Motivation and Place:
Music Participation in Rural Australia

Amelia Anne Gallina

ORCID Identifier of the Author: 0000-0001-9466-0680
Degree for which this thesis is being submitted: Doctor of Philosophy
Year of Submission: April 2017
Melbourne Graduate School of Education
This thesis is being submitted in fulfilment of a PhD.
Abstract

The nature of music learning and music’s unique function in students’ lives point to important additional challenges to understand the motivation to learn music. (Thomas, 1992, p.425).

The aim of this research was to explore the participation motivation of students and musicians from two rural Australian towns. Secondly, to examine the role of ‘Place’ in influencing motivation to become involved in music. The third purpose of this study is to explore whether there is any understanding to be gained from considering the three categories of music participation (Kokotsaki and Hallam, 2007) and Kudryavtsev, Stedman and Kransny’s (2012) model of Place.

The situational and sustained motivation to participate in music is examined by taking a close look at the motivational profile of participants. Data was collected through the practice of questionnaires, observations of music classes and rehearsals and interviews with students and community musicians.

The findings of this research can be explained based on three categories (Kokotski and Hallam, 2007). Music as a musical act involves the motivational role of repertoire. The musicians affinity with their own sound and desire to improve their own musicianship as well as the seeking out of opportunity that is the opportunity to get out of the practice room and into the reality of the performance space. The second category of findings is music as a social act. Which includes topics such as the economic support behind the community bands and choir. Finding a sense of community and the recognition of the ensemble within the community and the role of music participation in the chance to interact with and meet new people. The involvement of music for the purpose of extra musical gain is the third and final category of research findings and can be summarised as Personal motivations. Such extra musical gain sought by participants includes creativity, confidence and the development of stronger personality.
Declaration

(i) The thesis comprises the original work towards the Doctor of Philosophy.
(ii) Due acknowledgement has been made in the text to all other material used.
(iii) The thesis is fewer than the maximum word limit in length, exclusive of tables, maps, bibliographies and appendices.
Acknowledgements

There are many acknowledgements that need to be made to people who have contributed in some way to the completion of this research. I would like to begin by thanking my PhD supervisors Associate Professor Neryl Jeanneret and Professor Susan Wright. I would also like to thank the musicians and teachers who participated in my research: the music faculty from Tobruk College, Haven Civic Band, Haven Civic Choir and Aster Falls Town Band without who this research could never have been carried out.
Table of Contents

List of Tables ........................................................................................................ viii
Figures.................................................................................................................... ix

1. Background .......................................................................................................... 1
   1.2 Research Questions ....................................................................................... 2
   1.3. Significance ................................................................................................ 2
   1.4. Organisation of the thesis ........................................................................... 3
   1.5 Keywords ...................................................................................................... 4

Chapter 2. Literature Review .................................................................................. 5
  2.1 Motivation to study music .............................................................................. 5
     2.1.1 Music as a musical act .............................................................................. 5
     2.1.2 Music as a social act ................................................................................ 6
     2.1.3 Personal motivations ................................................................................ 7
  2.2 Challenges and de-motivating factors ............................................................ 9
  2.3 Predictors of retention .................................................................................... 11
  2.4 The concept of place ...................................................................................... 14
  2.5 Rural education ............................................................................................... 17
     2.5.1 Motivation and rural youth ..................................................................... 17
     2.5.2 Relationships and rural youth ................................................................. 18
     2.5.3 The problematic rural curriculum .......................................................... 18
     2.5.4 The particular difficulties facing education in rural areas ....................... 19
  2.6 Conclusion ....................................................................................................... 21

Chapter 3. Literature Review: Motivation Theory Reviewed .................................. 22
  3.1 Attribution Theory ........................................................................................ 23
  3.2 Expectancy Value Theory .............................................................................. 24
  3.3 Goal Orientation theory ................................................................................ 27
  3.4 Conclusion ....................................................................................................... 34

Chapter 4. Methodology ......................................................................................... 39
  4.1 Qualitative research ....................................................................................... 39
  4.2 Quantitative research ...................................................................................... 40
  4.3 Mixed methods research ............................................................................... 41
  4.4 Research that has studied motivation in relation to music education .............. 41
  4.5 Methodological approach ............................................................................. 43
  4.6 A Multiple Case study approach ................................................................... 43
  4.7 Participants ..................................................................................................... 44
  4.8 Questionnaire ................................................................................................. 45
  4.9 Semi-structured Interviews .......................................................................... 47
  4.10 Observation .................................................................................................... 51
  4.11 Data Collection ............................................................................................. 52
  4.12 Analysis ......................................................................................................... 53
  4.13 Reflecting on the Tools ............................................................................... 53
  4.14 For Noting..................................................................................................... 60
  4.15 Conclusion ..................................................................................................... 60

5. Pilot Study: Results from Tobruk College ...................................................... 61
  5.1 Background .................................................................................................. 61
  5.2. Recruitment of participants ...................................................................... 62
  5.3 Students and parents .................................................................................... 62
6.3.6 Socio-economic status ........................................... 117
6.3.7 Conductor Character ............................................ 118
6.3.8 Conductor Strategy ............................................. 119
6.3.9 Conductor Motivation .......................................... 120
6.3.10 Culture .......................................................... 121
6.3.11 Challenge ......................................................... 123
6.4. Conclusion .......................................................... 125

Chapter 7. Aster Falls ..................................................... 126
7.1 Aster Falls Town Band ............................................. 126
7.1.1 Alwin Franks ..................................................... 126
7.1.2 Samuel Pendar ................................................... 127
7.1.3 Chester Green .................................................... 127
7.1.4 Charlie Chalk ..................................................... 127
7.1.5 Carrie Roads ...................................................... 128
7.1.6 Doug Higgins .................................................... 128
7.1.7 Gayle Gray ........................................................ 129
7.1.8 Garry Long ........................................................ 129
7.1.9 Jill Jones ............................................................ 129
7.1.10 James Carter ..................................................... 130
7.1.11 Mackenzie Black .............................................. 130
7.2 Emergent Themes ..................................................... 131
7.2.1 Personal and Musical Experience ........................... 131
7.2.2 Safety Comfort and Accessibility .......................... 132
7.2.3 Belonging .......................................................... 133
7.2.4 Collegiate Music Making ..................................... 135
7.2.5 Socio-economic status ........................................ 136
7.2.6 Conductor/Teacher Character ............................... 137
7.2.7 Conductor/Teacher Strategy .................................. 138
7.2.8 Culture ............................................................. 139
7.2.9 Challenge ......................................................... 140
7.3 Conclusion ............................................................ 141

Chapter 8. Comparing sites ............................................. 142
8.1 Framework for Analysis ........................................... 142
8.2 Haven Civic Band .................................................. 143
8.3 Haven Civic Choir .................................................. 154
8.4 Aster Falls Concert Band ......................................... 167
8.5 Conclusion: Comparison between sites ....................... 180

Chapter 9. Discussion and Conclusion ............................... 183
9.1 Music as a Musical Act ............................................. 183
9.2 Music as a Social Act .............................................. 188
9.3 Personal Motivations Revisited ................................. 190
9.4 Drawing it all Together ............................................ 193
9.5 Conclusion ........................................................... 193
9.6 Limitations of the study .......................................... 194
9.7 Significance of the Study ......................................... 195
9.8 Directions for Further Research ................................. 196

References ...................................................................... 197
List of Tables

Table 3.1 Three recent theories of motivation: A summary ................................................. 23
Table 3.2 Expectancy value theory (based on Paul Pintrich, 1989 & Pintrich and DeGroot, 1990) .......................................................... 26
Table 3.3 Goal orientation theory: Multiple perspectives from the literature (Table adapted from Paul Pintrich, 2000) .................................................. 29
Table 4.1 Methodologies employed in a small sample of studies presented in the literature .................................................. 42
Table 4.2 Number of participants .......................................................... 45
Table 4.3 Scales and sample questionnaire items .......................................................... 46
Table 4.4 Types of interview (Cohen, Manion and Morrison, 2011 & Gillham, 2005) .......................................................... 48
Table 4.5 Table of themes .......................................................... 50
Table 4.6 Music student and community musicians: Link between theme and focus of Questions and Interviews—Questionnaire, Interview and Observation .......................................................... 56
Table 4.7 Instrumental music teacher and community conductors: Link between theme and focus of Questionnaire and Interview .......................................................... 57
Table 4.8 Principal and parents: Link between theme and focus .......................................................... 58
Table 4.9 Link between theme and focus: Bringing it all together .......................................................... 59
Table 5.1 Student participants from Tobruk College .......................................................... 63
Table 5.2 Teacher participant from Tobruk College .......................................................... 74
Table 6.1 Participants from Haven Civic Band .......................................................... 99
Table 6.2 Participants from Haven Civic Choir .......................................................... 104
Table 7.1 Participants from Aster Falls Town Band .......................................................... 106
Table 8.1 Haven Civic Band: Performance orientation .......................................................... 145
Table 8.2 Haven Civic Band: Task Value-Breakdown .......................................................... 148
Table 8.3 Haven Civic Band: PSSM Items .......................................................... 151
Table 8.4 Haven Civic Band: Extrinsic and Intrinsic-Goal orientation .......................................................... 152
Table 8.5 Haven Civic Choir: Item Statements 1 .......................................................... 155
Table 8.6 Haven Civic Choir: Item Statements 2 .......................................................... 156
Table 8.7 Haven Civic Choir: Task Value 1 .......................................................... 157
Table 8.8 Haven Civic Choir: Task Value 2 .......................................................... 158
Table 8.9 Haven Civic Choir: PSSM Items 1 .......................................................... 160
Table 8.10 Haven Civic Choir: PSSM Items 2 .......................................................... 161
Table 8.11 Haven Civic Choir: PSSM-Age and Gender .......................................................... 162
Table 8.12 Haven Civic Choir: Extrinsic and Intrinsic Goal orientation-Breakdown 1 .......................................................... 164
Table 8.13 Haven Civic Choir: Extrinsic and Intrinsic Goal orientation-Breakdown .......................................................... 165
Table 8.14 Aster Falls Town Band: Performance Orientation Items .......................................................... 169
Table 8.15 Aster Falls Town Band: Item Statements .......................................................... 173
Table 8.16 Aster Falls Town Band: Task Value-Breakdown .......................................................... 174
Table 8.17 Aster Falls Town Band: PSSM Breakdown .......................................................... 177
Table 8.18 Aster Falls Town Band: Extrinsic and Intrinsic Goal Orientation-Breakdown .......................................................... 179
Table 9.1 Music motivation and place .......................................................... 185
Figures

Figure 1.1 Organisation of thesis………………………………………………3
Figure 3.1 Model of attribution theory (Weiner, 1986)…………………………25
Figure 3.2 Achievement goal framework (Elliot and Harackiewics, 1996 & Elliot and McGregor, 2001)………………………………………………33
Figure 3.3 Model of motivational influence……………………………………36
Figure 3.4 Concepts from the literature that helped to shape this research……37
Figure 3.5 Diagram of the theoretical framework underpinning this study……38
Figure 5.1 Cynthia Ross: Motivation Profile…………………………………64
Figure 5.2 Jennifer Ross: Motivation Profile…………………………………65
Figure 5.3 Antia Patience: Motivation Profile…………………………………66
Figure 5.4 Amy Patience: Motivation Profile…………………………………67
Figure 5.5 Sally Mills: Motivation Profile……………………………………68
Figure 5.6 Johanna Mills: Motivation Profile…………………………………69
Figure 5.7 Lisa Hannah: Motivation Profile…………………………………70
Figure 5.8 David Hannah: Motivation Profile………………………………71
Figure 5.9 Stephanie Bowles: Motivation Profile……………………………72
Figure 5.10 Rosie Bowles: Motivation Profile………………………………73
Figure 8.1 Framework for analysis (Based on Kudryavtsev, Stedman and Kransny, 2012 & Kokotsaki and Hallam, 2007 & Elliot and Harackiewie, 1996).142
Figure 8.2 Haven Civic Band: Goal orientation……………………………144
Figure 8.3 Haven Civic Band: Goal orientation-Starting Age………………146
Figure 8.4 Haven Civic Band: Goal orientation-Gender……………………147
Figure 8.5 Haven Civic Band: Task value……………………………………148
Figure 8.6 Haven Civic Band: Avoiding Novelty……………………………149
Figure 8.7 Haven Civic Band: Self-handicapping……………………………149
Figure 8.8 Haven Civic Band: Task value-Starting Age……………………149
Figure 8.9 Haven Civic Band: Task value-Gender…………………………..150
Figure 8.10 Haven Civic Band: PSSM………………………………………150
Figure 8.11 Haven Civic Band: Starting Age and Gender…………………..152
Figure 8.12 Haven Civic Band: Extrinsic and Intrinsic Goal Orientation……153
Figure 8.13 Haven Civic Band: Intrinsic and Extrinsic Goal Orientation-Starting Age………………………………………………………………………153
Figure 8.14 Haven Civic Band: Intrinsic and Extrinsic Goal Orientation-Gender………………………………………………………………………………154
Figure 8.15 Haven Civic Choir: Mastery Goal Orientation……………………155
Figure 8.16 Haven Civic Choir: Goal Orientation-Starting Age……………156
Figure 8.17 Haven Civic Choir: Goal Orientation-Gender……………………156
Figure 8.18 Haven Civic Choir: Task Value………………………………….157
Figure 8.19 Haven Civic Choir: Task Value-Starting Age………………….158
Figure 8.20 Haven Civic Choir: Task Value-Gender………………………..158
Figure 8.21 Haven Civic Choir: PSSM……………………………………….159
Figure 8.22 Haven Civic Choir: PSSM-Age and Gender……………………162
Figure 8.23 Haven Civic Choir: Extrinsic and Intrinsic Goal Orientation……163
Figure 8.24 Haven Civic Choir: Intrinsic and Extrinsic Goal Orientation-Starting Age…………………………………………………………………………166
Figure 8.25 Haven Civic Choir: Intrinsic and Extrinsic Goal Orientation:
Gender

Figure 8.26 Aster Falls Town Band: Performance Orientation

Figure 8.27 Aster Falls Town Band: Performance Orientation-Starting Age

Figure 8.28 Aster Falls Town Band: Performance Orientation-Gender

Figure 8.29 Aster Falls Town Band: Mastery Orientation

Figure 8.30 Aster Falls Town Band: Task Value

Figure 8.31 Aster Falls Town Band: Task Value-Starting Age

Figure 8.32 Aster Falls Town Band: Task Value-Gender

Figure 8.33 Aster Falls Town Band: PSSM

Figure 8.34 Aster Falls Town Band: PSSM-Starting Age and Gender

Figure 8.35 Aster Falls Town Band: Extrinsic and Intrinsic Goal Orientation

Figure 8.36 Aster Falls Town Band: Intrinsic and Extrinsic Goal Orientation-Starting Age

Figure 8.37 Aster Falls Town Band: Intrinsic and Extrinsic Goal Orientation-Gender

Figure 9.1 Summary of Participants Responses
Chapter 1: Introduction

1. Background

My very first experience of participating in music was at the hands of my kind and encouraging elderly first grade classroom teacher in Queanbeyan, New South Wales. Our school did not yet have a music program but none-the-less our classroom was alive with music. One of my favourite memories of this time was how our teacher encouraged us all to sing every day and as the icing on the cake I was invited to conduct the class choir at a festival to be held at the town hall. It wasn’t so much conducting as it was waving my arms around in time to the music but none-the-less it gave me a memory that I will treasure for the rest of my life. Looking back on it, I can see the important role our teacher played in securing my life-long love of music.

My family moved to the growing town of Hastings on the leafy Mornington Peninsula when I was in my last years of primary school. I was fortunate that my new school had a well-established music program supporting both a choir and an instrumental ensemble. It was here that I first heard the sound of a clarinet and started what would become a life-long love affair with the instrument, although it wasn’t until I started secondary school that I would be given the chance to have lessons.

At the time of my pre-tertiary schooling, Hastings was a fairly low socio-economic area and the secondary school I attended was also financially limited. Although instrumental lessons were subsidised by the college, a yearly music levy was payable. There were no scholarships available as there were at the nearby private schools and this excluded many students from having the opportunity to learn an instrument. Additionally, the instrumental disciplines available to students were limited, presumably because there was not enough funding to support specialist teachers, or maybe because teachers were simply not interested in travelling from the city for only a few hours of work. Consequently it was not until I was in Year Twelve that my instrumental teacher was a specialist on the clarinet. My secondary college only had one ensemble, an incomplete concert band that never seemed to improve, presumably because of the transient nature of the student base. In addition to drawing your attention to socio-economic factors and how these influence the opportunities available for students, the second point is the role peers can play in the musical life of the school. When I was in year seven, there was a senior clarinet student, who I came to admire not only for his beautiful tone and musicality but also because of the encouragement and support he gave me as a young fledgling musician. I wanted to play as well as he did and this motivated me in my practice.

By the time I finished secondary school, I knew that I wanted to be a music teacher. Towards the end of my undergraduate studies, I was given the opportunity to undertake one of my teaching placements in the Gippsland town of Bairnsdale. Here I was not only fortunate to have the opportunity to experience life in the country, I was also able to be part of, for a short time at least, a lively music department. Despite its small size and geographic isolation Bairnsdale was able to support several ensembles and offer students many valuable performance opportunities. This, participation and performance not only served as essential learning experiences, they also helped to motivate existing, and attract new, instrumental music students to the program. It was this taste of rural education, which opened my eyes to the strong sense of community
spirit that prevailed in these rural and remote towns. I knew from that moment on that I wanted to be part of such a close-knit community. At the conclusion of my tertiary studies, I enthusiastically took a position teaching music in Hamilton in rural Victoria. It was wonderful; I was working within a team of highly dedicated staff in a school where music was a high priority.

These experiences led to my interest in research and in exploring several issues that struck me as a result of my time in rural settings. I am interested in the circumstances, factors and/or events, which motivate people to participate in instrumental music. What makes children, and indeed adults, desire to learn an instrument and become involved in the community of musicians? Why is it that for some people music becomes a life-long passion while others become lost along the wayside? I wondered about how socio-economic factors concerning families, communities and schools affect opportunities, and motivation, to participate in instrumental music. What strategies or initiatives are schools and community groups implementing to help curb the impact of such difficulties, so that varying financial circumstances are no longer a barrier to participation? I am also concerned with questions of Place especially as they relate to geographic location (including the influence of rurality) as well as notions of community, relationships, and the motivational or emotive properties of both formal and informal music places. I am interested in participants’ perspectives regarding the kinds of people who belong, or seek to acquire membership in any form, to these communities of music practice.

This thesis focuses on various elements that influence both young people and adults to participate in school and community music and the aim was to examine and compare the motivational profile of members of three community-based ensembles from two rural Australian towns.

1.2. Research Questions

This research addresses the following research questions:

1. What factors influence the participation motivation of musicians from two rural Australian towns?
2. Does ‘Place’ influence participants’ motivation to participate in music? If so, how?
3. Is there any understanding to be gained from considering an intersection between Kokotsaki and Hallam’s (2007) three categories of music participation and Kudryavtsev, Stedman and Kransny’s (2012) model of Place? If so, what?
4. How can such an understanding be applied to improve the practices of teachers and community music providers to increase motivation among participants?

1.3. Significance

Through examination of the above questions I endeavour to expand practitioner knowledge concerning participation and motivation in instrumental and choral music. While there has been research done relating to the motivation of music students attending metropolitan schools, very little has been done on rural schools and even less on ensembles based in these communities. Much research carried out concerning
Place has concerned geography, literacy or general education with very little focused on motivation in music (Ardoin, 2006). The importance of this research is the exploration of the role of place in the motivation of participants in both instrumental and choral music with a particular emphasis on communities in rural locations.

1.4. Organisation of the thesis

![Organisation of Thesis Diagram]

Figure 1.1 Organisation of Thesis

**Chapter 1 Introduction:** examines the keywords used in this thesis and provides an overview of the elements of my background which lead to this research, a list of research questions and an overview of the significance of this study.

**Chapter 2 Literature Review:** highlights some key themes presented in the available literature including the motivation to study music, challenges and demotivating factors, predictors of retention, place and rural education.

**Chapter 3 Motivation Theory:** presents a summary of a collection of theories of motivation presented in the literature.

**Chapter 4 Methodology:** explores the differences between qualitative and quantitative research as well as presenting how I approached both my data collection and analysis.

**Chapter 5 Pilot Study:** presents an introduction to Tobruk College and the participating students and instrumental music teachers. This is followed by a summary of emergent themes.
Chapter 6 Haven: presents an introduction to the conductors and musicians from both the Haven Civic Band and the Haven Civic Choir. This is followed by a discussion of emergent themes.

Chapter 7 Aster Falls: organised in much the same manner as Chapters Five and Six except discussion is based around the Aster Falls Town Band.

Chapter 8 Findings: presents a framework for analysis followed by a discussion of findings.

Chapter 9 Discussion: presents a comparison of results a presentation of the limitations of this study, followed by an argument for the relevance and importance of the study as well as directions for further research.

1.5 Keywords

The following is a brief representation of the keywords used throughout this paper. For more in depth definitions see chapters two and three.

Place: According to Resor (2010) Place is both a physical location as well as one’s mental attachment to that location. Also of relevance here are the social characteristics evident in these locations.

Rural: A rural place is largely geographically and socially isolated from other communities and is somewhat smaller in size when compared to more metropolitan areas.

Motivation: Throughout the thesis, there are several categories concerning motivation.

Music as a Musical Act according to Kokotsaki and Hallam (2007) concerns the intrinsic value of music that is: the actual music itself, as well as the individuals desire to improve their own musicianship.

Music as a Social Act includes a sense of community (Gallina, 2006a) and belonging, a chance to interact with, and meet, new people (Kokotsaki & Hallam, 2007).

Personal Motivation is the involvement in music for extra musical gain (Kokotsaki & Hallam, 2007).

Attribution Theory, which according to Weiner (1986), is motivation based on a cause and effect model.

Expectancy Value Theory concerns how students perceive a task and how this perception influences their ability for success or failure (Pintrich, 1989).

Goal Orientation Theory can be divided into two concepts. Mastery Goals, which are where learning is based on self-referenced standards, and Performance Goals, where the aim is to avoid all negative judgements of ability, based on the level of performance achieved by others. (Pintrich, 2000).
Chapter 2: Literature Review

Motivation and retention are key factors in the development and maintenance of a strong and vibrant musical culture in both the school and in the wider community (Hartley, 1996). In recent times, in a climate where music teachers are at times forced to justify and defend their subject in an ever expanding and time-poor curriculum, it seems that these issues are among those at the forefront of academic and practitioner thought. The literature surveyed here, while largely the result of international studies examining student motivations towards music and general academic pursuits, brings to light several key themes and issues for consideration. This chapter reviews will examine: the factors that influence students (and adults) to participate in music, factors that contribute to the retention and attrition of instrumental music students, Place and issues concerning rural education. It concludes with a summary of preceding discussions, as well as with the presentation of a theoretical framework underpinning the study.

2.1 Motivation to study music

The literature seems to suggest that there are several factors that contribute to the desire to maintain participation in music. Kokotsaki and Hallam (2007) point to three such categories of participation:

1) Music as a musical act,
2) Music as a social act and
3) Personal Motivations.

These categories form a useful framework through which to examine the music motivation research.

2.1.1 Music as a musical act

In their study of 78 undergraduate and postgraduate music students from two English universities, Kokotsaki and Hallam (2007) found that the intrinsic value of music, that is music as a musical act, was among the most influential sources of motivation for these students. Participants were surveyed for their responses to two questions concerning their past and present involvement in ensemble music, and their perception of the impact of this participation. The researchers concluded that the students were motivated by firstly, the music itself including its construction and its place within a cultural or historical context, and secondly by their desire to improve their all-round musicianship, including the further development of listening and sight-reading skills and enhancing their technical proficiency on their instrument. However, this study was essentially a multiple case study and while it may still provide valuable insight into what motivates adult music students working at an advanced, pre-professional level, it must consider whether the results would be consistent if it were to include school-age children. To this extent the question becomes, are musical factors a key motivator for entry-level or beginning adult students or indeed for younger music students regardless of their level of advancement or experience?
2.1.2 Music as a social act

In addition to intrinsic factors, the literature also points to social factors as being musical motivators. In fact, this category is multifaceted and proved to be the most extensively reported on amongst the relevant literature surveyed here. Music’s function as a social catalyst is well represented in the research (Adderley, Kennedy, & Berz, 2003; Higgins, 2007; Kokotsaki & Hallam, 2007) and concerns the ability of musical participation to provide a sense of belonging, and an opportunity to meet new people. In this way, Higgins (2007) contends, musical participation can often guarantee a ‘we’ experience and a chance to develop essential social skills. In other words, as people, where a sense of community amongst those involved is not only evident in, but also paramount to, the everyday existence of the ensemble. Kokotsaki and Hallam (2007) found that many of their participants were motivated by the understanding that their contribution to the whole sound was equal to that of everyone else, and that it was this sense of importance which contributed to a strong feeling of belonging. It was participants’ involvement in ensemble music that afforded them the opportunity to meet a diverse range of people and develop their social and leadership skills. While these motivators may be strongly connected with the desire to participate in ensemble music, their impact (or the potential lack thereof) on the motivation for solo practice and performance should be considered. Perhaps there is not an ensemble for your instrument in your location, or the rehearsals may simply be too far away?

Davidson (1999; 1996) builds on this notion of socially-based influence by concluding that among the students surveyed, peer influence, in the form of seeing other students perform in the school band, was the single most influential factor motivating them to learn an instrument. Similar findings were reported by Younghusband (2005) who found that motivation grows out of seeing others ‘do it’ (p. 161). Hutchinson (2007a) reported that the majority of students surveyed as part of his study claimed that the decision to learn an instrument was their own, although many students also admitted to the secondary influences of parents, siblings, extended family, music teachers and professional musicians. The literature suggests that peer influence is a strong motivating factor for school aged youth to commence instrumental learning. Due to the isolation of many remote students, however, it needs to be considered whether peer influence is the main driver of their decision to learn an instrument, or whether there are other factors which play a greater role.

Similarly, a study by Gallina (2006) found that participants viewed involvement in musical activities as a way to “foster a community spirit among groups of individuals otherwise relationally and emotionally unconnected” (p. 26). In this way, participation in music, particularly ensemble music, was seen as a means of assisting students to not only reaffirm existing friendships but to also build new ones across age barriers. For many students the community that develops through shared participation in music is the single most important reason for sustained involvement in school music programs (Countryman, 2009). Furthermore, in this study, one student, when reflecting on his experiences in the music program at his high school, went so far as to say “… if I walked away from it I’d be walking away from my friends… It was all about the friends not about the music” (p. 94). It seems that the main motivating factor for this student was not the enjoyment of the music itself but rather the benefits that participation had on his high school social experience. It should also be considered whether motivation stemming from the ‘music as a social catalyst’
perspective is conducive to sustained motivation once the individual leaves school, an area to be discussed later in this review.

Corporate endeavour and peer support, as associated with musical participation, are also among the socially orientated factors of motivation to be represented in the literature. The overwhelming sense of group accomplishment that is felt when working with others to achieve a common goal is among the principal socially orientated motivation factors to emerge from the literature. To this extent, in a study modelled on previous research into academic motivations, Schmidt (2005) found that his participants felt they learnt more effectively in music when they were working in groups with other students. This has strong implications for rural and especially remote students, who may be learning in situations where, due to student numbers or isolation for example, they may not have the opportunity to play, sing or learn in a group. Further to this idea of peer support, Wristen (2006) found that the group learning environment can be a strong motivator for people to take up an instrument. In this way, the adult participants in this study cited the benefits of group learning as feeling less individual pressure and no judgment, with the added advantage of being able to learn from others “in the same boat” (Wristen, 2006, p. 394). This notion of the motivational benefits of group instruction may also have negative consequences, especially in the school environment where youth tend to place such a high value on the opinions of their peers. While peer influence can often be positive, negative self-esteem, peer ridicule and social ostracization can also result when students act contrary to what is popular or seen as the right thing to do (Berndt & Keefe, 1996; McEwan, 2008).

The final social motivation can be labelled collectively as ‘Music for outreach’ and describes the motivation that stems from using music as a means to reach out to others. Such activities would involve concerts to raise money for a cause, regional and rural tours to share the joy that music brings, or by taking music as a form of social interaction to people who would otherwise go without (Gallina, 2006; Parkes & Jones, 2011; West, 2009). Considering the strong sense of community I experienced living and teaching in Hamilton, together with the deep community connections Schmuck and Schmuck (1992) reported as existing among the people in the rural towns they visited, I hypothesize that the potential to use music as a form of outreach, as well as the other socially orientated factors mentioned above, may be among the key sources of motivation for the rural and remote people who will participate in the research.

2.1.3 Personal motivations

The final of the three categories proposed by Kokotsaki and Hallam (2007) is Personal Motivations or, the motivation to pursue musical activities for extra-musical gain. The participation in music for the development of extra-musical skills and attributes is well documented in the literature and plays a vital role for the advocacy campaign for music education in schools. Research suggests that not only is musical learning beneficial to students’ academic development (Randolph, 2010; Zupan, 2000), possibly a keen motivator for parents to enrol their children into music lessons, it also aids in the development of positive and arguably essential life skills (Fredricks & Eccles, 2006) including self-confidence (Kokotsaki & Hallam, 2007; Taylor & Hallam, 2008), effective leadership skills (Temmerman, 2005), listening skills (Hirt-Mannheimer, 1995) and the ability to communicate (Temmerman, 2005). Indeed, Randolph (2010) also supports this notion finding that participation in musical
activities facilitates success in school and learning in general. Specifically, the study found that schools with music programs had a higher graduation rate, 90.2% compared to 72.9%, than their counterparts with no such program. Further to this, students from schools with music programs of reportedly higher quality achieved more favourable outcomes on standardised tests in English and Mathematics than students without music in their schools (Randolph, 2010).

The recreational (Wristen, 2006) and emotional side of music (Kokotsaki & Hallam, 2007), that is the pursuit of music as an enjoyable hobby, as a source of relaxation, or as an outlet through which to express oneself, have also emerged in the literature as valid sources of external motivation. However, it is unclear in much of the literature just to what extent these extra-musical factors promote sustained motivation or whether their pull is more transient. Furthermore, Thomas (1992) also takes up this issue by suggesting that, because there seems to be less pressure in schools to study music than there is to study other academic subjects, the degree to which student’s motivation for music is intrinsic rather than extrinsic may be vital for their longevity as musicians. Thomas (1992) continues by explaining that the degree to which one derives personal satisfaction in their musical endeavours simply by doing their best rather than by the desire to be better than someone else is essential for sustained motivation towards music. This notion is also more recently supported by Schmidt (2005) who concluded that although student motivation tendencies were relatively consistent across the year levels surveyed, there was a slight preference in older students towards the mastery and intrinsic orientations, where as younger students tended to be driven by competition and a desire to fuel their own egos. This notion that a tendency towards intrinsic and mastery orientations leads to sustained motivation in music is likewise endorsed by Schmidt, Zdzinski and Ballard (2006) who found that, among the undergraduate music students surveyed, there was a penchant towards mastery and intrinsic motivation orientations. Having worked as a secondary school music teacher and as a teacher of adult beginning instrumental students, this idea resonates with my thinking and observations about what drives those who are committed to their music. While a more in depth examination of mastery and performance goals will follow it is pertinent at this point to note that the substantive literature on this subject seems to suggest that longevity in instrumental music participation is linked to intrinsic rather than extrinsic factors. Therefore, it may prove useful to examine at what point, and with what genesis, motivation orientations become refocused; such a study, although really outside of the scope of the present inquiry, would provide useful information to teachers and community music directors in their efforts to combat negative retention rates.

Further to this, Hidi and Harackiewicz (2000) contend that interest is the relationship between the individual and their environment and that this relationship consists of two factors; individual interest (a personal outlook regarding a particular subject which develops over time) and situational interest (born of environmental stimuli). Of relevance to the present discussion, however, is the notion that situational interest may not be wholly detrimental. Indeed, Harackiewicz, Barron, Carter, Lehto and Elliot (1997) found that performance, rather than mastery, goals predicted the achievement of university students in an introductory psychology course. Similar results were found by Nielsen (2008) who concluded that many students in their first year of post-secondary music study, at a selected sample of conservatoria, were largely orientated towards performance approach goals, the author suggesting that this may be in part
due to the fact that they had just completed a rigorous audition process, competing
with other students for a place at the conservatorium. While these studies focussed on
the relationship between a student’s goal orientation and their level of achievement,
and therefore cannot directly attest to the link between achievement goals and
sustained interest in a particular field, the results suggest that the adoption of
performance approach goals is not entirely detrimental. Therefore, in relation to the
present inquiry, I believe that it will be pertinent not to dismiss extrinsic sources of
motivation offhand, because to do so, would be to ignore important influences, such
as social and environmental factors, which the literature suggests are valid sources of
human motivation. Therefore the question needs to be raised; can extrinsic sources of
motivation lead to sustained interest and participation in instrumental music?

In a study of the retention and dropout rates of children in their first twenty months of
musical learning, Pitts, Davidson and McPherson (2000) found that being guided by a
personal intrinsic orientation rather than being swayed by extrinsic incentives was the
key to sustained motivation. By way of example, the researchers interviewed the
students and their parents to ascertain practice behaviour as well as intentions to
continue with music lessons. The researchers found that although students who
continued lessons for the twenty months and retained an interest in their instrument
were receiving some external stimuli in the form of monetary practice incentives and
sanctions, they were chiefly governed by a long-term commitment to learning and a
strong identification with their instrument. On the other hand, students who dropped
out or continued without intrinsic interest were solely motivated by external factors.
Unlike the first group of students, they viewed musical participation as something
transitory or as an activity only for the short term, not as something useful or
enjoyable to last throughout their lifetime. Interestingly the students in this group
received limited parental support for their learning.

Of the research cited above, only one study (Younghusband, 2005) reported focusing
specifically on music education in rural locations, and this study was rather narrow in
scope seemingly concentrating on improving remote students’ motivation by
increasing their access to professional level musicians as role models.

2.2 Challenges and de-motivating factors

In addition to the motivating factors, the literature also makes mention of a few
challenges and de-motivating factors. The first of these was the slow learning process,
especially the perceived difficulty of developing the requisite skills and knowledge,
needed to succeed on an instrument (Taylor & Hallam, 2008; Wristen, 2006).
Similarly, the authors (Taylor & Hallam, 2008; Wristen, 2006) concur that some
people, especially adults, tend to place unrealistic expectations on themselves and
when they are unable to meet these unobtainable ideals they give-up their
involvement. Similar findings were reached by Nicholls (1984) who concluded that
students, at an early age, arrive at the somewhat inaccurate view that musical ability is
innate and unchangeable. Holding this position means that if they do not perceive
themselves as initially talented, having not succeeded on the first attempt, they see all
future effort on their part as pointless and consequently their motivation wanes. In this
way, Klienedinst (1991) and Nielsen (2008) contend that self-concept is a valuable
predictor of student retention in music.
A second de-motivating factor concerns issues of time, more specifically, not finding enough time for personal practice due to conflicting activities including sport, work, or other family commitments (Driscoll, 2009; Klinedinst, 1991; Wristen, 2006). Although the literature did not elaborate further on this issue one must consider, with the overcrowded school curriculum and the need to work longer and harder to manage the family financial situation, whether time factors play a greater role now than they have in the past.

In a study examining motivation for music as compared to other school subjects (Mathematics, Science, Physical Education, Art and mother Tongue), McPherson and O’Neill (2010) found that students tended to value music less than their other subjects. The researchers explain this discrepancy by suggesting that historically music was valued for recreation and entertainment whereas in the more academic subjects, students learn skills and content that is vital for everyday life. These findings suggest that it is the utilitarian value of a subject that leads to its motivational value, and that music did not measure favourably compared to the other subjects in this research because it supposedly cannot offer such practical returns. This concern for the utilitarian value of a subject may be of particular importance for the proposed inquiry for, as found by Hardre, Sullivan and Crowson (2009), rural students are more likely to show interest and expel effort in subjects they perceive as being useful.

It has already been clearly established in the literature that the social side of music can be beneficial for students and a strong motivator for continued participation. The social aspects of schooling are not always so positive and this brings us to the fourth de-motivating factor; negative peer influence. To this extent, McPherson (2003) contends that often schools do not consider the students’ need for social motivation, a form of motivation that lies beyond academic goals and includes the social side of schooling. Further to this, Berndt and Keefe (1996) assert that, because students, particularly adolescents, place such a high value on peer evaluation, their actions and decisions can be strongly influenced by the opinions of their peers, even to the point where they are no longer being true to themselves. This notion of students making decisions based on their social rather than academic interests, is further highlighted by Gross (1989) who suggests that if a student decides to pursue an academic goal not approved by their peers they may become socially isolated.

The final de-motivating factor is one’s sensitivity to criticism. Atlas, Taggat and Goodell (2004) propose that sensitivity to criticism results in lower levels of enjoyment and reduced confidence. Therefore, from a musical perspective, if a student views all teacher feedback as negative criticism, even if it is phrased positively and with encouragement, their motivation toward lessons and indeed toward playing their instrument is likely to be reduced.

Of the research whose scope included the challenges of participating in music, none considered the different way of life that exists in the country. People living in rural and remote areas face very different challenges to schooling and everyday life than their metropolitan and suburban counterparts and this fact needs to be more widely acknowledged in music education research.
2.3 Predictors of retention

A number of the research studies surveyed explored the issue of retention and highlight several factors that may be used to predict the longevity of instrumental students. The first of these factors is one’s self concept in music (Klinedinst, 1991; Nielsen, 2008). In other words, when people have faith in their own ability as a musician they become motivated to work harder, invest more time and consequently improve further. Conversely, if people doubt their ability, whether this view is justified or not, they adopt the position that the perceived lack of results is not worth their time and energy and so discontinue. Schmidt (2007) contends that secondary school students tend to attribute their motivation towards, and success in, their musical endeavours to internal rather than external factors. The participating students expressed a desire to achieve in music for music’s sake, they believed that musical ability is something you can develop through practice and they displayed strong self- and group efficacy, in other words they believed in their own abilities and that of their ensemble.

A second predictor of retention is socio-economic status. In many schools and certainly in the wider community, participation in instrumental music tends to be on a user-pay basis. Therefore, if families find themselves in a difficult financial situation, it is the ‘extra’ activities, such as music, which tend to be the first to go (Bonham, 1984; Driscoll, 2009; Rocks, 2006). Hutchinson (2007b) found this to be true, that when families are struggling financially it is often the extra costs like purchasing an adequate instrument, sheet music, paying for lessons and travel that put ongoing participation out of reach.

One of my closest friends, who I think has the potential to be a world-class virtuoso on the ‘cello, had to drop out of the music program completely last year. He desperately needed a new instrument and even the most basic one was going to cost thousands of dollars. His parents just could not afford it. They struggled to pay for lessons and buy music and because they did not own a car, the whole matter of getting him to lessons and going to concerts became a major hassle. The school tried to intervene and buy an instrument and arrange for free lessons – but in the end, there seemed no solution and like turning off a light switch, music just ceased to exist in his life. For me this was a very sad state of affairs, but I’m sure that there are similar cases in other schools.

(Hutchinson, 2007a, p. 129)

Having taught music in a rural town, I certainly have examples where students were forced to give up their music participation, (or were not be able to commence lessons in the first place) because their parents could not afford the expense of lessons, instrument hire or music camps. Interestingly, and contrary to my experiences, Kinney (2010) found that socio-economic status, while a strong predictor of retention, had little influence on the decision to commence participation in music. Kinney went further to assert that the reason for this discrepancy is that perhaps schools were able to offer incentives for commencing students (e.g. free or reduced-fee hire of school instruments) and, while this is a positive step, it is often the continuing costs such as reeds, valve oil, tours or concert dress which preclude some students from participating beyond the early stages. Examining this issue more closely, raises the question whether the strategies used by music departments in wealthier communities to promote commencement (e.g. free or reduced-fee instrument hire) and retention (e.g. music tours and camps to reengage and focus students in the music program) would be available to, or viable in, communities with a lower economic base.
A third predictor to emerge from the research is the relationship between students’ intellectual ability (particularly in the areas of reading, mathematics and the ability to comprehend instructions) and their musical aptitude (Klinedinst, 1991; Young, 1971). Young (1971) contends that, at the commencement of musical learning, attainment is related to one’s intellectual ability and while this relationship is strong in the beginning it weakens over time as musical aptitude takes on a more dominant role. The implication of this is that academically weaker students may consider themselves incapable of learning a musical instrument and therefore, avoid possible embarrassment by not pursuing the opportunity. Conversely, while academically gifted students may be encouraged by their success in other subject areas and, as a result, may be quick to take up the challenge of learning an instrument, with time their rate of progress may seem to decrease as musical aptitude takes on a greater role in the learning process; a setback that could easily lead to frustration and eventual discontinuation if not managed appropriately (Klinedinst, 1991; Young, 1971). While intellectual ability may be a valid and useful predictor of longevity in instrumental music, it really lies outside the scope of the current project because the current research does not seek to measure intellectual ability.

Similarly, Davidson (1999) contends that early success in musical learning can be a factor leading to student motivation. In this study, the majority of students had been exposed to musical learning, usually in the form of recorder instruction, prior to taking up a woodwind or brass instrument and although the majority of students had little experience of practice, the success and enjoyment to come out of these early forays into music education acted as a strong motivating factor. Results from a study by, Simpkins, Vest and Becnel (2010) also support this theory concluding that the characteristics of initial exposure to an activity, like music, can be a potent predictor of motivation. The researchers also emphasise that this early introduction should be followed by continued and consistent re-engagement in that activity in order for the motivation to have any lasting effects.

Part of what I appreciated the most about living and teaching in rural Victoria was the strong sense of community that prevailed; people cared about their neighbours, parents showed a strong interest in their children’s learning, and teachers really knew their students. It is these relationships that researchers cite as among the most important predictors of retention. To this extent, Creech (2010) asserts that children with high levels of parental support across behavioural, cognitive and personal domains were more likely to push on with their learning in the face of difficulty and go on to achieve higher levels of performance than children without such support. Davidson et al (1995/1996) discovered that children who are persistent in their musical learning have a very different relationship with their parents than those who discontinue. For example, persistent musicians tended to have parents who sat in on their early lessons and home practice and sing with them when they were small and although their motivation tended to be extrinsically driven during the early stages of learning, focus naturally shifted to the intrinsic spectrum as the child grew older and their parents gradually withdrew. Conversely, the opposite pattern was true of children who discontinued their studies; they were very much left to their own devices during the formative stages and, as motivation waned, their parents provided great amounts of stimulus for their extrinsic motivation, to the point where the child’s own intrinsic motivation became non-existent. It needs to be acknowledged that this study
focused on individuals who commenced their instrumental learning while at school and, consequently, does not take into account adult learners who, by necessity, would need to be intrinsically driven at the outset.

The early learners need for relationships that are strong in comfort, security and encouragement, is further highlighted by Sosniak (1985) who discovered that a student’s first teacher was valued more for their personality, warmth and approachability than for their skill as a musician. These studies, however, only seemed to focus on the student-first-time-learner and as a result did not consider the student with some level of musical experience or indeed the adult beginner who is new to music, an area of interest in this current research. Nonetheless, this gap in the research has been bridged to some degree by Sichivista (2003) who, in a study of university choir participants, found that students with prior experience in music, who have parents with some degree of musicianship, tend to develop a better self-concept, are likely to value music more highly, and tend to display higher levels of motivation towards their musical participation.

Recalling for a moment the notion of teacher influence, Hays, Minichello and Wright (2000) found that the personality of the early mentor is vital for developing sustained motivation. In a study of successful and discontinuing music students Davidson, Moore, Sloboda and Howe (1998) found that successful students (those who continued with instrumental study to achieve a fair to high level of competence on their instrument) valued the friendly, chatty, relaxed and encouraging qualities more highly in their first instrumental teachers than did those students who discontinued their participation. The researchers went on to explain that as the students progress in their studies the successful learners began to value the professional qualities as well as the performance and teaching expertise of their teachers more highly than their personal qualities, these were valued to much the same extent as those students who discontinued. This suggests that while the teachers’ personal qualities are more valuable for their engagement of the beginning student, as the student develops musically the professional and performance skills of their teacher become much more important for ongoing motivation (Davidson et al., 1998). As only a subjective measure, the thoughts and opinions of the students, was used in this study, it needs to be borne in mind that there are other factors, apart from the personal and professional qualities of the teacher, at play which would contribute to the retention and attrition of young instrumental students. As this study was conducted on school aged students further research is needed to ascertain whether these findings would hold true for the adult beginning instrumental student.

The first school that I taught at had a dynamic strings teacher who started ‘Junior Strings’, an ensemble through which all students in grades two to four learnt to play the violin. In addition to the weekly ensemble rehearsal, students were also each given one small-group lesson a week to help develop their technique and, quite often they would play in class every day with their teachers who were also learning the violin through the program. While I can’t be exact on the retention rate at the end of grade four, the music program as a whole benefited from the motivation, and consequent retention, of students coming out of the ‘Junior Strings’ program, as many of the young violinists either continued with violin, changed to another stringed instrument or moved over to woodwind or brass. This anecdote, however, is in contrast to the findings of Hartley and Porter (2009) who found that a later starting grade may impact
on a student’s decision to continue with music. More specifically, the researchers found that there was a greater retention rate at the end of the first year and at the beginning of seventh grade, for later starts to string instruction; that is instruction beginning in grades five or six. The authors recognise, however, that their findings are in contradiction to Suzuki string programs in which the starting age is much lower.

There are some further points to consider: while starting age may have some impact on the retention of string students, because the context in which the learning is occurring is so important (to be discussed later), to gain an accurate picture the previous experience on the part of the learner, the method of instruction employed by the teacher, the classroom environment and the school culture in regards to the value of musical learning need to be considered, factors that were not taken into account by Hartley and Porter (2009).

To this point I have reviewed the literature through the framework of Kokotsaki and Hallam’s (2007) three categories of musical participation, explored the literature’s take on several de-motivating factors and examined the literature’s view on the issue of retention. How the research has considered the concept of Place has also played a pivotal role in helping to shape and define this inquiry.

2.4 The concept of place

In ancient Greece, Plateia (street) was a central place for feasts, celebrations, events, and meetings. Plateia is not some position, not an empty space, but an area that becomes a significant because of the events, meetings, feasts, that “take place” in the place, which thereby comes into existence as a place by virtue of the event. (VanEijck & Roth, 2010, p. 870)

Throughout the literature, Place as a concept has been explored through the lens of a range of academic disciplines including: psychology, sociology, anthropology, education and geography (Ardoin, 2006). As such many definitions of what constitutes ‘place’, and its related constructs abound in the literature. For some, Place is about geography and peoples’ relationship to a place. To this extent, Resor (2010) proposes that there are three general aspects of place:

1) Location (the actual geographic position),
2) Locale (the setting in which people live their lives. This includes actual physical objects like buildings, trees and furniture), and
3) a Sense of Place (a person’s attachment to a place).

In a study of university residential students, Sixsmith (1986) found that home (Place) was described by the participants not just as a house or their dormitory on campus but rather as their family homes, their hometown, the country or even their bedroom. In other words, personal and social characteristics of a place became crucial to the definition of Place.

