^{172}\) As mentioned in footnote 116 above, Hou Ruohai was an active and eminent Ming loyalist. Hua Tingxian’s *Concise Records of Events in Fujian* records Hou’s plea that competing factions unite in resistance to the Qing: ‘At this time we should be preparing our weapons in wait, uniting our spirits. Yet while danger gathers, we are in the practice [of showing] resentment in our writings and speech – forget to announce the indignation of the heavens, and turn our weapons against each other. How can I remedy this?’ 此時宜枕戈待旦, 戮力一心。乃處累卵之危, 而修筆舌之怨; 忘敷天之憤, 而操同室之戈:吾其濟乎. Yuanxian’s account of this incident is cited in the Concise [Records] on the South in the Declining Years of the Ming (Ming ji nan lüe) 《明季南略》, Taipei: Datong shuju, 1987, pg. 321, attributed to Ji Liuqi (計六奇 1622-?). In ‘Sending off The Elder of Shangqiu Hou Ruohai – Two Poems’ (‘Song Shang Qiu bo Hou Ruohai er shou’) 《送商丘伯侯若孩二首》, Tianran relates, in obvious sympathy with Hou, his passionate loyalty to, and longing for the resurgence of, the Ming throne. Information on Hou’s life in retirement after the fall of the Ming can be found in Liu Dechang (劉德昌), *Shangqiu County Gazetteer (Shangqiu xian zhi)* 《商丘縣志》 (44th year of Kangxi (1705) – Taipei: Chengwen chubanshe, Rpt. 1976).


\(^{174}\) *Recorded Sayings*, fascicle 12: (CBETA, J38, no. B406, p. 192, c8-10).

\(^{175}\) This character is missing in the extant manuscript.

\(^{176}\) *Recorded Sayings*, fascicle 12: (CBETA, J38, no. B406, p. 192, c11).

\(^{177}\) *Recorded Sayings*, fascicle 12: (CBETA, J38, no. B406, p. 192, c13).
Among the people of Tang times, only the words of Li Taibai are a spontaneously-created profound wonder, because he was able to achieve enlightened understanding without knowing Chan. In the case of Wang Wei, his works contain many Buddhist terms, and people in later times vied to laud his mastery of Chan. In summary, this is perhaps not Chan, but only ‘a Chan of words.’ It does not compare with Tao Yuanming and Li Bai who advanced beyond words’ 唐人獨李太白語自造玄妙，在不知禪而能道耳。若王維多佛語，後人爭誇善禪，要之豈非禪耶，特文字禪耳。非若陶李，造乎文字之外.178

‘Uncenteredness,' Suicide and Insanity - Zhen as a Remedy for Yuan

Tianran’s prefaces suggest that indulging in emotional excess can lead to an author or his readers to lose their equilibrium and can even lead to them committing suicide. Suicide is not presented here as a noble course of action, despite it having been valued by many loyalists. Suicide results from the inability of noble, loyal people to rein in their sentiments when confronted by setbacks. Tianran intimates that suicide is a form of temporary insanity, which is not seen for what it is; it is legitimized and even valued by people who draw parallels between their intense emotional anguish and that of the ‘loyal’ poets of antiquity.

Although Lun was a Qing official, the phenomena of advertising the extremity of one’s predicament in poetry and art, imitating literary predecessors, and even valorising suicide that are spoken of in this preface, were pervasive in Ming loyalist communities in Tianran’s times. Some early-Qing Ming loyalists committed suicide in a manner that resembled Qu Yuan and were praised for doing so. Fang Yizhi, who was regarded as ‘mad,’ was one figure praised for this (although historians doubt that he drowned himself intentionally).179 Many loyalist literati portrayed themselves as ‘mad’ or ‘crazed’ (狂). The prevalent problem of ‘madness’ (whether real or feigned)180 in loyal communities is a topic discussed directly by Kong Dingfang (孔定芳) in ‘Ming-Qing yidai yu Ming yimin de xinli fenwei’ 〈明清易代與明遺民的心理氛圍〉 [‘The Transition from the Ming to the Qing and the Psychological Mood of

---

179 For a discussion on this, see Wai Yee-li’s introduction to Idema et al. (eds.) Trauma and Transcendence, pg. 52.
180 Madness may have been ‘feigned’ by some loyalists as a strategy to escape punishment.
Ming Loyalists’].\textsuperscript{181} Figures such as the writer Gui Zhuang \textsuperscript{182}（歸莊 1631-1673）, the painter (and tao chan monk) Bada Shanren （八大山人 1626-1705）, projected this ‘insanity’.\textsuperscript{183} This madness or inclination for suicide was not only inspired by political events;\textsuperscript{184} it also became – like ‘drinking wine’ – inextricably intertwined with the poetry and art of these individuals.\textsuperscript{185} The famous 20\textsuperscript{th}-century historian Xie Guozhen （謝國禎）describes this as follows:

Ming loyalists deeply felt the pain of the loss of their state. They feigned madness and defiled themselves. If they were not joining Buddhist monasteries, they were entering the dao; they called themselves ‘stained priests’ or the ‘living dead’. They resided in old huts by deserted riverbeds, and wailed and sighed, singing elegies with aroused spirits, appearing as though they did not know what they were saying. At times they would drink to relieve their sorrows, or would write or draw to entertain themselves. An example is Bada Shanren, who, after drinking wildly, would wave his brush and spill ink, scribble a picture… and depict scenes and sentiments of indignation at society’s corruption.\textsuperscript{186}

The ‘intoxicated’, ‘childlike’ speech that Tianran valorised in his ‘Qingyuan’ preface seems to share some of the elements that appear in this description of the behaviour of ‘crazed’ loyalists. However, in Tianran’s later writings this type of self-indulgent behaviour is seen as being problematic. His preface to Lun’s ‘Interpretations of Sao’ directly addresses a loyal Qing official, not a loyalist. However, because it was written just after the turning point of the Rebellion of the Three Feudatories (that is, when the hopes of Ming loyalists had been dealt a fatal last blow) it can be regarded as a critique that addresses the problem of loyalists’ ‘insanity’ in that period. The fact that this preface was written in a way that virtually ensured that Lun would not publish it, and was included in Tianran’s Recorded Sayings collection, can

\begin{footnotesize}
\textsuperscript{181} In \textit{Lishi dangan} 《歷史當案》, No. 4, 2004, pgs. 47-56.

