THE OPERAS OF G.W.L.MARSHALL-HALL

Warren Arthur Bebbington
M.A. (Queens, N.Y.), B.Mus

Thesis submitted for the degree of Master of Music

Faculty of Music

University of Melbourne

August 1978
ABSTRACT

G.W.L. Marshall-Hall, 1862-1915, English-born musician who settled in Australia in 1891, is chiefly remembered as a pioneer teacher and conductor, founder of the Melbourne University Conservatorium and the Melba Memorial Conservatorium, Melbourne, propogator of the first orchestral subscription concerts in Melbourne, and founding Professor of Music at the University of Melbourne. An outspoken Bohemian, his book of poems *Hymns ancient and modern* (1898) was judged lewd and sacrilegious and led to his severance from the University in 1900. Marshall-Hall was also a composer of over 50 works, including operas, symphonies, overtures, string quartets, and numerous songs. The six extant operas are a representative sample of his creative work, exhibiting strong influence of Wagner and later Puccini, but flawed by the limits of a largely untutored technique. Most interesting is the effect on the composer's creative work of prolonged isolation from and occasional return-visits to Europe.

295pp, including 26pp of musical examples, 7pp of illustrations, catalogues of music and literary works, thematic catalogue of operas, iconography, bibliography, index.
I sing of magnanimous deed,
Of puissance, endurance and toil; -
Of strengths that waste, of hearts that bleed,
Of vast spirits that manikins spoil.

G.W.L. Marshall-Hall
from 'Of the sorrow of things'
A book of canticles 1897
PREFACE

The first thesis on a composer of Australian domicile no longer alive should not require apology or justification. As it concerns G.W.L. Marshall-Hall however, whose music is completely unknown, a note of explanation should be offered. The music of Australia's past has usually been studied in broad survey, and only one composer, Percy Aldridge Grainger, has received extended individual treatment. Grainger's connection with Australia is by descent rather than domicile, a connection more tenuous than Australians would care to admit. Marshall-Hall, though English-born and -raised, was a major participant in the transplantation to Australia of the musical part of European life. While this does not make his scores any more palatable to the modern music-lover, it reveals them as significant products of a phenomenon of cultural change and growth of which Australia has a special history, and about which we have much to learn.

Aside from this, there were personal reasons for the choice of Marshall-Hall. His manuscripts were accessible, numerous, and in need of cataloging and investigation. Above all, recordings of the operas were non-existent, the chances of their performance remote, and the challenge of recreating them in my imagination was compelling.

I am indebted to the Board of the Grainger Museum, University of Melbourne, for providing for my study facsimiles of major manuscripts in their Marshall-Hall Collection and allowing me access to all the originals; to the Rev. E.L. Burge, Warden of Trinity College, University of Melbourne, and Miss J. Arnold, Director of the Melba Memorial Conservatorium, for access to papers in their collections; to Mr. J. Burke, of the University of Melbourne, for assistance in identifying the Greek excerpts in the autograph score of Harold; to Mr. J. Rich, of the Royal Melbourne Institute of Technology, who shared with me most generously insights gained from his own unfinished research; to Dr. M. T. Radic,
whose thesis was not available to me but whose comments in the initial stages were helpful; and to my mother for proof-reading the two final drafts and supervising the typing during my extended absence abroad, 1976-78. My principal debt however, is to Dr.K.Dreyfus, Archivist of the Grainger Museum, for her unflagging interest, stimulation, and support throughout the period during which I was (or rather, should have been) at work.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Abstract</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preface</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of illustrations</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of abbreviations</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chapter</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I Introduction</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II 1862-1890</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III 1891-1900</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV 1901-1911</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V 1912-1915</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Appendices</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I Catalogue of Literary works</td>
<td>221</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II Catalogue of Music.-Chronology</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III Iconography</td>
<td>277</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV Bibliography</td>
<td>279</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Index</td>
<td>284</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS

Professor Marshall-Hall, oil on canvas, 1915,
by E. Phillips-Fox . . . . . . . . . . . . . 1

_Dido_ act 5, scene 2, autograph vocal score, p.163,
showing mutilations by newspaper cuttings . . . 38

_Hymn to Sydney_, 1897, cover-design by Ernest
Moffitt . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 96

_Alcestis_, photograph of the Melbourne Town Hall
Performance, 22nd June 1898 . . . . . . . 117

_The new Patroclus_, cartoon by Norman Lindsay,
_Alma mater_, July 1900, on Marshall-Hall's
severance from the University . . . . . . . 142

_Aristodemus_, scene 12, autograph full score,
p.144, showing composer's hand . . . . . . . 159

_Stella_, scene 6, autograph full score, fly-
leaf, showing set-design in composer's
hand . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . 172
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AB</td>
<td>Music Library, Australian Broadcasting Commission, Sydney</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BL</td>
<td>British Library, London</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BO</td>
<td>Bodleian Library, Oxford</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BU</td>
<td>Baillieu Library, University of Melbourne</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CR</td>
<td>Central Registry Files, Archives, University of Melbourne</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GM</td>
<td>Grainger Museum, University of Melbourne</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LC</td>
<td>Library of Congress, Washington</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LL</td>
<td>Latrobe Library, Melbourne</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MC</td>
<td>Melba Memorial Conservatorium Library, Melbourne</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ML</td>
<td>Mitchell Library, Sydney</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NL</td>
<td>National Library of Australia, Canberra</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NY</td>
<td>New York Public Library</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RC</td>
<td>Parry Collection, Royal College of Music, London</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TC</td>
<td>Leeper Library, Trinity College, University of Melbourne</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER I
INTRODUCTION

G.W.L. Marshall-Hall may be described as Melbourne's most important musical pioneer. He came to Australia in 1891 as the founding Professor of Music at the University of Melbourne, but his activities extended far beyond the precinct of the University. From the start he saw his role in a broader sense: a professorship was 'an unexampled chance of influencing the coming generation and of raising the art of music in their minds'.¹ When he died in 1915 he left behind a rich legacy: a tradition of regular orchestral concerts which offered programmes of the best European quality; a Conservatorium within the University, and another one supported independently, which competed to provide a lively centre of musical education in the city; and the groundwork for regular chamber music concerts and for permanent Australian opera.

A brief survey of present-day musical life in Melbourne reveals the extent of his importance. The two Conservatoria he established still exist, and still reflect his philosophies to a striking degree. At the Melbourne Conservatorium, now renamed the Melba Memorial Conservatorium, the aims and syllabus have changed little since his day: Interpretation Class, Opera Class, and History and Aesthetics of Music are titles he gave at the beginning of the century. At the University Conservatorium, change has been more apparent, though the aim of a well rounded theoretical and practical musical education remains, as opposed to the purely theoretical course which the University authorities had originally intended.

¹Marshall-Hall, letter of application for Professorship, 1888, CR.
and which is still a pattern in a number of distinguished European universities. Certain ideas peculiar to Marshall-Hall's original conception remain too, a case in point being his inordinate emphasis on the study of Romantic XIXth century music. At the orchestral subscription concerts in Melbourne today, the formula for the programmes has changed little since his day - a foundation of Mozart, Beethoven, Schubert, Schumann, Brahms and Wagner with a sprinkling of contemporary music.

Marshall-Hall's legacy involves more than these visible musical institutions. He can be credited with the development and education of musical taste in Melbourne to a startling extent. At the time of his arrival Offenbach, Gounod, Sullivan, Nicolai and Mendelssohn were the standard fare of orchestral concerts in Melbourne, and the overture and medley were the standard genre. Previous attempts to offer more serious programmes on a regular basis had failed. In his first ten years of conducting concerts in Melbourne, a public emerged for symphony, concerto, operatic scena, as well as the latest tone poems and character pieces, and the programme formula that became standard was established.

It is difficult to accept that this development of musical taste was simply an outcome of the young city's natural maturation, or even of Marshall-Hall's enormous energy. Part of the development must have its origin in the attention Marshall-Hall attracted as a public figure. He was continuously

1 Until course revisions approved while this thesis was in progress, Romantic music was afforded twice the study time of any other historical period at the University Conservatorium. Marshall-Hall's purpose in this policy was that contemporary music should receive the most attention. Ironically, as time went on, Romantic music was less and less contemporary.

2 vide programme, Victorian Orchestra 33rd Concert, The Argus, 1 January 1891, p. 6.
surrounded by controversy in Melbourne: he was an atheist and vocal opponent of Christian morality, and Melbourne society was more than sensitive about this issue; he was an opponent of unionism, and opposed union activities in the musical profession at a time when labour was organising itself strongly in Australia; he believed in the supremacy of Germany among the civilized nations, and dedicated a concert to Prince Bismark at a time when anti-German feeling was running high in Melbourne; and he was quick to make a strong stand on any controversial topic, defending the dramas of H. Ibsen when they were regarded as perverse, or championing the Heidelberg school of painters long before they were thought respectable. These controversies attracted the public's attention to him, and music was frequently a lively topic in Melbourne as a consequence.

There is little doubt that Marshall-Hall was a musician of rare gifts. Arthur Somervell, examiner for the Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music, London, and from 1901 Chief Inspector of Music in Schools for England, wrote in 1900:

I have examined at Sydney, I have nearly finished at Melbourne, and the standard of the two places is as different as chalk and cheese, and I attribute it to the fact that they have had there for some years a first rate musician, a man with a head on his shoulders, and a strong head too, who is to this juvenile country what a schoolmaster is to a boy, disciplining him into the right ways of thinking and acting, fearlessly holding up only the highest standards and utterly scorning the philistines who oppose him.¹

Of his conducting, the leader of his orchestra Franz Dierich, who played with many European orchestras, wrote in 1936:

¹Quoted in E. Scott, A History of the University of Melbourne, Melbourne, 1936, p. 156.
Of all the conductors under whom I played, he was in the same class as Hans Richter, Molinari and Weltner for musicianship, sincerity and enthusiasm. All the others although some of them were very clever, were all more or less showmen who only want effects. *sic.*

The English writer on music A.E.J. Lee was so impressed with Marshall-Hall's work that he gave him 1000 pounds. He wrote in 1925:

He was as I have said, the first of British conductors. ...I do not say he was in every respect the equal of Richter, Nikisch, Kussevitsky and Weingartner... In the world of music those names are household words, that of Marshall-Hall is not. The difference between him and them may amount to no more than that.  

But aside from teaching, conducting, and championing whatever cause took his fancy, Marshall-Hall was also a composer. He composed from his teenage years till the end of his life, and his output included 7 operas, operettas or music dramas, 6 works for orchestra, 5 for soloist and orchestra, 2 for chorus and orchestra, 8 for various chamber groups, 7 for piano solo, 3 for the church, and 30 songs. As a composer his talents were less well known, less discussed, and therefore less appreciated. Few reliable critics heard his music, and those who did heard only the works composed before his arrival in Australia in 1891.

It is significant that the most distinguished critics to deal with Marshall-Hall's music were unanimous in their opinion that he had a promising talent. Sir Hubert Parry.

---

1F. Dierich, letter to Mrs. H. Brookes, 10 October 1936, GM.
3see Appendix II.
English composer and Professor of composition at the Royal College of Music while Marshall-Hall was a student there, wrote in 1888:

...as a composer he has gifts of a very high order indeed, combined with considerable literary powers and taste...¹

George Bernard Shaw, eccentric but perceptive as a musical critic, reviewed several of the composer's works. In 1890 he reviewed a book of songs for The World:

Of the songs which claim more serious consideration ...one is a little cycle of songs by Marshall-Hall with a rhymed preface containing some strong observations as to the sort of encouragement the author received in this country 'where Truth and Art seek bread and home in vain'. Australia has now offered Mr. Marshall-Hall a professorship which will, it is to be hoped, establish some sort of truce between truth and art and their natural enemies, the baker and the landlord. But these songs will not make Mr. Marshall-Hall so popular in Australia as Mr. Milton Wellings, for they are no simple tunes with every strain repeated and furnished with an obvious compliment. They run into dramatic monologue of the very latest Wagnerian type, rather a serious matter for the ordinary amateur.²

George Grove, Principal of the Royal College of Music and founding editor of Groves Dictionary of Music and Musicians, wrote the composer a glowing testimonial for the Melbourne professorship, and quite possibly was the author of the programme note, for the 1888 Performance of an aria from Harold, which concludes: "...all the subjects are worked together in a manner that cannot fail to arrest attention

¹Hubert Parry, testimonial letter for Marshall-Hall, 7 March 1888, GM.

by its ingenuity and stirring effect," though when expressing his opinion in private he was not so enthusiastic. 1

After 1891, very little of the writing on Marshall-Hall's music can be regarded as reliable critical assessment. In Melbourne the music reviews were written by amateurs, and often by men with a strong personal bias for or against Marshall-Hall. The Argus, the most respected and worthy newspaper in Melbourne at the time, kept a music critic who was a loathed enemy of the composer, T.H. Guennett; and when Guennett died in 1900, he was replaced by Rev. E.H. Sugden, who was a personal friend and supporter of the composer. The Herald used E. Hartung as their critic, who was none other than the Secretary of the composer's Melbourne Conservatorium. The opinions of these men are of historical interest, but must be discarded as critical assessment.

Few of the contemporary histories of Australian music dealt with Marshall-Hall as a composer. W. Arundel Orchard, Director of the Sydney Conservatorium in the early years of the twentieth century, described the composer's excitement on hearing Puccini's Madame Butterfly in Sydney in 1910 and suggested an influence of that work on Stella. 2 In his Music in Australia, he describes the 'Horn Quartet' as part of the composer's effort to foster chamber music in Melbourne; but he attributes Fritz Hart's Malvolio to the composer, and gives some inaccurate information about European performances of the composer's work. 3 Arundel-Orchard's observations are a mixture of perception, reminiscence, and material also found in E. Scott's A History of the University of Melbourne. 4

---

1 Programme note, /1888 Henschel Popular Concerts/, in composer's scrapbook, GM; but see reference in letters, Groves to Miss Oldham, RC.
3 W. Arundel Orchard, Music in Australia, Adelaide, 1952 pp.93,141-
4 E. Scott, loc.cit.
which he does not synthesize into any evaluative conclusion about the composer. Isabelle Moresby in *Australia Makes Music*, recalls the composer's 'black unruly hair, bushy eyebrows, piercing eyes, terrifying or inspiring voice...' and she describes his abilities as a conductor, but has nothing to say of his music.¹ Thomas Brentnall, Melbourne representative for the Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music, London, included in his *My Memories*... a discussion of the composer's severance from the University of Melbourne in 1900, but makes no mention of the music.² James Barrett, Lecturer on physiology at the University of Melbourne and later Chancellor of the University, a leading Melbourne surgeon, who collaborated with the composer in many of his ventures, confined his numerous references to the composer to his conducting abilities.³

The periodical literature is even less productive after 1891. John F. Runciman, critic for the *Saturday Revue* (London) and editor of *Chords*, confined his comments to the composer's conducting abilities,⁴ though he had played a Marshall-Hall work at an organ recital in 1890. Edmondstoune Duncan, a fellow student at the Royal College of Music with the composer, wrote an obituary article for him in 1915, which gives the most complete account of his scores, editions,

¹Isabelle Moresby, *Australia Makes Music*, Melbourne 1948, pp. 145-


and performances, and seems to be an isolated attempt to record his achievements. Harold Elvins, a colleague at the Melbourne Conservatorium, wrote of the composer's high ideals, but not of his music:

Marshall-Hall built as only men of great true spiritual strength build, stronger than he knew. It was the idealist the visionary, not the human being, who was the architect. The foundation upon which his teaching and curriculum were established was the spiritual power of the classics, a power that forbade the entry of any form of charlatanism or any element that would undermine the highest musical or artistic ideal...  

J. Sutton Crow, a pupil of Marshall-Hall, wrote of the character of the man, but again, not of his music:

What a personality! What a joy to spend happy hours in the company of a man with such human understanding... He was of the opinion that the community was the slave of conventions and needed to be stung into life if it was to accomplish anything in the arts, and more particularly in music.

It is tempting to conclude that the enthusiasm of Parry, Shaw and Grove for the young Marshall-Hall and the general silence of reliable critics after 1891 indicates a composer who never developed his talents to maturity. A.E.J. Lee was of that opinion, 'The Professor', he wrote, 'will have to realise that his strength lies in conducting rather than composing'. Alternatively, it might be tempting to conclude that the emphasis of writers in Melbourne after 1891 on his conducting rather than his composing indicates that composition

4. A.E.J. Lee, Letter to Barrett, 3 May 1914, GM.
was a side interest for him and not intended for serious consideration.

In terms of the number of performances of the composer's works, the music must certainly be regarded as a failure. Most often the works were performed once and never repeated. Excerpts from Harold were performed by George Henschel with the London Symphony Orchestra in 1886 and at Runciman's organ recital in St. Nicholas Cole Abbey in 1890; the Overture to Giordano Bruno was given at the Crystal Palace by August Manns in 1893; the String Quartet in C was given at Queens Hall in 1895; the Eb Symphony was given twice in London by Henry Wood at Queens Hall in 1907-11; while in Melbourne the composer conducted his Idyll in 1894 and 1906, the Choral Ode in 1899, the Eb Symphony in 1904 and 1908, the Phantasy for horn and orchestra in 1906, Caprice for violin and orchestra in 1910, Long after in 1900, 1906, and 1912, Quartet for horn, violi, viola, and piano ca 1910, String Quartet in D in 1911, and excerpts from his operas Dido in 1899, Aristodemus in 1901, and Romeo and Juliet in 1912. Alcestis and Stella were the only operas ever to be performed complete, the former three times in Melbourne in 1898, and in Meissen, (East) Germany, in 1913, the latter in Melbourne in 1912, and again in abridged form in London in 1914. \(^1\) There is some evidence that Leonard, Melody, An Grabe Anselmos, La belle dame sans merci, the slow movement of the Symphony in C, and the songs of Song-cycle of life and love were also performed\(^2\). But no work was taken into the regular repertoire.

In terms of the composer's success with publication too, the works must be regarded as a failure. None of the music survived beyond a first edition, and today none is available in print or on commercial recording. An excerpt from Harold was published in the

\(^1\)See Appendix II \(^2\)Ibid.
Magazine of Music in 1888, A song-cycle of life and love by Joseph Williams in 1890, An Australian National Song in Federated Australia in 1900, the Eb Symphony by Paris and Co., Berlin, and in duet arrangement by Breitkopf und HärTEL in 1905, Deux Fantaisies by Schott, London ca 1907, and Romeo and Juliet in vocal score by Enoch and Sons, London, in 1914 through private subscription from Mrs Herbert Brooks, a former pupil. A plan to publish Alcestis with a German translation seems never to have come to fruition. The manuscripts of the extant works are preserved in the Grainger Museum.¹

Since his death, his works have been completely neglected by performers. Verbruggen, Director of the Sydney Conservatorium gave the Eb Symphony in 1917, and more recently the Australian Broadcasting Commission have made tapes of the Quartet for horn, violin, viola, and piano, one of the Deux Fantaisies and an excerpt from Romeo and Juliet arranged by George Dreyfus. But this has been all.

Marshall-Hall's lack of success with performances, publication, and critics does not however, subtract all value from his music as study material. For his migration to Australia at the age of 27, and his creative reaction to it are of the highest interest. Geoffre; Serle, in his sketchy, derivative, but nevertheless useful study of the creative spirit in Australia, From Deserts the Prophets Come, has touched on an important issue, the nature of the climate in Australia in the 1880s and 90s for an artist:

A colony was a fair field for the materialist struggle to get up and out of the rut and on top, no holds being barred. Acquisitiveness is the mortal enemy of the life of intellect and creativity. A long time has to pass before a new society will recognise praiseworthy virtues other than hard work, manual skills and the ability to cope and improvise...
There is little doubt that writers and artists felt

¹see Appendix II
themselves confronted with a viciously hostile society.\textsuperscript{1}

The public for the arts was therefore small:

The small conservative public interested in art at this stage sheered away in distaste from painting reflecting Australian nationalism, however moderately... (After 1900) the educated middle class, with a few exceptions, was content to import culture like other consumer goods, and had a minimum contact with any living creative culture.\textsuperscript{2}

Serle identifies in Australia at this time a painful process of transplantation, in which the European culture gradually gives way to a new aesthetic. He identifies the process as slowest of all for music in Australia, and it would not be surprising therefore that Marshall-Hall found little recognition for his music in his adopted country. Cut off from Europe by great distance, it would not be surprising that he found it difficult to maintain links with England's musical life. His only contacts with Europe after 1891 were his three return visits there in 1894, 1907-8 and 1913-14; the scores of new Debussy and Tchaikowsky works sent to him after 1908 by A.E.J. Lee\textsuperscript{3}; and the fleeting contacts with visiting artists for whom he conducted. A judgement of his success as a composer based on his success with performances, publication and criticism is, on these grounds, of questionable value. Furthermore, there are numerous cases in the XIXth century where composers of first rate ability did not find commercial success in their own lifetimes. Wagner is the outstanding case in point: few of his operas were successful with the public at first, and he was rescued from financial difficulties by his friends many times.

\textsuperscript{1}Geoffrey Serle, \textit{From Deserts the Prophets Come: The creative spirit in Australia, 1788-1972}, p. 55.

\textsuperscript{2}\textit{Ibid.}, p. 79...90.

\textsuperscript{3}A list of scores sent by A.E.J. Lee appears in Prospectus, 1910 Orchestral Subscription Series, Melbourne, GM.
There is compelling argument too, that composition was not a side issue for the composer. Such was his faith in his music, and in particular in his operas, that at the age of 50 he abandoned his livelihood in Melbourne and returned to England, confident of a permanent career as a professional opera composer. He wrote to James Barrett:

I am not thinking of taking up conducting, even where it is feasible. I am relying on the fact that there are no English composers of opera; and indeed only a couple of 'operators' just now in the whole world. I pin my faith entirely on Stella and Romeo. If I am there to superintend and they get a fair hearing, they are certain to succeed.¹

His faith in his music sustained him through two years of financial hardship and personal misery, in spite of all signs that only complete failure confronted him. Even after his return to Melbourne in 1915, failure had not daunted him, and he made plans for two more operas, one based on Shakespeare's As You Like It, and one based on The Trojan Women.²

Furthermore, it is possible that Marshall-Hall simply did not have a fair hearing. A.E.J. Lee's damning comment was based on an extensive knowledge of the composer's conducting abilities, but his knowledge of the music was limited to his experience of Stella in London in 1914 - a disastrous performance, in which the tragedy was staged as a curtain-raiser to a variety show at the London Palladium. Even for a very brilliant composer, there were few opportunities to have new works heard, either in Australia or in England. In Australia, according to Serle, the situation became worse rather than better after 1900,

¹Marshall-Hall, letter to Barrett, 4 February 1913, GM.
²Letter to Barrett, 3 July 1913, GM, which announces his plans for two more operas. These are assumed to be (1) As You Like It, referred to in a letter to Barrett, 12 December 1912 GM, and (2) The Trojan Women, referred to in Theatre Magazine March 1915, p.18 (also published as Theatre, Sydney, Melbourne)
as the public for the arts turned their backs on local
talent, and looked longingly toward Europe:

the period 1900-1940 marks a perpetuation of
colonial dependance and a curious hesitation in the
development towards nationhood. For Australia was
captured by jingo-imperialism and British racism;
evangelical imperialism almost fulfilled the function
of organised religion...The idealistic impulse of
the bush had died away. It is difficult to discern
any coherent cultural development or much achievement
in the first third of the century...Australian
taste was now utterly conservative and backward. ¹

In England, the situation was little better. William Chappell,
in his study The Late XIXth Century Renaissance of Music in
England, points out that the operatic life of England was
dominated by foreign (usually Italian) opera until about 1880,
and then by Wagner. ² Though pleas for the establishment of a
native opera had been of frequent occurrence since 1875 ³ and
Stanford had waged a particularly strong campaign after 1899,
the Carlo Rosa Company and the Moody Manners Company were the
only outlets for native opera; the former till 1900, the
latter after 1900. ⁴ The situation was curiously like the
once-only performances that Marshall-Hall was confronted with
in Australia:

Native works comprised only a small proportion of
those presented by established bodies in London;
but for the existence of the provincial festivals
many English composers could never have reached
perfection...the fact that most of these works
received only one performance and were forgotten.
'a mournful procession of the still-born' they were
called by Joseph Bennett - was not really important.
They allowed the fledgling native composer to try

¹Serle, op. cit., pp. 89-90.
²William Chappell, unpublished M.A. thesis, University of
Melbourne 1963, p. 82.
³Ibid., pp. 83-98.
⁴Ibid., p. 83.
his wings. They were necessary precursors of works of greater artistic merit...Gerontius and later masterworks might not have eventuated without experience gained at festivals by their composers.

On all these grounds, a new appraisal of Marshall-Hall's music seems called for. To try to establish whether music which has never been fairly heard by the public is 'good' or 'bad' music would be pointless: the appropriate test for this kind of aesthetic judgement would be to perform the works under satisfactory conditions. But an attempt to determine a proper perspective for Marshall-Hall's music, to compare him therein to appropriate models, and to measure his success in putting his own ideas into practise would be a useful replacement to the existing inadequate judgements of the composer.

There is another reason for undertaking a new appraisal of Marshall-Hall's music. Serle, in studying the effects of cultural transplantation on Australia, identifies Percy Grainger and Henry Tate as the first significant composers in Australia. This is an unlikely proposition. Serle can hardly be blamed for his scanty view of 19th-century music in Australia, for he was limited to the manuals of Australian music history available to him, none of which is particularly adequate. In his synthesis of a general cultural history from studies in various disciplines, he has done useful work. He summarizes the process of European cultural transplantation as follows:

An early period of imitation, of working in the styles of the parent civilization, is followed by a stage of national assertiveness which celebrates the local subject matter and values of the new nation struggling to be born; then an uneasy period of clash between the nativists and those holding fast to the values of the imperial source; and finally, when something like mature nationhood has been achieved,

2 Serle, *op. cit.*, pp. 79-83.
a reconciliation in which a relaxed sense of nationality is combined with openness to international influences.¹

Tate and Grainger, according to Serle, are the beginning of a late flowering of the 'national assertiveness' stage for Australian musical history. Before this, there was no 'period of imitation' for music - 'musical composition was of negligible importance'.² It may well be that there was no composer in 19th-century Australia of Grainger's stature, but the only way of demonstrating this is by a prolonged period of substantial work on the part of Australian musicologists. The full panorama of colonial musical life in Australia has yet to be illuminated. Substantial archives of early Australian composit remain neglected and numerous collections in private hands of the fourth-, and fifth-generation Australians remain unexamined. The resurrection of very significant music remains a real possibility.

An appropriate limitation for a new appraisal of Marshall-Hall's music would be to confine the examination to the operas - Leonard, Dido, Harold, Aleotis, Aristodemus, Stella, and Romeo and Juliet. By constructing a chronology of these operas, see Appendix II it can be seen that opera was a medium which occupied the composer throughout his life, from his early teens to his last projected plans The Tempest, The Trojan Women, and As you like it. It was on his operas that the composer staked his career, as a reliable source of income, in

¹Serle, op.cit., p.229
²Ibid., p.48
1912-14, and it was for opera that he hoped to be remembered. His operas therefore, are a representative sample of his creative effort, and seem to be the part of his output that he regarded most seriously.

Opera is an art form combining music with theatrical representation. Though music plays a fundamental role in determining the character of an opera, the nature of its role is difficult to define. In the operas of Rossini or Bellini, music dominated the other elements; in the operas of Peri or Caccini the text had a dominant role; in the operas of Wagner there was an attempt to achieve a balance between the various elements. Donald Jay Grout in *A Short History of Opera* has proposed that opera can be further defined by its special inherent features of luxuriousness and stylization or convention:

> It involves the co-operation of a large number of experts...is conditioned poetically, musically, scenically and to the last detail by the ideas and desires of those upon whom it depends, and this to a degree and in a manner not true of any other musical form. The opera is the visible and audible projection of the power, wealth, and taste of the society that supports it. Opera is always laden with certain conventions, which people agree to accept while at the same time acknowledging them to be unnatural or even ridiculous. Take for example the practice of singing instead of talking...Not only are there such timeless conventions in opera, but every age has a set of them peculiar to itself, which the second or third generation following begins to find old fashioned and the next generation finds insupportable.

---

1 When the composer returned to England, he took the Ms. scores of *Alcestis*, *Aristodemus*, *Stella* and *Romeo and Juliet*, with him - vide chapter V.

2 A page of score from *Romeo and Juliet* is sculptured in marble on the composer's gravestone at the Brighton Cemetery, Melbourne.


Two of the Marshall-Hall works to be considered here depart from the convention of singing, *Alcestis* and *Aristodemus*, and the question of whether they can properly be called opera will be relevant to the enquiry.

If music plays a fundamental role in the works, an examination of the musical genre and forms will be of importance. Normally, the study of form in tonal music involves the study of the interaction between thematic design and tonal structure, and neglect of this interaction can lead to an incomplete view of a work. Donald Tovey in 'A note on opera' criticizing the Wagner analysts who confine themselves to thematic design, notes:

No classical symphony has larger slabs of exact recapitulation than those that hold Wagner's immense works together...when he broke down the old classical organisation of operatic numbers, he did not pulverise music into 'motives', but built it into symmetries tenfold longer in time and a thousandfold more voluminous than any that music had known before. How far smaller symmetries can co-exist with these is a profound and practical question which constitutes one of the permanent stumbling blocks of criticism.¹

In Marshall-Hall's generation, the analysts - and the composers too - were particularly unbalanced in this regard. Egon Wellesz, in his *Essays on opera* has pointed this out:

Wagner's followers indeed took over from him just what was least worthy of imitation, the moments in which the action of the drama was held up...They no longer grasped the full sweep of the drama as a whole, the structure of acts and scenes. They expended their best energies on isolated phrases and words. They composed the details only of the drama...²

But a consideration of opera must involve more than a


study of musical genre and form, for presumably the other elements endeavour to collaborate with music to produce a single unified impression on the audience. An examination of this hybrid aesthetic impression needs a flexible approach. The focus of such criticism is perhaps best defined by Joseph Kerman in his study *Opera as Drama*.

In seeking a critical method, he compares analogically the role of music in drama to the role of poetry in spoken drama:

What is essentially at issue is the response of the persons in the play to the elements of the action. In this area, poetry can do more than prose discussions or placement of the actors into physical or psychological relationships. The particular aspect or weight of such relationships, of events and episodes, is determined by the quality of the verse; and in the largest sense the dramatic form is articulated by poetry in conjunction with the plot structure. The same can be true of music.

If the functions of poetry and music in drama are analogically the same, then the criticism of poetry and music in drama is analogically the same:

Each art has the final responsibility for the success of the drama, for it is within their capacity to define the response of characters to deeds and situations. Like poetry, music can reveal the quality of the action and thus determine dramatic form in the most serious sense... The final judgement is then squarely musical, but it is not purely musical any more than it is purely literary.

Taking this view, Kerman examines a representative sample of operas from Monteverdi's *Orfeo* to Berg's *Wozzeck*. His conclusions are convincing: those operas he judges failures do not fail because of mere faults in conception or technique — for he is able to point to many such faults in good operas —

---

they fail because of ineffective, inappropriate, or insensitive responses to the action. Others fail simply because the area of human experience chosen for treatment proves intractible to the necessities of dramatic form.\textsuperscript{1} 'The best operas are dramatic, and they stand with the best productions of the modern age.'\textsuperscript{2} In considering opera therefore, it is not necessary to exclude any genre or form from the realm of possibilities; the crucial question is the dramatic impact a particular form produces in collaboration with the plot-structure and the visual effect.

A consequence of this view is that the action of the drama and the expressed response to the action are of differing importance in opera. This is undoubtedly true, and accounts for the difference between the attributes of a good play and a good opera libretto. Grout observes that while a play emphasises characters and plot, an opera libretto invariably emphasises episodes - pauses in the action which allow for the development of musical ideas, - aria, chorus, dance and orchestral interlude. Character and plot are sketched in broad outlines, with normally fewer events, less complex interconnections, and simpler action than in corresponding spoken drama. Words and images are normally limited to ideas that are relatively easy to convey, and are chosen for their emotional suggestion and vocal sound quality.\textsuperscript{3} To return to Tovey:

\begin{quote}
The general formula for the solution of the problem of opera is that each step in the action must occur swiftly and culminate in a tableau which gives opportunity for highly developed music...dramatic action is explosion, and each explosion changes one tableau into another.\textsuperscript{4}
\end{quote}

\textsuperscript{1}\textit{Ibid.}, p. 263.
\textsuperscript{2}\textit{Ibid.}, p. 267.
\textsuperscript{3}\textit{Grout, op. cit.}, pp. 4-5.
\textsuperscript{4}\textit{Tovey, op. cit.}, p. 354.
Marshall-Hall wrote or arranged the librettis for most of his operas, and it will be relevant to examine the suitability of his settings to operatic treatment and the nature of his adaptations, for they will have a bearing on the extent of his success with musical treatment.

An examination of the composer's music must also take his theoretical writings into account, and it may be assumed that the musical works were composed with these theoretical standards and principles in mind. How far Marshall-Hall measured up to his own theoretical dicta would depend both on his technical abilities and the quality of the dicta themselves, and may provide information useful to an appraisal of his music. Marshall-Hall expressed his ideas before 1891 in a series of articles and letters published in the English musical journals. After his arrival in Australia, the contributions to English journals ceased, and he expressed his ideas chiefly through his public lectures at the University of Melbourne, extracts of which were occasionally published in The Argus. The poetic efforts published during his first ten years in Australia are also of interest. In the years after his severance from the University in 1900 he was less vocal, though he occasionally wrote an article for The Argus, and programme notes for his orchestral concerts. In the final three years of his life, during his miserable stay in England, his personal letters to James Barrett are of some importance. A list of literary works, published and unpublished, can be found in Appendix I.

A survey of the composer's theoretical writings reveals certain changes in his ideas over the years. These may be conveniently expressed in a series of chronological abstracts, which appear throughout the text of this study, interpolated with the study of the operas that were contemporary to the writings.

The perspective in which Marshall-Hall's operas should be
viewed must be made clear, for the questions of the originality and the significance of his music and ideas may be dealt with by comparing his work with the music and ideas of others around him. Important factors are the direct influence on the composer of the ideas and styles of others, the influence of the artistic milieu on the composer, and the influence of the preferences and taste of the public at large. In the case of Marshall-Hall it is clear that these influences must be considered in two parts - before and after 1891 - for with his removal to Australia the milieu, the public, and the exposure to the styles and ideas of others change drastically.