For others, the concept of place goes beyond the physical, as Green (2006) notes; it is about personal identity, meaning and context as well as the social structures which govern everyday life (also see Knez, 2005; Lindstedt, 2011). Similarly, Cuba and Hummon (1993) suggest that place identities are influenced by a number of social factors including; a person’s interpretation of place, their experience, their social participation with friends and in organisations, and their demographic characteristics.
More recently, McInerney, Smyth and Down (2011) assert that “Place is a lens through which young people begin to make sense of their surroundings” (p. 5). Essentially, through and in ‘Place’ they develop and maintain relationships and social networks. (McInerney et al., 2011)

Examining Place through either a geographical or social lens alone is to ignore the interrelationship between these two constructs. In this way, other researchers take a broader view and suggest Place ought to be considered as being made up of environmental and social dimensions and that these dimensions interact, such that one should not be considered in absence of the other. To this extent, Sixsmith contends that Place “…features a unique and dynamic combination of personal, social and physical properties and meanings” (1986, p. 294). Further to this, Polakow and Sherif (1987), suggest that finding one’s place means finding one’s self, identifying place and people and being identified. The researchers go on to note that Place is about there being a symbiotic relationship between individual and their environment each transforming and influencing the other. More recently, Stevenson (2011) contends that Place identity is a “complex and developmental entity in which the biophysical environment can be a source of ideas and values that shape one’s personal and/or professional aspirations and identity” (p. 48) and Fettes and Judson (2011) suggest that Place is “the local natural context in which one lives” in which all the aspects of the environment and the culture of the place, inform ones perception of, and interaction with, the world. In sum, Place goes beyond either the environmental or the social to encompass them both in a web of meaning that not only defines one’s Sense of Place but also one’s very identity.

The work of others in the field suggests that these definitions of Place do not extend far enough, that they do no encompass the subtlety needed to really understand people and Place. To this extent, the literature suggests that there are four basic components to the concept of Place. To use the terms of Kudryavtsev, Stedman and Krasny (2012) these are: Place Attachment, Place Meaning, Place Dependence and Place Identity.

Place Attachment refers to the connection between place and people or the degree of importance a place holds in a person’s life (Kudryavtsev et al., 2012). To put this in other words, Place Attachment is the emotional aspects of one’s relationship to place, that is, place in the sense of the natural or built environment (Trentelman, 2009). However, Jorgensen and Stedman (2006) suggest that the construct of Place Attachment only refers to one’s positive feelings towards a place; I view this as incomplete as a negative relationship to Place is possible and may result in reduced motivation to participate in that Place. This concern is echoed by Pretty, Chipuer and Bramston (2003) who explain that there is also a negative side to place attachment that seems to be omitted from the majority of the place-based literature. The researchers contend that people can feel a sense of entrapment because of their connection to place; they feel that they cannot leave because of their strong ties to the place. Alternatively they may not notice that the community no longer meets their needs either because their needs have changed or because of the steady decline of the community itself.

Place Meaning refers to the symbolic meanings people attach to places. These meanings are affected by the environment, socialization, politics, economics, culture and aesthetics (Kudryavtsev et al., 2012). Indeed Green (2006) emphasises the
importance of this dimension contending that a geographic location cannot become a Place until meanings are attached to it (also see Relph, 1986). Research suggests that Place meanings accumulate over time (Smaldone, Harris, & Sanyal, 2008) and that they develop through experience in a place (Kudryavtsev et al., 2012; Stedman, 2002). The researchers continue to suggest that these experiences do not need to be personal; one can also develop Place meanings through vicarious experiences (Kudryavtsev et al., 2012). In fact, the researchers explain, that direct personal experience may not be enough to understand the various meanings a place holds, and suggests that other sources, for example the stories of others, may be needed to uncover the hidden meanings of a Place.

Place Dependence is generally considered to be a sub-dimension of Place Attachment and refers to the ability of a place to provide for one's needs (Kudryavtsev et al., 2012). This definition is likewise supported by Stevenson (2011) and Trentelman (2009) who explain that Place Dependence has to do with sites that attend to one’s interests and needs.

Finally, Place Identity, a second sub-dimension of Place Attachment, refers to the extent to which place becomes a part of how a person defines themselves and how they wish to be seen by others (Kudryavtsev et al., 2012; Trentelman, 2009). Fettes and Judson (2011) suggest that people often transform their environment in an effort to make it sit well with their forming, environmentally influenced, identities, to help create a sense of belonging in a place or to mark a place as their own.

The antithesis of Place is Placelessness. As Relph (1986) contends, placelessness is the weakening of place identity to the point where all communities offer is the same look, the same feel and the same experience.

…mass communication appears to result in a growing uniformity of landscape and a lessening diversity of places by encouraging and transmitting general and standardized tastes and fashions. (Relph, 1986, p. 92)

Relph suggests that it is the media that contributes to this sense of placelessness as well as the globalization of communications, culture, and the education system, which support it. Gruenewald (2003a) asserts that a place-based approach to education may be able to restore a sense of place to local communities. Gruenewald explains that place-based education relates to how students see their world and encompasses pivotal aspects of place in that it increases student understanding and engagement in learning through authentic, real world experiences. In this way, place-based education is not only more relevant to students and their world; it can also potentially contribute to the local community.

This considered, the definition of Place to be used in this study, draws strongly on the above cited literature, especially that by Green (2006) and Cuba and Hummon (1993), and in this way recognises the importance of both the physical environment, the locale (Resor, 2010), as well as people’s connection to that environment. I acknowledge, however, the importance of the social environment, that is, the relationships between people, and between people and their communities and organisations including, in this case, the culture of the school and community ensemble. To this extent I will be
adopting the Place dimensions as described by Kudryavtsev et al (2012) as a starting point through which to interpret my data.

I have mentioned earlier in this thesis that I was amazed by the sense of community I discovered when I moved to the country; there, the relationships between people, and between people and their environment, seem so much more alive and relevant than they do the city. Despite this, to my knowledge a concern for the concept of place has not been evident in the music motivation literature, nor has music been a noticeable part of place-based research (In my search I found only two studies Cohen (1995) and Nowotny et al. (2010)). Therefore, because of the unique social/environmental relationship that seems more prevalent in rural and remote communities, and the fact that the relationship between motivation in music and the contextual insight offered through place-based inquiry has, to my knowledge, yet to be investigated, that I consider it vital to include Place as a critical factor to be considered in my research.

To this point, I have outlined two of the main areas of research that have helped to shape the theoretical framework for the study: Kokotsaki and Hallam’s (2007) three categories of musical participation (Music as a musical act, Music as a Social Act and Personal Motivations) and Kudryavtsev et al’s (2012) layered definition of Place. Additionally, through sharing some of my own story, I have attempted to provide some idea about the context that sparked my initial inquiry and sent me on this journey. However, the literature tells its own story of the nature and state of rural education and although many of the studies are international it still serves as a useful contextual backdrop to my research.

2.5 Rural education

In addition to the literature concerning motivation and Place, a large portion of the research surveyed explores the motivational issues confronting rural youth and their relationships together with the unique difficulties facing education in rural areas. While some solutions are offered, the literature suggests that there is still much work to be done.

2.5.1 Motivation and rural youth

Many of the studies surveyed regarding rural education point to the idea that rural youth tend to have lower motivational levels and lower educational and occupational aspirations than their non-rural peers (Gandara, Gutierrez, & O'Hara, 2001; Ley, Nelson, & Beltyukova, 1996). This may be in part due to a number of factors including: peer environment (Quaglia & Cobb, 1996), teachers and the classroom environment they help to create (Greene & Miller, 1996), socio-economic status (Ley et al., 1996), the level of education achieved by their parents (Haas, 1992; Hardre, 2007), access to educational opportunities (Hardre et al., 2009; Howley & Harmon, 2000), and the motivational profile of individual students (Hardre & Henessey, 2010). Of these factors, it was not isolation or limited opportunity that were considered to be the most common barriers to motivation and success but rather, it was economic constraints that rated most highly (Ley et al., 1996). This evidence suggests that the socio-economic concerns of rural families may prove to be a strong de-motivating factor when it comes to participation in instrumental music, an issue pertinent to this inquiry. Similarly, Paasch and Swain (1995) contend that socio-economic status is the single largest factor influencing rural school dropout rates. They also explain that the
characteristics of the local labour market may also be a contributing factor suggesting that there seems to be a lack of ‘economic incentive’ (p. 25) particularly among those who do not want to leave the community.

In addition to socio-economic factors, the research suggests that the culture prevailing at the school also has a role to play when it comes to students’ motivation towards school and learning in general. The degree to which schools emphasise and value aptitude, achievement, creativity, challenge and risk taking in the academic arena has a significant effect on the way students view both the task and themselves as learners (Hardre, 2007). Reeve (1996) suggests that for ultimate motivation the school culture should be supportive of student autonomy and that this will be reflected in student-teacher relationships, school rules and policies established by the administration. In this way, the literature seems to propose that rural schools benefit in this regard from smaller class sizes, greater opportunity for student-teacher interaction and fewer classroom problems when compared to their metropolitan counterparts (Ballou, 1995).

2.5.2 Relationships and rural youth

…even though the small district high school, as the safe vortex of its community, offers the shelter and stage for public gathering and community identity, it is a troubled house divided by its interpersonal closedness and misunderstandings (Schmuck & Schmuck, 1992, p. 10).

In their study of the towns on the highways of rural America, Schmuck and Schmuck (1992) found that rural schools were manifesting impersonal relationships rather than the family-like connections that might be expected. People in these rural schools were relating to each other in terms of function (e.g. teacher-student) rather than valuing and respecting each individual as an entire person. The problem is teacher-student social and relationship factors play a pivotal role in student motivation and where these are lacking it is students’ sustained interest and motivation that suffer (Hardre, 2007; Kokotsaki & Hallam, 2007; Wristen, 2006). Students need to feel part of a team working towards a common goal, they need to feel that they can contribute without fear of judgement and they need to have a sense of autonomy and unfortunately these qualities seemed rare in the traditional teacher-student relationships that were so prevalent in the schools visited by Schmuck and Schmuck (1992).

2.5.3 The problematic rural curriculum

Ballou (1995) contends that students in rural schools are less likely, than their urban counterparts, to have access to specialised and advanced courses or, at the other end of the spectrum, remedial support. Ballou continues that this situation is likely due to the fact that rural schools may not have enough students to justify and support such specialized program offerings. This situation may also arise from the limited physical and financial resources with which many rural schools are working.

This notion of limited curricular offerings is further highlighted by Schmuck and Schmuck (1992) who found that rural students cited too few elective and advanced courses as being one of the negatives aspects of education in the country. Further to this, Khattri, Riley and Kane (1997) claim that the lack of available resources for rural schools means that students may not receive the education they need to compete on
the national and world stage. Schmuck and Schmuck (1992) reported that most of the rural schools they visited relied on textbooks that were designed for urban and suburban students and their communities thus compounding the issue of lack of adequate resources further.

Despite this, Howley and Harmon (2000) suggest that some rural schools do not necessarily view their narrower curriculum as a negative. The researchers assert that many of the teaching staff employed at the rural schools studied reported seeing it as an opportunity to offer a more focused curriculum and as a chance to raise the general expectations for their students. The research points to additional benefits of this seemingly ‘narrow’ curriculum; for one, it teaches students essential skills required for employment and further study and secondly, from a school perspective it is manageable because most teachers are able to teach the basic subject matter; although this does mean that rural teachers are less likely, than their metropolitan counterparts, to have majored in the subject they are required to teach (Ballou, 1995).

2.5.4 The particular difficulties facing education in rural areas

A further aspect of the rural education literature concerns the difficulties that are faced by students, teachers and indeed communities when it comes to education. Atkin, Rose and Shier (2005) found that due to the limited numbers of potential learners in rural areas, educational providers must operate under different constraints than their non-rural colleagues. Such constraints include: the geographic isolation, the lack of qualified tutors available to teach or assist, the financial burden of operating support and extra-curricular programs, the limited availability of ongoing, relevant and high quality professional development opportunities for teachers, and inconsistent internet access (Atkin et al., 2005; Barley & Wegner, 2010; MCEEYA, 2001; Rossi & Sirma, 2008). If then as Kudryavtsev et al (2012) and others (Stedman, 2002) suggest, Place meaning is partially developed through experiences in a place, it needs to be considered whether the varying factors and circumstances, as described above, that lessen or even inhibit experiences in certain domains, have an impact on one’s Sense of Place and, by extension, their motivation.

In contrast to the negative factors and difficulties inherent in rural education, the literature also provided a more positive perspective. Herzog and Pittman (1995) in a study of rural students and their communities found that rural students were able to identify some positive aspects of schooling in the country:

1) The teachers knew their students,
2) The students built close relationships with each other, and
3) The students perceived their school to be safe and secure compared to their perceptions of urban schools.

The students surveyed also pointed to three negative aspects of their rural schooling:

1) Old and rundown buildings,
2) Lack of support for disadvantaged students, and
3) Poor preparation for tertiary study or the workplace.

The findings of this study were based on students’ self-reporting and while they seem to be supported by other research in the field the question needs to be raised whether there might be more to the positive side of schooling in the country. Indeed, much of
the rural education literature surveyed seemed to come from a deficit rather than positive position and, as such, many of the themes discussed here have demonstrated the negative aspects of education in rural and remote areas. While it is acknowledged that there are challenges that are particular to rural and remote areas, the current inquiry also seeks to uncover the positive work that is being done by educators and community ensemble directors to motivate their students in relation to instrumental music; an important gap in the research.

Distance education has been cited in the literature as being a valuable resource for the education of rural and remote students in that it can offer advanced studies and access to curriculum areas that would otherwise be unavailable (Hannum, Irvin, Banks, & Farmer, 2009; Stevens, 1994). Through distance education and the use of increasingly accessible information communication technologies, schools are able to offer students a much broader array of studies, originating from a diverse multitude of locations around the country (Stevens, 1994). Stevens (1994) continues that this is of particular benefit when communities, due to the limited number of learners, lack of infrastructure, or through the unavailability of suitably qualified teachers, cannot in themselves offer students a full and varied education, particularly at the secondary level. Furthermore, if schools utilize the available technologies and resources that distance education has to offer, while they will always remain geographically distant from the country’s more urban centers, their students and staff need not be isolated from resources and educational opportunities occurring in other parts of the country (Barker & Hall, 1994; Stevens, 1994). In other words, distance education is bringing the world closer to rural students and their teachers. Additionally, Stevens (1994) continues that if rural schools can be seen to offer the same opportunities that are available in urban classrooms then utilizing distance education may even begin to curb the problem of out-migration as families will no longer feel pressured to move to the country’s cities to ensure a well rounded and comprehensive education for their children, an issue pertinent to Place dependence.

Despite the obvious benefits, there may also be negative implications and barriers to implementation. Whether by taking up Distance education opportunities and thus entering the ‘global market place’ of standardized learning, in some small way students are losing the Sense of Place that comes through a personal connection with the local rather than the global. Additionally, individual circumstances may dictate that distance education is not always a viable option for many rural and remote schools. In this regard McSwain (1995) points out that, due to a lack of student interest, scheduling issues, lack of support personnel, monetary issues, and problems with inadequate or lacking infrastructure and equipment, implementing a distance education program is simply unobtainable for many of these schools. As an additional barrier, Hannum et al (2009) found, particularly among schools that were yet to implement distance education programs, the lack of staff technical expertise was also a major factor preventing them from offering these programs to their students.

Despite these concerns, the literature did offer a solution Fourche Valley School in Arkansas. Howley and Harmon (2000) explain that the school has forged strong ties within and outside of their community for example sharing teachers via distance education and are therefore able to offer wider subject choice for their students. They have also been able to broaden their school community through networking with other schools and external agencies. The findings of this study (Howley & Harmon, 2000)
indicate that although there may be concerns regarding provision of academic, extra-
curricular and support programs in rural schools, positive results can be obtained
when the school links in with distance education or works in partnership with the
local community. Similar findings were reached by Fox and Wright (1997) who
suggest that school-community partnerships could be a valuable and viable option to
help overcome the difficulties many rural and remote schools face when it comes to
providing extra academic support for their students.

A final concern for rural and remote education is daily transportation and the major
constraint that this places on students’ academic and social lives. Fox (1996) suggests
that the greater length of time rural students spend on the bus, compared to their
metropolitan peers, results in lower grades, poorer fitness levels, fewer opportunities
to participate in social activities, poorer study habits and loss of activity choice. With
regard to extracurricular activities, like music, Fox (1996) concludes that the
participation of rural students declines the further from school they live as the extra
hours of bus travel leads to extra financial costs and more restrictive time constraints.

Much of the literature concerning rural education seemed to come from a deficit
rather than a positive position. As such, many of the themes discussed here illustrate
the negative aspects of life in the country. On a more positive note, Schmuck and
Schmuck (1992) found that even though students were negative about the curricular
offerings available to them at their rural schools, few were negative about the school
experience as a whole. Students commented on the pleasure they received from being
with their friends and participating in extra-curricular activities. They also reported
that they felt more safe and secure at their schools compared to their metropolitan
counterparts citing “…no drugs, muggings or weapons” (p. 18) as the reasons behind
these feelings of security.

2.6 Conclusion

When considering the motivational factors put forward in this chapter, it should be
borne in mind that much of the body of research surveyed here was conducted in a
context far removed from the locales under investigation. Consequently, the
categories of musical motivation, the de-motivating factors as well as the predictors of
retention have indeed provided a useful theoretical framework through which to
examine and contextualise the results of the present inquiry.
Chapter 3: Literature Review: Motivation Theory

The final body of research of concern to the present inquiry is the literature concerning motivation theory. While largely the result of international studies exploring students’ academic motivation, brings to light several ideas for consideration that have proved themselves to be valuable informants for the present inquiry.

We may not be able to make students enjoy their subjects, but we can go a long way toward encouraging enjoyment. (VanDeWeghe, 2009, p. 11)

Many theories concerning the mechanics of motivation resound in the literature, and while on the surface these theories may appear to be quite different in essence they share some similarities especially when it comes to the role of self-belief. Throughout the following paragraphs I will present a brief introduction to Attribution Theory, Expectancy Value Theory and Goal Orientation Theory with the aim to explore their similarities and differences, to create a synthesis of the core ideas that comprise each of the models, and finally to present an overview of how these ideas have influenced the theoretical framework underpinning this research.

Upon examination of the literature concerning motivation towards various areas of schooling, I noticed that in addition to the major and arguably more prominent, and certainly more researched, theories of motivation (as mentioned above and discussed in the following paragraphs), independent theories, often with clear ties to one or more of the dominant theories, have also emerged. As can be seen in Table 3.1 each of these models can be summarised and explained with reference to four categories of influence: personal factors, utility value, environmental factors and task factors. Looking initially at personal factors, the range of this category is quite large, encompassing factors as diverse as aesthetic feelings, self-efficacy, and general health and wellbeing. Secondly, Leung and McPherson (2011) point to the importance of students’ perception of the utility value of music, that is, the students’ view of the practical purpose of learning music and its relevance for their everyday life. The third category is environmental factors and here, it is the influence of third parties, such as teachers, parents and peers, and the swaying power of external rewards that are the most common element across the three motivation theories. The final category is task factors and the main focus here is the influence that lesson content and methods of instruction have on student motivation. The key take-home message here is the importance of both personal and environmental factors in the promotion of motivation.
### Table 3.1 Three recent theories of motivation: A summary

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Aesthetic feelings e.g. enjoying the sound of the instrument</td>
<td>Goal setting and goal achievement skills</td>
<td>Self efficacy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Self recognition</td>
<td>Learning strategies</td>
<td>General health and nutrition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sense of achievement</td>
<td>Competing priorities</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Music preferences</td>
<td>Intellectual profile</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Enjoyment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Self-expressions</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Utility Value</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Usefulness</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental Factors</td>
<td></td>
<td>Links the teacher makes between lesson content and students existing knowledge</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Parental support</td>
<td>The amount of time invested in relationships</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Teacher influence</td>
<td>The offering of external incentives</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>School influence</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Peer support</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Influence of successful others</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Task Factors</td>
<td></td>
<td>The actual content</td>
<td>The relevance and nature of the task</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Method of instruction</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Required degree of thinking and problem solving.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Types of assessment used</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 3.1 Attribution Theory

Weiner’s is a model for motivation based on a cause and effect type scheme in which the perceived reason for a learner’s success or failure has a strong effect on their motivation towards the same or similar tasks in the future. According to this model, a person’s success or failure in a task can be attributed to a number of factors including: ability, effort, strategy, nature of the task, or luck. It is the students’ perception of the cause of their success or failure; that is whether it is stable (the learner is in control) or unstable (where control is in the hand of external forces), that precipitates certain psychological and behavioural consequences for the individual (1986).

The model in Figure 3.1 presents, is a way of looking at motivation that considers not only the personal and social contexts within which the activity took place but also the
perceived cause for the outcome and, importantly, whether or not the cause is considered controllable by the individual. The model then goes on to outline various psychological (e.g. expectancy beliefs and positive or negative emotion) and behavioural (e.g. performance striving) consequences according to the results of the student’s internal inquiry (Weiner, 1986).

The important aspect to note concerning attribution theory is that it is all about the learner’s perceptions of what is, regardless of what is accurate or perceived by others. Consequently, this perception is based on whatever enables the learner to feel good, or in some cases not as bad, about themselves regarding the outcome of the activity (Weiner, 1986).

3.2 Expectancy Value Theory

During the same decade as Weiner’s work (cited above), Pintrich (1989), was conducting his own research in motivation in the field of expectancy value theory. Through this research, Pintrich (1989) contended that there are three components to this model of motivation:

1) Students’ beliefs about the importance and value of the particular task.
2) Student's self-concept regarding their skills and ability needed to achieve in the task, and
3) Student’s feelings about themselves or their emotional response to the task. Table 3.2 (below) provides a brief outline of this model.

In Table 3.2 one of the factors contributing to students’ motivation under this model is how they perceive the task. This includes not only the relative importance of the task as compared to other tasks and priorities, as well as the value of the task in terms of utility and interest; it also encompasses reasons why students engage in a task in the first place according to the motivational properties of various intrinsic and extrinsic goals and incentives. The second factor embraced by this theory is expectancy, which comprises of students’ self-efficacy, their beliefs concerning the degree of control they have over their own learning and behaviour, and, based on this, their expectancy for success or failure. The final variable governing this model is students’ affective response to both their performance on a particular task, or in a particular domain, and their feelings towards the task itself (Paul Pintrich, 1989; Paul Pintrich & DeGroot, 1990).
Figure 3.1 Model of attribution theory (Weiner, 1986)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>General Discussion</th>
<th>Characteristic 1</th>
<th>Characteristic 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Value</strong></td>
<td><strong>Student goal orientation</strong></td>
<td><strong>Task value</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Value components of the model contain reasons for wanting to engage in the task, beliefs about the importance of the task and its utility and interest value.</td>
<td>• Intrinsic motivation (motivated by mastery, challenge, learning and curiosity)</td>
<td>• The value attached to success or failure.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Extrinsic motivation (motivated by grades, rewards, and approval from others)</td>
<td>• The individual perceptions of the importance of the task.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Intrinsic and extrinsic motivation may be two extremes of a continuum but students may be able to adopt characteristics of both while engaging in a task.</td>
<td>• The intrinsic value or interest in the task.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Task value</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Expectancy</strong></td>
<td><strong>Self-efficacy beliefs</strong></td>
<td><strong>Control beliefs</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expectancy components relate to students’ self-efficacy judgements, control beliefs and expectancy for success.</td>
<td>• Students’ beliefs about their performance capabilities in a particular domain.</td>
<td>• Students’ beliefs concerning who (self or others) is responsible for their learning.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Students’ beliefs about their probability for success or failure on a particular task.</td>
<td>• Students who believe that they are in control of their own behaviour tend to perform better than those who believe others are in control of their success or failure.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Affective</strong></td>
<td><strong>Feelings about self</strong></td>
<td><strong>Feelings about the task</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students’ feelings about themselves and their reaction to the task.</td>
<td>• Self-evaluation in terms of self-esteem.</td>
<td>• Emotional reactions to the task. E.g. Test anxiety.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3.2 Expectancy value theory (based on Paul Pintrich, 1989; Paul Pintrich & DeGroot, 1990)
3.3 Goal Orientation theory

The notion of goal orientation has a strong presence in the literature and the basic dichotomous model of mastery and performance goals appears to be also widely used. Although the components of the model are often given different labels, still it seems to be upheld as the standard framework amongst the prevalent research (Table 3.3). For the purposes of this research however, I will adopt the labels mastery goals (focus on learning and improving based on self-referenced standards) and performance goals (focus on avoiding negative judgment of one’s competency or aspiring for a positive judgment of ability based on norm-referenced standards) to represent the opposing sides of the framework.

By way of further explanation, Ames (1992) contends that, when students are governed by mastery goals they work with the aim to develop new skills, increase competence and gain understanding. These students will measure success based on self-referenced standards, believe that ability is changeable and that effort is related to outcome. Conversely, Pintrich and Schunk (2002) explain that if students are governed by performance goals they will work to achieve public recognition of their achievements with the aim to avoid all negative judgments, and to achieve this success with very little effort. Additionally, the student will tend to focus on their own ability and self-worth rather than on the task itself (Ames, 1992), and will tend to measure their success by how well they do in relation to others. In this way, goal orientation theory is a means of using a student’s self perception of ability, their perception of the nature of intelligence and their interpretation of the classroom environment to explain and predict their motivation towards learning (Dweck & Legget, 1988).

With this in mind, Pintrich and Schunk (2002) explain that goal orientation theory is contextual, that is to say, it assumes that the personal goals adopted by the students are influenced by the learning context. In other words, student goal orientations are not static; they can be altered based upon the students’ interpretation of their environment. For this reason, Pintrich and Schunk (2002) contend that student age, task, authority in the classroom, classroom reward structure and methods of evaluation adopted by the teacher, are all influential classroom factors determining whether the students are orientated towards mastery and/or performance. Ames (1992) also supports this contention suggesting that the classroom environments in which the students are participating influences their orientation towards either mastery or performance achievement goals.

In a comparative way, Blumenfeld (1992) contends that the quality of students engagement diminishes, and the probability of them adopting a performance goal increases, if the student does not perceive the task to be valuable or meaningful to them personally. However, the author also calls for a clearer definition in the literature concerning what is meant by the term ‘meaningful’. To this extent, Blumenfeld (1992) distinguishes between cognitive meaning, meaning in terms of interest, and meaning as the extent to which the task links in with the student’s prior knowledge, supports self-understanding or influences their future career options. For the purposes of the present research, I acknowledge both of the dimensions of ‘meaning’ as put forward by Blumenfeld (1992) because I too believe that the
perceived value of a task can be measured not only in terms of student interest but also in terms of how it connects to them on an individual level both in regards to discovering links to prior knowledge but also to the finding of support for the realization of future aspirations.

Further to this, Ames (1992) argues that social comparison, another environmental factor, is also an important concern for motivation in that it affects the way students see themselves, the task and others. Ames explains that the effects of social comparison acting negatively on students is evident in their diminished willingness to take risks in their learning, their adoption of superficial learning strategies and their development of an unfavourable self-concept. Indeed there is a substantial body of literature (e.g. L. H. Anderman & E. M. Anderman, 1999; Goodenow, 1993; Hicks, 1997; Skinner & Belmont, 1993) calling for social goals to be included in considerations of students’ motivation in academic contexts. This approach, the research suggests, may be particularly helpful when working with students in their early adolescence as social factors may be particularly salient at this age (Urdan & Maehr, 1995). Therefore, in order to more fully take contextual factors into account what the individual is trying to achieve socially in conjunction with what they are trying to achieve academically should be considered (Hicks, 1997). In this way, the literature points to a number of social goals that students can espouse:

1. Relationship goals: to form close relationships with, and be accepted by, peers (Hicks, 1997)
2. Responsibility goals: be a contributing member of a particular social group e.g. to be a good class member (L. Anderman & E. Anderman, 1999; Hicks, 1997; Wentzel, 1993)
3. Status goals: to achieve social visibility and prestige, to be a member of the popular crowd (L. Anderman & E. Anderman, 1999; Hicks, 1997)
4. Social welfare goals: striving to succeed in school in order to become a productive member of society (Urdan & Maehr, 1995)
5. Social solidarity goals: striving to succeed so as to bring prestige to ones family or peer group (Urdan & Maehr, 1995)
6. Social approval goals: to succeed in order to gain the approval of ones peers and significant adults (Urdan & Maehr, 1995), and, by focusing in on these social goals one can hope to gain greater insight into students academic motivations that is, why students strive, or not, to achieve in the school context.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Learning Goals</th>
<th>Performance Goals</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Dweck &amp; Legget</strong></td>
<td>• Aim to increase competence</td>
<td>• Aim to avoid negative judgements or to gain favourable judgements of</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(1988)</td>
<td>• Challenge seeking</td>
<td>competence.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• High Persistence in the face of difficulty</td>
<td>• When perceived ability is high a mastery goal is adopted.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Belief that the nature of intelligence in malleable</td>
<td>• Low persistence and avoidance of challenge is the result when perceived ability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>is low.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Belief that intelligence is fixed and unchangeable.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Ames (1992)</strong></td>
<td><strong>Mastery Goals</strong></td>
<td><strong>Performance Goals</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Aim to develop new skills, gain understanding, improve</td>
<td>• Aim to gain public recognition for superior performance and to achieve</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>competence and gain a sense of mastery.</td>
<td>success with very little effort.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Success is based on self-referenced standards</td>
<td>• The focus is on own ability and self-worth rather than the task itself.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Holds the view that effort relates to the outcome.</td>
<td>• Success is determined by doing better than others.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Maehr &amp; Midgley</strong></td>
<td><strong>Task-Focused Goals</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(1991)</td>
<td>• Aim to gain mastery, build on ones competence, and gain</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>insight, skill and understanding and to achieve something challenging.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Learning is valued in and of itself</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Mastery is contingent on effort.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Nicholls (1984)</strong></td>
<td><strong>Task Orientation</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Aim to learn something new, gain new skills or knowledge and</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>to do their best.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Success is determined by self-referenced standards.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Pintrich &amp; Schunk</strong></td>
<td><strong>Mastery Goals</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2002)</td>
<td>• Aim to master the task or achieve self-improvement.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Focus on trying to accomplish something challenging and</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>improve competence.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• More likely to hold the view that effort is related to outcome.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3.3 Goal orientation theory: Multiple perspectives from the literature (Table adapted from P Pintrich, 2000)
The findings by Anderman and Anderman (1999) suggest that students adoption of social responsibility goals is related to an increased mastery focus, while the endorsement of status or relationship goals are related to an increased focus on self and the adoption of performance goals. However, this study only focused on the impact of social goals on the adoption of mastery and performance approach goals and as such did not consider performance avoidance (a goal related to maladaptive learning strategies) which, if considered, may have influenced the results. In addition to the positive influence of social goals the possibility for a negative influence needs to be considered. From my experience, for example, if a student adopts social status goals, the focus of their motivation, that is whether or not they strive for academic success, is dependent on the values of the peer group with whom they are trying to achieve favour. Therefore, if a student aims to become a member of the popular crowd at school and these students do not value academic success then the student is not likely to be motivated to achieve. Conversely, if the peer group a student wishes to be a part of values achievement then this is likely to ignite their academic motivation. Similarly, Ryan, Stiller and Lynch (1994) found that adolescents who reported having parents and teachers as role models demonstrated more positive academic motivation than those who reported emulating friends. Taken together, as Goodenow (1992) contends, this suggests that by identifying school and classroom factors and making them compatible with student social goals student motivation toward schooling can be advanced.

Education is fundamentally a social and interpersonal process. Although individuals can and do learn many things through isolated observation of the world around them, personal experimentation and experience or solitary reading, for the most part what we term education (i.e. schooling) occurs in the company of others. (Goodenow, 1992, p. 177)

Due to the large role social factors play in students’ academic lives, the degree to which students feel a sense of belonging at school can likewise enhance or diminish their motivation to learn, and indeed, participate in the classroom environment. To this extent, Goodenow (1993) found that students’ sense of belonging at school were substantially related to their expectancy for success and the value they placed on learning. Goodenow (1993) continues that much of students’ academic motivation may have its basis in their sense of belonging and more specifically in the perceived support they can expect to receive from others in the classroom. In fact, the author explains, in further support for the importance of social factors, belonging and perceived support is associated with effort and grades to a greater extent than is intrinsic motivation.

Additionally, in an old but important work, Ames (1992) asserts that the issues of authority in the classroom can also affect students’ goal orientation. In this way, whether teachers are autonomy controlling or supportive is evidenced in whether they provide students with choices and allow them to make decisions regarding their own learning. It is important to note here that, in order for such decisions to be a positive influence on students’ goal orientation, the choices need to be seen as equal, so that choice is not based on a student’s desire to expel minimal effort or to avoid failure. Consequently, students are more likely to adopt mastery goals when tasks include
variety and are perceived as relevant, are inbuilt with a sense of student control and a sense of personal, yet appropriate, challenge. Ames (1992) develops this idea further by adding that mastery goals are made salient when the learning process is emphasised over the outcome. This can be done by highlighting meaningful learning, encouraging self- rather than norm-referenced standards, and by providing opportunities for self-directed learning. Furthermore, if teachers utilize assessment strategies that do not emphasise social comparisons yet promote the value of effort they will be headed in the right direction towards a mastery goal focused classroom.

To build on this idea further, Blumenfeld (1992) suggests that challenging tasks that can be achieved with a reasonable amount of effort are supportive of student endorsement of a mastery goal orientation. It should be questioned what the author means by the term ‘reasonable’. Perhaps it means tasks in which students can achieve success with the support of their teacher; however, this explanation appears unlikely as Blumenfeld later contends that students may not readily seek such individual support because it has connotations for them of a lack of ability. Therefore, perhaps ‘reasonable effort’ is influenced by the way the task is presented by the teacher and whether the students view the learning to be gained as meaningful and worthy of their efforts (Blumenfeld, 1992).

Another important distinction evident in students who adopt mastery, as opposed to performance goals, is their attitude and response to failure. When students who espouse performance goals fail to meet the norm-referenced standards for a particular task, or have to exert large amounts of effort in order to do so, they consider themselves to be lacking in ability. The result is that students may become anxious or defensive and might even develop disdain towards the task. On the other hand, however, failure for students who have adopted mastery goals simply means that the task will require more effort and creativity to accomplish (Dweck & Legget, 1988). In a study of 101 fifth grade students Elliot and Dweck (1988) found that when performance goals were emphasised in the classroom, children who believed that they had low ability gave up on attempts to try and find effective solutions to the problem before them and believed that their mistakes reflected a lack of ability. When students believed that they were of high ability, they responded in a task-orientated manner in the face of difficulty, although like their perceived low-ability peers, they still sacrificed the opportunity for learning when they sensed the possibility for public error. This finding suggests that there may be two sides to a performance orientation, where, on one hand, performance-focused students who perceive themselves as having low ability withdraw their effort out of learning when the task becomes difficult, while on the other hand, high-ability, performance-focused students largely continue in a task-orientated manner. Given this, the question then becomes; is the adoption of performance goals always wholly detrimental to students learning? The answer to this question will be addressed in the ensuing paragraphs through discussion of the extension of the mastery/performance goal framework.

Elliot and Harackiewics (1996) extended the dichotomous mastery/performance model by proposing a three-part theory that involves one mastery and two performance goals (approach and avoidance) (refer to the pink squares in Figure 3.2). In this model, mastery and performance-approach goals both represent approach orientations; that is, they are governed by self-regulation towards a perceived positive outcome, task mastery and the improvement, or attainment, of self- or norm-
referenced standards respectively. Performance avoidance, on the other hand, represents an avoidance orientation and, therefore, is governed towards avoiding perceived negative outcomes and promotes the use of defensive strategies (such as not trying) that reduce engagement in a task (Elliot & Harackiewicz, 1996). Additionally, although largely ignored in subsequent research, Elliot and McGregor (2001) recently proposed a further extension to the framework calling for the separation of the Mastery orientation into approach and avoidance spheres (add the green square into your viewing of Figure 3.2). For the purpose of this research I have adopted the Elliot and Harackiewics (1996) three-part model of Goal orientation theory as I believe that it best encapsulates Kokotsaki and Hallam’s (2007) three categories of musical motivations; Music as a musical act (Mastery), Music as a social act (Performance approach & Performance avoidance), and Personal Motivations (Performance approach).

To build on this further, there seems to have been some tension in the literature concerning whether or not Performance goals should be separated into approach and avoidance spheres, in the manner of Elliot and Harackiewics (Elliot & Harackiewics, 1996), and if so, what are the implications for our understanding of achievement motivation. The first issue here is whether performance approach goals are significantly different from performance avoidance goals so as to warrant their separation into distinct individual constructs. Turner and colleagues (2002) found that a classroom performance goal structure did not relate to higher levels of avoidance behaviours amongst the students participating in the study and that rather, it was the combination of instructional aspects, that resulted in the identified differences between the classrooms studied in terms of students’ personal goals and reports of self-handicapping behaviours. However, this study did not distinguish between Performance Approach and Performance Avoidance goals and, had this been the case, the results of the study may have been different. For example, Midgley and Urdan (2001) found that a student’s adoption of Performance avoidance goals predicted their use of self-handicapping strategies, where as Performance approach goals did not. Additionally, and contrary to the finding of Turner and colleagues (Turner et al., 2002), this study also found that students’ perception of a performance focus in the classroom positively predicted self-handicapping strategies while perceptions of a Mastery goal structure negatively predicted the same outcome. This suggests that not only is there a distinction between Performance Approach and Performance Avoidance goals, they may also have differing effects on the dynamics of the classroom and ultimately students learning and engagement with school.

In their study of the goal orientations of senior college students, Barron and Harackiewics (2003) found that Mastery goals, while linked to students’ interest, did not relate to students’ end of semester results. This study also found that Performance Approach goals were positively linked to students’ grades but not their level of interest in the course, and finally, that Performance Avoidance goals were a negative predictor of both interest and grades. This suggests that, depending on the desired outcome (i.e. long-term interest or high test scores); some goals may be better suited than others for a particular class or in a particular environment. This notion, that different contexts may necessitate a different goal focus, is likewise endorsed by Elliot and colleagues (2005) who found that Performance Approach goals are likely to be more effective than Mastery goals when:
• Assessment is based on normative standards.
• Competence is evaluated publically.
• Shallow processing is needed.
• The student finds the given task boring.
• Competence feedback is acquired from an external source.
• Short-term outcomes are considered.

Harackiewics, Barron, Pintrich, Elliot and Thrash (2002) also support this idea suggesting that not only may different achievement goals be more effective than others in certain situations, some goals may also be more, or less, effective in some individuals over others. This idea is also considered by Midgley, Kaplan and Middleton (2001) who noted:

An orientation to demonstrating ability is consistently related to the use of superficial strategies such as memorization and rehearsal. Certainly these strategies have instrumental value for some kinds of academic tasks and tests. The question is whether this instrumental value is sufficient to conclude that performance approach goals are good. (2001, p. 78)

The researchers went on to suggest that performance approach goals need to be partnered with mastery goals in order to yield positive effects. This contention is echoed by Harackiewics and colleagues (2002) who similarly advocate that optimal motivation is achieved through the simultaneous adoption of both mastery and performance approach goals.

Figure 3.2: Achievement goal framework (Elliot and Harackiewics, 1996 and Elliot and McGregor, 2001)
The final aspects of motivation theory of note came from McPherson (2007) who contends that motivation towards music is shaped by four basic psychological needs: firstly, by a need to feel competent because the more competence that is felt the more likely one is to engage in learning tasks, persist in the face of difficulty and achieve success (see also Austin, Renwick, & McPherson, 2006). Secondly, the need for the activity to feel purposeful, that is when the study of music is perceived to be meaningful or valuable and the extent to which it relates to an individual’s personal goals (McPherson, 2007). Thirdly, motivation is shaped by the need to feel autonomous and make independent choices (McPherson, 2007), and lastly, high levels of intrinsic motivation are likely to occur when children feel relatedness towards others and to the task at hand, as well as when they feel supported in their learning by their parents and teachers (McPherson & Davidson, 2006).

Vallerand, Fortier and Guay (1997) suggest that teachers’ support of autonomy has a greater impact on the motivation of rural students as compared to their suburban and urban peers. This finding may be due to the relative isolation experienced by many rural students and the effects of reduced class sizes which would likely lead to increased individual teacher attention.

3.4 Conclusion

Up to this point, I have explored Kokotsaki and Hallam’s (2007) three categories of musical participation with reference to the supporting literature. I have examined the concept of Place in light of its potential as a model for contextual understanding, I have discussed the literature’s view of some of the issues concerning education in rural areas, and I have explored various components of motivation theory with particular emphasis on goal orientation theory as a means to understand human motivation. To draw this all together I present three figures: Figure 3.3 highlights that Environment, Task and Individual are three predominant sources of motivation in the educational context. The Figure then breaks down each of these three sources of motivation into a list of influences that then play a prominent role in informing how each of the three sources is perceived and lived in the lives of the students.

Figure 3.4 succinctly presents aspects from the literature that have played a role in assisting to shape the research. These include influences on motivation: Goal Orientation Theory (Ames, 1992; Dweck & Legget, 1988; Maehr & Midgley, 1991; Nicholls, 1984; Pintrich & Schunk, 2002) as well as a list of other general factors:

- Music as a Musical Act: The intrinsic value of music
- Music as a Social Act: The individuals’ sound contributes to a sense of belonging
- Personal Motivations: The pursuit of musical activities for extra musical gain

Finally, Figure 3.4 also acknowledges Sense of Place (Kudryavtsev et al., 2012) (See table 9.1 p.201: ‘Music Motivation and Place’ for greater information of Figure 3.3 and 3.4)

- Place Attachment
- Place Dependence
Place Identity
Place Meaning

Figure 3.5 shows that motivation is a complex web of interactions and influences but more specifically, that an individual’s motivation in music is influenced by a number of intrinsic and extrinsic factors:

- Musical factors: such as a love for the timbre of a particular instrument
- Individual factors: for example, one’s self-concept of ability
- Environmental factors: the setting in which one lives and participates
- Extra-musical factors: such as participating in music as a means to improve one’s self-confidence.

The way the individual then responds to these factors is determined by their goal orientation and sense of Place which in turn influences their self-identity and world view, which in turn influences the effect the original set of factors have on their motivation in the future.

Taking the existing research into account through the present inquiry I will seek to explore the following research questions:

1. What factors influence the participation motivation of musicians from two rural Australian towns?
2. Does ‘Place’ influence participants’ motivation to participate in instrumental music? If so, how?
3. Is there any understanding to be gained from considering an intersection between Kokotsaki and Hallam’s (2007) three categories of music participation and Kudryavtsev, Stedman and Kransny’s (2012) model of ‘Place’? If so, what?
4. How can such an understanding be applied to improve the practices of teachers and community music providers to increase motivation among instrumental music participants?
Figure 3.3 Model of motivational influence
Figure 3.4 Concepts from the literature that have helped to shape this research

**GOAL ORIENTATION THEORY**

(AMES, 1992a; DWEEK & LEGGET, 1988a; MAEHR & MIDGLEY, 1991; NICHOLES, 1984; P. R. PINTRICH & SCHUNK, 2002)

Goal orientation theory is a framework through which one is able to explain, or even foresee, certain achievement behaviours amongst individuals, particularly students in educational settings, through the way they view the nature of intelligence and their interpretation of the classroom environment.

These characteristics influence, and are influenced by, the goal orientations (mastery, performance approach and performance avoidance) adopted, to various extents, by the individual.

**THREE CATEGORIES OF PARTICIPATION IN MUSIC**

(DIMITRA KOKOTSAKI & SUSAN HALLAM, 2007)

**ADDITIONAL MOTIVATION FACTORS**

- Task value and relevance
- Self concept
- Emotional response to the task
- Sense of autonomy in the classroom.
- Perceived causes of outcomes
- Interpersonal influence and support
- Pedagogy and lesson content
- Learning strategies
- Aesthetic feelings

**Task**

- Difficulty
- Value
- Content
- Method of instruction
- Relevance

**Individual**

- Sense of competence
- Sense of purposefulness
- Goals and strategies
- Perceived ability
- Self-efficacy
- Self expressions
- Competing priorities
- Sense of autonomy
Figure 3.5 Diagram of the theoretical framework underpinning this study
Chapter 4: Methodology

In educational research there are three main paradigms; qualitative, quantitative and mixed method (Johnson & Christensen, 2008). Through an exploration of these paradigms the following discussion will be used in order to locate this methodological position within the wider field of motivation research. This chapter will conclude with an outline of the specific research design I have adopted, followed by an in depth examination of the research instruments and how they were used in working with the participants.

4.1 Qualitative research

Bresler and Stake (1992) contend that qualitative research acknowledges that any given action or event carries with it a multitude of different meanings dependant on the diverse backgrounds of those involved, and therefore, the resultant accounts of reality can be as numerous as those who participate in, or recall it. In this way, phenomena exist as part of unique social, historical, cultural and economic contexts and therefore must be understood as such (Lodico, 2000). This being the case, it is then the task of the researcher to come to understand and express these meanings in a way that remain true to the individual yet make sense of the whole (Bresler & Stake, 1992).

Ridenour and Newman (2008) suggest that for qualitative researchers, knowledge about reality “…is accrued subjectively, in natural settings that are value laden and difficult to generalize” (p. 13) This subjectivity is one of the strengths of this approach in that it allows the researcher to respond to a multifaceted array of cues and meanings that exist in the context and therefore provide the reader with an experience of that context (be it only a vicarious one)(Eisner, 1998). For critics of qualitative research, this same subjectivity is considered to be a weakness of the approach, instead, insisting that for something to be knowable, it must also be quantifiable (Phillips & Burbules, 2000) to an extent not appropriate for the nature of qualitative data.

Additionally, qualitative research is about focussing on the idiosyncratic; it is not about conformity or standardisation. In this way, what researchers do in the research setting, the methods they employ, how they relate to the participants and the degree to which they participate in the setting itself will depend on their strengths as a researcher, their particular research interests and the unique qualities of the contexts in which they are working (Eisner, 1998). In this regard, the benefits of a qualitative approach to research are three-fold:

1. Qualitative research takes into account the multiple realities and the multiple perspectives that exist for a single phenomenon and those who live it.
2. It allows for a rich description of events providing the reader with a vicarious experience of reality, as it exists for the participants.
3. The researcher is able to get up close to the people or phenomenon they are studying. They are able to observe from the inside.
On the other hand, from a possibly, although not always, negative perspective, qualitative research is by its very nature context specific, and therefore, makes it difficult for the researcher to generalise beyond the specific case studied.

4.2 Quantitative research

Quantitative research makes certain assumptions about the nature of reality that are in stark contrast to its qualitative cousin. In quantitative research, according to Ridenour and Newman (2008, p. 13) “…knowledge about reality is assumed to be objective, separate and distinct from one who studies it; knowledge is deductively reasoned and generalizable; knowledge of reality is lawful, value free, and context free because reality is stable and knowable” In other words, quantitative research appears to assume that there is only one reality, only one truth, which is knowable within the limits of probability. Here objectivity is important and the researcher must remain separate from the participants throughout the duration of the study (Mertens, 1998). In this regard, the benefits of quantitative research are three-fold:

1. It can be used to argue causality and provide statistical descriptions.
2. It is relatively easy for the researcher to remain objective.
3. Findings can be generalised to the wider population.