\textsuperscript{182} Qing authors’ accounts of the ‘insanity’ of Gui Zhang, and expressions of it in his own writings, are outlined in ‘Ming-Qing yidai yu Ming yimin de xinli fenwei.’ In recent decades Gui Zhuang and his literary works have become the focus of considerable attention in Chinese scholarship. One (of the many) other works that address Gui’s ‘(feigned) insanity’ include Liu Hongjuan (劉紅娟) ‘Yi qi yi zheng – lun Gui Zhuang’ （亦奇亦正論歸莊）（Honghe xueyuan xuebao 《紅河學院學報》, Vol. 3, 2004, pgs. 41-44）. Gui was also an associate of Gu Yanwu （顧炎武 1613-1682）, another loyalist known for his ‘insanity’.

\textsuperscript{183} Birth name Zhu Da （朱耷）. Zhu was said to draw in a peculiar manner, and was known to make strange noises while composing his works. For an account of the peculiarity of his art, and how it expressed his grief at the loss of his state, see The Editorial Committee of Chinese Civilisation: A Source Book, \textit{China: Five Thousand Years of History and Civilisation} (Hong Kong: City University of Hong Kong Press, 2007), pg. 761.

\textsuperscript{184} Gu Wu lost most of his family members due to fighting during the Ming-Qing transition.


\textsuperscript{186} The his introduction to his \textit{Fang Yizhi nianpu} 《方以智年譜》 (Hefei: Anhui jiaoyu chubanshe, 1983), fascicle 1 - ‘Preface’ (‘Xu’ 序) Ren Daoxin （任道斌） calls Fang Yizhi a ‘mad youth’ (狂生). Some loyalists held that Fang had committed suicide by drowning, as had Qu Yuan. For a discussion on the parallels drawn by loyalists between Fang’s death and the suicide of Qu Yuan, see Wai-yee Li’s introduction to \textit{Trauma and Transcendence}, pg. 52.
\end{footnotesize}
arguably be taken as showing that Tianran regarded this text as being a teaching directed at a broader audience which may have included Ming loyalists.

The connection between Tianran’s critique of the ‘insanity’ of poets who indulged in their emotional anguish and his syncretic conception of the idea of ‘innate nature and sentiments’ perhaps points to another connection, one between Tianran’s approach to poetry and his approach to religious practice. His critique of the ‘madness’ of some ‘loyal’ poets might be seen as being linked to his opposition to ‘crazed’ Chan (kuang chan 狂禪) or ‘wild fox Chan’ (ye hu chan 野狐禪).\(^{187}\) In the early Qing, the phenomenon of monks behaving enigmatically, violating taboos wantonly, yelling at disciples or beating them in the manner of Tang masters such as Linji Yixuan (臨濟義玄 d. 866)\(^ {188}\) had become pervasive. We can suggest that the actions of poets who indulged in making overt displays of their ‘madness’ – people such as Lun who had previously isolated themselves in a hut to indulge in their lamentations and who tried to advertise their melancholy by imitating the writings of, and identifying themselves with, the tragic loyal officials of antiquity who had committed suicide – had parallels with crazed Chan.

The connection between literary, philosophical and religious manifestations of ‘crazed Chan’ during the late Ming and wider Ming culture has been discussed in depth by Zhao Wei (趙偉),\(^ {189}\) and has also been discussed by Zhang Yonggang (張永剛).\(^ {190}\) Zhao Wei asserts that the term ‘crazed Chan’ was first used by advocates of the Cheng-Zhu tradition of neo-Confucianism such as scholars belonging to the Donglin faction of late Ming scholars. The term was initially used to attack the ‘crazed’ behaviour of the founder of the Taizhou school faction of the Wang Yangming school of mind, Li Zhi. It was also associated with critiques of iconoclasts such as Li who used Buddhist ideas to interpret Confucianism, or who argued that

\(^{187}\) Tianran’s disciple Jin Wu, in a postscript to his teacher’s Mind Seal of the Laṅkāvatāra, stated that Tianran was the ‘pillar that [stopped the flow of] kuangchan’ 砥柱狂禪, fascicle 1: (CBETA, X18, no. 334, p. 104, a17 // Z 1:27, p. 70, c11 // R27, p. 140, a11).

\(^{188}\) For extensive discussions on the nature and prevalence of ‘kuang chan’ in the late Ming / early Qing, see Jiang Wu’s Enlightenment in Dispute. See also Zhao Wei (趙偉) Wan Ming kuangchan sichao yu wenxue sixiang yanjiu 〈晚明狂禪思潮與文學思想研究〉. Chengdu: Bashu shushe. 2007.

\(^{189}\) Wan Ming kuangchan sichao yu wenxue sixiang yanjiu 〈晚明狂禪思潮與文學思想研究〉 (Research on the Late Ming Trend of ’Crazed Chan’ and Literary Thought).

\(^{190}\) See Zhang, ‘Wamming ‘Kuangchan’ yundong yu Gonganpai de xingshuai’ 〈晚期「狂禪」運動與公安派的興衰〉 (The late Ming ‘Crazed Chan’ Movement and the Rise and Decline of the Gongan School’) (Kunming ligong daxue xuebao (shehuikexue ban) 《昆明理工大學學報(社會科學版)》, Vol. 8, No. 4, 2008, pgs. 54-61). This paper does not discuss the Buddhist ‘crazed Chan’ trend in detail.
Confucianism, Buddhism and Taoism were in essence the same. According to Zhao, it was only later in the Ming that it was extended to critiques of what were deemed to be degenerate practices in Buddhist monasteries. In literary criticism, Kuangchan was in particular often associated with Gongan thinkers inspired by Li Zhi and the iconoclastic views of some Chan monks, who treated being ‘authentic’ as more important than abiding by traditional norms of social ethics and propriety. Although Tianran’s critiques of those whose writing was excessively devoted to the model of antiquity resembled the critiques of the Gongan school, we can suggest that he was as opposed to crazed iconoclasm as he was to archaism.