Marshall-Hall spent most of the first twenty seven years of his life in England, and the English musical climate during this time is an important factor to be considered. To return to Chappell, the last quarter of the XIXth century was a period during which 'an immense revival of national musical consciousness' was taking place in England. Stanford and Parry were the leaders of this revival, two widely cultured and educated men who were both knighted for their services to music - an indication of the increased status that musicians enjoyed in England as the revival progressed.¹ Chappell saw four direct influences on English composers of this 'Renaissance'; the first was the 'intellectual' influence, manifested in the growth of popularity in England of Bach, Brahms and Schumann:

The emotion was often at some distance from the surface. It was this element of intellectualisation that appealed to the British mind, which possessed the same characteristics. Restraint, reticence, strong emotion kept well below the surface were the common factors that resulted in a strong affinity between Bach and the British spirit - an affinity which still exists.²

¹Chappell, op. cit., p. 297.
²Ibid., p. 298.
The second direct influence was the ideas of the 'nationalist' composers, Dvorak, Grieg and Tchiakowsky:

Little was derived from them in the way of idiom or content but their intense nationalism spurred on British composers to emulate them in using elements from the British environment; their ethos and use of native folk music was assimilated.¹

The third direct influence was the music-dramas and ideas of Richard Wagner:

Wagner, because of his forward-looking and progressive approach to music as well as his evident greatness as a composer captured the imagination of the Renaissance group and they followed his methods as far as native reticence allowed - in the use of leitmotiven for instance. One feels however that it was Wagner in his diatonic aspect that appealed - as the composer of Meistersinger rather than of Tristan.²

The fourth direct influence was the choral music of Handel, Bach, Mendelssohn and Brahms, to which the native English disposition for choral singing responded strongly at this time, perhaps because of the introduction of tonic-sol-fa teaching in schools and the flourish of extra curricular choral activities in Universities.³

The spirit of the artistic milieu may be seen in the musical life of the Universities and gathering places for young composers and musicians. In the universities, orchestral and choral societies made an important contribution:

Although relatively small in quantity, this music-making exerted a powerful influence on a stratum of society generally apathetic to art. Minds that had regarded music as an unnecessary and ornamental fringe to life were conditioned to the idea that music was an equal partner to the other arts and that the pursuit of music could rank with the other professions.⁴

¹Ibid., p. 306.
²Ibid., p. 307.
³Ibid., p. 310.
⁴Ibid., p. 148.
But musical education was in a sorry state. Though things improved a little towards the end of the century, courses for the would-be composer were conservative. The course at Oxford, for example:

...tended to be heavily academic, producing composition that was technically correct according to textbook rules but which was dull and lacking in spark of inspiration. Most of the professors produced textbooks of harmony and counterpoint, and the rules laid down therein had to be observed very closely by students taking musical degrees. The most unfortunate aspect of these textbooks was their artificiality. If they had been founded on the practice of the great masters they could have done little harm; instead however they all too often appeared to prove the master wrong.¹

In the schools too, the climate for music was poor:

Such music as there was in the day schools before Foresters Elementary Education Act of 1870 and indeed long after it was purely vocal, consisting of the singing of songs (invariably moralistic in theme). Where there happened to be a competent teacher, sight-singing was also taught - a result of the Hullah-Curwen sol-fa movements...no pianos were provided in day schools until 1890, and when they were, strong opposition was encountered from parents who thought that instruction on the piano was intended...even at the end of the century little music beyond class singing took place in the elementary schools... (In public schools) musical activities were limited to individual instrumental training and vocal music directed towards school concerts and the chapel choir - the day of musical appreciation as a subject had of course not yet arrived.²

¹Ibid., p. 150.
²Ibid., p. 142.
It is significant that Chappell concluded that opera was not really involved in the Renaissance. The leading opera composers were Balfe, Macfarren, Wallace and Benedict till 1880, then Stanford, Thomas, MacKenzie, Cowen and Sullivan until 1900. The generation contemporary with Marshall-Hall was led by Bantock, Smyth, MacCunn and Holst. Except for Macfarren, the operas of all these composers tended to be:

light in nature and written down to the public taste... In terms of number of performances, most of these operas must be classed as failures... serious native opera in the Renaissance period may therefore be considered as having been in a feeble state indeed.\(^1\)

Chappell does not accept the usual explanations for the failure of English opera in this period: unfriendly critics could not be blamed, for they were unfriendly with good reason; over-cautious managers could not be blamed, for they were and are always cautious; and intractable singers are a common problem in all operatic enterprise.\(^2\) Chappell saw the real reasons as the poor quality of the libretti, such as the 'fake, antique, "Olde Englishe" in Stanford's \textit{Canterbury Pilgrims},' the obscure, stilted action, the lack of really British dramatic subjects, plagiarism, and the lack of composers with the technical command to discard alien models.\(^3\)

The preferences and taste of the public at large may be seen in the programmes of the leading concert series of the day: Manns' Crystal Palace series, Richter's concerts, Henschel's London Symphony Orchestra concerts, and after 1900.

\(^1\) \textit{Ibid.}, p. 93.
\(^2\) \textit{Ibid.}, p. 100.
\(^3\) \textit{Ibid.}, p. 105.
Wood's Queens Hall concerts. Throughout the time of Marshall-Hall's residence in England, these performances were dominated by foreign works, though Manns 'gave most generous recognition of British composers'.\(^1\) Beethoven had the overall ascendancy, while Bach steadily grew in popularity to a position of worship by the end of the century. Schubert and Brahms were both antagonised until Manns gave them popularity.\(^2\) The opportunities for native composers were few, and mostly in the provincial festivals.

Chappell's view of English musical life is based on a rejection of the reminiscences of musicians of the period, a criticism of existing histories, and a return to the primary sources: the musical journals of the period, *Musical Standard*, *Musical Times*, *Musical World*, *Musical Opinion*, *Musical News* and *School Music Review*. The observations he recorded are methodically determined, and would seem a reasonable basis for a view of the climate of the period.

After 1891, the cultural climate changed for Marshall-Hall. He became cut off from his English and European experience, indeed there is evidence that it become an idealised memory for him: On his return visits in 1894, 1907-8, and 1913-14 he was repeatedly disappointed with aspects of what he found. His response to these renewed contacts is documented in his writings, and will be treated in the text of this study. His only other contacts with live European culture after 1891 were the visiting artists who performed in Australia. Significant among these for a study of the composer's operas is his introduction to the music of Puccini through the performance in Melbourne of *La Bohème* in 1901, *La Traviata* in 1911, and the performance in Sydney of *Madame Butterfly* in 1910. His response to these works is also

documented in his writings, and will be dealt with in the
text of this study. An important factor to be considered is
that there were no direct influences of other composers on
Marshall-Hall, simply because there were no other composers
of any significance in Melbourne: the leading local
composers were a clergyman, G.W. Torrance, and two amateur
choral conductors, Joseph Sommers and Julius Siede. These
three men could have been of little interest to Marshall-Hall.
But while the composer was isolated in this sense, he was not
isolated in the broadest cultural sense. To return to Serle,
there was a thriving creative school in Melbourne at the time
of his arrival — the Heidelberg school of painters:

The Heidelberg painters of the late 1880s
achieved a remarkable breakthrough in quality,
style and range of painting... Much of the painters' inspiration and what they had to say was a clear
reflection and product of the ferment of
nationalist idealism of the day... Streton's
bold pastoral landscapes and the history painting
of Roberts and McCubbin (despite their very
different approaches) reflected the new interest
in the Australian past, celebrated the achievement
of a century.\(^1\)

Serle identifies this movement as the period of 'national assertiveness' for Australian art, and indeed for most cultural pursuits except music. It was the 'springtime, adolescent period' of Australian cultural history.\(^2\) But it vanished quickly in the 1890s, giving way to a less productive period:

Naive, confident optimism was reflected by writers and artists striving to express a new civilisation. But in the 90s depression and class war shattered such illusions... The nationalist surge of the 80s and 90s proved to have been a false start. Depression, drought, class war and military adventuring in South Africa ushered in the twentieth century. The achievement of Federation, against the tide, brought little revival of national inspiration.\(^3\)

\(^1\) Serle, op. cit., p. 71...78.
\(^2\) Ibid., p. 60.
\(^3\) Ibid., p. 60...89.
In the first years of the twentieth century, this Heidelberg school, or what little remained of it, dispersed. Streeton, Roberts, and many others turned their backs on Australia, and spent long periods abroad; some, like Norman Lindsay, sought a refuge from national assertiveness or from imitation of the parent culture in 'a tradition substitute - for any past other than the present';

Lindsay is the star example of a problem which is peculiar to isolated cultures like Australia's. He had no sense of history whatever, but he disliked and distrusted the present. Therefore he tried to flee backwards into an illusory past whose true nature he would not and could not understand.¹

The artistic milieu in Melbourne when Marshall-Hall arrived was therefore not musical, but significant nevertheless. As it happens, Marshall-Hall quickly became intimately involved with the painters of this group, and it is likely that their ideas would have influenced him, and that the change in climate after 1900 would have affected him too.

The preferences and taste of the public at large for music has already been referred to: it was in an embryonic state. Barbara MacKenzie, in Singers of Australia, documents the occasional tours of foreign opera companies in the 1890-1915 period, brought to Melbourne by the two local entrepreneurs, George Musgrove and J.C. Williamson's.² Choral societies flourished as they did in England, and local bands offered light weight programmes of overtures and medleys. The interest in 'home grown' opera was negligible, and the opportunities for performance of new works, unless they were oratorios or chorus pieces commissioned for the local choral societies, were small.³ As has been pointed out, Marshall-Hall had a

¹Ibid.. pp. 93-94 quoting Robert Hughes.
considerable degree of influence on the development of musical taste in Melbourne, and he created his own performance opportunities. It is significant however, that the lack of public opportunity for Marshall-Hall was not a malaise which affected him alone: it was a common problem for the milieu in which he lived. The Heidelberg painters too, as Serle points out, achieved little public recognition.\textsuperscript{1} Streeton and Roberts however, did not assume the pose of artists hampered or stunted in their development by lack of public patronage or interest, for they were surrounded by a lively company of fellow artists with whom to share their ideas. In view of Marshall-Hall's involvement in their milieu there is no reason why he should have felt any poorer for artistic stimulation than they did.

If the perspective in which Marshall-Hall's operas may be viewed is little different before 1891 from any other English composer of his generation, after 1891 it should account for the aspirations of Melbourne's painters. It will be useful therefore, while examining the composer's Melbourne music and ideas to compare it with the ideas of his artistic friends.

It is not anticipated that this study will dramatically reveal a figure of major significance for late XIXth- and early XXth-century music, hitherto hidden from the world at large. That possibility is remote. The production of opera by English-born composers, as Chappell has said, was in a feeble state; only the discovery of an operatic Elgar would upset this analysis. What can be expected here is the study of how a talented English musician responded creatively to an unusual situation - transplantation a great distance from his cultural home.

A study of Marshall-Hall's operas as a representative sample of his creative work may be conveniently divided into four parts: 1862-1890, from his birth to his departure for Australia; 1891-1900, until his severance from the University of Melbourne; 1901-1911, until his preparations to return to

\textsuperscript{1}Serle, \textit{op. cit.}, p. 79.
England; and 1912-1915, until his premature and unexpected death. These divisions are chronological, and based on the four different phases of his residence and employment rather than on any pre-conceived notion of stylistic development. In the absence of a definitive biography of the composer, a sketch of salient biographical information was prepared, which was interpolated with the study in this chronological division.

It should be noted that substantial work was in progress at the time of the commencement of this study in several closely related areas. An historical project relating to Marshall-Hall's activities in the public sphere and the controversies which surrounded him in Melbourne was being undertaken in the History Department of the University of Melbourne; a study of musical associations in Melbourne, including those with which the composer was associated was being undertaken in the Music Faculty; an historical and critical study of opera in Australia, cataloguing and fully documenting the sources was being undertaken at the University of Adelaide; and a study of the instrumental music of Marshall-Hall had been commenced at the University of Adelaide. None of these projects was completed during the period in which I was at work on the present enquiry, and none were made available to me in any form.

---

See! in legions untold
Flock the spirits of air,
And my being enfold
In their golden-bright hair;
They uplift me! - I'm borne
Through the wakening dawn -
Where? O where?

Marshall-Hall
from The call of Genius
published ca.1888, unidentified
cutting in GM.
CHAPTER II
1862-1890

George William Louis Marshall-Hall was born in Edgware Road, Blackheath, London on 28th March 1862, third son of a surgeon and grandson of a famous physiologist. As a boy he attended Blackheath Propriety School, where he did not shine intellectually, though the school records show a high mark in theology. From there he is said to have gone to Kings College, London. He became versed in Latin, Greek, Botany, Chemistry, Architecture, and Painting, and he learned the piano and violin. He had a flair for languages, becoming fluent in French and German and picking up a little Spanish.

From the age of twelve, he developed a passion for music. He began hoarding The Musical Standard, he played and studied the songs of Schubert, and he began to compose songs in a Schubertian manner. While his family was staying in Berlin for a time, he took lessons in piano from Carl August Haupt, Director of the Royal Institute for Church Music, and singing from a certain Herr Kotyolt of the Royal Berlin Opera. He came into contact with Wagner's operas - he may have been present at the first performances of Parsifal at Bayreuth in 1882 and he soon

1 Blackheath Propriety School Records, Lewisham Public Library.
2 E. Duncan 'G.W.L. Marshall-Hall; composer and poet; an appreciation' in Musical Times vol.LVI, August 1915, p.487
4 Copies of The Musical Standard nos.541-546, 1874-75, are preserved in the composer's estate, GM.
6 Letter of Application, loc.cit.
7 He wrote an article about it in Magazine of Music September 1888.
attempted to write opera too. He became fascinated with
cconducting, attending many concerts of Hans Richter and von Bülow,
and pencilling their interpretations into his scores. ¹

In 1878 at the age of seventeen, he went to 'Military College,'
near Oxford, as an Assistant Master teaching languages and playing
the college organ. ² In February 1882 he matriculated into Oxford,
but he never entered a college or completed a degree; his stay
could have lasted no longer than a year. ³ In September 1883 he
enrolled at the Royal College of Music, studying organ with
Walter Paratt, composition with Hubert Parry, and counterpoint
with Frederick Bridge. ⁵ The college was a new and exciting venture,
soon to make itself known for being more progressive and practical
than the Royal Academy of Music or the University Music Faculties,
and Marshall-Hall could not have asked for more distinguished
teachers. For a term he worked well, but he did not return in the
New Year. ⁶ Various stories have circulated about his departure
from the College - he may have thrown a book at Grove, the principal,
if so there is no mention of it in the College minutes. In any

¹ 'Music in Berlin' The Argus 26th January 1907.
² Testimonial letter from A. A. Bourne, Head of the college, 13th
January 1882, CR.
³ John Foster Alumni Orgonienses: the members of the University
of Oxford 1715-1886 (1887) Nedeln: Kraus Reprint Limited, 1968 ser. 2
vol.1-2, p. 587
⁴ Oxford University Calendar Oxford, 1883 p. 246; no entry 1884.
⁵ Royal College of Music report cards, minute books for 1883, RC.
⁶ Parratt: 'Has worked well,' Parry: 'Most hardworking and intelli-
   gent,' Bridge: 'Intelligent student'; no records for 1884. RC.
⁷ Anon. 'Marshall-Hall: a character sketch' in All about Aus-
event, in 1884 he took up work as a schoolmaster again, at Newton College, Devonshire. ¹

A picture emerges from these records of a restless young man, consumed by enthusiasm for music, yet lacking in the application necessary to make something of it. Marshall-Hall was not bent on following his father and grandfather into the medical profession, and later described the education he had received as work which 'encourages a boy to study not that he may become noble and good...but that he may sell his acquirements to the best market.' ² It is said that as a language teacher, he was so engrossed in composing that the headmaster had told the pupils to arrive half an hour after the appointed time, for Marshall-Hall was always late. ³ At Newton he was still required to teach languages, but he was also organist and choirmaster, and this was possibly the nearest he could get to a professional musical appointment with his tenuous training and experience. His single term at the Royal College of Music appears to be the only formal musical training he ever received, and what he learned otherwise about music he taught himself.

Marshall-Hall's scores up to his time at Newton number 2 operas, Leonard and Dido, as well as 20 songs, 3 works for church use, and 6 piano pieces. A further 8 unfinished sketches survive from this period, comprising 3 piano pieces, 3 anthems, and 2 drafts of songs on a single text of his own 'Parting and meeting'. ⁴ The composer lent naturally toward opera and music drama, and seemed to have little flair for piano music or sacred music, for he rarely

¹Testimonial letter of G. Townsend-Warner, Head of Newton College, 21st October 1886, CR.
²'What progress has England made in music...' School, ca. 1887
³Anon 'Marshall-Hall: a character sketch' loc. cit.
⁴See Appendix II
attempted them again after this early period. All these scores may be viewed as student exercises, in which the composer was learning his skill by trial and error, convinced that problems of composition were best solved by constant writing. When he gained opportunities to perform and publish his work in later years, he never sought to use these pieces, save a single aria from Dido. This is especially significant, because he had no hesitation in lifting whole passages from one work when composing another in later years. In 1885, the autograph score of Dido came to be used as a scrapbook for newspaper cuttings about gardening (see plate facing page 38). It is not unlikely that the composer himself put in these cuttings, for he had a knowledge of Botany and it remained a life-long passion of his. The defacing of the autograph score underlines his attitude to the work. Leonard has vanished entirely, save one duet that he copied out. Perhaps the score met the same fate as Dido, or perhaps the composer threw it away, selecting a single duet for preservation. Both operas appear in Tower's Dictionary of operas and operettas 'which have been performed on the public stage', but no other evidence for a performance has come to light.

Dido was completed by 1885, perhaps much earlier, for there are errors in nomenclature throughout the autograph which suggest a quite inexperienced hand.

---

1This was his advice to would-be composers in 'The essentials of art' in Alma mater vol.IV, no.5, p.13
2Nine pages of the autograph vocal score are partially or wholly obliterated by glued cuttings from the Garden Illustrated 1885-86, pp.125,135,139,150-53,163,165, GM
3See J. Sutton-Crow 'Marshall-Hall' Melba Con Magazine no.12 1945 p.4-7
4See Appendix II, Thematic Catalogue, 1:1
Marshall-Hall's libretto makes a number of changes to the Dido and Aeneas' story, as it originates in Vergil's The Aeneid book IV. The adaptation may be expressed as follows in Table 1.

**TABLE I**

**DIDO - MARSHALL-HALL'S ADAPATION OF VERGIL**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Vergil</th>
<th>Marshall-Hall</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>The Aeneid Book IV</strong>¹</td>
<td><strong>Dido</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dido in love, deserts her responsibilities to enter an affair with Aeneas.</td>
<td>Scene added with Aeneas in love, desiring his responsibilities to seduce Dido. act i</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Juno and Venus plot a meeting in the cave between the lovers.</td>
<td>Omitted. Aeneas and Achaetes plot the cave encounter. act ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interlude: The jealousy of King Iarbas, Fama.</td>
<td>Omitted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cave scene referred to in one paragraph.</td>
<td>Cave scene made a whole act, in which Aeneas seduces Dido. act iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The quarrel: Dido tries to blackmail Aeneas into betrothal.</td>
<td>A betrothal is assumed in the quarrel. act iv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aeneas receives a vision warning him of the burning of his fleet.</td>
<td>Omitted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dido commits suicide when her plans are defeated.</td>
<td>Dido commits suicide as the only honourable solution for a victim of breach of promise. act v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Epilogue: Juno and Iris.</td>
<td>Omitted</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The consequences of this adaptation are far reaching. Vergil's Dido is an emotional, irrational queen who deserts her courtly responsibilities to enter an illicit affair. Her death may be interpreted as the tragic outcome of her own moral collapse.\(^1\) Marshall-Hall's Dido is portrayed as a woman wronged by a scheming caddish man, summed up in her climatic lines in act V:

\[\begin{align*}
\text{I might have wed the mightiest at my choice,} \\
\text{And yet for thy dear sake I spurned them all} \\
\text{And laid mine honour in the dust for thee.}\end{align*}\(^2\)

The over-emphasis on the cave scene further polarises the interpretation. It becomes not a classical drama of intellectual conflict between the will of gods and the wants of mortals, but a carnal conquest, a sentimental story.

Marshall-Hall's adaptation may be explained as his youthful reaction to the Wagnerian dramas he had seen. In his early attempt at opera, he wanted a tragic heroine of the Wagnerian type: an Elsa or Isolde. It was common among critics of his time to regard Vergil's Dido as a jilted lover\(^3\), and in Dido the young composer saw a Wagnerian heroine ready made for him. He never considered Dido in any other light, as can be seen in his reference to her more than a decade later in his poem To Irene:

\[\begin{align*}
\text{...doing eternal penance for that wanton boy} \\
\text{Who maddening in love and loveliness} \\
\text{Sought immortality in Helen's kiss...}\end{align*}\(^4\)

This libretto the composer arranged into five acts. The arrangement may be expressed schematically as follows, Table 2.

---


\(^2\)Dido Ms. vocal score, p. 160.


\(^4\)Marshall-Hall, To Irene, Melbourne 1896, p. 12.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>act</th>
<th>scene</th>
<th>action</th>
<th>number</th>
<th>page in Ms score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>introduction</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>chorus</td>
<td>Dido and maidens</td>
<td>'Hail God of Light'</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>scena</td>
<td>Dido and Anna</td>
<td>'Maidens disperse'</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>march</td>
<td>Aeneas and soldiers</td>
<td></td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>scena</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>'Once more united'</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>scena/air</td>
<td>Aeneas alone</td>
<td>'At last alone'</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>recitative</td>
<td>Aeneas and herald</td>
<td>'Sir Trojan'</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>introduction</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>chorus</td>
<td>Maidens and soldiers</td>
<td>'Here awhile we gladly rest'</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>scena</td>
<td>Aeneas and Achates</td>
<td>'My chief, this heaviness of mien...' (184-200)</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>chorus</td>
<td>Dido and company</td>
<td>'All hail great Queen'</td>
<td>46 l</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>pageant</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td></td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>introduction</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>scena</td>
<td>Juno</td>
<td>'The hour has come'</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>scena/duetto</td>
<td>Dido and Aeneas</td>
<td>'Here in this friendly shelter' (171-177)</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>introduction</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>scena</td>
<td>Achates and soldiers</td>
<td>'Achates thou that knowest'</td>
<td>71 l</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>scena</td>
<td>Achates, Aeneas</td>
<td>'The sweet dream is o'er'</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>chorus/duet</td>
<td>Soldiers</td>
<td>'Di maris'</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>chorus</td>
<td>Dido and maidens</td>
<td>'Sweetly our song we raise'</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>scena</td>
<td>Dido and Anna</td>
<td>'Gracious Queen'</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>duet</td>
<td>Dido and Aeneas</td>
<td>'Dear love in tears'</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>quartet</td>
<td>Dido, Aeneas, maids</td>
<td>'Ah leave me not'</td>
<td>105 l</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>duet</td>
<td>Dido and Aeneas</td>
<td>'Farewell my love'</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5i</td>
<td>introduction</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>chorus</td>
<td>soldiers</td>
<td>'Once more upon the heaving waves'</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>scena/air</td>
<td>Achates</td>
<td>'Ah cruel love'</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>scena/chorus</td>
<td>Achates soldiers</td>
<td>'Di maris'</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>scena/trio</td>
<td>Achates,Dido,Anna</td>
<td>'Achates is it thou?'</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5ii</td>
<td>introduction</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>scena</td>
<td>Anna Dido</td>
<td>'Anna is all prepared'</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>scena</td>
<td>Dido alone</td>
<td>'Alone ah yes!'</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>finale</td>
<td>Anna, priests,</td>
<td></td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1In the Ms. vocal score, the opera runs from pp. 1-169. Later additions appear in three appendices, pp. 184-200, pp.171-177, pp. 178-183, which are indicated as intended for insertion at pp. 45, 65 and 102 respectively.
TABLE 3

DIDO — RECURRING THEMES (from autograph vocal score):

theme 1: associated with Dido's fate

appearances: Overture, p. 1; entry of Herald bringing Dido's message, Act 1 p. 31 (transposed, varied); Introduction, Act 2, p. 33 (rhythm $\frac{3}{4}$); Pageant before the hunt, Act 2, p. 47; Dido 'to the grave', Act 5 scene 1, p. 140.

theme 2: associated with the Trojan soldiers

appearances: entry of the Trojans, Act 1, p. 22-23 (sequential repetition); Trojan chorus, Act 2, p. 34 (transposed); Achates and soldiers, Act 4, p. 73 (2 octaves higher).

theme 3: Dido and Aeneas' duet

appearances: refrain at the opening of the duet, Act 3, p. 57; transposed at p. 60, 65, insertion p. 171-73; voices in thirds p. 69-70.
theme 4: Dido's aria

appearances: Introduction to the aria, Act 5, scene 2, p.142-43 (sequential repetition); opening recitative p.145 (transposed); interlude p.157 (transposed); p.160-61 (figures based on the rhythm of m.3 of the theme); before Dido's final words, p.161 (restatement, original form).
A major fault in the musical fabric of Dido is the proportions of the component parts. The overture, for example, is far too long. It covers 358 bars, three times the length of Wagner's prelude to Tristan und Isolde, while the opera that follows is only a fraction of the length of Tristan. The piece has a rambling episodical design, and a coda overburdened with applause-getting gestures, (tremolos, rows of ascending parallel chords, and emphatic 'thumps' by added-tone chords). It is possible that the composer later realised the imbalance caused by this over-long overture, for he wrote three pieces of additional material which extend three of the scenes of the opera. This added material appears in three appendices to the Ms. vocal score, with instructions as to the places of insertion. The extensions are for the scheming of Aeneas and Achates in act ii, the love duet in act iii, and the quarrel in act iv. The act ii insertion develops the character of Aeneas further, by the introduction of a proposal to abduct Dido by Achates, to which Aeneas reacts with horror. Four new thematic shapes appear to sustain the new action. The act iii insertion introduces no new thematic material, but serves as a slowing of the pace of the love duet, a 'marking time' to build the climax more steadily. The act iv insertion serves to exploit the tensions of the quarrel further by giving Aeneas 26 additional bars of placatory speech, which highlights even more Dido's desperate 'Do not leave me' at the end of the insertion.

These three insertions may therefore be said to be dramatically adept. But from a musical point of view they do not correct the imbalance in the work from the over-long overture. The scale of the work may be said to approach a one-act piece of five scenes rather than a five-act opera.

Recurring theme (1) requires some comment, because of its harmonic application in the work. The composer evidently tries to create an atmosphere of tension with the theme, of foreboding, by a play on the Bb-F# augmented fifth., see Table 3. A
comparison with Puccini's use of a similar device twenty years later in *Tosca* the opening chords, is instructive. Both composers play on the tension of an augmented chord, but Puccini's result is infinitely more concentrated and effective. The conclusion which may be drawn from this comparison is that Marshall-Hall is not deprived of fine ideas, though as yet he lacks the technique to make the best use of his ideas. But a more important criticism can be made by examining the composer's application of theme (1) in *Dido*. In its final appearance, accompanying Dido's resolve to commit suicide in act v, scene 1, it appears in the following harmonic form:

Autograph vocal score p.140

This harmonic form has a clear association in the listener's ear with Chopin's *March Funebre*. It was clearly the composer's intention that this theme, associated throughout the work with Dido, should here be clarified as a theme of death and destruction. This technique, of transforming a theme to have new significance in different dramatic context, is another aspect of Wagner's musico-dramatic style, and may be said to be a further part of the composer's attempt to assimilate that style to his own purpose. Unfortunately, the association with Chopin is a simplistic device, and tends to give the work the banality of a melodrama rather than the grandeur of a classical tragedy, at least to the modern ear.
In a somewhat haphazard way, the composer makes a limited use of harmonic colour-change for dramatic effect. Act I, for example, divides clearly into two halves of different tonal character. In the first half, Dido's scene, the tonality is unsettled: the maiden's chorus is disturbed by chromatic passages and the keys of Dido's dialogue with Anna continually side-step. In the second half of the act, by contrast, the tonality is clear cut, Aeneas' aria is firmly grounded in F major. A similar design occurs in Act IV, where the Trojan's scene has clear cut prolongations, while the maiden's chorus alternates between major and minor, and Dido's speech has continually shifting chromatic passages.

The most striking use of tonal design for dramatic purpose is evident in the love scene, Act III. The mood of the hunt is set at the opening of the act, with a jolly hunting ditty in C major, bars 1-15. Juno subsequently appears, accompanied by a motif of falling minor 7ths, which is similar to subordinate passage work first heard in the overture, bars 16-52. The storm which follows is made of swirling chromatic scales and cascades of themeless major and diminished chord figures, bars 53-55. Then the cave scene begins, with Bb major as tonic. As Aeneas' passion overtakes him, Ms. vocal score page 58, the music touches the rather distant E major; but presently, Dido's calm reply draws the music back towards the subdominant Eb, p. 60. The duet that follows prolongs the subdominant, insertion p. 176, with a succession involving the supertonic as the passion reaches a musical peak, p. 67. At the close of the scene, as Dido finally yields to Aeneas' demands, 'Ah slay me too for I am thine!', the dominant F arrives, resolving on the word 'thine' to the tonic Bb once more, p. 70. But a fine touch is still to come. With Dido's yielding her fate is sealed, and the events that follow are inevitable. Thus in the ten bar postlude after 'I am thine', the subdominant, Eb major is prolonged to the end. The feeling that a course has now been
fixed, that some hidden decree of destiny has now been sealed, is convincing. The melodic structure contributes to the same progression: in the duet Aeneas has imploring, rising phrases, to which Dido replies with emphatic downward runs. Eventually, Dido's replies imitate Aeneas' phrases, p. 69, and finally she sings with him in thirds, pp. 69-70.

The major 'numbers' of the work are Dido's aria in act v, and to a lesser extent, Aeneas' aria in act i. Dido's aria occurs in act v scene 2. This scene is ushered in with a 44-bar introduction, which introduces a theme which occurs throughout the scene, Table 3 No. 4 above. F# minor has referential function here. Anna is despatched quickly from the scene in ten bars; a further 13 bars of the new theme follows, and the aria-proper is ushered in allegro molto. A number of thematic figures occur of familiar sound, though they cannot be interpreted as direct references! Dido's wish to see Aeneas' 'comrades fall in slaughtered heaps before triumphant foes' recalls a motive from the overture, p. 6, bars 12-15; and her memories of Aeneas 'methinks I feel the burning kisses yet' recalls the heartbeat rhythm from Aeneas' aria in act 1, p. 25. The essence of her aria 'and laid mine honour in the dust for thee', is prepared by 19 bars of Bb tremolo and announced on a high G, which is held for over three bars. An interlude follows, pp. 160-161, in which the theme is heard again and Dido weeps and lights the pyre. Then come her final words, marked 'with suppressed passion', often monotone on F# and never beyond the range middle-C/G, with an accompaniment reduced to a low, ppp, molto largo-pulsing. Only at the very last words is she assertive: 'Aeneas... (half spoken)... I curse thee... (leaping an octave to high G)'. As she falls dead, an ugly, ill-prepared, ffff discord is heard, as below, p.162 in the score, resolving through a mess of incompetent voice-leading to C minor.
After the choral epilogue which follows, the discord returns, this time resolving to C major as the final cadence of the work.

Dido's aria in act v is another example of the composer's attempt to assimilate certain techniques of Wagner. The continuous fabric, combining lyric and declamatory elements, bears similarity to Wagner's Sprechgesang manner; the hymn-like, eight-part, antiphonal-choral epilogue bears similarity to the end of Lohengrin: the extended passages on a single harmony are a technique used widely by Wagner, as are the references to earlier musical material. But again there is evidence that Wagner's techniques are not fully understood: lines of text are frequently repeated, a feature which Wagner expounded from his music as early as Die Fliegende Holländer (1843); and the chromatic technique which gives Wagner's harmonic movements their power, is absent. In the score it may be seen that the young composer's harmony in Dido's aria follows the simplest diatonic procedures, steps up a fifth or down a minor third, or else simple homophonic slides from one tonal centre to an unrelated chord. The smooth, subtle movement of parts, the brave, but compelling added-tones and dissonances which give Wagner's harmony its power are absent. Aeneas' aria in act i is similar: a continuous succession of moods and feelings evoked by different rates of accompaniment rather than by harmonic design. The adagio at the end of the aria, p. 30 is an example:
it has the 'exotic' melodic-colour and aimless key-shifting of popular songs of the day rather than contrapuntally conceived chromatic harmony. The aria begins with a throbbing accompaniment evoking the 'veins filled with fire', while the vocal line surges up and down in waves of emotion. At 'Ah me! The heart so seared with fiery griefs...', the throbbing is still; then at 'Waking I think of thee' a different, more strident rhythm begins; finally changing into the adagio 4/4.

Other parts of the opera are a mixture of bright touches and simply unsuccessful blotches. The quarrel scene in act iv has an interesting touch. Dido and Aeneas are extraordinarily civil towards each other: they converse in formal melodic sentence couplets, pp. 101-2 and pp. 106-7. In the accompaniment there is meanwhile an increasing frenzy of tremolos, perhaps depicting their inward desperation and distraction. But their speech remains civil. It is as if the composer recognised that in the presence of all their court, Dido and Aeneas would speak with greater indifference and composure than they did while alone together in the cave. The prelude to act v is another example of inspiration: here low tremolo chords marked crescendo alternate with high decorated turns, creating an atmosphere of stealth well suited to the night scene which follows on the wharf. But there are other numbers which can only be described as failures. The act iv prelude is 51 bars of adagio, in which a succession of sudden bursts of activity, static semibreves, and long pauses seem to have little cohesion. Perhaps the composer was again attempting to assimilate Wagner's practice of making the prelude to the penultimate act an important one. The result here however, is simply a very long, not very coherent orchestral statement. The scene that follows this prelude rarely rises above mundane convention. The sailor's prayer 'Di maris' is in four part harmony with sparse suspensions, reminiscent of the English hymnody of the day; the maiden's chorus that follows attempts to produce a feeling of
girlish innocence through the use of delicate woodwind figures
dancing over the quiet throb of a distant village band,
rather after the manner of Sullivan's 'Climbing over rocky
mountains'; but plain and inappropriate to a Carthaginian
court. The chorus in act v 'Once more upon the heaving waves'
is a rambling binary, which may have been more effective
if it had been more concise; and Achates' aria which follows,
'Ah cruel love' is ruined with a grating accompaniment, made
worse on pp. 123-130 with laborious harp triplets. Anna's
pleading with Achates which follows suffers from an overabundance
of rhythmic activity and indiscriminate pauses which deprive
it of any real phrase shape. The composer achieves a small
measure of harmonic impact at this point by giving Anna a
pleading f major, p. 134, which contrasts presently with the
rising chromatic tremolos of her curse, p. 138.

It is difficult to regard Dido as any more significant
than any of the other student exercises the composer produced
before 1884. It is an unequal score in its component parts,
and unbalanced in its overall structure. It shows a
considerable flair for theatrical gesture, in its flashes of
effective tonal-contrasts and dramatic use of change-of-line.
It also shows an interest in Wagner's musico-dramatic
principles common among many opera composers in England of
Marshall-Hall's generation - in its imitation of Wagner's
psychopathic-heroine type plot, in its concealing of the
separate 'numbers' by links, in the use of recurring themes
which have dramatic significance, and in many of its smaller
details of musical design. But the assimilation of Wagnerian
principles is always superficial. In the final analysis, Dido
is a worksheet for later operas. The composer believed that
all problems of composition would be solved by constant writing,
and this is what he was doing in Dido. The fact that the
score was later used as a Botanical scrapbook, and the fact
that it was almost certainly the composer himself who converted
the score to a scrapbook, seem to support this view. The adaptation of the Dido and Aeneas legend into a tale of conquest and jilted love, indeed, extra-marital love in the highest and noblest quarters of society might have given Dido some controversial value in the straight-laced, Victorian England in which it was written. But it was spoilt by indifferent music. Its chance of success today, even its controversial potential, would be small. Dido was never performed, except for Aeneas' aria from act i, which was given at the composer's orchestral concerts in Melbourne in 1899, orchestrated for the occasion from the Ms. vocal score. The local critics found the orchestration more effective than the music.