There are several obvious issues with the philosophy behind such an approach. Indeed, Phillips and Burbules (2000) outline three major flaws:

1. The notion of truth is not as absolute as proponents of quantitative research would have us believe; in fact, in any particular study there may be as many truths as there are participants. In this way, the unique cultural, intellectual and experiential backgrounds of participants determine what they see as true and, therefore, it is possible for one person’s truth to be in tension with the truth of another.
2. Observation by its very nature can never be completely neutral. In other words, what an observer sees (or does not see) and indeed even the very focus of their observation are all coloured by their background, their theories, their hypotheses and their assumptions.
3. One cannot rightly claim that the evidence gathered supports only one theory when, in reality, there may be other, or multiple, theories to which the evidence points and, therefore, data should be examined through the lens of its context.

In regards to the above summary of the essence of qualitative and quantitative research, as a researcher I identify with the need to gather and interpret data with reference to its context; I too feel the need to delve deeply into the contextual surrounds of phenomena and reach a level of understanding only possible through a qualitative approach. Indeed, the qualitative paradigm fitted beautifully with my research design in that it allowed me to really explore the nature of the motivations and challenges of musical participation as experienced and lived by the participants themselves. In this respect, the participants are not numbers but people; people capable of interacting with their physical and social environments, influencing and being influenced, and importantly they are capable of being cognizant of these processes and are able to share them, and their insight, with the researcher. Therefore
in the main study I replaced each participant and place with a pseudonym. However, much of the surveyed literature concerning motivation was conducted using quantitative methods alone (as will be discussed later) and therefore, in my view, was not able to capture well the context in which their participants were acting.

4.3 Mixed methods research

It is difficult to form generalisations with qualitative research; therefore, I also recognise that, at times, there are some aspects of phenomena that are best expressed in numbers for reasons of clarity and comparison. For this reason, I have taken a mixed-method approach to this inquiry which, in addition to the kind of data mentioned above, would allow me to gather demographic data and create the motivational profile of the participants, in order to help make sense of the qualitative data and to enable comparisons both within and between cases.

4.4 Research that has studied motivation in relation to music education

Existing literature on the topic of motivation in music and other educational pursuits has been conducted in a range of settings using a range of approaches.

Table 4.1 is a visual representation of a very small selection of the studies published on the topic. In terms of participants, the majority of studies involved various combinations of primary, secondary and/or tertiary students. In terms of method, many of the studies are largely quantitative. The present inquiry hopes to add to the existing literature by gaining insight into the motivations and challenges of community musicians of all ages participating in various Australian contexts using a combination of qualitative and quantitative methods.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>REFERENCE</th>
<th>SUBJECTS</th>
<th>INSTRUMENTS</th>
<th>AIMS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(Abeles, 2004) - USA</td>
<td>2&lt;sup&gt;nd&lt;/sup&gt; and 4&lt;sup&gt;th&lt;/sup&gt; grade students</td>
<td>Vocational choice survey</td>
<td>To examine the influence of orchestra/school partnerships on students’ interest in instrumental music.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Atlas et al., 2004) – UK</td>
<td>19 Undergraduate music students</td>
<td>Sensitivity to criticism scale</td>
<td>To examine the effects of sensitivity to criticism on the motivation of music students.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Barrett &amp; Smigiel, 2007) – AUS</td>
<td>25 children aged between 6 and 17.</td>
<td>Artefact elicited interview</td>
<td>To gain children’s perspectives of meaning, value and participation in music.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Corenblum &amp; Marshall, 1998) – Canada</td>
<td>253 year 9 students</td>
<td>Questionnaire, Interview and Observation</td>
<td>To develop and test a model to predict student intentions to continue in a high school band program.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Hartley &amp; Porter, 2009) – USA</td>
<td>172 elementary, middle and junior high school teachers.</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
<td>To examine the influence of beginning instructional grade on string students enrolment, retention and performance.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Kinney, 2010)- USA</td>
<td>Middle school students</td>
<td>Document analysis. Specifically an analysis of school records pertaining to students’ demographics and their results on achievement tests.</td>
<td>To fit prediction models to students’ decisions to enrol and continue in band programs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Leung &amp; McPherson, 2011) – China</td>
<td>Primary and secondary aged music students</td>
<td>Structured interview</td>
<td>To examine factors influencing the motivation of musical high achievers to study music.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Martin, 2008) - AUS</td>
<td>224 music students &amp; 239 sports students</td>
<td>Motivation and engagement scale (MES)</td>
<td>To test a framework of motivation and engagement in music and sport.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(McEwan, 2008) – AUS</td>
<td>Middle school students</td>
<td>Semi-structured interview</td>
<td>To examine motivational and contextual factors that influence students to participate in classroom music programs.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.1 Methodologies employed in a small sample of studies presented in the literature
4.5 Methodological approach

I will now review exactly how I went about addressing my four research questions:

1. What factors influence the participation motivation of musicians from two rural Australian towns?
2. Does ‘Place’ influence participants’ motivation to participate in instrumental music? If so, how?
3. Is there any understanding to be gained from considering an intersection between Kokotsaki and Hallam’s (2007) three categories of music participation and Kudryavtsev, Stedman and Kransny’s (2012) model of ‘Place’? If so, what?
4. How can such an understanding be applied to improve the practices of teachers and community music providers to increase motivation among participants?

While reading and considering the relevant literature I felt that in order to answer my research questions I would need to have participants from a range of sites around Australia and from towns that were different in key characteristics, such as size, SES, and level of remoteness. However, while planning the logistics of how my data collection would work I quickly realized that visiting multiples sites in multiple states would prove to be a mammoth task, certainly much too big in scope to be manageable within the time frame of a PhD; I needed to rethink. What follows is an examination of the results of this deliberation.

The following discussion begins with an overview of my methodology focusing initially on the number and breakdown of participants for each stage of the project and an in-depth look at the research instruments used with an emphasis on how their focus links with the major themes to come out of the literature review. Next, I will demonstrate the link between these themes and the research questions and finally will sum up with a discussion concerning data analysis.

4.6 A Multiple Case study approach

My research project is based on a three-phase, multiple case study design; this was chosen as the most suitable framework through which to collect data because as an approach it aims “…to preserve the uniqueness of each individual case, yet produce cross-site conclusions” (Bresler & Stake, 1992, p. 85).

According to Thomas (2003) a multiple case study approach has several advantages. Firstly, the approach allows for rich description of participants and their actions, and secondly, case study allows the researcher to highlight the multiple factors that result in the unique actions and lives of the individual. In the present study, the issue of generalizability will be addressed by firstly, comparing the data between cases and secondly by examining the aggregate of the data with close reference to the themes outlined in the literature to determine the extent to which participant views correlate with current understandings on a broader scale.
4.7 Participants

The pilot study in which I trialled the questionnaires, interview schedules as well as observation techniques was conducted in one K-12 school, Tobruk College (pseudonym), in a regional Victorian town. I decided that a trial in a community ensemble was not necessary due to the fact that the questionnaires for the community musicians and conductors were comparable to those designed for the students and instrumental music teachers respectively.

For the pilot study students were chosen using random sampling techniques, specifically selecting every fifth student from a complete role of instrumental music students representing each of the four identified year levels. This recruitment strategy was chosen because it targeted only those students sufficiently advanced in their schooling, (i.e. grade three and above), to be able to comprehend the questions asked of them both in the questionnaire and interview stages of the research. Additionally, by targeting students from years three, six, nine and twelve it was hoped that I would obtain a broad cross-section of the population of music students enrolled at Tobruk College. The initial response rate among students was very low with only three of twenty consent forms originally distributed to students signed and returned. In order to try and improve this situation I distributed a second round of information letters and consent forms to all students taught by the participating instrumental teachers, however once again the response rate was unfortunately very low.

As for the instrumental music teachers, they were initially contacted, on my behalf, by the then Director of Music, Alison Watson (pseudonym), who clearly explained to potential participants the background and purpose of my project while simultaneously outlining the time commitment involved should they agree to participate. Instrumental music teachers were then requested to collect a participant package, including introductory letter and consent form if they were interested in the research and wished to become involved in the project. Alison Watson was also instrumental in encouraging Angela Donaldson (pseudonym), principal of Tobruk College, to participate in the study and share her insight of school structure and culture as well as her valuable understanding of students and staff.

Opportunity sampling was used to select community music ensembles from two rural Australian towns. These towns were chosen because they differ on important demographic variables, such as mean level of household income, local industry, and overall landscape. In addition, these towns served as a base from which to conduct my research as they are as sites central to their area and consequently I was able to access participants from the smaller outlying communities who come to town for education, employment and various other recreational pursuits. Due to the limited number of participants in rural ensembles, as compared to their metropolitan counterparts, together with the possibility of a low response rate, I invited all members of the community-based ensembles to participate in the research. Table 4.2 outlines the numbers of participants from each site who agreed to participate.
The first stage of the study employed a largely quantitative questionnaire, followed by interviews and observations. The purpose of the questionnaire was to construct the motivational profiles of participants. The items comprising the questionnaire were largely drawn from pre-existing instruments selected to elicit responses that would help me construct the motivational profile of participants and gain a feel for the goal focus of the school, classroom, rehearsal and home environments. These questionnaires were based on selected scales from three existing instruments:

2. Patterns of Adaptive Learning Scales (PALS) (Midgley et al., 2000)
3. Psychological Sense of School Membership Scale (PSSM) (Goodenow, 1992)

The MSLQ and PALS were designed to assess the goal orientations of tertiary, elementary and middle school students respectively while the PSSM assesses a student’s sense of school belonging. Additionally, extra items were included on the questionnaire, which were designed to gather demographic data: age, gender and years of playing/singing experience with the intention of opening up avenues through which to analyse and compare the responses. Table 4.3 outlines these selected scales together with sample questions as adapted for initial use in the pilot study. Also included were some open-ended qualitative items to add support to the ever-building picture regarding case and context.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scale</th>
<th>Sample Item</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Value component: Intrinsic goal orientation (MSLQ)</td>
<td>In music, I prefer pieces that challenge me, even if they are difficult to learn. (S)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Value component: Extrinsic goal orientation (MSLQ)</td>
<td>In music, getting a good grade is the most important thing. (S)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Value component: Task value (MSLQ)</td>
<td>I think what I do in music is useful for me to learn. (S)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expectancy component: Control of learning beliefs (MSLQ)</td>
<td>If I don’t understand what we do in music, it is because I didn’t try hard enough. (S)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expectancy component: Self-efficacy for learning and performance (MSLQ)</td>
<td>I’m certain I can play the most difficult pieces my teacher gives me in music. (S)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Affective component: Test anxiety (MSLQ)</td>
<td>When I perform I think about how bad I am compared to other students. (S)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mastery goal orientation (Revised) (PALS)</td>
<td>It’s important to me that I improve my skills on my instrument/voice this year. (S)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Performance approach goal orientation (Revised) (PALS)</td>
<td>One of my goals is to show others in my class that music is easy for me. (S)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Performance avoid goal orientation (Revised) (PALS)</td>
<td>One of my goals is to stop others from thinking I am a band musician. (S)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perception of classroom goal structures: Classroom mastery goal structure (PALS)</td>
<td>In music, how much you improve is really important. (S)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perceptions of classroom goal structures: Classroom performance approach goal structure (PALS)</td>
<td>In music, it’s important to get high scores on tests/exams (S).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perceptions of classroom goal structures: Classroom performance avoid structure (PALS)</td>
<td>In music, showing others that you are not a bad musician is really important. (S)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academic related perceptions, beliefs and strategies: Academic self-handicapping strategies (PALS)</td>
<td>Some students purposely don’t try hard in music. Then if they don’t perform well, they can say it was because they didn’t try. How true is this of you? (S)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academic related perceptions, beliefs and strategies: Avoiding novelty (PALS)</td>
<td>I prefer to play/sing music that is familiar to me rather than music I would have to learn. (S)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academic related perceptions, beliefs and strategies: Skepticism about the relevance of school for future success (PALS)</td>
<td>My chances of doing well later in life don’t depend on my involvement I music. (S)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perception of parents, home life and neighborhood: Parent mastery goal (PALS)</td>
<td>My parents would like me to do challenging work in music, even if I make a mistake. (S)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perception of parents, home life and neighborhood: Parent performance goal (PALS)</td>
<td>My parents would be pleased if I could show that music is easy for me. (S)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perceptions of the schools goal structure for students: Mastery goal structure for students. (PALS)</td>
<td>The importance of trying hard is really stressed to students. (P)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perceptions of school goal structure for students: Performance goal structure for students. (PALS)</td>
<td>At this school, students are encouraged to compete with each other academically. (P)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Approaches to instruction: Mastery approaches (PALS)</td>
<td>I consider how much students have improved when I report on their progress. (IMT)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Approaches to instruction: Performance approaches (PALS)</td>
<td>I encourage students to compete with each other. (IMT)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Psychological sense of school membership scale (PSSM)</td>
<td>I am included in lots of activities at my school. (S)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

S = Student  P=Principal  IMT= Instrumental music teacher

Table 4.3 Scales and sample questionnaire item

The second stage of this research project was based on a multiple case study approach involving semi-structured interviews and qualitative observations. The objective here was to further explore the motivational profile and contextual picture created through the questionnaire and to continue to examine the role of Place in the participant’s motivation towards instrumental music.
4.9 Semi-structured Interviews

In selecting the style of interview that would be most suited to the purpose of the research I considered three types of interview, structured, semi-structured and unstructured. A summary of the results to this enquiry can be found in Table 4.4. The primary aspects of the interviews I considered had to do with the degree of imposed structure and also the possibility of reliability when comparing the results. As Table 4.4 attests, the structured interview is researcher controlled in that the questions, and their order, are predetermined. While this consistency allows for ease of comparison and the possibility of easy replication, the standardized wording may disrupt the flow of the conversation. The unstructured interview, on the other hand, affords much more directional control to the participant. However, as questions arise out of the context of the interview it is difficult to compare results of this type due to the fact that participants are often asked different questions (L. Cohen, Manion, & Morrison, 2011; Gillham, 2005).

Hence, the semi-structured interview was deemed to be the most appropriate, as it allows for the composition of an interview schedule which outlines themes to be covered during the interview and areas of interest where probing questions may be utilized if the important topics are not addressed spontaneously or in enough depth (Gillham, 2005). Therefore, the semi-structured interview allows for greater flexibility while at the same time ensuring some degree of consistency between interviews.

The themes to be addressed in the interviews, like the questionnaires, were drawn from the table of themes (Table 4.5). It is anticipated that the interview will allow the researcher to:

1. Investigate themes and questions that were not covered by the questionnaire.
2. Delve into covered themes with greater depth.
3. Follow up on ideas that emerged from the questionnaire analysis.
4. Gain a more personalized and context specific perspective.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Interview Type</th>
<th>Character</th>
<th>Positives</th>
<th>Negatives</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Structured Interview| The exact wording of the questions is determined beforehand and consequently all participants are asked the same questions, in the same way, and in the same order. | • Participants all answer the same questions thus allowing for greater ease of comparison.  
• Interview can be easily replicated.  
• Reduces interviewer bias. | • Less flexibility.  
• Standardized wording may result in an interview that does no flow naturally like a conversation. |
| Semi-structured Interview | The same basic questions are asked of everyone but the wording and order may change. | • Interviewees may be prompted by supplementary questions for depth or clarity.  
• Comparison is achievable because the question content is basically the same for each respondent.  
• Potential to flow much like a conversation. | • Important topics may be accidentally omitted.  
• Differences in wording between respondents may change the resultant answers to questions therefore compromising comparison. |
| Unstructured Interview | There are no predetermined questions or topics as the interviewee is largely determining the structure of the interview by telling their story. | • Questions emerge out of observation and the context of the interview.  
• The participant has the opportunity to tell their story uninterrupted by more structured questioning. | • Different questions are used for different people resulting in mixed results.  
• Comparison and analysis of data can be difficult. |

Table 4.4 Types of interview (Cohen, Manion & Morrison, 2011 and Gillham, 2005)
|--------|---------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| School K-12 | Principal    | • Culture of the school  
  • Socio economic factors  
  • Community links         | To find out the value of music within the school, financial constraints within which the department functions, and how the principal perceives the role of the school in the community | • Austin & Vispoel (1998), Bandura (1986), Leung & McPherson (2011), Maehr & McInerney (2004), Pintrich & Schunk (2002) and McPherson (2007)  
| Teachers | • Strategies used to motivate and encourage students  
  • Perception of particular difficulties and benefits of location  
  • Methods of instruction  
  • Culture of the music department | To find out teacher perceptions of the environment and/context in which the students are working. | • Bandura (1986), Barry, Oakley and Pitty (2000), Leung & McPherson (2011) and OEDC (2000)  
  • Barry, Oakley and Pitty (2000)  
  • Bandura (1986) and Leung & McPherson (2011) |
| Students | • Intrinsic/Extrinsic Motivation  
  • Mastery and Performance Goals  
  • Perception of particular difficulties and benefits based on location  
  • Reasons for getting involved in music  
  • Social influences and support  
  • Task Value  
  • Self-efficacy beliefs  
  • Expectancy  
  • Place | To find out students’ motivation orientations, their perception of particular benefits, constraints, and characteristics of their ‘Music Places’ and what motivated them to get involved in the first place | • Pintrich (1989), Pintrich & DeGroot (1990)  
  • Adderly, Kennedy & Berz (2003), Kokotsaki & Hallam (2007), Marsh (2003), Schmidt (2005), and Wristen (2006)  
  • Barry, Oakley & Pitty (2000) and Leung & McPherson (2011)  
  • Weiner (1986) |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Socio economic factors</td>
<td>Strategies used to motivate and encourage their child</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perceptions of particular difficulties and benefits based on location</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perception of particular difficulties and benefits based on location</td>
<td>Reasons for getting involved in music</td>
<td>Barry, Oakley &amp; Pitty (2000) and Leung &amp; McPherson (2011)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strategies used to motivate and encourage students</td>
<td>Perception of particular difficulties and benefits of location</td>
<td>Gruenewald (2003a), Parks &amp; Jones (2011), West (2009)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.10 Observation

Observation was used to further enhance the validity and reliability of the research through a process of triangulation (Ridenour & Newman, 2008). On this point, Flick (2007) contends that triangulation involves examining data from multiple perspectives. For this study, I employed both triangulation of data (studying the same phenomena at different times, in different locations with different people), which is captured in the very nature of a multiple case study, and triangulation of methods (triangulation through combining different methods to overcome the limitations are one alone). In other words, it was hoped that through a combination of questionnaire, interview and observation I would not only be able to confirm the reliability of the collected data but will also be able to make certain generalisations about the cases as a whole.

According to Johnson and Christensen (2008) there are four approaches to observation which can be used to obtain this goal. The first such approach is for the researcher to observe the phenomenon as a complete participant in that phenomenon. Here the researcher becomes a member of the group being observed and does not inform the participants about the research. Consequently, this style of observation has negative implications in terms of ethical concerns, as the participants are not given the opportunity to decline participation or to withdraw themselves from the research. Additionally, because of the close relationship between the researcher and participants there is the possibility for objectivity to become lost. On the positive side, because the participants do not know they are being observed, there is no change in behaviour as a result of the observation.

The second approach to observation is the participant as observer. Here, the researcher attempts to become an insider of the group being observed and spends a good deal of time in the field. The participants are aware of the researchers’ presence and the nature of the research, therefore the researcher can gain participant permission to collect data and gain feedback regarding observations and tentative conclusions. From a negative perspective, however, participants may act differently knowing that they are being observed, although according to Johnson and Christensen (2008) this can change with the establishment of a trusting relationship between the researcher and participants.

The third approach to observation to be considered is observer as participant, where the researcher is in the dual role of researcher and participant although tends to act more often as a researcher. In this approach the participants know they are being observed and the researcher doesn’t spend as long in the field as they might with the above-mentioned approaches, instead relying on briefer interactions. While it is more difficult to gain an insider’s perspective with this approach, it is easier to stay objective. The final approach to be discussed here is researcher as complete observer. Here, the researcher fully immerses themselves in the observer role while the participants usually do not know that they are being observed. Therefore, while there is minimum “reactivity” (p.214) there are obvious ethical concerns.

Having considered these four approaches to observation, I decided that the third approach, observer as participant, would meet the requirements of the present research with limited time in the field. While I endeavoured to participate in the
research environment, to be largely treated as an insider and therefore able to gain an insider’s perspective, I wish to remain objective.

To this end, participants for the observation component of the research were drawn from those who participated in the interview phase. Therefore, at the pilot school site the participating instrumental teachers were observed teaching instrumental lessons as well as during their work with their ensembles. Participating students will be observed during their regular instrumental music lessons and rehearsals where possible. Additionally, community musicians and their ensemble conductor will be observed during their regular rehearsal times.

The focus of the observation component of the research was to:

1. Gain a firsthand feel for the climate of the music classroom, department and ensemble rehearsal spaces in order to build on the perspective of the music teachers and ensemble directors as derived from the interviews.
2. Gain an insider’s view of the teachers’ and musical directors’ methods of instruction in order to support their own perspective of their practice.
3. Understand the strategies used by the teachers and musical directors to motivate and engage their musicians.

### 4.11 Data Collection

In phase-one the participant packages (including the consent form, plain language statement and questionnaire) were mailed to the contact person from the community ensembles to be distributed to potential participants. The questionnaires were then self-administered by participants and returned to the researcher along with the completed consent form in the stamped self-addressed envelope provided. The reason for this is so that I could analyse the results prior to commencing phase two of the project; site visits, as it was anticipated that the results of the questionnaire would inform the direction and focus of the case studies. The pilot study was the exception as I withheld the student questionnaires until after I arrived at the site so that they could be administered to students collectively thus enabling a follow-up discussion concerning any issues or problems that arose while students were completing the questionnaire. This, however, proved to be unfruitful because even though the numbers were small it was very difficult to coordinate a time we could all meet around students’ other lunchtime commitments, and secondly it was obvious that students wanted to go outside with their friends as quickly as possible and this therefore may have resulted in students not thinking about a question as thoroughly, as they would normally, before committing to a response.

The focus of the second phase of the study was on gaining a deeper understanding of contextual issues, classroom/rehearsal room factors and, the participants’ sense of Place, with an emphasis on how these influence motivations. I employed two contrasting yet complimentary methods: interview and observation. As part of phase-two I spent a month in each site observing rehearsals and lessons (as was the case with Tobruk College). I planned to spend the first two weeks of my fieldwork observing and conducting informal conversations with participants in order to gain an insider’s view of the school/ensemble culture and a feel for ‘Place’. The purpose of this approach was to acclimatize the participants to my presence; to help them feel
comfortable and at home with my being in their environment. I was hopeful that this approach would result in participants’ honesty and openness when it came to the informal conversations and interviews. Exact interview times were negotiated with the relevant participants, audio recorded and conducted during the school day for Instrumental music teachers and their students, while interviews with community musicians and ensemble directors were conducted at a mutually convenient time in a mutually agreed upon location. In terms of observation, I originally planned to follow a self-constructed schedule through which I would be able to gather the same, or at least similar, information from each group I observed. However again this proved unfruitful as right from the pilot study I noticed that participating in the context would not only be helpful for participants but it allowed me to gain a better feel for the place. By way of example, at Tobruk College I was approached to play in a trio for a student soiree as well as attend rehearsals and play along and support the clarinet students in the school orchestra for their performance at speech night. When I was working with the Aster Falls Town Band, I too was asked to participate, so I not only joined their concert band, but also the ‘Liquorice Sticks’ (not surprisingly a clarinet ensemble) and played at three events, the Million Paws Walk, at a church service and in the local eisteddfod. I also participated in some administration duties for the eisteddfod. Unfortunately, I was not invited to participate to such an extent with the two ensembles from Haven.

4.12 Analysis

The questionnaire data were mainly quantitative so I used excel, to assist process and compare the results. As such, I will be exploring and comparing the questionnaire data according to variables such as: age, gender, and location. The few questionnaire items requiring a qualitative response were analysed by exploring and arranging the data according to emergent themes.

As the Interview data are qualitative, and as one of my primary concerns is for the participants’ voices to be heard, I took an ‘interpretative phenomenological approach’ (Smith, 1995, p. 10) to the analysis of interview data. This stance assumes that what is said in the interview has some level of ongoing significance for the participants, and although this connection is not always obvious, it is the researcher’s task to interpret the data in such a way as to be sensitive to the participants’ voice. In this manner, firstly I explored the transcripts and applied codes according to emergent themes. I then analysed each individual theme, looking for possible connections both within and between themes. Finally, I arranged copies of the data according to the overall schemata of themes presenting my observations and analysis interspersed with directly quoted segments from the original transcripts. This approach to analysis is endorsed by Smith (1995) who reminds researchers that the participant is the expert and therefore should be given ample opportunity to share their story.

4.13 Reflecting on the Tools

The tables presented here illustrate the focus of the questionnaires, interviews and observations. Table 4.6 demonstrates the relationship between the focus of the questionnaire and interviews.

The main focus of the questionnaires was building the participants’ motivational profile. This was achieved by focusing on:
2. Learning beliefs and self-efficacy.
3. Learning strategies
4. Whether participants are influenced by Mastery, Performance Approach or Performance Avoid goal orientations.

Other aspects of the questionnaires include:

1. The collection of demographic data including age, gender, instruments played and level of education.
2. Motivational factors including reasons for taking up an instrument and why they continue to be involved in instrumental music.
3. To uncover important or meaningful ‘music places’. These are places that are connected in some way to the participants’ music making that hold particular significance for the individual.

The main focus of the interviews was to explore various aspects of the participants’ sense of place, specifically the influences of their social environment, feelings associated with their “Music Places” and the particular difficulties, frustrations and benefits of being a musician in their school and town, and how these factors influence their motivation to participate.

Table 4.7 highlights that the main purpose of the questionnaire was to ascertain the goal focus of the teacher’s/conductor’s instruction as well as the goal focus of the school/ensemble environment more generally. The questionnaire asked a few broad open questions pertaining to the teacher/conductors perceptions of the music or ensemble program and then focused on this a little further to ask about their perceptions of the culture there. Additionally, the questionnaires were designed to gather some basic demographic data including, the participants’ years of experience, the length of time they have been in their current position and a description of their role from their own perspective.

At the centre of the table under “Main focus of interview items” the focus is on both the specific difficulties and specific benefits of being a musician in their school/ensemble and town, and how these factors influence their motivation. The interview also links back to the questionnaire to look at participants’ perspectives of the motivational strategies they employ in their teaching.

The final component of this table highlights the main focus of the observations, which will be equally on the role of Place and the goal orientation implied by the teacher/conductor through their practice. To achieve this, I was interested in the characteristics of the physical environments in which the participants are acting but also, importantly, in how the participants interact with and within these environments. The teaching program and pedagogy of the teachers and the ensemble conductors was also explored.

The last of the ‘Theme and Focus’ tables looks at the questionnaires for Principals and the Parents of instrumental music students. The first half of the table focuses on the questionnaire for Principals the primary aim here was to contribute to my picture of context by examining the Principal’s perceptions of the goal focus of their school, school culture and the place of music within the school. This questionnaire was also
designed to continue to build on my sense of context and ‘Place’ by collecting information about the connection between the community and the school.

The purpose of the parent’s questionnaire is likewise about building up my contextual understanding by looking at the students’ motivation through the eyes of their parents. Additionally, the strategies parents use to motivate their children in instrumental music and the goal structure of the family home will also be examined. Also of interest here is the parents’ perceptions of how their place of residence and financial situation influence their child’s motivation to participate.
| Motivators | * | * | * | * | * |
| Challenges | * | * | * | * | * |
| Goal Orientation | * | * | * | * | * |
| SES | * | * | * | * | * |
| Place | * | * | * | * | * |
| Difficulties facing rural youth | * | * | * | * | * |
| Demographics | * | * | * | * | * |

Table 4.6 Music student and community musicians: Link between theme and focus of Questions and Interviews of Questionnaire, Interview and Observation
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Instrumental music teachers and community conductors</th>
<th>Main focus of questionnaire items</th>
<th>Main focus of interview items</th>
<th>Main focus of observation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Years experience, how long in current position, Description of role.</td>
<td>Perception of Music program</td>
<td>Motivation strategies used.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perception of the culture of the music department</td>
<td>Goal focus of instruction (Mastery/Performance)</td>
<td>Difficulties of being a musician at school/in the town.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perceptions of school goal structure</td>
<td>Perceived challenges</td>
<td>Benefits of being a musician in school as a source of motivation?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Motivators</td>
<td></td>
<td>Impact of financial situation on music</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Challenges</td>
<td></td>
<td>Observation of the physical environment/interaction with it</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goal Orientation</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>The teaching program</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SES</td>
<td></td>
<td>Pedagogy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Place</td>
<td></td>
<td>Observed motivation strategies used.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Difficulties facing rural youth</td>
<td></td>
<td>Students/community interaction and teacher/mentor</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demographics</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.7 Instrumental music teachers and community conductors: Link between theme and focus of Questionnaire, Interview and observation
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Principals and Parents</th>
<th>Focus of the Principals’ questionnaire</th>
<th>Focus of the Parents’ questionnaire</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No. of students, No. of staff, from where does the school draw its student population, how students get to school</td>
<td>Perceptions of the school structure</td>
<td>Goal focus of the home</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How does the school support the community, how does the community support the school?</td>
<td>Perceptions of school culture</td>
<td>Strategies used to motivate child in instrumental music</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perceptions of the music program and its importance to the school</td>
<td></td>
<td>Perception of their child’s motivation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Perception of how location impacts of their child’s musical participation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Impact of the family financial situation on child’s musical participation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.8 Principals and parents: Link between theme and focus
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Stud./C. Muso Questionnaire</th>
<th>Stud./C. Muso Interview</th>
<th>Observation</th>
<th>Teach./C. Con Questionnaire</th>
<th>Teach./C. Con Interview</th>
<th>Principals Questionnaire</th>
<th>Parents Questionnaire</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Motivators</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Challenges</td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goal Orientation</td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SES</td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Place</td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Difficulties facing rural youth</td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demographics</td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.9 Link between theme and focus: Bringing it all together
4.14 For Noting

In reading this document there are several points for consideration that need noting.

In tables 6.1 (page 99), 6.2 (page 104) and 7.1 (page 126) the Age was not included for the Musical Director of any of the ensembles as this data was not a part of the questionnaire for conductors. The Age was also not included for Michael Foote, Samuel Pendar and Chester Green as I did not have access to their completed questionnaires.

Participants were included in chapter eight when they were not included in chapters six or seven as even though they completed a questionnaire they were not available to be interviewed. This was done as I had very few participants and needed the extra data to make greater reliability of the statistics in chapter eight. Participants were included in chapter six and seven when they were not included in chapter eight (for example Michael Foote) when they participated in an interview when again I did not have access to their completed questionnaire.

Finally, results from Paul Smyth and Leanne Gray were included in chapter 7.2 but not in chapter 7.1 as they completed the interview for teachers not community musicians. Their questionnaire results however were included in chapter eight as they are members of the band and the questionnaire they completed was the same as that for the other band members.

4.15 Conclusion

Throughout the preceding chapter I have endeavoured to explore and make sense of a selection of methodological literature and tried to position myself as a research student within this wider field. Chapter five begins with an introduction to ‘Tobruk College’ (Pilot Study) and follows the journey through recruitment, data collection, analysis, and so forth, paving the way for the following case studies of participants which focus on their motivations, challenges, difficulties and most importantly their music places.
Chapter 5: Pilot Study

The pilot study was conducted in 2012 and involved a one-month site visit to Tobruk College where I interacted with students and staff while observing and participating in instrumental lessons and ensemble rehearsals. The purpose of the pilot was to trial the recruitment strategy, questionnaire and interview process with students, parents and teachers. The pilot was also important in the identification of emergent themes.

5.1 Background

Tobruk College is a long established independent day and boarding school for girls in years 7-12 and a co-educational day school for children enrolled in pre-school to Year 6. It is situated approximately 80 kilometres from Melbourne. Tobruk College has a strong reputation in the community and excellent facilities notably their new state-of-the-art music centre that is well equipped to meet the needs and demands of their extensive and growing music program.

Currently the music program at Tobruk College consists of:

- A one-hour music class per week for students in prep to year 6.
- Specialist tuition on a stringed instrument for students in year 3.
- A 30-minute choir rehearsal per week for students in years 3 and 4.
- A 1-hour choir rehearsal per week for students in years 5 and 6.
- Students in years 7 and 8 receive two, one-hour music periods per week for one semester per year.
- One period per week of specialist instrumental tuition on a woodwind or brass instrument in year 7.
- Music is an elective for students in years 9 and 10 with options such as music technology.
- VCE\(^1\) music investigations and performance are offered in units 1-4.
- Approximately 300 students are involved in the extensive instrumental music auditioned and non-auditioned ensembles.

When asked how important the role of music is to the day-to-day existence of the school, the principal, Angela Donaldson, explained that through participation in music students grow in the sense of who they are as a person. Through working collaboratively with others they grow as citizens as they each learn to explore and develop their own creativity and through shared success, grow in confidence as learners.

A strong sense of community is also a significant part of life at Tobruk College. As well as being active citizens in their school community, students and staff are encouraged to move beyond their close-knit community to participate and make a difference out in the world beyond the classroom. This vision is evident in the way that music students and staff so generously provide ensembles to play for charity.

\(^1\) The Victorian Certificate of Education is a pre tertiary entrance-ranking program for school students in years 11 and 12 attending schools in Victoria, Australia.
events and other functions out in the local community and share their facilities with community groups. Tobruk College is also an active member of the Peninsula Music Society and participates annually in the Melbourne Chamber Orchestra program.

5.2. Recruitment of participants

In the recruitment stage of the pilot study twenty students (five from each of grades three, six, nine and twelve) and their parents were invited to participate in the research via introductory letter. These students were chosen using random sampling techniques as outlined in chapter three.

Unfortunately this first wave of data collection was not particularly successful with only one student from year 9 and two from year 6 as well as five teachers (woodwind, voice, piano, percussion and harp) consenting to participate. Consequently, a second wave of participant packages and recruitment letters were sent out to students of the participating instrumental teachers identified in the first round. This second attempt at recruitment yielded a further two viable responses. Three other students returned their consent forms but were unable to be interviewed which meant that they could not be included in the analysis of results.

These disappointing results may have been due to a number of factors. The students were contacted as potential participants through a master list of all instrumental music students enrolled at the school in the identified year levels. This may have caused problems for students in Year Twelve who only had a few weeks of classes left before the commencement of their end of year exams, and may not have been willing to take on any extra responsibilities at this time. Selecting students from a master list, rather than recruiting via the instrumental music teachers, may have limited the power of persuasion on behalf of the instrumental music teacher who could have offered encouragement for their students to participate.

Nonetheless, it was decided that even with the small number of students, the preliminary data would still offer valuable insight into the research questions as well as test the effectiveness of the chosen research instruments. Clearly, I would have to be mindful of improving my recruitment strategy in the future.

5.3 Students and parents

The following discussion highlights the background and character of Tobruk College through an introduction to the participating students and instrumental music teachers. Throughout this section the individual voices of participants will be heard in an attempt to present an accurate picture of the music life at Tobruk College as experienced by the participants. The data is drawn from the interviews and the questionnaire. Table 5.1 presents a summary of the student participants.
Jennifer Ross is twelve years old and in Year six. She is actively involved in the offerings of the music department learning two instruments; oboe and piano with one and seven years’ experience respectively on each instrument. Jennifer’s early introduction to music came largely at the hands of her family who were heavily involved in instrumental music and encouraged her in this endeavour.

With piano…Mum had done it so…she wanted me to play… With the oboe that was just because my Grandma loves it…(and) we had a Christmas concert piece that our class did and it was oboe music…I really liked it so that was the reason I started that. (JR Interview)

In terms of motivation towards her music learning, Jennifer’s mother, Cynthia describes her as being ‘highly motivated’ towards making music with others, ‘well motivated’ to learn new pieces but ‘poorly motivated’ when it comes to technical work and preparation for performances and exams (CR Questionnaire). Cynthia is a firm supporter of her daughters’ music education and this is evident in her strong encouragement of her daughter’s participation in orchestras and bands rehearsing both during and outside of the school setting. Cynthia also sets firm expectations for weekly practice and dedicates time to listen to Jennifer’s playing and provides her with supportive and ongoing feedback as to her progress. At times Jennifer describes this level of support as ‘really annoying’ particularly when her parents are ‘…cracking it at us because you’ve only done 10 minutes and not 15 minutes of practice…’ (JR Interview).

Jennifer also comments on the idea that motivation grows with prolonged exposure. She suggests that ensemble playing can be uncomfortable at first but as time goes on it becomes more relaxed as the people become familiar and the music becomes easier to an extent where it becomes a reason to keep going.

Cynthia Ross perceives Jennifer as fortunate in her education. As a family they carefully budget their weekly household income (range of $2500-$2999), and consciously sacrifice certain other ‘entertainment options’. This provides their three children with music lessons, which she considers essential to her children’s ‘holistic education’. From a less positive perspective, however, Cynthia points out that although the music opportunities offered to students at Tobruk College are extensive, living some twenty minutes away from the school does place undue pressure on the
family. Living even further away from the city effects opportunities to participate in larger ensembles.

Figure 5.1 shows the characteristics of Cynthia’s goal orientation towards her daughter’s music participation. Cynthia’s Mastery Approach to instrumental music is very strong suggesting that she projects for her children an approach to learning where improvement is individual and measured by self-referenced standards. She wants her children to spend time thinking about new concepts and to face challenges without fear of making a mistake as long as they are learning and growing. On the other hand, the low response for a Performance orientation suggests that Cynthia is not worried whether or not Jennifer can demonstrate that she is best in her class or that music is easy for her.

![Figure 5.1 Cynthia Ross: Motivation Profile](image)

Figure 5.2 presents Jennifer’s motivational profile. Here her results for Mastery (MGO) are similar to that of her mother’s perhaps indicating parent/child influence. Jennifer also rated Performance Avoid (PAR) on par with Mastery and almost two points ahead of the Performance Approach (PAG) suggesting that while she largely measures her success based on her previous performances she is still worried about looking incompetent as a musician in front of others. Self-Handicapping (ARSH) is rated below 3 suggesting that she does not make up excuses or actively sabotage herself in order to have something or someone to blame if her performance is less than satisfactory. Jennifer also provided a low rating for Control of Learning Beliefs (LB) indicating her opinion that the responsibility for her learning is not her own. Despite this a high score for Task-value (TV) suggests that music is a very important part of her life. Jennifer has also identified her music learning as being an intrinsic (IGO) activity.
Amy Patience is 12-years-old, in grade six and plays the piano which she has done on and off for six and a half years. She spent five years learning the violin, which she later gave up due to ongoing teacher/student differences. For Amy, having a teacher she can connect with is an important part of her motivation.

…it was just like a different kind of teaching that I wasn’t used to and I didn’t enjoy…that sort of affected me not to want to do the violin. But now that I’m doing piano and I’m with a nice teacher…I like practicing and…(I’m a) bit more enthusiastic. (AP Interview)

Amy’s mother Anita describes her daughter as being largely self-motivated when it comes to practice although she does acknowledge that at times she needs a gentle reminder when she has not touched the piano for a few days. This suggests that, like Jennifer, Amy’s family plays a large role in her motivation. When asked about this further Amy reveals that her sustained motivation has a lot to do with the fact that many of her family members play instruments and can therefore really offer her help and support in her music making. This encouragement towards dedication and commitment is further evidenced by Anita who explains that in their home they have in place a strict rule that music practice is done without exception before television, or other similar activity like engaging in computer games. Like Jennifer’s mother Cynthia, Anita tries to further encourage this level of engagement in music practice through the provision of genuine and positive feedback on all aspects of her daughter’s playing.
As a family who places such a high value on music, Anita is very firm when she points out that, even with a weekly household income of $1000 - $1249, other activities or luxuries would go before music lessons, although she does acknowledge ‘cringing’ somewhat at the sight of the tuition. Despite the cost, Anita praises the numerous musical activities that are available at Tobruk College such that students have the opportunity to learn any instrument that they wanted and that even though there may be a shortage of piano teachers in the area due to the extensive program on offer at the school this is not much of a problem.

Figure 5.3 highlights Anita’s motivational profile. The results here are markedly similar to Cynthia’s although the identification with either Mastery or Performance is less strong and the margin of differentiation is less steep.

Figure 5.3 Anita Patience: Motivation Profile

Figure 5.4 shows that like Jennifer, Amy rates Mastery (MGO) more highly than either Performance Approach (PAG) or Avoid (PAR) even though Amy’s rating for Performance Avoid was quite high suggesting that she does not wish to take ownership or responsibility in the case of her own poor performance. Amy also scored both Avoiding Novelty (AN) and Self-Handicapping (ARSH) below four suggesting that she is comfortable with learning new things and is not likely to sabotage her own performance which reflects the high value she places on her Music learning.
Figure 5.4 Amy Patience: Motivation Profile

5.3.3 Johanna Mills

Johanna Mills is 14-years-old, in year 9 and has been learning both the guitar and voice since she started at Tobruk College in year 7. Johanna’s mother, Sally (Questionnaire), describes her daughter’s motivation as high, especially when it comes to singing and acknowledges that Johanna has expressed a desire to pursue a career in the music industry. This enthusiasm for music is emphasised by Johanna revealing that she wants to develop a career in music because ‘my heart and mind are in it and I know I’ll always be focused on that one area’ (JM Interview). Johanna was the only student who expressed a desire to continue with music upon leaving school suggesting that she would like to compose and teach or at least be involved in school music in some way.

In addition to learning an instrument Sally, encourages Johanna’s participation in a wide range of activities associated with the performing arts especially her involvement in ensembles, which has noticeably improved her daughter’s self-confidence (SM Questionnaire). Additionally, Sally recalls consistently reminding her daughter that involvement in these extra activities is a “…privilege and (that) she should take full advantage of the music opportunities at her school” (SM Interview). Like both Jennifer and Amy, Johanna recognises the tremendous support she receives from her family particularly her parents suggesting that caregivers play an important role in supporting and encouraging their children in music. While some parents may feel out of their depth in regards to music having never had the experience of learning an instrument themselves, Johanna’s father is a clear example of how simply showing
a genuine interest in your child’s musical learning can go a long way towards encouraging their continued involvement.

In terms of the financial situation of the Mills family, they are fortunate to be comfortably positioned within the higher range of income earners, earning $4000 or more per week. This affords Johanna the opportunity to be fully involved in the musical offerings of the school. Although as Sally explains, there have been times when as a family they have had to sacrifice other things in order to enable their daughter to partake in the numerous activities and experiences on offer through the school.

Figure 5.5 represents Sally’s motivation profile, which indicates a preference towards a Mastery goal focus towards her daughters learning and participation in music albeit not very strong.

![Figure 5.5 Sally Mills: Motivation Profile](image)

Johanna’s motivation profile (Figure 5.6) shows a different emphasis regarding goal focus than we have seen in the other students. Like the others Johanna rates a Mastery Goal Orientation (MGO) most highly and gives equal rating to both intrinsic factors (IGO) and Task Value (TV) suggesting that she aims towards mastery for personal reasons not out of a desire to demonstrate her skill and that music is something very important to her and something she really wants to focus on. Looking at Self-efficacy for Learning and Performance (SE), although rated one degree lower, seems to suggest that Johanna has the confidence in her learning to reach her goals in music. Furthermore, Performance Approach (PAG) and Avoid (PAR) are barely rated over 4, the degree of emphasis indicating that she barely associates with these goal foci. Finally, Johanna does not engage in Self-handicapping behaviour nor does she shy away from learning new things, which fit well with the other aspects of her profile.
5.4.4 David Hannah

David is an eleven-year-old student and in Grade 6. His first introduction to instrumental music came when he was in Grade 3 and had the opportunity to take cello lessons as part of the music program offered during the middle years of primary school. David continued with the cello for the full two years when, due to timetabling issues and other family concerns, he stopped playing the cello and took up the drums, which at the time of his interview he had been playing for two years.

Initially, David chose the drums because he saw a friend playing and thought it looked like fun and promptly formed a band with some of his friends. In terms of David’s present motivation, his mother Lisa explains that he is highly enthusiastic about music and enjoys listening to a wide range of styles, which is perhaps the root of his passion in that each drum has its own unique timbre and is a feature of many genres. This is somewhat contradicted by David’s own response suggesting that his other subjects are more important and that music is just an extra-curricular bonus to do during school and if anything it would only be an enjoyable hobby after graduation.

Figure 5.7 shows that like other mothers, Lisa rates a Mastery Goal Orientation above a Performance Orientation. This suggests that as a parent, Lisa focuses on encouraging her son to value his learning in music and not to worry where he sits in...
the scheme of student standards as long as he is practicing, trying new things and having fun.

David’s motivation profile (Figure 5.8) shows a pattern that is closely reflective of Johanna’s profile. The fact that David has rated Performance Avoid as less than four is supported by his very low results for avoiding novelty and self-handicapping as these tend to be strategies of someone espousing an Avoid orientation. David’s high rating of intrinsic orientation, self-efficacy and task value also supports this.
Rosie began taking clarinet lessons from age seven because she has fond early memories of her mother playing Stranger on the Shore for her when she was little. Following this early start to instrumental music, Rosie had a brief period where she lost her motivation completely and did not play at all. Her interest returned when a friend wanted to learn the clarinet and this opened up the social aspects of music and a sense of a music community, although when asked, this community did not extend beyond Tobruk College.

Rosie is now heavily involved in the music program at school playing three instruments, clarinet, bass clarinet and trumpet. Rosie’s mother, Stephanie, describes her as “Obsessively involved but doesn’t practice enough” (SB Questionnaire), which perhaps reflects the large amount of time Rosie spends being involved in music at school. Stephanie believes that this level of commitment is not reflected in the amount of practice done at home. For Rosie, in terms of importance, music is up there with both sport and a general all round education. For Stephanie though, her measure of interest is the amount of practice done and due to the Bowles’ family budget being restrictive, Rosie is threatened that lessons will be cancelled if she doesn’t put the work in at home. When asked about how important she sees music being in her life after school Rosie stated that it will be very important and hopefully will be an asset to her career goal as an Occupational Therapist.
Like the other mothers Stephanie Bowles rates Mastery over Performance (Figure 5.9) indicating that the former is a vital part of her educational aspirations for her daughter’s own goal focus.

![Stephanie Bowles: Motivation Profile](image)

Rosie’s profile (Figure 5.10) shows the same shape when it comes to Goal Orientation as both Johanna and David, although the distance between Mastery and the two performance goals is exaggerated. Here Mastery Orientation was the most highly rated among all characteristics followed closely by Intrinsic Motivation. However, there seems to be an enigma as a value for Text Anxiety above four representing feelings of low self-worth and a fear of being judged does not support a focus on mastery by self-referenced standards and playing music for music’s sake and personal meaning.
Despite the different student ages and level of experience on their chosen instrument, one theme to emerge was the role of the students’ family, particularly their parents, in their ongoing motivation. For the majority of the students including Jennifer Ross and Amy Patience, their families are all involved in instrumental music themselves either as a past participant or in the present and are able to offer much needed support and encouragement regarding their child’s own participation in the musical offerings available at Tobruk College. On the other hand Johanna Mills is still in receipt of parental support despite her own parents not being in possession of any level of musical experience themselves. However, this situation clearly demonstrates that how by simply showing an interest in a child’s participation this is often enough to support and encourage their continued involvement.