Tianran’s critique of ‘crazed intelligence’ in Buddhist practice and in literature can perhaps be seen as evolving from these tendencies. His reservations about excessive behaviour seem to have been primarily directed at crazed ‘loyalist’ poets. We can argue that both ‘crazed’ early Qing Buddhists and loyalist poets were inspired by, or mimicked and revered, ‘crazed’ or enigmatic figures of antiquity. While earlier critics might have seen a connection between the ‘kuang’ of Gongan/Taizhou school thinkers and their attempts to be ‘genuine,’ I would suggest that for Tianran, being kuang was the antithesis of being ‘zhen’ – it was associated with imitation, and thus ‘falsehood.’ One should always strive to be authentic, and if anguished emotions were excessive, they were not genuine or authentic. Tianran claimed that ‘crazed intelligence’ resulted from people lacking honest self-introspection. Being authentic required acknowledging negative feelings, but such feelings could also be ‘feigned’ or affected as a result of the desire to imitate others or to advertise the nobility or profundity of one’s sentiments. Indulging in these sentiments disassociated the author from his ‘true’ self, meaning that his words no longer conveyed his ‘true’ innate nature.

**Historical Transformations and the Shifting Tropes of Genuineness**

Tianran’s prefaces can be read as focusing on the moral, therapeutic and spiritual impact that poetry can have at junctures where the author faces intense emotional crises. At different

---

191 Zhang Yonggang’s ‘Wan Ming ‘kuangchan’ yundong yu Gonganpai de xingshuai’ asserts that the Gongan advocates were perhaps the main target of Donglin scholars’ critiques of ‘kuangchan,’ and that their critiques played a part in bringing about the decline of this school (see esp. pg. 56).

192 Chengjiu’s biography of Daosheng states: ‘The Master receives people in a regular manner, and is without exception genuine and authentic. Advocates of ‘wild fox’ Chan often dismiss and abjure him. However, after but a single meeting [with him], many men of genuine practice and genuine learning who are now respectable elders with their hair turning white are still in Danxia, and have not stepped off the mountain’ 師以本分事接人, 一味真實, 野狐禪輒斥去之, 一時會下, 多真參真究之士, 至今耆碩白首丹霞, 足不下山. In *Divination of Dreams*, pg. 79.
times Tianran wavered between showing support for, expressing ambivalent feelings towards, and – especially later in his life – voicing opposition to, the notion that venting emotional anguish was an appropriate and efficacious way of dealing with torment and of enlightening people. However, we can contend that there was an underlying theoretical consistency to these different positions. Stated simply, poetry should in all cases express vividly and authentically the innate nature and sentiments of the author; it should be ‘genuine.’ To be ‘genuine’, one should avoid imitating others blindly or placing too much emphasis on literary expression. Being ‘genuine’ certainly did not mean using poetry and stirring up one’s sentiments to aggrandize oneself, that is, using poetry as a medium for advertising one’s loyalty or profundity. Rather – as with Tianran’s understanding of genuineness in his religious thought – being ‘genuine’ required exercising ‘self-reflection’ and being honest in assessing shortcomings and harmful proclivities, especially those accentuated by exposure to personal or collective tragedy. Only by doing so could one finally express not only one’s sentiments (qing) and one’s ‘character’ (xing 性) but also the inner yearnings of one’s ‘innate nature’ (xing 性) – that is, one’s immaculate ‘Buddha nature’, the basis of one’s ‘true identity’ (xingqing). Tianran’s preface to Lun’s Interpretations of Sao perhaps had a message for bona fide ‘loyalist’ writers. This was that anger at the Qing had to give way to gradual acceptance of a new political reality, and to the prospect of lasting peace. ‘Locking oneself in one’s room’ and finding a private space to dwell on one’s anguish, let alone valorising this anguish as a mark of one’s loyalty, could no longer be described as either healthy or moral when Qing rule was becoming a more and more inescapable reality. Few monastic thinkers after Tianran composed treatises on poetry that discussed the positive religious value of ‘indignation’ as Daosheng had done. As the Qing began to consolidate its power, monks, in their literary interaction with gentry officials, had to continue to be ‘sincere.’ But it was no longer expedient for them to be seen to condone or legitimise conflict between this class and the Manchu state, that is, to support the gentry in being ‘disconnected’ and ‘indignant’.
Epilogue

This thesis has discussed a unique strand of monastic writings on poetry that emerged in ‘loyal/loyalist’ monasteries in the late Ming / early Qing. These works reflected the socially-engaged brand of Buddhism that had developed in that period, and we can argue that the ethos that these writings communicate differs markedly from the eremitic values that were dominant in earlier Buddhist poetry. The monastic writers of this era were particularly radical in that they affirmed the moral value of the expression of emotions that arose as a result of the poet’s engagement with the ‘defiled’ world of politics, acknowledging emotions that Buddhists conventionally regarded as impure and ‘unwholesome’ (*ākuśala*). In advocating the voicing of ‘indignation,’ it might even seem that they showed a positive view of one of the cardinal ‘three poisons’ (*trīḍoṣa*) – the three defilements whose eradication lies at the core of Buddhist soteriology.

We can argue that while the monks whose work I have examined emphasized ‘engagement’ with society in the broad sense, the core domain or locus of this engagement was the ‘defiled’ world of politics. Eminent Chinese Buddhist monks had, of course, been embroiled in politics since the early periods of the religion’s introduction to China. However, there was still a deep conflict between the ideals of the eremitic life and engagement with the political world. This conflict affected not only Buddhists but also others who embraced a life of reclusion and self-cultivation and who saw political involvement (particularly in times of moral decline) as threatening to their purity of thought and action.¹ In late Ming / early Qing writings on poetry, however, we see that it was suggested that dealing with ‘real’ and unpleasant political crises could in itself be an opportunity for realisation of the ‘genuine mind’. Because monastic and gentry culture converged more and more from the late Ming onwards, it arguably became possible to see the dissatisfaction of ‘loyal’ subjects’ at political injustices as part of the struggle against what was ‘unsatisfactory’ (*duḥkha*) that defined the Buddhist mission. As a result, new solutions could be found to the age-old conflict between eminent Chinese monks’ intimate engagement with politics and their own non-secular religious values.