After two years at Newton College, Marshall-Hall took an appointment as Assistant to the Musical Director of Wellington College, a better-known school. The only work known to have emerged from 1886 is the sextet Die Blumen; the symphony, several overtures and string quartets he is said to have composed in this period are not extant. He was at Wellington only two terms, and by the following year, 1887 it seems he had obtained what was to be his last English job. According to his letter of Application for the Chair of Music at Melbourne, in 1888 Marshall-Hall was teaching composition and singing, and conducting the choir of the London Organ School and College of Music (also known as the London Music School). Founded in 1865 by the Rev. F. Scotson Clark, this school had advertised its activities from time to time in the Musical Times.

---

1 See footnote 2, p. 42
2 Programme note, 2nd Subscription Concert [1899]; announcement of the concert in the 261st Melbourne Liedertafel Concert programme 1899, GM
3 The Argus 12th October 1899
4 Testimonial letter of A. Gray, Music Director, Wellington College, undated, CR.
5 Programme note, Menschel Concert, 1888, in composer's scrapbook, GM, refers to works he is supposed to have composed.
One of the more long-lasting of the numerous private music schools that sprang up in London in the latter half of the 19th-century, it has left us no records. Clark died in 1883, no director was appointed to replace him.¹

It is significant that at the time he took this appointment, Marshall-Hall had only a patchy musical education and no success as a composer to speak of. He had developed a practical facility, he had a first hand knowledge of German musical life, but in the finer points of counterpoint, orchestration and composition he was untrained. His attempts to have his music published or performed were unsuccessful.² The chief value of his short time at the Royal College was not an educational one, but was in the contacts he established with a number of important musicians: George Henschel, Professor of Singing, Hubert Parry, Professor of Composition, and Grove himself. These men were later to write him testimonials that were important in obtaining for him the Chair of Music in Melbourne. But despite his lack of formal training, he commanded a following at the London Organ School among his students, his choir, his orchestra and his peers. It must have been by sheer force of personality that he was so successful: he was a magnetic speaker, tall and handsome, broadly cultured with a glowing enthusiasm for music and all fine arts. His critical standards were severe, he was eruptive in his hatred of sham.³ By force of personality he coked out a living in London, while he waited for the London public to discover his music, as he felt sure they would.

From 1887 onwards, Marshall-Hall published a number of articles in the London Magazine of Music, The Musical World, School, and occasionally in the daily press too. Carl Stewart MacPherson, three years younger than Marshall-Hall, first appeared in the Magazine of Music in the same year, and went on to make a major contribution as a writer on music. But while

¹Chappell, op. cit.
²According to the programme of the Henschel Concert, 1888, GM.
³Sketch of the composer from E. Duncan, op. cit.
MacPherson compared Mozart's re-instrumentation of Handel's Messiah with the original score, Marshall-Hall's writing was of quite a different sort. His ideas were polemical, his observations subjective and rarely documented except in the most superficial way. As his views are often reiterated in several places, they are summarised below in a series of abstracts. Together, these abstracts do not represent a systematic theory of music, for Marshall-Hall was no theoretician. They simply list his more frequently expressed ideas:

ABSTRACT 1

MARSHALL-HALL'S VIEWS ON ENGLISH MUSICAL STYLE

1. The feelings of the Englishman are very deeprooted, and what does not touch them directly and immediately is ignored.¹

2. English composers, instead of striking directly at the emotions, have been satisfied with exploiting mild feelings of pleasure.²

3. If English music is to touch the more noble feelings, it must follow German music by being more simple and direct, more universal in its appeal.³

¹'The natural gift of apprehension is not, however, very common.' 'Music: Some Faults in our Education System' Magazine of Music, July 1888. 'Their feelings are very deeprooted...and what does not immediately touch them is...ignored'. 'National Opera' unidentified daily newspaper.

²'The music of our English Composers has so little character and is of so uniform a mildness that it cannot be said to have been influenced by foreign music; if however, this is at all the case, I should say it is by Mendelssohn in his most namby-pamby maudlin mood' in 'What Progress has England Made in Music during the last ten years...?' School 1887-88. English composers are content with 'mere pleasing succession of sounds...great feelings are expressed by other means' 'National Opera' 'There is a growing impatience with the old half-hearted school of musicians.' 'National Opera'.

³'We already have Russian, Swedish, Danish, Hungarian, French, Italian styles - why more? ...while everyone recognises the local peculiarity of all other music, the German alone is remarkable, because it has no surface polish, alone it is universal...' National Music in School 1887-88. Music is 'for educating a man's higher nature...man is attracted to what is good and beautiful in spite of himself...it is only when constucted on such broad lines that (English) opera can succeed in finding a home in the hearts of the nation...' 'National opera'.
Marshall-Hall's ideas about English music were based on one assumption: namely, that opera and dramatic music were of paramount concern to English composers. They ignored the awakening of English musical conscience in other genres which Chappell describes as a Renaissance. If opera was assumed as an important form for English music to adopt then it was true, as the composer pointed out, that English composers had few achievements. As Chappell describes it, English operatic life was foreign dominated, and the existing native opera was light and comic in the main. But Marshall-Hall's analysis of the problem was neither original nor new. Pleas for better native opera had been frequent in the musical press since 1875, and continued till Stanford's efforts at the end of the century. Marshall-Hall may be said to have simply joined the chorus of nationally-conscious composers of his day in his recognition of the operatic problem. His proposal of a German solution was not original either, for a number of operas had appeared in a musical style obviously inspired by Bayreuth. Following Wagner's lead in choosing national-historical or ancient mythical subjects A.G. Thomas had produced Esmeralda, 1883, Nadonsha, 1885; Cowen his Pauline, 1875; A.C. MacKenzie his Columba, 1883; and Stanford his The Canterbury Pilgrims in 1884. Charles Santley, who was later to sing an excerpt from Harold, wrote:

English people do not care for 'grand opera' in their own language, although a round sum of money was made by Balfe's grand opera 'The Rose of Castille', and others so designated. They like what the French call, and for which we have no equivalent name, 'opera comique,' in which a great portion of the drama is in spoken dialogue.

Marshall-Hall's ideas of the nature of creativity may be summarised as follows, Abstract 2:

---


2 Charles Santley Student and singer: the reminiscences of Charles Santley London: Edward Arnold, 1892 p.295 327pp
ABSTRACT 2

MARSHALL-HALL'S VIEWS ON CREATIVITY

1. There exists in the air a multitude of spirits who are the agents of all forms of life energy. ¹

2. The artist has a special temperament that allows him communion with this spirit world. ²

3. In creating, an emotion or idea formed in this nebulous world forces itself on the artist. It is not a conscious act. ³

¹ Halfway between man's conscious and unconscious a world exists...the world of mermaids and mermaids, of dryads and hamadryads, of elves and spirits, gnomes, trolls, and fairies...they embody the mysterious hidden untraceable forms of energy which lie at the root of all living matter...' 'The Essentials of Art' Alma Mater 1899 Lecture 1. The dedication of his poem To Irene is a specific example of his application of that belief: 'E lo spirito mio Per occulta virtu che de loii mosse D'antico amor senti la gran potenza'.

² The artist has the consciousness that he sees something in a different light to that in which other men see it...that he is in regard to this one thing a prophet, an apostle' The Artist and his Critics The Musical World April 1890. Music's language 'only becomes intelligible to the vast majority when converted into living sounds by and at the hand of the artist' The Artist The Argus July 1891. 'We are all, but for what we instinctively discover of their (the artists') language & meaning, parrots'. Music: Some Faults in our Education System Magazine of Music July 1888 'the language they speak, though difficult at first of comprehension, is worth all the trouble that can be devoted to it...' Music: Tone Poetry Magazine of Music 1888. The idea is aptly illustrated in his poem The Call of Genius, circa 1888, Marshall-Hall scrapbook, Grainger Museum, where the artist and his lover dialogue, each in different metre. 'Only the artist can understand the signs of the artist' The Artist, ibid.

³ The critic feels nothing of the living necessity which forces words into the mouth of the artist'. The Artist and his Critics The Musical World April 1890. 'Out of a vast nebulous mass worlds form. Creation will never hurry itself. Patience!...I always find that true creativeness in one is that feeling of a lack in ones work which agonises one so much that one is forced to work...it must evolve without my aid and force itself upon me'. Letter to Tom Roberts 13 June 1892 in Mike to Bulldog, ed. Croll (Sydney 1946). The Call of Genius describes a power working secretly on the artist so forcibly that it tears him away from even his lover's arms.
Marshall Hall's idea of the nature of creativity places him close to Wagner in theory. Wagner said 'I simply cannot compose when nothing at all occurs to me', ¹ by which he meant that composition must spring from a vision or overwhelming need. To Wagner, this meant that the definite extra-musical vision or subject controlled not only the nature of his themes but the whole course of his developments. In Marshall-Hall, on the other hand, the reader is given the impression that all could be left to the extra-musical vision, that the composer could abdicate from conscious consideration of musical construction and shape. He believed that when ideas and forms would not come easily the best thing was to abandon work, so that the music could 'evolve without me'. ² His attitude is an extreme opposite to the theory of creativity propounded by Hanslick, of which Marshall-Hall could not have been unaware. ³ Hanslick wrote that a creative artist no doubt needed a highly-developed emotional faculty, a special temperament, but this is not the productive factor in creativity:

It is not feelings, but a specifically musical and technically trained aptitude that enables us to compose...A strong pathos may fill (a composer's) soul...but it can never become the subject matter, as is obvious from the very nature of music. ⁴

To Hanslick's school of thought, composition is constructive and, as such, purely objective. The opposed views of Hanslick and Wagner had been the cause of controversy for many years, and Marshall-Hall's articles therefore have the effect of


²Letter to Tom Roberts, June 1892 in Croll, Smise to Bulldog Sydney 1946, p.


⁴Hanslick, loc. cit.
identifying him vehemently with Wagner's camp.

Marshall-Hall's attachment to Wagner was as irrational as it was passionate. In books which ventured any criticism of Wagner he scrawled blunt comments in the margin. Two books which survive from his library are particularly decorated: Parry's *Evolution of the art of music* ('pedantic misapprehension...false comparison. ..very lame theory')¹ and a volume of Nietzsche ('Bah! Nonsense!. ..is he deaf? - or has he a physical defect of the ear? - or...?')² In any event, his attitude would explain his youthful lack of attention to overall proportion in *Dido*, and his willingness to present good ideas along with not-so-good, refusing to allow the conscious critical faculty to operate in the act of composition.

On the other hand, the composer's idea of a spirit world existing which embodied forms of life-energy was akin to the newly-developing views of the Symbolist school of France. It is significant that his idea of the spirit world crystalized into more specific form some years later, after his return trip to Europe from Australia in 1894, when it was quite likely that he came into contact with this developing art in Paris. After 1894, he described this realm as a world of 'mermen and mermaids, of drels...spirits, gnomes, trolls and fairies...' ³ while in the 1887-88 period it remained for him a less-specific idea, but one which is implied clearly in his writings, particularly in the poem *The call of genius*, ca. 1883.

His ideas about the relationship between emotion and music may be summarised as follows, Abstract 3:

---

¹In the GM, 1896 edition.

²In the NL. vide Kenneth Hince 'The case of the dismissed professor' *Quadrant* vol.3, no.1 Summer 1958-9, p.25-30

³vide note 1, p.60
ABSTRACT 3
MARSHALL-HALL'S VIEWS ON EMOTION AND MUSIC

1. Emotions, radiated by the spirit world, can be expressed more definitely in music than in speech.¹

2. Intense emotions of joy and grief, those experienced between two people in silence, can be expressed directly only in music.²

3. Emotion in music is expressed by theme, into which rhythm, harmony and tone colour are concentrated.³

4. Music setting out to express emotion can create noble and generous impulses in the listener.⁴

¹ Every act is the result of emotion, and by embodying in words the action and its effects it is possible to reproduce the original emotion, but only to a very limited degree. The power of music to affect this is far greater...it is able to reproduce them to a marvellous perfection.' Music and Man School 1887-88. Language, sculpture, painting and music are 'mental sign systems... in which certain signs correspond to certain emotions, and certain modifications of these signs to modifications of these emotions.' The Artist and His Critics The Musical World April 1890. 'Music has become a means of expressing the emotions and thoughts of man...' What Progress has England Made in Music during the last Ten Years...? School 1887-88.

² To this numbness of joy and grief, music imparts a tongue... Those profound emotions, which poets by the most subtle use of language can but hint at...are by music given substance and form...' What Progress has England Made in Music During the Last Ten Years...? School 1887-88. Similar ideas in Music as a Religious Force School 1887.

³ Emotion is expressed musically by rhythm, variability of pitch and tone colour, concentrated into melodic form'. Inaugural Lecture, University of Melbourne 1891 'Music is a development of the emotional side of speech, of the inflection of the voice, which, indeed, form melody' Music and Man School 1887-88 'Music is able to depict the fluctuating emotions which agitate the mind far more exactly and definitely than words...' National Opera, unidentified newspaper.

⁴ Listening to music 'man is attracted to what is good and beautiful in spite of himself' National Opera, unidentified cutting, Marshall-Hall scrapbook. 'Music has attained a capability, to those who, having deeply studied, understand its subtle inflections, of transmitting from mind to mind that inner depth of feeling which stirs up in man the will and power to act...' Music and Man School 1887-88. 'To make a child noble, not wealthy, is the only way to make it happy...nor can any more potent factor be found for this than music, in as much as it is founded directly on the human heart'. The Letter and Spirit of Music School 1887-88.
The composer's ideas on emotion and music seem heavily dependant on Wagner's *Oper und Drama*, 1850-51, both in their specific arguments and general conclusions.\(^1\) Wagner wrote that music was a language of emotion\(^2\), that there are emotions that can be only expressed directly in music\(^3\), and that emotion is expressed in music through theme.\(^4\) It is possible that Marshall-Hall's view that light comedy and topical stories were unsuitable material for English opera also has its origin in Wagner's extensive discussion of poetry and suitable operatic texts.\(^5\) It is again informative to compare these views with Hanslick, who argued that music is not equipped with a vocabulary to express specific words, and therefore cannot express specific emotions either;\(^6\) that intense emotions cannot be expressed directly at all in music, only the dynamic properties of them can be represented\(^7\); and that the only emotional impulses music creates in the attentive listener are emotions of enjoyment or disappointment derived from an understanding of the progression of the sounds.\(^8\)

---


\(^2\) Melody is 'the most complete expression of exalted feelings' Abrahams, *op. cit.* p. 103.

\(^3\) 'Articulate language (is) capable only of description and indication, unless (the poet) intensifies this language into tone language', *ibid.*, p. 102.

\(^4\) Melody is 'the first emotional language of mankind', *ibid.*, p. 102.

\(^5\) To the operatic poet and composer falls the task of conjuring up the holy spirit of poetry as it has come down to us in the sagas and legends of past ages...Here is the way to raise opera to a higher level from the debasement into which it has fallen' *ibid.*, p. 102.

\(^6\) 'Definite feelings and emotions are unsusceptible of being embodied in music. Our emotions have no isolated existence in the mind' E. Hanslick, *op. cit.*, p. 21.

\(^7\) 'The aesthetic expression of music may be described by terms such as graceful, gentle, violent, vigorous, elegant, fresh— all of these ideas being expressible by corresponding modifications of sound' *ibid.* p. 23.

\(^8\) 'An art aims, above all, at producing something beautiful which affects not our feelings but the organ of pure contemplation, our imagination' *ibid.* p. 11.
Marshall-Hall's ideas about emotion and music again place him at the extreme opposite position to Hanslick. A sense of synthesis is evident only in his view that meaning is a connotation given to certain signs, and that music has the capacity to communicate certain of these signs. This is a position acceptable to both Wagner's and Hanslick's schools of thought.

His views on the essentials of music may be summarised as follows, Abstract 4. Once again, the reader is struck by the similarity of the composer's views to Wagner's writings on the essentials of music. Wagner contended that music was founded on theme; that into theme strong harmony and individual, powerful rhythm must be concentrated; and that in music-drama, theme functions in the orchestra while the function of the voice is to make the meaning of the words definite. Furthermore, tone-poetry was for Wagner the supreme form of music, while 'Abstract' music was a puzzle to him. In Marshall-Hall these ideas appear without modification, and he persistently read concrete meanings into Beethoven's symphonies as Wagner did. His instrumental music too, followed a quasi-poetical scheme.

\[\text{Wagner's criticisms on Mozart, Beethoven and Gluck are based on criticisms of their melody: 'up to now this melody has been song melody' Abraham, op. cit., p. 99.}\]

\[\text{It is 'compound sound, simultaneous harmony and melody that completely brings home to one the content of the melody', ibid., p. 107.}\]

\[\text{In the complete expression of all that the actor communicates to eye and ear...the unifying bond of expression therefore proceeds from the orchestra', ibid., p. 107.}\]

\[\text{Newman, op. cit., p. 279.}\]


\[\text{cf. Programme note, Eb Symphony, Melbourne Orchestral Subscription Concerts, 1904 GM.}\]
ABSTRACT 4

MARSHALL-HALL'S VIEWS ON THE ESSENTIALS OF MUSIC

1. The foundation of a musical work is theme.

2. Inspired theme must have strong harmony, individual and powerful rhythm.

3. Form is founded on instinct, and is of little importance.

4. Tone poetry is the supreme form of music.

5. Theme in music drama functions in the orchestra. The voice parts should make the sense of the words clearer than in speech.

1 As in all works of genius, the main strength, the foundation on which the whole is erected is the theme. 'Parsifal: Its Teaching and Noble Aim' Magazine of Music August 1888 Music is a development of the emotional side of speech, the inflections of the voice, which, indeed, form melody' Music and Man, School 1887-88.

2 The technical qualifications of a really inspired theme-thought, which however, in spirit is indefinable, consist of (1) a manly strength of harmony; (2) an individuality and power of rhythm, (3) the outcome of these a purity and simplicity of melody.' Parsifal: Its Teaching and Noble Aim, Magazine of Music, August 1888.

3 'the intellectual side of music - form, harmonic and melodic, is in itself utterly uninteresting to any but the pedants...it must add emotional power...' The Letter and Spirit of Music School 1887-88 'The arts are founded upon and developed purely by emotional instinct and are neither explicable nor understandable by the intellect...' The Artist and his Critics, The Musical World, April 1890.

4 Tone poetry is music 'where it ceases to be mere sensual sound and has acquired a power to affect and influence'. Music: Tone Poetry, Magazine of Music, July 1888. Tone poetry is 'only a lately born off-spring of music...there is a wonderous something in her not possessed by the latter, namely, a soul.' Music and Man School 1887-88. 'Music indeed in itself is nothing. It becomes something only when it expresses the mighty passions of a great heart The Letter and Spirit of Music School 1887-88 Marshall-Hall included the major German composers in his definition of 'tone poets': Bach, Beethoven, Mozart, Schumann, Schubert, Brahms, Wagner. vide Music: Tone Poetry, op. cit.

5 Marshall-Hall makes this clear in his study of Parsifal in Magazine of Music, August 1888, and adheres to it throughout his life.
But there is a departure from Wagner in Marshall-Hall's views on the essentials of music which, more than his views of creativity in general, implies that form is grounded in instinct. It derives from Wagner's view that subject controls the form, but is interpreted by the young composer as form being simply unimportant, the spontaneous was always good enough. Perhaps this departure was a convenient philosophy for a composer who had never been thoroughly trained in composition; but in any event, it was a contradiction of his own idea that music was a specific language of emotion, Abstract 3, for a language that has word and sentence structures must have paragraph and large scale structures too. In any language, fine words are not enough; if they are strung together in thoughtless, ill-considered ways the result cannot be communicative in definite terms, but will be a montage of the vaguest, most-indefinite meanings.

Notable omissions from the composer's ideas on music are opinions on counterpoint or key-relationships. Wagner's harmony is contrapuntally-orientated, with its roots in the chorales of J.S. Bach, and he regarded Bach as the supreme authority in matters of technique.¹ Contrapuntal combination of themes and motives was for him a fundamental part of his expressive language. Marshall-Hall, when he later spoke of it, adopted the view that all contrapuntal forms other than the harmonised chorales of Bach were redundant.² Wagner viewed key relationships as the musician's unique ability to instill a variety of feelings into one character in a music-drama through different key colour³; whereas Marshall-Hall was silent about key relationships.

In view of the heavy dependence of the young composer's views on Wagner, it is valuable to examine his attitude to Wagner's music. These ideas may be summarised as follows, Abstract 5.

¹Abraham, op. cit., p.
²Prospectus, Melbourne Conservatorium for 1910, p. 12.
³Abraham, op. cit., p. 105.
ABSTRACT 5

MARSHALL-HALL'S VIEW OF WAGNER

1. The foundation of his music is theme, into which massive harmony and a wealth of rhythm are concentrated.¹

2. His use of these themes was spontaneous, yet deeply significant.²

3. His distinctive character portrayal makes his types of good and evil seem very human, haunting us with the lessons they convey.³

4. Through his theme thought and visual portrayal he sets before us a message: that the simplest and purest man, not the wealthiest, is worthy of our esteem.⁴

5. His form cannot be imitated, rather it leads us back to Bach, Mozart and Beethoven.⁵

¹The groundwork of Wagner's strength lies in the nature of the melody...the thought which other composers often scatter over many bars is concentrated by Wagner into one or two bars...the wealth of rhythm...and massiveness of harmony...give a stirring eloquence' The Professor, The Student and Wagner School 1888. "He who can write a grand meaning-fraught theme is a genius.' Parsifal: Its Teaching and Noble Aim' Magazine of Music August 1888.

²Wagner's harmonic inventions were the result of emotions so profound that they could be depicted by no other means' The Professor, The Student and Wagner', op. cit. In his study on Parsifal, op. cit. Wagner gives twelve themes and their motivic units and examples of how they are applied.

³We feel that, had we been placed in the position of his characters we should have said and done just what they said and did...these offspring of his imagination haunt us.' Parsifal: Its Teaching and Noble Aim, op.cit.

⁴'By holding up a lofty ideal of what we should be, makes us discontent with what we are; urges us on on the path of virtue and unselfishness...the simplest and purest man—and not he who has piled up the biggest heap of gold - is most worthy (of) our esteem and homage'. Parsifal Its Teaching and Noble Aim, op. cit.

⁵'he derived his unparalleled constructive power from careful study of Bach, Mozart and Beethoven...what requires to be enkindled and ever fed in the student is enthusiasm (for these)' The Professor, The Student and Wagner, op. cit. 'Wagner, like Beethoven, ever says "Here is the germ of my thought: now see what a world of beauty it suggests.' Parsifal: Its Teaching and Noble Aim, op. cit.
Marshall-Hall's views on Wagner seem merely to draw out of the music illustrations to prove his own ideas. Consistent with his lack of concern for consciously conceived form, he passes over a consideration of Wagner's form, saying it cannot be imitated. Consistent too with his view of music's ability to create noble and generous impulses in the listener, Abstract 3, he sees Wagner as a teacher of his listeners, even instructing them on issues of morality. His idea that Wagner's main concern is to repel people from 'the man who has piled up the biggest heap of gold' is similar to the view taken by G. Bernard Shaw in his study The Perfect Wagnerite, which to the modern reader may be judged an extreme view. But perhaps most interesting is the composer's interpretation of the role of the visual in Wagner's dramas: he believed that the most profound impression Parsifal makes on the opera-goer is in the scene depicting the agony of Amfortas. It cannot be doubted that this scene is of importance to Parsifal's impact, but to single it out as the most profound moment is a curious proposition. It may be concluded from this that Marshall-Hall attached a special significance to the portrayal of physical agony on the operatic stage, believing it to be perhaps the most powerful of theatrical scenarios. This would certainly account for the choice of climatic scene in Dido where, unlike Purcell, the composer preserves Dido's death exactly as Vergil described it: Dido falls on her sword and the wound 'gurgles in her breast'.

At the same time as these views were being published, the composer completed the vocal score of his largest opera, Harold. It is likely that this score was completed before 1888 (see Appendix II). Harold is based on events in the life

---


of the last Saxon king of the English of that name, c. 1022-1066, son of Godwin, Earl of Wessex. Godwin and Harold were banished from England in 1051 by Edward the Confessor. But Godwin was a powerful Saxon patriot, his influence was not easily dissipated in England; and the two returned home after only a year. When Godwin died in 1053, Harold became Earl of Wessex; and in the next years grew to be a confidant of Edward the Confessor, so much so that when Edward died, on 5th January 1066, Harold was able to proclaim himself king. In becoming king Harold ignored a more rightful heir and an oath he had made to support the claims to the crown of William of Normandy. During his reign he freed England from foreign forces by gaining a victory over Harald Hadrada of Norway. But England's freedom lasted only 19 days, for while Harold was occupied with the Norsemen in the north, William and the Normans landed at Hastings in the south. Harold hastened south with a tired, depleted army to confront William and on 14 October 1066 they fought their famous battle at Senlac near Hastings. The Saxons were completely defeated and Harold killed.  

1 The source of Marshall-Hall's setting for the opera was not historical record however, but a romance based on the historical events, Harold The Last of The Saxon Kings by Lord Lytton.  

2 This novel is a coloured version of the truth, giving an account of Harold's relationship with his cousin Edith the Fair which is more purified than tradition admits, a version 'which on many accounts may I hope be entrusted to the young' and plays up the superstitious elements through the introduction of a sage Hilda and the heathen Vala.  

Marshall-Hall's choice of the Harold story as subject for his longest opera may be said to put into practice his belief

---

2 Lytton Harold the Last of the Saxon Kings, London 1874.  
3 Ibid., preface, p. vii.
that English opera should follow Wagner's lead in choosing national-historical subjects. It was not an original idea, for Cowen, Hiles and Naprawnik had all attempted music-dramas based on the story.¹ Nor was his decision to adopt Lytton's version particularly original, for Wagner himself had set Lytton's Rienzi. Lytton's Harold had been criticised for its free mixture of fact and fiction, its free use of untranslated Saxon words and alleged overstatement of the learning of William the Conqueror.² Lytton had defended his piece by claiming it was fundamentally patriotic, that Harold was portrayed as a lover of justice and freedom, and that the Normans were portrayed justly.³ This criticism attracted some public notice, for Lytton was a politician and diplomat, as well as one of the most influential British authors of his day. Marshall-Hall's decision to adopt it as his source has the effect of identifying him with one camp in a controversy, as his published articles identify him as pro-Wagner, anti-Hanslick. In any event, his decision was a fine one, for the novel is fine material for Romantic opera, with its interpretative mixture of history, myth and sentiment. Tennyson, in the next generation, also thought it worthy material for a drama, which he dedicated to Lytton's son.⁴ Lytton's novel is a story of a great age, the last glimpse of a fiercely patriotic monarchy and the beginning of a noble and heroic middle age for England. It has much of the potential for the kind of sentiment that the young composer saw in Wagner's operatic subjects.

Marshall-Hall's adaptation of Lytton for his opera may be summarised as follows, Table 1.

²Kunitz and Haycraft, British Authors of the Nineteenth Century.
⁴Tennyson, Harold, London 1877.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Book</th>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Marshall-Hall 2</th>
<th>Act</th>
<th>Scene</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td></td>
<td>events before the trial of Godwin</td>
<td>omitted</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II</td>
<td></td>
<td>&quot; &quot; &quot;</td>
<td>(Prologue (1 i-ii)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>i-ii</td>
<td>(vol.1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III</td>
<td>i-iii</td>
<td>trial and banishment of Godwin</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1-181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV</td>
<td></td>
<td>Harold and Edith</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>iii</td>
<td>182-216</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Oath of Harold to William</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>i-ii</td>
<td>(vol.2)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Edith offers to give up her troth to Harold</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>iii</td>
<td>1-60</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V</td>
<td></td>
<td>events between Harold's omitted return to England and death of Edward</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>61-145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI-VIII</td>
<td></td>
<td>death and premonitions of Edward the Confessor</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>iv</td>
<td>146-162</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IX</td>
<td></td>
<td>Hilda's death and premonitions</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>ii</td>
<td>192-247</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>battles with Norsemen, and forbidding in Harold's house</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>i</td>
<td>163-191</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XI</td>
<td></td>
<td>Battle of Hastings and aftermath</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>i-ii</td>
<td>248-299</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1Lytton - Harold Last of the Saxon Kings (London 1878).
2Ms. vocal score in 2 vols., Grainger Museum.
From this table it can be seen that the composer's adaptation of Lytton's novel was selective. The entire material for the libretto comes from six of the twelve books of the novel. Only the most important incidents are used: the trial and banishing of Godwin, the oath of Harold before William, and the bloody aftermath of the Battle of Hastings. These three scenes establish the patriotic fervour among the Saxons, establish the pretext for the Norman invasion of England, and finally establish the event on which the whole future of England depended. The composer's arrangement of this selection into an opera of four acts can be expressed as follows, Table 2:
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>act</th>
<th>scene</th>
<th>page in Ms. score</th>
<th>action</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Prologue</td>
<td>1/1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>introduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>i</td>
<td>167</td>
<td>Norman Bishop Odo arrives to claim hostages to secure Godwin's good conduct.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ii</td>
<td>182</td>
<td>Edith and Harold love scene. Hilda, Harold's aunt, speaks mysteriously to them.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>i</td>
<td>2/1</td>
<td>introduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Harold in Normandy, imprisoned and resisting William's proposals.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ii</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>Harold ceremoniously takes his oath to William before all the Norman court.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>iii</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>Harold reaffirms his troth to Edith, despite her pleading to give it up for England's sake.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>iv</td>
<td>146</td>
<td>The death and terrifying premonitions of Edward the Confessor.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>i</td>
<td>163</td>
<td>Harold and his soldiers prepare for battle with the Norsemen.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ii</td>
<td>192</td>
<td>The house of Harold, filled with premonitions of death. Hilda is poisoned by a snake, casting a shadow over her predictions of victory for Harold at Hastings.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ii</td>
<td>263</td>
<td>William and the Normans celebrate victory. Edith's aria of rebuke to William, her death on the body of Harold.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Marshall-Hall's arrangement makes the three main incidents the pillars of the opera; the first, middle and last scenes respectively. They are also the most spectacular scenes, the only ones to employ a singing chorus. Between these pillars, the fictitious elements of Lytton's novel appear: the liaison with Edith and its development, the supernatural prediction of the dying king and its development in 'a mysterious tragedy in Harold's household (the death of Hilda). The consequence of this arrangement is that, while Lytton's novel depends for its impact partly on romance, partly on historical sentiment, and partly on its sheer complexity and Saxon mannerisms, the opera achieves its impact more sharply. The three vital scenes are not so much dramatically important as they are historically precise, and their effect on the British viewer would have been purely epic. Marshall-Hall's libretto may be said to have stripped away the complexity of Lytton, and clarified the speculative aspects as supportive tissue.

The thematic fabric of Harold makes a much more extensive use of recurring motives than Dido. It is also of interest to note that certain of these shapes are similar to shapes in Dido. A theme appearing in the bass of the Dido overture for example, (Ms. vocal score, p. 6) appears again as a theme of the prelude to act ii of Harold. The theme has a very subordinate role however, and in the midst of such a complex of other themes it is difficult to claim that it was a conscious act of borrowing from an earlier work. It was more likely a coincidence, a product of the composer's insistence on spontaneous inspiration as the guide in composition.

In view of Marshall-Hall's faith in Wagner's principles and practice as the solution to the problems of English opera, it is relevant to examine Harold for the extent to which it imitates Wagnerian principles. Wagner's music dramas after Oper und Drama are characterised by libretti. based on mythology; polyphonic conception in which the orchestra carries the
melodic interest, related to the 'inner' action of the
drama while the voice carries melodic interest related to the
'outer' action of the drama; continuous music, though with
recitative and aria-like distinctions still apparent; a
network of leitmotifs, that is, short melodic phrases
identified with a particular character or idea, which then
reappear and accumulate a special significance in new contexts;
periods within each act, that is, perceivable forms, often
bogen (ABA) or bar (AAB); an overall period design modified
by introductions, transitions, codas, and varied repetitions;
these period designs depend on key structures; and harmony which
exhibits complex chromatic alterations, telescoping resolutions,
blurring suspensions, and non-harmonic tones producing at times
a novel, ambiguous tonality. The outcome of these features
is that the musical form is at one with the dramatic form,
that both are organically connected in expressing one idea.¹

Harold exhibits a number of properties of Wagner's
leitmotif technique, and lends itself to thematic analysis
which relates specific themes to specific ideas in the libretto.
An attempt at thematic analysis was made for a programme note
on the work in 1889, which was inadequate in several respects.²
Table 3 below summarises the thematic scheme of the work.
There are 37 motifs identifiable with specific ideas in the
libretto; of these six may be distinguished as the principal
thematic ideas of the opera, and four as subsidiary thematic
ideas. The remaining 26 motifs do not recur beyond the scene
in which they first appear. Beyond the motifs referred to in
Table 3 there are 37 other shapes distinguishable as motifs
which do not refer to specific ideas.

¹Summary of Wagner's style summarised from Grout D.J.

²Programme note, Henschell Popular Concerts, circa 1888,
Marshall-Hall scrapbook, Grainger Museum. The annotator made
an error in copying out one shape he regarded as principal,
and therefore conclusions he based on this were rendered inaccurate
'idiot' wrote Marshall-Hall in the margin.