A second idea to emerge was the parent’s thoughts regarding their child’s level of motivation and personal home practice. The children were well motivated in terms of their participation in the program offerings at school and in making music with other students but were somewhat less dedicated when it came to practicing at home. However, this level of enthusiasm for school music as evidenced in the interviews with Jennifer Ross, Amy Patience, Johanna Mills and Rosie Bowles was not evident for David Hannah whose response indicates that he values his other subjects more highly than music, that music is merely an enjoyable extra-curricular activity.

5.3.6 Summary

![Rosie Bowles: Motivation Profile](image)
5.4 Instrumental Music Teachers

This section introduces the five participating instrumental music teachers who shed further light on school and community culture.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PARTICIPANT</th>
<th>INSTRUMENT(S)</th>
<th>YEARS TEACHING</th>
<th>YEARS AT TOBRUK COLLEGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Karen White</td>
<td>Piano</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Michael Brown</td>
<td>drum kit percussion</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Jayne Carol</td>
<td>Voice</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Penny Davis</td>
<td>Flute, clarinet, oboe, bassoon</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>20+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Robyn Black</td>
<td>Harp</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>18 months</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5.2 Teacher participants from Tobruk College

5.4.1 Karen White

Karen White is a piano teacher and accompanist of 25 years’ experience who has been working in her current position at Tobruk College for the past 10 years. For her, some of the highlights of teaching in her current town are the noticeable sense of community, the ‘appreciation of quality teaching and commitment’ both within and outside of the school and the opportunity of ‘being involved with other professional musicians’ (KW Questionnaire). From a negative perspective the only challenge Karen mentions regarding teaching in this town is that ‘everyone knows everyone else in some way’ although, for Karen, this is also seen as a positive in terms of the relative ease of developing a solid reputation and consequently being sought after for teaching, performance and accompanying work (KW Interview and Questionnaire).

In terms of the limitations of being a musician in this area, Karen suggests that there are not too many opportunities for performance beyond the school context and that the distance and consequent travel time to and from the city to attend concerts is also a problem. When asked to describe the music department at Tobruk College, Karen mentions the plethora of opportunities that are available for students to participate in music, and that this is a result of all the music staff bringing all their individual experiences, expertise and knowledge together to realise a common vision in the teaching of students.

5.4.2 Michael Brown

Michael Brown is a drum kit and percussion teacher of 13 years experience. He has been working at Tobruk College for 3 years and in addition to taking small group and individual instrumental lessons he has also established and rehearses a school percussion ensemble. For Michael, some of the highlights of teaching music at Tobruk College are being able to inspire students to achieve great results through the application of steady effort and persistence, to also grow in confidence as a player and performer, and perhaps consider music as a possible future career path. In terms of the challenges of teaching music at this school, Michael suggests that amongst the students in general there is not a great deal of effort put into the study of music. He attributes this to the limited cultural and social importance placed on music in both the school and the wider community, which positions music as somehow less than the
traditional academic subjects, such as Mathematics. As a musician in this area, Michael feels that he is not always appreciated for the work he does, that expectations of remuneration vary too widely in the community and between schools, and that there is a general ‘lack of respect due to ignorance about the arts and music ‘teaching and performance’ in general (MB Questionnaire). Despite this, Michael acknowledges that the music program at Tobruk College, despite his perception of the dominance of the classical style, is a ‘good program that is always looking at improving itself’ (MB Questionnaire).

5.4.3 Jayne Carol

Jayne Carol is a vocal teacher with 11 years experience. At Tobruk College, where she has been teaching for 5 years, she is not only a teacher of voice she is also responsible for conducting four school choirs and is involved in the house music competitions each year. Jayne comes across as enthusiastic in her role and cites the following as highlights of her work at Tobruk College:

1. Involvement in school concerts, festivals and eisteddfods.
2. Working in different styles and with music of different cultures.
3. The opening of the new school music centre.
4. The increase in student participation in choral music.
5. Running the choral leaders program.
6. Working with a dynamic team of music staff.
7. Having a professional accompanist at choir rehearsals.

Some of these blessings, however, are also a source of challenge for example setting up the auditioned choirs each year and selecting repertoire that is appropriate for students’ current level of expertise and something that will spark and hold their interests in the long run. Further challenge stems from the very ethos of the school which Jayne believes both sport and music are regarded as equally important aspects of a well-rounded education. While providing students with many different activities to choose from can easily be seen as a positive, Jayne points out many of these extra events and activities take students away from rehearsals and instrumental lessons and because of this it becomes very difficult to schedule students so that they don’t miss out.

5.5.4 Penny Davis

Penny Davis has 33 years’ experience as an instrumental music teacher, more specifically teaching flute, clarinet, oboe and bassoon to students varying in ability on their chosen instrument from absolute beginner through to an advanced level. Penny lists highlights of teaching music at Tobruk College as some of her instrumental students go on to become professional musicians in their own right, working in the year 7 and 8 classroom program, and witnessing the students’ growth in both enjoyment and creativity. Penny feels some of the challenges inherent in teaching music in this area are the parents of instrumental music students exhibiting a general lack of appreciation for the value of classical music and, that with the extensive, yet over crowded, extra-curricular offerings at the school, and in the community, students are simply just too busy to undertake the necessary practice needed to succeed on an instrument. This is not being followed up by parents because they don’t understand
the commitment and time involved. In terms of the benefits of being a musician in this area, Penny acknowledges that being known and recognised around the town, participating in local music endeavours, such as playing in a local orchestra and therefore feeling a part of one’s local community, is a definite advantage. However, living a fair distance from the city poses other problems, such as not being able to regularly collaborate with musicians of a similar standard and the travel requirements needed to participate in professional development activities and attend concerts. In describing the music program at Tobruk College, Penny suggests that it is known for offering students of a beginner to intermediate standard a ‘great range of ensembles’ as well as offering tuition in a range of genres made possible by having teachers who specialise in rock, jazz, contemporary and classical styles on staff (PD Questionnaire). This last point is further emphasised by Penny’s perspective of the culture of the music department at Tobruk College stating that it ‘…works well because all teachers help each other, support each other and know their strengths and weaknesses and are not afraid to ask for help’ (PD Questionnaire).

5.4.5 Robyn Black

Robyn Black is a music teacher with 30 years’ experience who has made a major contribution to the music program at Tobruk College with the establishment of a harp (non-pedal) program 18 months ago. Robyn explained that one of the difficult aspects of teaching in this area has been travelling significant distances to and from work each week for only one day of teaching, which makes it difficult to adjust student lesson timetables around their other school activities and commitments often at very little notice. An additional difficulty is the need to combat the prevalent ‘finishing school attitude’ operating within the college together with having to deal with the limitations of an over-crowded curriculum leaving students ‘time poor’ and consequently, in her opinion, leaving them to achieve little depth in their learning.

5.4.6 Summary

There are several highlights and negatives of shared relevance to the participating instrumental music teachers. Beginning with highlights, the positive circumstance of having the opportunity to be involved with other professional musicians and the importance of witnessing their students grow in instrumental skill, creativity and as human beings. The primary negatives were firstly, students being involved in too many activities that take them away from lessons and rehearsals and make it difficult for teachers to reschedule lessons. Secondly, the travel time and distance between this area and the city making it difficult to attend professional development activities and work as a performer in the evenings but still arrive at school energised and prepared the following day.

5.5 Emergent Themes

Several themes have emerged from the Pilot study:

- Collegiate Music Making and Relationship Building
- Socio-economic Status
- Teacher Characteristics
- Teacher Strategy
- Culture
5.5.1 Collegiate Music Making and Relationship Building

The primary issues surrounding collegiate music making are the blessings and tribulations of teaching instrumental students in groups as opposed to individually. Most lessons were one-on-one and the instrumental teachers were rather vocal about their preferences in this regard. I only observed one group lesson apart from those involved in the year 7 and 8 Band program during my entire one-month site visit.

Robyn Black explained that she highly values the one-on-one experience that is made possible through the individual music lesson, where the students’ individual needs are paramount and do not become lost in the sea of other students in the way that can sometimes happen in whole class or even small group teaching. The one-on-one lesson is a time for students to learn at their own pace and receive individual attention from an adult, other than their parents, that they so crave and that is essential for the development of their self-esteem.

This notion that students’ individual learning needs are better met with one-on-one lessons is also expressed by Jayne Carol who explains that in addition to being beneficial for the student, it is also easier to teach students individually. From her own experiences as a vocal teacher, Jayne suggests that while group lessons can work especially in terms of students’ motivation and participation the difficulty arises in the teachers’ satisfaction with their own teaching, when even though the students are learning something in the group context the teacher struggles with the idea that they are not learning all that they could be, that they are being hampered in their learning by the structure of the lessons.

Penny Davis builds on this notion suggesting that it does not matter if you are an excellent teacher the students will always suffer when they are taught in groups because they come to you with very different needs and in a group situation it is very difficult to address these needs while at the same time maintaining the interest of the other students in the group. What makes the difference between a good teacher and a not so good teacher in this situation is that the former will not be satisfied with what the students are learning, knowing that they could accomplish much more in a one-on-one lesson. Interestingly though, Penny also points out that some students might work better in group situations where they can motivate each other in learning and attendance which can all be met through involvement in the ensemble opportunities available at the school. For Penny, however, these benefits of group learning should not be at the expense of the quality of learning and teaching that is achievable through one-on-one lessons. She elaborates,

I much prefer…individual (lessons). I have had a couple of bassoons together but bassoon embouchure is not quite as tricky as flute embouchure. I really don’t like teaching in groups it doesn’t matter how well you teach because one students gonna have one aspect of their playing that’s good and others that are bad… and really you’re not doing any favours… I find it’s not a positive experience for anyone… they might work better with someone else but you won’t do a good job and… I’m in the business of doing a good job. (PD Interview)
Sometimes individual lessons are not so much about the quality of learning and teaching made possible, or even the learning and teaching at all. At times it is more about the student having that one-on-one time with an adult which they might not experience anywhere else, where they can work at their own pace or simply talk about things that are happening in their life or at school, because often either the student or parents are kept too busy with other commitments and this kind of one-on-one engagement becomes really difficult. As Robyn Black noted,

I remember back in the 1980s when I was… a horn player… I’d never done any teaching and suddenly I had all these students and half the time the boys were out getting their teeth broken…and they couldn’t play and half the other time they hadn’t practiced…and we’d try to find a place and a time when they could even practice…and these kids would be doing swimming coaching at 6 in the morning and they’d be finishing off homework at 8:30 or 9 at night… Often times (I’d say) to my colleague in despair… how could they possibly learn an instrument and he said…it’s not necessarily about learning to play the French Horn it’s that one on one time…(and this) really changed my mind about what music teaching can be about. (RB Interview)

The following statement from Michael Brown has a slightly different feel. While he mainly teaches students individually, he recognises that learning in groups of two can be both manageable and not detrimental to student learning.

I find that two’s ok but more than two gets a bit more difficult cause the… learning curve of each student is different…. So two… is good cause even if… one’s accelerating faster it’s enough time within… a half hour… or forty minute lesson (that) I can dedicate some time to the kid who kind of needs the more attention… But when… you subdivide three and four people between half an hour… I think it lessens the education of the instrument for those kids (MB Interview).

Michael’s approach to group lessons is that, like Penny and Jayne, he understands the difficulty of teaching in groups in terms of managing students individual learning needs, however, Michael has found that teaching in groups of two is feasible in that he can divide the time, 30 or 40 minutes, between the two students giving them both the individual attention that they need while at the same time giving them valuable experience of playing with another musician. Michael also recognises that students benefit from shared lessons particularly in the first year when they can support and encourage each other in their learning particularly giving each other the confidence to be exposed as they try new things as required in instrumental lessons. Michael suggests that over the course of the first year of lessons students’ characters develop, they become more confident in their learning and so no longer need the crutch of their best friend at lessons, they are ready to really take off in their drumming and continue their learning through individual lessons.

Likewise, Robyn highlights that in addition to the individual lesson, and all that entails, it is also important for students to experience the excitement of group playing and seeing what they can accomplish when they collaborate with other musicians. Jayne also recognises that there are benefits to group lessons; sometimes for economic reasons they may be the only viable option for some students.

5.5.2 Socio-economic Status

The impact a family’s financial situation has on their child’s instrumental learning is a point of contention amongst the participating teachers. For Robyn, money means the availability of a plethora of opportunities that take the students away from the time
needed to learn an instrument. This can lead to superficiality in learning such that economic privilege can become somewhat of a disadvantage. From her experience, the wealth of opportunities and activities available to students who attend wealthy private schools takes away from the depth of learning and leads to a superficial understanding of subject matter because the students just don’t have time, or believe that they don’t have time, to practice and explore the concepts in any depth. Because of this time concern, brought about by the business of students, Robyn also believes that music learning is not practiced as it should or needs to be, that the reading of notation is not reinforced in the same way as language reading and this Robyn believes is a real setback for students.

My theory is that when you give kids too many choices and have them doing too many things you just get the surface learning… this broad expanse… maybe that’s ok for kids from prep to (grades) 4 or 5…but then you must teach people to dig down deep in one area and that probably means not so many choices…I love to have a depth and… maybe I don’t get as much accomplished in lessons…but I like to think I’ve given a child a more complete picture and maybe awakened a hunger in them to explore. (RB Interview)

Karen White also contends that socio-economic advantage can be a negative in that while most of the families attending Tobruk College are quite well off, sometimes the parents don’t appreciate what their children are learning in music; that because of their financial situations they take it for granted; it’s just another thing they do at school, or perhaps it’s fashionable to learn a particular instrument. Penny agrees, suggesting that there are a lot of families in the Tobruk College community who are wealthy and affording lessons and purchasing or hiring an instrument for their child is not a major imposition. The problem is in the lack of understanding parents display in regards to music and what musical learning entails.

These days we get a lot of people who’ve got lots of money but no understanding of musical culture…Music’s just one of those things that the kids do, they come to a lesson once a week and they might never touch (their instrument between times) and the parents don’t care… (PD Interview)

On the other hand, there are benefits to economic advantage. For Michael working in a school that is financially prosperous affords him, as an Instrumental music teacher, the flexibility to utilize his specialist skills to offer students experiences that they otherwise would go without.

I take the Brazilian (percussion) ensemble… which is quite obscure, generally other schools take a more traditional classical type ensemble…I’ve studied a lot of Latin and South American rhythms…and… was grateful that the heads of music here were able to embrace that and allow me to keep that going and in turn they supported it by actually buying things like Brazilian drums, agogo bells…and tambourins…so having the budget to buy those things has been really valuable for me…and the students. (MB Interview)

It is not only the financial situation of the school that is important in terms of opportunities for students, the economic position of the family that is, whether or not they can afford the expense of lessons and acquiring an instrument, is also a factor. He recognises that due to unforeseen changes in the socio-economic climate, or indeed changes in family circumstances, that arise from time to time, even the most talented or studious students are forced to give up music because their families can no longer financially support it. These changes, it seems, such as a parent losing a job or an
increase in interest rates can be unexpected and does not discriminate according to class and it is because of this that teachers need to be sensitive to the financial situation of their students families.

I had a young student... who... was really progressing well... He was the type of kid who was quite shy and... he found... drums was the thing he was good at... He really started to build up his confidence... (Then in) year 9... the GFC... happened and that’s when... his... parents kind of put the hard word on him and said either practice an hour a day... or... you’re not gonna do it. (MB Interview)

Such financial hardships, Jayne suggests, are not all that common in the Tobruk College community. Even though some families can only just afford to send their child to the school while others can easily manage it, the main financial concern for families is how many instruments their child can learn rather than can they learn at all. Despite this, Jayne offers some strategies that can be used towards overcoming lack of opportunity due to financial hardship. She suggests that while group lessons are not always ideal, perhaps for some struggling families they are the only option as parents just simply can’t afford for their child to have individual lessons so the decision becomes to either learn in a group or not learn at all.

You are aware that (for some families) their situation is quite tight so you might get them to buy one book and the rest of the music you might try and source or lend them copies of things like that because you are aware that... they can’t afford too many extra costs... I think that’s why you have group verses individual because some of them just wanna have fun and wanna learn and maybe get a bit better but... you know they can’t afford the one on one... there’s (that) motivation factor or there is a cost involved... particularly if their... not well off. (JC Interview)

While the economic situation of the school as well as individual families has a clear impact on the opportunities available to students in music the financial constraints of the broader community also play a role. As an example of this Jayne explains that in a less financially advantaged community there are certain constraints which make it more difficult for the school to attract specialist teachers thus limiting the breadth of opportunities available to students.

5.5.3 Teacher Characteristics

Students’ perception of their instrumental teacher’s character was a factor in their continued motivation towards music. One of the key characteristics identified by the students was having good people skills and the ability to foster positive relationships. Amy tells of losing all interest in her first instrument the violin because the connection with her teacher - not only in the traditional teacher/student relationship, but also as human beings - just was not there. By contrast, Amy also spoke about her new piano teacher Karen White sharing that she is thoroughly impressed by her enthusiasm for music, and the relationship they now share which has made significant changes to both her attitude and motivation.

She (is)... really nice and... she’s enthusiastic about music and she also has children so I think she sort of gets other kids... (Now) I like practicing and it’s enthusiastic… (AP Interview)

Jennifer also comments on the importance of liking your teacher a state that can only come when positive relationships have been fostered. The excerpt below highlights how having a positive attitude towards your teacher leads to increased motivation to practice and do well.
Jennifer: Like that sense if you don’t do something well…it’s kind of like letting your teacher down so it…motivates you.

Researcher: Because you like them?

Jennifer: (Enthusiastically) Yeah, Yeah. (JR Interview)

This notion of the importance of positive people skills and fostering healthy relationships are further emphasised by Rosie Bowles, who distinguishes between a good teacher as someone who connects with their students and a bad teacher someone who lacks people skills.

I think you can be a good musician but you’ve got to be able to teach people…you’ve got to be able to connect with them…you can tell when you have a bad teacher, they might be an awesome musician but they might not necessarily be able to teach. (RB Interview)

The building and maintaining of relationships through the use of positive people skills seems to also be very important for Karen, as it seems to bring about enthusiasm in students for attending lessons and practicing at home. The fact that Karen is not shy to talk about herself with students only makes her more approachable and therefore her students are more willing to participate and try new things in lessons.

Karen has a warm and friendly manner toward her students and this seems to reap rewards in that her students appear at home in her presence. She is not afraid to talk about herself, letting the students in so that they come to see her as a person who has a life outside of school, for example talking about the holidays with Millie, sharing some of her own past experiences at the show and asking questions indicating that she is really interested in what her students say. (KW Observation)

Johanna, on the other hand who is a little bit older than either Jennifer or Amy, values her instrumental teacher for both her personality and professional qualities.

She…(is) extremely nice, and…very organised…She always…(knows) what to say… (JM Interview)

Jennifer also expresses the importance of a teacher’s ability to display certain professional attributes as a means to motivate their students. Here she explains that being able to give appropriate advice is a vital quality in a successful teacher.

Looking back at my old teacher…she was a lovely lady and all but it just wasn’t the same level of expertise and…advice that you get here in ways that you can improve your playing. Like if I play some of the stuff I did they wouldn’t have said the same thing as they do here. (JR Interview)

Teacher mood also emerged as an important factor influencing student motivation. In the extract below Jennifer explains that if she had a teacher who often appeared to be in a bad mood, she would be unlikely to engage in practice because she would feel that no matter what she did it would never be good enough.

I know if I…(had) a grumpy teacher…I wouldn’t want to practice cause…she’s still going to be the same whether I practice or not. (JR Interview)

Amy further highlights this idea, that teacher characteristics like mood can have a powerful effect on students’ feelings towards lessons.
Some of my friends…do flute here (and) don’t…like their teacher that much and they don’t like coming to their lessons… I don’t know why cause we have a nice teacher it encourages us to come. (AP Interview)

5.5.4 Teacher Strategy

There were several teaching strategies that participants saw as important to fostering student motivation. These include using humour, empowering the student as a learner, embracing performance as a motivational tool and encouraging collegiate music making.

Using humour and modelling enthusiasm for learning outcomes and importantly learning processes was one of the key strategies participants used to motivate their students. This approach has proven successful for student Johanna who asserts that such an approach has pushed her to work harder to achieve greater results.

Sometimes if I get (something) wrong my guitar teacher…giggles at me (laugh)…and it makes me feel a little embarrassed and then it motivates me to do more to do better next time… When I get things right…(it’s like) ‘whoa that’s awesome’ and I (think I) can achieve more. (JM Interview)

During the times I observed Robyn teaching harp, I found further examples of using humour and overt enthusiastic encouragement to motivate students. Through my observations I discovered that Robyn has a friendly manner and is very encouraging of her students, always finding something nice to say about their playing and where appropriate combining this with a little bit of humour, for example: “That’s the best finger technique I’ve seen all day including my own”. Robyn also seems to get excited over every aspect of the music she teaches and every one of her students’ triumphs: “We’re spending so much time on technique because your technique is getting so good and I just get excited over the little things” (RB Observation).

For Karen using humour and colourful toys to make lessons fun and to encourage students to enjoy their practice was an important strategy. She is a teacher who enjoys using fun objects, like colourful toys and textas, to help motivate her students during lessons and understand and come to appreciate the necessity of repetition in practice.

I try and use a lot of visual…for example I’ve got little toys…I guess my encouragement is more so that they understand repetition in their practice and how to do repetition but make it fun or make it not so dreary. (KW Interview)

Empowering students to take control over their own learning also emerged as a key motivational strategy for teachers. Karen spoke of the importance of allowing the student to feel like they are in control over the direction of the lesson rather than just blindly following teacher direction. One example of the way she achieves this with younger students is to hold cards behind her back each representing a different activity or piece and the student simply chooses a card. In otherwords, for Karen motivating her students means allowing them to feel like they are in control, that they are autonomous in their learning and in control of how they practice. Teaching students, particularly young students, to be independent and to take responsibility for their own learning is valuable not only for the obvious motivational benefits but also because it sets students up to be lifelong learners and gives them the tools and confidence they need in order to succeed.
I think that it’s really important that the kids feel like they have control over what’s going on rather than me just telling them what to do all of the time and they…seem to really respond to that. (KW Interview)

During my observations of Karen’s piano lessons, I noticed she invited parents to sit in on their child’s lessons which while common with Suzuki-based-instruction was an uncommon strategy at Tobruk College. Despite this, it seemed an important part of Karen’s approach towards assisting particularly young students to become independent learners by encouraging and enabling parents to assist with home practice.

I’d love every parent to sit in or mostly every parent…it’s a fine line because they need to be independent you’ve got to ultimately encourage them to be independent…to have the motivation themselves…and the skills but it’s fantastic having the parents there especially at the beginning because…they might understand something the child hasn’t quite grasped and then they know what needs to be practiced basically that’s the main thing. (KW Interview)

It seems for Karen that the benefit of having parents attend lessons is so that they can assist with their child’s practice, they know what needs to be revised and have seen, in lessons, some strategies they can use at home. This approach is particularly helpful for younger beginning students as they grow and develop as independent learners but just need that little bit of extra encouragement on the way.

Michael takes a slightly different approach to supporting student autonomy in learning. Right from the very first time he meets a new student Michael gets them talking about why they chose the drums and what music they like listening to. He then uses this knowledge to make sure the students understand how everything they are learning in drums is geared towards this primary objective. The important aspect of this approach, however, is that from time to time Michael re-asks these questions to make sure that they are still working towards students own goals, so that students are ultimately in charge of the direction of their own learning.

I wanna find out about their personal interests I wanna know firstly the reason why they chose the drums whether it was coming from the parents or themselves and that way I know they are actually there of their own will and then I ask them…what inspired them or what made them choose…the instrument then I also go in to asking them what kind of music they like if they’ve got a favourite band or a favourite singer or even just a favourite song and then I sort of take it from there and try to let them know that everything we’re gonna learn is geared towards all the stuff they wanna learn so I always try to turn it around to keep them in step with…the root reason why they…started or were inspired to learn the drums…I don’t only do (this) in the beginning of the first lesson…cause I know that we all…grow as music listeners and tastes may change and so I always try and tap into that...(MB Interview)

Jayne’s approach to student control is in a way similar to Michael’s. She first finds out what the students want to get out of the lessons and then begins instruction with a song that the student knows, or likes, and uses it as a springboard to build up their confidence in singing before they branch out to something new. In accordance with encouraging students to take control over their own learning Jayne works to promote student autonomy in practice by asking students at the end of every lesson to write down what and how they are going to practice thus giving them the responsibility and control.

To get them to practice a couple of times a week…it might just be saying… ‘What’s your goal for this week?’ and it might be ‘I’m gonna try and practice once for ten minutes’ ‘Ok what are
you gonna do in that ten minutes? ’I’m gonna do my warm ups and sing my song for five
minutes’ (JC Interview)

Teaching students how to practice and how to learn goes a long way towards
promoting a sense of autonomy. This extract taken from my notes during one of
Karen’s piano lessons is an example.

Karen: (In regard to a new scale – D Major) Why don’t you start on D and see what you think
doesn’t sound like a major scale. (Faith looks confused so Karen plays a one octave scale D to
D using only the white keys; D Dorian) Stop me when it’s not right.

Faith discovers that D major has two sharps. Then Karen stands and asks Faith to do the same
so they play D major scale in turns for the entire range of the piano.

Karen: How else could you practice it?

Faith: Practice the difficult bits?

Karen: How about adding a rhythm?

Faith plays the scale in a “long short short” pattern in which the longs are really long giving
you time to “work out your next move”.

Karen: What’s another way we could do it? (Silence) Most scales are in groups of 3 and 4
with the thumb on the bottom of each group (demonstrating) I find this “clumps” really good
for hand positions. (Faith tries it with Karen assisting as needed) (KW Observation)

In the above extract Karen engages Faith in discovery learning as she supports her in
working out D major scale based on what she knows a major scale to sound like. By
encouraging Faith to build her own knowledge she sets her up to be in control of her
own learning, to be independent as a learner and to be motivated to seek out new
understandings.

Working at an appropriate pace for each individual student’s learning needs was yet
another factor towards encouraging motivation. Robyn strives to motivate her
students by building on their knowledge and instrumental technique in small bite-
sized pieces at a time, hopefully encouraging her students to become inquisitive and
motivated to discover and learn more. The important thing with this approach is to
work at a pace that allows the individual student to absorb the new information so that
they can grow in knowledge and see their understanding blossom.

I think that it’s really important to work at the level of the child and at the rate they can absorb
information and so if you keep giving them small amounts of information that build into a
larger and larger picture they see their progress, they feel that they’re understanding more.
(RB Interview)

Providing students with appropriate and non-treatening performance experiences is
vital motivational tool used by participants. Here most teachers encouraged their
students to perform right from the very beginning as a way to promote practice by
giving them something tangible to aim for, something to work towards, and as a
means to build on their confidence as musicians.

I try and tailor the program…for each kid so that it keeps them motivated and they know
they’re always going to have to perform…it’s not going to be a bad experience its always
going to be good cause sometimes if they’re really shy they’ll often be playing with me or
they’ll be playing with the piano um I always try and be happy in my lessons and positive…
(PD Interview)
Robyn acknowledged the value of performance as a source of motivation but admitted that at this time she does not encourage this aspect of music learning enough citing that there is just too much the student needs to learn in terms of note reading and technique before they can perform. When asked for an example, Robyn explained that she often accompanies her students in lessons, a kind of mini performance that appears to the student as a game and this she contends works well as a motivational tool for students of all ages.

Something I want to do more of is to get them into playing and performing...so I’ve just published a very simple book of rounds and fragments that can be used creatively so encouraging creativity as well as encouraging...reading what’s on the page... Another thing that I like doing is as soon as they can play the simplest single notes pieces or exercises I make a little accompaniment on the spot with them...so there’s that motivation. (RB Interview)

Encouraging making music with others is a vital component of the music program at Tobruk College in their offering of many auditioned and non-auditioned ensembles for students to participate in. In this regard, it is not necessary for students to be having all of their instrumental lessons in a group, for as we have discussed already this is not always a positive experience for the teacher or the student, but by at least occasionally working in ensemble with other students there’s something motivating about working together and seeing what you can achieve that you might not have been able to achieve on your own.

I never feel that a child or even adult shouldn’t have that one on one to go at their own speed and then the group time to see what the group can accomplish, there’s something motivating if you handle the group well and they’re all excited about doing something together you know that provides its own motivation. (RB Interview)

Michael is not only a teacher but also a practicing musician. In this way he can motivate his students by keeping it real; teaching his students what it is like as a musician in the community beyond the classroom and giving them strategies that will help them as they negotiate the real world.

Just being a working musician is really important for me I think as an instrumental teacher just being in touch with what’s happening out there, having direct experience week in week out I can pass on not like just knowledge but wisdom about how to play music and I can give real examples of why we’d learn something a particular way... I had a student and I was showing them about two ways we kind of transcribe music and this is specific to drums, we can look at a note for note chart which is a bit more of like a classical approach where every single note is notated but more often than not I’ll get a call three days before the gig and (they) say our drummers sick or broken their arm or they’ve a more expensive gig where their gonna get paid 800 dollars they wanna do that but we need a fill in drummer for their position in this particular show and so I won’t get music, sheet music, I will get a bunch of CD’s or even a link to a drop box of Mp3’s of probably about 25 songs so I’ve got to sit there and write a shorthand version so I take my students through that process...(MB Interview)

Providing challenge was the final teacher strategy to emerge. Penny recounts how she gives students different levels of pieces and encourages them to perform regularly so that they have a goal, something to challenge them that they can work towards, and consequently their motivation is sustained.

I give them lots of variety in pieces so there can be easy pieces, medium and hard pieces so there’s pieces that they can achieve quickly…pieces that take a bit longer and maybe one
piece that (is) going to take them a lot of work to give them a bit of a challenge. (PD Interview)

5.5.5 Culture

The culture of families and the College emerged as vital components of school life effecting both opportunity and motivation. For Angela Donaldson, the notion of community, belonging and striving for personal excellence are a key focus of the culture upheld at Tobruk College. In this way being liked and respected for who you are as an individual is vital to school standards.

The culture is one of community belonging and opportunity. We aim to lead excellence and inspire future lives. (AD Questionnaire)

Robyn, however, presents a different perspective suggesting that the very structure of the school the inflexibility of the systems, and the unwavering push for excellence, has in a way suffocated the creativeness in her teaching. She also mentions that this might assist her focus, but concludes that overtime this firmness may stifle her creativity and cause her to lose enjoyment in teaching. Michael too has a position on the College's culture of pushing academia suggesting that because of this music is often undervalued by students, staff and parents.

There is not a lot of effort put in to the cultural and social importance placed on learning music. Also…music is not perceived to be an academic subject therefore not relevant. (MB Questionnaire)

Jayne and Angela, however, both disagree with Michael’s contention suggesting that music holds an important and renowned position within the school. As an instrumental teacher, Jayne sees herself to be very fortunate to be working in a school where music is viewed to be as important to students’ all round education as sport. When music is respected by staff and students and involvement is high, the experience in music, both in terms of education, creativity and students’ social development, soars and more opportunities can be made available for students which in turn increases the prominence of the program both within the school and indeed the wider community. Angela suggests that not only is music valued for the content and integrity of the subject itself, it is also valued for the opportunities it offers to students to be creative, work collaboratively and experience success not to mention the many performance opportunities that are made available to students through the Music Department.

A final point is that the culture created by the staff within the music department affects the programs and opportunities that are offered to students.

We all share a similar vision and at the same time are able to bring different experiences and knowledge to the teaching of students. (KW Questionnaire)

The music department works well because all teachers help each other, support each other and know their strengths and weaknesses and are not afraid to ask for help. (PD Questionnaire)

The extracts above demonstrate the importance of having diverse experiences and knowledge yet one vision. That a positive culture for the students begins with the teachers and how they interact with each other and capitalise on their different strengths to create a diverse and active music culture within the school.
The culture and background of families also emerged as a vital component of student motivation. Robyn distinguishes between two types of money, old and new, and suggests that the parents from families who are new to money, and therefore have possibly not been exposed to very much classroom or instrumental music during their school years, do not understand what learning an instrument entails and as a result they do not, or feel they cannot, follow up on the learning at home.

A lot of people now…come from backgrounds where they may not…have (had) a lot of education compared with people that graduate generationally from places like this, so it’s not generational…and a lot of them for example…(have) never had the opportunity to play an instrument so they don’t really understand…so the parents haven’t grown up playing music and they haven’t understood they think it’s really nice to have…a daughter playing the harp you know it’s really exotic but they don’t understand what it takes…because there’s no culture of music you know…generationally. (RB Interview)

This idea that the music culture of the parents effects their students’ participation is further highlighted by Penny who suggests that the parents have money but, because of their own background, they have no musical culture. This, Penny continues, affects the students in a number of ways, firstly she suggests, parents and children view music as something to do at school and consequently little practice and revision is done between lessons, thus severely hampering students’ progress. Secondly, many students come to their first lesson with no knowledge or appreciation for classical music and little experience of nursery rhymes thus making it very difficult for students to learn the basic intervals of music. Traditionally they are often learnt through nursery rhymes and teachers need to fill the gap.

The school clientele has changed and…these days we get a lot of people who’ve got lots of money but no understanding of musical culture as in classical music so it affects how they look upon music. Music’s just one of those things that the kids do, they come to lessons once a week and they might never touch it and the parents don’t care if they don’t… Whereas in the past we had a lot more parents who were interested in music and who had an understanding of classical music and who encouraged…their children to learn and practice and so you’ve just got to adapt your teaching all the time, I don’t teach the way that I taught when I started…you’ve just got to find something that…motivates kids who haven’t got any understanding of music. (PD Interview)

5.5.6 Challenge

The instrumental teachers put forward several challenges and frustrations they have encountered while teaching music at Tobruk College. Some of these challenges are global issues, that is, issues faced by music teachers everywhere, and others are more location specific, meaning that they are somewhat particular to the College.

The first challenge is global. Robyn speaks of the difficulty of getting her students to practice. Sometimes it may be that they have spent too much time in front of the television or playing computer games, while at other times it may be that they are just too busy with other activities and homework. The primary frustration for Robyn is that she can teach students the same concept many times however, without the work at home the student cannot absorb it.

Kids aren’t always correct in that...(that they didn’t have time to practice), they may have had time…but they forget to tell you they figured in TV watching…but you know over and over again they are kept really busy doing projects…and field trips and you can’t get anywhere in music without that practice that links the different
areas of the brain together and completes the brain mapping. I can teach them over and over the system for learning… but…(if it’s not) reinforced (you get nowhere).

(RB Interview)

Keeping the music program current is another challenge faced by teachers. Michael suggests that the main frustration is the time it takes for a curriculum idea to be put forward and pass the approval process instigated by the school hierarchy. The problem with this, Michael explains, is that by the time the idea gets approved it has become somewhat out dated and this prevents the Music program from being current and relevant to the students. While Michael acknowledges that it is also important to study music of the past, he stresses that in order to attract students to the program, the program it needs to be abreast with what is current in the music industry.

The time that it takes for an idea to start and then get to the end is too long by the time that it’s reached there it’s a little bit dated and I find that music in all music departments across Australia are a little bit old and therefore we miss out on being in touch… In instrumental music it’s great because I can directly ask my students and I can tailor to the individual likes and dislikes of that student but I can understand that in a classroom setting though cause you have to adhere to this strict kind of guideline… it doesn’t grow with the students or what’s happening today… It’s… important… to keep a foot in what’s happening, in whatever’s cool and the kids respond… to that on many levels, what they wear, what they listen to… whether its and iPod or an iPad and so these are ways that we can keep kids interested in music and motivate them to keep learning. But if we stay a little bit too stagnant… we can lose students.

(MB Interview)

A third challenge is the lack of understanding by teachers from other disciplines of what music has to offer. Often they make it very difficult to hold extra rehearsals and uncomfortable for students to leave their classes to attend instrumental lessons.

I think that’s the main down side… when other teachers don’t really understand that… we need to have extra speech night rehearsals held during class time and we’re just the same as an excursion that you take your kids out for an excursion and we’re effected by that, it’s the same thing… occasionally some teachers don’t like kids coming out of lessons but we just try and encourage them to think of it as… they’re going into another lesson rather than just going off to do something and it’s actually no they’re going to learn something one on one and possibly learn a lot more in half an hour one on one than in a half hour group lesson but there are still a few teachers in the school that are a bit reluctant and some kids find it really hard to stand up and say “I have to go to a music lesson” cause they kind of get told off almost and you know looked down on… (They) shouldn’t really be having that from a teacher… there should be that respect.

(JC Interview)

The challenges of working with teachers of other disciplines is frequently a lack of communication which causes problems in when scheduling lessons and rehearsals.

The main frustrating thing is communication between the different departments… I mean there’s always times when we’ll be told “… there’s an excursion… tomorrow or today” and we haven’t been told about it. (It) is not such a big problem for me because I can rearrange things but when you’ve got a teacher who is only here one day it’s really hard. (KW Interview)

Regarding location specific challenges Jayne sometimes struggles with the school authority, particularly when there is a lack of consultation in decision making, which can have unfair consequences for the students.

There’s challenges sometimes (when) the school doesn’t respect decisions. (For example)… there was an incident where a student didn’t get into an auditioned choir and there was a complaint made and as a result the daughter was put into the choir, so there was sort of an overriding of a decision rather than a supporting of (staff).… 100 girls went through the process and have accepted the decisions… and you’re going to… contradict that and it’s not
just the fact it was done it’s more the fact that it was completely unfair to the rest of the kids as well and it was done without consultation… I find that quite difficult… when… seniority will pull rank. (JC Interview)

Jayne feels there are further challenges when these decisions lack specialist knowledge of music education, over-riding the teachers’ expertise.

With a past principal, we… had to put forward our speech night suggestions and they would be checked as to whether they were appropriate even though they weren’t musicians and had no idea so you would have to send them a u-tube recording or something of the song and say this is sort of it… and they would sometimes make suggestions of, oh, I think you should do this song or whatever and you would sort of think oh gosh the kids are not gonna like that. (JC Interview)

The participants also felt there are unrealistic demands placed on music teachers at the school. During her interview, Jayne highlighted that in providing performance opportunities for students, sometimes there are just too many concerts scheduled for around the same time and these concerts, being over and above the regular school time commitment, take a lot out of staff.

The demands are a little bit unrealistic… Sometimes there are too many concerts around the same time… and that can be quite difficult… sometimes we’ve had… three concerts in three weeks or four in five weeks… which is a lot of your time and if you’re working full time… (it) does impact on how you pull up the next week… how much rest you can get. (JC Interview)

5.5.7 Teacher Motivation

Several ideas have been explored about factors that have an impact on student motivation to participate in instrumental music. What has not considered to this point is whether the motivation of the teacher may effect the motivation of the student. Several ideas emerged including having some degree of flexibility, working in excellent facilities and the positive relationships formed with other members of staff.

Penny suggests that when she has freedom and flexibility in her teaching, for example, not having pressure or restrictions put on you from above, you can really enjoy your work and do what your heart tells you is best for your students. It is this level of care and support that students really respond to and this is evident in their relaxed attitude, their willingness to give things a go and the creativity they use in their learning.

There’s no pressure from above for me to put kids in for exams or do things that I don’t think suit them whereas at other schools I’m told you will do this you will do that… I’ve been teaching for like 40 years so I think I know what I’m doing and I don’t want to be told you… will have this accompanist or you will do this… because I think I always have the best interests of the students at heart and you can only work that way if you are really happy in your job and yeah I love teaching here. The kids are also… more relaxed… they’re more… inventive (and) they’re more imaginative… it’s a great place to be. (PD Interview)

From my observations I found that the obvious pleasure Karen derives from the many aspects of teaching at Tobruk College especially in regards to having flexibility and variety in her work seems to be responded to by her students who in turn display an enthusiasm for coming to lessons and rehearsals and an eagerness to demonstrate what they had been working on at home. On a personal level, Karen’s own sense of fun for music seems to rub off onto her students especially through her constant use of
positive feedback, the links she makes between musicianship and students’ lives outside of school and through her use of age appropriate games.

There are lots of benefits and positives…for me personally it’s great because I live five minutes away…I can pretty much run my own show, I’m not constricted with anything. I can have as many or as few students as I like as long as I make up the salary component I have I can do whatever I like. I’m lucky because I get to do other things it’s not just teaching cause I get to play for choir and accompany everything, just about…this building’s really nice and the people are nice I get along with everybody so I guess I’m really lucky in a way that I’m happy to come to work every day. (KW Interview)

Another aspect of teaching that the participating teachers derive their motivation is seeing how their students grow as musicians; how they develop in their technique and creativity and come to really enjoy music no matter their level of expertise.

I had a kid where drums was the only thing that he was really good at, he was one of those kids who kind of got teased, he wasn’t the cool kid and drumming made him hip, cool you know and…by the time he hit…year 10 he really started to excel he was like the best drummer in the school…and he was even looking at that being a career path for him…(and I) played a role in helping him choose his career path. (MB Interview)

Michael explains further that working with students, encouraging them to focus on their music making and develop in their playing is really rewarding for him as a teacher.

Inspiring students to focus, achieve great results through practice and perseverance. Also inspiring students to really think about their career and future and watching a student slowly grow from not knowing how to play and perform, to being a good player and performer. (MB Questionnaire)

For Penny, in addition to witnessing the development of high achieving students, for her observing what the average student can accomplish and helping them to really enjoy music is a really important and rewarding aspect of her work at the school.

Teaching instrumental music to several students who have gone on to be professional musicians…(as well as working) in the year 7 and 8 classroom with students…seeing how creative they can be (and) seeing less talented students really enjoying music (has been really rewarding). (PD Questionnaire)

In a similar manner, Jayne enjoys teaching singing and directing choirs as she relishes in witnessing what her students can accomplish under her guidance both in terms of the development of their technique and musicianship, but also in what they can achieve in performance. The important aspect to note here is that Jayne encourages her students to also recognise, and be motivated by these small achievements so that they keep growing and developing as musicians.

I just love working with groups of people and seeing what harmonies they can do, what things they can achieve…what performance can we sort of produce. Individually it’s much more about how can I connect with this student to get the best result but also…where did they improve and how did they improve and what I can do and oh hey I suggested that and hey that sounds really good now and…it’s not like an ego thing but it’s like that I’m making a difference…and I can hear it. And I like writing their reports and thinking oh wow this is where they’ve come from you know I always encourage them to celebrate the little things as well because the little things over time make a big difference…I think it’s just the enjoyment of teaching and enjoyment of seeing kids grow and learn in knowledge and…ability. (JC Interview)
5.5.8 Place

The concept of Place is multifaceted and several components shone through during data analysis. These are relationships and a sense of belonging, the ability of a Place to meet needs, issues of location and emotionality. The formation and maintenance of positive relationships and feeling a sense of belonging in a Place emerged as strong issues for participants. In this way, Johanna cites the bathroom and her bedroom as her favourite places to practice yet acknowledges that it is not so much the physical nature of the space that is important but rather the family members who occupy it.

I practice at home…usually in the bathroom when I give my brother and sister a bath because my parents are making dinner and sometimes I like to sing because my brother and sister don’t really know what’s going on cause they’re only small so I sing in front of them and they copy my tunes and…it’s not really embarrassing. (JM Interview)

The formation of positive relationships has a strong effect on a person’s sense of belonging and consequently their attachment to Place. As the extract below attests it is the feeling of knowing others and being known yourself, which is a major contributor of having this sense of belonging and sense of Place.

Within…a term of being (at Tobruk College) I’d walk through and you’d hear the teacher calling out…‘Hi Jen’ and…you know it’s that type of thing that’s really nice…It’s just another place where you kind of fit in and belong it’s…one of those community things…and being involved in stuff…it’s just a good feeling I guess. (JR Interview)

For Karen, too, Place is about the relationships that form and exist between people occupying the space. Karen contends that it is important to learning and motivation that both students and teacher are comfortable with each other and share a positive relationship. That the students feel settled enough with her that they are not afraid to make mistakes or ask questions as part of their learning.

I like to make it so that every child comes in here and they kind of feel ‘I’m happy to be here’ and sometimes it might end up being a bit of a therapy session for some kids or it might just be a place where they know …they’re not going to feel bad about anything. If they did something that’s not quite right…I’m here to help them. (KW Interview)

The ability of the music department to meet their needs was a second aspect of Place that proved to be important to participants. Here, Amy compares the ability of Tobruk College to meet her needs as a performer as compared to her old school. She highlights the many performance opportunities that are available for students as solo performers. Tobruk also has many auditioned and non-auditioned ensembles for students to become involved in. This might be because living at a distance from school means that it is difficult for her to attend rehearsals that occur before or after school, limiting her choice of ensemble, or it may be as simple as she is learning the piano and there are few other ensemble opportunities available to her other than duet work with her teacher or another student.

Most of the performances are at school and if you just wanna do…a solo then there’s soiree there’s also music openings but there’s lots of them and lots of concerts. At my old school they never used to do that…but at Tobruk College they have…eight performances per year not including your just like class items and there’s so much and that’s where you can perform. (AP Interview)
A third component of Place, was location and the effect of the isolation of the school and local community in terms of opportunity to work with others and attend performances. Karen explains that being a pianist and accompanist in this area is a definite positive because it’s small enough that you can develop a good reputation and consequently get a lot of work. As a down side, Karen suggests that living where she does can be pretty isolating in terms of performing and attending concerts but as she has little children she is not participating much in this aspect so this community fulfills her current needs.

Down here is a bit isolated…for me it’s not so bad because I can get a lot of work because…there’s not many accompanists down here especially and I know…if I wasn’t teaching here I could still get a lot of students…I guess in my time of life I’m pretty busy with my kids so I’m not spending a great deal of time doing extra things. If I had more time I might make some more effort to do work with other people, there are some great musicians down here that you could work with. In terms of concerts and things, I love going to concerts but it’s quite limiting because at the end of the day it’s a trip up to the city. (KW Interview)

Michael develops this idea of isolation further. As a practicing musician who lives and gets most of his performance work playing in contemporary ensembles in Melbourne, the difficulty stems from the relative isolation of the school community as he has to wake up very early and face a long drive to get to work and this is exaggerated when he has had a late gig the night before.

It can be hard because like even last night I was playing until 1am and… I live in Carnegie (which) it’s about a 50 minute drive so Friday mornings I have to be here at 7:50am which means I get up at 6 to leave at 6:30 to be here by 7:30 to have the instruments set up for the girls ready to play at 7.50…It doesn’t happen all the time, then it would be virtually impossible for me to continue I would basically just fall apart…There’s pros and cons for all work and it’s one of the cons I guess. (MB Interview)

The distance of the school from the city is also of concern to Robyn. In the extract below Robyn makes an important point that it is difficult for instrumental teachers to travel long distances for only one day of teaching, it can be expensive in terms of petrol and toll ways, and it often means little flexibility within student timetabling. These issues, Robyn contends, make it very difficult for schools, especially in country areas, to attract instrumental teachers particularly on not so common instruments like the harp.