¹ Richard Mather, for instance, points out that ‘Landscape Buddhism’ (Mather’s term) was promoted by the key founder of the ‘secular’ landscape poetry tradition and associate of Huiyuan, Xie Lingyun (謝靈運 385-433), as a complement to life in office, as well as being a potential alternative to it. See Mather’s ‘The Landscape Buddhism of the Fifth-century Poet Hsieh Ling-yun’ (*Journal of Asian Studies*, Vol. 18, Issue 1, Nov. 1958), pgs. 67-79.
However, we might argue that for some monks of the late Ming / early Qing period, politics was not so much something from which they felt they could not escape, but rather was a world that they thought it their duty to be part of and may even have at some level have yearned for. For this reason forced, coerced or reluctant ‘dislocation’ or ‘exile from politics was perhaps more of a source of difficulty for them than it had been for their predecessors. We might see a desire for power and authority as the source of the sufferings that gentry officials experienced in political life when they were in ‘exile’ from the ‘centre’ of political power. However, this ‘centre’ also entailed the idea of the ‘legitimate’ emperor who was the ‘son of heaven’, the ‘earthly’ conduit of divine cosmic will, giving the political centre a quasi-religious dimension. By abandoning the conventional Buddhist poetics of ‘detachment’ and by emphasising zhen as a concept that involved ‘reconnection’ between speech, emotion and the author’s world, monks who experienced the political upheavals of the late Ming / early Qing sought to find a remedy to the problem of ‘dislocation’ that they, or the communities they served, suffered from as ‘exiled’ loyal subjects. By bringing together impure ‘reality’ (zhen) and the transcendental ‘real’ (zhen), they brought the secular world into the fold of their Buddhist mission. The point of intersection between pastoral and soteriological goals was the idea that physical dislocation from the political ‘centre’ could be replaced by reconnection with a spiritual ‘centre’ – transcendental reality or truth.

The poetics of Hanshan are the first example of this process. Hanshan lived in an era when factionalism was hastening the decline of the Ming, and he was exiled from the centres of Ming power to the ‘peripheries’ of empire in China’s far south as a consequence of these factional struggles. He came to believe that being ‘genuine’ in depicting this traumatic experience could be a conduit for realising that all phenomena are manifestations of the ‘genuine mind.’ Hanshan used the concept that all is ‘mind only’ to ‘transform’ the hellish world of Leifeng’s steamy tropics into a ‘cool and pure’ realm. He broke the illusion of ‘dislocation’ between north and south, that is, between the ‘centres’ of power and influence where he had once resided, and the barbaric ‘peripheries’ of empire to which he was exiled. The idea of the unity of all phenomena belonging to ‘one mind’ helped him overcome the geographic boundaries that separated him from the ‘centre’. As Hanshan stated in his ‘Army
Poems’: ‘uneven are the landforms of north and south; the ten thousand li share the same bright moon.’

Daosheng’s dislocation or ‘exile’ was, unlike that of Hanshan, not geographic, but temporal. He lived through dark, ‘wintry’ times in which the Ming dynasty had fallen (surviving only as a remnant in the far south of China) and the new Qing state was consolidating itself, often by violent means. For Daosheng, ‘reconnection’ was a matter not of overcoming spatial barriers but rather of reconnecting with the proper order of time; he conceived this as a matter of entering, through winter, into a ‘season without summer and without winter.’ Daosheng understood history as a ‘seasonal’ cycle that was expressed in, and moved along by, alternating modes of poetic expression, a view based on correlating the four seasons with the four different types of poetic emotion that were delineated by Confucius. Being ‘straightforward’ in expressing ‘indignation’ in poetry could reawaken the spring light in the midst of a dark winter, restarting the temporal cycle. When sentiments come into harmony with the will of heaven they lead to an inner centring or reconnection with the transcendental source of the ‘centre’. Even when there was no ‘true’ political centre, this process of centring facilitated moral and spiritual progress, progress in which the poetry of indignation played a key role.

We can argue that Tianran moved away from these metaphysical approaches to ‘centring.’ In Tianran’s times the Ming dynasty had no real geographic base in mainland China and no real prospects of future restoration. For Tianran, the issue of resolving ‘dislocation’ from the ‘centre’ was not one of space (as it was for Hanshan) or of time (as it was for Daosheng). Instead, we can argue that he ‘internalised’ the question of the centre, seeing the state of being ‘uncentred’ as fundamentally psychological. For Tianran, the emotional turmoil of loyal subjects was not the product of disconnection from a ‘centre’ that was either geographical or historical (i.e. temporal), but was the result of being disconnected from the ‘way of heaven’ that this ‘centre’ should ideally follow. ‘Reconnection’ with this transcendental reality or truth, and by extension with one’s ‘true’ self, meant realising that traumatic external circumstances do not necessarily produce inner turmoil. Inner ‘centring’ can be achieved in the absence of an outer ‘centre.’ For Tianran, the anguish of Qu Yuan and other wronged ministers was no longer something that could be praised without qualification.

---

One still needed to be ‘genuine,’ but being genuine no longer entailed the vehement expression of ‘indignation’ about one’s own misfortune.

We can argue that it was ‘zhen’ that connected monks and their loyalist disciples to the ‘centre’, a centre that was ‘pure,’ and whose purity could protect morally-committed people from the ‘impurity’ or ‘defilement’ that grew and transformed in character as the Ming-Qing transition process unfolded. In Tianran’s era, after Ming rule had collapsed and hopes for its revival were fading, discussions on metaphysics were replaced with an emphasis on ‘inner’ centring. This centring was achieved by banishing ‘defiled’ emotions such as resentment, and by ‘purifying’ the body by rejecting ‘impure’ substances such as alcohol. We can suggest that the growing emphasis on the ‘internal’ ‘purity’ of the body arose as the ‘impurity’ of the outer world faded. Arguably, when monks and ‘loyal’ disciples became submerged in a ‘defiled’ world as the Ming declined and then fell, they first tried to connect with remnants of the old world that were still ‘pure’ and then tried to recreate a pure world. As the world around them became more and more impure, they attempted to draw upon an inner ‘purity’ divorced from the outer ‘impurity’ of politics. But when a dark age began to be replaced by a new enlightened age, purifying the ‘inner’ body seems to have become more of an imperative; we can argue that this purification prepared the subject to re-engage with the ‘outer’ world of politics.