**TABLE 3**

**HAROLD - RECURRING THEMES**

Principal leading-motifs (from autograph vocal score)

---

*motif 1: associated with the fate of the Godwin household*

*appearances: Prologue, Godwin relates his past, vol.1,p.36-7.*
motif 2: associated with Harold's memories of past nobility and love

appearances: Harold thinks of Edith, Act 1, scene 1, vol. 1, p. 163; curtain falls at end of act 1, scene 2, p. 179 (transposed); interludes in the Edith-Harold duet, v. 1, p. 191 (transposed), 195 (transposed, augmented), 200 (transposed, varied), 203 (figures based on rhythm of m. 1), 205 (transposed), 209-10 (transposed), 221 (figures based on rhythm of m. 1); Harold dreams of Edith, Act 2, scene 1, v. 2, p. 27-31 (rhythmic figures in sequence); Harold thinks of Edith while taking the oath to marry another, v. 2, p. 53-4 (sequences); Harold and Edith v. 2, p. 113 (transposed), 128 (transposed), 135 (rhythmic figures), 137 (rhythmic figures); Overture Act 3, scene 2, v. 2, p. 192 (transposed), 194 (transposed); Edith v. 2, p. 199 (transposed), p. 211 (rhythmic figures); Battlefield, Act 4, scene 1, p. 250 (transposed); Edith's aria, middle section, Act 4 scene 2, v. 2, p. 284 (restatement, original form).

motif 3 (a)

motif 3 (b)
motif 3 (c)

Motif-group 3: associated with the difficult moments for Godwin's House

appearances: Prologue, introduction, v. l, p. 1, 2, 14 (transposed), 19 (sequential treatment) (3a); p. 3, 15 (harmonic variant) (3b); Godwin's defence (3c) p. 25; Siward (3a) p. 111 (original form); Act 1, scene 1, (3c) p. 130 (octave lower); Godwin and Edith, p. 132-34 (3c, figures based on the rhythm of m. 2-3), 151-52 (3c, figures based on m. 1-2); Githa mentions Harold's leadership potential, vol. 2, p. 75 (3a, transposed); Harold accepts his father's advice not to marry Edith, p. 100 (3a diminished, varied); Harold and Edith p. 123, 125, 130 (3b rhythm); Saxons prepare for war p. 162-62 (3a, original form); 170, 174, 178, (3a transposed fragments), 182 (original form); Battlefield, Act 4, scene 1, p. 249-50 (3a, opening, transposed); Harold's body born in, Act 4, scene 2, p. 264 (3a transposed).

motif 4 (a)

motif 4 (b)
motif 4 (c)

Moe movement

motif 4 (d)

motif-group 4: associated with Harold's vow of love to Edith

appearances: Edith and Harold, Act 2, scene 3, v.2, p.103 (4a), 105 (4b), 106 (4c), 114 (4c), 124 (4c, transposed), 127 (4c, transposed), 136 (4d), 139 (4d varied), 143 (4b, transposed, in bass), 144 (4c, transposed); Act 3, scene 1, p.191 (4c, transformed); Act 3, scene 2, Edith p.208 (4c, transposed).

motif 5 (a)
motif 5 (b)

motif-group 5: associated with Harold's heroism

appearances: Act 2, scene 1, v.2, p.1 (5b); Harold resists William p.7 (5b varied), 11 (5b, transposed), 21 (5b transposed), 23 (5b rhythmic motif), 33 (5b octave higher); p.12 (5a), 14 (5a sequentia: treatment), 19 (5a transposed), 23, 24 (5a transposed), 49 (5b transposed); Edith thinks of Harold, Act 2, scene 3, v.2, p.82 (5a transposed); Harold p.84 (5a, sequential treatment), 99 (5a transposed); Harold appointed Edward's successor, Act 2, scene 4, v.2, p.151 (5b transposed), 156 (5b transposed), 159 (5b transposed then augmented in bass); Harold prepares his men for battle, Act 3, scene 1, v.2, p.168 (5b transposed), 177 (5a transposed), 178 (5b rhythmic figures), 181 (5b transposed), 190 (5b transposed) Act 4 scene 2, v.2, chorus p.253 (5a); Edith's aria p.274 (5a transposed) 276 (5a transposed).
motif-group 6: associated with Edward and the weakness of the Saxon rule

appearances: Prologue, chorus in praise of Edward, v.1, p.21 (6a), 34 (6a, transposed); Odo takes hostages for Edward from Godwin Act 1, scene 2, v.1, p.167 (6a transposed); Act 2 scene 3, news of the King's illness, v.2, p.73 (6a transposed); Death of Edward, Act 2, scene 4, p.146 (6b), 147-49, 154-55 (6b, varied).

Secondary leading-motifs

motif 1: associated with the pricking of Harold's conscience

appearances: Act 2, scene 2, taking of the oath, v.2, p.50-52 (sequential treatment), 55-56 (sequential treatment), 57-58 (sequential treatment), 59-60; Act 2 scene 3, v.2, p.96 (transposed), p.102 Alred reminds Harold of the country's faith in him (transposed); ditto, v.2, p.229-30, 235 (transposed); Act 4 scene 2, p.297-99 (sequential treatment closes the opera). Harold with the Normans v.2, p.24-25 (rhythmic motif of m.1); Edith p.134 (rhythmic motif of m.1); Edith p.275-76 (rhythmic motif of m.1)

motif 2: associated with Harold's moments of joy

motif 3: associated with the Saxons as warriors

appearances: Saxon encampment, Act 3, scene 1, v. 2, p. 190; Harold enters prepared for war, Act 3, scene 2, v. 2, p. 216-17 (rhythmic figures based on motif); search for Harold's body on the battlefield, act 4, scene 1, p. 249 (rhythmic figures based on motif).

motif 4: associated with Haco

appearances: Haco and Harold, act 2, scene 1, v. 2, p. 3-5, 12 (varied); 13 (varied), 15 (varied); Harold and Haco, Act 3, scene 1, v. 2, p. 171 (transposed), 179 (transposed).
From Table 3 a number of general observations can be made about the relationship between thematic and dramatic scheme in the opera. Group 2 is present throughout the opera, in moments associated with Harold's memories of nobility and love. Group 3 is present throughout the opera in moments of difficulty, for the Godwin House. These two thematic groups encompass the chief interplay of ideas in the opera: a House of love, nobility, and truth on the wane through tragic blunders, Sweyn's illicit affair, Harold's oath to William and his betrayal of Edith. The other principal groups are associated with the action of the libretto: Edward's weakness, Harold's heroism, Harold's various fateful activities, and his efforts to avert fate. The subsidiary themes are associated with various secondary aspects of the action: Haco's loyalty, Harold's joy, Harold's terror, Harold's evil flaw, the Saxons as warriors. Less important characters are assigned non-recurring themes: Edith, Sweyn, Odo, Alred, Godwin.

Harold therefore may be said to represent a detailed attempt on Marshall-Hall's part to imitate Wagner's leitmotif technique, in its numerous instances where the interplay of principal themes correspond to the interplay of principal ideas in the plot, namely nobility and fatal flaws. The composer's understanding of Wagner's thematic technique had matured considerably since Dido. On the other hand, the number of themes not associated with specific ideas is larger than Wagner would have tolerated. It is possible that the composer intended, but did not succeed, in conveying the impression that these subsidiary themes have a specific meaning. The imitation is therefore somewhat less striking than Wagner.
There are certain similarities between the opera's tonal scheme and Wagner's principles of tonal design too. A period structure is evident in certain scenes: the *bogen* forms of Harold's speech to Edith, Act 2 scene 3, p.117ff, Harold with his soldiers, Act 3 scene 1, p.163-69, the interlude, Act 3, scene 2, p.192-98, and Edith's aria, act 4, scene 2, p.270ff; and the *bar* form of Act 2, scene 2, p.37-60.

Overall, the key of C seems to have a referential function in the work, ending in the minor. Structural leaps of a major 3rd or pivoting on diminished 7ths are common. But there is little relation between the small and large scale in the tonal design; it is simply not well thought out. There are preludes, interludes, and codas, as in Wagner, but they do not form a logical tonal scheme as Wagner's do. In the harmonic details, the chromatic alterations and elaborations often seem arbitrary. All that can be said of Marshall-Hall's technique is that he chooses continuously meandering successions for music accompanying the more passionate moments - act 1, scene 2, act 2, scene 3 (love duet), and act 4, scene 2 (Edith) - and clearer, more-directed progressions for other sections of the text.

*Harold* is an attempt to assimilate Wagner's musico-dramatic principles to English opera, in its national-historical subject, its *leitmotiven* fabric, and its continuous, numberless structure. Beyond this, it is a score of some individual merit, in its intelligent sharpening of the Lytton work into a dramatic scheme of three rapid movements toward climatic tableaux, and its effective association of a small number of principal dramatic ideas with musical shapes, making its overall-dramatic structure and the overall-musical structure at
one in their intent. But it is arguable whether the three climatic tableaux are in themselves successful. They are undoubtedly spectacular and moving from a visual point of view; but from a tonal point of view they show no striking features of expansion or resolution, nor do they have the contrapuntal power of similar climatic moments in Wagner's music dramas. The use of 'fake, antique olde Englishe' throughout the libretto, as in Stanford's *Canterbury Pilgrimage*,¹ and in many other works of the period in England is just as bewildering and affected as it always was. Despite Marshall-Hall's rhetoric about 'universal appeal', *Harold* belongs to the *genre* of the stilted, late nineteenth century English operatic failure, rather than to a class of mysteriously neglected masterworks.

*Harold* generated considerable interest amongst champions of new English works. George Henschel conducted an excerpt at his London Symphony Orchestra concerts in 1888, the same series in which works by Parry, Stanford, MacKenzie and Cowen received their premieres.² Charles Santley sang the part of Godwin and 'all his vocal power was needed in the amazing scene'.³ In September 1888 the *Magazine of Music* published an excerpt from the opera,⁴ and the *Musical World* wrote:

> We understand that Mr. S.W.L. Marshall-Hall's /sic/ music drama, "Harold", a scene of which was produced last February by Mr Henschel, has been purchased by a well-known German theatrical agent, who is negotiating for its production at Cologne. It is surely a reproach to the apathy of English managers that a work which so plainly exhibits genuine power should not obtain a full hearing in London.⁵

¹ *supra* p.32
² *Programme note, composer's scrapbook, GM. Notice of concert Musical World*, February 2nd 1888.
⁴ 'Where thorny brake' in *Magazine of Music*, Supplement, vol.5 no.8, September 1888, p.44-47. Extract from act 2 scene 3, p.117-19
⁵ *Musical World* 'Facts and Comment' September 29, 1888 vol.67 no.39 p.764
John F. Runciman played an organ arrangement of the prelude to the Prologue at a recital he gave in St Nicholas-Cole Abbey, Queen Victoria Street, in March 1890, which was reviewed favourably by G. Bernard Shaw.¹ August Manns agreed to perform a work of the composer's at the Crystal Palace².

1888 was a year of great promise for Marshall-Hall, and no doubt one of his happiest as a composer. The success of his first exposure to the public must have been partly responsible for his good fortune in being shortlisted for interview for the new Chair of Music at the University of Melbourne, over which deliberations had been in progress since 1887.³ There was certainly no academic reason why he should have seemed attractive amongst a field of 47 applicants. He wrote A Harold Overture in the same year, and ten years later published a drama A Dramatic Fragment⁴ based on the Harold story. When he was commissioned to write Alcestis in 1898 he tried adapting music from the still-unperformed Harold⁵.

But in 1889 and 1890, matters progressed no further. The Cologne performance did not eventuate, the Manns performance was delayed five years,⁶ and the Committee of Selection for the Chair of Music at Melbourne found none of the applicants adequate and made no appointment. In 1890, a small breakthrough came by way of the acceptance for publication of A song-cycle of life.

² The programme note for Henschel's concert, GM, records that 'a symphonic prelude from Mr. Marshall-Hall's pen will shortly be produced at the Crystal Palace.'
³ Sir Graham Berry, letter to Chancellor, University of Melbourne, 4 May 1888 CR. Advertisement, Musical World 25th Feb 1888.
⁴ A Dramatic Fragment in Hymns ancient and modern Melbourne, 1898, based on events leading to the trial of Godwin.
⁵ vide p. 131
and love by Joseph Williams\textsuperscript{1}, but this was of little significance. Williams and other publishers produced dozens of these little sets, aimed at the parlour-music market, all in numbers of six or twelve songs. Though Cowen and A. Goring Thomas contributed sets, Marshall-Hall was in the company of very minor composers, Florian Pascal, Rosamond Francillon, A. E. Horrocks, and lesser figures.\textsuperscript{2} In the preface, Marshall-Hall wrote:

\begin{quote}
A stranger in my native land;
Wherin I've found a thousand staring eyes
And scarce one generous heart;
Where friendship dies
With vanishment of what it looks to gain;
And Truth and Art seek bread and home in vain.\textsuperscript{3}
\end{quote}

Here can be seen an assumed pose of noble dissatisfaction with the state of musical life and society in general. It became a constant affect in Marshall-Hall's writings of later years. Without the security of a solid foundation of musical training, he must have been easily subject to many frustrations, and now frustration was only thinly concealed when he spoke of society, or music critics. A summary of his views on society follows:

\textsuperscript{1}Published by Joseph Williams, 1890. Bernard Shaw, in his review in \textit{The World} 31st December 1890, says he received his copy on 24th December from the publishers, which would explain why only a proof copy is in the estate, for Marshall-Hall had left London for Australia on 21st November. Scott, Barrett, Duncan, and others have stated erroneously that the set was published 'when the composer was 16'.

\textsuperscript{2}Folio of Joseph Williams publications, BL.

\textsuperscript{3}Preface, \textit{A song-cycle of life and love}, \textit{op. cit.}
ABSTRACT 6

MARSHALL-HALL'S 'VIEWS OF MUSIC'S ROLE IN SOCIETY

1. Great artists have been common men, and art is properly the property of the ordinary man.  

2. Education, at present directed at the amassing of wealth, should properly be directed to making men noble and generous, through sharpening the senses to the arts.  

3. Music, as the most direct language of emotion, is the most potent factor for education of the senses.  

4. Honour and respect in the world, once achieved by brute force, and now achieved by the amassing of wealth, would then be achieved by acts of compassion and generosity.  

1 'Art and especially music is the property of the workers... our Beethoven, our Wagner were both men of might, good hearty radicals with the utmost respect for a well-clayed suit of corduroys.' Music of the People, The Star May 1889. 'Schubert, Schumann, Beethoven and Wagner... led most hard, anxious lives, never knowing from month to month how they should contrive to exist'. The Artist and his Critics The Musical World April 1890.  

2 '...our pernicious education system - which encourages a boy to study, not that he may become noble and good...but that he may sell his acquirements to the best market...' What Progress has England Made in Music during the Last Ten Years' School 1887-88. '...place the good and beautiful in so attractive a light that men may be allured to study them for their own sake...the study of what is beautiful is in itself the most recreative diversion that there is.' Music: Its Place and Work in our lives' Magazine of Music June 1888. 'to make a child noble, not wealthy, is the only way to make it happy...' The Letter and Spirit of Music School 1887-88.  

3 'I believe music to be a most important factor, hitherto, neglected, in raising the moral perceptions of man.' Letter to Sir Graham Berry 31 January 1889, Central Registry, University of Melbourne. 'If our children can be trained to understand this language to the fullest extent, what a mighty agent for good it will become' Music and Man School 1887-88. 'Music is no mere pleasing sensation of sounds...its end and object is education...of the noble and godlike in man.' Music its place and work in our lives' Magazine of Music June 1888. Opera is 'for educating a man's higher nature... by stage and action of the play...by music.' National Opera, unidentified cutting, Marshall-Hall scrapbook.  

4 vide Music as a Religious Force School 1887. Also: 'It is now more than ever time that we cultivate unselfish and true methods of gaining happiness, when we are surrounded by a vast multitude of poverty-stricken brother mortals...' Music: Some Faults in Our Education System Magazine of Music July 1888. 'It is never possible to destroy evil by damning it. This can only be done by elevating the evil-loving mind to love good.' The Artist and his Critics The Musical World April 1890.
Marshall-Hall’s view of music’s role in society is the most immature of all his ideas. His study of Classics had no doubt acquainted him with Aristotle’s *Politics*, on which his rhetoric about music’s place in education as ‘the most recreative diversion that there is’ is heavily dependant.¹ From Chappell’s account of musical education at this time in England², it may be supposed that the composer’s observations on music education were timely, if not original. However, his proposition that through a proper appreciation of music the world would be transformed, was foolish, based as it was on his misconstrued belief that music inspires action in man, vide Abstract 3. His idol Wagner had a more complex view of the effects of music – it could communicate a lesson to the listener, but only when combined with certain visual portrayal and certain classes of poetry.³ On this point, Wagner is in qualified agreement with Hanslick, who pointed out that, though music operates on the emotions with greater intensity than any other art, it has no physical power.⁴

Marshall-Hall’s idea that art was the property of the common man is also unsound. He may be excused for thinking that Wagner had the ‘utmost respect for a well clayed set of corduroys’, for Wagner’s indulgence in every kind of luxury and his revulsion for all but the most pampering of garments was not widely known until Newman’s study of 1914.⁵ His


²vide chap. 1.

³Wagner, *Oper und Drama, loc. cit.*, p. 103.

⁴Hanslick, *op. cit.* p. 77.

simplistic view of Beethoven's character is less excusable, for Thayer's study was well known. Nevertheless, the idea is unsound, and G.B. Shaw's reply to one of these articles may be quoted as a valid objection:

Society, for Beethoven purposes, is divided into people who can afford to keep a piano and go to opera and concerts and people who can not. Mr. Marshall-Hall's idea that people who cannot are nevertheless screwed up to concert pitch by honest thorough, manly toil shews that, though he be an expert in the musical question, in the labour question he is a greenhorn.

His view of music's role as the great reforming agent of society were perhaps the retreat of a young man of affluent origin from the ugly reality of the industrial society around him. The glaring inequalities of London society in the 1880s might have been solved through a sacrifice by Marshall-Hall's own socially-privileged class of some of their exploitive freedom and liberty: once the poor had bread and rest, as Shaw pointed out, they would make music for themselves. But the young composer chose rather to think of a fanciful world in which the poor would be raised to the tastes of the rich, without the rich making any material sacrifice.

Marshall-Hall's views about musical criticism, published in the 1889-90 period, may be summarised as follows, Abstract 7:

1 Thayer Life of Beethoven was not printed in English till 1921, but was available in Germany more than forty years before that.


3 Ibid.
ABSTRACT 7

MARSHALL-HALL'S VIEWS ON MUSIC CRITICISM

1. There is an undiscovered law that causes repeated study of a musical work to reveal whether or not it be of real value. ¹

2. Musical language cannot be immediately understood, only repeated study gives understanding. Criticism of a new work is therefore not possible. ²

3. Because of the emotional not intellectual base of music, criticism is a matter for each individual, not a 'professional'. ³

¹Because of this 'undiscovered law...the more we peruse and study a work (we are able to) perceive if it be truly spoken'. The Artist and his Critics, The Musical World April 1890. 'Darwin has shown the marvellous modification the organs have undergone...music too must have this object or die; what is useless can no longer be endured.' Music: Its Place and Work in our Lives, Magazine of Music, June 1888.

²Music systems 'are not readily grasped in their entirety, save by those who have long studied them...it may be extremely difficult for the artist to make himself immediately understood.' The Artist and his Critics, op. cit., 'criticism of a new work is almost impossible at the hands of one man, unless the critic possesses genius equal to that of the artist.' ibid.

³'Ve are all capable of recognising real beauty and worth if we would but use our own eyes and not peer through the dusty spectacles of others' Music: Its Place and Work in Our Lives, op. cit. 'Any noble man can actually transform into tones his own glorious emotions'. Music as a Religious Force School 1887 Bach and Beethoven 'supposed an unwritten law of musical expression which they supposed everyone to understand...the intellectual side of music...is in itself utterly uninteresting to any but the pedants.' The Letter and Spirit of Music School 1888.
These views of musical criticism are contradictory. The professional critic lacked the artist's special personality and was therefore unable to understand his language, but on the other hand, any amateur could make a decisive criticism after repeated study of a score. The propositions that musical taste is a personal matter for the individual, and that critics should reserve judgement on new work are more tolerable. As Chappell describes it, musical critics at that time in England were certainly hostile towards local opera composers; and an appeal for less judgemental attitudes from the critics and a willingness to decide individually on behalf of the public was timely. The composer's dislike of critics may also draw on Wagner, who had, or affected to have, an abhorrence for them.

In September 1890, when matters seemed hopeless for the composer, the University of Melbourne finally made up its mind about the Chair of Music and offered it to him for a five year term at 1000 pounds per annum. He accepted and on 21 November 1890 set sail with his wife May and daughter Elsa for Australia, passage money of 150 pounds having been advanced to him.

It is unlikely that Marshall-Hall was the ideal choice for the Chair of Music in a young university. His application was impressive in its claims to the command of 5 languages, to a wide general education, to ten years of teaching experience, to skill at the piano, violin and singing, and to a record in composition and writing about music. It was supported by ten equally impressive testimonials, principal among them those

---

1 Letter of appointment of Professor Marshall-Hall, 1 September 1890, CR.
2 Letter, Berry to Premier of Victoria, 5 September 1890, CR.
3 Letter of application for the Professorship, loc. cit.
from Grove, Parry, Manns, Henschel, and the baritone Charles Santley.

But the application detailed no formal musical training and little specifically-musical teaching experience. It was a somewhat dubious record. The 1888 Selection Committee, which comprised Sir Frederick Ousley, Dr. A.C. MacKenzie, Dr. C.V. Stanford, Herr Goldschmidt and Charles Halle, some of the most eminent musicians in England, was not deceived by the application, as their decision to make no appointment indicated. No first-class European musician would, in their opinion, leave Europe for a restricting teaching position in Australia, even at 1000 pounds per annum. Ousley's opinion of the applicants was specific:

...eminently respectable men and good musicians in the ordinary sense of the word, but yet there are certainly not five, indeed hardly one of whom I could honestly speak as a first class man pre-eminently fitted for so responsible and onerous a position.

It is perhaps extraordinary that the opinion that ended the two year selection stalemate and influenced the University Council decisively in Marshall-Hall's favour was not the opinion of a member of the Selection Committee - distinguished though its members were - but the opinion of an amateur. The acting Governor of Victoria, Sir William Robinson, whose numerous amateur songs have thankfully long since been forgotten, had met Marshall-Hall socially in London and been immensely impressed with his learning and ability. It was his intervention that produced a final decision.

It is difficult to see however, that any better result would have eventuated for Melbourne. An appointment to a

---

1 Letter, Berry to Chancellor, op. cit.
2 Ibid.
3 Ousley, Letter to Berry, 3 May 1888 CR.
4 Robinson, Letter to Berry 19 June 1890, CR.
musical post cut off from Europe would hardly have been taken by a musician with definite, immediate prospects of success in Europe, as the Selection Committee had said. A refusal to make an appointment, on the other hand, would have failed to meet the need for musical leadership in Melbourne which undoubtedly existed.¹ Marshall-Hall's appointment, may be described as an effective compromise: he was the best Melbourne could afford.

¹A. Garran, 'Literature and Art', Australasia Illustrated (Sydney 1892). The account of the musical life points to the lack of proper music schools, conservatoriums, et. al.
Thou liest, wretched Priest! — Again I say
Thou liest. — 'tis thy trade to ever lie:
The healthful master that this shapeless clay
gave beauty, life, yea! immortality,
For your uncleanly lusts had ne'er a thought—
your 'virgin'god — papa, your mother — 'maid',
Nor all the loathed abortions priest-begot,
who, sexless, fain would all life else castrate.

G.W.L. Marshall-Hall
unpublished stanza of On the Mask
of Mary by Michelangelo /sic/
1897. Ms. in ML.
HYMN TO SYDNEY

DEDICATED TO ARTHUR STREETON IN HIS CAMP AT MOSSMANS BAYS

BY G.W.L. MARSHALL-HALL

DECORATED BY ERNEST MOFFITT MDCCXCVII
CHAPTER III
1891 - 1900

The orchestral concerts and the Conservatorium which Marshall-Hall created and directed in his first years in Australia constitute his most important contribution to Australian musical life. Apart from the performances of the International Centennial Exhibition of 1888, at which a large part of the standard concert repertoire had been given under the English conductor-composer Frederick Cowen, Melbourne had heard little orchestral music of any quality before Marshall-Hall's arrival. The existing Victorian State Orchestra was plagued with financial difficulties, and offered largely light-weight programmes. For the aspiring practical musician Melbourne offered little in the way of satisfactory training, and the Depression of the 1890s offered little hope for the creation of a new music school. The University envisaged that Marshall-Hall's teaching would be chiefly academic rather than practical, along the lines of the existing English and Scottish University music courses.

Within five years a very substantial change was evident, and the Year Book of Australia was describing Marshall-Hall as 'the musical enthusiast of the year'. He had assembled a new orchestra of 60 from amongst the theatre musicians and was giving regular concerts of Wagner, the standard repertoire, as well as the latest scores of R. Strauss, Brahms, Rimsky-Korsakov, and later Saint-Saens, Debussy, and MacDowell. He gave support to

---


2 Programmes of these were published periodically in The Argus.

3 Geoffrey Blainey, A Century History of the University of Melbourne, Melbourne: 1957, p. 115 ff. Marshall-Hall's duties were listed in a letter, Registrar to Warden of Senate, 19th February 1891, CR.

4 Year Book of Australia for 1895 ed. Edward Greville, p. 63

5 A fuller account involves (1) 'Repertoire' 100th Orchestral Concert Programme, 1910, GM; (2) J.W. Barrett Outline history of orchestral music in Melbourne, Melbourne, 1940 (3) Concert prospectus programmes, engagement notices and accounts in MC, NL, GM; (4) Numerous reviews in The Age and The Argus.
William Laver, a local music teacher, who had been seeking to have a school of music established at the University; and while Marshall-Hall was on leave of absence in England, April–December 1894, Laver completed arrangements to have his teaching studio and numerous private pupils made the nucleus of a University Conservatorium. A staff of no small European experience was engaged, Otto Jung advanced money for the first term's rent of the building, and the project soon paid for itself, confounding the University's expectations.¹ In this way Marshall-Hall, whose own experience of Conservatoriums was small, gained a practical component for his University course, and Laver official recognition for his work. 142 students had enrolled by the end of the year. Marshall-Hall was also quick to recognise real talent among local youth where it existed. He helped the twelve-year old Percy Grainger arrange a concert in Melbourne, and chaired the committee set up in 1895 to raise funds for the boy to study in Leipzig.²

During this time, the composer's regular creative work proceeded as before. Overture to Giordano Bruno was completed in 1891, the Symphony in C in 1892, the Idyll for orchestra by 1894, and the String Quartet in C before 1895.³ There is evidence that he finished a movement for bassoon and piano in 1891 too.⁴

¹A full account involves (1) The Life of Laver, Ms., in NL, Ms.2691/3608; (2) Ian Braid The growth of the University Conservatorium, 1938, typescript, GM (3) Correspondence, University Council for 1894, CR; (4) Blainey, loc.cit. (5) Ernest Scott A history of the University of Melbourne Melbourne, 1936; (6) letter, Marshall-Hall to Streeton, 21st February 1895, GM.


³see Appendix II.

⁴Croll Smike to Bulldog, Sydney, 1946 pp.59-61, containing letter Marshall-Hall to Streeton. It is not certain however that the bassoc and piano piece referred to here is that listed in the Catalogue of Music, Appendix II.
It is interesting to observe how the composer was viewed in his newly adopted country. On his arrival, the *Year-Book of Australia* had this to say:

...a young gentleman absolutely unknown by name to Australian amateurs well acquainted with the progress of musical affairs in England, was chosen for the post and arrived in Melbourne early in January. The newcomer was at once 'interviewed' with the object of finding out who he was, when he told the Melbourne press people that he 'had been educated in Germany under the first maestri' and had been 'very successful in England' where he had 'got through a lot of work'. A scene of his from an unpublished opera, 'Harold' had once been sung at a London concert by Mr. Santley; he had written another opera whilst in Germany; and he had also 'written for the papers a good deal'. This strikingly modest record has been deemed sufficient by the London committee, though the candidate has not even a University degree to support his claim to the important post he now fills.  

On his students, friends, and supporters however, he had immense influence. Brian Wibberley, a pupil and aspiring composer, wrote:

...there was an indefinable something, a strange magnetism and contagion about his enthusiastic individuality that exerted a subtle and commanding influence over everyone brought within its charmed circle. To describe him as being popular among his students is to use idle and pedantic phraseology. Our loyalty deepened into devotion.  

With this kind of impact, it was not difficult for him to cover his deficiencies while amongst the impressionable, isolated, young Australians. It was not long before *Alma mater*, the polemical University journal, was describing him as 'well known throughout the whole musical world as the composer of many songs, and also of several symphonies...'. A foolish over-estimation, this kind of claim would hardly have been taken seriously anywhere but in Australia; it was easily made and unfortunately, when repeated often enough became easy enough for the composer himself to believe.

Force of personality, if capable of inflating a composer's reputation amongst an isolated circle, was certainly capable of filling a classroom, whether or not any material of substance was

---

1 *Year-Book of Australia for 1892* edited by Edward Greville, p.105
2 Brian Wibberley 'Professor Marshall-Hall' *The Gleam* vol.1, no.1, July 1900 p.22-24
3 *Alma mater* September 1898, p.62, annotation to a photograph.
being offered. Marshall-Hall made a great impression on his students, though he was hardly equipped for the task of lecturing on music, and was quick to jibe at those who were. He was able:

...to get a great hold on the sympathies of his students and other young fellows and girls artistically inclined who ... allowed themselves to come within the scope of his magnetic power. He is thus an excellent guide, perhaps it would scarcely be correct to say an excellent teacher. His every word is full of suggestion rather than of information...  

His great vitality, vigour, sense of humour and characteristic piercing laugh, which could be heard echoing a block away, all had their effect. Buoyant, by temperament an optimist, he was prone to making statements like 'All textbooks are equally good -- or bad!!', or 'More of counterpoint is to be learned from Bach or Beethoven than from Macfarren or Prout!!' In a sense, he was right -- few today would disagree that English musical pedagogy at the end of the XIXth century was in a sorry state. But there is little evidence that Marshall-Hall had anything to replace it with, other than a most subjective kind of appreciation. His anti-academic protestations were a cover for his own lack of training.

Sometimes his pronouncements were of a different kind. In 1891 he tried to have German made a compulsory study for music students. The University would not support his stand. On this occasion, his idea was sound: a knowledge of German is as vital now to the study of composers' letters, treatises, lieder, and the classics of musical scholarship in that language as it was then, and it is

1All about Australians /anon./ 'Marshall-Hall: a character sketch' vol.4, no.47, March 1, 1905

2Herbert Brookes In Memoriam, G.W.L. Marshall-Hall An elegy spoken at the graveside of the late Professor... Melbourne: Sands and McDougall Pty.Ltd./1915/p.5-7

3Wibberley, loc.cit.

4University Council papers for 1891, CR.
the continued failing of Australian universities that they will not seek to achieve the kind of rigour in languages that is common practice in Europe and America. But it is likely that other motives were behind Marshall-Hall's drive on this issue. His belief in the supremacy of German society over British, and his desire to aggravate the anti-German feelings of the local community would have played their part.

Marshall-Hall's first years in Australia were not without their difficulties. In his personal life, his marriage foundered and his wife May returned to England with their daughter in 1892. Marshall-Hall never sought a divorce, though he soon began living with another woman, Catherine Hore, who bore him two illegitimate children. In his creative life there was the unfamiliar cultural environment. Melbourne was very different from London in the opportunities for performance and patronage of music by local composers. While leading conductors in London gave two Marshall-Hall works in his absence, in Melbourne performances would occur only under his own baton. The economy was simply on too small a scale to support professional composers. Unlike Frederick Cowen, who received a fee of 5,000 pounds for his services to the 1888 Exhibition—a record even by European standards—most local composers worked only for choral societies, municipal bands, the churches, or for domestic needs, and few received any remuneration for their efforts.

When Marshall-Hall became honorary Conductor of the Melbourne Liedertafel in 1897, one of the city's amateur choral societies, it gave him an important outlet for his music: his Alcestis, Aristodemus and Study on Tennyson's Maude were all performed there under his baton, and his Choral Ode on Goethe's Helena

---

1 I am grateful to Mr. Joe Rich for clarifying this issue.
2 Supra, Chapter 1, p. 13.
and *An Australian National Song* were specially written for the Liedertafel's use. But opportunities of this kind were rare in Melbourne.

There was a certain pessimism about local music too, a feeling that there was nothing in the country conducive to inspiration. The landscape seemed to English ears shockingly silent and monotonous; Cowen in particular had declared that there was nothing in Australia to inspire the musician.

The most important factor affecting the composer's creative activity however, was the influence of his newly-adopted artistic milieu. From his first months in Australia, he fell in with the local painters of his own age-group. He befriended Arthur Streeton, 1867-1943, (who lived in Sydney 1890-97, but still spent periods in Melbourne) and Fred McCubbin 1855-1917; and camping with them at Little Sirius Cove, Mosman, Sydney, in December 1891, he met Tom Roberts, 1856-1931. The circle soon broadened to include Ernest Moffitt, Lionel Lindsay, Norman Lindsay, E. Phillips Fox and H.H. Champion. In his first years in Melbourne, Marshall-Hall became close to these men, often assembling with them for dinner at Fasoli's Italian Restaurant in LaTrobe Street, or at coffee-houses in Carlton in

---

1 Programmes, Melbourne, Liedertafel, nos. 256, 263, 266, 271, GM. The minutes for 1897-98 Annual Meetings give an account of the composer's appointment, GM.

2 Garran, *loc. cit.*

3 Croll, *op. cit.*., p. 17.

the evenings, exploring the bushland at weekends, and camping by the sea in the vacation periods. With his friend Hermann Kühr, principle horn in his orchestra, Marshall-Hall maintained an active interest in the Victorian Artists Society. In 1897, when Moffitt and the Lindsays settled at Chartersville, an old lodge in bushland, Heidelberg, out of Melbourne, Marshall-Hall took over a room there, installed a piano, and held musical evenings on Sundays, singing and playing Schubert lieder. 1

Marshall-Hall was in a much more secure position financially than his artistic colleagues, and he became an important patron of their work. He purchased a quantity of Streeton’s and Moffitt’s work, and encouraged Baron Pinchhoff and others to do likewise. 2 He engaged Streeton and Moffitt to illustrate his poems and to design posters for his orchestral concerts. 3

(See plate facing page 96.). He engaged Lionel Lindsay to paint the set for Alcestis, 4 and he sent friends and pupils to view their work. Moffitt enrolled as a student in the Conservatorium in 1895, and later Marshall-Hall employed him as Secretary of the Orchestral Concerts and the Conservatorium. 5 Streeton did a fine portrait of the composer in 1892. 6 Roberts did two portraits, possibly both on commissions arranged by him. 7 When Moffitt died of peritonitis in 1899, at the age of

---

1 See footnote 4 (1) p. 102, above, p. 59.
2 See footnote 4 (4) p. 102 above, p. 118.
3 The cover of To Irene is signed by Streeton; Hymn to Sydney is signed by Moffitt; posters by Moffitt are reproduced in footnote 4 (2) p. 102 above.
4 See footnote 4 (1) p. 102 above, p. 117.
5 See footnote 4 (2) p. 102 above, p. 6.
6 The Streeton portrait is reproduced in footnote 4 (8) p. 102 above, p. 22.
7 This is a point of some dispute. The 1899 Robert’s portrait, oil on wooden panel, is now in private hands; the 1900 Roberts portrait, oil on canvas, is in the Grainger Museum, Alma Mater, Vol. V, no. 6, p. 282 records Roberts presenting the latter to the Conservatorium, but it is not clear where the funds came from.
twenty nine, Marshall-Hall was heartbroken, and gave Lionel Lindsay 20 pounds to publish a memorial to him.\footnote{See footnote 4 (5) p. 102 above, p. 78. The memorial is footnote 4 (2) above.}

More important than the composer’s friendship and generosity towards the painters was the interchange of ideas that took place. Bernard Smith has identified the composer as ‘one of the earliest and in some ways the most important influence and patron of the Heidelberg school’,\footnote{See footnote 4 (4) p. 102 above, p. 108.} and a review of the composer’s theory of creativity, Abstract 2, will reveal the nature of this influence. His view of a spirit world as the source of inspiration, his idea of the special temperament of the artist and of the subjective purpose of art might well have been new to these young Melbourne artists; certainly he brought to their company a knowledge of the classics, of Romantic literature and of music. Streeton began to read the lives of Beethoven and Wagner, and when in Melbourne he attended the composer’s concerts.\footnote{See footnote 4 (3) p. 102 above, p. 42.} In his works literary and musical associations began to appear, and for a time there was a distinct movement away from realism toward idealism, away from simple description towards reflection and an air of dreaminess. The Silver Harmonies of Evening, 1894, Oblivion and Bush Idyll, 1895, were particularly notable in these respects.\footnote{The paintings are now lost. Galbally cites Charles Condor as a source of Streeton’s excursions into allegory and symbolism, \textit{vide} (8)102 above. But Condor had left Australia some time before these paintings were undertaken. See foontote 4 (4) p. 101 above.}

Moffitt too, moved away from his early naturalism to a more idealised style, in the \textit{genre} of the \textit{art nouveau}. The dryads, spirits, and other mysterious beings in his posters, and the pagan Greek pastoral scenes of \textit{Hymn to Sydney} show particularly ideas which Marshall-Hall espoused.\footnote{See footnote 4 (2) p. 102 above, p. 16.} Roberts came to similar ideas in his \textit{Odalisque} 1895, and \textit{Adagio}, 1899, though, having had less frequent
contact with Marshall-Hall, other sources of influence must also be considered. It is significant though, that Marshall-Hall criticised Roberts' work with confidence, advised him about the creative process, and suggested he read the works of Zola. E. Phillips Fox alone among the composer's friends betrayed no influence of his ideas. Fox belonged to a fundamentally different school of thought; he divided his time equally between Melbourne and Paris, and may be described as an Australian Impressionist. Between 1892 and 1902 he was in Melbourne, but though a mutual admiration existed between him and the composer, their styles were dissimilar. It was on Moffitt and Streton that Marshall-Hall had profound influence; for them he represented the latest trends in European ideas, and possibly their only direct contact with Europe at that time.