I live up in the Dandenong Ranges and I have to come all the way down and that (the travel time and cost) is not a benefit, its hideous… I can’t catch time, catch kids lessons up…that’s really, really hard. So how do you get local teachers that can teach especially the rare instruments in country areas? I should imagine that’s always gonna be difficult. (RB Interview)

Penny also comments that the travel time and distance between Tobruk College and the City is a definite disadvantage. Although there are local orchestras to play with, Penny contends that students need access to more experiences in music than are available in the wider school community.

It’s definitely a draw back because you don’t get up to the city very often… There are local orchestras to play with which I do but I think for students they need to get exposed to the outside world otherwise they think they’re a big fish in…a little pond so that’s when I recommend they go to Melbourne Youth Music…It is hard being down here because you feel as if you’re away from the musical activity but there are events that happen down here but for students not as many as I would like, the Saturday morning music school in the city, there’s no equivalent to that. (PD Interview)
Penny continues to say that if as a musician you wish to meet other people and attend workshops you need to travel up to the city which as Penny explains makes you think twice about attending. However, Penny then suggests that even though this situation can be frustrating she concludes that, unless you are a ‘top musician’ there are enough opportunities in the Tobruk College community.

You’ve got to make yourself go up to the city…to meet other people and do workshops and that…means you’ve got to spend a whole day doing P.D which if you lived 5 minutes down the road you’d be more inclined to go than if you say there’s a P.D. in Carlton then you sort of think twice about doing it. So it’s a bit frustrating in that respect…but no there’s…lots of opportunities here, there’s enough for me, I mean…if you’re a top musician obviously you need to go elsewhere to perform but it’s fine for me. (PD Interview)

It was not only the teachers who expressed concern over the distance to the city and the potential lack of opportunity available in their own community. Students also commented on the opportunities lost because they live too far away. While Jennifer agrees that their community is a great place to live, in terms of music, things become more difficult. This is expressed by Jennifer as the tyranny of distance that is, living at a distance from Melbourne, being close enough to hear about the opportunities available to music students there, yet living too far away to access them:

I know that some of the things up in…Melbourne like the band and…sometimes you look at them and see…advertisements in the newspaper or Mum and Dad are talking about it…and you see stuff and it’s like ‘oh wouldn’t it be great to live up there and be able to do it…so that’s a bit frustrating. (JR Interview)

It was not only the distance to the city that was of concern to participants even the distance needed to be travelled just to attend school was also an issue. Amy cites living too far away from school and having to travel by bus as the major difficulty in that she is unable to attend before and after school rehearsals, so in effect she misses out on a lot of opportunities that the school has on offer.

I catch the bus every day to school…sometimes it’s frustrating…when there is stuff in the mornings and you can’t get there because I have a younger sister and she has to get to school…and Mum can’t drive up here and be back in time. (AP Interview)

The participating students also acknowledged the emotional aspects of Place. I continued the interview by extending this line of questioning to find out how these performance spaces make the students feel. For Amy the physical position of her piano at home allows her to forget extraneous thoughts and emotions and give her full attention to the music.

At home it…takes my mind off stuff when I play and cause…my piano…(is) facing a wall…I can’t really look around so…you don’t really need to look around you just look at the music. (AP Interview)

Jennifer introduces the idea that the actual size of the space can influence one’s feeling towards performance. In this case a small intimate room creates much less pressure on Jennifer as a performer and even helps her to relax and enjoy the experience.

If you do…a performance like a soiree you only like have…between 10 and 20 students there and it’s just in one of the rooms so it’s a lot smaller and a lot less pressure and its sort of relaxing and that’s really good. (JR Interview)
The following extract taken from my interview with Rosie supports the notions that the size and location of a Place is a really important element in how the space makes you feel. For Rosie, these elements relate to the level of remoteness and solitude a Place is able to provide. It is these factors which lead to a sense of confidence in practice where one can play without fear of disturbing or being interrupted by others.

Half the time (I practice) in our walk-in-robe because I share a room with my sister (and) she doesn’t like the sound of me practicing the clarinet (laugh) which I guess is a sign…We’ve got a music room but it’s at the front of the house and…I don’t like playing in front of people if I don’t sound too good so I just go into my room and just quietly practice…It makes me feel comfortable practicing (in the walk-in-robe)…I probably get more nervous at the soirees because a lot of people don’t hear me play…I don’t practice with people watching me because I feel self-conscious. (RB Interview)

The size of a Place, in this case the music classroom, was also of concern to Robyn who comments that it is especially important in terms of respecting personal space and avoiding feelings of claustrophobia.

Especially in Western Culture we all have the body space and distance and I think a small room is really claustrophobic…(so) whenever I can I keep the door open…and it’s really important in a small space to keep the door open…it feels good to me and I think it also feels good for the child. (RB Interview)

Size was also important to Penny who explained that the benefits of having a large space were not being restricted in movement and being able see her students face on to check embouchure and posture which is essential to the playing and teaching of woodwind instruments. Penny also comments on the importance of having a sizable room for the development of students’ sound.

Sometimes we stand up and sometimes we sit down…I like them to stand up occasionally and perform cause…they tend to feel the music better when you’re standing up you feel more…at home with the music and you can use your body a lot more…As for using the space…there are some kids that…I’ve had to walk around…patting them on the back…with the beat but generally that doesn’t happen…It’s also good to be able to see the student face on rather than side on because then you’re looking at…their embouchure and the way they’re holding their head and body…so you need a reasonable sized room so that you can actually see that…but a room this size is just perfect (laugh)…obviously it’s really good for the students to get into a bigger room because otherwise they get use to their sound being small. (PD Interview)

The relationships, location, size or emotional influences associated with Place are not all that is important; the actual physical characteristics of the space can also have an effect on participant motivation. For Amy and Jennifer, despite their comments suggesting that certain Places can help you to focus on your practice or help you to relax leading up to and during a performance, Amy suggests here that size or location of a Place doesn’t really influence her in music, in fact it doesn’t make her feel any different. Jennifer’s comment below supports the idea that as a pianist the actual instrument that is in the performance space is more important for these feelings than the room itself. This suggestion correlates with the idea that there is more to Place than just the actual space, that is for example the size of the room or its location, that one also needs to consider how the contents of the space and the way they are arranged may also play a role.

I really love the grand pianos. The big black ones…the massive ones, I really like them. I’m always a bit more excited. And the white grand piano…that’s pretty good as well. (JR Interview)
Johanna builds on this emerging picture further suggesting that not only can the physical characteristics of a Place make you feel more excited about a performance it can also become a source of inspiration for other aspects of participation in music. For Johanna the beach is a special place, an inspiration to her in that it allows her to explore her own voice in both singing and composing.

Probably the beach (is my favourite space) because there’s…a huge landscape and you don’t know how far across your voice can reach…It’s a good scene and it…opens your mind up to…lyrics that you’ve never heard of before if you’re in a really pretty landscape. (JM Interview)

Amy talks about the benefits of the physical location of the objects in a space mentioning her keyboard at home and the importance of not being too constricted due to a lack of space.

(The keyboard) is next to the T.V. but I just put the headphones on and play…I think it’s…the best…space for it…because you don’t wanna be too squashed. (AP Interview)

Jennifer goes a little further to suggest that her parents strategically placed her piano to enable them to listen to her playing and make encouraging and corrective comments as needed. This suggests that the layout of a space is vital to student motivation and learning.

(The piano is) in the lounge room…(which is near the) kitchen so I think Mum and Dad’s idea in…placing it there was that they could listen and…then they could tell me (if I made a mistake). (JR Interview)

The participating teachers also mentioned the importance of the physical characteristics of a Place including its contents and layout as influential factors.

Karen White’s teaching space is a medium to large sized almost square room with off-white walls and a window above the desk. The window looks out towards the oval and Tobruk Junior School such that Karen is able to see her students coming. Next to the desk is a small brown bookcase, which stands about waist height. Two pianos are lined up against the wall opposite a wiped-clean whiteboard. There are boxes of files containing a colourful array of display books resting on top of the unused piano. There is a small notice board on the wall that supports the door on which are various posters and pamphlets about activities and opportunities available to students at school and through the local music society. Also against this wall is a small blue, two-draw, filing cabinet. (KW Observation)

As the above excerpt attests Karen’s teaching space is well equipped to meet her teaching needs for example boasting two pianos as needed for ensemble playing. It is bright and interesting in appearance and is ample in size such that teacher and student can move around during lessons depending on content focus and student needs.

Sometimes…we might work on the board or we might move around, usually (we are) mostly at the piano. Depending on what they’re doing I might use the other piano as well… This is about the minimum space (I require) I don’t know how many metres about four by three…? I used to teach in a very confined space and you do feel much more claustrophobic…I think that’s really important. I’d actually like to put more things on the walls but I’m usually not allowed (laugh). (KW Interview)

Jayne also makes extensive use of her classroom space, however, not so much in terms of decoration as the walls were left rather sparse apart from a small notice board that was covered in thank you cards and photographs of student performances. Jayne
used the different spaces of her room to mark different aspects of the lesson giving the lesson structure so that the students were always aware of what to expect and what was expected of them.

1. bounce around the room...I have my desk which is where we always start and then we move to the piano and do warm-ups and then...if they're doing a lot of classical repertoire or repertoire that I have recordings for they're standing with the stand. Occasionally we go into other rooms if their doing exams to get them used to the space...sometimes there's...choreography depending on the girl and the piece and what they're doing...and then...sometimes it’s conducting or whatever so really the whole space gets used...I think it just keeps it interesting....Also (there are) different sections so they...know...sit down that’s the (time for) sight singing...(and working) out admin...there’s the warm-up time and then there’s sort of the performance time and so I think it just gives them structure and...helps them in (the) lesson to know what they are doing and...it’s like a routine so they...can know what's going to happen next lesson. (JC Interview)

Not only does Jayne use the space to structure the lessons and keep things interesting for her students; she also uses it to assist students to work on their technique.

It’s great having the window for the girls to look out cause I always say to them focus on something far out the window because then they’re gonna project their sound where as if they stand and face the wall two metres away they’re naturally not gonna sing as loud because they hear the sound bounce back quicker (JC Interview)

The ability of a Place to meet the needs of both teacher and student was best summed up by Michael who explains how the features of his teaching space, the items that are present within that space, meet his needs and those of his students. Even having a desk has made a huge difference in terms of granting him the respect he deserves as an instrumental teacher.

In the past I’ve taught in basements...and storage areas which...(is) common for drummers...we get...thrown somewhere in the back of the school...where we can make as much noise as we want...but...this space has been a really important change...It’s amazing how having a space and a desk has given me respect. (MB Interview)

In terms of how he actually uses the space Michael spoke of fully utilizing its contents to the benefit of teaching and student learning.

The beauty is that there’s two pianos in this room as well so I often use the space to accompany a student, to give them an example of what it’s like playing with another musician and being in a band...with drums often...the beginners or young musicians...can’t really hear...the sum of the parts they only hear the drum beat and often they can’t hear that this in an integral part of the whole composition. So...having the space with a piano in there I can give them a picture of that you know an aural picture...and they can play along and they...see how the beat works with chords or bass line or even singing as well... We’ve (also) got the other electronic set of drums so we can actually play together...it’s quite common for a violinist...to have their teacher play along but with the drums it’s less common...

Having a whiteboard with a music stave has been really important (too) so I can articulate certain rhythmic theory things where sometimes just verbalizing it...or exemplifying it through playing doesn’t work...

Another thing is drummers use backing tracks which have the bass, the chord information, basically all the other instruments besides the drums (so) they can work on their listening and timing, it’s like being in a virtual band and so I use the (speakers that are kept in the) space...

The other thing is that they’ve got wireless Wi-F...here too...even just now I’ve got a student...who wants to learn a song by their favourite band and I can straight away look it up. So having that Wi-Fi connection allows me to keep (up with) their interests. (MB Interview)
When asked if there was anything about the space that he would change, Michael mentioned the soundproofing, as he was worried about the sound leaking out and disrupting the surrounding classes. However, he also mentioned that he has had positive comments regarding the sound, that it makes the music centre appear to be alive, and together with the large windows, it even worked to recruit new percussion students. So ultimately the only change he would make was to create extra storage to keep the instruments when not in use so as to make better use of the space.

Having this space (has)…influenced me having more junior students (where) before I had no junior students… And I think that’s a direct influence of them (walking past) …and actually having big windows…so they can sort of see the kids playing stuff and having some sound seeping through and leaking out invokes that kind of thing ’Oh, that’s cool I’d like to do that’.

(MB Interview)

5.6 Conclusion

Even though the response rate for my pilot study was somewhat underwhelming, the results presented above still assist in creating a picture, of what it is like to be a music teacher and student at Tobruk College. Through the examination of interview transcripts, observations and questionnaires the teachers, while recognising the motivational properties of group lessons, prefer to teach individually for the quality of learning and relationships that can develop between teacher and student.

In terms of socio-economic status, the teachers acknowledged that Tobruk College families tend to be average to wealthy financially and so, perhaps the struggle, faced by students and families attending less well-off schools in less well-off areas, may not really be as relevant here. However, it is this financial security that has resulted in the plethora of opportunities available to students attending Tobruk College.

Teacher characteristics and strategy also revealed themselves to be important factors in student motivation. Students responded to the personality of, and the emotion expressed by, their teachers. They also recognised and valued their teachers’ expertise and skill as a musician.

In terms of the motivating role of Place, there are several aspects of this concept that play an influential role. These include the physical size of the space, the relationships and interaction between people present in the Place as well as the sense of isolation felt by both staff and students.

Perceptions of culture varied widely between participants. Principal Angela Donaldson views the culture of Tobruk College to be positive for students, staff and families. This is brought about by the strong sense of belonging and unwavering push for personal excellence embodied by the school community. In contrast however, not all of the staff agreed with Angela’s position regarding the culture of the College. For example Robyn Black explained that in her opinion this unwavering push for academic excellence stifles the creativity out of her teaching. In this regard perhaps the data suggests that the personal values, and professional role or position of the individual participants may have helped to shape these differences in opinion. Another example of such differences of opinion can be viewed in the comments given by Michael Brown who explained that not a lot of social or cultural importance is placed on the study of music and therefore it is not considered as academically
relevant. Jayne Carol, on the other hand, disagrees with this statement suggesting that in her opinion the study of music is given a very prominent position within the College. That it is viewed with as much importance, regarding students’ individual growth, as sport.

Some of the key challenges faced by music teachers working at the school, were lack of student practice, overcrowded workloads, and the difficulty in keeping the music program alive and current. Examining what motivates these teachers to continue teaching despite these difficulties the participants noted that variety in workload, watching students learn and grow as musicians but also as people and playing a role in students chosen career path were all among motivating factors.

Therefore, in conclusion, due to the sheer amount of data that grew out of the pilot study I needed to narrow down the focus for the main study in order to allow me sufficient space within the scope of the main study to each of the themes in sufficient depth. These themes include: Teacher character (the manner with which the teacher acts in the presence of their students which in turn has an ongoing effect on the students motivation to practice and attend lessons), teacher strategy (including: humour, empowering the student as a learner, embracing performance as a source of motivation and encouraging music making in a group), culture (explained by Angela Donaldson as belonging and personal excellence), challenge (can be both global such as keeping the music program current and local such as not having the respect from those in senior positions) and teacher motivation (including: freedom, flexibility and seeing students grow as both people and musicians). Consequently, for the data collection proper, I maintained the current focus of the questionnaire, which was to establish the motivational profiles of the participants and then follow this with the interviews and observations. These would focus on the many facets of ‘Place’, collegiate music making and relationships (for example, the implications of one-on-one lessons), the role of socioeconomic status as it applies to family, community and school/community ensemble, the influence of the multiple levels of the physical environment, culture, and finally, teacher/musical director strategy as applied to dealing with the above.
Chapter 6: Haven

Haven is a small town in rural western Victoria, approximately 300 kilometres from Melbourne. It is home to approximately 10,000 people and as it is central to the district it boasts several primary and secondary schools, community music groups and other recreational outlets that are utilized by residents of the smaller outlying communities. Seven members of the Haven Civic Band and eleven members of the choir were interviewed.

6.1 Haven Civic Band

Haven Civic Band is a mixed Brass Band open to all interested brass and percussion players, which results in an ensemble with members from all walks of life ranging from age twelve to mid-sixties with a wide range of experiences and abilities. Haven Civic Band is largely community focused, performing for visiting dignitaries, combined concerts with other bands, play-outs for special events and community milestones and commemorations such as playing for the Commonwealth and Olympic Games torch relays and the 150th anniversary of the Hospital. The Band is also known throughout the community for playing for events like the openings of local buildings and gardens as well as other community celebrations such as ANZAC Day and the annual Carols by Candlelight. They meet weekly for rehearsals in the Band Rooms located at the Show Grounds. In sum, Haven Civic Band is a community minded ensemble that is geared towards collegiate music making and serving the local community. The following chapter provides an introduction to the participating band members.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PARTICIPANT</th>
<th>AGE</th>
<th>ROLE</th>
<th>INSTRUMENT(S)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Marsha Jackman</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Musical Director</td>
<td>Tenor Horn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Rebecca Smith</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>Player</td>
<td>Euphonium Trombone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. James Beach</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>Player</td>
<td>Cornet Trumpet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Lisa Foote</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>Player</td>
<td>Baritone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Mark Foote</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>Player</td>
<td>Tuba</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Michael Foote</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Player</td>
<td>Trumpet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Paul Munroe</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>Player</td>
<td>Trumpet</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 6.1 Participants from Haven Civic Band

6.1.1 Marsha Jackman

Marsha Jackman has been a member of the Haven Civic Band for the past nineteen years and the Musical Director for the past three years. When asked to describe her role in the ensemble Marsha lists conducting the band, choosing and sourcing music, preparing music for people including photocopying and transcribing parts as necessary, teaching the principles of music as well as secretarial duties such as correspondence and minute taking at meetings, preparing the newsletter, organizing performances, liaising and communicating with community members and the Local Shire Council. In addition to choosing and sourcing music that the members are going to enjoy playing and want to take home and practice, Marasha chooses warm-ups that
promote counting and playing in ensemble, this style of warmup which includes a bit of theory work is essential as some people have very little experience and do not see their instrument during the week. In this regard, Marsha says it is difficult to keep everyone motivated and enthused as some people have only had a few lessons whether they be individual or small group instrumental lessons at school or Junior Band rehearsals while some people have had lots of experience. “That’s hard with music choice…to try and choose music that will challenge those people who have had lots of experience but not alienate or exclude the people who haven’t had much experience.” (Marsha Jackman Questionnaire) In other words, this approach is important to challenge those with experience but still make sure that you are not dumbing down the music for those with less experience so they still feel like they are contributing to the overall sound. Building on the idea of the role of music in the lives of the musicians from Haven Civic Band, Marsha suggests that there are really two types of band people. Firstly, there are those that don’t touch their horn from one week to the next only playing at rehearsals while there are others who are also involved in different groups during the week such as the Haven Symphony Orchestra and travel to various other groups in the greater district to really immerse themselves in the musical life of the wider community.

Examining Marsha’s data, her approach to instruction is largely Mastery focused. There are some elements of Performance Goals such as pointing out members who are doing well as an example to others or making it clear to members how their individual performance compares with others. This suggests that Marsha uses a variety of approaches to her teaching, conducting and leadership of the band however, despite her use of a range of activities and repertoire she still agreed to the statement which suggests that a lot of the work they do in rehearsal is boring and repetitious. However, this may just be her frustration at having to go over and over the same repertoire because some of the members do not practice between rehearsals.

6.1.2 Rebecca Smith

Rebecca Smith plays Euphonium and Trombone in the Haven Civic Band. Her first experience in music was as a very young student in the recorder band of her local Primary school where she first experienced the way parts work together to create something musically special. For Rebecca she perceives her first teacher of recorder as ‘awesome’ in that he smiled at them and made them feel happy and important as part of a team.

Maybe the love and passion that he had for community music…how to him music was for everyone not just people who could afford lessons or children who started at a young age…music was for absolutely anybody who wanted to have a go at it and that I think made me happy (Rebecca Smith: Interview)

Through her interview Rebecca shared that she didn’t feel this again until her own children were learning music at school and the brass teacher offered her lessons and the loan of an instrument. Rebecca has not stopped playing since she went to her first Band rehearsal and was shown her first notes. She feels glad that she didn’t go through life without the experience.

It’s just the best thing because I can commit myself to practicing and get something out of it. It’s an achievement…something that perhaps I thought I wouldn’t be able to do…now I’m doing it and I’m loving it so anything is possible and you can make so many new
friends…that’s the best thing we’ve all got something in common even though we might be at different levels…we can all sit there together and have fun. (Rebecca Smith: Interview).

Rebecca is motivated to attend rehearsals for the sheer love of the sound of her instruments and the fact that she feels like she is getting better at playing and reading every week. For Rebecca, however, being a member of Haven Civic Band is not only about the music, it’s about rising to a challenge as part of a team and to produce something that you could not achieve on your own. Rebecca comments that another good part of being a musician in the community is the cross-pollination of players in that if you join a second group you will likely meet someone you already know and will be welcomed whole-heartedly.

6.1.3 James Beach

James is a V.C.E Music Performance student majoring in Trumpet. James first became interested in Trumpet after finding a Bugle in a box in the garage, he then was fortunate enough to find a young and enthusiastic teacher who was easy to relate to and very passionate about music. Now he plays cornet for the Band. In terms of repertoire sometimes James plays things that don’t really engage him but he practices them anyway so that he can improve to an extent where he can play things that would inspire him and that he would ultimately enjoy.

In terms of motivation James sees himself as largely self-motivated but sees the advantage of playing in a band with other musicians who know what it is like to play a brass instrument. This is often the difference between playing in a brass band with a conductor skilled in brass instruments compared to a concert band where the conductor may be skilled in woodwind and lacks understanding and compassion towards brass players.

For James, music is an all-consuming hobby one which is high on his focus list far more important than any other extra-curricular activity.

It’s so much a part of me now I’ve been playing it for so long…it would feel odd to stop it would be a hole in my life and also…there aren’t that many trumpet players around so it’s almost a responsibility to the bands. (James Beach: Interview).

Following this statement, I asked James whether this sense of responsibility was motivating or a source of pressure. James responded: “…it is pressure. Motivation would imply something positive but it’s pressure more than motivation” (James Beach: Interview). In other words, being a musician in the Haven community is not so much difficult or frustrating it’s more a burden of responsibility because of the ever-dwindling number of musicians.

6.1.4. Lisa Foote

As a younger student Lisa showed potential on recorder so she was told that she was going to start piano lessons even though she would have preferred to study the guitar. So she got up to AMEB\(^2\) grade four but then stopped because her teacher continued to

\(^2\) The Australian Music Examinations Board holds ranked theory and music performance examinations on a range of instruments for beginners to advanced students.
hit her over the fingers. Much later she picked up Baritone horn because the rest of her family were out at Haven Civic Band rehearsals and she was left alone at home.

Lisa continues to be involved in music because she really enjoys the German Shepherds (another local ensemble) because the standard is much easier than that of the Haven Civic Band and there is more than one player per part. However, she stays with the Haven Civic Band because they own the instrument and even though the music is too technical for her current ability she feels she will get there eventually.

For Lisa the ideal member of the band, someone who will enjoy it and be able to contribute will be someone who espouses the following character traits:

- Someone with some ability
- Someone who contributes but also listens
- Someone willing to give things a go
- Someone willing to move outside the box and try new things
- Someone adventurous
- Someone who will practice

However, the most important thing that Lisa put forward was that “…there is no typical person in music really because they come from all ages, stages, gender the whole lot the whole gamut” (Lisa Foote: Interview). In music you can be sitting next to someone who is five times older than you are and you can be learning from them and them from you.

6.1.5 Mark Foote

Mark studied piano as a young student only Preliminary and Grade one mainly under sufferance from his parents. He then had ten to fifteen years off music until he got into electone organ and his Mum brought him one and he got into the pedals and that brought back some of the early piano technique. Later Mark was introduced to the Tuba by the then Musical Director because he was taking his son Michael to rehearsals each week.

While Mark plays both the electone and the Pipe Organ he enjoys playing the Tuba the most because playing in a group is different. It’s the listening and fitting in with other musicians that he enjoys as well as making new friends.

6.1.6 Michael Foote

Like his mother Lisa, Michael started his musical life on the descant recorder. He was then promoted to tenor recorder of which he preferred the tone and later he got the chance to play brass, the trumpet, and has not turned back since.

For Michael playing music is his only social hobby. However, Michael does not really enjoy the music at Haven Civic Band that much but understands that if people leave the band will be in a difficult position. So again the burden of responsibility is about not wanting to let people down.

Overall the Foote’s are passionate about participating in music. This is evident by the fact that they are committed to coming to rehearsal each week even though they live
out of town and need to travel twenty-five to forty minutes in order to attend when for others it is simply around the corner.

6.1.7 Paul Munroe

Paul has a family background in music his father was an excellent violinist who played largely by ear and his mother played the piano and was a superb reader although not so adept at improvisation. Paul tried both of these instruments but found that he did not relate to either of them “so I picked up the trumpet and obviously it was looking for me.” (Paul Munroe: Interview). Now Paul sees his involvement in music as good for his health, and a way to stave off nasties like Alzheimer’s. Musically, for Paul, the Haven Civic Band is a vehicle for his endurance and ultimately he enjoys it believing that the band has the use of him as a teacher and mentor although he goes on to explain that he would rather be in more of a student role.

In terms of support Paul finds everyone including family, friends, and Band members highly supportive especially his wife Noelle who comes to and enjoys all performances. He also finds it beneficial to play trumpet trios with his son and daughter-in-law because they are both very competent players and he learns a lot from them. Even though he was largely self-taught during the early stages of his playing career he gained a great deal of support and encouragement from his uncle who played in the Army Band during the Second World War as the solo cornet player as well as the deputy band master. “He was very supportive and that’s how I’ve tried to be with my students, ‘Ok, that was very good, now to make it better we do this.’” (Paul Munroe: Interview)

In terms of finance Paul bought his first trumpet when he started doing training and then he borrowed cornets from the band as part of his membership. The second trumpet he bought was in 1973 or 1974. In terms of Band membership fees Paul is a life member so he is excused from paying fees however he wants to see membership fees reduced to $2 a year so there is no financial barrier for anyone.

Paul wants to pay the conductor, even if it is only a nominal amount because in his opinion it changes the relationship between the conductor and the members so that they are able to sack the conductor if they are unhappy. Also, Paul feels that paying fees does not affect members’ motivation at all instead contending that they should be motivated by the music itself.

Looking at what it is he gains out of his long term participation in music Paul suggests enjoyment and eternal youth because he is forever associated with young people and has a good relationship with his children because they too are keen musicians. On the down side, for Paul not being able to play something at sight because of tricky fingering or lack of flexibility is a real frustration. However, for him, this can be worked through by choosing appropriate exercises in the Arbans.

6.2. Haven Civic Choir

Haven Civic Choir is an amateur vocal ensemble with approximately thirty choristers. Belinda Thomas is the musical director and they rehearse each week in a local school
music hall. The following introduction to the eleven participants provides insight into the Choir and an overview of its position and role within the local Haven community.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PARTICIPANT</th>
<th>ROLE</th>
<th>AGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Belinda Thomas</td>
<td>Musical Director</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Ryan Abraham</td>
<td>Singer</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Haylee Reade</td>
<td>Singer</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Jayne Bath</td>
<td>Singer</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Janice Beach</td>
<td>Singer</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Claire Smith</td>
<td>Singer</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Arnold Marks</td>
<td>Singer</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Melinda Rose</td>
<td>Singer</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Gemma Thomas</td>
<td>Singer</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Rose McIntyre</td>
<td>Singer</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Catherine Lock</td>
<td>Singer</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 6.2: Participants from Haven Civic Choir

6.2.1 Belinda Thomas

Belinda has been conductor and Musical Director of the Haven Civic Choir for approximately ten years. Overall the choir has a really strong role in the local community. They do a lot for local events such as Australia Day, ANZAC Day, the local eisteddfod, Christmas events and annual festivals. Additionally, they are also invited to sing at local funerals, worship services and police services and finally they produce compact disks for use by the community and sing annually at local aged care facilities. Looking at how the community supports the choir, they invite the choir to sing at local functions and provide a small community grant if the choir passes the application process (Belinda Thomas: Questionnaire).

Looking at the role music might play in the life of her choristers Belinda suggests that music is just a source of fun; they like doing it, it’s something they enjoy and something that they can do together. Additionally, for some choristers music could be a therapeutic escape from lives and boring jobs, a form of escapism. For others they join because they want to learn more about music, about the different styles, to read and generally improve their technique and understanding of choral music. Belinda concludes that music brings people together especially as part of events like Australia Day, ANZAC Day and Christmas events to which music is a part of even if you are not musical in yourself. The singers are community minded people and they see this musical activity as a way to contribute to the community.

When asked what opportunities are there available for musicians in the Haven community Belinda replied “For a country area it’s pretty jolly good” Haven Civic Choir is not the only choir in town; there are other groups the choristers could join. It is not only adults who have access to choral groups. School students are also very well catered for. Some years at the local Music Festival, there is a commissioned work that requires as many choristers from the community who want to sing as possible. There are also other community concerts such as the eisteddfod which provides performance opportunities. A number of professional orchestras play at the Arts Centre and Art Gallery which is uplifting to all who attend and also professionally developing to those who work in the area.
Belinda’s first thought regarding why her singers continue their involvement with the choir was the big social aspect to the choir. As a result the singers develop lasting friendships within the group. The choristers enjoy the type of events they perform in and the sense of community mindedness that is evident. However, it seems to be the repertoire itself that determines whether choristers attend rehearsals or not. For example, it was very frustrating when a tenor returned to the choir one rehearsal before a performance. Belinda saw it as unfair for the choristers who put in all the effort to learn the repertoire for him to attend one rehearsal and then the concert.

6.2.2 Ryan Abraham

Ryan’s musical journey began when he started listening to various styles of recorded music and as a young adult seeing bands and singers performing live on television. He sang along and wished to be part of that world. Ryan’s first introduction into producing music himself came when his brother-in-law gave him an old acoustic guitar, a “plywood pieces of crap… held together with sticky tape” and a few lessons (Ryan Abraham: Interview). Singing didn’t come until much later when he was performing with a church band in Melbourne and doing some busking in his spare time. Now, Ryan enjoys the buzz of being able to create something and share his creation with the wider community. Even though his skills are still somewhat raw, he appreciates being able to contribute meaningfully to the whole musical output and being acknowledged for that contribution. He particularly liked singing in an SATB community choir where he finds the harmonies uplifting and the overall sound to be a form of magic or wizardry.

Ryan draws support for his music from a variety of different sources. Firstly, and probably most significant, Ryan finds support in those with whom he generally associates. For example, playing regularly in the band at the local Church, he is always thanked warmly with great enthusiasm and sincerely welcomed back each week, which he finds to be a tremendous encouragement. Even though Ryan’s wife does not attend all of the performances in which he is involved, if it is a special moment in his musical career, perhaps singing or playing a solo, she makes sure she attends so that Ryan knows he is strongly supported. Haven is a small community and it is the people that Ryan sings, plays and generally interacts with, people who he sees often and from whom he gains ongoing and positive feedback, that are his main sources of inspiration and support. In addition to this, Ryan acknowledges that there are a lot of people who have given up their involvement in music over time or people who have never had the experience to begin with, so as a music participant he has something that many people do not and this is a major motivator. Ryan insists that money has never been, and never will, be a motivator for performance. The closest he has come to a paid gig was money for petrol or some free pizza.

For Ryan, participation in the Haven Civic Choir is a great source of pride and enjoyment, a place where he can be accepted for who he is and the skills he brings to the table. Ryan describes the choir as a group of humble yet enthusiastic singers of varying age and ability. In terms of the choir, Ryan describes it as a group of humble yet enthusiastic singers of varying age and ability. A group whose performance repertoire ranges from the madrigals of the 1600s to very contemporary and often humorous works, works that are always challenging and inspiring. There are certain personal characteristics, which Ryan believes are common within the choir. These
people are not shy and radiate confidence, is thick skinned enough to accept criticism and mindful enough to take feedback of all types and use the feedback as a form of motivation.

6.2.3 Haylee Reade

Haylee Reade comes from a musical family. Both of her parents played the piano and many times hosted sing-alongs for family and close friends, and these were Haylee’s first introduction to the world of music participation. By the time she reached the age of four, Haylee was enrolled in piano lessons and was gifted enough to be able to play by ear at this young age, her experience, however was not all that inspirational.

Haylee describes her first teacher as ‘terrible’ and recalls being terrorised by a thick black pencil that was frequently rapped over her knuckles causing her to dread her lessons. When asked how she persevered through that, Haylee explained that she did not want to but was forced by her mother and it was not until she completed her time at teachers’ college that the motivation to study music became her own instead of her parents’. As an adult, after moving to Haven, Haylee joined the Dramatic Theatre Club as a way of meeting new people and to feel a sense of belonging in her new place of residence. After her first production, Haylee noticed that most of the cast belonged to the Haven Civic Choir as a means to continue singing and develop their voices between productions and Haylee found that she just drifted in after them. Now, Haylee’s continued involvement in the choir is fuelled by a desire to participate in the community.

The role of the other choristers in Haylee’s ongoing participation is also of utmost importance. Often times Haylee would whisper something like ‘I’m going to give up’ to the person next to her during a rehearsal, however, her comrade, Lauren, would whisper back ‘No you’re not.’ and offer up a bribe of magazines and chicken eggs (Haylee Reade: Interview). Expanding focus to the choir as a whole, Haylee describes the different sections of the S.A.T.B choir as small cliques and quite enjoys, and gains motivation from fun, banter and teasing that goes on between these four groups. Haylee, describes the choir as a friendly yet disciplined group of singers, a group that is large enough that if you are lacking in confidence, you can hide somewhat within the ranks. Haylee also describes the comradery and social network provided by the choir as particularly helpful when she first moved to Haven and was not happy with the school in which she was teaching at the time. She greatly missed her previous school and needed the support of friends to help her through this difficult time and Haven Civic Choir was there to provide.

6.2.4 Jayne Bath

As a child Jayne did not have the chance to learn an instrument even though her school was recognised as having a very strong music program that she enjoyed. The highlight, however, of this era was an excursion to the Melbourne Town Hall to hear the Melbourne Symphony Orchestra and it was this experience that initially sparked Jayne’s interest in music. As a young adult she belonged, for a short time, to a classical guitar ensemble but later gave this away because she did not believe she had enough talent as a musician. Later in life, as her children left home and she had more time, Jayne followed a friend to the Haven Civic Choir and has been a member ever since spurred on by a sense of fun and the rewards of singing. She believes the group
has more skill than she will ever have but are able to tolerate the contribution of someone of her experience without being superior or judgemental.

Looking at the Choir as a whole, Jayne contends that there are certain characteristics that are important in someone who makes a lasting commitment to the choir. Firstly, they should be keen to have a go and attend rehearsals on a regular basis. They should also be eager to have fun with the group even though they might be somewhat timid at first. They need to be willing to contribute to the light hearted atmosphere of the group. They should be mature in years but young at heart, although Jayne would hope that people would feel comfortable irrespective of their actual age. They should be willing to give it a go and be strong enough in character to persist in the choir past those awkward first few rehearsals.

6.2.5 Janice Beach

Janice’s first foray into music was the choir at her school under the baton of Mrs Hilton who made the lunchtime rehearsals and regular performances at school assemblies and the local annual metropolitan eisteddfod not only educational but also enjoyable. Despite her love for the school choir, Janice discontinued singing until she moved from Melbourne to the country where she joined the choir at her Church. It was not until she moved closer to town that a friend introduced her to the Haven Civic Choir. She loves singing and enjoys hearing how the four parts mould together, and also the opportunity to make new friends, which the choir affords. However, Janice believes that the ultimate drawcard of belonging to a choral group, or any musical ensemble for that matter, is the opportunity to participate in different community events that she would otherwise not attend such as the eisteddfod, the local Music Festival as well as ANZAC and Australia Day celebrations, it is rewarding to be able to give something back to the community.

In regards to Place, Janice explains that the annual Carols by Candlelight held at the Botanical Gardens in which the choir takes part is a difficult performance. It is outside, there are many children running around, adults are speaking to each other and it feels like no one is listening or interested in what the choir is offering. To Janice these factors make her contribution seem like a complete waste of her time. On a positive note Janice divulges that her premier Music Places are the local churches not only for their lovely acoustics but also for the comfortable atmosphere they exude. More broadly however, as a community, Haven is very arts minded, there are a lot of ensembles and a lot of people who take part in these ensembles.

6.2.6 Claire Smith

Claire has always enjoyed music, particularly singing. She grew up in a convent school and remembers listening to the senior choir in awe and longing for the day when she could become a part of that glorious sound of a choir which predominately sang Latin Masses for the Church. At home, Claire’s family owned a piano and a radio and there was always a strong love for music. Later at Teachers College, Claire was invited to join a choir that sang trios and quartets and although she was too timid to join in her first year, by second year she was enjoying her contribution to this ensemble. Now retired, having taught music at the primary school level for many years, Claire loves participating in communal music making predominately because
of her affinity for harmony even though she longs for the Haven Civic Choir to tackle some more advanced, adventurous and challenging repertoire for the greater harmonic interest.

There are two characteristics that Claire believes would encourage people to stay in the choir despite the level of seriousness. Firstly, they must have a good ear which would assist in the learning of new repertoire even if their reading skills are somewhat lacking, and secondly they must demonstrate an ability to sing. They do not have to be a soloist, but it is important to blend. One of the nice things about the choir, Claire contends, is the way that everyone talks to each other and can put an opinion forward without fear of retribution.

Currently, music is still a vital piece in the jigsaw of Claire’s life and even though performing is not as important as it used to be, listening wise it is still very much up there. In other words, the role of music in her life has changed over time given her circumstances and degrees of ability.

There are a number of performance venues around Haven and the surrounding communities such as the Art Gallery, churches and the local Performing Arts Centre. Of these, according to Claire (Interview), Saint Mary’s Church is the best but unfortunately it is the biggest and the choir simply doesn’t draw a large enough audience. Even though she finds Saint Mary’s Church to be a pleasing and reverberant venue Claire’s primary Music Place is the large cathedrals in the city such as Saint Patricks and Saint Pauls, as well as those found overseas particularly in Europe, which she enjoys for the inspiration of the sound and the beauty of the architecture.

In regards to the music environment of Haven Claire insists that the locals are extremely lucky, especially compared to people living in other small towns around the country. School music is very strong and there are several ensembles available to adult members of the community in different styles and genres.

6.2.7 Arnold Marks

Arnold was born into a very musical family. His mother was a leading soprano and his Grandfather played the violin so there was always music in the home. At the age of seventeen Arnold moved to South Gippsland and took singing lessons from a woman who used to sing with the Vienna Opera Company and one of the gifts she gave him was a love of classical music. Later in life Arnold moved to Haven and immediately took the lead role in Dramatica Theatre’s production of The Sound of Music and joined two choirs one of which was Haven Civic Choir.

As a choir, Haven Civic Choir is often singing music that they really are not capable of but as his first teacher said ‘if you can not get to the top of Mount Everest, just go as far as you can go’ at any given stage. In regards to Arnold’s (Interview) sources of support for his singing he has found that he has many adoring elderly women at his church who ‘telepathically’ express their support and offer unbiased and positive comments on a job well done. Music is an important part of Arnold’s life even though he does not put it ahead of anything else, he is ‘like a jigsaw and that’s (music) just one of the pieces and without it the jigsaw is not complete.’ (Arnold Marks: Interview)
When asked to describe the Haven Civic Choir to someone who was thinking about joining, Arnold suggests that the first thing he would say is that it is fun and certainly not embarrassing. He would offer further encouragement by assuring them that choir is not much of a time commitment, rehearsals are once a week, you get school holidays off and there is the occasional concert. Aside from personal practice, it does not intrude much on day to day life, it is healthy and it enables you to socialize with a great group of people.

6.2.8 Melinda Rose

From a young age Melinda knew she wanted to be a musician. Her mother was a piano teacher, her Father played the violin, and their house was always full of music. There was never any doubt that she wanted to get involved in music herself. Melinda’s first music teacher was at a private secondary school in Melbourne where she ran three vocal ensembles: Choir, Chamber Choir and Glee Group, and Melinda was in all three. Melinda’s life continues to be full of music. She loves singing particularly with others and especially the more complicated Baroque music “I love the interplay of the melodies” (Melinda Rose: Interview) the counterpoint of it all. Overall, for Melinda, music is a self-driven art, it can be a private thing where you just sit and listen on your own with no interruptions and not having to worry about the musical tastes and opinions of others.

In regards to Place, Melinda explains that the choir largely performs in churches not because they are engaging in sacred repertoire but rather because there is a piano and the atmosphere is intimate. In this regard, Melinda’s favourite venue to perform in Haven is Saint Andrew’s Presbyterian Church because in her opinion the acoustics are beautiful, you can see every audience members’ face, and there is an overriding sense of warmth. Her ultimate Music Places are in Vienna. Having taught there for several months, she had the opportunity to attend Musikverein and she found the acoustics to be brilliant, and the second Place is her own home where she can listen to music on her own and just relax. Looking at the musical environment and culture, Melinda asserts that Haven has long been recognised as a musical place. This is due to the work of a few people years ago who established both school and community choirs and arranged for professional ensembles to come and perform thus encouraging an affinity with music. There are many choirs, particularly in schools, and it is the interaction between these groups together with the small town ethos, which helps to further build and sustain this culture.

6.2.9 Gemma Thomas

Gemma’s first experience of learning an instrument came at the age of five when she began to study piano under Mrs Alice whom she can barely remember but knows she was good for her and kept her motivated. At primary school, Gemma learnt the recorder and simply loved the feeling of ensemble playing. Despite this, she did not continue with music in secondary school and it was not until she became an adult that she returned to music and joined the Haven Civic Choir. Not being a trained singer and having only ever sung in unison prior to this Gemma is motivated in her involvement by the sound stemming from the four parts as well as the social aspect of choral participation.
In regard to the characteristics of the singers Gemma finds them to be a happy group and while any adult can participate, it is the younger people that tend to come and go more than the older generation who seem to have greater commitment. However, Gemma sees that the primary common thread within the choir is the individuals’ connection to the church.

Like many other participants in the Haven Civic Choir, Gemma acknowledges that the overall music environment or culture of the community is quite strong. There are three secondary schools each with a good music program, the local Music Festival is a major draw card and the Eisteddfod encourages many students and adult solos and ensembles to perform. It is these events, which Gemma finds to be an inspiration and a good source of local pride.

6.2.10 Rose McIntyre

Rose’s interest in music came at an early age stemming from a musical home environment where her father was very interested in music, played the piano and took his family to see the Ballet and Opera. It is this informal contact Rose believes brought her to singing. As a teenager she began attending her local church not really for any spiritual reason but rather for the singing. For Rose this was the first time she had any professional direction in how to sing and where her love of singing really blossomed, the choir only ever sang in unison but just being part of it was enough for her passion to be realised. As an adult, Rose moved to Haven and joined the choir in approximately 1985, she removed herself in the early 1990s to study and returned to the choir early in the new millennium. Rose is motivated to continue her participation in the choir by a number of factors: firstly, just having a good sing every Monday night produces endorphins and enhances mood, there is the self recognition of achievement and the positive feedback from an audience, the social aspect of singing and being able to catch up with people you might only see once a week, the sense that you are letting people down if you are absent or under rehearsed and lastly, driving her conductor Belinda, who has sight problems, to rehearsal.

In terms of the role music plays in her life, Rose (Interview) explains that her attendance at rehearsals is a source of ‘Me Time’, a time where she can be relaxed allowing the music to take her mind on a journey (although not necessarily to where the composer intended) and find enjoyment. She also acknowledges that choir is not as important to her as it has been in the past when she had no other creative outlet. Now she participates in group and solo craft activities in addition to her singing. Looking at the choir as a whole, Rose describes an un-auditioned choir where anyone who shows even the slightest interest can join.

6.2.11 Catherine Lock

The genesis for Catherine’s involvement in music reaches all the way back to when she was a little girl when shop keepers would lift her onto the counter and ask her to sing for their patrons. Growing up Catherine was always surrounded by music; her sister and aunt played the piano and her father played multiple instruments. He played clarinet while she was in bed and she would sing along until she fell asleep. Catherine’s first music teacher was for piano, which she learnt for eight years. She did not enjoy it and wanted instead to learn the violin but was not allowed. Music continues to be a very important part of her life. For example, she often discusses
with friends if you ever have to lose a sense what would it be? And her answer would always be the same, never hearing because she could not bare life without music (Catherine Lock: Interview).

Looking at the character of members of the Haven Civic Choir, Catherine describes a group who enjoy having fun and who are flexible enough to try a lot of different styles of music, they are easy to fit in with because everyone is delightful and they always make new comers feel welcome. For example, when Catherine first started attending choir rehearsals each week they would say hello and make it such a warm environment. This enthusiasm for each other and the strong sense of comradery bleeds through into the music.

Catherine’s ultimate Music Place is the church because growing up she was heavily involved in the music of her church and often the acoustics are second to none, which is a really important factor in the enjoyment of a performance space. When she moved to Haven she was very surprised to hear about the Choir because she thought she would only be able to sing at church. However, there are several choirs for adult participants in Haven which suggests a heightened focus on music participation and community engagement. This importance of community involvement is particularly evident at Christmas time especially performing at Nursing homes because the patrons would not necessarily have that opportunity otherwise and seeing the joy on their faces when they sing along is heart-warming.

6.3. Emergent Themes

Throughout the data collection process it quickly became apparent that the participants from Haven held a strong sense of Place. This manifested itself in discussions centring on belonging, how the feel of a Place affects both the quality of their musical output, their overall safety, comfort and assess ability, relationships, culture, socio-economic factors as well as how the history and traditions behind a Place can be sources of motivation and inspiration.

Ten themes emerged from the Haven data:

- Acoustics and musical experience
- Safety, comfort and accessibility
- History and tradition
- Belonging
- Collegiate music making
- Socio-economic status
- Conductor character
- Conductor strategy
- Conductor motivation
- Culture
- Challenge
6.3.1 Acoustics and Musical Experience

The overall feel and acoustic properties of a Place impact on a musicians’ experience of their sound as well as the quality of the sound they are able to produce. Rebecca Smith from the Haven Civic Band (Interview) suggests that certain environments make you feel good because they have a positive effect on your tone. Rebecca continues with an example explaining that the way the acoustics of many of the Haven’s churches assist you to produce a tone that you may be unable to produce in another venue which, gives you confidence and an ‘uplifting feeling’. From the Haven Civic Choir Rose’s (Interview) experience is quite similar in that she likes to practice in the shower because it is a comfortable space with a nice resonance making you ‘sound fantastic even if you’re crap’. Rose likes to perform in venues with good acoustics and a nice feel for this reason she enjoys singing in the local Catholic Church.