The efforts of monks who were in literal or figurative exile to ‘reconnect’ with a ‘pure centre’ through zhen were paralleled by attempts to forcefully ‘dislocate’ themselves from impurity. This is why genuineness needed to be paired with indignation. Indignation served as the most potent symbol of their rejection of the impure or turbid world into which they had been thrown. The emphasis of Daosheng and his peers on indignation, did not reflect a dilution of religious commitments or an acceptance of the impurities of the secular world of politics, but was rather a means to reject those impurities. However, indignation itself needed to be purified; it needed to be zhen – to be centred or linked with the ‘centre.’ The emphasis on the need to be zhen in expressing indignation might be regarded as an instrument that these monks adopted to ensure that their violent rejection of impurity did not itself become a source of violence and corruption; they were attempting to ensure that there was ‘indignation without resentment’. It helped them to regain or maintain inner harmony, or ‘centredness,’ in a largely futile struggle against the political violence and the historical upheavals of their times.
I contend that the ideas about poetic genuineness put forward by monks of the late Ming / early Qing were not only a development in Buddhist literary theory, but also supplied a new resource for uniting Buddhist practice and a pastoral strategy for addressing the practical and existential problems of loyal subjects faced with crises in the political ‘centre.’ It is plausible to see these developments as a belated response to a very long historical problem, one which, as noted above, had roots in the earliest periods of Buddhism’s development in China – the problem of monks seeking to pursue pure religious lives while engaging closely with the political world, and in particular with political figures. Literary exchange, and poetry in particular, had traditionally played an important part in the interactions between monks and people in the political world. I would argue that the Ming-Qing transition witnessed a pivotal transformation in the way that this engagement was understood and managed, and in the relation that engagement had to literary practice in the monastery. On the one hand, there was a new acceptance that Buddhists and even monks could legitimately have political lives and engage with political issues. On the other hand, this engagement could not only be reconciled with religious ideals, but could even provide a conducive site for religious practice. Furthermore, these developments opened the possibility that Buddhism could itself play new and more active roles in the political lives of lay disciples themselves, and perhaps even in politics more generally.

This last claim may seem excessive, but it was arguably something that critics of Buddhism acknowledged. One such figure was Qu Dajun. Writing about the poetry of Tianran’s dharma brother Zuxin Hanke, Qu stated that ‘[the author’s] wounded feelings at the loss of social ethics, regret at the demise of his state, and his peerless perfected character, are something which the gentry are unable to attain’ 其痛傷人倫之變，感慨家國之亡，至性絕人，有士大夫之所不能及者. And he observed: ‘[When] a sage does not arise, the great dao is lost and must be sought in Chan; when loyal officials and filial sons are few, great righteousness is lost and must be sought in the sangha. The teachings of the Spring and Autumn Annals have perished and so the power to express praise and blame is lost, and must be pursued through poetry’ 聖人不作，大道失而求諸禪。忠臣孝子無多，大義失而求諸僧。春秋已亡，褒貶失而求諸詩. The above passage expresses the view that in an era of decline,
monk’s ‘loyalty,’ the Buddhist *dao*, and poetry’s capacity for emotionally-charged moral commentary, came together in ways which served as a substitute for the key moral pillars of a more enlightened world: enlightened Confucian governance, an enlightened Confucian gentry and enlightened Confucian literature. From Qu’s perspective as a devout loyalist who himself temporarily and perhaps reluctantly ‘escaped into Chan,’ this was not an ideal state of affairs. Despite this, he acknowledges the moral and political value of Buddhism, particularly at a time of crisis.

*The ‘Loyalist’ Legacy: Anguish and ‘Orthodoxy of Sentiment’ in Qing/Republican-Era Lingnan Monastic Poetry*

Had Qu Dajun lived through the flourishing period of the early-mid Qing, he might well have acknowledged that this trajectory of Confucian decline and the concomitant flourishing of Buddhist institutions had been reversed. We can observe that the poetry of moral indignation seems to have become less prominent as Qing rule consolidated itself. However, when the Qing itself declined in the late 19th and early 20th centuries, it was again suggested that monks were to be praised for writing poetry that voiced impassioned responses to historical events. He Jialin (何佳林) expressed this in his ‘Preface’ to the *Lianxi Poetry Anthology* (*Lianxi shi cun*), a collection published in 1893 by the late Qing monk Baofa (寶筏) of Haichuang temple:

> After Tianran preached the dharma in Lingnan, the *Haiyun Chan Literature* anthology – which selected the collected writings of more than 120 authors of the ilk of Azi – greatly opened up the teachings of the orthodox doctrine. In general, its genre of poetry is works that reflect poignantly on their times and narrate events; like the school of Hanshan, they all emanate from a moral correctness of innate nature and of sentiments. For this reason it has lasted a long time and is widely available. Over the past hundred years and more, the compositions of the elders [Jindan] Chenyi, Shidong [Lihuan] and Jishan [Chengjiu] have been as numerous as the trees in a forest; they are all [similar to Chengjiu’s] *Collection of The Hall of the Divination of Dreams*. Furthermore, in the last few decades there have been Squire Jing’s *Fragrant Sea Collection*, Squire Yin’s *Hall of India Collection*, Squire Cheng’s *Water and Clouds Collection*, Squire Jie’s *Collection from the Mysterious Thatched Hut*, Squire She’s *Sparse Clouds Collection* – these all take Haiyun as their ancestral lineage and Haichuang as their school; we can go back upstream to find their source there.

自天然之聞(聞)法嶺南，所采阿字輩一百二十餘人之集編而為《海雲禪藻》，大啟宗風。其詩類多感時述事，亦如憨山之一派皆出乎性情之正，所以歷久

---

title ‘The Poems of the Monk Zuxin [Hanke]’ (‘Seng Zuxin shi’) (僧祖心詩).
The above passage depicts a Lingnan ‘lineage’ of monastic poetry that was characterised by ‘morally-correctness of innate nature and of sentiments’ (xingqing zhi zheng 性情之正) and by ‘reflecting poignantly on the times and narrating events.’ This ‘lineage’ stemmed from the writings of Hanshan, and linked his writings with those of Tianran’s Haiyun order and with other Lingnan monastic poets up to the late Qing. He Jialin’s tracing of this poetic lineage back to Hanshan occurred in a period of political upheaval that strongly paralleled the world of the late Ming – the era of the final years of the Qing. There is evidence that poetry expressing Buddhist critiques of moral decline was particularly emphasised in this era. The late Qing / early Republican commentator Cheng Dequan (程德全 1860-1930) praised the mysterious Tang Buddhist poet Hanshan (寒山), whose poetry mixes ‘mountain residence’ forms with pithy moral exhortations and spiritual guidance, saying that his ostensibly Buddhist poetry ‘used wording that was mocking and filled with invective, so that when he encountered distressing moments of torment, sorrow and rage, he was able to express it in poems and songs’以詼諧謾罵之辭，遇其牢愁悲憤之慨，發為詩歌. Cheng states that the Tang dynasty Hanshan was inspired to do this by his intense dissatisfaction with and dismay at the corruption of officials and at the tumult of his era5 - a view of the poetry of the Tang-era Hanshan that was seldom expressed prior to the time of Cheng.