If Moffitt and Streton absorbed some of Marshall-Hall's Romanticism, he absorbed features of their style too. Streton, the stronger artistic talent of the two, had a joyous, naturalistic vision of the Australian landscape, which profoundly differed from the prevailing pessimism about the new land. In his early canvasses he had tried to capture a fleeting impression of an immense, sunlit, elemental land, full of light and air. Marshall-Hall soon came to share Streton's enthusiasm for the Australian climate and scenery, and was moved by the artist's carefree temperament.


2See footnote 4 (8) p.102 above, p. 61.

3See footnote 4 (6) p.102 above, p. 28.


5On his own account, vide 'The essentials of art' Alma Mater, Vol. 4, No. 4, p. 48.
he found an artist who seemed superbly poetic without a knowledge of poetry or literature, and who seemed to create without a conscious theory of creativity or a study of the great masterworks as his basis.

The composer dedicated his Overture Giordano Bruno to Streeton, and then set out to try and capture the same fleeting impressions of the Australian landscape in music and verse as Streeton had captured on canvas. Setting aside the passionate moods of his earlier poems and libretti, he produced Hymn to Sydney, a kind of rambling effervescence of praise for that city in Sappic verse, again dedicated to Streeton:

   City of laughing loveliness! Sun-girdled Queen!
   Crowned with imperial morning, bejewelled with joy,
   Rainmended soft like a bride in virginal sheen...

In music, the only successful expression came in 1903 when he temporarily abandoned dramatic rhetoric to compose the Eb Symphony, which he dedicated to 'my friends under the southern cross' and said, in his programme notes, was inspired by his camping at Mosman's Bay with his artist friends. Filled with an overabundance of joyful tunes and ideas, the Symphony is a complete contrast to the weighty gestures of his other orchestral scores.

But these two works were the only major fruits of the composer's efforts to express the Australian environment.

---

1Reference to 'that overture I dedicated to you' in the composer's letter to Streeton, 25th February 1895, GM. The overture, GM, was originally titled Overture in G minor, and then Dramatic Study, vide titles of autograph and Ms. copy in GM.


3Dedication, title page of full score, published privately 1906 GM. Programme, 1908 performance in GM.
In Streeton's art, Marshall-Hall was aware of significant moods and emotions which were beyond the power of his own musical style to express, and yet were significant enough to demand expression. In the Eb Symphony and the Hymn to Sydney he had to abandon some of his own artistic aims and methods, and it was a struggle to capture the intuitive, spontaneous technique and joyous moods that seemed to him the essence of Streeton's art.

If he seemed unable to absorb Streeton's ideas into his practice, he was able to reconcile them with his own ideas in theory. In 1899 he published a series of articles, 'The essential in art' in the University journal Alma Mater, which showed a substantial new stream in his thinking. These eight articles were originally delivered as a series of lectures and, perhaps to give them academic weight, were laced with quotations from Schopenhauer's The world as will and idea. 'My object,' intoned the composer, 'is to bring clearly before you the essential unity of the world...' and then he proceeded to quote from Schopenhauer's descriptions of the cosmic will, without ever touching on the erotic life of chastity, fasting, and self torture advocated to break down the wicked individual will.

As with Wagner before, Marshall-Hall's use of the Schopenhauer system is selective; only those parts of the system which will give authority to his own ideas appear. A summary of the views on emotion in music and music's role in society expressed in these lectures follows, Abstract 8:


2 A summary of the system may be found in Bertrand Russell, History of Western Philosophy and its connection with political and social circumstances from the earliest times to the present day. London, 1961 p. 722-27
ABSTRACT 8

MARSHALL-HALL'S VIEWS ON EMOTION IN MUSIC AND MUSIC'S ROLE IN SOCIETY MODIFIED AFTER 1891

1. Art is an end in itself, though indirectly a refining force. 1

2. There is a naive, spontaneous species of art alongside the Romantic. 2

3. Emotions of mirth, strenuous activity, boisterous joy, etc., may be better expressed by the spontaneous method. 3

4. Art is not for the many, but the special few (not the rich few). 4

5. The human whose life is joyous, strenuous, may be closer to the spirit of the ancient Greeks than the introverted intellectual. 5

---

1. Art has no purpose, no object...Although however, Art is an end in itself and has no direct purpose, it indirectly tends to refine and develop the mind, op. cit., I, pp. 24-25.

2. The Romantic, at all events in Literature and Painting, has its antithesis in the Naturalistic school, op. cit., III, p. 9. The Eb Symphony 'belongs rather to the naive spontaneous than to the introspective analytical school'. Programme, Orchestral subscription concert, 28 May 1904, GM.

3. Romanticism 'lost in vague spirituality looks with contempt on the animalism of human nature', op. cit., III, p. 9. 'This English symphony will have produced its intended effect if it reawakens in its hearers those emotions of beauty, joy, and courage from which it sprang'. Eb Symphony Programme, loc. cit.

4. 'Art as a whole is only for the few, not the rich few, but the few of special training, of special mental power,' op. cit., II, p. 47.

5. 'The Greeks invariably associated gymnastics with musical training, rightly considering that where one or other was neglected a man tends to become brutal or effeminate. And how true this is may be gathered from a very brief glance over the ranks of athletes and musicians today', op. cit., II, p. 47. 'Nowadays we are becoming so fragile, so refined, so spiritualised that there will soon be nothing left of us but a superfine essence,' op. cit., III, p. 11.
A comparison of Abstract 8 with Abstract 6 will demonstrate that Marshall-Hall's view of music's role in society had matured since his London days. He no longer asserted that art was the property of the common man and that Beethoven and Wagner were 'good hearty radicals'; art was the property of the specially gifted or specially trained few. Nor did he dwell on music's reforming powers: art was an end in itself, and if it had power to educate man's senses towards noble acts of compassion and generosity, then this power was an indirect force. His first Melbourne years had shown him that the common man was more impressed with his abilities to pioneer a scheme for an orchestra or a Conservatorium and to see it through than his abilities as a thinker or artist. There were few performances for his works and there was harsh criticism for his ideas. After one of his first public lectures, The Argus editorial had commented:

Professor Marshall-Hall has that strange modesty we have occasionally noticed in mere ordinary professors of music which leads them to think that they have strayed by mistake to a planet whose inhabitants are utterly incapable of understanding their art... There will be some difficulty in changing all at once to the rapt and ethereal ideas of a musical professor. And professor Marshall-Hall may discover before the change is made that human society and the universe are organised on somewhat wider plains than the final movement of a symphony.¹

His lecture, 'The Artist' 1891, had repeated opinions he had expressed in London three years before without modification, ideas that remained immature and contradictory, and for which the criticisms of G. Bernard Shaw remained valid. But if Shaw's criticism had been characterised by a spirit of good humour and reasonable debate, The Argus editorial was characterised by the absence of any rational argument to support its crushing condemnation. This early criticism had the ring of truth,

and by the lectures of 1899 Marshall-Hall's theories of music's role in society were less fanciful. The reality of his orchestral concerts, for example, was that he played not to the 'common man', but to the genteel, and depended on wealthy patrons for support. He was a University professor, comfortably provided for by the Establishment; and his pupils came from private schools more often than from the slums of Collingwood.

A comparison of Abstract 8 with Abstract 3 will demonstrate the influence of Streeton's art on his theories. Now he held that there were other moods and emotions than the intensely subjective, ecstatic moods of Wagner; emotions of mirth and joy were as worthy of artistic expression as intense passion and pain. Indeed, they may be closer to life's source, as embodied in the ancient mythology and radiated by the spirit world, than the introverted emotions. But while these moods should have come to his art spontaneously - or so he thought - they came in the Hymn to Sydney and the Eb Symphony only with protracted effort, and not entirely successfully. This difference between Marshall-Hall's theoretical position and his practical experience must have been the most disturbing part of his creative crisis in these years.

Other ideas however, were not abandoned. The views which appear in 'The essentials of art' unchanged since their first expression in London may be summarised as below, Abstract 9.

This restatement of old ideas indicates that the composer's surrender to Streeton's art had not been unconditional. Still convinced that the creative idea should force itself on the artist, and puzzled that Streeton's aesthetic would not, he never abandoned his Romantic aims and methods entirely. In 1896 he published To Irene, a hot-blooded poem which adheres to the theme of human passion as a spiritual power radiated from the human form by unseen agents, with the motto:
ABSTRACT 9

MARSHALL-HALL'S VIEWS UNCHANGED SINCE LONDON

1. Music is capable of exact depiction of the emotions.¹ (vide Abstract 3 nos. 1 and 2)

2. In creating, ideas force themselves upon the artists.² (vide Abstract 2 no. 3)

3. Music's importance in education is much underestimated.³ (vide Abstract 6 no. 2)

4. Wagner is the supreme dramatic artist and an example of the noble life; Beethoven is the musical counterpart of Shakespeare; Bach the supreme polyphonist; Schubert the supreme composer of song.⁴ (vide Abstract 5 nos. 4 and 5)

5. Form is the spontaneous succession of emotions.⁵ (vide Abstract 4 no. 3)

¹'That which prompts us to action then is our feelings... Music is able to reproduce with the exactness and nicety of life itself every moment, every variation, every minute shade of that form of energy which we understand as emotion.' - The essentials of art', op. cit., II, p. 40.

²'The Artist produces not what he will but what he must. His significance and value lie in this, that he produces to us fact, truth.' - ibid., I, p. 26.

³In II p. 48, ibid., he calls for the introduction of courses of music and movement as required parts of the school curriculum.

⁴Tannhauser 'shows with what astounding and terrible vehemence this energy (a heroic spirit) expends itself...' - ibid., II, p. 43, 'A Beethoven sonata is the representation of typical elements in man...consummate command of artistic resources and conception are no less characteristic of Beethoven than Shakespeare...' - ibid., IV, pp. 12-13 'We can find nothing in the art of music to which to compare the grand and noble expressive outline of Schubert's song-melody, outside Beethoven and Bach's abstract works...' - ibid., VI, p. 61.

⁵'Structural form in a musical work is the logical sequence of emotions,' - ibid., III, p. 12.
E lo spirito mio
Por occulta virtu che da lei mosse
D'antico amor senti la gran potenza.

In 1897 he published A Book of Canticles, an attempt to synthesise the theme of human passion with Streeton's carefree gaiety. The result was trite little pieces, in traditional verse forms, dealing with the subject with a licence and freedom unknown at the time save in Oscar Wilde. An innocent-looking English ballad asserts that adultery is simply living life to the full, another little ditty instructs the reader that the man who has loved only one woman has not loved at all, and an epitaphalium for Michelangelo's Virgin Mary makes a rather lewd assertion - Mary is:

...dreaming of that all-wonderous hour
when slain by loves immittigable power,
the god grew faint within her wild embrace
And she immortal with celestial grace.


Hymn to Sydney was denounced by the press as without interest or merit, while To Irene and A Book of Canticles were ignored. None was a commercial success.

1To Irene, Melbourne, 1896, p. 1.
2'To take life for what its worth/Will never lack for food or mirth...You and I will also lie/happy as the gods on high'. A Book of Canticles, Melbourne: 1897, p. 5: 'To my sweetheart, to be merry with me'.
3'The heart that's framed for loving/must oft test fall/And who hath loved only one/Ne'er loved at all.' ibid., p. 21, 'Loves Perjuries'.
4Ibid., p. 22. 'On Michelangelo's Mask of Mary'.
5The Argus reviewed Hymn to Sydney in 1897, but no review of the other two publications was discovered.
contained at least three pieces composed before his arrival in Australia, previously published in England (see Appendix I). The only other piece with Australian aspirations was From Cremorne Point in 1899, a final and more modest effusion in the Hymn to Sydney vein, no more successful than its predecessor. In an accompanying commentary he tried to rationalise his Hymn to Sydney by invoking its parallels with Romantic imagery.

Apart from his poetic efforts, opening a Conservatorium brought Marshall-Hall to consider the question of music education and its philosophy. In the Prospectus for his Conservatorium, he expounded his educational credo, simple but sound principles, which are summarised below, Abstract 10:

---

1 He began working on Alcestis in November 1897, according to The Argus, August 2, 1898.

2 From Cremorne Point' The Bookfellow (Sydney) No. 3, March 25, 1899, pp. 13-15. Sydney had 'a grand lyrical quality... the weird magnitude of the Egyptian desert... the strange adventurous possibilities of the Greek coast... the gorgeous luxury of Southern Italy and Asia...'
ABSTRACT 10

MARSHALL-HALL'S VIEWS ON EDUCATION IN MUSIC

1. Performance must be taught systematically. Expression can be taught.¹
2. Music education cannot be centred in dexterity, but must encompass the whole social life of man.²
3. Principles of both interpretation and composition can be found through the study of the great tone poets, Bach, Mozart and Wagner.³
4. There is a commonwealth of the arts, and a Conservatorium should be a centre for all the arts.⁴

¹Schools 'must impress on them that to be a musician a man must be more than an acrobat' The Letter and Spirit of Music, School, 1886. In this article Marshall-Hall gives a systematic guide for interpretation of Bach's Prelude 18 of Das Wohltemperierte Klavier, grounded on muscular contraction and expansion of the human voice. 'A pianist nowadays must know something more than how to press down the keys'. Preface to 1895 Prospectus of the University Conservatorium.

²The new musician's 'chief interest will centre not in music, but in the social life of man...to contribute their life towards bettering the world', Musica and Man, School, 1887-88. 'It is necessary for him to be acquainted with the theory of his art; to know something of harmony and counterpoint; of the construction of musical works; of the lives and characters of the great tone poets...'. Prospectus 1895, op.cit.

³Prospectus, 1895, ibid. 'interpretation of works is made a special study. The bedrock of this system is a thorough grounding in the works of J.S. Bach,' Prospectus 1907, of the Melbourne Conservatorium. A fine example of Marshall-Hall's method of drawing principles of composition and interpretation from musical works is his analysis of Schubert's Der Doppelgänger in Music: Tone Poetry Magazine of Music, August 1888 or his analysis of Prelude 18 from Bach's 48 supra note 1 above.

⁴It is hoped the Conservatorium will become a centre of artistic life round which will gather those interested in music' Prospectus 1895, op. cit., vide The Essentials of Art Alma Mater Lecture 1 June 1899 'Language Sculpture, Painting and Music... are all mental sign systems...' The Artist and his Critics, The Musical World, April 1890.
The structure of his Conservatorium course indicates a practical application of these ideas and his success is attested by the lack of change in structure in the courses of the University Conservatorium for many years after his death.\(^1\) Only his desire that the Conservatorium should become a centre for the arts never came to fruition, although for a time the Victorian Artists Society held exhibitions there. He tried unsuccessfully to persuade Streeton to set up his studio in the Conservatorium soon after it opened in 1895, and did not pursue the idea afterwards.\(^2\)

Marshall-Hall's setting of *Alcestis* was performed in 1898. Revival of appropriate musical settings for the plays of ancient Greece was as problematic in the 1890s as it is today. There was an interest in Universities then in making models of ancient instruments and writing music according to the ancient Greek modes to be presented with the dramas, and various experiments took place. Reporting on an English musical production of the *Alcestis* of Euripides, *The Champion* told Australians in 1895:

> Greek plays are periodically being given by many of the principal colleges and universities in England...The resurrection of these old plays is both instructive and interesting.

\(^{1}\) A comparison of Marshall-Hall's 1895, *Prospectus* with Conservatorium Handbooks as late as 1950 reveals little change.

\(^{2}\) Letter, Marshall-Hall to Streeton, 25th February, 1895, GM.
and we would draw the attention of our own University auth-
orities to the above precedent.  

Marshall-Hall's Alcestis does not set out to revive ancient music. It began as modern, incidental music for a performance of The Alcestis of Euripides by the students of Trinity College at the University, a production intended to raise money for a gymnasium. But the College got more than they bargained for, and the result caused the Warden of the College, Dr. Leeper, a personal financial loss.  

Alexander Leeper, 1848-1934, appointed founding Warden of Trinity College in 1875 when he was 27 years old, was arranger and producer of Alcestis. An Irishman, an inspiring teacher and a strong leader who had distinguished himself in Greek prose at Oxford, he had a modern conception of the drama. It would be given in Greek, with no masks or choric movements but

---


with a sumptuous staging and incidental music in the latest Romantic style. He had a pamphlet printed for the audience, giving an English translation of the work so all could follow the action. This translation was his own work, save the choruses, which were from Way's *Euripides in English Verse*.  

Leeper divided Euripides into three acts with eight scenes, as below, Table 1.

For the purpose of musical setting, it was a logical division, for there are three primary movements in the drama: the events leading to Alcestis' death, Admetus' hospitality to Heracles, and the events leading to Heracles' tribute of gratitude in returning Alcestis to life. The individual scenes do not indicate scene change, but rather mood change, for the whole drama takes place before the palace of Admetus, and the vitality depends on the different moods the action casts over this specific location.

Marshall-Hall gave Leeper more than incidental music: he wrote background music for the entire drama, an aria for Alcestis on her deathbed, and choruses to be sung by an off-stage choir. He engaged a 50-piece orchestra, 76 voices from the Melbourne Liedertafel for the chorus numbers, and Lionel Lindsay to design a setting.

Marshall-Hall's *Alcestis* may be considered at least a partial recreation of the ancient stage. It is known that in ancient

---


4Lionel Lindsay, *Comedy of Life...op. cit.*, p. 117.
## TABLE 1

**ALCESTIS - ARRANGEMENT OF THE TEXT**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Euripides</th>
<th>Leeper</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Line</td>
<td>action</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 - 76</td>
<td>Prologue: Apollo, Thanatos</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>77-140</td>
<td>Parados: Chorus I - lament for the dying Alcestis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>141-212</td>
<td>Episode: slave tells of Alcestis' preparations for death</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>213-279</td>
<td>Stasimon: Chorus II plea to the gods to deliver Alcestis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>280-392</td>
<td>Episode: Admetus, Alcestis, death of Alcestis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>393-434</td>
<td>Monody of Alcestis' son</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>435-475</td>
<td>Stasimon: Chorus III - farewell lament</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>476-567</td>
<td>Episode: Heracles arrives, Admetus welcomes him</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>568-605</td>
<td>Stasimon: Chorus IV - suspecting good will come of Heracles visit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>606-860</td>
<td>Episode: Pheres and Admetus argue Chorus V - funeral procession</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>861-1008</td>
<td>Heracles hears of Admetus heroic concealment of Alcestis' death</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chorus VI Kommos: a tribute to Alcestis' heroism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1009-1158</td>
<td>Episode: Heracles returns Alcestis to life</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 1159-1163 | Exodus: Chorus VII - joy at the reunion, and the moral 'manifold things unhoped for the gods to accomplishment bring...'

---


2 Leeper, *op. cit.*
drama the chorus had vocal functions, individual actors broke into song, and that there was music throughout the action.¹ The artistic impression was musical to a considerable degree. Furthermore, Euripides lived in an era of reform in Greek arts and letters, in which a complex sort of music was appearing: flutes, reeds, lyres, cymbals and all manner of instruments played together; while the style of Timotheus of Milet, c. 400 BC, Phrynis of Mytilene, c. 450 BC, and other musician-poets was becoming chromatic and elaborate, free in form and subjective in expression.² It is known that Euripides was not uninterested in the modern music of his time.³ In that Marshall-Hall's score provides music throughout the action, sung choruses, and an aria for Alcestis, all relatively chromatic and elaborate in style and subjective in expression, it was in a sense analogous to the spirit of the Euripidean stage.

While the rich harmonic music of the late XIXth century does not combine as easily with the spoken voice as the music of Euripides' time would have, it was less remote from the ancient stage than any of the previous opera settings. There were more than twenty musical treatments of The Alcestis prior to Marshall-Hall,⁴ and a comparison of his with those of Lully, 1674, Gluck 1767, and Handel, 1743, from the point of view of authenticity may be expressed as below, Table 2.

²Ibid.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Euripidean stage</th>
<th>Lully</th>
<th>Handel</th>
<th>Gluck</th>
<th>Marshall-Hall</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Greek text</td>
<td>French text</td>
<td>English text</td>
<td>French text</td>
<td>Greek text</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Choric movements</td>
<td>Numerous ballets</td>
<td>Two ballets</td>
<td>Numerous ballets</td>
<td>No ballet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Actors spoke and</td>
<td>Numerous ensembles</td>
<td>Solos for four characters</td>
<td>sung throughout</td>
<td>Alcestis has an aria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>occasionally sang</td>
<td>several choral numbers</td>
<td>chiefly choral setting</td>
<td>several choral numbers</td>
<td>Chorus has vocal numbers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chorus has vocal</td>
<td>No spoken dialogue</td>
<td>Spoken dialogue unaccompanied</td>
<td>No spoken dialogue</td>
<td>Accompaniment through most of dialogue</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>functions</td>
<td>Five acts and prologue - all different scenes</td>
<td>unspecified</td>
<td>three acts and numerous scenes</td>
<td>Single scene</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---


2 Sachs, *loc. cit.*

3 Apel, *loc. cit.*

4 Sachs, *loc. cit.*


Though these three earlier settings are of considerable musical worth, they are not authentic in any respect. Marshall-Hall could have found few models for his treatment in previous music-drama. The only works of comparable conception are A.C. MacKenzie's *The Dream of Jubal*, 1889, and R. Strauss' *Enoch Arden*, 1898, the latter of which he could not have known at that time.\(^1\) Beethoven's *Fidelio* (the grave-digging scene) and Weber's *Der Freischütz* (the incantation scene) contain similar scenes, but these are exceptional to the rest of their respective scores. Marshall-Hall's *Alcestis*, with its continuous musical fabric set against spoken voice and occasional bursts of song or chorus, was an original conception.

In discussing theatrical representation, it is sometimes difficult to define the extent of musical involvement required to differentiate 'incidental music' from 'opera'. Marshall-Hall's *Alcestis* departs from the operatic convention of continuous singing, but the music is near-continuous nevertheless. The music has a fundamental role in the impression conveyed and affects the character of the drama considerably, as will be seen. This is an essential attribute of opera, and though *Alcestis* is perhaps best described as a melodrama (in the ancient sense), its consideration as among the composer's operas does not seem out of place.

Whether consciously or unconsciously, *Alcestis* has the semblance of a single tonal scheme for the first time in Marshall-Hall's operas. Neither *Dido* nor *Harold* exhibited more than a haphazard, local use of tonal design for dramatic effect. But here the various shadows that the action casts over the palace seem to be heightened by tonal scene change.

\(^1\)Apel *op.cit.* p.435
Bb major seems to have a referential function for Act 1, scene 1, and structurally the whole of Act 1 moves from Bb to the distant B major, bII, emphasising tonally the sense of desertion and loneliness that envelopes the palace after Alcestis' death in scene iii. The whole of Act 2 seems to have a parallel structure, moving from C major, II, in the Introduction, to C# minor, #II, for the funereal procession of scene ii. In Act 2, scene i, the movement from E minor, #IV, to G major, VI major, highlights the false splendour that is turned on at the palace for Heracle's benefit. Act 3, scene i, opens in the #IV, E major, and has a progressive harmonic motion by fifth steps, #IV-VII-II-VI...IV...V - I, arriving once more at Bb, as a sense of real glory returns to the palace, when Alcestis returns to life, in scene iii.

Marshall-Hall's attention to tonal design in Alcestis contradicts his belief that form should force itself on the composer as the spontaneous sequence of emotion. But it may be described as his way of solving aesthetic problems inherent in the melodrama conception he had chosen. A combination of spoken dialogue, instrumental music, chorus, and a single aria has no easy aesthetic means of unity that will at the same time allow for a spirit of solemn tragedy. The single tonal-scheme, combined with the melodic design - which involved recurring motives as shall be shown - was one way of holding the various elements of the production together. It is possible too, that the creative crisis in his work of the preceeding seven years had left him more open to consider form, despite his beliefs.

The Alcestis, 438 BC, has long been a battleground for critics, for its strange bitter-sweet ending, with its fairy-tale
like unreality, was unusual in Greek tragedy. Some XIXth century scholars viewed it as a Romantic marvel, with its wish for the impossible, its escape from death, and its pure heroine. Others interpreted it as a satirical morality, dissecting conventional values, in which Admetus beats death only to learn the high cost of living longer:

Just as Euripides starts out from a fairy tale, so he returns to it at the end after he has shown in all the intervening parts of the play what happens when the tale is transposed into reality. Some XXth century scholars have interpreted it as a study of Admetus: a disturbing personality, incorrigible, obstruse, betraying the noble Alcestis at every turn. His true colours are revealed only when he is with his father, Pheres, and tempers flare. In the final scene, Alcestis is silent, dissociating herself from an unreal world in which Admetus 'has his cake and eats it too.' Charles Beye wrote that it is 'a dark comedy of manners, which moves curiously, raising our emotions ambiguously, leaving us never sure of what we feel.' The protean character of the play allowed Robert Browning, in his Balaustion's Adventure, 1871 to rewrite Admetus' character, making him in the end as heroic as Alcestis: while T.S. Eliot's The Cocktail Party, 1950, transformed the whole radically into an almost unrecognisable Christian morality. Marshall-Hall's setting, by the extent of the musical involvement, adds a specific interpretive element of his own. His changing musical emphasis, which varies from scenes without music at all to dramatic aria, may be summarised as below, Table 3.

---

1J. Wilson, XXth Century Interpretations of Euripides' Alcestis New Jersey, 1968, introduction, p. i-vi.
5Wilson, op. cit., p. viii.
**TABLE 3**

ALCESTIS - MARSHALL-HALL'S MUSICAL ARRANGEMENT OF THE DRAMATIC ACTION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scene and action</th>
<th>Musical Treatment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Act 1 scene 1, Prologue</td>
<td>Melodrama</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Act 1 scene 2, Coryphoeus and Maid</td>
<td>Nil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Act 1 scene 3, death of Alcestis</td>
<td>Aria for Alcestis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Act 2 scene 1, arrival of Heracles/Heracles and Admetus</td>
<td>Nil/melodrama</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Act 2 scene 2, Pheres and Admetus</td>
<td>Nil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Act 3 scene 1, Heracles drunk</td>
<td>Melodrama</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Act 3 scene 2, Admetus and Coryphoeus</td>
<td>Melodrama</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Act 3 scene 3, Heracles returns Alcestis to life</td>
<td>Melodrama</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
It can be seen from Table 3, that the different scenes are given a differing importance musically. The result is a specific interpretation of the drama: Marshall-Hall's _Alcestis_ is a Romantic fable of heroic death and magical resurrection. The aria for Alcestis on her deathbed - the only moment in the work when a character breaks into song - emphasises her as the heroine of the work. At the same time, Admetus is pushed into the background - his scene with his father, Pheres, has no musical setting at all.

As in _Harold_, the score lends itself to thematic analysis which relates specific themes to specific ideas in the libretto. An attempt at thematic analysis was made in the programme of the August 1898 performance, which reads into the score more than the ear may be expected to detect.\(^1\) Table 4 below summarises the thematic scheme of the work. There are 9 shapes identifiable as themes in the work; of these 4 may be distinguished as the principle thematic ideas of the opera, the remaining 5 occur as themes in the choruses and do not appear in the work beyond the chorus in which they occur. Beyond this, there are 24 other shapes, unrelated to the 9 themes and fulfilling a more transitional role in the piece.

---

\(^1\) *vide* Programme note, 256th Concert, Melbourne Liedertafel, 1st August, 1898, GM. This anonymous analysis, perhaps by the composer, identifies the four principle themes as in Table 5, but also claims that a transitional theme heard in the overture, p. 6 and another p. 7, are representative of 'The god of death' and 'The approach of death' respectively. There is little to support this claim.
TABLE 4

ALCESTIS — RECURRING THEMES

Principal themes (arranged from the autograph full score)

theme 1: associated with the intervention of the gods
appearances: Overture, p.5, 8 (rhythmic motif b); Admetus returns from the funeral, p.135 (motif b); Heracles enters with Alcestis, p.161 (b motif); Chorus VII 'manifold things unhoped for/ the gods to accomplishment bring' p.166.

theme 2 (a)

theme 2 (b)

theme 2: associated with Admetus
appearances: Apollo speaks of his gratitude to Admetus, p.13(a); Admetus enters, p.99-100; Chorus IV, p.101 (a, transposed), 104 (a) (original form), 106 (original form), 113 (transposed) (a), 116 (a, figures related to the rhythm); Chorus V, p.117 (a, transposed, rhythm double-dotted), 124-26 (a, transposed, rhythm altered); Mar.-servant tells of the imposition on Admetus, p.129 (b), 131 (b); Admetus enters, p.136 (a, transposed, m.1).
theme 3: associated with Alcestis

appearances: Apollo speaks of Alcestis' willingness to die, p.13; Alcestis' aria, p.63-65 (original form, then sequential treatment)

theme 4: associated with Heracles

appearances: Apollo's speech, p.15; Heracles' arrival, p.93 (figures based on rhythm), 94, 96, (ditto), 98 (transposed); Heracles enters drunk, p.132 (transposed); Heracles exits p.133 (transposed); 134 (transposed); Heracles enters with Alcestis, p.161 (transposed, augmented, rests interpolated).

Non-recurring themes
Chorus I  p. 21 (1)

Chorus I, p. 35 (2)

Grave con moto

Chorus II p. 49. Chorus III, p. 85, is an abbreviated restatement of Chorus II, transposed.

Chorus IV p. 101-02, 111 (transposed)

Chorus VI p. 137, 141 (transposed).
The principal themes are clearly associated with the main protagonists in the drama, Alcestis, Admetus, Heracles, and the gods. They function simply as musical signatures for the main characters, and there is no attempt to relate them by interplay to the interplay of the principle ideas of the plot, as there was in Harold. In act 2 scene 2; the funeral procession is accompanied by theme (2.) and (1)-(b), associating Alcestis' death with the work of the gods, but elsewhere there is no other detailed association. It is possible the composer intended but did not succeed in conveying specific meanings to other melodic shapes.

The most striking feature of the score is its choral writing. Marshall-Hall scores for double choirs, TTBB, all-male, whose antiphonal dialogue is impressive. The voices intone in unison in Chorus I, in joyful melismas in Chorus IV, or in four-part chorale harmony in Chorus V. There is a variety of forms, Chorus II builds towards a climax, Chorus IV is a regular ABA, Chorus VII has an instrumental coda. Marshall-Hall shows himself capable of fluent and interesting manipulation of large choral forces, if not with the mastery of Hubert Parry, certainly better than Melbourne had heard in G.W. Torrence's Revelation, 1882,\(^1\) or the numerous pieces of Julius Siede.\(^2\)

Alcestis makes substantial adaptations of music from Harold, summarised below in Table 5. By critical concordance of the extant scores and sketches for Alcestis with the Ms. score of Harold, it is possible to reconstruct the composer's creative process, and this reconstruction provides a unique opportunity to test his theories of creativity as publicly expressed against his actual practice. He began work in

---

\(^1\)First performed, Melbourne Town Hall, June 1882, Ms. score in Leeper Library, Trinity College, University of Melbourne.

\(^2\)Siede wrote frequently for the Melbourne Liedertafel, vide Mss. scores in GM.
November 1897¹, sketching an Introduction, act 1 scene i, the first two choruses and Alcestis' aria.² His work was then interrupted by illness until March 1898.³ By this time, the University term was underway and the performance date was drawing near⁴, leaving him no time to complete a vocal score. On 25 March, he began work on the full score,⁵ resolving to fill the incomplete gaps with music from Harold, which was unknown in Melbourne. Working quickly, using only the original Greek, he attempted to fit the text of Alcestis to music from Harold.⁶ He wrote Chorus III as a transposed, abbreviated version of Chorus II.⁷ He was able to write Choruses IV and V almost entirely from Harold. But when he came to Choruses VI and VII, though he had considered music from Harold, he abandoned his plans. Chorus VI preserves only a few details of Harold, while for Chorus VII he chose to rewrite the Alcestis overture. He finished the full score on 17 April 1898.⁸

¹The Argus, August 2nd, 1898.
²Ms. sketches for the vocal score, GM.
³Annual Report, #31, 1899, Melbourne Liedertafel, GM.
⁴The performance was first scheduled earlier than June, but was delayed when the soprano had a bicycle accident - Memoirs of Valentine Leeper, loc. cit.
⁵Date in composer's hand, Ms. full score, p. I, GM.
⁶see notes, Table 5
⁷vide Table 4.
⁸Date in composer's hand, Ms. score, foot of final page, GM.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>TABLE 5</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>ALCESTIS - ADAPTATIONS FROM 'HAROLD'</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chorus IV - song of joyful anticipation of Heracles arrival at the palace</th>
<th>Act 1 scene ii - introduction and coda to arrival of Bishop Odo at Godwins' house to claim hostages. Tense, cool.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Alcestis</strong></td>
<td><strong>Harold</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chorus V - funeral procession, bearing body of Alcestis</td>
<td>Act 4 scene i - Battlefield of Senlac, searching for body of Harold.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chorus VI - tribute to the dead Alcestis sombre, resolute, imbued with a sense of Fate.</td>
<td>Act 3 scene ii - Hilda's speech to Edith about the absent Harold, sombre but optimistic.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>extent of adaptation</strong></td>
<td>Preserved in its entirety, with minor details changed. Instrumental melody given to choir.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Transposed down a minor 3rd. The older music was for soloists, and this lower pitch is better for chorus.</td>
<td>1. Substantially new material for the main sections.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Used older material as A section in an ABA scheme.</td>
<td>2. Some details of the orchestral interludes preserved: crescendo effects, downward rushing minor scales, dotted rhythm figures.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Extensive changes to melodic line.</td>
<td>Rewrote the Alcestis overture.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

1. Lines 569-579, 604-605 of Euripides *Alcestis* (chorus IV) are pencilled in at this point, p. 166, p. 179 of *Harold*, Ms. vocal score.
2. Lines 741-746 of Euripides *Alcestis* (chorus V) pencilled in at this point, pp. 249-250 in *Harold*, Ms. vocal score.
Marshall-Ball's decision not to go ahead with adaptations for Chorus VI and VII reflects his special theories of emotion and meaning in music. Chorus VI required a sombre, resolute tone, imbued with a sense of Fate, while the Harold music he had considered for it, though similarly sombre, must have seemed philosophically irreconcilable. Even in Chorus IV, the difference between the mood of hope in the text and the tense coolness of the Harold music from which he borrowed caused him to make extensive changes in the melodic line. For Chorus VII he was not prepared to compromise any further, and chose to rewrite the Alcestis overture. He was clearly concerned that the emotions of the music should be appropriate.