In a similar way, Arnold Mark’s (Haven Civic Choir) story describes that rehearsing in the right room effects not only one’s motivation as a singer but also the way they sing. There are so many necessities that need to be in place to make a room conducive to practice, you need to be able to hear all of the parts, hear the accompaniment and importantly hear the people on either side of you. From Arnold’s experience where they practice at the moment in the music room of the local Private secondary College, this is simply not the case. Arnold feels that he does not have a good musical ear but he understands that where you rehearse has a lot to do with how you hear the music, how easy it is to produce and how good you feel about the result. As far as performance venues go, Arnold explains that the worst place to perform is the Performing Arts Centre because even though it has good acoustics from an audience perspective as a chorister the sound immediately disappears making it very difficult to sing blended and in tune. On a more positive note, the Art Gallery is the best place to sing in Haven because you can hear what you are producing and there is lots of resonance.

Examining the Foote’s (Haven Civic Band: Interview) thoughts regarding this issue, specifically the feel and physical nature of the places where they practice and how those places effect their motivation, there are a couple of points that need to be considered. Firstly, Michael explains that playing with the HSO provides him with the opportunity to play in the purpose built Arts Centre which has a nice affect on the tone produced. In contrast Mark Foote from the band (Interview) suggests that when playing in the pokey little room that is the Town Band room the sound is not right and this effects the outcome and therefore the drive of the musicians. Paul Munroe (Band, Interview) agrees with the idea that the current band rooms are unsuitable sharing that he was around when the Band rooms were being built explaining that the builder thought that he knew what the band needed during the initial planning stages. Unfortunately, Paul was unable to convince the builder that the join in the ceiling would, in his opinion, split the sound and as a result the room effects the overall sound that the band is able to produce and the band has to learn to become comfortable with it to be productive during rehearsal.

The Band members, Paul Munroe and the Foote family are in agreement that playing outside is very difficult as the sound becomes lost, it escapes therefore making it hard
to hear each other and so produce a balanced and coherent performance. The Footes (Interview) go as far as saying that when they play outside they feel isolated, unsupported and disconnected from the rest of the band.

These feelings of isolation are also expressed by Jayne Bath (Choir, Interview) who suggests that even though the P.A.C was purposely built for the performing arts it offers choristers an ‘alarming experience’ in which you are unable to hear across the choir and you feel very much alone, it is highly uncomfortable. However, Jayne believes that if you practice enough in the hall and place yourself well enough such acoustic problems may be able to be circumvented.

Contrary to this, Ryan Abraham (Choir, Interview) explains that the actual venue does not matter, that the physical space itself does not register as an important factor in how; he thinks about music production. Rather, it is the people that occupy the space, and how, as a performer, you relate to them that makes all the difference.

6.3.2 Safety, Comfort and Accessibility

The motivational properties of the perceived safety of the practice environment emerged as an important concern for participants particularly in regards to not disturbing others or being disturbed yourself. In this way Gemma Thomas (Choir) explains that for her, her safe space is in her car especially during commutes to, or from, town. With forty-five minutes each way Gemma Thomas (choir) has a lot of time to listen to classical music on the radio and singing along a pastime she could not indulge in at home for fear of being ‘sprung’ by ‘farm men’ working on her property. For Jayne Bath (Choir), however, her ultimate practice space is in her home. This is because she prefers the solitariness of practice in an environment where she is unable to be overheard by others so she can enjoy the experience totally alone. Similarly, sometimes Rebecca Smith (Band) will practice at home when no one is around because she feels her playing is too loud. On the other hand she will often practice at the band rooms where she can play as loudly as she requires without fear of not being good enough to share your music publically.

Accessibility of the venue as well as the physical and emotional comfort of musicians also emerged as an issue close to the hearts of the participants. Concerns such as the size of the rehearsal venue as well as the physical contents of the space were among the key ideas raised. Having an appropriate rehearsal space that fully meets the needs of the ensemble is very important for the ongoing motivation of the ensemble. In this way, Marsha Jackman from the Haven Civic Band explains that the only space the Band has exclusive use of is the small room located at the Show Grounds. When the Band was greater in size they had to, by necessity, rehearse in the larger room next door. However, following every rehearsal they had to return all their equipment back to their own space, which has, overtime, become somewhat of a nuisance.

Jayne Bath from the Haven Civic Choir takes this feeling of ownership over one’s rehearsal space to the ensemble further. She suggests that in a small community like Haven, where space is at a premium, the choir is very fortunate to have the facilities at the local private school available to them. It offers them a space to rehearse each week and storage for their library; it is easily accessible with ample parking space; it is comfortable and warm; it has appropriate seating and acoustically it is satisfactory.
Marsha Jackman from the Haven Civic Band brings to light another important point that the feel and cleanliness of a rehearsal space brings about a certain level of respect for the rehearsal environment. Marsha commented that the committee tries to decorate the band rehearsal room with posters to try and motivate people to come, yet acknowledge that it still needs a bit of a spruce up because I think if your environment is clean and tidy and upbeat then that reflects on peoples’ enthusiasm and also their respect for the space as well so if the instruments and the space are clean and tidy then there’s a respect for that space (Marsha Jackman: Interview).

Marsha commented that while she was at University in Ballarat she played in a Concert Band which she believed had the ideal rehearsal space: it was a small hall with a wooden floor and a raised stage at one end, a little kitchen, toilets and two rooms on either side of the stage where they could store their instruments, chairs and music stands in one and their library in the other. The space also had lots of natural light and consequently was the ideal space to hire out to others to raise money for the Band.

Looking at Place and how it effects people as musicians, Haylee Reade from the Haven Civic Choir describes their rehearsal space at the local private secondary college as more comfortable, and in this way better than all of the places the choir has practiced in over the many years since its inception. In this way it is the physical aspects such as heating, cooling, lighting and appropriate chairs that make this venue not only look nice but also make it, together with the addition of easy parking, an environment suitable for a productive and stress free rehearsal. Broadening the scope somewhat, Haylee describes a community with an abundance of talent, a place where retired and elderly people are offered music as an outlet for their creativity and because of this participation they are still valued by the community.

As a chorister Arnold Marks agrees with Rebecca (band) in that where you sing not only affects the sound you are going to make but also the way you feel about it. Arnold discusses aspects of a place that are vital for a choral rehearsal. For example, the need to have a purpose built rehearsal room which meets all the necessities for practice such as being able to hear all the parts and, importantly, being able to hear the people on either side of you. Arnold goes on to concede that where they (choir) currently rehearse does not meet these requirements.

Belinda Thomas from the Haven Civic Choir raised the importance of the way the space, as well as its physical resources, are used to promote productivity and enjoyment during rehearsals. During the rehearsals, the way the choir uses the space is very important. Sometimes they rearrange the room for rehearsal to reflect the space of an up coming performance. This is done so to avoid confusion. For example, if the piano will be on the opposite side of the choir than what the choristers are used to. At other times Belinda arranges the choristers into a U-shape or seats each of the sections into a circle so that they can hear across to assist them to learn their parts more effectively. Currently their rehearsal space at the school is small with lots of furniture and they use a small space in the centre. They are welcome to use the auditorium, which is much larger and has better acoustics but the piano is always locked so they would need to overcome that problem. In considering the different rehearsal spaces, Belinda was asked if she was to design a rehearsal space that would work really well with what she wanted to achieve with the choir, what would it be like. Firstly, and probably the most important would be a decent piano and
comfortable chairs which are not heavy, even a stool because as the choristers get tired they “just melt away” (Belinda Thomas: Interview). Ultimately, lightweight backless stools would help with posture because then the choristers would be unable to slouch when they are seated. It would be good to have the choir stand more but Belinda recognises that it is an adult choir and some choristers cannot stand for long. That is why they sit-stand, sit-stand even though the sound is better then they are standing and why backless stools would be so effective.

6.3.3 History and Tradition

The motivational properties of the history and tradition of a Place also emerged as a sub-theme. For Haylee Reade (Choir), her interest in music participation both as a performer as well as an audience member was confirmed on a recent holiday to Europe. Here she attended many wonderful concerts in lovely old Baroque churches that were steeped in the history of those who came before and the architecture, which does not have to be ornate, is so very different from what we see in this country.

6.3.4 Belonging

The importance of feeling a sense of belonging emerged as one of the most mentioned aspects of Place to arise from the interviews conducted in Haven. In this respect Marsha Jackman from the Haven Civic Band explains that an important part of belonging is in the friendships made along the way suggesting that if you are a musician no matter where you go you will have a friend with similar values to your own.

Similarly, Rebecca Smith (Haven Civic Band) raised the idea that music brings people together from all areas of the community; people who are very different in terms of family culture, beliefs and age. Rebecca suggests that these aspects of a person’s life are not of significance when they play together more importantly is the music they create.

I think the bizarre thing about…being involved in community music, perhaps not in a professional situation because they’d be there for different reasons, but in community music you can be sitting beside somebody who’s not from your background at all, not the same age as you perhaps decades younger or older but you’re still sitting there making music. (Rebecca Smith: Interview)

Paul Munroe (Haven Civic Band) agrees that in most cases musicians have pleasant and accepting personalities. He goes further to suggest that if the ego is greater than their ability, this generalisation is inaccurate.

What we need is people with ability who have actually developed that ability…we need a training program of course but what we need is people who can play. But generally my experience is that people who are fairly good musicians tend to get on reasonably well…it’s those who have got an ego bigger than their ability that don’t. They’re at all levels of course but generally I’ve found that those who are reasonably good get on well together because they’re doing it because they enjoy doing it rather than something they are forced into. (Paul Munroe: Interview)

Rebecca Smith (Band) raises a vital point; that a sense of belonging stems from the relationships within the band. The importance of respect due to members regardless of who they are and what they bring to the ensemble rather than who they are related to.
Even though we’re mother/daughter she treats me just like another player. It’s tricky to put into words…but she doesn’t treat me like a mum at band she respects me, yeah that’s the word, she respects me for being the Eupho player. (Rebecca Smith: Interview)

Lisa Foote’s (Haven Civic Band) response takes a different path suggesting that part of feeling a sense of belonging in relation to community music is feeling comfortable within the group. For Lisa, comfort refers to the music being of an appropriate standard for your current level of ability and a sense that you are not alone with the possible support gained from having another musician playing the same part.

Ryan Abraham’s (Haven Civic Choir) response presents yet another aspect of belonging. Here he suggests that it is the music itself and the very act of creating it that brings people together in a very special way that only collegiate participation in music can bring.

It’s the magic, the buzz of the magic harmony, contributing to something, being with my peers and being encouraged by and encouraging them that’s quite enjoyable. When we all get on the same page and hit the right notes in the precise sequence and the right volume and tempo when it all comes together as one we know that, you know, we’ve kind of joined forces well and that is very special. (Ryan Abraham: Interview)

Finally, Arnold Marks is a chorister who has a strong reputation in the Haven community for singing at weddings and funerals and bringing music to the elderly. He suggests that participating in a community music ensemble, which puts itself out there in service of the community, affords individuals a certain standing within that community as well as a sense of belonging to the community not just as a member of the group but also as an individual.

Well there’s the personal ego trip if you like where you know you’ve got some standing in the community because you are in a group a community group and that’s a really positive thing. (Arnold Marks: Interview)

6.3.5 Collegiate Music Making

The primary issue concerning collegiate music making to arise from the Haven data was that making music with others extends your own motivation. In this regard, Rebecca Smith (Haven Civic Band) explains that she enjoys playing with others, especially people who are technically and musically more advanced than she is as it pushes her to work harder and consequently achieve more. Rebecca goes on to say that she hopes her own skill offers the same inspiration to others who are less experienced.

Lisa Foote (Haven Civic Band) also supports this idea explaining that Marsha, the musical director, has put in a lot of work to improve the relationships between members of the band and that this has gone a long way towards improving the overall standard they are able to produce. Lisa continues saying that this effect is a direct result of members witnessing the effort that their fellow bandsmen put in thus encouraging them to make that same effort themselves and not be left behind or be seen as a drain on the rest of the band.

The second issue that emerged is its importance in breaking down social barriers and fostering the development of positive relationships. Lisa Foote from the Haven Civic Band explains that not only can you play beautiful music with someone you are close
to, the wonderful thing about music is that you can also produce it with people you do not yet know or are not friends with. And the results can be just as moving.

You can be socially friends with someone and play music with them but you can also have someone you can’t stand and still play good music together…its one thing that cuts down the barriers in a lot a ways. (Lisa Foote: Interview)

Rebecca Smith (Haven Civic Band) takes up this issue of fostering friendship through music suggesting that being a member of the Band is about building relationships with people from all walks of life. Rebecca goes on to explain how she travels to other towns to experience playing with different ensembles and play alongside professional players at workshops and tutorials. For example playing alongside ‘Shrewd Brass’, which she said improved her own playing to the point where she hopes that she could be such an inspiration to other younger or less experienced players.

It makes you realize who you are and makes you a better person because you are doing something that you absolutely really love…You also create heaps of friendships and that in turn makes you a better person cause everyone offers you something you wouldn’t get normally. (Rebecca Smith: Interview)

6.3.6 Socio-economic status

The issue regarding socio-economic factors to come out of the interviews in Haven were whether or not community music groups should charge membership fees, consideration of how these fees should be structured and the implications for musicians and their membership to the ensemble.

Even though their financial situation should not preclude them from participating in music, the state of our society’s economic structure often means that it does. As a young child, Jayne Bath (Haven Civic Choir) was unable to learn an instrument because there was no money to support it. Even when Jayne was in her mid teens and the school orchestra needed a cellist and despite her ideation that it would be a fun and worthwhile experience Jayne did not approach her parents because there was simply no money to be had.

Such financial issues do not only affect individuals. As a whole the Haven Civic Choir has also had to bow down to these monital pressures. In recent times, the choir has had to increase it’s annual fees from fifty dollars annually to eighty in order to keep pace with increased costs. Even though the extra money was to go towards purchasing new music to expand their library as a means to keep choristers interested, there were still a number of people who were ‘miffed’ (Jayne Bath, Haven Civic Choir: Interview) by this price increase.

Examining this a little more closely, Belinda Thomas (Haven Civic Choir) explains that her choristers’ motivation and ability to participate has been affected by this rise in the annual fees. Belinda remarks that a lot of men think the price is too high, especially those who also sing with a local male voice choir, which does not have a subscription fee. On the other hand, Belinda comments that if you pay the subscription, you will be more committed. The choir needs the money to run its events especially as it is getting to the point in town where if you want a good piano,
you have to pay for it because the churches do not have adequate pianos unless you bring your own.

Paul Munroe (Haven Civic Band) echoes this idea suggesting that membership fees should be kept to a minimum so that your financial situation is not a barrier to music. Along this line Paul suggests that if a payment is required then it changes the relationship between members and the band where they feel they are committed because they have reached into their wallets rather than be committed because of the music.

In relation to reducing the financial barrier for participants, Marsha Jackman from the Haven Civic Band explains that in an attempt to solve this issue the bands current fee structure is geared towards constructing the payment cycle to be in line with other community organisations particularly sports and recreation groups because membership to those is very popular in the community. This transition involves the charging of a small two-dollar fee each week rather than charging a termly or yearly subscription.

Paul Munroe (Haven Civic Band) raises the question of whether it is indeed appropriate for community music groups to make money from their members. Paul goes on to suggest that perhaps there are other options available such as charging admission fees for performances and applying for community and government grants.

A further suggestion was given by Paul Munroe who believes that ensembles should offer financial incentives to their conductors rather than having musical directorship solely on a volunteer basis. This would alter the dynamics of the relationship between the conductor and the ensemble making the conductor somewhat of an employee of the band giving control back to the members of the ensemble.

6.3.7 Conductor Character

The character traits of the two conductors from Haven that motivate and encourage their musicians to maintain their involvement in ensemble music include a friendly personality, a sense of humour, a positive attitude and an expectation of high standards. Belinda Thomas’ (Haven Civic Choir) skill as a musician and her positive attitude is another source of motivation for choristers. This skill manifests in the way she goes over individual parts until they are correct (Janice Beach, Haven Civic Choir). An example of this is Janice Beach who describes her conductor as friendly, fun and although she puts up with a lot of nonsense from her choristers, she is nonetheless encouraging that is evidenced by the thumbs up and Belinda’s lovely smile following a job well done.

The motivational qualities of having a conductor who is well skilled at leading an ensemble is further mentioned by Gemma Thomas (Haven Civic Choir) who describes her conductor as someone who knows what she is doing. That she has innate musical ability and good skills as a teacher and ultimately she has the personality that makes you think you can do better. It is these factors she believes that extend the knowledge and music appreciation of the choristers. The importance of conductor skill is reinforced by Arnold Marks (Haven Civic Choir) who explains that his ongoing motivation for music stems from the music itself and the comradery he experiences with his conductor whom he finds to be vivacious, positive and able to
immediately recognise mistakes. It is these characteristics that improve the choir in terms of ability and willingness to try new and difficult things.

Rose Macintyre (Haven Civic Choir) agrees that the expectation of high standards is a vital ingredient for a successful ensemble. In this way she explains that Belinda Thomas can be a hard taskmaster at times, she demands a certain standard and expects that the choir will perform in a professional manner. However, she is very much patient in how she instructs, particularly with newer members. She has a great sense of humour and willingly takes time out of her own life to prepare for and run rehearsals, which Rose finds particularly inspiring.

The expectation of a high standard in performance is one thing but knowing when to relax and focus on something else for the time being is another important factor. Melinda Rose (Haven Civic Choir) finds the ability of her conductor to be exacting yet positive as an important motivational factor. Additionally, Melinda finds her to be friendly yet not afraid to be hard on sections or individuals at times explaining that she strikes a satisfactory balance between being fussy and knowing when to let things slide for the moment.

This notion of the motivational qualities of the skill of a conductor was particularly evident when talking to Ryan Abraham (Haven Civic Choir) who appreciates, and is encouraged by, his conductor’s precision and aural skills. Ryan respects her ability to be tolerant of different musical styles and the way in which she is able to assist the choir to modify their approach to incorporate such diversity. In sum the overall manner and skill a conductor brings to the table is very important for the motivation and musical output of their ensemble.

6.3.8 Conductor Strategy

Several strategies used by the conductors to promote sustained motivation among their musicians emerged from the data. These include demanding a high standard, focusing on team building and promoting enjoyment through creating variety.

Looking at the demand for high standards first, from James Beach’ (Haven Civic Band) perspective, Marsha seems to concentrate on one piece for the majority of the rehearsal and through keeping a tight rein over the band focuses on the perfection of difficult pieces. On the other hand, the conductor of near-by Toppingham Brass approaches this demand for a certain standard from a different angle. James explains that he is much less controlling and plays a greater amount of repertoire in rehearsal and for James, this laidback atmosphere and approach is more motivating as he would much rather play music that is easy to play at a high standard than music that he can only just play.

Jayne Bath from Haven Civic Choir too sees the value in the demand of high standards yet suggests that how this is achieved is very important for motivation. Jayne explains that her conductor Belinda finds ways to be humorous despite the whole choir not paying as much attention as they should. She is able to demand a high standard without constant criticism therefore leading Jayne to feel guided rather than pushed and this she finds is an extremely motivational approach.
From a conductor’s perspective, Belinda Thomas (Haven Civic Choir) views her role in keeping her choristers life-long enjoyment and participation in music as extremely important. To this extent she tries to keep things fairly light hearted because she recognises that they have to enjoy what they are doing.

That’s why I use a lot of humour and things…when I know that they could do better…or to get them working harder I’ll put on the cross (face), I’m cross and I’m angry and they all know it was just a joke but it’s motivating them to get going to work harder (Belinda Thomas, Haven Civic Choir: Interview).

Belinda is aware that she needs to keep things light hearted to ensure that the choristers are enjoying the rehearsals and will therefore put in the work to achieve and maintain a high standard in performance. An example of this is if there is a passage that they are just not getting instead of just continuing to hammer it she’ll leave it and go home and work out another strategy to work on that passage. For example, if it’s a rhythmic issue Belinda might go home and develop a new warm-up for the following week which they will learn and then revisit the difficult passage.

An important strategy used by Marsha Jackman (Haven Civic Band) to promote motivation among members is to focus on team building and an all round team approach to practice and performance. Lisa Foote (Haven Civic Band) explains that Marsha has put in a lot of effort since being promoted from first Tenor Horn to conductor a few years ago. She works hard to make the group look and sound like a team for example rewriting parts if the music is too difficult for certain members of the band to manage. Additionally, Marsha gives a newsletter out when the band has something coming up to make sure everyone has everything, all the correct music in the right order and all the correct uniform to create that important team look.

The final strategy used to insight motivation was promoting enjoyment through creating variety in both rehearsal and performance. Belinda Thomas (Haven Civic Choir) tries to source music that her choristers would enjoy singing and in the last five years she has tried to find different events for the choir to sing at. As Belinda explains:

(The choir has got a) history behind them and I found that they get into this lilt just the same sort of things year in year out after about…ten years…with them I sort of felt we can’t keep doing the same thing it’s not self-motivating for me so what’s it doing to my singers? (Belinda Thomas: Interview).

As an example, in 2013 the choir experimented with a Cabaret style Christmas concert. It was the same repertoire, but a different structure and different venue resulting in a different kind of night and was a break from the traditional Christmas service; something which would hopefully raise the enthusiasm of the choristers. Other strategies Belinda uses to motivate choristers include showing recordings of the repertoire they are working on from sources such as You-Tube therefore encouraging choristers to listen to other choirs perform and helping them to realise that they should feel comfortable to suggest repertoire and having guest conductors come and teach new warm-ups and repertoire.

6.3.9 Conductor Motivation

When Belinda Thomas (Haven Civic Choir) and Marsha Jackman (Haven Civic Band) were asked about their primary motivation, the key reason they continue in
their conducting role despite the afore mentioned difficulties their answers were quite dissimilar. For Belinda she has enjoyed learning and performing advanced repertoire, being involved in local festivals, eisteddfods and events, getting to know the choristers and hearing the choir improve their skills. On the other hand, Marsha’s motivation stems from a desire to give back to the band that gave so much to her as a young musician and providing a service to the Haven community as a whole providing people an opportunity to become involved and learn an instrument when due to a range of factors would not be available elsewhere.

I feel like I’m continuing the band and not letting it cease…(for) those people who I got so much enjoyment from when I was growing up…It’s good to be able to help people too and see people enjoy music and give back to people who would not otherwise get it, who couldn’t afford it elsewhere or feel like their an adult and it’s too late for them. It’s good to see those people come and get some enjoyment out of it. (Marsha Jackman: Questionnaire).

6.3.10 Culture

Participants viewed culture not only as a community entity it was also considered in relation to the individual music groups founded in that community. Ryan Abraham’s (Haven Civic Choir) description of the culture of Haven is of a place with a very healthy musical environment especially for such a small rural community. Jayne Bath’s (Haven Civic Choir) response echoes this in that for a small community Haven’s music culture really is thriving. Jayne continues on to suggest that this is for two main reasons. Firstly, the fact that there are regular performances by professional music groups who come in from the city and secondly, that there are several tertiary qualified musicians who call Haven home, supporting and encouraging upcoming musicians by including them in community musical activity. Rose McIntyre (Haven Civic Choir) further supports this view explaining that there is a very strong focus on music that begins at the primary level with choirs and recorder groups.

As an extension of this, Rose McIntyre believes that the Eisteddfod is the main driving force behind the musical activities of the town. The local Music Festival is important because it brings in outside professional musicians to town and filters the experience out to the surrounding areas and because of these events music has great legitimacy within the community.

Arnold Marks (Haven Civic Choir) suggests that classically, Haven has a very strong musical culture. He goes on, however, to suggest that if you listened to the local radio station you would be forgiven for thinking that pop music was the be all and end all of musical taste. Ultimately, Arnold defines Haven as a conservative place explaining that it is not leading in musical participation but there is certainly a strong interest.

James Beach’s (Haven Civic Band) comments support Arnold’s opinion regarding the classical culture of Haven explaining that from his perspective there is a very strong Arts focus from within the Haven community but there are some elitist tendencies towards classical music and the Haven Symphony Orchestra. In this regard, the HSO is seen as the pinnacle of musical excellence in terms of general all round musicianship despite it only being active once a year. The Haven Civic Band falls below this even though it is a staple, a constant in the community.
Rebecca Smith (Haven Civic Band) also brought up the issue of a sense of elitism suggesting that while most groups are good to be involved in there is some snobbery that can put off some players. Occasionally there are people outside the band who want to pigeon-hole the Band to say it is not as good as other styles of playing and that they just play hymns and marches. However, Rebecca explains that the new Musical Director Marsha is trying to change this by projecting the Band’s image and therefore change the minds of those in the community. Belinda Thomas (Haven Civic Choir), however, disagrees with this contention describing a people who are open to try different things and accept all kinds of music. There is the folk element, choral, instrumental and these are open to both students and teachers so there is the trained and academic side but there is also a lot of music out in the community and the churches are also very active. So all together the music culture of the community is very open-minded and everyone is willing to have a go and it’s all very inclusive. Paul Munroe’s (Haven Civic Band) comments support this view that the musical culture of Haven and the surrounds is very good with little snobbishness and lots of talent. That people play together for the fun of playing.

In addition to the musical culture of the Haven community, participants also focused on the culture of their ensemble. In this regard the importance of a sense of pride and community involvement was one of the key issues raised.

From Marsha Jackman’s (Haven Civic Band) perspective the Haven Civic Band has a culture of community involvement and pride. In other words, musicians are made aware of the importance of being proud of not only who they are as individual musicians but also to take pride in who they are as a group and therefore to give back to the community which supports them.

An important aspect of pride is the image the ensemble projects out into the community. For as Marsha (Haven Civic Band) explains it is important, particularly in a small town, to encourage players to look tidy and be respectful at certain events and be part of the community. In this regard the Band has attempted to upgrade its image by changing the uniform to include a nice fitted black jacket, as well as update the repertoire to include not only hymns and marches from the past but also to add modern music such as Jazz and contemporary Popular charts.

Another important component of projecting a positive image out into the community is finding and maintaining a balance between preserving history while at the same time catering for modern tastes. In this regard as musical director Marsha Jackman (Haven Civic Band: Interview) aims to ‘honour tradition while also catering to contemporary audiences and members’. Despite this, the numbers at Haven Civic Band are falling, for some it is other commitments on Wednesday nights such as sport. While others come to a number of rehearsals and then decide that it’s more difficult than they expected and they just do not have the perseverance to continue.

Linking to the issue of dwindling numbers raises another aspect of a community culture of being able to encourage community members to take part in the ensemble. Ryan Abraham’s (Haven Civic Choir: Interview) response to this issue is that the Haven Civic Choir has a ‘lets try’ attitude towards encouraging people to sing and join the choir but also in terms of the way they embrace all styles of repertoire stepping out of their individual comfort zones to try something new.
Another aspect of ensemble culture is the focus on helping everyone to recognise that they are a vital part of the whole sound no matter which part they are playing. As Musical Director, Marsha Jackman (Haven Civic Band) sees it as her responsibility to make sure that there is a culture of encouragement within the band where by everyone’s individual contribution is meaningful and important to the band’s musical output. Feeling a sense of belonging at both the community and ensemble level is an important part of the culture of the Haven Civic Band. To this extent Marsha Jackman notes that the musical culture of Haven is very high, that there are many musicians in more than one ensemble and that if you are a musician you are known and always have a friend around town. Although she does mention that at times the band does not always show enough respect to senior or long standing members, which can be both difficult and frustrating. Despite this however, generally there is a sense of being part of a band ‘Family’ with strong feelings of friendship and community pride (Marsha Jackman, Haven Civic Band: Questionnaire).

6.3.11 Challenge

Several challenges faced by the two Musical Directors from Haven included: Ensemble focus, monetary concerns, dwindling numbers, and rigidness of structure.

The skill of the conductor to enforce a certain degree of focus during rehearsals while not minimizing enthusiasm, is vital for the success and productivity of the ensemble. Marsha Jackman (Haven Civic Band) explains that being Musical Director of the Band is a wonderful experience but it is also challenging particularly when members view Wednesday night rehearsals as an excuse to get together and make music when there is no direction or purpose to the rehearsal. Thus she sees it as her responsibility to alter this condition so that there is a focus on performance and sharing the music with the community.

Participant enthusiasm plays an important role in sustaining motivation, however, this can cause difficulties if it affects the focus and attention of the choir during rehearsals. Claire Smith (Haven Civic Choir) explains that the atmosphere of the Haven Civic Choir is one of great enthusiasm and while this does not affect the overall quality of the sound, it certainly has an impact on the learning process and therefore the difficulty level of the music selected. By way of explanation, Claire remarks that such levels of enthusiasm while also a positive in some respects, take away from the real seriousness of the rehearsal and results in it taking a surprisingly long time for the choir to learn new repertoire. However, if the choir adopted a ‘heads down attitude’ they would lose this atmosphere and consequently lose several of its singers and while Claire (Interview) would thrive in this level of seriousness, there would be others who would be ‘out like a shot.’

The financial situation of an ensemble if not managed efficiently can cause challenges in the future. The members of the Haven Civic Choir only pay eighty dollars a year. The financial impact of this is that when the choir needs to purchase more expensive pieces of music, the committee needs to ask individuals if anyone wishes to buy their own copy. Rose McIntyre (Haven Civic Choir) explains that the problem of this is that if the people ever leave the choir they will take their music with them leaving a reduced supply of copies.
Another source of challenge can be found in the rigidity of the choir’s systems and overall approach to repertoire and performance. Rose McIntyre (Haven Civic Choir) explains that for her the main frustration for choir members is that in general it is an elderly group that can be rather inflexible. The problem with this is that if the choir does not learn to change, grow and adapt from the traditions of its long history and begin including more modern music into its repertoire, it could eventually disappear. This causes problems of its own in terms of the growing division between members of the choir. In this way Melinda Rose (Haven Civic Choir) explains that there is an ongoing debate within the choir regarding the spread of the choir’s focus. Belinda Thomas (Haven Civic Choir) along with a considerable slice of the choir, is pushing for the inclusion of more modern music into the repertoire as a means to cater for broadening tastes and attract more young people to the choir. Despite this, past impressions of the Haven Civic Choir is that it has always been a classical ensemble and some members of the choir, including Melinda, want it to stay that way and not merge closer and closer to the model of the local contemporary vocal ensemble. The challenge of ever dwindling numbers is an issue that plagues many ensembles in towns across the country. The reasons behind this are as varied as the problem is ramped including the style of music undertaking, unrealistic expectations regarding accomplishments or ability, out migration and differences in opinion.

Members of the Haven Civic Choir suggest that despite the jovial rehearsal environment there are still, on a regular basis, people who come to the choir for one or two rehearsals never to return. Jayne Bath (Haven Civic Choir) suggests that perhaps the style of music does not suit them or they underestimate the amount of work that goes on behind the scenes to reach performance standard expecting to hear a polished sound during the early stages of preparation. This is particularly true at the beginning of the year when the choir is working towards the local Music Festival, where the repertoire is imposed, not chosen by, the choir and is ‘dreadfully ambitious’ and this can often scare away potential new members after only a single rehearsal.

Migration is another important issue faced by the ensembles in Haven. In this regard Ryan Abraham (Haven Civic Choir) explains that due to increased audience size and number of available musicians and singers, you would be forgiven for thinking that there would be more performance opportunities in Melbourne, compared to a small town like Haven. However, having previously spent time in Melbourne, Ryan has found that even though there are fewer people and events, there are more opportunities to perform in Haven because there are less performers available. This is not due to a lack of talent but rather because budding musicians at the primary and secondary level tend to leave town to follow a different career path when they finish school and the level of in migration is not large enough to sustain these numbers. (Ryan Abraham: Interview)

A further reason for the attrition of choristers is the sense of continually working towards a performance. Too often the choir is asked to perform in town and along with their regular performances such as the choral festival, the eisteddfod and various other civic functions, there is just too much pressure especially when people just want to sing for enjoyment, to revisit old repertoire and not be constantly focused on performance (Belinda Thomas, Haven Civic Choir).

The final challenge brought up by conductors is the difficulties or frustrations involved in working with adults. Belinda Thomas (Haven Civic Choir) explained that
sometimes she wishes she was working with children instead of adults because with children you can listen to something or just mention a bit about it and you can feel them become excited where as adults tend to be a bit more selective. With children you get to make decisions but with adults you do not want to be a control freak because there are thirty different opinions and in the end you have to choose one.

6.4. Conclusion

The numbers of the participating members from Haven Civic Choir and Haven Civic Band were rather strong.

The data showed that major reasons for their participation were making new friends with similar interests, to gain positive benefits in terms of their health and to gain an avenue of escapism from their everyday life.
Chapter 7: Aster Falls

Aster Falls is a relatively large remote town in Australia’s Northern territory. With a population of approximately 25,000 residents Aster Falls offers the charm of a remote country lifestyle with the conveniences of a larger township such as schooling options and a community Arts hub.

7.1 Aster Falls Town Band

Aster Falls Town Band is a community concert band open to all interested woodwind, brass and percussion players regardless of age or ability. The Band is extremely community minded and participates in many community functions and events including the Million Paws Walk, the Aster Falls Eisteddfod and services at any one of the local churches. The following paragraphs look into the lives of eleven members of the Aster Falls Town Band and the role Place plays in their lives as musicians residing in the Aster Falls community. Unfortunately, I did not gain complete access to any of the local schools in Aster Falls, however, I was able to interview two of their music teachers. Paul is a classroom music teacher at a local secondary school and Leanne works largely with instrumental students in multiple Primary schools. Results from these participants are included in chapter 7.2: Emergent Themes.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PARTICIPANT</th>
<th>AGE</th>
<th>ROLE</th>
<th>INSTRUMENT(S)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Alwin Franks</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Conductor</td>
<td>Clarinet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Samuel Pendal</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Player</td>
<td>Percussion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chester Green</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Player</td>
<td>Saxophone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charlie Chalk</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>Player</td>
<td>• Clarinet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Tenor Saxophone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Flute</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Piano</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carrie Roads</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>Player</td>
<td>Flute</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doug Higgins</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>Player</td>
<td>Clarinet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gayle Gray</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>Player</td>
<td>Clarinet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Garry Long</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>Player</td>
<td>Clarinet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jill Jones</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>Player</td>
<td>Trumpet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>James Carter</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>Player</td>
<td>Clarinet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mackenzie Black</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>Player</td>
<td>Flute</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 7.1: Participants from Aster Falls Town Band

7.1.1 Alwin Franks

Alwin is the conductor of the Aster Falls Town Band, a position he has held for several years. He is an ex-military bandsman and consequently competently plays several instruments including the clarinet and comes to the ensemble with a wealth of experience he hopes to share with anyone who will listen. Unfortunately, Alwin does not feel supported and appreciated by the other members of the band feeling he needs to be pleasant he needs to keep his opinions to himself for fear of being interpreted as ‘pushing pressure’ (Alwin Franks: Questionnaire).
7.1.2 Samuel Pendal

Samuel attended a school with a very vigorous music program with a commitment to the students believing anyone who wanted to learn an instrument had the opportunity to do so. From the age of approximately eleven, Samuel (Interview) wanted to play on the ‘coolest looking instruments’, the timpani, and he supposed if he was having lessons, he would be allowed to ‘muck around’ on them. From Year seven he took percussion lessons and has continued with music ever since except for a hiatus of approximately fifteen years while he was an academic in America, married and started a family. Samuel came back to music when he moved to Aster Falls because he felt there was a large hole in his life, and he realised that leaving music behind was a big mistake. It was at this time that he became a member of the Town Band.

Samuel explained that it was his early music teachers who have been his biggest mentors throughout his life, making a lasting and positive impression. They connected with him on a deeper level and gave him a love of music, which later became a need to participate.

Music is a vital aspect of Samuel’s life, which is why he returned to music after such a long break. He could no longer live without music in his life. However, this passion has nothing to do with performance but rather it is an issue of process. The way he learnt to think about the world happened at a time when he was playing, and he believes returning to music gives him back access to that part of his brain.

7.1.3 Chester Green

Chester is a saxophonist who first engaged in music at a young age after seeing a variety of musicians play in the community and at his school. For Chester his ongoing motivation stems from the feeling that playing is a stress reliever in his final year at school. Chester believes that being involved in music helps to keep his mind sharp and focused. At times this was made difficult by his friends, who think and act like his participation in music is a bit of a joke, but in many ways music is what got Chester through high school in that it calms him down and relieves his emotions.

Chester’s ultimate source of inspiration was his attendance at Generations in Jazz. Here, performing and listening to professionals and other schools perform who are at a much higher standard than himself or his school, was inspirational. It provided him with a goal to strive for and was simply a pivotal moment in his musical life.

7.1.4 Charlie Chalk

Charlie is a Year twelve student who received his first introduction to music as a young student in Sydney when his school was endeavouring to put together a band for their students. Charlie thought this would be an enjoyable outlet so, even though he desperately wanted to learn the oboe, because of his braces he decided to take up the clarinet. Now Charlie plays four instruments, clarinet (six years), tenor saxophone (one year), flute (two years) and piano (six months), participates in four community ensembles, and holds a music scholarship.

Charlie gains much support for his music from his family. For example, his Grandmother teaches music at the University level and plays the violin in an
orchestra. He also receives encouragement from his clarinet teacher who he says is very nice to the point where they are learning from each other and it is not a teacher constantly leaning over a student. They play music together and he makes music fun. Looking back to his first instrumental teacher, Charlie explains how important encouragement is right from the very beginning and he feels he received this support in the musical doors that were opened to him as a young beginner.

Charlie also explained that he gains a lot from his participation in music. There are many skills, Charlie contends, that come from playing music; life skills and brain skills, even physical skills and academic skills. Looking deeper at the academic skills, Charlie says he gains from music and we see skills such as comprehension, creativity and various tasks in Mathematics.

7.1.5 Carrie Roads

Carrie came to music as an adult shortly after moving to Aster Falls. There was a small ensemble of excited and enthusiastic people called the Celebration Flutes who helped her along the way as she basically taught herself to play. They not only assisted Carrie in her learning in a traditional way but also wrote parts especially for her, which they gradually increased in difficulty as she improved. Carrie does not know why she did not get the opportunity to learn earlier in life especially as she would consistently ‘play’ on the piano at her aunt’s house (Carrie Roads: Interview). She has always loved music so when the opportunity to learn the flute came up she jumped at it. Now, Carrie stays motivated because she enjoys playing with others and hearing the sound that is created when two or more people get together and make music.

Looking at how important music is in her life Carrie explains that music is neither her life nor her career (she is a retired primary school teacher), but rather music is part of her family life. She has many instruments at home; a piano, saxophone, flute, xylophone, bongo drums and a range of auxiliary percussion that her grandchildren make use of; they even put on little concerts for the family Christmas.

7.1.6 Doug Higgins

Doug began his musical journey at the beginning of the sixth grade in an American middle school. When students had the option to learn an instrument and join the school concert band, Doug decided to learn the clarinet. At this time music was big in Doug’s town and by the time he reached high school approximately one quarter of students were in the community concert band. He has a huge love of music stemming all the way back to these early experiences. I asked him what it is about the clarinet that he finds so special. Doug answered that as an instrument it has a great range and is flexible making it one of the easier instruments to orchestrate for. Now Doug plays the contrabass clarinet and professes to love playing the bass line because ‘it’s like you’re the rock that’s holding everyone else up’ (Doug Higgins: Interview). Additional motivation to play comes from the support of the community in the form of positive feedback following a performance and because of the community enjoyment Doug found that he wanted to find a way to get music to more people, so he formed a small wind ensemble for which he arranges or writes all of the music. He’s found it to be very well supported not only by the community but also by musicians who ask to be involved and find causes for which the ensemble can
contribute. In terms of the position of music in his life, Doug finds that it comes second to his family but upon further thought Doug explains that he does a lot of art and craft these days and that these activities together with music are on a balancing wheel for number two depending on what is happening in his life at the time.

Looking back to his first instrumental teacher in the band program at his school, Doug (interview) recalls someone who was extremely motivating and made it seem to him that the clarinet was the instrument to play even though at the time his classmates were more interested in percussion or the trumpet, he was a “fantastic role” model.

7.1.7 Gayle Gray

Gayle first became involved in music in late primary school when she began taking clarinet lessons with her mother who was the music teacher at her school. With both her parents’ being music teachers, Gayle feels that music plays a very prominent role at home. During her early lessons on the clarinet, Gayle was learning in a small group which she felt led her mother to step out of that mother/daughter relationship and act more professionally, yet still friendly. While she was a student up until Year twelve Gayle was a member of the Town Band and after a yearlong break Gayle realised how much she missed playing and socialising with her friends that she returned.

In regards to Place, every year Gayle inhabits the local Arts Centre, sometimes as a listener other times as a performer but she really likes the space. The main theatre has a large stage with orchestra pit and orange seats for the audience. In addition to the physical characteristics, Gayle is also drawn by the fact that every time she enters the orchestra pit for rehearsals and performance there is always something new to learn.

7.1.8 Garry Long

Garry first became interested in music in 1994 when his daughter joined a Concert Band that was just forming and he went along to the first rehearsal and thought that being able to be part of that sound was something he wanted to do. Now, Garry plays clarinet in the band and continues to enjoy it because of the social aspect, the joy of communal music making, the challenge of reading music and playing his clarinet to his best ability.

Considering how the members of the band offer support and encourage participation, Garry feels that conductor, Alwin, is constantly encouraging everyone to play at their best through clear instructions and Garry does not want to let him, or the rest of the band, down by playing too many wrong notes or inaccurate rhythms.

7.1.9 Jill Jones

Jill first learnt to play a range of brass instruments when she joined a local Brass Band after some of her friends expressed an interest she had a go at cornet, tenor horn, fugal and tuba however now she plays the trumpet. Now Jill remains in the band not because she enjoys the music as such but rather she is drawn by the social aspect of playing in a Band, which provides her with the opportunity to forge life long friendships. Jill gains support for her music making primarily from her family. Her father’s side all engage in musical activities predominately with the piano but she does have a young cousin who has just begun to learn the trumpet. The important
thing to note here is that the parents push music but not extensively. They allow their children to try anything they are interested in. After Jill joined the Brass Band it became a real family thing as others began to take up the opportunity to play brass and become a member of the band community.

Looking at how important music is in Jill’s life, she explains that she enjoys having music playing in the background whether it be from the radio or her ipod, it’s like a soundtrack to her life.

7.1.10 James Carter

James first got into music when he was in the north east of the Northern Territory where a grant was received to purchase all the instruments to form an orchestra, but there was no funding for tuition. Because his daughter was learning the clarinet, he had to help her through the beginner series of books and he worked to stay one lesson ahead of her. They also shared the one clarinet at this time. James continues to be involved in music because he sees it as being one part of a composite person, just as good for your brain as dancing, drama and running. Music is as much a part of him as any of these activities.

James (Interview) feels that he gains ongoing support not only from his fellow band members but also from his family. His children all played instruments during primary school and high school but they were never “soldiers” for music they just did not put in enough work however, they have never gotten in the way of him attending band. In regards to what he gains out of his participation in band James explains that it is all about the fun, the comradery and a means of giving back to the community.

In James’ opinion the Aster Falls Town Band attracts people who have aspirations of being in a community ensemble not only accomplished musicians or people who used to be accomplished, tired of it and want to return to music. In terms of his own role in the band James feels that he is one of the old members of the band and because of this as well as being president he believes that he can say whatever he likes and will be listened to. It is also his responsibility to ensure that the band is always a safe and fun environment.

7.1.11 Mackenzie Black

As a young child Mackenzie and his other three brothers were introduced into the local brass band at their father’s suggestion. He knew the conductor and arranged some lessons so that Mackenzie and his siblings had a fair idea how to play and read prior to actually attending their first band rehearsal. Now, Mackenzie remains motivated in his music not only because it is a social outlet but because it gives him personal pleasure. It is a stress relief from work because he has to concentrate on the breathing, the tone and the technique. It immerses him in a music world far removed from the pressures of everyday life.

Mackenzie usually practices and performs indoors, and the small flute choir usually practices in someone’s kitchen while the band rehearses in the music room at one of the local schools. He also plays at the church at his wife’s insistence and the wind ensemble busks at the local mall. However, Mackenzie’s ultimate Music Place is a cave in the Bungle-Bungles, which was said to have beautiful acoustics. Once, when he was visiting this cave he brought his flute along to test out the acoustics and even
though they were not as good as he was expecting, several people came up and thanked him for his music resulting in the cave becoming a special place to MacKenzie.

### 7.2 Emergent Themes

The following sections of this report explore the eight themes to emerge from Aster Falls:

- Personal and Musical Experience
- Safety, Comfort and Accessibility
- Belonging
- Collegiate Music Making
- Socio-economic status
- Conductor/Teacher Character
- Culture
- Challenge

Again I have separated several aspects of Place for greater clarity in discussion, however, these will be reconnected later in Chapter Eight for further analysis.

#### 7.2.1 Personal and Musical Experience

Exploring the data from Aster Falls, the ability of a Place to influence the formation of ideas and represent a communion between multiple aspects of the participants’ lives are very important components in developing and sustaining motivation in music. For Samuel Pendal the saying ‘Generals are always fighting their last war’ (Samuel Pendal: Interview) is an apt description for his music. In this way Samuel explains that where he played his last gig, whether it be classical or pub rock for example, informs his approach to the next, even if it is in a different genre. More specifically and because of this, Samuel’s Music Place is the annual local eisteddfod because, even though he is on the organising committee and somewhat struggles with his responsibilities with that, the eisteddfod is a safe space to try out new ideas, if they work great try them somewhere else if not you will know why. In other words, the eisteddfod is the difference between an interesting idea and actually experimenting with that idea with others.

Considering Places in terms of motivation and inspiration, for Doug Higgins, even though it is a mammoth task lugging all of the instruments and equipment, Ti Tree Mall has been an engaging and beneficial performance space because, as there is a market, there are many people about thus providing a perfect opportunity to busk for a worthwhile cause. However, Doug’s most important Music Place was found when the wind ensemble gave a performance of Baroque and Renaissance works at the studios of Craft Central. This is where Doug has his art studio and for him it was like all aspects of his life coming together and was most enjoyable. Examining the music environment of Aster Falls, Doug explains that for a town of its size it has a tremendous approach to the Arts, from the eisteddfod and the Arts Centre to the various craft spaces and art galleries there really is so many opportunities to get involved in the Arts.
7.2.2 Safety Comfort and Accessibility

In regards to the safety, comfort and accessibility of a Place this section explores how the ability of a Place to meet the participants’ needs; physically, emotionally and in terms of relationships, inform motivation to participate in instrumental music. Considering the music classroom as Place, Paul Smyth explains that the assignment of space is very important to the functionality of the room. Usually their senior classes are very small often with a maximum of around six and as part of their studies they have a theory and a practical component so the space is set up to reflect this. Looking at the music environment we see a school that is very busy in the Arts and many of the students are involved in some way. When the school is advertised it is put forward as being strong in the Arts and it helps that their Principal is also a musician because he also knows the value of music.

This idea is also of concern to Garry Long who practices in the spare room at his home because it is quiet and he can do what he likes without being disturbed. Therefore, Garry continues, this Place meets his needs as a practicing musician. In terms of his ultimate Music Place Garry explains that the community Arts Centre is a great space; the stage is of a good size and the acoustics are satisfactory, the dressing rooms are wonderful and it is also a fantastic rehearsal venue. Garry also tells us that the music environment of Aster Falls is quite rich due to the many influences that are active in town and the many opportunities that are available for musicians in different styles.