Other monastic authors who lived during the tumultuous period of Qing decline wrote poetry that was even more similar to the models of poetry that this dissertation has studied. Perhaps the most famous example is the late Qing Jiangnan poet Bazhi Toutuo (八指頭陀 also known as Jichan Jing’an 寄禪敬安 1851-1912) – a politically-marginalised monk who grew up during the time of the Taiping rebellion (1850-1864), and whose writings are regarded as expressing ‘sullen disconsolation’ and ‘anguished’ ‘patriotic’ sentiments.6 Bazhi Toutuo was

---

4 I quoted part of this passage in Chapter 3. For the original passage, see Baofa (寶筏) The Lianxi Collection of Selected Poems (Lianxi shicun)《蓮西詩存》(Beijing Shifandaxue tushuguan cong xijian Qingren bei ji congkan 《北京師範大學圖書館藏稀見清人別集叢刊》, Vol. 30, Guilin: Guangxi shifandaxue chubanshe, 2007), pg. 365.

5 See Hanshan (寒山), Li Yi (李誼) (ed.) Chanjia Hanshan shi zhu 《禅家寒山詩注》(Taipei: Zhengzhong shuju, 1992), pg. 674.

6 Hwang Ching-chia [Huang Jingjia] (黃敬家) in ‘Bazhi Toutuo shi zhong de rushi qinghuai yu chanwu yijing’ 〈八指頭陀詩中的入世情懷與禪悟意境〉(Chengdu zhongwen xuebao 《成都中文學報》, Vol. 29, July 2010, pgs. 83-114) discusses both Bazhi Toutuo’s ‘Chan of poetry’ (詩禪) and his tenet of being engaged with
both a mentor to, and much admired by, the eminent and influential Republican-era ‘humanistic’ Buddhist and reformer Taixu (太虛 1890-1947). Early in his monastic career, Taixu composed poems that were not dissimilar to those of Bazhi Toutuo, poems that expressed emotional anguish at the chaotic state of the world during the violent political transition from Qing to Republican rule. For example, Taixu’s ‘Poem on Lamenting the State of the World together with Yunquan’ (1908) (‘He Yunquan kaishi shi (Wushen)) 《和雲泉慨世詩(戊申)》 contains the lines: ‘The world is in chaos, and I board a small raft to float across the sea; The scars of the past cover the land. Facing the wind, I shed tears of sorrowful concern for the times’ 世亂乘桴浮海游，幾年鴻爪九垓周。臨風一灑憂時淚。 Taixu had responded to the ongoing political revolution of his era by promoting a Buddhist ‘revolution,’ and was one of the main figures responsible for the formation of the ‘humanistic’ Buddhism (人間佛教) that developed in China and in Taiwan in the mid-to-late 20th century, and flourishes in many parts of the wider Chinese world today.

Ming-Qing Monastic Poetry and its Resonances with Humanistic Buddhism

Is it possible that the ideas about poetry that took shape in the Ming-Qing transition monastery laid the foundations for the distinctive literary practices of modern ‘humanistic’ Chinese Buddhism? As noted, humanistic Buddhism is the brand of Chinese Buddhism that is dominant in Taiwan and in much of Sinophone Southeast Asia and is increasingly present in mainland China. Its principle modern advocates are Sheng-yan (Shengyan 聖嚴 1931-2009), Hsing-yun (Xingyun 星雲 born 1927)), and Cheng-yan (Zhengyan 證嚴 born 1937).

---

7 A number of poems written about Bazhi Toutuo can be found in Taixu, Taixu dashi quanshu bian weiyuanhui 《太虛大師全書》編委員會 (ed.) Taixu dashi quanshu 《太虛大師全書》, (Beijing: Zongjiao wenhua chubanshe, 2004), fascicle 34, Shicun 《詩存》– ‘Caoyin caoshe shicun’ 《潮音草舍詩存》, pgs. 1-6. See ‘Caoyin caoshe shicun,’ pg. 10.
8 See ‘Caoyin caoshe shicun,’ pg. 10.
9 A discussion on Taixu’s reforms can be found in Don Pittman’s Toward a Modern Chinese Buddhism: Taixu’s Reforms (Honolulu: University of Hawai‘i Press, 2001). For a more recent discussion on Taixu’s ideas about the relationship between Buddhism and modernity, and the context in which these ideas arose, see Scott Pacey’s article ‘Taixu, Yogācāra and the Buddhist Approach to Modernity’ (in John Makeham, (ed.) Transforming Consciousness: Yogācāra Thought in Modern China, New York, Oxford University Press, 2014), pgs. 103-122.
Hsing-yun, founder of the Buddhist Light Mountain or Fo Guang Shan (Foguang shan 佛光山) tradition, and Sheng-yen of Dharma Drum (Fagu shan 法鼓山) both arrived in Taiwan soon after the Chinese Nationalists retreated to the island in 1949 following decades of civil war on the Chinese mainland. Like the late Ming / early Qing Buddhists studied in this dissertation, these leaders have advocated concern for the material welfare of people, have engaged extensively in charitable endeavours, and have also emphasised Buddhism’s role in upholding traditional social ethics. They have also sought to spread the dharma through non-‘Buddhist’ media and literary genres, including biographies and self-help books, television programs (Fo Guang Shan has its own cable network), websites and other digital media platforms, and newspapers. The religious leaders of these Buddhist organisations use these media forms to promote, and put into practice, ideas that resonate with those found in the Ming-Qing Buddhist writings on poetry that this thesis has investigated. Cheng-yen has stated, as a principle of Buddhist practice, that ‘when people are wounded I feel pain... when people suffer I feel empathetic sadness.’ This principle has often been expressed in published dharma talks that discuss current events and crises, and which advocate reflection on the emotional anguish that these events engender. For example, Cheng-yen spoke of feeling ‘pain throughout the heart’ after hearing details of the Malaysian Airline MH17 tragedy and the Fuxing GE222 incident in July 2014. Hsing-yun has been a strong advocate of the notion that Chinese Buddhism has an important role to play in promoting traditional Chinese social ethics and raising public morality, and has been vocal in discussing political issues, such as cross-strait relations. He has even stated that the so-called ‘China dream,’ promoted by China’s current President Xi Jinping, not only has value as a political discourse or ideology, but can also inspire new forms of Buddhist practice. Sheng-yen has written on...
several occasions about the ‘mind of great rage’ (*dafen* 大憤) in Buddhist practice. He has stated that ‘the mind of great rage’ ‘is not a kind of *dvesa*... it means persistently practicing Buddhism with vigour, and continuously moving forward. When we come across difficulties, we feel empty and disappointed... But Buddhist practice is just like the saying that ‘when moving against the current in a boat, if you are not moving forward, then you are moving backwards.’ When you cook rice, you need to steam it until it is cooked. If you steam it for a moment, turn off the fire, and then start the fire again, the rice will never be cooked. Buddhist cultivation is the same.’