Against this reconstruction of the composer's creative process must be held his claim, in the 1899 lectures, that in composing Alcestis he had first imbued himself with the text:

...then unconsciously the emotions translated themselves into music...I have never found it possible to complete anything by thinking it over and patching it up.¹

While the foregoing account of his composition would indicate a deep concern with the emotional connotation of his music, it must qualify this latter claim that he composed spontaneously.

Alcestis was originally scheduled for a week-long run in the Melbourne Town Hall, but was postponed following the indisposition of the soprano, Florence Towl, a student of Trinity College, in a bicycle accident.² It was eventually performed for one night only, on 22nd June 1898. The audience was enthusiastic, and the music was judged 'a striking success... of no mere provincial quality...'.³, though Leeper was unhappy

¹ The essentials of art', III, op. cit., p. 12.
² Memoirs of Valentine. Leeper, loc. cit.
³ Tucker, loc. cit.
with some aspects of the production. Marshall-Hall repeated the production without costumes or scenery at the Liedertafel concert on August 1st, and gave the Death Scene at the Conservatorium's 'Scenes from Opera' on 20th December. A visiting German scholar, Dr. Poeschel, was impressed with the piece, and subsequently had it performed by the Fürsten und Landes-Schule, Meissen, 'Saxony, in their Stadt-theater in 1913. The Crown Prince of Saxony attended, and the press praised the work for its choruses.

Alcestis is conceived on a less ambitious scale than Harold, and in its simpler thematic scheme represents a retreat from the composer's formerly slavish imitation of Wagner. Its carefully-conceived tonal structure and striking all-male double choruses make it a fine work, and the first of the composer's operas to be of more than academic interest. Its melodramatic conception makes it an interesting experiment in revival of the spirit of the ancient stage, as seen through the richly-coloured glasses of XIXth-century Romanticism.

A flourish of creative activity followed the successful performance of Alcestis. Marshall-Hall completed the Choral Ode from the Helena of Goethe, for chorus and orchestra, in 1898, and Dramatic Fragment, another drama based on the Harold story, dealing with Sweyn's adulterous relationship

---

1Lionel Lindsay relates that, while painting the palace, 'Leeper, who was always poking his classical nose into our work' queried the source of Lindsay's design (he was improvising figures instead of imitating the Parthenon as had been decided). Lindsay hoodwinked Leeper into believing his designs were from recently discovered Sicilian coins. Lindsay, Comedy of Life... op. cit., p. 117.

2Programme, 256th Concert, Melbourne Liedertafel, GM.

3Programme, 1901 Prospectus, Melbourne Conservatorium, MC.


5Performed at the Melbourne Liedertafel, 23rd October, 1899, 263rd Concert Programme, GM.
with a nun Algive and the events leading to his trial by the Witan. He published his new drama, together with some more poems in the vein of *A Book of Canticles*, in 1898 under the title *Hymns Ancient and Modern*.1

In its synthesis of the theme of human passion with a licentious, light-hearted style, *Hymns Ancient and Modern* was no more successful than its predecessor. Of even less significance were a series of epigrams included in the collection, which poked fun at what the composer considered to be the church's hypocrisy2 and negativism3, society's mediocrity4, and the common man's 'Natural coarseness'.5 The whole collection was scurrilous and trite.

Respectable Melbourne society in the 1890s held views that made the public circulation of atheist or libertine opinions most unwise for a public figure in Marshall-Hall's position. Even his admirers were surprised at his lack of discretion in

---


2 *Ibid.*, 'King David', p. 48: O David was a worthy king/Merrily he could harp and sing/He became the father of his nation,/ by dint of prayer and fornication/He loved his lass and he loved his art,/ and he was a man after God's own heart.' This was, according to the composer 'a summary in plain English of a hypocritical sermon'. *vide* 'To the Chancellor and Council of the University of Melbourne', *op. cit.*, p. 7.

3 *Ibid.*, p. 47 'Jew gods': 'Hideous scarecrows that flop in the wind/Are your Jew-gods to frighten the weak and the blind...'. This was intended to highlight the difference between the 'negative' approach to life of the Judeo-Christian faith and the 'positive' approach of the ancient Greeks, according to the composer - *vide* 'To the Chancellor....' *op. cit.*, p. 7.

4 *Ibid.*, 'Teetotalism'. Teetotalers, according to the composer were too ready to damn others when they themselves were damned.

5 *Ibid.*, 'Democracy' Though the common man is now educated, his natural coarseness remained, according to the composer.
publishing this collection.¹ But no-one could have anticipated the ferocity of Melbourne's reaction. The Argus reviewed the book under the heading 'A Public Scandal'. Their reviewer, veiled in anonymity, intoned:

Any father might be led to give a child a work which, with a knowledge of its contents he would certainly keep outside the family circle...The book is certainly unfit for general and family circulation for which its title seems to bid, and we discharge a public duty when we give citizens this warning...²

The article urged the University Council to 'say whether this same man should write and publish these verses, and should lecture to the young - especially the young women of Victoria,' In the following days, the paper published numerous letters of support from readers.³

Pressure was put on Wrixon, Vice Chancellor of the University and, though only 38 copies of the book had been sold, the public rumpus was such that a special meeting of the University Council was called, for which Marshall-Hall prepared his defence in a printed pamphlet.⁴ The Council, trying to maintain a respected image in the eyes of the government and prospective benefactors in the community after the Depression cutbacks, took a serious view of the issue. Apart from the poems, Marshall-Hall had offended wide sections of the community with his speech in honour of Prince Bismark at the Liedertafel performance of Alcestis, when the papers were full of anti-German sentiment over the war in Pretoria.⁵ In the protracted

¹Thomas Brentnell, My memories: being the reminiscences of a nonagenarian, Melbourne: 1938, p. 126- account of how he came by a copy of the book.
²The Argus, August 5th, 1898, p. 5.
³The Argus, August 6th, 8th, 10th 1898.
⁴'To the Chancellor and Council of the University of Melbourne', op. cit.
⁵The Argus, August 3rd 1898, editorial, p. 4.
deliberations that followed, Marshall-Hall offered to take leave until the end of his five year term and then resign. ¹ The Council accepted this offer, more or less on the condition that he took his leave abroad. This was unacceptable to Marshall-Hall, who intended to stay in Melbourne and obliterate the 'false and baneful slur' on his reputation, and he withdrew his resignation. ² Finally, on October 24th 1898, the Council resolved that when his term ended in 1900 he would not be reappointed, for he had 'endangered the future of the Conservatorium' with his 'libidinous' verse and his anti-religious beliefs had 'infringed the University's policy of neutrality in religious matters.' ³

In his remaining two years at the University, Marshall-Hall set about vindicating his reputation. He performed more of his music, Choral Ode at the Liedertafel and a scene from Dido at the orchestral concerts in 1899. ⁴ A subscription list was drawn up to put his concerts on a permanent basis. ⁵ Long after, arranged for orchestra, was scheduled for performance in 1900; An Grabe Anselmos, An Australian National Song, and La belle dame sans merci also date from this period. He wrote and published Aristodemus, a stern morality set in ancient Sparta, ⁶ using the dramatic style that had proved so successful in Alcestis. He was concerned that the public would see him capable of moral and edifying art.

But he did not abandon some of the more controversial postures adopted in his poems. To return to his 1899 lectures, there are passages which attempt a rational justification of his beliefs. Those theories which seem modified by the poetry scandal may be summarised as below, Abstract II. Notions of

---

¹ Letter; Marshall-Hall to Chancellor, July 1898, CR.
² Letter, Marshall-Hall to Chancellor, October 1898, CR.
³ The Argus, October 25th editorial.
⁴ Reviews: The Argus, October 12, 24th 1899.
⁵ 261st Melbourne Liedertafel Concert Programme, 19 June 1899.
ABSTRACT II

MARSHALL-HALL'S VIEWS ON MUSICAL CRITICISM AND CREATIVITY MODIFIED AFTER 1898

1. Only fully developed artists are reliable critics of art.  
2. Music expresses not the good (for concepts of good change) but the heroic, (which is unchanging).
3. Sexual intercourse is the most profound form of beauty, though the expression of it is regarded as vulgar.
4. Creation is bound up with contemplation.
5. Form, that is instinct, is possible without conscious effort if the creator is fully developed.

---

1'It follows from our view of aesthetics that the fully developed musician alone is competent to form a reliable judgement as to the real value of musical works'. ibid., II, p. 47. 'Every creative artist must remember that newspaper criticism is merely an expression of opinion on the part of one who can effect nothing positive; who is therefore worthless... Only does criticism become scientific and useful when it is exercised by the creative artist himself, for a definite purpose', ibid., VII, pp. 113-114.

2'Great energy expends itself in many directions, not only those we deem right and proper and best for humanity. The ever changing conditions of climate...of civilization change our notions of good and evil. But the heroic remains fundamentally the same in all ages...' ibid., II, p. 42-43.

3'Of all forms, the form which awakens this supreme happiness most clearly, most powerfully, most ecstatically, most generally, is the relations between man and woman - Love...the mutual caresses of lovers are the physical expression of the deepest intellectual truth'. Preface, Hymns Ancient and Modern (Melbourne, 1898) 'The vulgar is all that excludes us from such considerations of truth...' ibid., VII, p. 111.

4'The creative Artist is one who possesses this subjective or objective faculty of pure contemplation...in the clearest, most significant and unmistakable manner.' ibid., I, p. 26. 'The distinctive faculty of the artist is to perceive the permanent qualities in fleeting phenomena...it very often happens that the rudest and most common object will present some feature which his imagination at once seizes on and expands...' ibid., VIII, p. 114.

5'Structural form in a musical work is the logical sequence of emotions...a fully developed musician...attains such ripeness that without further care he can deliver himself over entirely to his poetic thought and when he comes to analyse the resultant composition, he will find that his themes have developed themselves without conscious aid...' ibid., III, p. 13. 'Form is to Art what instinct is to life...Form and emotion are present in the same way, generally in inverse ratio...', ibid., VIII, p. 161.
good and evil change, he proposed, and physical love is the
most profound form of beauty. He abandoned his former theory
that criticism of an art work was a matter for ordinary individuals:
only the creative artist himself could form useful critical
judgements. While his modified view of criticism was:
consistent than that of his London days, his view of the
portrayal of physical love was a misapprehension. Marshall-Hall
had always been swept away by the frank portrayal of extremes of
human emotion, as his London article on the agony of Amfortas in
Parsifal revealed.¹ It was this weakness that led him to write
bloodied final scenes for his first two operas: Dido falls on
Aeneas' sword and the wound 'gurgling in her breast' as Vergil
puts it; while Edith falls on the dead body of Harold, which is
so mangled as to be unrecognisable. It was the same weakness
that led him to write peurile passages about human love in his
poetry. He could not see that the impact of physical frankness
depended on shock, and shock value tends to pale with time.
Marshall-Hall's belief in the profundity of extreme human
emotion remained a fundamental flaw in his theory and practice.

He had given in a little to criticism of his theory of
creativity. Though he still claimed for the artist a special
temperament, the act of creation was less mysterious than he
had proposed in 'The Artist'; it was simply a matter of
contemplation - a position approaching Hanslick's. He still
held firm to his view of form as instinctive, though he was
at pains to explain how complex form could be produced without
the involvement of the intellect.

By 1900, public opinion about Marshall-Hall's behaviour
had changed, and many felt the University Council had acted
too severely in resolving on dismissal.² The Council referred
the whole matter to the Conservatorium Sub-Committee, which

¹vide Chaper II, Abstract 5, p. 64.
²The Argus, June 5, 1900.
procured from the professor a statement undertaking to fall into line with University policy if he was retained. It seemed the whole business would be dropped.

But from amongst the ranks of *The Argus'* anonymous attackers of 1898, one of the most powerful emerged and led an open campaign to prevent Marshall-Hall's reinstatement. Alexander Leeper, Warden of Trinity College and producer of *Alcestis*, collected letters of protest from 67 headmistresses of girls' schools, organised resolutions of protest from the Councils of all the leading private schools in Melbourne, and asked the University Council to meet a deputation of heads of schools which he would lead.²

Leeper's zealous campaign had its origins in a piece of gossip he had heard, to the effect that Marshall-Hall had once told a female violin student that before she could play the Kreutzer sonata of Beethoven with any feeling she would have to break the seventh commandment.³ An inflated version of what was actually said,⁴ this story nevertheless inflamed Leeper beyond forgiveness. He had fixed ideas about the nature of the education suitable for women, and to carry out his scheme he had admitted women to residence in Trinity College long before other colleges had considered it.⁵ The Kreutzer episode made Marshall-Hall, in Leeper's eyes, unfit to teach in a Faculty which was largely female. Furthermore, Marshall-Hall lived with a woman to whom he was not married and by whom he was having an illegitimate family.

Leeper's efforts were countered by petitions from Marshall-Hall's past pupils, parents of his present pupils, his staff, businessmen and musicians and the Professorial Board.⁶ His

---

¹Statement by Marshall-Hall, 6th June 1900, CR.
²*The Argus*, 18th June, 1900.
³Valentine Leeper, *loc. cit.*
⁵Leeper, *loc. cit.*
⁶Preserved in Council Papers, June 1900, CR.
artist friends sent a petition too, while Lionel Lindsay, George Douglas, and Castieau wrote and published a burlesque on the scandal, and Norman Lindsay drew a cartoon 'The New Patroclus' for Alma Mater, the University Journal, (see Plate facing p.142 ). In this cartoon, Marshall-Hall lies wounded, protected by Conscience and Dignity from Insolence and Vial Perversion (The Argus) with Leeper caricatured amongst the attackers. Which way a Council member would vote became an issue in the 1900 Council election, and pamphlets were circulated for or against a candidate according to his views on Marshall-Hall. In one pamphlet, J.Redford Corr laid down specific passages from the poems, as 'material on which to form an opinion of the Professor's standards of good taste and morality'.

As the Council heard Leeper's deputation, on 18th June, a large body of undergraduates occupied the room next door and eventually broke into the meeting, chanting 'Three cheers for Marshall-Hall, three groans for Leeper' - perhaps the first student disruption of a Council meeting at the University.

But the motion to reinstate Marshall-Hall was defeated, and a new committee in London was appointed to select a replacement. Marshall-Hall applied to the committee, but his name was struck from the list secretly, and Franklin Peterson, an English organist, was appointed. When it was discovered that Marshall-Hall had not been considered, some Council

---

1 Ibid.
2 Published in Outpost, vide Lindsay, Comedy of Life... op. cit., p. 117.
4 Pamphlets for and against Rev.F.H.Sugden, Master of Queens College and known Marshall-Hall supporter, are in the Hince Collection, NL.
5 J.Redford Corr Extracts from the published works of Professor Marshall-Hall Melbourne,1900 p.1
6 The Argus 19th June 1900
7 The Argus 26th June 1900
8 Confidential memo, Sir Andrew Clarke to Council, 1900, CR
9 Council Minutes,10th December 1900, CR
members and sections of the public were appalled, but it was too late.  

Perhaps the most remarkable petition of the 1900 campaign was that from the Professorial Board, signed by every member save those on leave, supporting Marshall-Hall on the grounds of his right to free speech and the illegality of a test of religious beliefs under the University Act.  

The Council, structured as it was half of clergy, politicians, and other outsiders, chose to ignore this petition, along with others supporting Marshall-Hall. The Marshall-Hall case showed that University Councils with this make-up can, in times of crisis, take action to which a unanimous Professorial Board is opposed, and which reflect the wishes of transitional public opinion more than principles for which a secular University should undoubtedly stand firm. Councils of Australian Universities have changed little since 1900 - the University of Melbourne Council for 1978 had only 6 academic members, while 17 of its other 33 members were appointed by the Governor of Victoria-in-Council or co-opted by the University Council itself.  

The implications of such a structure remain serious.  

1 Letter, Stanford to Sommervell, 6th November 1900, CR  
2 June 1900, preserved in Council papers, CR.  
3 Calendar University of Melbourne, 1978, pp. 34-35
CHAPTER IV

1901 - 1911

For a time, Marshall-Hall's dismissal from the University had little effect on his activities. The Conservatorium was not properly University property, having been financed independently from its inception, and the (ex) professor was able to continue as its Director. In 1901 he issued the annual prospectus with the name 'University Conservatorium' changed to 'Melbourne Conservatorium'\(^1\); the public lectures, the opera performances and the student concerts (numbered 35th - 38th) continued as before.\(^2\) Beyond the Conservatorium, the orchestral concerts and chamber music concerts showed no signs of abatement either.\(^3\) Marshall-Hall was still a leading figure in Melbourne, both as a teacher and conductor.

The University Council was faced with a dilemma. When the new professor of music, Franklin Peterson arrived, he was presented with all that could be lawfully claimed from the Conservatorium - chairs and music stands\(^4\) - and was given a room in the University Museum.\(^5\) Plans were made for an official University Conservatorium, but these took nine years to

\(^1\) Prospectus, Melbourne Conservatorium, 1901, MC.
\(^2\) Diary, Melbourne Conservatorium, 1901, MC. Entries for 21st February, 27th April. Programmes of the concerts are inserted or glued between the leaves.
\(^3\) Programmes, 1st Chamber Music Concert, 3rd September, 1901; 2nd Chamber Music Concert, 15th October 1901; 3rd Chamber Music Concert...MC and GM.
\(^4\) Diary, Melbourne Conservatorium, 1901, entry for 21st February notes that the University had taken their chairs and music stands, MC.
\(^5\) Ian Braid, The Growth of the University Conservatorium, 1938, typescript, University of Melbourne, GM.
realise.\textsuperscript{1} Peterson began giving student concerts in Wilson Hall (the first numbered '33rd'), and choral and orchestral concerts with Alberto Zelman Jnr. conducting.\textsuperscript{2} In his anxiety to establish some useful role for himself in the eyes of the community, he moved to set up an Australian organisation for music examinations, created in the image of the Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music, London, operating successfully in Australia at the time. The Associated Board's local representative, Thomas Brentnall, was indignant at Peterson's wholesale imitation of the English system, and eventually took his complaint to the press.\textsuperscript{3} Marshall-Hall saw little point in the scheme: 'I consider the modern craze for examinations ridiculous, and if this whole silly business were knocked on the head to-morrow it would not matter two straws.'\textsuperscript{4} Whatever its merits, the scheme appealed to the public and by 1911 was firmly entrenched in Melbourne.\textsuperscript{5} In 1918 it was established nationally as the Australian Music Examinations Board, and has survived ever since with only trifling changes.\textsuperscript{6}

Leeper, in his efforts to separate Marshall-Hall from the girls of the Conservatorium, had only succeeded in separating Marshall-Hall, the girls, and the Conservatorium from the University. But 1901 brought a much more serious matter to the University's attention: an outrageous embezzlement was discovered in the University accounts. The amount involved was of staggering

\textsuperscript{1}Fraid, op.cit.\textsuperscript{2}Programme, 33rd Students' Orchestral Concert, Wilson Hall, May 14th 1901, NL; Programmes, Melbourne Orchestral and Choral Concerts, 1905, NL.

\textsuperscript{3}Thomas Brentnall My Memories, being the reminiscences of a nonagenarian Melbourne, 1938 p.229.

\textsuperscript{4}H.A.S. 'Music under the Southern Cross' in Westminster Gazette 10th February 1907.

\textsuperscript{5}Various newspaper cuttings from 1911 are in the Melbourne University Conservatorium Album, NL.

proportions, against which the problems of musical professors paled into insignificance. Only The Argus sustained its attentions to Marshall-Hall, presenting him as a figure of fun. In 1902, when Nellie Melba, now a famous diva, visited the students of the Marshall-Hall Conservatorium, The Argus contrasted the reception she received with the sober welcome accorded her at the University by Peterson:

The ex-professor exhausted Lempiere's Classical Dictionary, Roget's Thesaurus and Hymns Ancient and Modern to find apostrophe and metaphor to hurl at his wondering guest.

The building had been decorated in her honour, and she had been presented with a decorative scroll containing Marshall-Hall's words of welcome together with signatures of the staff and students. Melba was evidently impressed, and treasured the gift.

In 1902, May Marshall-Hall died in England, and the composer immediately married Catherine Hore. Catherine had long been upset by insults from local people who disapproved of their household and illegitimate offspring; and the death of their son Herrick in infancy was probably not unrelated to the traumas of the University controversy.

---

1 Geoffrey Blainey, A centenary history of the University of Melbourne Melbourne, 1957 p.118 An employee of the University accounts, F.J. Dickson, had made off with 23,839 pounds, more than 24 times the size of the annual professorial stipend.

2 The Argus 2nd October 1902

3 A.C. Murphy, Melba: a biography London, 1901 p.198ff, includes a reproduction of the scroll and an account of the address of welcome.

4 I am indebted to Joe Rich for clarifying this point for me from his unpublished research.
In the same year, 1902, Marshall-Hall completed a musical setting for Aristodemus, having published the drama ca. 1900.¹ The libretto is based on the Messenian king of that name who ruled from 731-724 B.C. During his reign, Aristodemus led a conquest against Sparta with some success, and turned the Spartan women to prostitution. When he found his own daughter pregnant before her marriage however, he was incensed beyond reason, and murdered her. After her death he was haunted continually in his sleep by visions of her long hair, and was finally driven to suicide. After his death the war with Sparta continued for some years with much bloodshed on both sides.² The story had never attracted much attention among opera composers, the only existing settings being by four little known Italian composers.³ Marshall-Hall introduced a number of fictitious elements into his version, and these may be summarised as below, Table 1.

¹ The Argus, 2nd October 1902, quoted in Braid, loc. cit.
² Supra, Chapter III, p. 130.
⁴ John Towers, Dictionary catalogue of operas and operettas. London: 1910, lists G.F. Sances who wrote a work entitled Aristomenes Messinia and D. Capranica, S. Favesi and V. Pucitta, who wrote operas entitled Aristodemo. All four settings were performed more than 50 years before Marshall-Hall's birth, part I, Vol. 1, p. 59.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Historical Source</th>
<th>Marshall-Hall</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>The historical source</strong>&lt;sup&gt;1&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td><strong>Marshall-Hall</strong>&lt;sup&gt;2&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aristodemus conquers Sparta and puts the women to prostitution for his soldiers.</td>
<td>Prior to the drama</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aristodemus discovers Taira is not a virgin and murders her.</td>
<td>An episode introduced in which the goddess Artemis, incensed by the treatment of the Spartan maids, decrees that Aristodemus and all his house will slay themselves.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aristodemus is haunted by his dead daughter's hair, and suicides.</td>
<td>An episode introduced in which the tide has turned against Aristodemus' army and he learns that Artemis might be appeased by a sacrifice of a Messenian virgin.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The war continues after the king's death.</td>
<td>An episode is introduced in which the chosen virgin turns out to be a foster child, not of pure blood; and Taira, daughter of Aristodemus offers to take her place.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<sup>1</sup>Taken from Lempiere, *op. cit.*, the most authoritative source of Marshall-Hall's time, and a probable source of his knowledge of the story.

From this table, it can be seen that Marshall-Hall's story was largely his own. The god Artemis intervenes to determine a revenge for Aristodemus' treatment of the Spartan women; and each death in the drama becomes part of the inevitable fulfilment of her decree. In the final scene, as the victorious Spartans burst into the palace, they find the bodies of Aristodemus, his Queen, and daughter, lying symbolically before the statue of Artemis. The story becomes bluntly moralistic: 'guilt', asserts the dedication, 'revenge[s] itself in the world'.

Marshall-Hall's adaptations in Aristodemus may be said to demonstrate his desire to prove himself capable of edifying art after the scandal over his poems. Like Dido and Harold, the drama ends in a pool of blood and horror; but here the horror has a moral purpose, while in the earlier operas it seems an affectation, employed because he believed the expression of extremes of human emotion to be great art. He added an extra death to the story, that of the Queen, and made Taira's death particularly revolting to drive his message home. Aristodemus was not entirely free of sensual connotations, set as it was around the violation of Spartan virgins by drunken soldiers, and the extra-marital activities of a Messenian princess. But it was edifying enough.

It is clear that Marshall-Hall conceived his drama in imitation of the formula that had proved successful in Alcestis: an alternation of monologues, stylised dialogue, and choric movements. But he did not begin to make a musical setting and evidently did not think of the piece in terms of a libretto till after its publication ca. 1900\(^2\). Excerpts from the vocal score were already in performance in 1901, which would suggest a fairly rapid period of composition.

\(^1\) 'Alle Schuld rächt sich auf Erden - Goethe' appears on the title page, published drama, \textit{op. cit.}

\(^2\) vide the sketches of accentual rhythm for the choruses in the sketch libretto, which is a proof-copy of the published drama
In describing Marshall-Hall's arrangement of a libretto from his published drama, we are fortunate in having the proof-copy from which he worked while writing the opera. Some pages are obliterated by cuttings pasted in, for the composer later used the copy as a scrapbook in which to make his rough draft for an opera on Shakespeare's The Tempest. But elsewhere, alterations, divisions, and musical sketches appear, as follows:

TABLE 2
ARISTODEMUS - SUMMARY OF ALTERATIONS TO TEXT

1. Divisions. Scenic divisions are marked on p.5 (scene 1), 5 (2), 6 (3), 6 (4), 8 (5), 9 (6), 9 (7), 15 (11), 16 (12), 17 (13), 10 (8), 10 (9).

2. Sketches. p.17:

```
\[\text{Never till the day saw}\]
```

Accentual schemes ('--' etc.) are marked facing p.7
(first ten lines), 38 (2nd Chorus), 39 (both choruses), 40 (all choruses), 41 (chorus).

3. Alterations. p.7: 'Here in this island/we arrived; and here/ Have I thy schoolmaster,/made thee more profit/than other princess' can' replaces 'storm we/are stricken...reappear'; 27: 'Slaughter x' opposite 'Yea'; 27: 'noble spirits' replaces 'these'; 28: 'x-hor: nour' opposite 'There is that royalty'; 28: in square bracket; 28: 'gases' replaces 'shrieks' (last line, Chorus); 31: (As she turns) to 32: (With her eyes fixed on the invisible figure) omitted; 31: 'around' replaces 'about' replaces 'around'; 33: Corphæus replaces Guard; 39: figures '10, 8' by Aristodemus' speech; 41: Chorus omitted till 'O towers'; 41-2 'Woe's me, Ithome' omitted on each appearance; 45: Corphæus takes last three lines of Guard's speech; 47: Spartans' speech omitted; 47: 'At the head' - scene ix omitted.

---

1 NL JAF 111690:55 2 see p.203f 3 page numbers are recto pages in the NL copy; which corresponds in its interleaving to the GM copy.
The division of the published drama into scenes imitates Leeper's division of *The Alcestis* into scenes, though both works have only one stage setting. But whereas Leeper's divisions indicate changes of mood in *The Alcestis*, Marshall-Hall's in *Aristodcmus* do not; for the price of stern moralising was a uniformly bleak mood which envelopes the whole plot. The alterations of words and omission of sentences in the chorus lines are motivated by simple considerations of rhythm or design; the alterations of words in the spoken parts are second thoughts about the drama rather than arrangements for musical setting, for they are not exactly connected to the musical notation and thus have little relevance to the precise musical configuration.

From all points of view the libretto is dreadful, devoid of dramatic contrast and stilted rather than stylized in its prose. Perhaps the worst example of the obscurity of the text occurs when Damis reveals to Aristodemus that Taïra is not a virgin. This passage, so crucial to the action, brings forth an unfortunately near-comic line:

> Even now waxeth within her womb  
> A witness to our vows.¹  

The musical conception, as with the dramatic style, is designed in imitation of *Alcestis*: spoken dialogue is set against a background of continuous music, with choral interpolations. Here however, none of the characters sing, and the chief musical interest is in the choral pieces. The resulting structure is more distant from opera than *Alcestis*. Its eight expansive choral movements with melodramatic interludes make it a hybrid musical type, perhaps unique.

A comparison of the musical and dramatic structure, Table 3 below, indicates an attempt to introduce musically the shape the work lacked dramatically.

¹Ms. libretto, scene 15, GM.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Scene numbers in the published drama</th>
<th>Caeleuras and musical divisions in the score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Artemis, incensed at the outrages of Aristodemus' soldiers decrees death to all his house</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Introduction in F#</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hymn to Artemis - chorus I</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Prelude in f</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enter Aristodemus, fortified at Ithôme with the remains of his army</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>F# returns at end</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tisis the Oracle tells Aristodemus how to appease Artemis</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chorus II, recalling the birth of their ancestors, imploring Zeus for mercy</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>D cadence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Queen arrives and a lot for the sacrifice is conducted</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>(nil)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taira arrives</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>New theme (Group 5 in Table 3 below)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The sacrifice is prepared</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ophioneus, the Soothsayer stops the sacrifice and has a vision</td>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chorus III in disbelief of Ophioneus</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A guard arrives to confirm Ophioneus' report about the virgin chosen for sacrifice</td>
<td>11</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A messenger arrives to reveal that the virgin has fled</td>
<td>12</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taira offers to take the place of the virgin</td>
<td>13</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chorus IV farewell lament for Taira</td>
<td>14</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1 Marshall-Hall, *op. cit.*
2 Ms. Vocal score, composer's hand, GM.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Event</th>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Damis enters, revealing Taira is not a virgin</td>
<td>15</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chorus V: Agamemnon's Sacrifice</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>Coda, b cadence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A messenger tells of A Aristodemus murdering Taira</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>(nil)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ophioneus arrives and curses the house for the murder</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>Introduction returns in A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chorus VI then Aristodemus implores the statue of Artemis for a sign and the shield crashes to the ground</td>
<td>19</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chorus VII</td>
<td>20</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A messenger tells of the Queen's suicide</td>
<td>21</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A guard tells of the utter defeat of Aristodemus in battle</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>(nil)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aristodemus orders his people to flee and he suicides</td>
<td>23</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chorus VIII (finale) before Spartans storm the palace</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>Coda - 11 bars</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>25</td>
<td>f# cadence</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
From this table it can be seen that Marshall-Hall's score was divided into four parts by the interpolation of an interlude and a sharp key shift after scene I, by a cadence and caesura after scene 5, and by another cadence and caesura after scene 16. Only 22 of the original 25 scenic divisions appear in the Ms. score, scene 7 having been musically merged with scene 6, scene 19 with scene 18, and scene 24 with scene 23. Alterations and missing leaves at these three points in the Ms. score indicate that this merging was an afterthought rather than planned from the outset. The result of this scheme was to musically articulate four broad scenes within the drama, which correspond to the four main movements in the action: scene I is the prologue; scene 2-5 is the exposition of the main relationship in the drama - that between Aristodemus' leadership of his people and Artemis' decree that undermines it, scene 6-16 is the development of the plot, leading to Taira's brutal murder, and scene 17-25 is the resolution of the drama in the inevitable destruction of Aristodemus.

Other than the articulation of the drama into four scenes, there is no other evidence of attempts to define or colour the meaning of the drama musically. There is no aria to define a musical highpoint, and there is no differentiation of scenes for interpretive purpose as there was in Alcestis. That the character of the drama is less affected by the music than the former work is a further reason for defining it as a hybrid of chorus and melodrama rather than as an opera.

As in Harold and Alcestis, the score lends itself to

---

1 There are two Ms. vocal scores, one in the composer's hand, vide Bibliography. Both scores have leaves cut out at scenes 6 and 20, and similar alterations at p. 47 in the original (p. 45 in the copy), indicating late revision. Other alterations in the original score in pencil are incorporated in ink in the copy, indicating earlier revision.
thematic analysis which relates specific themes to specific ideas in the libretto. Table 4 below summarises the motivic scheme of the work.\(^1\) There are eight shapes which are distinguishable as motifs, and which recur throughout the score. Five of these may be distinguished as the principal motivic ideas of the opera, the remaining three as secondary recurring motifs. Apart from this there are 36 shapes distinguishable as motifs in the work, which do not recur beyond the scene in which they first appear.

From Table 4 a number of general observations can be made about the relationship between the thematic and dramatic schemes in the opera. Motifs 1 (a-c), in their various guises, appear in most scenes of the opera. Motifs 2 (a-b) are present in most of the scenes in which Aristodemus has dialogue. These two thematic groups encompass the chief interplay of ideas in the libretto: Aristodemus' leadership of his people and his guilt over his war-crimes in Sparta. The presence of both themes together in the scenes where Aristodemus is involved indicates the constant presence of the guilt that undermines all his actions. Motif 5 appears with Taira's entrances and action. Like themes given to other Marshall-Hall heroines, Edith (group 2 (a), Harold Table 3, Chapter 2) and Alcestis (theme iii, Alcestis, Table 5, Chapter 3) it is a nervous, rising theme, perhaps abstractly associated with youth, love, or heroism. Its subordinate role in the score perhaps indicates the small role such human qualities have to play in this work. Motifs 3 and 4 have different musical shape, but it is difficult to distinguish between their dramatic connotations, which seem to collectively refer to the shadow of inevitable vengeance that Artemis has cast over the palace. Of the themes that recur less often, motif 6 seems also to join motifs 3 and 4 in referring to Artemis in various ways, and 7 and 8 recurs so infrequently that its connotation is unclear.

\(^1\)Page numbers in Table 4 refer to the original Ms. vocal score. The pagination in the Ms. copy differs from this.
TABLE 4
ARISTODEMUS - RECURRING MOTIFS
(from autograph vocal score)

motif 1 (a)

motif 1 (b)

motif 1 (c)

motif-group 1: associated with Aristodemus' guilt

appearances: Artemis relates Aristodemus' crimes, p.1, 10-12 (a). (accompaniment varied); Chorus I relates how the kingdom has been overrun at Artemis' will, p.14-15 (a); Tisus tells Aristodemus of Artemis' wishes p.58 (a), 59 (a, transposed, varied), 61 (transposed); Chorus II implores Zeus for mercy, p.62 (b, original form), 69, 70, 87 (b, varied); the sacrifice, p.117 (b, varied); Ophionus stops the sacrifice with his ill omen, p.122 (b, varied, transposed); the Queen expresses her unhappiness, p.125, (b, transformation of m.1); Death of Taira, p.220 (a, transposed, complete restatement); the sign from Artemis' statue, p.254 (a, varied, transposed); the bodies lie before the statue, p.296-97 (a, transposition, variations of m.1-3).
motif 2 (a)

motif 2 (b)

motif-group 2: associated with Aristodemus as King

appearances: at the mention of Aristodemus, p. 3 (a); entry of Aristodemus, p. 52 (a, transposed); Aristodemus' reply to Tius, p. 60 (a, transposed); Aristodemus orders the sacrifice, p. 118 (a, transposed); Aristodemus' reply to the guard, p. 137 (a, transposed); Aristodemus comes forward, p. 133 (b); Aristodemus orders his people to flee, p. 282 (a, transposed), 284 (a, transposed).

motif 3 (a)

motif 3 (b)

motif-group 3: associated with Artemis (1)

appearances: Chorus I, Hymn to Artemis, p. 27 (a), 32 (a, transposed), 33 (a, extended), 34 (a, original form); Tius tells of Artemis' anger, p. 55 (b), 60 (b, transposed).
motif 4: associated with Artemis (2)

appearance: scene 4, p. 54

motif 5: associated with Taira

appearances: Taira arrives and speaks, p. 106, 110-11 (variation of m. 2); Taira offers her comments, p. 136 (original form), 133-39 (augmented variation of m. 2); Taira offers to be sacrificed, p. 145 (transposed); Aristodemus responds to the curse for Taira's murder, p. 236-37 (transposed).

motif 6: associated with Artemis (3)

appearances: Artemis speaks, p. 5-6; Chorus V, p. 182 (transposed, augmented), 216; Artemis statue is revealed, p. 286 (harmonically altered).
Allegro moderato

motif 7: association unclear
appearances: Artemis departs, p. 9; Queen speaks, p. 108 (transposed).

motif 8: associated with imminent tragedy
appearances: end of Artemis' speech, p. 9; Chorus VII, p. 263 (varied in detail), 268 (varied in detail).
The motivic scheme may therefore be said to underline, by interplay of the principle thematic ideas, the interplay of the two principle ideas of the drama, namely, Aristodemus' guilt and how it undermines his regime. The lack of clear contrast in the associations of the other recurring themes with ideas in the drama reflects the lack of real contrast in the drama itself; the composer tried in vain to find musical-dramatic contrast in a uniformly grey text. The large number of non-recurring themes, as in the earlier operas, may indicate that the composer intended but did not succeed in conveying other specific associations.