The safety and functionality of a Place is also important to James Carter who explains that his practice space is in the front room of his house. It is a quiet space in that if you close the door and shut the curtains little sound can escape making it a safe place to practice. The room is also a friendly space because it is where his musician friends gather round the Pianola and sing together. James’ most meaningful Music Place is the community Arts Center and even though the curtaining detracts from the sound somewhat playing in the orchestra pit holds great memories for James for example when the musical “Annie” came to town. (James Carter: Interview)

Exploring the safety of a Place a little further, Gayle Gray explains that her Music Place is the music room where the band rehearses. For her it is special because that is mostly where she pulls her clarinet out of its case and also it is the place where the band gets together and it is good to play music with other people in a safe and welcoming environment. Looking at the music environment of Aster Falls, Gayle feels that musicianship and music appreciation are not very prevalent or important. However, amongst those who play instruments the Town Band, its contribution to the community is very important.

Having everything you need within a particular space is very important to feeling a sense of Place. Here Carrie Roads refers to one’s physical needs such as the amount of space available and the objects within that space. Currently the band rehearses in the music room of the local high school, which is not surprisingly built for that purpose, but this has not always been the case. During the time when the band was told they could no longer rehearse at the school they were forced to meet in the Town Hall. It was big, cold, the acoustics were poor and there was nowhere to store their chairs, stands or music library. Charlie Chalk takes this discussion further to suggest that relationships formed in a Place are also important for motivation. For him, the
friendly atmosphere of his music room at school is also a vital ingredient for his motivation in the way that his teachers and peers support his efforts and appreciate his achievements in music. The relative safety and functionality of a Place are also important to Chester Green. His Music Place is his bedroom at home, which Chester views as being satisfactory for practice purposes although he does not enjoy practicing when other people are around. He is fearful that his sound would be a distraction for them. Chester's lesson space is also in a house but instead of being in a bedroom, it is in a room that has been purposely set up as a rehearsal space so the environment is more conducive to music making.

Charlie Chalk's interview demonstrates that there are certain attributes of Place that are conducive to effective practice and performance and those that are not. In terms of Place, Charlie practices at home in his bedroom but he does not have a music stand so he sits with incorrect posture and mostly just works on the fingering. The school music rooms are where he does most of his practice and school is also where he does most of his performance work, playing and arranging the music for school assemblies each week, playing for visiting dignitaries, and participating in the local eisteddfod this year. Looking at how these Places make Charlie feel in his music he explains that his bedroom is a relaxed environment so he does not practice very hard instead he fiddles around with the music in a creative manner creating something new which in turn assists him to better understand the structure of the music. He also enjoys playing at assemblies except when he feels he does not have enough time to put some creativity into his arrangements. When asked about his most influential Music Place, Charlie was very sure in his response: the music room. In his opinion it has everything he needs from computers and keyboards for composition, to practice spaces where he can work without being disruptive or being disrupted. Another positive aspect of the music room is his relationships to those who inhabit that space in particular the music staff who he describes as friendly and helpful. (Charlie Chalk: Interview)

In relation to the negative aspects of Music Places, Alwin Franks finds not having control of his own rehearsal space is a difficult issue to over-look. If he had his way Alwin would not change the rehearsal venue but he would grant the band greater access to it, he would have an office, a large library as well as practice rooms which he would open early for members to make use of.

7.2.3 Belonging

The manner in which one interacts with others in a Place and as a result builds for themselves a positive reputation and a sense of belonging is one of the positive influences on motivation to be discussed here. In this way, through her school instrumental program, Leanne Gray has a reputation within the community for providing students with a valuable and fun learning experience. Looking at the provision of opportunity further, Leanne suggests that being a small town Aster Falls has many opportunities for musicians that they would not have in the city because there are many more musicians of a higher standard and you would have to know someone or be prepared to audition to “get your foot into the door” (Leanne Gray: Interview). The importance of relationships in building a sense of belonging is still further highlighted by Jill Jones who explains that participating in music as part of the Aster Falls Town Band has given her enjoyment, achievement and importantly
friendship and it is because of these factors that Jill feels the band meets her needs as a practicing musician. Delving more deeply into the idea of friendships and belonging, James Carter says he continues to be involved in the Town Band because he sees all the musicians as being on the same page. Even though sometimes they do not agree on too much they all enjoy making music together and it is this combined strength that keeps the band going.

In terms of fitting in, the participants’ roles within the band informs the level of perceived belonging that individuals are able to obtain. In this regard, Gayle Gray feels a sense of belonging that she moves within the inner circle much more, she supposes, than the newer members. However, this was not always the case when her mother was the Musical Director and her sister played in the band. Gayle felt as though she didn’t really belong there in her own right but now she is the only one in her family to be a member of the Band, she feels that she has value as a musician and is not there just because her mother conducts.

Looking at the characteristics of someone who participants believe would fit in well with the current band and words appear like “regular attender”, “reliable” and “conscientious”. Garry Long (Interview) also added that these character traits rule him out. I asked Garry to explain this comment further. When he first started learning the clarinet and attending the local band in South Australia he was super keen, he progressed quickly and was an enthusiastic member of the band. Now in Aster Falls, Garry is teaching so in his opinion he gets all the social stimulus he needs and does not need the band to fulfil this human requirement. Doug Higgins expands on this idea further to say that someone who does, or wants to, participate in addition to endowing the characteristic mentioned above will also be engaged. Doug (Interview) explains that this is the biggest problem the band faces. By ‘engaged’ Doug is referring to the business of people, that everyone is engaged in so many different activities and has so many different commitments that band is not their primary focus.

Doug Higgins explains that inter-band relationships are not always as positive as they should be and this has a strong impact on belonging and overall enthusiasm. Doug’s relationship to his current conductor, Alwin Franks, reveals someone who is rather strict, who does not ‘mess’ with the adults of the ensemble too much, but is constantly pushing the youth to sit up straight, which Doug feels is a waste of time and feels that the younger players should not have to put up with that sort of thing in a voluntary ensemble. Doug feels over-looked perceiving that neither he nor his horn are liked very much by his conductor. Despite all of this, of the current band members the primary characteristic in Doug’s opinion is a strong sense of humour, which results in a friendly and light-hearted atmosphere. In his opinion this is important for a volunteer organisation.

Returning to a sense of belonging, Carrie Roads explains that at first her skills on the flute would have been too low for her to fit in with the Town Band and she feels that she would not have been accepted because of this even though in reality this is likely not to be the case. As her skills developed she joined the Band and she now feels that even though she is still at the lower end of the ability scale and misses quite a lot, nobody seems to mind. She feels comfortable, not pressured and has a strong sense of belonging and she feels part of the fabric of the band because she has been there for quite a long time. For Carrie, belonging is not a given phenomenon but rather a state that develops out of relationships as they build over time. Chester Green largely
agrees and suggests that part of feeling a sense of belonging is knowing that your voice is heard and not being afraid to express your opinions.

Similar to the Haven data there are several more aspects of belonging raised. The first comes from James Carter who suggests that belonging is about relationships and from a community band perspective. It is about cross-generational relationships based on mutual respect and fun. Gayle Gray sees belonging being about feeling a sense of security and support. Possibly the reason why Gayle does not like to try new repertoire is not so much a lack of skill but rather a sense that she was not supported and was fearful that she would make a mistake in front of everyone. Similarly, for Samuel Pendal, belonging is about feeling safe enough to be yourself and contribute to the group where you are able and not being afraid to ask for assistance when needed. A second point raised by Samuel is that belonging is having one’s own niche within the group and the sense of responsibility that comes with that.

Another issue to be raised here relates to the manner in which participation in music builds social bridges. An example of this comes from Samuel Pendal who works for the Land Council and part of his job is to support the Indigenous rangers. Every year they hold a camp with people coming from all over the Northern Territory representing fifteen to twenty different languages. On one occasion when they set up their instruments after hours for a jam session, with permission, Samuel joined in and from then on he became one of the crowd; he was accepted and language and race were no longer an issue.

Finally, in regards to the character of someone who would fit in well with the Aster Falls Town Band, Charlie Chalk suggests that they would be of medium skill, happy and bubbly. Even if they are a bit quieter in personality older band members would still come and talk to them and make them feel welcome. In terms of how Charlie sees himself belonging to the band he explains that he has many friends with whom he can joke around and play small pranks. However, there are some people who he does not get on so well with but that is a ‘minor issue’ (Charlie Chalk: Interview). Taking these ideas together it is evident that belonging has little to do with actual skill levels but rather has to do with the relationships one can forge.

7.2.4 Collegiate Music Making

In relation to the social aspects of music, participation can result in the forming of new friendships and the provision of support across various social strata. Garry Long explains that there is no one who supports his music; that in the past, his entire family; wife and three children, all used to play but currently they do not continue to be involved. I was interested in how Garry continues to be motivated without such support. In this regard, Garry explains that the community band as an institution is a great instrument for encouraging people to make music together and for him this social aspect of music is the reason why he continues to play.

Along similar lines, Carrie Roads has made quite a few good friends through her musical endeavours who support her and encourage her to play and get involved in various ensembles even when she was just beginning. I have already touched on an example of this, the Celebration Flutes, but there is something else I need to add. As a member of the Celebration Flutes, Carrie did not feel scared to make a mistake as
making a mistake would mean additional support and instruction. Even though the ensemble only got together once a month, part of the rehearsal would always be a party so during the playing time they would concentrate on the music and during the party they would indulge in wine and cheese while they enjoyed each other’s company.

The final aspect of Place comes from Samuel Pendal who responds that the importance of Place comes from the opportunities that are available within that Place. More specifically Samuel explains that the local eisteddfod is a vital forum for ideas, musical ideas within the community giving people the opportunity to explore and present their ideas for feedback and evaluation. The other important aspect of music that has motivated Samuel over the years is the realisation that music offers human connections. It cuts across social barriers including age, income and employment to the extent that if an old musician plays with a young musician then the music just seems to take over and age does not seem to matter any more and for a student at an age where their peer group is the most important aspect of their lives, this is a genuinely eye opening concept to learn. (Samuel Pendal: Interview)

Focussing back on the band as a whole and the characteristics that make a good member, Samuel Pendal outlines that the most important aspect is someone who always tries their best and listens to what is going on around them. Music making is somewhat of a conversation. If you are playing with someone who is a really “top notch musician” yet they are not listening to you it becomes very one-sided much like a conversation when one person does all of the talking and doesn’t listen to the opinions of the other person (Samuel Pendal: Interview). However, if you are playing within a band and everyone is listening to those around them the result is a blending of sound and a more enjoyable, worthwhile and importantly, satisfying experience, it is all about the relationships. The character of the band, Samuel suggests is very supportive of beginners offering them a safe space to play, learn and grow as musicians yet it is not below the more advanced musician. If you contribute that is great and if you have something to learn the environment is such that it is not embarrassing to ask for assistance.

7.2.5 Socio-economic status

Socio-economic factors play a huge role in Aster Falls. Looking at the economic aspect first there are many families in the community where the parents just do not have the money to pay for their child to be involved in the instrumental music program even though it is already heavily subsidised. As a way to allow these children to be exposed to music Leanne Gray has set up a bucket band, which is free for students. The school pays a flat rate for so many places and provides the drumsticks. Secondly, the socio factor also plays an important role as some parents do not work or they have not finished school themselves or they do not even read English and with these challenges it is not surprising that they do not value music making, therefore it can be difficult to give these children the opportunity.

In relation to Haven, there were several issues concerning socio-economic factors that arose: membership fee structure and the reducing of financial barriers, the effect of fees and payments on relationships and whether community groups should consider other options, rather than charging their members, to raise funds. Here, however, Samuel Pendal raises an additional point for consideration. There are no fees payable
for being a member of the Aster Falls Town Band so the financial concerns evident in Haven are not strictly relevant here. However, Samuel’s response suggests that socio-economic factors as they apply to the town band are less to do with money and more to do with time. In other words, even though one needs to have employment for financial security, heavy work commitments can impact on time to participate in community groups, and practice. In terms of the Aster Falls community in many cases the socio-economic situation of individuals and families is fairly low and being remote means that if instruments need repair you need to send it off to a capital city. The band does not charge subscription fees because otherwise their member base would fall because people could not afford it, or think they could not afford it; they are already stretched simply acquiring an instrument. (Alwin Franks: Interview)

Looking at Aster Falls in terms of social factors on a larger scale, Samuel Pendal discusses that the music environment is very much about variability; it is about feast or famine. By way of explanation, at one time you may be playing in several ensembles until one day a key member leaves the community and the band falls apart. This is a common occurrence in Aster Falls because the population is extremely transient. This has had a strong impact on the Aster Falls Town Band because it effects the instrumentation and consequently the balance of the ensemble. Looking more deeply at Place, Aster Falls is somewhere where you can try out new ideas that you would never even attempt in the city, maybe the city has a greater selection of more proficient musicians. The other advantage is the breadth of opportunities that are available to musicians in Aster Falls due to the smaller participant base.

7.2.6 Conductor/Teacher Character

Members of the Aster Falls Town Band hold differing opinions regarding the motivational properties of conductor Alwin Franks’ character. For Mackenzie Black, he believes that as a practicing musician, Alwin does little to motivate him to participate in band. In this way, Mackenzie observes that while Alwin is a nice man he just does not have the charisma of their previous conductor and has not seemed to motivate as many people to attend rehearsals. Even though Alwin selects repertoire to challenge the band, which is seen as a good thing, several people have left the band since Alwin has taken up the baton. From the perspective of the past, Mackenzie feels that he has never been motivated by his instrumental teachers nor band conductors. Instead he is motivated by personal factors and peer pressure, not wanting to be an embarrassment to himself. Looking at his current conductor Alwin, Mackenzie tells us that he has a background as a Military Bandsman and brings this experience to the band. He puts up a variety of challenging repertoire particularly Marches, which is something they did not get with their previous conductor. However, Mackenzie Black ultimately attends band, as was mentioned previously, for his own personal reasons and he supposes that Alwin does the same and it is this attitude that is not favoured by several band members.

In Gayle Gray’s opinion, Alwin Franks is very proactive about marches, which is something that Gayle is disappointed about because she wants to play the repertoire that the band used to play. She knows she can play this and she is not confident with new repertoire because her rhythm reading is not up to par. She also explains that Alwin is very good at offering her moral support, especially as she is trying to sight-
read a new piece reminding her to just have a go, that she can do it and that it does not matter if she makes a mistake. Despite his best intentions, some bandsmen have come to resent Alwin’s appointment as Musical Director. Along these lines, James Carter believes because Alwin is getting paid for what he does, he should be there and ready for the band. The band is starting to resent Alwin’s lack of time management in that they can be waiting for twenty minutes past the scheduled start time and sometimes even finish early. On a more positive note, James sees Alwin as being sharp and knowledgeable in music although there are some differences of opinion regarding Alwin’s role as a tutor for the band. Some people like to be able to ask questions, while others do not want to ‘waste’ time with Alwin’s answers instead preferring to just play what is in front of them. (James Carter: Interview)

In relation to musician/conductor relationships, Samuel Pendal enjoys creating music with Alwin Franks (musical director) because he has superb knowledge and encouragingly passes this on to the Band members in a way that makes necessary repetitions not only enjoyable but also informative. Alwin’s pet focus on tone is also a large motivator for Samuel in that he strives to draw out the best possible sound not only at the individual level but also between instrumental sections and indeed the entire band.

Also on a positive note, Chester Green (Interview) finds Alwin to be brilliant yet somewhat ‘weird’ but this seems to make band all the more enjoyable and interesting. In terms of repertoire, Chester believes that it is Alwin’s background as a musician in the military, which results in them playing a lot of marches and although Chester finds this satisfactory, he acknowledges that he craves to do something different every now and then. Despite this, Chester explains that he learns a lot under Alwin. He always offers helpful hints to improve the playing of individuals and ultimately, the band as a whole, he is always welcoming and never criticises which results in Chester feeling comfortable and motivated in his band participation.

For instrumental teachers knowing how to support and teach a beginner is vital to encourage a lifetime of enjoyment and ongoing participation in music. In this regard, Chester Green views his first teacher as someone with a lot of experience working with beginners which is a real positive as there are very few instrumental teachers in Aster Falls. In Chester’s opinion, Leanne, his first instrumental teacher, was a very friendly person, someone who has firm expectations for students in regards to practice but she also knew when to stop and when to go over something again. 7.2.7 Conductor/Teacher Strategy

The role conductors and music educators play in generating motivation among their charges is very important not only in terms of the day-to-day motivational focus of the individual but also in promoting sustained motivation over a much longer period of time. In regards to how Alwin Franks approaches the motivation of his ensemble he explained that it is about providing them with challenging music and answering questions the moment they are asked. Even though, as mentioned earlier, some of the older members find that answering questions is wasting the band’s time, those who ask the question find it validating. When asked how he endeavours to encourage musicians’ lifelong enjoyment and participation in music, Alwin states that he tries to
make the rehearsal fun and turns up every week. If the individual musicians do also then they get his expertise and if not then he cannot do any more.

The provision of performance opportunities can be a strong source of motivation for students and community music participants. In this way, Aster Falls instrumental teacher Leanne Gray primarily motivates her students through encouraging them to take up various performance opportunities that are available to them such as performing at school assemblies. Additionally, Leanne also works through an instrumental tutor book with her students and finds that ticking off and dating the pieces once they are accomplished is also a source of motivation. As Leanne teaches mostly young students, usually from Grade four to Grade six, she finds that for many of them learning an instrument is the first time they have noticed music so they are not always interested in practicing and she finds that if she pushes it then it might upset the apple cart for some so it is all about making learning fun. I asked Leanne Gray about how she sees her role in encouraging her students’ lifelong enjoyment and participation in music and she explained that this is the most important part of her role in teaching these young students. It is about giving them the chance to make music with others and see that it is a community thing.

Regarding music participation in schools, we see how Paul Smyth and his colleagues set about motivating their students in music, but he tells us that at a basic level it is difficult because they are competing against other areas such as computing and physical education. For Paul, motivation is about directing the program towards something that the students actually want to do, something they are interested in. In this case each term the music department holds a rock band competition and have introduced ukuleles into the classroom program both of which they hope will lead students to taking up an instrument like guitar in the instrumental program. For the classical musician, the school encourages them to perform at assemblies for credit and they also hold a soiree, which is mainly for the senior students although junior students are allowed to perform as well. Paul sees his role encouraging music in the life of his students as very important. He encourages them to not only learn an instrument but also to see and appreciate the music in their lives, he sees it as a means of helping the child become an adult a well rounded adult. Looking at Paul Smyth’s role in supporting students’ aspirations for the future and the role of music in their lives after school he tells us that he plays a very specific role. He endeavours to assist students to realise that music is a life long learning skill that it is important to have even if it is just a side activity to work.

7.2.8 Culture

In Haven, culture was about the strong Arts focus within the community as well as involvement and pride within these structures. Here, however, Chester Green’s response suggests that the music environment in Aster Falls is very much unseen, in other words it is not as public as that existing in Haven. Despite this, Chester goes on to explain that if you really want to participate in music and know where to look then you will find someone willing to make music with you.

The music environment in Aster Falls is lead by the schools. Leanne Gray travels around to the schools and teaches a range of instruments to the students and forms a small band-like ensemble, and without her school music would be seriously depleted.
Schools also seem to enjoy having a little choir of their own which Leanne often polishes leading up to performances like the annual eisteddfod. In terms of the wider community, James Carter feels that the council just maintains the band to uphold and promote its public image and this together with the Arts Centre suggests that music is an important part of the life of the town.

7.2.9 Challenge

While there are many positive aspects related to participation in music, there are also a few negative components or frustrations and challenges inherent in running school music programs and community ensembles. As a member of a community ensemble particularly in rural and remote areas one is likely to find that they are always on the look out for new members. This is certainly true for the Aster Falls Town Band as due to the transient nature of the population the instrument combination and ultimately the balance of the band changes from one year to the next. With this in mind I asked Carrie Roads how she would describe the band to someone who she was trying to encourage to join. Carrie’s answer included that the band is a friendly and all encompassing group who are accepting of musicians of every standard. They play a broad range of music from marches to concert works to suit the diverse events at which they are invited to perform.

Looking now at the more negative side of things, some teachers at the local schools do not support the performing arts because they do not understand the importance, difficulty and integrity of these subjects. This poses particular difficulties when students need to be removed from their regular classes to attend their instrumental lessons. Not only is this difficult from a timetabling point of view, it also poses difficulty from a financial perspective as the money that parents pay for music lessons does not cover the whole cost of the program. (Paul Smyth: Interview)

In terms of how Leanne Gray uses her classroom space she usually begins with the students in a row for a warmup or to play a piece all together, then she asks her students to spread out around the room so she can give them all a little bit of individual time. Leanne goes on to explain that the music environment at the six government primary schools where she teaches is, in general, not all that great. In one of the schools the Principal is a musician and supports her program because he knows the value of it whereas the other schools do not seem to think about how what they do effects her teaching and this is a real frustration.

As a musician in Aster Falls, Charlie Chalk feels that the town meets his needs, just. He attends a school that has several ensembles and the town supports a community concert band and other smaller groups of various combinations and styles. In total Charlie believes that there is a medium level of music participation in Aster Falls and as a musician there are enough options to keep you busy you just have to go looking and you will be welcomed in with open arms. Where the problems are, is that there are not enough people sitting for music examinations for the A.M.E.B (Australian Music Examinations Board) to send up an assessor so Charlie has to record his program and send it be assessed. The other issue is Charlie Chalk feels that because he is of grade six standard currently that the town will not be able to support him beyond this level and he will have to move to the city.
7.3 Conclusion

The participation rate for my research among members of the Aster Falls Town Band was relatively high and consequently the data revealed a rich and diverse picture of the musical lives of these ensemble members. What remains is an in-depth examination of the sum of the emergent themes from both Haven and Aster Falls and a discussion of the possible implications of these results for instrumental music participation.
Chapter 8: Comparing sites

In chapters five to seven I have presented a picture of the people within the community ensembles under study and I have briefly explored emergent themes such as socio-economic status, culture, belonging and aspects of Place. In this chapter I will draw these together through an examination of the quantitative data to emerge through my research moving towards chapter 9 where I will gather these ideas together with the qualitative data to explore how the concept of ‘Music Places’ informs prolonged and situational motivation.

8.1 Framework for Analysis

The diagram below (see figure 8.1) acknowledges three distinct constructs:

1. Place (Kudrayevtsev, Stedman and Kransny, 2012)
2. Music Motivation (Kokotsaki and Hallam, 2007)
3. Goal Orientation (Elliot and Harackiewics, 1996)

These constructs interact in a web of meaning, which enabled me to interrogate the meaning of Place theory for music educators, students and musicians alike. Definitions for each of these theories and a picture of how these were explored in the available literature review has already been presented in Chapter Two. Below I will simply demonstrate for illustrative purposes, some ways in which these constructs may be conceived.

Figure 8.1 Framework for Analysis: Based on Kudrayevtsev, Stedman and Kransny (2012), Kokotsaki and Hallam (2007) and Elliot and Harackiewics (1996).

‘Music as a Musical Act’ (Kokotsaki and Hallam, 2007) correlates with ‘Mastery Goal Orientations’ (Elliot and Harackiewics, 1996) in terms of being motivated in music for musical gain; practicing to better all round musicianship and to acquire greater musical understanding. ‘Mastery Goal Orientation’ supports these foci in so far as it is about working to improve for individual reasons that is working at task mastery, rather than being concerned with appearances and how others perceive you. As a result of this, for the purpose of this research, I have altered Kokotsaki and Hallam’s (2007) and Elliot and Harackiewics’ (1996) two constructs as mentioned here, combining them to create ‘Music as a Mastery Act’ which by definition means participating in music for the purpose of acquiring greater skill and knowledge and working towards this goal to gain mastery rather than be concerned with how you and your music are perceived by those around you.
‘Music as a Mastery Act’ also relates to a key component of Place namely ‘Place Meaning’ (Kudrayavtsev, Stedman and Kransny, 2012). Music is abound with meaning: the meaning of the composer, how it speaks to the musician and their audience and its role within cultural and historical contexts. These meanings can be linked to a physical or even mental Place either visited or unvisited and it is the links forged by content and setting which, in turn, influence how the music, is perceived by the individual and others.

‘Music as a Social Act’ (Kokotsaki and Hallam, 2007) is connected to ‘Place Attachment’, ‘Place Identity’ (Kudrayavtsev, Stedman and Kransny, 2012) as well as ‘Goal Orientations’ (Elliot and Harackiewies, 1996). The Social Act of music is a basic human need for companionship and a sense of belonging in so far as the relational links we forge with others in a Place. These links might be with fellow members of an ensemble whom the individual may not see outside of the rehearsal environment or a connection that is formed between the performer and their audience. ‘Place Identity’ defines us in relation to others. This can be both positive and negative in so far as we may see ourselves as a contributing member of an ensemble or, at the other end of the spectrum, as a musician who is a drain on the ensemble, not living up to the standards set by the rest of the group. This is where ‘Performance Approach’ and ‘Performance Avoid’ fit into the picture.

The relationship between ‘Place Dependence’ (Kudrayavtsev, Steadman and Kransny, 2012) and ‘Music as a Personal Act is evident in the way people participate in music for extra-musical gain such as rewards or assurances (we either want or need) and the way that participation in music addresses these.

### 8.2 Haven Civic Band

This section focuses on Goal Orientation and how relevant this construct is in the lives of participants from Haven Civic Band. I also examine how Music as a Mastery Act relates to Place and participation in music for musical reasons. Following this Task Value, Psychological Sense of School Membership (Goodenow, 1992), Starting Age and Gender will also be discussed.

Ames (1992b) proposes that if a person is led by Mastery Goals, either in relation to themselves or a group, they will be focused on learning and improving. Importantly people espousing this goal will believe that ability is changeable and related to effort. Mastery Goals both at the individual and ensemble levels are certainly, on average, the most prominent (Figure 8.2). This is particularly true for Rebecca Smith whose results, indicate that both Mastery constructs were rated full marks (7). This may suggest that for her Classroom and Personal Mastery Goal orientations may interact having some kind of influence on each other. In other words, for Rebecca, her own personal outlook may influence how she perceives the goal orientation of the ensemble or visa versa. In support of these results, for Rebecca, practicing her instruments and therefore growing as a musician a little each day in terms of reading and the sound she is able to produce is a very important part of who she is. In terms of her high results for ‘Classroom Mastery Goal Structure’ Rebecca feels attendance at band rehearsal is not solely about the music but rather it is about how as a group they are able to improve their skills and musicality by tackling challenges as part of a team. Both James Beach (6.5) and Paul Munroe (6) also rate Personal Mastery Goals
prominently. By way of example, James in his interview shares that he practices his cornet and trumpet not to be better than everyone else but to get to a standard where he can play something that is more motivating than what the repertoire he is currently working on.

Also interesting to notice is the disparity between Classroom Performance Goals and Personal Performance Goals. According to Pintrich and Schunk (2002), those who espouse a performance goal work for public recognition, they aim to achieve success with very little effort, and evaluate their achievements according to the works of others. Elliot and Harachiewics (1996) and Elliot and McGregor (2001) explain that a Performance Orientation can be divided into two distinct constructs: Approach and Avoid. According to the diagram presented as figure 3.2 on page 37 those who follow either of these constructs are concerned with norm-referenced markers of ability, while those espousing a Performance Approach goal desire to gain positive judgements while Avoid goals are based on the aim to avoid negative judgements. In this regard each individual rated classroom Approach Goals more favourably than individual Approach Goals. This indicates that for participants performance approach goals are more relevant at the classroom level. However, ratings for a Performance Avoid orientation yielded a mixed result. Rebecca and James indicated that Performance Avoid characteristics are more prominent at the ensemble level whereas the opposite is true for Mark, Lisa and Paul.

Looking at this with a more focused perspective as Table 8.1, there is an interesting result. Each of the participants rated the item ‘In our ensemble, playing your part correctly is very important’ positively (i.e. between five and seven). What is interesting however, is how each of the participants interpreted the statement. Firstly, the participant may have responded with their mind on playing correctly as a means to improve personal and ensemble musicianship and as a way to improve the quality of their musical output and give pleasurable experiences to their audience. Alternatively,
participants could have been referring to wanting to play correctly so as to not embarrass themselves in front of the group.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Rebecca Smith</th>
<th>James Beach</th>
<th>Mark Foote</th>
<th>Lisa Foote</th>
<th>Paul Munroe</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>In our ensemble, playing/singing your part correctly is very important.</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In our ensemble, getting positive feedback is the main goal</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In our ensemble, learning new things is very important.</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At rehearsals, it’s ok to make mistakes as long as you are learning.</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In our ensemble, trying hard is important</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In our ensemble, how much you improve is really important</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In our ensemble, showing others that you are not a bad musician is really important</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In our ensemble, it’s important that you don’t make a mistake in front of everyone</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In our ensemble, it is important not to play/sing worse then everyone else</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One of my goals is to master a lot of new skill on my instrument this year.</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It’s important to me that I improve my skills on my instrument this year.</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One of my goals is to show other people that I am good at music.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It is important to me that I am a better musician than others in this ensemble.</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One of my goals is to show others that music is easy for me.</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It is important to me that I don’t look like a bad musician at rehearsals or in performance.</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One of my goals is to prevent others from thinking that I’m a bad musician</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One of my goals at rehearsals and in performance is to avoid looking incompetent</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8.1 Haven Civic Band: Performance Orientations

This incongruity can be resolved by examining the response for item nine, ‘It’s important to me that I don’t look like a bad musician at rehearsal or in performance’. On the whole the majority of participants were either neutral or negative towards this item except for Mark and Lisa. This suggests that for the most part, participants were thinking about developing skills and improving output in their response to item one.

This notion is clarified by looking at results for question statement “At rehearsals it is ok to make mistakes as long as you are learning” which shows that Rebecca, Mark
and Paul see making mistakes as an important part towards bettering your musicianship and as a result playing your part correctly, where as James and Lisa seem to believe that it is more important not to make mistakes as part of the learning process perhaps for reasons of not recognising that improvement is better than perfection which, according to Musical Director Marsha Jackman, is the philosophy upheld by the ensemble. In accordance to this philosophy and because reference was not made to social or musical insecurities; positive results for items ‘One of my goals is to master a lot of new skills…’ and ‘It’s important that I improve my skills on my instrument…’ indicate that the need to master and improve skills is for musical reasons.

Examining Goal Orientation from the perspective of starting age (Figure 8.3) yields some interesting results. Personal Performance Avoid orientation received the highest ranking (7) from Haven Civic Band members who began their instrumental education in primary school. It is significant to note that the opposite was true for those with a secondary school beginning who collectively rated the Personal Performance Avoid orientation with a low negative result (2). This suggests that young beginners may be more concerned with how their emerging ability compares to their peers while the secondary school starters are more likely to hold a self-referenced understanding of ability, which, is supported by their collective high score (6.5) for a Personal Mastery Approach.

![Figure 8.3 Haven Civic Band: Goal Orientation – Starting Age](image)

Considering Goal Orientation from the perspective of gender the highest result (Female 5.67 and Male 5.75) was given to the Personal Mastery Orientation. While at the other end of the scale Males collectively rated Performance Approach with 3.17.
The following collection of figures and tables explores how the participants value the learning that takes place inside their rehearsals. It considers whether the subject matter and skills explored and learnt, that is the repertoire and music technique, are liked and the degree to which they are understood. It also studies whether the subject matter and skills are considered to be useful to the participant and their beliefs regarding transfer. Transfer is the way in which learnt skills and subject matter in one area, in this case instrumental music, can be applied to life and other learning situations beyond the immediate rehearsal.

Figure 8.5 and Table 8.2 show that participating members of the Haven Civic Band all positively rate Task Value. However, of item ‘I like what I learn in rehearsals’ is where the greatest divide is evident ranging from Lisa (3) and Rebecca (7). This result is not unexpected considering that for both Avoiding Novelty that is wanting to play music that you already are familiar with so as to not appear incompetent, and Self-Handicapping which is taking action to either physically or mentally put in place a strategy so that if you do not perform well you can blame the strategy as the course. Lisa rates the highest of all the participating band members (see figures 8.6 and 8.7).

Item 3 ‘I think what I do in music is useful for me to learn’ was labelled strongly in the affirmative by all participating Haven Civic Band members. Rebecca Smith and Paul Munroe responding strongly agree (7) while the remaining members, James Beach and Mark and Lisa Foote, responded with a 6. This result is supported by participants rating for the question relating to the importance of understanding what is taught in rehearsals and the item relating to transfer, that is using what is learnt in music outside of rehearsal. Overall the results for Task Value presented here reflect Marsha Jackman’s approach to conducting the ensemble in her leading of warm-ups that promote musicianship skills, counting and playing in ensemble; skills that can be of great use outside of the immediate rehearsal. However, her attempt at selecting repertoire that will challenge yet not alienate certain junior musicians, encouraging...
them to enjoy the music and therefore be motivated to practice between rehearsals has so far been unsuccessful according to the largely mixed result (from 3 to 7) for item 1.

An examination of Figure 8.8 indicates that even though Primary beginners have the strongest result Task value followed closely by adults there is no significant difference between the three categories for starting age. There is also no significant difference in results for Gender presented as Figure 8.9.

![Figure 8.5 Haven Civic Band: Task Value](image)

**Figure 8.5 Haven Civic Band: Task Value**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Task Value</th>
<th>Rebecca Smith</th>
<th>James Beach</th>
<th>Mark Foote</th>
<th>Lisa Foote</th>
<th>Paul Munroe</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>6.75</td>
<td>5.25</td>
<td>6.25</td>
<td>4.75</td>
<td>6.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| I like what I learn at rehearsals | 7 | 4 | 5 | 3 | 5 |
| Understanding what I learn in rehearsals is very important to me. | 7 | 6 | 7 | 5 | 6 |
| I think what I do in music is useful for me to learn | 7 | 6 | 6 | 6 | 7 |
| I think I will be able to use what I learn in music outside of rehearsal | 6 | 5 | 7 | 5 | 6 |
| I think I will be able to use what I learn in music outside of rehearsal | 6 | 5 | 7 | 5 | 6 |

**Table 8.2 Haven Civic Band: Task Value Breakdown**
Figure 8.6 Haven Civic Band: Avoiding Novelty

Figure 8.7 Haven Civic Band: Self-Handicapping

Figure 8.8 Haven Civic Band: Task Value-Starting Age
As a means to quantifiably examine the three constructs: Music as a Social Act, Place and Performance Goal Orientations, I have used Goodenow’s (1992) Psychological Sense of School Membership Scale (PSSM) to measure musicians’ sense of belonging to their ensemble, whether they are liked or not for being themselves, whether they feel they have the respect of others, particularly from their Musical Director, and whether they experience Pride as a result of being a member of the group.

Looking at Haven Civic Band, and Figure 8.10 (below), most members average score for the PSSM scale is between four and six which suggests that the majority feel a positive relationship towards the band and those in it (Rebecca Smith and Paul Munroe: 6, James Beach: 4.82 and Mark Foote: 5). Lisa Foote on the other hand scores just above a two (2.36) indicating that her feelings towards these same areas is largely negative.

Table 8.3 (below) shows a more detailed breakdown of these results and for item “I feel very different from most of the other musicians in this ensemble” the results range from the majority of four to one five from Mark Foote. This result may suggest that while the statement was intended to refer to feelings of isolation resulting from difference the participants may have interpreted the statement as meaning ‘difference’ as both isolation as well as individuality and given that these two contracts represent
opposite ends of the scale it is not surprising that the results centered around a four ‘neither agree or disagree’.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Rebecca Smith</th>
<th>James Beach</th>
<th>Mark Foot</th>
<th>Lisa Foote</th>
<th>Paul Munroe</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sometimes I feel as if I don’t belong in this ensemble. *</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I wish I were in a different ensemble. *</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The other musicians in this ensemble like me the way that I am.</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I feel very different from most of the other musicians in this ensemble *</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I feel like a real part of this ensemble</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other members of this ensemble take my opinions seriously</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our musical director/conductor respects me</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I can really be myself at rehearsals</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I feel included in this ensemble</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In this ensemble there is at least someone I can talk to if I have a problem</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I feel proud of belonging to my ensemble</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8.3 Haven Civic Band: PSSM Items

The breakdown of results show why Lisa Foote’s average result for this scale is so different from everyone else. For example, she does not feel like she belongs, she does not feel that she is taken seriously nor has that respect that everyone craves and she does not feel that there is anyone in the ensemble that she can turn to if she is experiencing a problem.

After examining the results of the PSSM on a broad scale I was interested to see whether the age the individual first came to learn their instrument and gender influenced the results in any way. Figure 8.11 explores these ideas and, even though the results are close, highlights that the younger the starting age, the greater the sense of belonging and that males experience higher levels of belonging than females. However, these possible correlations still need to be confirmed and this will be somewhat achieved, (at least in a preliminary way) by further examination of the results for both the Haven Civic Choir and the Aster Falls Town Band.
Linking in with the goal orientation profiles I have been building throughout this chapter the focus now turns to extrinsic and intrinsic goal characteristics. The majority of band members recognise in themselves both intrinsic and extrinsic characteristics (Table 8.4 and Figure 8.12). Therefore, and tying into Performance Goals, many members believe that while it is important to demonstrate ability, perform better than others and be tangibly rewarded it is also important to seek challenge to improve musical knowledge and skill.

![Figure 8.11 Haven Civic Band: Starting Age and Gender](image)

### Table 8.4 Haven Civic Band: Extrinsic and Intrinsic Goal Orientations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Rebecca Smith</th>
<th>James Beach</th>
<th>Mark Foote</th>
<th>Lisa Foote</th>
<th>Paul Munroe</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I want to perform well because it is important to show my ability to my family, friends and others.</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>If I can, I want to play/sing better than most of the other people in this ensemble</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Being rewarded or congratulated for a good performance is the most important thing</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At rehearsal I prefer repertoire that really challenges me so I can learn new things</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At rehearsals I prefer repertoire that challenges me, even if it is difficult to play</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Being interested in how starting age can effect the formation of goal profiles, I explored this by constructing Figures 8.13 to 8.14. Looking at intrinsic goals first we see that these are more likely to be stronger in persons who began music tuition at a pre-adult age. The same is true for the Haven Civic Band and the Aster Falls Town Band in relation to intrinsic goals. However, in terms of extrinsic goal ratings below four were evidenced in the results for all three ensembles indicating that intrinsic goals are more evident in the individuals own goal orientations.
Figure 8.12 Haven Civic Band: Extrinsic and Intrinsic Goal Orientation

Figure 8.13 Haven Civic Band: Intrinsic and Extrinsic Goal Orientation-Starting Age
8.3 Haven Civic Choir

Examining the Classroom and Personal Mastery Goals of the Participants from Haven Civic Choir (Figure 8.15 and Tables 8.5 and 8.6) every chorister except Jayne Bath rate classroom Mastery Goals either equal to, or mostly, above their own personal Mastery Goals. This differs from the Haven Civic Band, where results were much more evenly spread. Perhaps this finding is largely to do with the philosophy of their Musical Director Belinda who is trained as a music educator and transfers her skills and beliefs in this area over to her leadership of the choir. Interestingly, there are a number of choristers, Jessica Small (2), Haylee Reade (1.5), Raymond Tunks (3.5), Rose McIntyre (3.5) and Eliza Stall (3), who rated their own personal Mastery Goal Orientations below four indicating that they do not see this characteristic as being relevant to them and their experience of music participation. Therefore, in these cases it is perhaps safe to extrapolate that there is minimal interaction between their experience of their choir and their own individual Mastery Goal Orientations.

Examining Figure 8.16 ‘Starting Age’ reveals that there is no significant difference between those with a Primary, Secondary or Adult start to music for Personal Mastery, Performance Approach or Performance Avoid or similarly for Classroom Mastery, Performance Approach or Performance Avoid. Interestingly, however, comparing results across all examined Goal Orientations the lowest result was given for Personal Performance Approach (Primary: 2.9, Secondary: 2.17 and Adult: 2.76). Results for Performance Avoid Orientation were also largely negative (Primary: 3.62, Secondary: 4.59 and Adult: 3.62), which suggests that a desire to either have one’s ability positively compared to other choristers or avoid negative judgements of ability as compared to others is not of great concern to members of the Haven Civic Choir. In Figure 8.17 it is clear that comparisons by gender yield very close results for each of the examined Goal Orientations. This suggests that gender has no significant effect on the way that members of the Haven Civic Choir feel about their Goal Orientation.
One of my goals is to master a lot of new skills on my instrument this year.

It’s important to me that I improve my skills on my instrument this year.

In our ensemble, learning new things is very important.

AT rehearsals, it’s ok to make mistakes as long as you are learning.

In our ensemble, trying hard is important.

In our ensemble, how much you improve is really important.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Gemma Thomas</th>
<th>Jessica Small</th>
<th>Melinda Rose</th>
<th>Arnold Marks</th>
<th>Claire Smith</th>
<th>Janice Beach</th>
<th>John Sea</th>
<th>Jayne Bath</th>
<th>Haylee Reade</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>One of my goals is to master a lot of new skills on my instrument this year.</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It’s important to me that I improve my skills on my instrument this year.</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In our ensemble, learning new things is very important.</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AT rehearsals, it’s ok to make mistakes as long as you are learning.</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In our ensemble, trying hard is important.</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In our ensemble, how much you improve is really important.</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
One of my goals is to master a lot of new skill on my instrument this year.

It's important to me that I improve my skills on my instrument this year.

In our ensemble, learning new things is very important.

At rehearsals, it's ok to make mistakes as long as you are learning.

In our ensemble, trying hard is important.

In our ensemble, how much you improve is really important.

Table 8.6 Haven Civic Choir: Item Statements 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Hilary Adams</th>
<th>Lauren Twee</th>
<th>Ryan Abraham</th>
<th>Raymond Tunks</th>
<th>Harry Lake</th>
<th>Catherine Lock</th>
<th>Rose McIntyre</th>
<th>Eliza Stall</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>One of my goals is to master a lot of new skill on my instrument this year.</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It's important to me that I improve my skills on my instrument this year.</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In our ensemble, learning new things is very important.</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At rehearsals, it's ok to make mistakes as long as you are learning.</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In our ensemble, trying hard is important</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In our ensemble, how much you improve is really important</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 8.16 Haven Civic Choir: Goal Orientation-Starting Age

Figure 8.17 Haven Civic Choir: Goal Orientation-Gender
Examining the Haven Civic Choir (Figure 8.18 and Tables 8.7 to 8.8), in terms of Task Value a similar trend to the Band is identified. In this case like the band everyone rates Task value in the affirmative indicating that they each recognise, to various degrees, Task Value as an important component to their participation. More specifically however, eight of the sixteen participants rated Task Value highly that is between 6 and 7 on the seven-point scale. Additionally, Claire Smith, a music teacher, rated Task Value as a very high 7 on par with Catherine Lock, the significance of this point will be made clear when looking at the results from Aster Falls. Also similarly to the results from Haven Civic Band examining the results by Starting Age (Primary: 5.64, Secondary: 6 and Adult: 5.43) or Gender (Female: 5.48 and Male: 5.36) yields no significant finding.