In different ways, these religious leaders all focus on addressing real world problems in a down-to-earth manner; they emphasise being ‘authentic’ in practice and putting emotional energy to positive use and see this as being at the centre of what it means to practice ‘humanistic’ Buddhism. In other words, they emphasise being authentic, dealing with real problems in the real world and engaging in Buddhist practice that will lead to the realization of spiritual ‘truth.’

What impact late Ming / early Qing ideas on the poetic expression of *zhen* grievances had on Chinese Buddhism in southern China after the consolidation of Qing power, and whether this has in some way shaped the literary practices of modern ‘humanistic’ Buddhists, are questions that invite further study. Nonetheless, the unique discourses on poetry that have been studied in this dissertation have, I believe, great intrinsic value. I hope that the study of these texts will open up a new sub-chapter in the intellectual history of the late-imperial Chinese monastery and in the study of the evolution of monastic literary theory, and, less directly, will raise important questions about how Chinese Buddhism and Buddhist doctrine have responded to eras of profound political and social crisis. I hope also that this dissertation may encourage a re-evaluation of what was and was not ‘Buddhism’ in a period whose Buddhist monasteries have often been decried for having become excessively ‘sinicised’ and ‘secularised.’

---

15 A discussion on this can also be found in Ku Ts’ung-yu [Ku Zongyu] (*辜琮瑜*) *Shengyan fashi de chanxue sixiang* 《聖嚴法師的禪學思想》 (Taipei: Fagu wenhua shiyi youxian gongsi, 2002), pg. 185, as well as in Sheng-yen’s book *Chan de tiyan, chan de kaishi* 《禪的體驗,禪的開示》 (Taipei: Fagu wenhua shiyi youxian gongsi, 1999), pg. 116.

16 See the website: Dharma Drum Mountain (ddm.org.tw): <https://www.ddm.org.tw/maze/135/7-1.htm>. The title of this article is *Dafen xin – faqi jingjin de xin* 《大憤心 – 發起精進的心》. The quote originally appears in *Shengyan fashi de chanxue sixiang*, pg. 185.
Bibliography

English Works

Araki Kengo (1975) ‘Confucianism and Buddhism in the Late Ming’ in de Bary (ed.) The Unfolding of neo-Confucianism, pgs. 39-66.


(1975) ‘Chu-hung and Lay Buddhism in the Late Ming’ in de Bary (ed.) The Unfolding of Neo-Confucianism, pgs. 93-140.


Translations


(1885) ‘Book XVII. Yo Kî or Record of Music [1],’ Section 1 (4) in Legge The Li Kî (The Book of Rites) Part II.


Chinese Works (Secondary)


Chen Yuan (陳垣) (Rpt.1990) Shishi yinian lu 《釋氏疑年錄》. Shanghai: Shanghai shudian chubanshe

(Rpt. 1985) Qingchu seng zheng ji 《清初僧詮記》. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju.

(Rpt. 1962) Mingji Dian Qian fojiao kao 《明季滇黔佛教考》. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju


(2008) ‘Fang Yizhi yu Mingdai fugu shixue de chengbian guanxi kaolun’ 〈方以智與明代復古詩學的承變關係考論〉 Chengda zhongwen xuebao 《成大中文學報》, No.21, July, pgs. 71-100


(2001) Ming yimin de Zhuangzi dingwei lunti 《明遺民的莊子定位論題》. Taipei: Taiwan daxue chuban weiyuanhui.


Xu Youfang (許又方) (2011) Zhuti shuxing de zhuixun yu chonggou : Qu Yuan de shenfen rentong ji Han ren dui ta de yuedu yu shuxie 《主體屬性的追尋與重構：屈原的身分認同及漢人對他的閱讀與書寫》. Taipei: Daan chubanshe.


Japanese Works


Chinese Works (Primary) (Includes Chinese translations of Buddhist texts)

Abhidharmamahāvibhāṣā-śāstra / Apidamo da piposha lun 《阿毘達磨大毘婆沙論》 (CBETA, T27, No.1545).


Bie’an Xingtong (別菴性統) Xu deng zhengtong 《續燈正統》 (CBETA, X84, No.1583).
Buddhāvatamsaka-mahāvaipulya-sūtra / Dafangguang fo huayan jing 《大方廣佛華嚴經》 (CBETA, T09, No.278).


Chaoyong (超永) Wu deng quan shu 《五燈全書》 (CBETA, X81, No.1571).

Chen Shiqing (陳世英), Tao Xuan (陶煊) et al. (comp.), Shi Guru (釋古如) (supplementary author), Qiu Jiang (仇江), Li Fubiao (李福標) (colls., eds.) (Rpt. 2003) Danxia shan zhi 《丹霞山志》. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju.


Deng Zhicheng (鄧之誠) (Rpt. 1984) Qing shi jishi chubian 《清詩紀事初編》. Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe.

Dharmatrāta Fa ju jing 《法句經》 (CBETA, T04, No.210).


Guifeng Zongmi (圭峰宗密) Yuanjuejing shu chao 《圓覺經略疏鈔》 (CBETA, X09, No.248).

Hanshan (寒山); Li Yi (李詠) (ed.) (Rpt. 1992) Chanjia Hanshan shi zhu 《禪家寒山詩注》. Taipei: Zhengzhong shuju.

Hanshan Deqing (憨山德清) Guan Lengqie jing ji 《觀楞伽經記》 (CBETA, X17, No.326).

Hanshan laoren mengyou ji 《憨山老人夢遊集》 (CBETA, X73, No.1456, p. 459, b5).


Zhuangzi neipian zhu 《莊子內篇註》 (CBETA, L153, No.1636).


Hanyue Facang (漢月法藏) Sanfeng-zang chanshi shanjushi 《三峰藏禪師山居詩》 (Manuscript, China National Library)

Harivarman, Kumārajīva (trans.) Satyasiddhi-śāstra (Cheng shi lun)《成實論》 (CBETA, T32, No.1646).