In any work where chromaticism is used as freely as Marshall-Hall does, it is difficult to discover a tonal logic. The rewards for studying the way in which Wagner, Schumann or Liszt achieve a new sonority through suspensions, anticipations or contractions of an underlying diatonic prolongation, are very great. Close study of a succession in Marshall-Hall is invariably frustrating, pointing usually to a conclusion that he simply did not understand the process of voice-leading, that his chromatic successions are aimless and arbitrary. In Aristodemus however, there are some features which suggest a greater attention to tonal design on the large scale than is normally evident in the composer's work, though his immediate successions do not bear close examination. The Introduction has a structure I...IIIb...I, where the tonic is F♭. There is frequent mixture of major and minor, from the opening measures (m.1-6). The work ends in F♭, and if this is considered the tonic of the whole work, it may be said that the dénouement, the death of Taira, is in IIIb. In this way the overall tonal structure of the work marks out on a large scale what has been foreshadowed in the Introduction on a small scale. The choruses, apart from nos.III and VI, form complete harmonic movements, while all the other scenes form progressive harmonic movements.
It may therefore be said that *Aristodemus* exhibits less of the tonal arbitrariness of *Dido* and *Harold*, and a more scientific construction than *Alceste*. It is interesting however, that in achieving some tonal logic, Marshall-Hall reached, not the compelling *continuum* of Wagner, with large scale *bar* and *stollen* designs imperceptibly present, but a succession of closed harmonic movements (the choruses) separated by transitions (the dialogue scenes), which looks back to the traditional 'numbers' (recitative-aria) structure of earlier opera.

The manipulation of spoken text is more sophisticated than in *Alceste*. In scene 18 the spoken voice is interweaved with the chanting chorus (double SATB) producing some interesting textural effects. Overall, the orchestral scoring is much more lightfooted and imaginative than any of his previous scores, apart from the scrubbing string accompaniment of scene 16. Though he lacked any formal training, his extensive experience in orchestral conducting in Melbourne seems to have sharpened his ear for orchestration.

*Aristodemus* is a rare hybrid of melodrama and choral music, and an illustration of Marshall-Hall's dramatic abilities misapplied. He had achieved a maturity of style, evident in the freely applied recurring themes, the logical tonal design and the new feeling for orchestral weight and contrast. But he employed his talent in the service of a miserable drama, bluntly moralistic and uniformly grey in mood. If Tovey was right in saying that 'histrionic suggestiveness of word and music will carry almost any nonsense over the footlights', then Marshall-Hall's work is a failure, for though he articulates the lifeless text musically into four scenes, and highlights the interplay of the two principal ideas thematically, there

---

is insufficient contrast, and the work remains bleak.

An examination of the extant sources indicates that the composer hoped for an ad hoc performance of the work with two pianos after he had finished the vocal score, which was in 1901. 1 His hopes were not realised, though he managed to have Chorus II performed at the Liedertafel Concert on 29th July 1901. 2 The full score was finished in 1902 3, but though he prepared a German translation 4, he was unable to have the drama performed. Aristodemus was not Marshall-Hall's last attempt at melodrama. But when Leeper required incidental music for his production of The Wasps of Aristophanes for the jubilee of the University of Melbourne in 1906, it was provided by Messrs. C.M. and I.M. Haydon of Ormond College, and not Marshall-Hall. 5

In 1903, Marshall-Hall's orchestral concerts were placed under a committee of management, after a public appeal for guarantors. 6 Following the death of Ernest Moffitt, Secretary of the orchestra, in 1899, management of the concerts had been largely in the composer's own hands, a burden that must have been intolerable. 6 The new management, under James Barrett, established fixed rates for all the players, placed Marshall-Hall on a stipend, and recouped losses from private sources. 7

Barrett, 1862-1945, leading Collins Street physician.

1 Scene 16 is scored for piano duo in the Ms. vocal score, and this would explain the existence of a second Ms. vocal score. Performances of operas with two pianos was common in amateur societies where other means were not available. The pencil alterations in the Ms. vocal score, incorporated in ink in the Ms. full score indicate their completion before 1902.

2 Programme 271st Concert, Melbourne, Liedertafel, 29th July, 1901, GM.

3 Ms. full score is dated 11th August 1902 on final page, vide Appendix II

4 Ms. libretto in translation, composer's hand; the German text is pencilled into the Ms. vocal score. vide Appendix II

5 Programme, Jubilee of the University of Melbourne, 25th April 1906, NL.

6 500 a Year Wanted', The Herald, March 1, 1903.

7 'Retrospective', Programme, 100th Orchestral Concert, 6th August 1910, GM.
lecturer; on physiology and later Chancellor of the University, had a high opinion of Marshall-Hall, and became in the following years his most dedicated supporter. Aside from managing the orchestra, he strove to turn the professor's other schemes and personal aspirations into realities: in 1906 he mounted a scheme for an Australian Grand Opera Company, to bring out from Europe more significant fare than the operettas offered by the commercial managements; in 1908 he paved the way for a permanent orchestra with the establishment of the Lady Northcote Permanent Orchestra Trust Fund; while in 1910 he mounted the chamber music series on more formal lines.

The formalisation of the orchestral management under Barrett ultimately led to the alienation of the players from the spirit of the enterprise, which in turn brought union trouble. But for the first four years it brought a certain amount of stability and security. Marshall-Hall was able to devote his full attention to the quality of the concerts, and to insist on adequate rehearsals, often held over three days for a single concert with additional sectional practise sessions. Notices of rehearsals for a performance of Beethoven's Choral Symphony in 1905, eventually abandoned, show the thoroughness of the preparation. The choir practised regularly for over four months. He maintained a solid repertoire of standard works, and was able to add new scores of Dvorak, Elgar and MacCunn, as well as local works of Siede, Hattenbach, or of his own. The reputation of the series grew, and eminent visitors paid him compliments; J.F. Runciman with an article in the London Saturday Revue in 1905 and A.E.J. Lee with a gift of 1,000

---

1 Prospectus, Australian Grand Opera Company Ltd., 3th May, 1906, GM.
2 'Retrospective', loc. cit.
3 Ibid.
4 Rehearsal schedule, undated, GM, listing sectional rehearsals for one concert to be held over 5 days and full orchestra rehearsals over another 3.
5 Dr. Hugh L. Murray's papers and directory of singers, 1905, in Hince Collection, NL.
6 'Repertoire' 100th Orchestral Concert Programme, loc. cit.
7 Saturday Revue 8th July 1905.
pounds in 1908.¹

Barrett's relationship with Marshall-Hall went beyond his role as a manager and supporter. He became a confidant and trusted ally for the composer, replacing the thinning circle of artistic friends. Streeton had left Australia in 1897, Norman and Lionel Lindsay settled in Sydney in 1900,² E. Phillips Fox was abroad from 1901-08,³ Roberts was abroad from 1903⁴, Moffitt, was dead. The eccentric, visionary composer faced these years - and middle age - with a sober companion. He still sang Schubert lieder after supper,⁵ went on trips to the sea or the bush, and kept late hours, but his company on those occasions was more often his students than his contemporaries now.⁶

Not surprisingly, a series of orchestral works date from this period, first performed at the orchestral concerts flowering under Barrett's management. The Eb Symphony, was completed in 1903,⁷ performed in 1904 and again in 1908,⁷ and its publication in a four-hand piano arrangement was undertaken by Breitkopf und Härtel.⁸ Long after, in its

²Geoffrey Serle, From Deserts the prophets come...Melbourne: 1973, p. 93.
³Len Fox, E. Phillips Fox: notes and recollections, N.S.W. 1962, p. 4.
⁴Serle, op. cit., p. 91.
⁵Letter, Franz Dierich to Mrs. H. Brooks concerning his encounters with Marshall-Hall socially, 10th October 1936, GM.
⁷Reviewed in The Age 30th May 1904; Programme in GM from a second performance, July 10, 1908.; autograph dated 1903.
⁸Eb Symphony for piano duet London: Breitkopf und Härtel, 1905.
orchestral arrangement, performed in 1900, was repeated in 1906, Phantasy for horn and orchestra, dedicated to Hermann Kühr, was performed in the same year. The Deux Fantaisies, dedicated to Eduard Scharf, piano teacher at his Conservatorium, was published in 1907; the Caprice for violin and orchestra, dedicated to newly arrived violinist Maurice le Plat, was performed in 1910; the Quartet for horn, violin, viola, and piano in 1909; the String Quartet in F was completed in the same period; and a String Quartet in D in 1911. Meanwhile, Bianca Capello, a drama set in XVith century Florence and dealing characteristically with the heroic suffering of a woman in love, was published in 1906, but a musical setting was evidently not attempted.

Abstract instrumental music of the sort produced in these years was somewhat alien to the composer's aesthetic theories, in view of his old belief that music was a specific language of emotion and that tone poem was therefore the highest form of independent instrumental composition. He found it necessary to construct theoretical justifications for this flourish of instrumental writing, and these he expressed in his programme notes and articles. These theories may be summarised as below, Abstract 12:

---

1 Reviewed in The Argus 27th August 1906 and 21st May 1906 respectively; Programmes in GM.

2 Programmes, Chamber Concert 1st October 1909; 96th Orchestral Concert, 9th April 1910; and Extra Chamber Concert, 7th July 1911 respectively. All in MC. See Appendix II.


4 'The form of a symphony' in two parts: - I: 104th Orchestral Concert Programme, 3rd June 1911; II: 105th Orchestral Concert Programme, 24th June 1911; 'The orchestra and its mystic voices' 106th Orchestral Concert Programme, 5th August 1911, all in MC. The last mentioned had previously appeared in The Argus.
ABSTRACT 12

MARSHALL-HALL'S VIEWS ON THE ELEMENTS OF MUSIC MODIFIED AFTER 1903

1. There are two elements in music — sensuous and poetic.  
2. The sensuous element consists of melody, harmony and rhythm, while form, its origin in feeling, is the poetic element.  
3. The orchestra is a family of modern symbols for the phenomena of life. The instruments are personalities in this symbolic world.  
4. Art aims to realise the logic and beauty of Nature, not Reason.

1. 'Now there are two elements in music, which save perhaps in the lowest forms of Art have always persisted, side by side, the sensuous or purely musical and the poetical. The first consists of those limitless combinations of melody and harmony from which the musician delights in building up sound patterns, lovely to the ear; the second in the selection and co-ordination of these tone patterns in such a way that the emotions they arouse form a mental experience running parallel to the sequence of emotions generated by life itself...' 'The Form of a Symphony'.

2. 'It has been my endeavour to show that the term abstract cannot properly be applied to music...on the contrary, just as Melody, Harmony and Rhythm, the sensuous elements of Music, have their origin in our physical nature, so also the forms which arise from the play of these elements, take their characteristics from those physical movements through which our feelings express themselves...' 'The Form of a Symphony' II.

3. 'The Greeks of old...associated with all earthly phenomena, organic and inorganic, spiritual symbols...This humanisation of Nature is perpetuated among us moderns in the orchestra...To the composer, the instruments which he employs are no mere technical means of producing sound; they are personalities, alive and sentient...They constitute a world which is the spiritual counterpart of the world in which he lives'. 'The Orchestra: Its Mystic Voices'.

4. 'The supreme advantage of art is that it enables us to realise within ourselves, as part of our sentient life, that satisfying beauty, that profound logic of Nature which the cold scrutinising eye of Reason ever faithfully dogs, but cannot assimilate'. The Form of a Symphony. II.
It can be seen from Abstract 12 that Marshall-Hall's solution to the problem of abstract music was to assert that no such music existed, for its elements originated in the same physical nature as human feelings. He wrote programme notes that sought specific emotional or extra-musical connotations in his instrumental works, and attempted to construct a table of specific meanings for each of the instruments of the orchestra: the percussion symbolised caves and grottos, the brass symbolised dwarfs, gnomes and pre-human beings, the woodwind symbolised animal life, and the strings humanity. Holding to his old belief that composition involved contemplation of a spirit world, he proposed that composing for orchestra was like becoming a god and ruling the beings of this spirit world.¹

Beauty was therefore the realisation of the logic of Nature, a logic beyond the comprehension of Reason. His reluctance to accept the possibility of intellectual, entirely-musical form in music remained a weakness for his composition. The fault in his argument was in drawing his examples from Tristan und Isolde and Fidelio, rather than from symphonies or quartets.²

His table of extra-musical equivalents for orchestral instruments - the nearest he ever came to defining the vocabulary of his 'specific' musical language - was inconsistent and fanciful, showing in effect that only the vaguest and most general associations could be made between specific sounds and non-musical phenomena.

In 1906, Marshall-Hall returned to Europe for a visit, a

¹'The orchestra: its mystic voices', loc. cit.: Percussion was 'spirits of caves and grottos...resonant space...'; brass was 'pre-human soul...giants, dwarfs, gnomes, gods...'; horns were 'twilight landscape...peace of woodland...'; woodwinds were 'nearer to mortality...the flute innocent and childlike...oboë delicate intangible sea sounds...clarinet sensuous maturity of a woman's voice...bassoon: highly strung temperament...cor anglais: transitory nature of individual existence...'.

²Ibid.
trip which provided him with his first extensive sampling of German musical life for more than a decade. Having preached the supremacy of German music and musical culture in Melbourne persistently, he was disappointed with what he found; in his isolation in Australia, he had come to view Europe through rose coloured glasses. He despatched his observations to The Argus in a series of ten articles, ¹ which may be summarised as below, Abstract 13:

¹ 'Music in Berlin', The Argus. I: January 26, 1907; II: February 9; III: February 16; IV: February 23; V: March 9; VI: March 16; VII: March 30; VIII: April 26; IX: April 27; X: May 18.
MARSHALL-HALL'S VIEW OF GERMAN MUSICAL LIFE AFTER 1906

1. The Berlin orchestras have achieved astonishing technical perfection, but now play older music with less feeling than Melbourne.¹

2. Melbourne lacks an outstanding professional choir to compare with the German choirs.²

3. Melbourne's music is admirably financed compared to the commercialised German music.³

4. With the immense number of talented people and the financial pressure in Berlin, Australian students would do better to stay in Australia.⁴

5. Berlin is not consistently better than Melbourne: it simply has the best and the worst all in the one city.⁵

¹"Here in Berlin what is not technically impeccable is not tolerated for a moment, yet they listen quite complacently to the most imperfect, inadequate, unintelligent emotional misinterpretations, especially of Beethoven and Brahms', ibid. I Berliners were 'cold' towards Brahms, 'the conductor had no feeling for the style of Brahms' ibid., III. 'We in Melbourne made many small interesting points which were not taken here at all...' ibid. IX.

²"Why have we not in Melbourne a choir capable of achieving equally artistic results?...There is a poor and wrong headed spirit among the amateur members of Melbourne's choral societies', ibid., VI.

³"Berlin is 'monstrously commercial' compared to Melbourne... I look forward with deep inward longing to finding myself once again in the more careless, thought-free southern home of sunlight. ibid., VI.

⁴"I have heard more fine voices and more well schooled vocalisation in this city in a few weeks than in all the fifteen years I have been in Australia...My advice to Australians who think to come to Europe and make a name for themselves is - stay where you are. Here even great talent can effect nothing without influence, friends and money; sometimes even with them but little.' ibid., VI.

⁵"One harbours a secret feeling of disappointment at finding even here in the heart of Germany, musical doings accepted as wonderful which really are mediocre and insignificant...it is the same old world as over there... Only in Berlin everything is to be had from worst to best', ibid., II."
Marshall-Hall's observations did not affect his older views that Wagner's music-dramas were the supreme musical forms, or that German music education and musical life was the finest in Europe because of the universality of their outlook.\(^1\) His more recent views of musical criticism were reiterated too.\(^2\) But he was drawn to the conclusion that Europe's music was in a sorry state and in need of a saviour who would achieve for her the heights of feeling he believed he had achieved in Melbourne. He seemed not aware of the new currents emerging in Berlin, Paris, and Vienna that would soon swamp the old world. It was not Ravel, Debussy, or Schoenberg, but Puccini, Strauss, and Bruckner that he named as leaders of their time.\(^3\) For so long a champion of the new, now the new found no place in his writings. His trip to Europe led him to misguided conclusions, and added to the restlessness which, in 1913, launched him back into Europe, just as the riot in Paris at the premier of Stravinsky's *Le sacre du printemps* heralded a new musical language, and on the eve of the terrible carnage of the Great War.

Significantly, the 'Music in Berlin' articles revealed in their author an outstanding and independent faculty for the criticism of musical performance. Artur Schnabel, Kreisler, D'Albert and Stenbach he correctly judged to be great performers;\(^4\) Weingartner he judged a master of elegance but incapable of

\(^1\) the Germans were the first of the moderns to discover a melodic style which carried the mind beyond the mere present... giving it a wider and more general application', *ibid.* V. See also the review of *Tristan*, *ibid.*; comments on education, IV, *ibid.*

\(^2\) *ibid.* Vand VI. 'It is always useless to attempt any historical evaluation of the works of a composer during his lifetime...'

\(^3\) *ibid.*, II and IV, VIII.

\(^4\) *ibid.*, IV and VIII.
the sublime;¹ Nikisch better with modern colouristic scores than with traditional music;² and Strauss a master of orchestration whose talents were wasted on the meaningless.³ These views, some of which were sharply at odds with prevailing opinion, have mostly borne out the test of time. It was sad that, when he finally returned to Europe, he did not seek to exploit his promise as a music critic.

Of more importance for his creative development was his experience of a new Puccini opera while conducting the Sydney Symphony Orchestra in 1909. J.C. Williamson's production there of Madame Butterfly made a profound impression on him and he returned to see it several times.⁴ Puccini was not new to him, having seen La Bohème in Melbourne at the Musgrove season of 1901⁵, having conducted scenes from it for his Conservatorium performances in 1904 and 1906,⁶ and having seen Tosca in Berlin in 1907. Bohème apparently did not interest Marshall-Hall, being a realistic opera of everyday scenes and common people, quite unlike his own dramas, which were rooted in antiquity and romantic fiction. But Tosca impressed him, and Butterfly—with its exotic setting, romantic to the core—took him deeply. As with Tosca, he reviewed Butterfly for The Argus, and his views may be summarised as below, Abstract 14.

---

¹Ibid., III.
²Ibid., I.
³Ibid., V.
⁵Programmes in 1901 Diary, Melbourne Conservatorium MC.
⁶Programmes, Student Performances of Opera, 10th December 1904; 15th September, 1906, MC.
ABSTRACT 14

MARSHALL-HALL'S VIEWS ON MUSICAL STYLE MODIFIED IN 1909

1. In modern German music, sensuous effect has replaced poetical feeling. Only Puccini has achieved emotional intensity. 1

2. Puccini's music has the depth of Wagner expressed directly and simply, without endless probing and analysis. 2

3. The future of music is in the combination of Italian clarity with German depth and imagination. Australia, with its Northern heritage and Mediterranean climate is an ideal location for such a meeting. 3

---

1 'The glory of Electra, of "Imogen", of "Leonora" of "Isolde" great as it is will not efface from our minds the tender loveliness of Mimi...since the music-dramas of Wagner I doubt if anything so intense (as Butterfly) has been created in any branch of art.' 'Madame Butterfly: first performance in Sydney' review The Argus, 1909, in MC.

'In these (modern German works) of course, the sensuous orchestration, which takes the place of poetical feeling lends itself to the astonishing bravura of the orchestras.' 'Music in Berlin', op. cit., I.

2 'He has dared to take us from the cheerful, superficial appearance of things straight down to the lowest abyss of human agony...The quaint pseudo-Japanese setting of the play, cheering though it is constitutes no important part of its effect...it seems very simple and direct. Everyone who was no musician would after a third hearing be able to follow all the details with ease'. 'Madame Butterfly', op. cit. Tosca 'has admirable clearness of form (in place of) endless depth of probing and analysis (of German opera)' 'Music in Berlin', op. cit., VIII.

3 'There is yet room in the world of art for a composer who will...unite Italian simplicity of structure with Teutonic depth of passion and wealth of musical imagination...We in Australia have the advantage of our hereditary northern blood and all its means of idealisation and sentiment together with a warm sunny southern climate, with its glorious sensuousness and joy of life.' 'Music in Berlin', op. cit., VIII.
Marshall-Hall perhaps saw in Puccini the musical style he had struggled in vain to achieve in the crisis years of his first contact with Streeton. There was a sensuous joy in Puccini’s magical vocal melody, an intuitive freedom in the phraseology, novel colouring in the orchestration and harmony, and an exotic flavour in the occasional 4th-, 5th-, or even 7th-doublings of the melodic line, or the side-stepping chromatic chords. There were recurring motives which recalled particular moods or events, but they recurred almost impressionistically, without generating musical development as in Wagner’s _liedmotiven_. Yet the whole was admirably dramatic and theatrical in conception. Perhaps Marshall-Hall could see too the cause of his earlier failure: the intuitive, sensuous moods of Streeton’s early art would not be produced in music by the spontaneous combination of boisterous themes — which had produced the riotous overabundance of the Eb Symphony — but by the intensification and concentration of a melodic line into an expression of direct urgency and constant tension.  

1. His idea that Australia was ideally placed for a meeting of German and Italian styles was a reasonable proposition; but when he spoke of German style he meant Wagner, who had been dead more than twenty years. He still assumed that the new would never equal the old.

_Butterfly_ renewed the composer’s interest in opera; _Stella_ was begun shortly afterwards, and ‘finished in the tail of Halley’s Comet, May 12, 1910, 1.30 a.m.’

2. It was set in a Melbourne seaside town, in ‘The Present (1909)’, and the characters were all very probable Melbournians. Stella, assistant to the local doctor, had eloped in her teens with an older man

---


2. Ms. full score, composer’s hand, final page, GM.
Scene VI

Road bordered with trees.

Shrubs + grass

Gate

Shrubs + grass

Tree with seat

Shrubs

Orchard
who had subsequently deserted her. Moving to the town to make a new start, she had found in the doctor, Noel Kirke, a man she could trust for the first time. Mrs. Chase, respectable society lady, had a child who was dangerously ill, and Stella had nursed it towards recovery. A local clergyman, Rev. Weldon, discovers Stella's background and informs the Social Purity Society, an organisation which meets at Mrs. Chase's home, presided over by the Mayor, to discuss matters of moral concern. Unable to face the thought of the exposure of her past to the whole town, Stella commits suicide.

The story was the composer's own, based on an inquest in a small country town, so he said.\(^1\) Quite possibly it was conceived in imitation of the *Butterfly* formula: realistic tragedy in unusual surroundings. Scenes of XIXth-century Japan were replaced with XXth-century Australia: a sea-side house with familiar alcoves, verandah, trimmed heges, and ti-tree in the background (see the composer's set design, plate facing this page). There are allusions to Melbourne's musical life too, in the jigs, rigadoons, and quadrilles, and the hymn tunes from an off-stage harmonium. The Scottish composer Hamish MacCunn, quipped that Marshall-Hall '...should advertise the leading tenor as Sig. Kang-caruso'.\(^2\)

The libretto is arranged in ten scenes, but as in *Aristodemus*, these divisions indicate little more than the entries and exits of the characters. In effect there are three set changes, making a one act drama of three scenes. The action may be summarised as below, Table 1.\(^3\)

---
\(^1\)William Moore 'First grand opera: Marshall-Hall's"Stella"' *Sydney Morning Herald* 20th August 1932


\(^3\)The Ms. vocal score has ten scenes marked, but the programme for the 1912 performance, GM, has three scenes indicated, as in Table 1 below.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Curtain Scenes</th>
<th>Scenes in Ms. score</th>
<th>action</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Noel and Stella examine the healing child at Mrs. Chase's house.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>The conversation turns to love. Stella regards it as a malady, Noel as truth. They arrange to meet later.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Mayor Chamley arrives, and Stella recognises him as the man who jilted her. They agree to treat each other as strangers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Chamley alone, is ashamed. Rector Waldon enters, and announces that he has discovered Stella is a fallen woman. He will expose her. Chamley urges him not to act hastily.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Mrs. Chase enters and the three discuss the coming meeting of the Social Purity Society and the healing child. Chamley is secretly plagued with cowardice and unable to confess.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Stella and Noel meet at Noel's house. Stella announces she must leave the town. Noel is stunned, reveals that he is in love with her and proposes. She refuses him an answer. A servant enters with some medicine for Stella for the child, comic stage business.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Stella alone, distraught, outside Mrs. Chase's house. She finally enters the house, while children play in the background and people arrive for the Social Purity Meeting.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
<td>Noel, Chamley and Weldon enter, discussing a previous nurse Noel dismissed for drinking. Noel announces he has proposed to Stella, the others are taken aback.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8</td>
<td>Chamley tells Stella that Weldon is going to expose their relationship. Waldon's voice is heard inside opening the meeting, and Chamley goes in. Stella, desperate, resolves on suicide, drinking the poisonous medicine.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>9</td>
<td>Noel rushes in to help her. She tells him of her affair and dies, as Chamley's hymn is heard being sung inside. Noel cries for help and all rush in.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The conception of realistic tragedy in an unusual setting was more than an imitation of Puccini's *Butterfly* formula. There are specific parallels between the plot and the events that led to Marshall-Hall's dismissal from the University of Melbourne in 1900. The symbols of the drama are clear: Stella is the Artist; the Mayor, the Rector, and Mrs. Chase are the forces of government, church, and society that stifle and oppress the Artist. *Stella* is a drama about the victimisation of an individual by a powerful social lobby, and its setting in Melbourne was intended to be unnerving. The Mayor is portrayed as a cad, a coward, and a hypocrite - none other than the man who eloped with Stella in years gone by; the Rector is a poisonous scandal monger and Mrs. Chase is one of 'God's Police'\(^1\), full of Victorian self-righteousness. Noel, the doctor, is Stella's patron and only friend, powerless against the forces the other characters represent. In its social sharpness, *Stella* is not unlike the dramas of H. Ibsen, whose cause Marshall-Hall had championed in Melbourne in the 1890s.

The score is a mixture of musical idioms, which may be summarised as below in Table 2.

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>scene</th>
<th>page in Ms. vocal score</th>
<th>action</th>
<th>musical idiom</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>Rigadoon-flavour&lt;sup&gt;1&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Noel and Mrs. Chase</td>
<td>Rigadoon with parlando sections</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II</td>
<td></td>
<td>Stella and Noel</td>
<td>Air, with parlando sections</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td></td>
<td>Noel gives his view of love</td>
<td>Mock-chanting&lt;sup&gt;2&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td></td>
<td>Duet: Knock on the door and they resume their duties</td>
<td>Knock imitated in the accompaniment, then a quadrille</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td></td>
<td>Chamley and Stella</td>
<td>Rich chromatic fabric fluctuating tempos</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49</td>
<td></td>
<td>Chamley and Weldon</td>
<td>Mock-chorale harmonisation, then parlando</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>59</td>
<td></td>
<td>Trio: enter Mrs. Chase</td>
<td>Waltz time, air</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>Lullaby</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>80</td>
<td>Noel and Stella</td>
<td>Rich chromatic fabric fluctuating tempos&lt;sup&gt;2&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>Enter servant</td>
<td>Hornpipe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>101</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>Jig-flavour.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>107</td>
<td>aria: Stella</td>
<td>Rich static harmony, broad melodic lines&lt;sup&gt;5&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>112</td>
<td>Children</td>
<td>Jig-flavour&lt;sup&gt;6&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>123</td>
<td>Weldon, Chamley, Noel</td>
<td>parlando</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>127</td>
<td>Quintet: enter Mrs. Chase</td>
<td>Rich chromatic fabric</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>155</td>
<td>Stella and Chamley</td>
<td>parlando</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>161</td>
<td>Weldon</td>
<td>Mock-chorale harmonisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>164</td>
<td>Stella alone</td>
<td>Rich chromatic fabric dramatic use of silence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>170</td>
<td>Noel enters</td>
<td>parlando</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>181</td>
<td>Duet</td>
<td>Urgent, chromatic fabric</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>192</td>
<td>Choir within</td>
<td>Hymn with harmonium accompaniment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>193</td>
<td>Stella dies, all rush in</td>
<td>Themeless chromatic passagework</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
TABLE 2 (CONT.)
Examples - from autograph vocal score

example 1: Rigadoon, p.1

example 2: Mock chanting p.24

example 3: Mock chorale-harmonisation p.49
example 4: aria, p.96-97

example 5: Stella's aria, p.108

example 6: Jig, p.112
There are radical departures from Marshall-Hall's earlier operatic style. Like Puccini, there is no overture; the drama begins at once. There are waltzes, homophonic jigs, dances, more like Sullivan than any of the composer's music since Dido. There are moments of mock solemnity, as when the Rector's line is accompanied by a parody of chorale harmonisation. The rich chromatic style of the earlier operas appears only sporadically: in the encounters between the Mayor and Stella, and Noel and Stella in the first two scenes, though more often in the third scene. It is the dramatic contrast between these various musical idioms that is crucial. The increase in intensity between the duet for Stella and Noel in scene 1, which is in the tempo of a quadrille, the duet for Stella and Noel in scene 2, which is more impassioned, and the frantic exchanges between Stella and Noel at the close of scene 3 are highly effective. The sudden appearance of the strains of hymn singing from within the house in scene 3, in the midst of the frenzied exchanges between Noel and the dying Stella, is perhaps the most striking contrast of all. In Marshall-Hall's previous operas, dramatic light and shade had been emphasised musically by tonal contrast and thematic association; now Butterfly had taught him to manipulate the whole stylistic idiom to dramatic ends as well.

As before, the score exhibits recurring motifs, and relates them to specific ideas in the libretto. Table 3 below summarises these. There are six shapes that may be defined as motifs and that recur in the score; though the most often heard of these, motif 2, appears in only eight different contexts, compared with the 13 appearances of motif 1 themes in Aristodemus. There are 29 other shapes which may be defined as motifs in the work which, though they do not recur beyond the context in which they first appear, comprise an equally important part of the thematic material.
### TABLE 3

**STELLA - RECURRING MOTIFS**
(from autograph vocal score)

```
motif 1: associated with Stella

appearances: Chamley and Stella, p. 35, 40 (transposed), 43 (as a solo melody), 49 (transposed); Mrs Chase refers to the cure of her child, p. 59, 68, 70 (a freely transposed inversion of m.1-2).
```

```
motif 2: associated with Stella's past and its consequences

appearances: Noel is told of Stella's decision to leave, p. 89, 90-92 (various transpositions); Stella joins the Quintet, p. 154 (transposed, extended); p. 98 (original form); 156 (figure derived from m.1); 157 (transposed), 163 (transposed); Stella dying, p. 179 (transposed); 196 (cadence based on motif 2).
```
motif 3: associated with the child, or Stella’s work

appearances: Stella and Noel discuss the child’s recovery, p.11; Weldon surveys the sick room, p.50 (transposed).

motif 4: associated with Chamley

appearances: Chamley and Stella, p.33-34, 36 (figures derived from the motif), 40 (transposed); Stella does not respond to Noel’s proposal, p.93 (transposed, diminished, triple-time).

motif 5: associated with Weldon (see Table 2, example 3)

appearances: Weldon enters, p.49; Weldon enters, p.121 (transposed).

motif 6: associated with love, related to motifs 1 and 2

appearances: Noel exclaims ‘You love me’ p.97; Stella hears Noel within the house, p.169 (transposed); Weldon says ‘this decides me’ p.126 (transposed); Stella dies, p.193 (transposed).
From Table 3, it can be seen that the recurring motifs refer to several of the important ideas of the drama: Stella's work, her fatal past and its consequences, her love for Noel, Weldon and the Mayor Chamley. The composer relates three of the Stella themes to each other musically, motifs 1, 2, and 6, but there is no attempt to associate the interplay of dramatic ideas by interplay of the associated themes. Motif 2, according to Hubert Marshall-Hall, came to his father in a dream, and was scored at 4 a.m. when it woke him up.¹ But neither this nor any other motif has a role significant enough to label it as the main thematic material of the work. As in Puccini's *Butterfly*, recurring motifs are used almost impressionistically, and are only part of the melodic inspiration. Puccini's impression on the composer seems to have been very strong.

As in *Alcestis*, the composer had no hesitation in using material that had been previously composed for other purposes. In *Stella*, the final duet 'O once again to hear thee say', was borrowed, with small modifications, from the Adagio second movement of the String Quartet in F, composed earlier in the same year, 1910. In the autograph score of the Quartet, the text of the Stella duet is pencilled in, just as *Alcestis* had been in the score of Harold.²

The tonal design of *Stella* is, at the most salient level, less chromatic than the previous operas, for the various airs and dances employ traditional accompanying figures and the simplest harmonic prolongations.

¹Moore, *Sydney Morning Herald* loc.cit.
²Autograph score, in GM
A number of the various components of the score have complete harmonic motions structurally; the opening rigadoon, pp. 1-9 has a structure f...Db...F; the trio of scene 1, pp. 61-75 has a structure Bb...E-Bb; the opening lullaby of scene 2, pp. 76-79 has a structure D...F-D; the little hornpipe for the servant in scene 2, p. 98 has a structure B...D...; and the children's jig, pp. 112-120, in scene 3, has a structure G...Eb...G.

But the intervening sections are more fluid. Stella and Noel's dialogue in scene 1, pp. 11-31, has a progressive harmonic motion, Ab...Bb, with a little interpolation of mock seriousness, in D, at p. 24. Their dialogue in scene 2, pp. 80-97, has a similarly progressive harmonic motion, b...A. Scene 3, apart from the introductory lullaby and the children's jig, meanders harmonically, with two contrasting moments, Weldon's line above a: c, p. 161, and the off-stage hymn in C, p. 192. The contrasts between these two passages and the rest are underlined by their difference of idiom, as discussed above.

Some of the logic of tonal design achieved in Aristodemus is not apparent in Stella, the small scale structures not always reflecting the large scale. The emphasis is on contrast, not only between differing musical idioms but between differing levels of harmonic complexity, ranging from the simple prolongations of the opening bars, with alternating I-V-I accompaniment, to the elaborate fluctuations of the final bars. Whereas in Aristodemus, the tonal design pointed towards a succession of closed harmonic movements separated by transitions, here the transitions become progressively longer and in scene 3 swamp the closed harmonic movements.