![Figure 8.18 Haven Civic Choir: Task Value](image)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Gemma Thomas</th>
<th>Jessical Small</th>
<th>Melinda Rose</th>
<th>Arnold Marks</th>
<th>Claire Smith</th>
<th>Janice Beach</th>
<th>John Sea</th>
<th>Jayne Bath</th>
<th>Raymond Turks</th>
<th>Rose McAuley</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I like what I learn at rehearsals</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Understanding what I learn in rehearsals is very important to me.</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I think what I do in music is useful for me to learn</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I think I will be able to use what I learn in music outside of rehearsal</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8.7 Haven Civic Choir: Task Value
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Hilary Adams</th>
<th>Lauren Twee</th>
<th>Ryan Abraham</th>
<th>Raymond Tunks</th>
<th>Harry Lake</th>
<th>Catherine Lock</th>
<th>Rose McIntyre</th>
<th>Eliza Stall</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I like what I learn at rehearsals</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Understanding what I learn in rehearsals is very important to me.</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I think what I do in music is useful for me to learn</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I think I will be able to use what I learn in music outside of rehearsal</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8.8 Haven Civic Choir: Task Value 2

![Graph showing Task Value (TV) for different age groups](image)

Figure 8.19 Haven Civic Choir: Task Value-Starting Age

![Graph showing Task Value (TV) for different genders](image)

Figure 8.20 Haven Civic Choir: Task Value-Gender
Looking initially at the results from the Psychological Sense of School Membership (PSSM), on the whole (Figure 8.21) on average, the sense of belonging on average appears to be higher than what we saw with the Haven Civic Band. In the breakdown of the items comprising the PSSM (Tables 8.9 and 8.10) for item statements five (“I feel like a real part of this ensemble”), nine (“I feel included in this ensemble”) and eleven (“I feel proud of belonging to my ensemble”) the participants’ ratings range from four (neither agree or disagree) to seven (Strongly agree) indicating that on the whole a sense of belonging is high in the Haven Civic Choir. Looking now at the question statement concerning pride in belonging, the results are even more so in the affirmative with ratings ranging from five to seven. This suggests that, as noted in earlier chapters, the choir and its members are very community minded and there is a strong element of pride in this relationship. Exploring these results to the PSSM through the lens of Starting Age and Gender (Figure 8.22) in contrast to what was seen with the Haven Civic Band, it is those who began at the secondary level (5.91) who experience the greatest sense of belonging and even though the results are close and thus the results are again insignificant it is still the adult starters (5.4) who feel the greatest levels of disconnect. Similarly results according to Gender also did not yield any significant results (Female: 5.64 and Male: 5.57).
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Gemma Thomas</th>
<th>Jessical Small</th>
<th>Melinda Rose</th>
<th>Arnold Marks</th>
<th>Claire Smith</th>
<th>Janice Beach</th>
<th>John Sea</th>
<th>Jayne Bath</th>
<th>Haylee Reade</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sometimes I feel as if I don't belong in this ensemble. *</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I wish I were in a different ensemble. *</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The other musicians in this ensemble like me the way that I am.</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I feel very different from most of the other musicians in this ensemble *</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I feel like a real part of this ensemble</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other members of this ensemble take my opinions seriously</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our musical director/conductor respects me</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I can really be myself at rehearsals</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I feel included in this ensemble</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In this ensemble there is a least someone I can talk to if I have a problem</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I feel proud of belonging to my ensemble</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8.9 Haven Civic Choir: PSSM Items 1
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Hilary Adams</th>
<th>Lauren Twee</th>
<th>Ryan Abraham</th>
<th>Raymond Tunks</th>
<th>Harry Lake</th>
<th>Catherine Lock</th>
<th>Rose McIntyre</th>
<th>Eliza Stall</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sometimes I feel as if I don’t belong in this ensemble. *</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I wish I were in a different ensemble. *</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The other musicians in this ensemble like me the way that I am.</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I feel very different from most of the other musicians in this ensemble *</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I feel like a real part of this ensemble</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other members of this ensemble take my opinions seriously</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our musical director/conductor respects me</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I can really be myself at rehearsals</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I feel included in this ensemble</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In this ensemble there is a least someone I can talk to if I have a problem</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I feel proud of belonging to my ensemble</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8.10 Haven Civic Choir: PSSM Items 2
Examining 8.23 the Haven Civic Choir results are largely in favour of an Intrinsic Orientation. Interestingly, when looking at item statements one ("I want to perform well because it is important to show my ability to my family, friends and others.") four (At rehearsals I prefer repertoire that really challenges me so I can learn new things.") and five (At rehearsals I prefer repertoire that challenges me, even if it is difficult to play.") results are mostly congruent. For example, Janice Beach who rated question one with a 6 indicating that it is of utmost importance to be able to positively demonstrate her ability in music to others. While for question three she gives a 3 suggesting that she does not prefer to learn repertoire that provides her with a challenge which confirms her result for question one in that if the repertoire is challenging she would be unable to demonstrate a strong ability. Upon quick examination of Figure 8.24 it is noticed that for both Secondary (Extrinsic: 3.67 and Intrinsic: 5.75) and Adult (Extrinsic: 3.91 and Intrinsic: 5) starts to instrumental music there is a clear difference between both intrinsic and extrinsic goal orientations. While examination of a Primary start (Extrinsic: 3.83 and Intrinsic: 4.79) yielded no significant result.
Figure 8.23 Haven Civic Choir: Extrinsic and Intrinsic Goal Orientation

Extrinsic and Intrinsic Goal Orientation

Extrinsic Goal Orientation (EGO)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Gemma Thomas</th>
<th>Jessica Small</th>
<th>Melinda Rose</th>
<th>Arnold Marks</th>
<th>Claire Smith</th>
<th>Janice Beach</th>
<th>John Sea</th>
<th>Jayne Bath</th>
<th>Haylee Reade</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I want to perform well because it is important to show my ability to my family, friends and others.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>If I can, I want to play/sing better than most of the other people in this ensemble</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Being rewarded or congratulated for a good performance is the most important thing</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At rehearsal I prefer repertoire that really challenges me so I can learn new things</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At rehearsals I prefer repertoire that challenges me, even if it is difficult to play</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8.12 Haven Civic Choir: Extrinsic and Intrinsic Goal Orientation-Breakdown 1
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Hilary Adams</th>
<th>Lauren Twee</th>
<th>Ryan Abraham</th>
<th>Raymond Tunks</th>
<th>Harry Lake</th>
<th>Catherine Lock</th>
<th>Rose McIntyre</th>
<th>Eliza Stall</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I want to perform well because it is important to show my ability to my family, friends and others.</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>If I can, I want to play/sing better than most of the other people in this ensemble</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Being rewarded or congratulated for a good performance is the most important thing</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At rehearsal I prefer repertoire that really challenges me so I can learn new things</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8.13 Haven Civic Choir: Extrinsic and Intrinsic Goal Orientation- Breakdown 2
Figure 8.24 Haven Civic Choir: Intrinsic and Extrinsic Goal Orientations - Starting Age

Intrinsic and Extrinsic Goal Orientations

- Extrinsic Goal Orientation (EGO)
- Intrinsic Goal Orientation (IGO)

Primary: 3.83, 4.79
Secondary: 5.75, 3.67
Adult: 5.00, 3.91

Figure 8.25 Haven Civic Choir: Intrinsic and Extrinsic Goal Orientation - Gender

Intrinsic and Extrinsic Goal Orientations

- Extrinsic Goal Orientation (EGO)
- Intrinsic Goal Orientation (IGO)

Female: 2.80, 1.73
Male: 3.00, 1.69
8.4 Aster Falls Concert Band

There are some very interesting findings when examining the Performance Orientations of band members of Aster Falls. Looking at classroom Performance Avoid first we see that the results here cover the full range of what is possible (Leanne Gray and Monica Green: 1 and Paul Smyth: 7). In congruence with this are Leanne’s results for Classroom Performance Approach (4.5), Personal Performance Approach (4) and Personal Performance Avoid (3). In contrast however, are Paul Smyth’s results for these same constructs to which he nominates a 7.

Examining the Performance Goals through the lens of gender (Figure 8.28), it seems that males are more likely to recognise both Performance characteristics in their ensemble practices where as females are more likely to acknowledge these in themselves. Also intriguing to note is the impact of Starting Age where an Approach orientation (Classroom Approach: 5.35 and Personal Approach Goal: 4.22) is more likely for someone who had a Primary school start to instrumental music where as an Avoid orientation (Classroom Avoid: 4.17 and Personal Avoid Goal: 4.17) is more likely for those who began their instrument in secondary school.

For participants from the Aster Falls Town Band, their scores for Classroom and Personal mastery yield some interesting results. Examining item statement two first (“At rehearsals its ok to make mistakes as long as you are learning”) we notice that six out of eleven participants (Leanne Gray, Charlie Chalk, Monica Green, Carrie Roads, Paul Smyth and Gayle Gray) nominated 7 as their response while the lowest result was still positive with Garry Long giving an answer of 5. Where the disparity comes in is when you compare these results to the answers provided for the other classroom Mastery Goal item statement one (“In our ensemble learning new things is very important”). Here, the highest result was still 7, however the lowest result was down to a 3 from Monica Green and Charlie Chalk indicating that they do not agree with item statement one which sits uncomfortably with their result for item two. Also interesting is the fact that only one participant (Paul Smyth) nominated 7 as a response to the questions for both Classroom and Personal Mastery Goals. This result sits well with his interview where he explained that as a music teacher he finds encouraging music, not just learning an instrument but also seeing music in other areas of their lives, in students as very important. That such an education in music will assist his students to grow into well-rounded adults with playing an instrument as a life long skill even if it is just secondary to work.

In their responses to Performance Approach orientations at both the individual and ensemble levels the majority of members’ view that the philosophy of the ensemble is greatly influenced by Performance Approach goals and it also seems that many of the Band members also consider these characteristics when forming their own personal motivation profiles. In other words, as a group the members of Aster Falls Town Band consider that playing their part correctly, gaining positive feedback in any form whether it be from their conductor or audience and “having a go” as important traits in the individual musician. Additionally, on a personal level the majority of participating Band members view that mastering new skills and aiming to be the best are among the characteristics important to them.
Regarding Performance Avoid goals, the majority of participants do not see that the culture of their band is informed by these characteristics. Interestingly, three out of the four participants who viewed Performance Avoid goals as being important to ensemble culture also see their own personal goal orientation to be influenced by these goals. In other words, for these four participants not making a mistake in front of everyone and preventing others, from thinking they are a band musician, is very important.

Figure 8.26 Aster Falls Town Band: Performance Orientations
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Leanne</th>
<th>Charlie</th>
<th>Garry</th>
<th>Monica</th>
<th>Doug</th>
<th>James</th>
<th>Carrie</th>
<th>Jill</th>
<th>Paul</th>
<th>Gayle</th>
<th>Mackenzie</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>In our ensemble, playing/singing your part correctly is very important.</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IN our ensemble, getting positive feedback is the main goal</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In our ensemble, learning new things is very important.</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AT rehearsals, it's ok to make mistakes as long as you are learning.</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In our ensemble, trying hard is important</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In our ensemble, how much you improve is really important</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In our ensemble, showing others that you are not a bad musician is really important.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In our ensemble, it’s important that you don’t make a mistake in front of everyone</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In our ensemble, it is important not to play/sing worse then everyone else</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One of my goals is to master a lot of new skill on my instrument this year.</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It’s important to me that I improve my skills on my instrument this year.</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One of my goals is to show other people that I am good at music.</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It is important to me that I am a better musician than others in this ensemble.</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Item</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One of my goals is to show others that music is easy for me.</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It is important to me that I don’t look like a bad musician at rehearsals or in performance.</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One of my goals is to prevent others from thinking that I’m a bad musician</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8.14 Aster Falls Town Band: Performance Orientations Items
Figure 8.27 Aster Falls Town Band: Performance Orientation-Starting Age
Figure 8.28 Aster Falls Town Band: Performance Orientation - Gender
Figure 8.29 Aster Falls Town Band: Mastery Orientation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>In our ensemble, learning new things is very important.</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At rehearsals, it's ok to make mistakes as long as you are learning</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In our ensemble, trying hard is important</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One of my goals is to master a lot of new skill on my instrument this year.</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It's important to me that I improve my skills on my instrument this year.</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8.15 Aster Falls Town Band: Item Statements
The Task Value held by the participants in the Aster Falls Town Band (Figure 8.30 and Table 8.15) is a mix of results and again, each collation of these individual responses is in the affirmative although some threes were scored to individual item statements. What is interesting, however, is that the two music teachers, Leanne Gray and Paul Smyth held Task Value in the highest esteem both rating it a 7 throughout. When this is compared with music teacher Claire Smith from Haven Civic Choir it may represent the beginnings of a pattern that music teachers are strong exponents of ‘Music as a Musical Act’ meaning that they recognise the value of music for what it is. Starting Age (Primary: 5.88, Secondary: 5.12 and Adult: 5.5) and Gender (Male: 5.79 and Female: 5.4) bares no influence on results for Task Value.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I like what I learn at rehearsals</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Understanding what I learn in rehearsals is very important to me.</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I think what I do in music is useful for me to learn</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I think I will be able to use what I learn in music outside of rehearsal</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8.16 Aster Falls Town Band: Task Value- Breakdown
Exploring the results for Psychological Sense of School Membership (Figure 8.33 and Table 8.16) for the Aster Falls Town Band, similarly to the band from Haven, the majority of members clearly feel a relatively strong sense of belonging with results ranging from 4.55 to 6.55. However, there is one member, in this case Doug Higgins (3.36), who does not experience these same positive associations.

Exploring this issue further in Table 8.16 Doug scores question statements seven to nine very low, ranging from one to three respectively. This suggests that he does not feel included; he does not feel that he can show his true colours instead hiding himself away from the other ensemble members and he certainly does not feel respected by their Musical Director (Questionnaire and Interview). However, whether this perceived lack of respect is related to musicianship, personal issues or his chosen instrument is unclear however talks with Doug suggest that it could be a combination of all three. It is also unclear how despite these concerns Doug still feels proud to be a member of the Aster Falls Town Band.
Broadening scope now to look at the results from all participating band members item statement “I feel like a real part of this ensemble” has ratings ranging from four to seven, largely remaining between six and seven, suggesting that on the whole there is a strong sense of belonging and, as the interviews seemed to suggest, perhaps it is the high involvement in the spin-off ensembles and their participation in the local community which attributes to this.

Figure 8.33 Aster Falls Town Band: PSSM
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sometimes I feel as if I don't belong in this ensemble. *</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I wish I were in a different ensemble. *</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The other musicians in this ensemble like me the way that I am.</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I feel very different from most of the other musicians in this ensemble *</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I feel like a real part of this ensemble</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other members of this ensemble take my opinions seriously</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our musical director/conductor respects me</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I can really be myself at rehearsals</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I feel included in this ensemble</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In this ensemble there is at least someone I can talk to if I have a problem</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I feel proud of belonging to my ensemble</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8.17 Aster Falls Town Band: PSSM Breakdown
Examining Psychological Sense of School Membership through the lens of Starting Age it is the adult beginners who experience the greater sense of belonging overall even though the results are very close thus suggesting that Starting Age bares no significance on the results. Also very close, when looking at the impact of Gender, it was the females who experienced the greatest sense of belonging in the Aster Falls Town Band.

![Psychological Sense of School Membership (PSSM)](image)

Figure 8.34 Aster Falls Town Band: PSSM-Starting Age and Gender

Figure 8.35 and Table 8.17 show similar results to that seen previously. The majority of players, all except three, view intrinsic factors as being highly influential in terms of motivation. However, what is different here is that the majority of participants stated that on the whole they are not influenced by extrinsic factors. Examining these results from the point of view of Starting Age yields no significant difference between all three categories (Primary, Secondary and Adult). There was also no significant difference in results for Gender (Extrinsic: 3.67 and Intrinsic: 4.8 for Females and Extrinsic: 3.83 and Intrinsic: 5.25 for Males).

![Extrinsic and Intrinsic Goal Orientation](image)

Figure 8.35 Aster Falls Town Band: Extrinsic and Intrinsic Goal Orientation
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I want to perform well because it is important to show my ability to my family, friends and others.</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>If I can, I want to play/sing better than most of the other people in this ensemble</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Being rewarded or congratulated for a good performance is the most important thing</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At rehearsal I prefer repertoire that really challenges me so I can learn new things</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At rehearsals I prefer repertoire that challenges me, even if it is difficult to play</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8.18 Aster Falls Town Band: Extrinsic and Intrinsic Goal Orientation-Breakdown
8.5 Conclusion: Comparison between sites

The final section, before this chapter draws to a conclusion, compares the results for the topics discussed earlier in this chapter between all three participating ensembles: Haven Civic Band, Haven Civic Choir and Aster Falls Town Band. The purpose of which is to present the similarities and differences that offer an interesting bearing on earlier discussion.

Focusing first on Intrinsic and Extrinsic goals through the lens of gender (Figures: 8.14, 8.25 and 8.37) for the Haven Civic Choir and the Haven Civic Band it is largely the females who recognise these goal foci in their own personal outlook. However, the opposite is true for the Aster Falls Town Band. Interestingly, both groups in all
three ensembles rated Extrinsic orientations as being neutral or negatively evident in their personal motivation profiles.

The Mastery Orientations of the Aster Falls Concert Band at both the ensemble and personal levels (Figure 8.29 and Table 8.14) demonstrate results that are markedly similar to those from the Haven Civic Band in that the majority of Personal Mastery Orientations are stronger than their ensemble counterparts.

Table 8.14 and the Mastery Orientation profile of participants in the Aster Falls Concert Band show that there is a large mix of results for each item statement. The only item statement where every participant answered in the affirmative (5 or above) was ‘At rehearsals it’s ok to make mistakes as long as you are learning’. However, what is interesting about these results is that the only participants who’s every result was strongly affirmative in terms of a Mastery focus both at the individual and ensemble levels were Leanne Gray and Paul Smyth who both happen to be music teachers in the Aster Falls community as well as being members of the band.

Examining the effect of starting age on the adoption of Mastery Goal Orientations we look at the results for the categories ‘Mastery Goal Orientation’ and ‘Classroom Mastery Goal Structure’ of Figures 8.3, 8.16 and 8.27 (‘Performance’ categories will be noted later). The results for all three ensembles suggest that being introduced to music and beginning to learn an instrument at a young age while in primary school leads to a greater sense of a Mastery Goal Structure in the ensemble context irrespective of what age you began your participation in that ensemble. Results for a Personal Mastery Orientation were much more split with results for Haven Civic Band and Aster Falls Town Band suggesting that a pre-adult start leads to a greater sense of a personal Mastery Goal Orientation.

Figures 8.4, 8.17 and 8.28 the results for both Personal and Classroom Mastery Goals are very close and seemingly without a pattern when examining them through the lens of gender. Greater significance can be found when exploring the Performance categories.

Examining Task Value through the lens of Starting Age across the three ensembles shows greater Task Value toward music when the individual began studying music when they were in Primary school. Results vary significantly for both the adult and Secondary school age starters. However, the results for two out of the three ensembles indicate that adult starters hold the second best results for Task Value. Perhaps these findings have to do with from whom the motivation comes from, whether it is from the individual themselves or perhaps their parents or peer group. In other words, at Primary school children’s introduction to learning a musical instrument (including voice) would have likely been in the parents’ control. At Secondary school the influence of the peer group becomes more apparent and therefore unless the individual is highly independent they would likely learn an instrument if it was considered as the right thing to do. Finally, as an adult, the motivation to study an instrument usually comes from within.

Looking at Task Value by Gender (Figures: 8.9, 8.20 and 8.32) again there is a similar spread of results to those with Personal and Ensemble-based Mastery Goals. The
results suggest that females hold the greatest Task Value over males even though the results are very close.

Finally the Psychological Sense of School Membership Scale, comparing the three ensembles an interesting result emerges. Out of all three groups there are only two participants who gave a negative response. The results given by Doug Higgins from the Aster Falls Town Band averaged to a low 3.36. Even though in his interview he stated that he loves music and playing the contrabass clarinet he felt that he held a stronger sense of belonging to the small wind ensemble he formed than he does with the Town Band. The other negative response came from the Haven Civic Band. Lisa Foote’s answers to item statements concern belonging and a sense of pride in the ensemble averaged to a very low 2.36. In a similar way to Doug, Lisa stated in her interview that she felt a greater sense of belonging and pride in her contribution to a second community ensemble because the repertoire chosen was more to her standard. For the remaining participants from each of the ensembles their results largely averaged in the affirmative that is from 5 to 6.8. However, in each ensemble there was at least one response in the range of 4.09 to 4.91 indicating a sense of neutrality when it comes to belonging to their ensemble.
Chapter 9: Discussion and Conclusion

In this chapter we will examine ‘Music Places’ which, if you consider the community ensemble as Place, are to be found at the cross section between Kokotsaki and Hallam’s (2007) three categories of music participation and Kudryavtsev, Stedman and Kransny’s (2012) four-part model of Place. Using the following table (Table 9.1) as a framework for discussion we will explore the significance of ‘Music Places’ in terms of motivation towards instrumental music participation.

9.1 Music as a Musical Act

Focusing initially on Music as a Musical Act, the first aspect of Place to come to the fore is Place Attachment. How the selection of repertoire, seeking out opportunities and an affinity with sound in their own way influence music participation and an attachment to the ensemble and music community as Place is considered.

Referring to Table 9.1, selecting appropriate repertoire is among the most vital actions for community ensembles and it is often an act that occurs largely behind the scenes, although Belinda Thomas (H.C.C), in her interview, suggests that one source of motivation for her choristers is to provide them with the opportunity to take part in this exercise. Again looking at the Community ensemble as Place, in her interview, Marsha Jackman (H.C.B) explains the importance of choosing repertoire that will encourage her musicians to take on greater responsibility regarding their participation in the ensemble. In other words, through selecting engaging repertoire, that will not alienate any sections of the band and that audiences will enjoy, Marsha hopes that her musicians will come to not only engage in private home practice but will also come to enjoy it. Therefore, this allows for rehearsals to be rehearsals rather than practices where members are struggling to learn their parts because they have not sorted these out at home. Lisa Foote (H.C.B) takes this idea of choosing engaging repertoire further to suggest that for musicians, whether they be students or further advanced, the repertoire needs to mean something to the participant and therefore it is important for selection to include a wide-ranging repertoire of different styles, genres and technical demands. Another way to assist musicians to take on greater roles within the ensemble is suggested by Catherine Lock (Interview: H.C.C) who explains that ensuring everyone knows their part is important to the whole, that they are not merely there to flesh out the sound but rather are an integral part of it.

Another important aspect of engaging in music participation is to occasionally ‘get out of the practice room and do it for real’ (Mark Foote and Michael Foote, Interview: H.C.B), in other words leave the relative safety of the rehearsal room and share your efforts with the greater community both as a form of entertainment and to hopefully attract new members. However, this can be difficult particularly in rural areas where there might not be enough musicians in the ensemble to cover all the parts. It becomes a vicious cycle where the ensemble does not perform because they are too few in number. In turn, they do not put themselves out there to be heard, they do not attract more members and therefore feel like they cannot perform in a balanced, engaging and satisfactory manner. However, Marsha Jackman and Rebecca Smith (Interview) offer a solution suggesting that if you reside in a rural area, as they do, in order to totally immerse yourself in the music scene it is vital to be prepared to travel as a
means to seek out opportunities in other larger communities. Such engagement may also allow the participant to become involved in different ensemble genres, genres that are not available in their own town. Ryan Abraham (Interview) approaches this issue from a different angle suggesting that there are more opportunities in rural areas like Haven than in larger towns and major cities. Basically, Ryan’s premise is based on the notion that in the cities, while there are more performance opportunities there are also more musicians boasting a high degree of musicianship to fill these roles. While in the country, however, there may be less performance opportunities but there are also fewer musicians therefore giving more people with only a modest ability the opportunity to perform.

Through their interviews, many participants commented that they participate in, or began to participate in their Place (the community ensemble) because of an affinity with the sound of either the ensemble or their chosen instrument. Doug Higgins provides an example of this by discussing how the timbre and physicality of his instrument, the contrabass clarinet, stirs his motivation and provides a link to his early experiences of music in his United States high school. Rebecca Smith agrees with this notion recalling how by participating in the Haven Civic Band she is able to recall her childhood experience of playing in a recorder band and enjoying how all the parts came together to create something beautiful. Further to this idea of the motivational beauty of ensemble playing we hear from Carrie Roads, Paul Munroe and Ryan Abraham (Interview) who explain their connection to the ‘magic harmonies’ (Ryan Abraham, Interview) created by historical ‘masterminds’ and ‘wizards’ of the past who are just as relevant today as they were in their time.
Table 9.1 Music Motivation and Place

Moving on to Music as A Musical Act and Place Meaning I consider aspects of Place that are significant for musical endeavour. First we will examine History and Modernisation. Marsha Jackman has been a member of the Haven Civic Band ever since she was a young girl. Now as musical director, even though the brass band has lost many members and is no longer seen as the social hub of the Haven community (James Beach, Interview), Marsha is aiming to continue and rebuild the band as a tribute to members gone by who gave her such excellent tuition and enjoyment while she was a student. The problem with attracting new members is, in Marsha’s opinion, due to community perceptions that the band is still stuck in the 1970s with a repertoire of mainly marches and hymns. In this regard, the dilemma Marsha faces is how to modernise for the community whilst still upholding the long history and traditions of the band. In order to do this the band is currently in the process of updating their uniform and including popular charts into their repertoire that will engage both musician and audience. Similarly, the community perception of the Haven Civic Choir is that it has always been a classical ensemble. On one hand there are those who want to reconsider the repertoire to include more modern works as a means to attract younger adult members. However, on the other hand, there is already a contemporary choir in town and the remaining members do not want to move closer to this model maintaining that the two choirs should remain separate (Melinda Rose, Interview). The implications of this for Place and motivation are that every Place has a history...
and while it is important to acknowledge this, it is also important to consider the future and think about how the Place (again community ensemble) can be sustained in the current environment. In this regard, it is important to keep current members motivated but it is also vital to engage with the audience, as among them are those who are the future of the ensemble.

The overall meaning of a Place is among the key motivating factors mentioned by participants. One of the prominent ideas to emerge here, with regards to Personal motivations and Music as a social act, is the concept of a safe place. For Rebecca Smith (Interview) having a safe practice space is vital and enables her to just ‘let go’ and not concern herself with the judgement of others. For Gayle Gray (Interview) is another whose comments are relevant to this discussion. For her a safe place is one where she feels comfortable to take her clarinet out of the case and give things a go, a place where she feels that making mistakes are alright and an essential part of the learning process. For Samuel Pendal (Interview) feelings of a safe Place are to do with the overall atmosphere that is present. In this case an air of enthusiasm in the music community has become somewhat a forum for ideas by providing him with a safe space to test out inspirations which he feels he would not be able to do in a larger or less accommodating town. On the other hand this sense of unrestricted enthusiasm can also be seen as a negative. In this regard Claire Smith (Interview) explains that such an atmosphere of enthusiasm may actually affect the quality of musical output as it takes away from the ‘real seriousness’ of the rehearsal. However, Claire continues by suggesting that a ‘heads down’ approach is likely to result in a loss of singers so there must be a balance or compromise to be found here.
Place Identity (Chapter Two) is concerned with how people think about themselves and how they would like to be considered by others. In this regard relationships and personal identity become increasingly important. Rose McIntyre (Interview) explains that sharing a love of music and fellowship with others in the Haven Civic Choir is vital in her feeling a sense of belonging to the ensemble providing her with a comfortable acceptance and friendly familiarity. This strongly motivates her to attend rehearsals each week. However, while it is clear that person-to-person relationships are important person-to-instrument relationships are similarly vital. Rebecca Smith (Interview) explains that as one of the more advanced members of the Haven Civic Band she finds much enjoyment in the teacher-student relationships she finds herself in as a tutor in support of the Musical Director. However, the relationship does not end there. In this role, teaching forces her to think about her own playing and this ultimately changes her relationship with her instrument. Additionally, Paul Munroe (Interview) takes this discussion further suggesting that as your relationship with your instrument develops it becomes somewhat like an extension of your own body much like the human voice.

Another aspect of Place Identity is Personal Identity and in relation to this James Beach (Interview) explains that for him participating in music releases a personal passion that he believes has always been “on the inside”, however, just needed an avenue for release, which makes him a better person, not only for himself but also recognisable by others, because he is doing what he loves. This internal drive is also expressed by Samuel Pendal (Interview), who explains that participating in music is not so much about external motivation but rather part of an internal need to play, settling his mind. However, for Arnold Marks (Interview) his passion and drive for music does not come from within, but rather from ‘without’. He goes on to explain this further by suggesting that he has been fortunate to have some very influential people in his life particularly his first vocal teacher who gave him the greatest gift; a love of classical music. While music is not his whole life, it is certainly an integral part of the ‘jigsaw’. Another interesting way to view this idea came from Haylee Reade (Interview) who explains that throughout her life music has and always will be something that she values as a part of herself. While she will change and grow music will remain a constant.

The final dimension to be discussed here under Music as a Musical Act is Place Dependence. Here, for the purpose of clarity, I have divided this final dimension of Kudrayavtsev, Stedman and Kransny’s (2012) Place model into two distinct constructs; Dependence Of and Dependence On, where ‘Of’ refers to a musicians dependence on a Place while ‘On’ refers to the dependence of the Place on the Individual. Examining Dependence ‘Of’ first I look at the infrastructure, whether currently in place or not, related to musical experience and output. One of the principle ideas to immerge here is the difficultly found in rural and remote areas with regard to getting instruments repaired and obtaining vital supplies such as reeds and sheet music. For example, Aster Falls is home to one music retailer however, the mainstay of their focus is on contemporary rock bands and as such they do not offer repairs for wind and classical string instruments and also do not stock acceptable reeds (Chester Green and Doug Higgins, Interview). In relation to lacking infrastructure Charlie Chalk (Interview) a year twelve student in Aster Falls tells us of the sheer frustration of having to always record the material for his A.M.E.B
(Australian Music Examinations Board) exams because his town is too remote and there are not enough students to warrant the board sending an examiner. On a more positive note Carrie Roads (Interview) speaks of her experiences as an adult learner in Aster Falls explaining that being in a remote town actually facilitated her participation in music inciting courage and therefore making it easier for her to take those first steps. Carrie did not have an instrumental tutor but rather joined a small ensemble and learnt on the job a pathway she feels would have been closed to her had she lived in a suburban or metropolitan environment. Furthermore, the Aster Falls Town Band has several student participants, which Doug Higgins (Interview) explains does not speak to the overall quality of the band but rather because it is a remote community the Town Band is their only chance for a ‘proper’ band experience.

The final aspect of “Dependence Of” to be discussed here is the importance of acoustics, not only for overall sound quality but also for its ramifications regarding performer confidence. Rebecca Smith (Interview) describes her experiences of playing in many of the churches in Haven and how the warm atmosphere and clear acoustics helps her to produce a tone that she can be proud of and this results in increased confidence when performing in that space. However, not only can acoustics incite confidence, they can also result in fear and insecurity on behalf of the performer. In this regard, many of the participants from Haven (for example, Paul Munroe and Michael, Lisa and Mark Foote, Interview) speak to the difficulty of performing outside (or for members of the Civic Choir the Haven Performing Arts Centre) as the sound simply disappears leaving them to feel isolated and resultantly, unconfident.

Moving onto “Dependence On”, in regards to Music as a Musical Act I explore balance and ensemble. Paul Munroe from the Haven Civic Band explains that as the ensemble is so small he feels that he has to take on a teacher-like role in support of the musical director by musically being someone the other band members can look up to and count on when he would rather be in a student role and feel able to make mistakes and ask for assistance when required. However, Samuel Pendal explains that there does not have to be a distinction between these two roles and that, as the only percussionist, he feels like one of the advanced players while at the same time he recognises that everyone can learn something and he is therefore not afraid to ask for help as needed while at the same time the Band can depend on him as a solid player.

Another component of “Dependence On” is the idea of the town relying on the band. This occurs because there are too few musicians and music ensembles in the local community so the band is often called upon to perform at public functions and events and are consequently received with open arms. According to Claire Smith this can have negative results where because there is no competition in acquiring these gigs. This can lead to sloppier playing on behalf of the individuals and ultimately the ensemble.

9.2 Music as a Social Act

Regarding the intersection between Music as a Social Act and the five dimensions of Place I consider ideas such as Economic support, Community recognition and Burden of responsibility. I begin with Place Attachment and culture.
As a community ensemble, the ability to maintain a friendly and welcoming atmosphere is one of the key sources of motivation for participants. Claire Smith (Interview) tells us that the Haven Civic Choir is not only a musical group, it is also a social group and this aspect is very important. As Rose McIntyre (Interview) explains, it offers choristers the opportunity to associate with people from all walks of life who they perhaps would not have the chance to meet if it were not for the choir. Catherine Lock and Haylee Reade suggest that a positive social atmosphere is created by light-heartedness (evidenced through subtle teasing between the sections of the group), warmth, humour and the ability to laugh at themselves. This sense of an inclusive culture is also echoed by Marsha Jackman who suggests that if you are a musician you will always have a friend in Haven and that not only are musicians welcomed into the ensemble but also their families are invited into the band family. Additionally, Rebecca Smith comments that this culture of friendship and inclusivity enables musicians to meet with people who share a passion for music and allow them to influence each other not only musically but also socially and personally.

Exploring the intersection between Music as a Social Act and Place Meaning I will focus on the notion of Musical Endeavour. Garry Long (Interview) explains that community bands (and by extension other community ensembles) are an important wellspring of participation and the musical lifeblood of the local community. In this way, music connects people from all walks of life whose paths may have been unlikely to cross otherwise. As Samuel Pendal (Interview) states for a young teen, whose world starts and ends with their immediate peer group, this is a genuinely shocking realisation. This notion that musical ensembles are an inclusive mainstay of the community is also expressed by Belinda Thomas who explains that Haven, as a community, is very open minded towards the Arts and consequently encourages participation at every level. However, in Haven you do not have to belong to an ensemble to share in the music community. In this way Catherine Lock (Interview) explains that one of her favourite aspects of Christmas is visiting local Nursing Homes with the choir encouraging them to sing along and thus sharing the joy that music brings to people who may otherwise go without.

In terms of Place Identity I consider Community Music as a social construct as well as community recognition and acknowledgement. Rebecca Smith’s (Interview) identity has, for most of her life, been defined by her relationships to others: someone’s daughter, someone’s wife, or as mother to her children. She goes on to explain, that through participating in community music she has come to find herself, make her own friends and forge her own identity. Another aspect of acknowledgement is that being a member of a community band, particularly in a small rural community, leads to appreciation of your work and recognition about town (Chester Green, Interview). Arnold Marks (Interview) describes participating in community music is a real ‘ego trip’. Being a member of the Civic Choir has afforded him a certain standing within the community and recognition as ‘a somebody’. In small, particularly rural or remote, communities there is a sense of intimacy between the performing artist and their audience, which results in personal appreciation rather than the generic applause you would find in larger venues. However, it is not only the relationships between the individual and their community that are of interest here for as Chester Green (Interview) suggests, intra-ensemble relationships are just as important particularly having your voice heard and being recognised as an equal within the group.
Music has an important identity associated with many community events and civic functions such as Australia Day, ANZAC Day, Public Openings and Christmas festivals. As Janice Beach explains being a member of the Haven Civic Choir has encouraged her to take part in many community events that she would likely not attend otherwise. This has given her the opportunity to give back to the community, which has given her so much. This idea of giving back to the community is echoed by Marsha Jackman who suggests that one of the important responsibilities of community music ensembles is to link in with the local schools. This is not only beneficial in terms of recruitment but also in fuelling a love of music and community pride amongst the younger generation. However, when considering community music, it is also vital to acknowledge the community identity of the individual which, as Doug Higgins (Interview) suggests, is spread thin. Their community responsibility is not only directed towards the band. Because of this that community groups are forever competing for an individual’s time and priority. In rural communities small numbers lead to a double dipping of residents in order to be able to maintain various community offerings.

Looking at Place ‘Dependence Of’, in particular economic support and removing barriers, Marsha Jackman (Interview) describes the lack of support the band receives from the local shire. Despite this the Haven Civic Band still offers a service to the community a place where socio-economic advantage is not important. The band focus is on maintaining a community ensemble environment where everyone is welcome and therefore does not exclude members of the community simply for an inability to pay. This is achieved by offering reduced or removed instrument hire fees. Free tuition is also offered to new members to help get them started on their chosen instrument (Rebecca Smith, Interview). However, at the other end of the country Doug Higgins says that the Arts are government funded at all levels in Aster Falls, which, in his opinion, is made viable due to the high tourism the area experiences.

Considering ‘Dependence On’ there is a huge burden of responsibility felt by several participants in relation to their music participation particularly in Haven. There are two main concerns here: firstly, James Beach (Interview) suggests that Haven is experiencing dwindling numbers of musicians involved in community music and that this problem is heightened by the local schools that are not feeding into these programs. Therefore, as Michael Foote (Interview) explains, even though he is not really enjoying his participation in the band he still feels a tremendous burden of responsibility. If he leaves the band will be too small in number to continue being viable. The second concern builds on from the first suggesting players feel that if they do not commit 100 percent, they are letting the other members down. In a group situation such as this it is vital to really support each other and to carry on (Michael Foote, Interview).

9.3 Personal Motivations Revisited

Reflecting on the intersection between Personal Motivations and Place, I focus on ideas such as escapism and creativity, confidence and personality as well as the functionality of Place. I attend in the first instance to the physical nature of participation as well as its entertainment value.

According to Kudryavtsev, Stedmand and Krasny (2012) Place Attachment refers to the link between people and Place. Therefore, by continuing to view the community
ensembles as Place the physicality of music participation becomes very important. One example of this comes from Charlie Chalk (Interview) who explains that participation in musical activities, in particular the playing of an instrument, helps with the development of brain skills such as coordination between the right and left sides as well as being mentally challenging in terms of comprehension and creativity. Another aspect of the physical nature of playing is the release of endorphins, which is much like a run for its physical and mental stimulation (Garry Long, Interview).

The entertainment value gained from participation in various musical activities emerged as another form of Place Attachment. To begin, James Carter (Interview) tells of the enjoyment when his two worlds collide. As a school Principal, James is known to many students around town and often when the band is marching for a community parade some of the students call out to him. While they are most likely seeking to gain notoriety for themselves James finds the attention and recognition entertaining. Another ‘fun’ aspect of participation comes from Jayne Bath (Interview) who explains that the humour and light-hearted banter present at rehearsals is a strong motivation for her continued attendance.

In terms of Place Meaning Rebecca Smith (Interview) describes her participation in music is a source of escapism from the stressors she encounters daily throughout her life, whether they be derived from societal pressures or work tensions. Her participation in music has become something that resides outside of her family or herself and helps her to cope with life. This sentiment is echoed by Belinda Thomas (Interview), who suggests that participation in music seems to be therapeutic for her choristers and an escape from the daily grind and their ‘boring’ jobs. Similarly, Claire Smith (Interview) states that participation in music has helped her to gain relaxation and enjoyment in life. She is glad that children are getting involved in music as it will assist them throughout their lives.

Motivation to participate in music has also been linked to offer an outlet for creativity and a source of pride. James Beach (Interview) explains that for him music has become a mechanism for his creative side and also importantly a way in which he can relax and express himself. In terms of pride, an example of this comes from Lisa Foote (Interview) states she has great pride in her son Michael who was able to perform at his grandfather’s funeral, which meant a great deal to him. He was able to expressive himself, as well as provide a support for reflection for the extended family.

In relation to confidence and personality Carrie Roads (Interview) has very low self-belief, sharing that she sees herself as a beginner musician who is, and always will be, limited in knowledge and skill. However, what Carrie has seemingly over-looked is the fact that she is a self-taught flutist who participates in several ensembles and is about to take on a second instrument. Therefore, it could be considered that for Carrie participation in music is slowly increasing confidence in herself, to the point where she is able to participate in collegiate music making and even consider taking up a second instrument. However, the development of self-confidence is not the only positive to emerge here for as Ryan Abraham (Interview) suggests, the ideal ensemble member would be someone who has the confidence to speak up, listen to others, take direction and not take criticism personally. While these attributes may not be immediately evident in choristers, their on going participation in the choir often results in the development of such confidence and these other personality traits.
Regarding ‘Dependence Of’, I consider both the physical environment as well as the socio-economic environment in which music participation takes place. In terms of the physical environment I will focus particularly on the rehearsal environment however, many of these ideas are equally transferable to the practice as well as performance spaces. According to participants (for example: Marsha Jackman and Haylee Reade, Interview) the eight major elements to be considered in the creation of a rehearsal environment are as follows:

- Size: That the size of the venue reflects the size of the ensemble
- Cleanliness
- Light
- Heating/Cooling
- Comfortable chairs that support posture
- The overall look of the space, for example whether it is upbeat
- Easy parking
- Acoustics

According to Marsha Jackman (Interview) when these eight elements are in place it is reflected in terms of productivity and enthusiasm in members as well as respect for others and for the physical space itself (including the collective resources of the band or choir).

However, it is not only the physical environment that affects the ensembles in this way; the socio-economic environment also has a large role to play. Members of the Aster Falls Town Band do not pay subscription fees unlike the other two ensembles in this study. According to Alwin Franks (Interview) the result of this arrangement is low commitment amongst band members. As the musical director he feels that any form of encouragement on his part, in an attempt to conquer this situation, is perceived as blatant pressure by ensemble members. Financial arrangements also influence motivation at Haven. Haylee Reade (Interview) explains that the new music centre built at the local private school (incidentally where the Choir rehearses) will act to maintain the enthusiasm for music among students, staff and by extension the entire community. Haylee suggests that because the school has spent money on the new building, which includes an intimate auditorium, it is now seen as important.

The final idea to be discussed from Table 9.1, considering Personal Motivations, is Variability. According to Samuel Pendal (Interview), the musical climate of the remote town of Aster Falls is very much about variability. In other words, like the environment where species of animal die out when their particular food source disappears, while other animals, which are more like generalists in regards to their diet, survive. So too is it for music in this community. This brings two considerations to light. Firstly, if you are very specific in your musical expertise and unwilling to branch out you may have difficulty finding your niche in this community. Unlike Haven, travelling to a neighbouring town for these experiences is not an option. Second, due to the isolation of the Aster Falls community and the limited number of musicians available, an ensemble or program can be largely built around a single person. If that person leaves, the group may fall apart. An example of this is the instrument program run by Lisa Gray who travels around to the local primary schools teaching music. While this is seen as a good thing and there are clear links that this program is the very foundation of community music in Aster Falls it is very much
reliant on the work of one individual. If Lisa should leave and not be replaced the program will die. This, in time, would have major repercussions for instrumental music in the area. This idea of not being able to attract musicians into the ensemble and the possibility of the ensemble ceasing to exist, is echoed by Rose McIntyre (Interview) who suggests that the inflexibility of the Haven Civic Choir towards expanding their repertoire to include more popular modern works results in their inability to attract young singers which, as their member-base is aging, could result in the choir disappearing altogether from the community. In this regard, Paul Munroe (Interview) stresses the importance of having both role models and students coming up as a means to sustain and develop ensemble growth. Similarly, Rebecca Smith (Interview) explains that in any ensemble it is vital to have strong players to support the aspirations of the young and lift the standards of musicianship.

9.4 Drawing it all Together

Throughout this chapter I have explored the intersection between Kokotsaki and Hallam’s (2007) model of music participation and Kudryavtsev, Stedman and Kransny’s (2012) model of Place. What remains, however, is to review the level of agreement amongst participants and to examine the implications for Music Places and sustained participant motivation.

Upon first glance it is clear in Figure 9.1 that the diagram presents the percentage of participants for whom each dimension of Table 9.1 was relevant. It does not however, present the number of responses for each participant in each dimension. In this way, a number of factors we can glean from Figure 9.1. Firstly, in all but two intersections (Place Attachment and Place Dependence) Music as a Music Act rated as the most relevant scoring between 64.52% and 77.42%. Secondly, intersections with Music as a Social Act was stronger than both Music as a Musical Act and Personal Motivations in two dimensions: Attachment 67.74% and ‘Dependence On’ 35.48%. Finally, Personal Motivations were seen to be the least relevant for participants except for its intersection with Place Attachment rating 45.16%. Therefore, it can be deduced that the most important attributes of a Music Place that will promote longevity in motivation are: the infrastructure especially in relation to acoustics, the culture and history behind the Place both in terms of both the ensemble itself but also the wider community and the relationships and personal identity forged in the Place.
To my knowledge, even though much research has been undertaken examining the factors that motivate students towards music, little has been done with a specific focus on the adult amateur or indeed on musicians living and making music in rural and remote locations. There are a number of studies which explore the challenges faced by rural youth in regards to education, however I was not able to find any with a particular focus on instrumental music. The main focus of this body of literature seems to be literacy and numeracy. Taken together this means that there is very little understanding about the particular motivations and challenges faced by musicians (both young and old) living in rural and remote contexts. In order to address this, through my research I hoped to explore possible links between Kokotsaki and Hallam’s (2007) three categories of music participation and Kudryavtsev, Stedman and Kransny’s (2012) four-part model of Place though consideration of the motivational profiles of participants and comparing this with participants’ reports of the different factors that motivate them as musicians in their particular ‘music places’.

9.6 Limitations of the study

There are some limitations to the methodology I used in this study. Firstly, as the questionnaires were self-administered, I was not able to address any questions participants might have had and I was not able to control how each participant would interpret the individual questionnaire items. Secondly, with face-to-face semi-structured interviews, one must be aware that what the participant recalls of their practice may be different from the actual reality of it. This is also seen as a benefit in that it allows for the multiple realities of participants to be seen, it is hoped that these flaws will be somewhat circumvented through the triangulation of data (examining a phenomena at different times, in different locations with different people) which is a
natural extension of multiple-case study, and the triangulation of method (using multiple methods to overcome the limitations of one alone) (Flick, 2007).

Thirdly, the nature of the interview is such that results will be subjective. By this I mean, how the participant sees themselves and their environment may be different from the way that other people see them. Therefore, the responses of the group will reflect these multiple realities. However, the presence of these multiple realities should not be seen as a negative as they allow me to delve deeper into the issue and get to the heart of what is important and meaningful for the participants.

Fourthly, the study contributed to the understanding of motivation and challenge faced by participants as they relate to participation in instrumental music and interact with their ‘music places’. However, I acknowledge that it is difficult to generalize beyond the specific cases studied, but the multiple sites involved in my work have become a series of case studies that were chosen because they differ on key demographic variables. As such it is hoped that practitioners in the field of music education and participation will find a useful take-home-message, that is relevant and helpful to their own specific context.

Fifthly, my original plans for this research involved working with both schools and community ensembles in the selected sites of Haven and Aster Falls. However, despite my attempts, I was ultimately denied access. This being the case I was forced to focus my attention on community groups, which, in the long term proved to be a blessing as these ensembles were a hub of music making and music learning out in the community. As such I was able to talk to musicians from wide sectors of the local communities who varied in multiple demographic characteristics such as age, occupation, instrumental specialization, years of learning and participation as well as their financial standing.

For the Haven ensembles I was purely an observer, I was somewhat positioned at a distance from the music making that occurred there. However, the situation was very different in Aster Falls. Here, due to the limited availability of musicians, I was asked to become an honorary member of the band and two of the subsidiary groups rehearsing and performing along side of the participants. The implication of this was while I gained a focused insiders perspective in Aster Falls, at times I felt that I perhaps missed some of what was happening as I focused on my role as musician rather than as purely a researcher. Despite this I felt that because I did participate fully in the musical activities in Aster Falls the participants came to trust me and therefore were more open to share their various thoughts and perspectives.

9.7 Significance of the Study

The primary rationale behind the inquiry is to develop an understanding of the particular motivations confronting rural and remote participants of instrumental music, with a particular focus on the amateur musician participating in a community-based ensemble. The second concern of the research is to explore the concept of ‘music places’ and how these help us to understand participant motivation. In this regard, while there have been multiple studies examining the factors which motivate students towards musical learning, limited attention has been given to the adult amateur or importantly, to musicians (student or adult amateur) living in rural or
remote locations. Thirdly, while there has been research studies conducted concerning the educational challenges faced by rural youth, to my knowledge none of these studies have considered instrumental music instead concentrating on literacy and numeracy or schooling in general. Hence, this means that there is very little understanding in the literature concerning the particular motivations and challenges that are faced by rural and remote participants of instrumental music. Additionally, because a sense of community and belonging are such central parts of country life, my aim was to effectively explore the particular motivations of rural and remote musicians through the lens of Place; an angle that, to my knowledge, has yet to be followed up in the literature and to ultimately explore the connections between Place (Kudryavtsev et al., 2012) and Kokotsaki and Hallam’s (2007) three categories of music participation a perspective yet to be explored in the available research. Additionally, the present inquiry seeks to enrich this research through qualitative methods, thus bringing the unique views of the participants to the fore, and by adding a unique rural/remote Australian perspective to the existing body of research.

9.8 Directions for Further Research

As previously mentioned the purpose of this research was to explore possible links between the three categories of music participation as proposed by Kokotsaki and Hallam (2007) and Kudryavtsev, Stedman and Kransny’s (2012) four-part model of Place. Through an in-depth investigation, taking the form of a multiple case study, I have been able to demonstrate that there may indeed be a connection between these two constructs and that at their communion lays Music Places where optimal motivation and engagement can be found. Additionally, this research has also led to the suggestion that the fourth dimension of Place Theory, ‘Dependence’, be expanded to include both “Of” and “On” subsets as a means to better accommodate, and make sense of, the themes to emerge through this research.

It is difficult to substantiate the findings through only three cases especially as two of these ensembles were from the same rural town; Haven. Therefore, in order to confirm the found connections, as discussed above, further research is needed not only in rural and remote communities but also with suburban and metropolitan ensembles to discover whether these proposed links between Place and Participation hold true.

The participants in the study were all from a Western background and therefore this perspective may have coloured their opinions and ultimately the results. To include non-western communities in future research particularly those who have a different relationship with their physical, social and spiritual environments such as Aboriginal Australians is a strong recommendation for further research.
References


Barker, B. O., & Hall, R. F. (1994). Distance Education in Rural Schools: Technologies and Practice. *Journal of research in rural education, 10*(2), 126-128.


Stevens, K. (1994). Australian Developments in Distance Education and Their Implications for Rural Schools. *Journal of research in rural education, 10*(1), 78-83.


Minerva Access is the Institutional Repository of The University of Melbourne

Author/s:
Gallina, Amelia Anne

Title:
Motivation and place: music participation in rural Australia

Date:
2017

Persistent Link:
http://hdl.handle.net/11343/192654

File Description:
Motivation and Place: Music Participation in Rural Australia

Terms and Conditions:
Terms and Conditions: Copyright in works deposited in Minerva Access is retained by the copyright owner. The work may not be altered without permission from the copyright owner. Readers may only download, print and save electronic copies of whole works for their own personal non-commercial use. Any use that exceeds these limits requires permission from the copyright owner. Attribution is essential when quoting or paraphrasing from these works.