_Danxia Dangui chanshi yulu_ 《丹霞澹歸禪師語錄》 (CBETA, J38, No.B409).

Jin Zhiming (金志明) *Chan yuan mengqiu yaolin* 《禪苑蒙求瑤林》 (CBETA, X87, no. 1614).


Jiying (紀蔭) *Zong tong bian nian* 《宗統編年》 (CBETA, X86, No.1600).


*Tianjie Juelang-sheng chanshi quanlu* 《天界覺浪盛禪師全錄》 (CBETA, J34, No.B311).


Kumārajīva (trans.) *Chengshi lun* 《成實論》 (CBETA, T32, no. 1646).

Li Kaixian (李開先) (Rpt. 1959) *Li Kaixian ji* 《李開先集》. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju.

Li Zhi (李贄) (Rpt. 1961) *Li shi fenshu; xu fenshu* 《李氏焚書 續焚書》. Kyoto: Chūbun shuppansha.


_Mahāprajñāpāramitā-sūtra / Daboreboluomiduo jing* 《大般若波羅蜜多經》 (CBETA, T07, no. 220).


Mengzi (孟子) (Zhao Qi 趙岐, Sun Shi (孫奭) (coms.), Li Xueqin (李學勤) (ed.)) (Rpt. 2001) *Mengzi zhushu* 《孟子注疏》. Taipei: Taiwan guji chubanshe.


Shen Shirong (沈士榮) Xu yuanjiao lun 《續原教論》 (CBETA, J20, No.B090).

Shengke Deyu (聖可德玉) Chanlin baoshun shunzhu《禪林寶訓順硃》(CBETA X64 No.1265).

Shilian Dashan (石濂大汕); Wan Yi (萬毅), Du Aihua (杜靄華), Chou Jiang (仇江) (coll., eds.) (Rpt. 2007) Dashan heshang ji 《大汕和尚集》. Guangzhou: Zhongshan daxue chubanshe.

Sengyou (僧祐) Chu sanzang ji ji 《出三藏記集》 (CBETA, T55, No.2145).


Bore xinjing zhishuo 《般若心經直說》(CBETA, X26, No.542).

Lengqie jing xinyin 《楞伽經心印》 (CBETA, X18, No.334).
Lengyan jing zhi zhi 《楞嚴經直指》 (CBETA, X14, No.291).
(Rpt. 2006) Qiu Jiang (仇江), Li Fubiao (李福標) (coll./eds.) Xiatang shiji《瞎堂詩集》. Guangzhou: Zhongshan daxue chubanshe.

Tianran heshang tongzhu xunlüe 《天然和尚同住訓略》 (Photocopy: Sun Yat-sen University Manuscript).


Wuyi Yuanlai (無異元來) Wuyi Yuanlai chanshi guanglu 《無異元來禪師廣錄》 (CBETA, X72, No.1435).


Xuanzang (玄奘) Cheng weishi lun 《成唯識論》 (CBETA T31, No. 1585).

Yongjue Yuanxian (永覺元賢) Yongjue Yuanxian chanshi guanglu 《永覺元賢禪師廣錄》 (CBETA, X72, No.1437).

Yongming Yanshou (永明延壽) Guan xin xuan-ou 《觀心玄樞》 (CBETA, X65, No.1290).

Zong jing lu《宗鏡錄》 (CBETA, T48, No.2016)

Yunmen Kuangzhen (雲門匡真) Yunmen Kuangzhen chanshi guanglu 《雲門匡真禪師廣錄》 (CBETA, T47, No.1988).

Yushan Shangsi (雨山上思) Yushan heshang yulu 《雨山和尚語錄》 (CBETA, J40, No. B494).

Zibo Zhenke (紫柏真可) *Zibo zunzhe quan ji* 《紫柏尊者全集》 (CBETA, X73, No.1452).

Zeng Fengyi (曾鳳儀) *Lengqie jing zong tong* 《楞伽經宗通》 (CBETA, X17, No.330)

Zhanran Yuancheng (湛然圓澄) *Jin’gang sanmei jing zhujie* 《金剛三昧經注解》 (CBETA, X35, No. 651).

Zhang Yan (張炎) 《詞源》. Shanghai: Shangwu yinshuguan.


Zhizhou (知周) *Chengweishi lun yanmi* 《成唯識論演祕》 (CBETA, T43, No.1833)


Zhu Xinyuan (朱心圓) 《揞黑豆集》 (CBETA, X85, No.1592).


Zongbao Daodu (宗寶道獨) *Zongbao Daodu chanshi yulu* 《宗寶道獨禪師語錄》. (CBETA, X72, No.1443).

Zuxin Hanke (祖心函可); Yan Zhixiong (嚴志雄), Yang Quan (楊權) (coll., eds.) (Rpt. 2008) *Qianshan shiji* 《千山詩集》. Taipei: Zhongyang yanjuyuan Zhongguo wen-zhe yanjiusuo.

**Web Pages**


“Hsingyun dashi tan ‘Zhongguomeng yu renjian fojiao’ 《星雲大師談「中國夢與人間佛教」》. Life News Agency 人間通訊社. http://www.lnanews.com/news/%E6%98%9F%E9%9B%84%E5%8A%A8%E5%9B%82%E5%9B%B2%E5%A4%A7%E5%B8%AB%E8%AB%87%E3%80%8C%E4%B8%AD%E5%9C%8B%E5%A4%A2%E8%88%87%E4%BA%BA%E9%96%93%E4%BD%9B%E6%95%99%E3%80%8D.html (accessed February 26, 2016).


Minerva Access is the Institutional Repository of The University of Melbourne

Author/s:
Bell, Corey

Title:
Genuine anguish, genuine mind: 'loyal' Buddhist monks, poetics and soteriology in Ming-Qing transition-era Southern China

Date:
2016

Persistent Link:
http://hdl.handle.net/11343/120187

File Description:
Genuine Anguish, Genuine Mind: 'Loyal' Buddhist Monks, Poetics and Soteriology in Ming-Qing Transition-era Southern China

Terms and Conditions:
Terms and Conditions: Copyright in works deposited in Minerva Access is retained by the copyright owner. The work may not be altered without permission from the copyright owner. Readers may only download, print and save electronic copies of whole works for their own personal non-commercial use. Any use that exceeds these limits requires permission from the copyright owner. Attribution is essential when quoting or paraphrasing from these works.