Apart from borrowing from Puccini the general conception and musical idiom of the work, specific devices may be pointed to as hallmarks of Puccini's style, which appear here for the first time in Marshall-Hall's scores: the intensification of a melody by octave and unison doubling, the use of parallel fourths, the dramatic use of a solo reed against a silent
background (in Stella and Chamley's meeting), the use of side slipping chords.\(^1\) Marshall-Hall was intrigued with this composer's novel orchestral effects, and attempted some of Puccini's subtle suggestive wash effects in the opening lullaby of scene 2. The rich, static chords and the broad, smooth melody that introduce Stella's aria, scene 3, p. 107, are similarly Puccinian, though perhaps sound better on the piano than they would in the composer's scoring of them.

**Stella** is a short opera, with an enjoyable mixture of dances, airs, bright tunes, and moments of deeper sentiment. Its archetypical-Victorian characters and musical parodies give it moments of humour, and its Melbourne setting make it an unusual piece. But it is more than a curiosity; its contrasts of musical idiom and harmonic style give it some effective dramatic shocks in the Puccinian vein. The mask of light-heartedness and frivolity hides a serious core, for Marshall-Hall was writing of his enemies in Melbourne. The message of Stella rests in the role of the recovering child. Stella proved her capacities with this child, she saved its life and there is no doubt of her efficiency at her work. As the opera progresses, the child vanishes from view; while a side issue, a phantom from Stella's past irrelevant to her present life, becomes blown out of all proportion, with tragic results. The child is a symbol for Marshall-Hall's work as a University professor, which had never been in doubt at the time of his dismissal from the University of Melbourne. It was his poetry that secured his downfall, amateurish pieces that were not even a commercial success.

The opera was first performed in Melbourne in 1912 at Her Majesty's Theatre, with considerable success.\(^2\) It

\(^1\)Ms. vocal score, pp. 17, 21, 43, 44, respectively.

\(^2\)There were two performances, Programmes, May 1912 GM. Letter Marshall-Hall to Barrett, May 6, 1912 accounts its success, GM.
was given in a shortened version at the London Palladium in 1914 as a curtain-raiser to an ordinary variety performance. Hardly an appropriate setting, the audience reception was such that the season was soon terminated.\(^1\) The score came to the attention of entrepreneurs in Sydney, London, and San Francisco in the composer's lifetime, but other performances did not transpire.\(^2\)

When asked in London in 1907 whether he would ever return to England to settle, Marshall-Hall replied:

> Out in Australia, we understand better, I think, the art of living...No, I have enjoyed my stay in the old country immensely, but I never want to come back to live here permanently again.\(^3\)

His visit to Europe had convinced him that his achievements, at least in conducting, in Australia were something he could be proud of. But tension was growing between the Barrett management and the musicians' union. Marshall-Hall's concerts had the patronage of a sector of the community opposed to worker organisation, and two pieces he wrote in The Argus in 1908, taking the view that strike action was immoral, hardly served to endear him to the Trades Hall Council.\(^4\) In 1910, the musicians finally refused to play with non-union members and demanded wage increases. Barrett's attempts at negotiation failed, and the union set up its own orchestra which gave concerts under Alberto Zelman with considerable success.\(^5\)

It is difficult to ascertain exactly what Marshall-Hall's ability as a conductor was. He was highly praised by local music-lovers, but this may mean as little as their assessment of


\(^{2}\) Ms. vocal score has three addresses on it, *vide* Appendix I

\(^{3}\) Westminster Gazette, February 10th 1907.

\(^{4}\) Letter to the Editor The Argus, 20th April, 1908, attacking the Trades Hall Council over their proposal that he write music for the May Day procession; 'Ethics and Boobblaching', The Argus, 25th July 1908, claiming that the modern worker cared not for the quality of his work, but only for the payment he had received for it.

\(^{5}\) Account of the dispute from (1) '1910 Orchestral dispute', typescript, GM, possibly by Barrett (2) Prospectus of the Victorian Professional Orchestra, November 1910, MC (3) J.W. Barrett, 'Professor Marshall-Hall', *op. cit.*
his stature as a composer. More significant is A.E.J. Lee's estimation of him, which is dramatic in its conviction that Marshall-Hall was of international stature. But it is not certain that Lee knew how Marshall-Hall achieved his results. While Nikisch was giving concerts on a single rehearsal, and Richter on two, Marshall-Hall required six or seven. Evidently even then, the results were not always satisfactory, for there were numerous postponements. Under such conditions even an amateur could produce good work.

Marshall-Hall's reputation was considerable enough to be paid substantial fees for his efforts. His concerts earned him 140 pounds in 1905, and after the Lady Northcote Permanent Orchestra Trust Fund was established in 1908 for 'the maintenance of a Permanent Orchestra in Melbourne under the direction (so long as he is able and willing to act) of G.W.L. Marshall-Hall', he received 200 pounds per annum, while the entire orchestra was paid a total of about 600 pounds per annum. In practice, Barrett treated Marshall-Hall with every consideration, while he treated the players to an unpleasant system of fines for lateness. But Marshall-Hall was unhappy with the players, and it affected his creative work. No work is known to have been completed after Stella before Romeo and Juliet in 1912.

In the same period, the Conservatorium appears to have been less able to sustain Marshall-Hall's stipend, even at half his old

---

1 A.E.J. Lee op. cit. 2 Harold C. Shonberg The great conductors vide footnote 4, p.161 3 New York, 1967 p.176-185 4 Typical is the notice that the Eb Symphony was to be performed at the 75th Concert, 15th July 1907, programme, NL, and its postponement till 1908.

5 Accounts, Marshall-Hall Concerts, NL. 6 ibid.

7 Engagement Notice, March 1912, in J. Sutton Crow's Diary, 1912, NL.

8 Two letters, Marshall-Hall to Barrett, 13th April 1909 and undated, in NL. Second reads: 'Orchestra very rough again- Ugh! Rolled up 2nd violins for another rehearsal (unpaid!) - Ugh! No more composition - Ugh! - am almost dead with 2½ hours trombone - damnation!'
University salary. In 1904 they had raised the fees sharply, but without endowment or government assistance, the burden was great.  

Meanwhile, Marshall-Hall's reputation as a conductor had travelled abroad in these years and it was rumoured that he would be offered the podium of the London Symphony Orchestra when Richter retired.  

In Melbourne he had conducted for Kubelik, Cherniavski, Leonard Borwick, and Mark Hambourg while they were on visiting concert tours, and Melba invited him to conduct Lohengrin in her 1911 Sydney season. His Eb Symphony had been performed in London twice by Henry Wood, who regarded it as a splendid work, and this added to the composer's belief that there were opportunities for him in London. He had not received any other offers for conducting or performance of his work during his 1907 visit to Europe; but he had been dogged by ill-health at that time, and spent more than two months of his stay in bed.

The increasing difficulties over his Melbourne concerts, the Conservatorium's financial problems, his belief that European music was in need of a saviour, and the rumours of opportunities in London made the composer increasingly restless.

---

1 Account of the financial difficulties from (1) Prospectus, Melbourne Conservatorium, 1904: notice of fee increase MC (2) Letter, Marshall-Hall to Barrett, from Berlin, 31 December 1906 (3) Letter, Marshall-Hall to Barrett from his new address, 19th May 1907 (4) Letter, Marshall-Hall to Barrett, 12th December 1913, from London, discussing the money owed him by the Conservatorium - all in GM.


3 Programmes, Melba Grand Opera Company, 1911, MC.

4 Letter, Wood to Barrett, 5th November, 1912.

5 Letters to Barrett, from Berlin, 31st December 1906; from Dorset, 11th January, 1907, GM.
to return to London permanently. It was not the possibility of conducting there that concerned him, for he knew the business of conducting an established orchestra through heavy programme schedules in two or three rehearsals was very different from shepherding an ad hoc orchestra to fine performances by constant rehearsal. His Melba engagement in 1911, his only experience of conducting under normal European conditions, had not been without its problems.\(^1\) It was as a composer he wished to return to Europe, though he had little concrete evidence to suggest he would survive there by his music.\(^2\)

But the prospect of success as a composer in Europe could not have seemed blacker than his outlook in Melbourne. The Australian Grand Opera Company, his hope for better opera in Australia, had failed to bring out great singers and conductors from Europe, though they produced a tolerable local Lohengrin, Tannhäuser, and Die Walkérie in the 1907 season, and he had withdrawn from the 'rotten undertaking'.\(^3\) The Conservatorium had not produced an artist of international acclaim: Chanter, the first graduate had become a local organist\(^4\), and Mabel Woolcock, the star singing pupil, had declined Melba's personal offer to teach her singing in Europe because of the rigorous work involved.\(^5\) The Ministry of Public Education, equipped with new teacher registration

---

\(^1\) He was unhappy with the rehearsal time, and had difficulties with the singers and the management, vide Letter to Tallis, of Tallis, Ward and Lemone (the management), undated and letter to Barrett from Sydney, undated, c. 1911, GM; Arundel Orchard, op. cit., p. 40.

\(^2\) Letter Marshall-Hall to Barrett, 4th February 1913, GM.

\(^3\) Letter Marshall-Hall to Barrett from Berlin, 11th January 1907, GM.

\(^4\) 'Victoria's first B. Mus.', Alma Mater, Vol. V, no. 6, 1900.

\(^5\) Reminiscences of Olive Affleck, loc. cit.
legislation, demanded alterations in the Conservatorium's course for teachers, while the University had succeeded in opening a magnificent new Conservatorium building for Franklin Peterson in 1909. After the 1912 success of Stella, perhaps earlier, Marshall-Hall made plans to leave Australia.

Things were not as bad as they seemed. Marshall-Hall's twenty years in Melbourne had left a decisive imprint on the musical life, which would not be erased. The orchestral concerts and both Conservatoriums flourished in the next decade, while Mabel Woolcock went on to a successful career - if only in Australia and New Zealand - as Madame Moreton. But by 1912, he felt his activities too much under the control of others, and Europe seemed to offer him an escape.

---

1Letter, Registrar, Council for Public Education to Secretary, Melbourne Conservatorium, 30th August 1911, MC.

2Braid, loc. cit.


4Press clippings, Mabel Woolcock papers, facsimiles in GM.
CHAPTER V

1912 - 1915

Before he left for London, Marshall-Hall completed another opera, destined to become his last, Romeo and Juliet. He began work on the libretto after Christmas 1911; the vocal score followed, composed at a feverish pace\(^1\), and the full score was completed in October 1912.\(^2\) The result was a four act work, the largest since Harold twenty five years before.

Whether through ambition for English success, or through frustration with the Australian experience, Romeo and Juliet was, like Harold, an attempt to produce an 'English' opera.\(^3\) But whereas the former took its text from a fiction, freely developing lines and action that would be musically compatible with the story, here Marshall-Hall tried to give musical expression to lines taken directly from Shakespeare's tragedy. He found numerous omissions and re-arrangements of the original were necessary to construct a workable libretto. These adaptations may be expressed as follows, Table 1.

---

1Letter, Marshall-Hall to Mrs. B(arrett), Friday, undated, GM. 'I am still doing my 10-12 hours a day hard work and cannot tear myself away from it, it has got hold of me...'

2Letter, Marshall-Hall to Barrett, 28th October, 1912, GM. 'Romeo is complete and is going to make a landmark in English opera...'

3Ibid., and Letter, Marshall-Hall to Barrett, 17th February, 1914, GM.
# Table 1

## Romeo and Juliet - Marshall-Hall's Adaptation of Shakespeare

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Shakespeare</th>
<th>Marshall-Hall</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Prologue</strong></td>
<td>omitted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Act I, scene I Sampson and Gregory argue; fight between Capulets and Montagues, Prince's speech</td>
<td>Fight retained. Dialogue omitted except lines 74-6, 80-1; Prince's speech truncated to 7 lines of which 2 are rearranged.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>scene 2, Capulet and Paris; Peter</td>
<td>Capulet and Paris scene abridged; Peter's speech retained.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>scene 3, Nurse, Juliet, etc.</td>
<td>Displaced till after scene 4. Nurse’s speech omitted, remainder abridged.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>scene 4, Queen Mab speech, Romeo, Mercutio and Benvolio dialogue</td>
<td>Queen Mab speech: lines 77-81 88-94 omitted, lines 59-66 displaced. Dialogue, sharply abridged, appears after scene 3 (displaced).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>scene 5, The ball</td>
<td>Capulet's speech of welcome abridged; 'O she doth teach the torches...': words changed; Romeo and Juliet dialogue unchanged save minor adjustment at the end. Chorus interpolated here.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Act II, scene I</td>
<td>Prologue omitted. Scene I condensed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>scene 2, The balcony scene</td>
<td>Slight alterations in Romeo's opening lines; dialogue preserved except for the omission of lines 85-112 (Juliet); ending at line 164, omitting the farewell biddings.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>scene 3, Romeo and Fr. Lawrence</td>
<td>omitted till after scene 5.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>scene 4</td>
<td>very compressed; Nurse and Romeo condensed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>scene 5, Juliet and Nurse</td>
<td>omitted. Part of act III scene 4 interpolated (Capulet and Paris); part of act II scenes 3 and 6 interpolated, reference to Rosaline removed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>scene 6</td>
<td>very condensed.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


2Typescript libretto, annotations in composer's hand, GM.
Shakespeare

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Act</th>
<th>Scene</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Romeo, Benvolio, Mercutio, Tybalt; citizens, Prince, Lady Capulet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>omitted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>omitted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Juliet's bedchamber, Romeo and Juliet, Lady Capulet, Nurse, Juliet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Romeo and Juliet dialogue preserved; Juliet's line 60 omitted; following dialogue very condensed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Begins at line 43, abridged</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Begins line 15, slight alterations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>omitted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>omitted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Romeo's man is given to Benvolio; dialogue amended. Then scene 3 continues with Paris and Romeo - abridged; Romeo's monologue preserved; Fr. Lawrence and Juliet dialogue omitted; Juliet monologue preserved till 'this is thy sheath!' Crowd arrives, rest of the dialogue omitted, 'Prince places the hand of Capulet in that of Montague across the bodies of their dead children' — stage directions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>very condensed</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Marshall-Hall

Largely preserved, save line 36; fight with Tybalt abridged; Citizen's text arranged to fit metrical chorus; Prince's speech very condensed; chorus interpolated

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Act</th>
<th>Scene</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>omitted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>omitted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Romeo and Juliet dialogue preserved; Juliet's line 60 omitted; following dialogue very condensed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Begins at line 43, abridged</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td>omitted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
<td>omitted</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Act 5, scene 1, Paris at the tomb; death of Paris; Romeo at the tomb; death of Romeo; Fr. Lawrence and Juliet; death of Juliet; Prince's speech.
The setting of a great prose drama directly to music is fraught with difficulties. Omission is almost always necessary, though is no substitute for summary and simplification. The rhythm of the spoken drama is often difficult to set consistently to music, and much of the dramatic impact of the original is unavoidably lost or reinterpreted by musical delivery. Shakespeare's plays are particularly problematic, and though more than 20 composers have set the *Romeo and Juliet* tragedy to music, few have attempted to use Shakespeare's lines and none have entirely succeeded.¹ At times, Marshall-Hall makes small alterations to Shakespeare's text in his setting, as below, from act 1 scene 5:

O she doth teach the torches to burn bright!
Her beauty hangs on the ear of night
Like a rich jewel in an Ethiop's ear.²

The altered second line of this famous passage is mystifying. It is inferior to the original, yet indefensible on musical grounds, for the original would have been no harder to sing than this. More puzzling are his omissions from the Queen Mab speech, Act 1 scene 4, which is re-arranged and the climatic lines, 88-94, are omitted. Perhaps his aim was a simplification of the details of the drama - Mercutio's death scene, act 3 scene 1 is also abridged - but one cannot help feeling a strong sense of loss at these numerous omissions. A chorus, as below, is interpolated in the Ball scene:

Youth's the season made for joys
Love is surely then our duty, love's our duty,
She alone who that employs,
She alone well deserves her beauty.³

²Vocal score, Enoch and Sons, London: 1914, p. 67.
³Vocal score, *op. cit.*, p. 51.
Aside from these unfortunate details, the thrust of Marshall-Hall's adaptation of Shakespeare is to preserve the vital interchanges between Romeo and Juliet; the Ball scene, the Balcony scene, the Bedchamber and the Tomb, and to reduce the other action to its essentials, omitting whatever is possible. The effect is admirable: a skeleton of action from which four expansive tableaux involving the two lovers emerge smoothly and naturally, giving ample opportunity for elaborate music.

This text was arranged into a libretto of four acts, a total of seven scenes, which may be expressed schematically as below in Table 2.

There is sound musical sense in this arrangement. The fight scene of act 1, scene 1 makes a colourful opening to the opera, after which the action moves quickly to the crucial meetings of the two lovers, which take up most of act 1 scene 2 (at the Ball), act 2 scene 1 (the Balcony), and most of act 3 (the bedchamber) and act 4 (in the tomb). The other action makes as few intrusions on the tragic love affair as possible. The Mab speech, the old English dances, and the episode with the Nurse and Peter are preserved as reliefs to the tension in act 1 scene 1, scene 2 and act 2, scene 2 respectively, after which the drama presses on to the end unswervingly.

The arrangement also indicates a concept of the work in separate 'numbers', and the thematic structure serves to confirm this conception. There are 52 shapes definable as motifs in Romeo and Juliet. Most of them do not recur beyond the particular context or number in which they first appear. Of those that do, one recurs throughout the opera, and has associations with particular ideas in the text. This motif appears below, Table 3, together with a further seven which appear less often in various guises.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>act</th>
<th>scene</th>
<th>page in vocal score</th>
<th>action</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Chorus 'A Capulet'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>12</td>
<td>Prince 'Rebellious subjects'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>16</td>
<td>Capulet and Paris 'Well Montague is bound'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>20</td>
<td>Peter 'Find them those names'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>22</td>
<td>Peter, Romeo, Mercutio, Benvolio, 'God gi' good den'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>29</td>
<td>Mercutio 'O then I see Queen Mab'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>36</td>
<td>Trio 'True I talk of dreams'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>43</td>
<td>Lady Capulet and nurse 'Nurse, where's my daughter'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>51</td>
<td>Lady Capulet, Nurse and Juliet 'Who calls?'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>55</td>
<td>Chorus 'Youth's the season made for joy'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>66</td>
<td>Old English dances (3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>73</td>
<td>Trio 'What lady's that'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>79</td>
<td>Romeo and Juliet 'If I profane'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>87</td>
<td>Romeo 'Can I go forward'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>91</td>
<td>Romeo 'He jests at scars'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>97</td>
<td>Romeo and Juliet 'Ah me - she speaks!'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>124</td>
<td></td>
<td>Mercutio and Benvolio 'Why where the devil should this Romeo be?'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>130</td>
<td>Mercutio, Romeo, Nurse 'Peter Anon!'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>138</td>
<td>Romeo and Nurse 'Now afor God'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>144</td>
<td>Capulet and Paris 'Sir Paris, I will make a desperate tender'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>147</td>
<td>Romeo and Friar 'Good morrow father'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>153</td>
<td>Romeo and Juliet 'Ah Juliet if the measure'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>159</td>
<td></td>
<td>Mercutio, Benvolio, Tybalt, Romeo, 'By my head here come etc'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>171</td>
<td></td>
<td>Mercutio's death 'I am hurt'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>177</td>
<td></td>
<td>Chorus 'Which way ran he?'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>179</td>
<td></td>
<td>Prince 'Where are the vile beginners?'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>act</td>
<td>scene</td>
<td>page in vocal score</td>
<td>action</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>186</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>189</td>
<td>Romeo and Juliet 'Wilt thou be gone?'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>200</td>
<td>Juliet and Lady Capulet 'Why how now Juliet?'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>206</td>
<td>Quartet 'How now wife, have you delivered to her?'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>213</td>
<td>Juliet, Lady Capulet, Nurse 'Is there no pity?'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>218</td>
<td>Juliet and Fr. Lawrence 'O shut the door!'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>228</td>
<td>Juliet 'I have a faint cold fear.'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>237</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>238</td>
<td>Frs. Lawrence and John 'Who bare my letter then?'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>240</td>
<td>Paris 'Sweet flowers with flowers'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>243</td>
<td>Romeo and Benvolio 'Her body sleeps'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>249</td>
<td>Romeo 'Mercutio's kinsmen, noble Paris'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>263</td>
<td>Fr. Lawrence 'Alack what blood is this?'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>266</td>
<td>Juliet and Fr. Lawrence 'O comfortable Friar, where's my Lord'</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
TABLE 3

ROMEO AND JULIET
(from published vocal score)

motif l (a)

motif l (b)

motif-group associated with impending tragedy

appearances: Opening fight, p.1-2 (a); Juliet leaves the balcony, p.112 (a, transposed); Fr. Lawrence enters the chapel, p.143 (transposed); 150 he announces the marriage (a); 158 (a, transposed); Mercutio dies, p.171-2 (a, transposition of m.1); Prince banishes Romeo, p.180 (a, transposed); Juliet drinks the phial, p.236 (b); Romeo fights Paris, p.246-47 (a, transposed); Fr. Lawrence arrives, p.264 (a, transposed); Noise, p.267 (transposed, a); Crowd, p.270 (a, original form); Juliet with the phial p.218-20 (b, transposed); 228-32 (b, transposed).
motif 2: associated with the hope of happiness - I: Juliet
appearances: Juliet and Romeo farewells, p.119; 123 (transposed; Juliet joins the Trio, p.155 (transposed); Prelude, p.187-88 (transposed variant on second part of the motif).

motif 3: associated with the hope of happiness - II: Romeo
appearances: Juliet and Romeo, p.116; Nurse gives Romeo Juliet's message, p.138-40 (only distantly related); 143 (only distantly related); Introduction to bedchamber scene (distantly related) 187.

motif 4: association unclear
appearances: Juliet hears Romeo is a Montague, p.85; Romeo then Fr. Lawrence at the tomb p.259 (transposed).
motif 5: association unclear

appearances: Queen Mab speech, p.27-28; Juliet with phial, p.223

motif 6: associated with Paris

appearances: Paris and Capulet, p.12; Paris enters, p.240 (transposed).

motif 7: associated with the Capulets

appearances: Introduction to Act 1 scene 2, Capulet's House, p.40; Romeo approaches Capulet's monument, p.245.
motif 8: associated with Romeo's longing

appearances: Romeo and Juliet on the balcony, p.94-96, 97-98 (transposed); Romeo's aria at the tomb p.250 (transposition of 1st phrase), 252 (transposition of 2nd phrase.)
From Table 3 it can be seen that, as in Stella, no recurring motifs have a sufficiently significant role to be labelled the principle thematic material of the opera. Only motif 1, that which seems generally associated with the hatred of the feud and its tragic results, seems to appear with any regularity. Two other motifs, associated generally with the hope and longing of the lovers, motifs 2 and 3, recur occasionally, five other motifs recur once or twice. There is no attempt to relate, by interplay of motifs the interplay of the chief ideas of the drama. The great majority of the motivic shapes are local to the arias, trios, choruses or scenes in which they first occur, and the motivic returns are sporadic.

In general, Marshall-Hall's thematic invention is richer here than in any of the previous operas. Motif 1 is concentrated and direct, its falling line highly effective for the tragedy it portrays. Motif 2 has an anxious throbbing quality which, by extension, gives rise to some soaring, radiant gestures in the balcony scene, not at all inferior to similar moments in Puccini. Motif 3 is given a lush, static quality by its harmonic and textural treatment, which employs parallel chords not unlike those of Debussy's music, with which the composer was by now familiar. The music of Juliet's 'I have a faint cold fear', act 3, and the Queen Mab speech, act 1 scene 1, display a striking flair for orchestral colour used for dramatic effect, and are perhaps the most imaginative music in all Marshall-Hall's operas:

1A.E.J. Lee had sent him Debussy scores, which had been performed at the Melbourne Orchestral Concerts.
In addition, Romeo and Juliet's scene on the balcony, 'Ah me - she speaks', act 2 scene 1, is a large, freely-designed, sectional piece, moving easily from lyric to declamatory sections, and full of lyrical beauty, perhaps the finest, most tender scene in all his music.
As in Stella, there are a number of complete harmonic movements in the score, and the transitional sections become longer as the work progresses. The Queen Mab speech spends a deal of time prolonging $\cdot \quad$ Eb, as are the chorus 'Youth's the season made for joys', act 1 scene 2, in G; the three English dances in C, G and F; the trio 'What lady's that', act 1 scene 2 in Eb; Romeo and Juliet's 'Ah Juliet if thy measure', act 2 scene 2, in Eb; and the orchestral introduction to act 3 in B. After the introduction of act 3 there is no other complete harmonic movement, the whole of act 3 and act 4 being structurally progressive movements. There is no clear overall tonal structure, each scene being a progressive movement harmonically, except act 2 scene 2, which is structurally a complete movement in Eb, and there is no larger tonal planning evident in the individual acts or the work as a whole. The level of harmonic complexity is more consistent than Stella, because less emphasis is placed on the use of contrast of musical idiom for dramatic effect. In its place, dramatic effect is achieved by sustained harmonic elaborations and prolongations in which cadences are delayed again and again, by elisions in which a new direction is suddenly adopted or a new theme suddenly announced, and by movement of the harmonic scheme independently of the tonal design. The abundance of local themes which form the thematic structure are set against a harmonic structure which does not point to a succession of 'numbers' or closed forms.

Marshall-Hall hoped Romeo and Juliet would be considered the first genuine English opera. ¹ A page from Romeo and Juliet's radiant music at the balcony, act 2 scene 1, was cut in marble and set on the composer's grave in 1915.² There is

²In Brighton Cemetary, Melbourne.
no doubt that it is the finest of his operas, the most imaginative in design, the most effective in orchestration, and the richest in thematic quality. The tonal design, while lacking the logic of some of the earlier scores, adds a quality of joyous outpouring, and the interplay between tonal design and thematic scheme adds a quality of intensity and energy, combining to produce - at last - a compelling musical counterpart to the qualities the composer had envied in Streeton a decade before. Musically, the score may be described as a fluent assimilation of Puccini's techniques to the temperament of the English Wagnerites.

The balcony scene, act 2 scene 1, was performed at the Conservatorium 'Scenes from opera' on 14th December 1912 at Her Majesty's Theatre, Melbourne, drawing a favourable response from the critics. ¹ Despite persistent efforts to have the work produced in Europe during his subsequent stay there, no other performance eventuated. The work has never been given complete.

When Marshall-Hall finished Romeo and Juliet, he seemed to believe his European fame was certain. He arranged Shakespeare's As you like it into a libretto, in preparation for writing a musical arrangement as a sequel if Romeo and Juliet was a success. ² At some stage too, he sketched a libretto for an opera based on Shakespeare's The Tempest on the blank pages of an old proof-copy of Aristodemus. ³ He evidently intended to use the same procedure as for Romeo and Juliet, creating a libretto by using the original Shakespeare text with certain omissions. From a printed edition of the Shakespeare text, he

² Letter, Marshall-Hall to Barrett, 12th December 1912 GM.
³ NL, JAF 111690:55.
pasted in the stage instructions for Act 1, scene 1, which he intended to be 'scenic only'; the dialogue of Prospero and Miranda, Act 1, scene 2, which he abbreviated by cutting out sections and crossing out individual phrases; the dialogue of Act 1, scene 3 and Act 4, scene 1, edited in the same way.  

Facing page 23-24 of Aristodemus, the following summary of his plan is found, in the autograph hand:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Act 1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sc.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prospero Miranda</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot; &quot; &quot; Ariel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot; &quot; &quot; Caliban</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot; &quot; &quot; Ferdinand</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sc. II</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Alonso etc</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot; Ariel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Caliban</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot; Trinalo</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Act II</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sc.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ferdinand</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot; &quot; &quot; Miranda(&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot; &quot; &quot; Prospero</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Caliban, Sliph, Trinc.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Alonso etc |
| " Prospero |
| " Ariel |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Act III</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Prospero</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot; Ferdinand</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot; &quot; &quot; &quot; Ariel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot; &quot; &quot; &quot; Alonso etc</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot; &quot; &quot; &quot; &quot; &quot; Caliban etc</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It is interesting that the composer conceived of an opera of very formal groups and stylised interchanges, in the manner of Alcestis and Aristodemus, even where the librettist was no less than Shakespeare. There is no evidence that he ever proceeded with a musical setting of the work, other than the curious existence in the estate of an overture to The Tempest attributed on its title page to G. Hurst.

\[\text{\textsuperscript{1}}\text{ibid. pp.6, 7, 8, 9, 11, 12, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19.}\]
At the end of 1912, Marshall-Hall made plans for immediate departure for Europe, appointing Eduard Scharf as Acting Director of the Conservatorium for 1913 and Fritz Hart, a young English musician trained at the Royal College of Music, to give his lectures during a 'temporary absence'.\textsuperscript{1} Privately Marshall-Hall had decided on a permanent departure from Melbourne, and by borrowing a large sum and counting on his son Hubert to support him by working in London orchestras, he estimated he could survive abroad for four years, by which time he felt sure Stella and Romeo and Juliet would have provided him with a comfortable income.\textsuperscript{2} The progressive entrepreneurs, Moody, Manners and Company, London, had agreed to undertake Stella, and A. Levey, horn player in Marshall-Hall's orchestra turned entrepreneur, had taken the score to San Fransisco.\textsuperscript{3}

Now began the most unhappy period of Marshall-Hall's life. In isolation in Australia, he had achieved prestige as a composer which led him to a complete miscalculation of the English musical scene and his importance and potential there. In one way, much was the same as when he had left in 1891: Parry, Stanford, and MacKenzie still held prominent positions. But a new generation was rising to prominence, headed by Vaughan Williams: Arnold Bax, Cyril Scott, Gustave Holst, Delius, Frank Bridge, and Percy Grainger were already making headway, all with their own aims and methods, and none adhered to the old Wagnerian credo or saw Puccini as the path to the future as Marshall-Hall did. The English nationalist movement of the 1880s and 90s was now bearing its first fruit, and musical life in England was in ferment. Towering above all was the figure of Edward Elgar, who for over a decade had enjoyed an international reputation.\textsuperscript{4}

If English musical life was transformed, on the Continent a more violent change was taking place. In 1913, the celebrated riot

\textsuperscript{1}Prospectus, Melbourne Conservatorium, 1913, MC.
\textsuperscript{2}Letter to Barrett, 4th February 1913, GM. He had borrowed 245 pounds on his life insurance and had 275 pounds from the Con.
\textsuperscript{3}Letter to Barrett, 5th January 1913.
\textsuperscript{4}Ernest Newman 'The War and the future of music' Musical Times September 1914
at the premiere of Stravinsky's *Rite of Spring* took place in Paris, the innovations of Debussy had received considerable prominence, and Schoenberg's circle in Vienna was gaining uneasy attention.¹

It is not surprising therefore, that Marshall-Hall's arrival in London in 1913, bringing operas and beliefs born of an old-fashioned philosophy, did not attract immediate attention. In May, Moody, Manners and Company announced they could not undertake *Stella*²; in June, Ricordi and Company, one of the largest publishers of opera in Europe, ridiculed *Romeo and Juliet* by offering to buy all the rights for one guinea.³ The provincial opera companies would not risk new works because of their precarious budgets, and the larger companies needed vast sums as guarantees. News of the successful performance of *Alcestis* in Meissen, Germany in June brought the proposal of a publication of that score in Germany, and *Romeo and Juliet* was recommended to the Intendant of the Stadt-Theater, Nuremberg.⁴ But in October, these projects too fell through.⁵

He did not give up hope easily. When in December 1913 it was realised in Melbourne that he was not planning to return, and Barrett conveyed to him fears that the Conservatorium would not survive without him, Marshall-Hall simply sent word that, if the Conservatorium closed, fittings and pianos would have to be sold to meet their debts to him.⁶ Fritz Hart.

¹William Austin *Music in the twentieth century* New York, 1965

²Letter, Marshall-Hall to Barrett, 8th May 1913, GM.

³Letter, Marshall-Hall to Barrett, 6th June, 1913, GM.

⁴Letter, Marshall-Hall to Franz Dierich, circa June 1913, undated, GM.

⁵Letter, Marshall-Hall to Dierich, 23rd October, 1913, GM.

⁶Letter, Marshall-Hall to Barrett, 12th December 1913, GM.
evidently interpreted this message as an outright instruction to close the Conservatorium, and resolved to obtain the Directorship himself to continue the enterprise.¹

In the following year, 1914, matters progressed no further for Marshall-Hall. The progressive young Thomas Beecham apparently studied and was impressed with the scores of Stella and Romeo and Juliet, but he demanded a 500 pound guarantee to back his production of them, a sum beyond the composer's already strained means.² Approaches to Albert Coates of St. Petersburg and firms in Cologne produced no response³, and Levey's plans for an American production of Stella fell through. Poor health put the composer in bed for several weeks and began to dampen his morale.⁴ In 1914 the Great War began, and Marshall-Hall applied for the army. But he was not to be released from his problems so easily: he was rejected for poor teeth.⁵

In June 1914, largely through the continuing efforts of Levey, Stella went on stage at a variety theatre, the London Palladium, and was howled off in only one week.⁶ Marshall-Hall deluded himself into believing that the cuts he had been required to make in scene 3 had caused the failure of the whole drama, having removed much of the tragic impact.⁷ But

¹Letter, Basil Hart (F. Hart’s son) to Mrs. D. Kiddina, 31st August, 1975, MC.
²Letter, Marshall-Hall to Barrett, 1st January 1914, GM.
³Letter, A.E.J. Lee to Barrett, 3rd May, 1914, GM.
⁴Letter, Marshall-Hall to Barrett, 17th February, 1914, GM.
⁵Letter, Marshall-Hall to Barrett, 30th May 1914.
⁷Letter, Marshall-Hall to Barrett, 12th June, 1914, GM.
the type of music which succeeded at the Palladium was a type that Marshall-Hall had always despised - operetta and music-hall - and no amount of adjustment would have made Stella suitable for such a venue.

The failure of Stella was the final blow to the composer’s hopes for London success. Running short of money and in poor health, Marshall-Hall contemplated applying for the vacant Chair of Music at Sydney University, or seeking work as a journalist. But he remained determined to 'Write two more operas' - possibly meaning 'As you like it' and The Trojan Women, to which reference is made in his letters.

Just when matters seemed hopeless, Marshall-Hall's fortunes in Melbourne changed magically. Franklin Peterson died, leaving the composer's old professorship vacant, and Barrett quickly collected a petition of 1300 signatures to have Marshall-Hall reinstated. On 6th July 1914, the University Council offered Marshall-Hall his old job, despite Lepher's efforts to have the issue delayed on a procedural matter.

Marshall-Hall was amused and greatly relieved by this. He cabled his acceptance to Barrett, and resolved to remain in Europe till December to absorb the new music of Delius, Debussy, Grainger and other 'futurists' he had heard. He planned to reunite the two Conservatoriums, to perform and teach new music, and to bring out Fischer Sobell, (possibly the same Sobell who had sung A song cycle of life and love

---

1 Ibid.
2 Letter Marshall-Hall to Barrett, 3rd July 1914, GM.
3 vide Appendix II
4 Petition, typescript, GM.
5 Minutes, University Council, CR.
6 Telegram, Marshall-Hall to Barrett, 29th June 1914, NL. 'Yes will accept offer MH'.
7 Letter, Marshall-Hall to Barrett, 3rd July 1914, GM.
in the composer's student days in London).

The shock of Marshall-Hall's stay in England must have been considerable. It is hardly surprising that he fell creatively silent after *Romeo and Juliet*, and no work is known to have been completed from then till his death in 1915. Nor was he able to be honest about the situation, beyond the frankness of his sad letters to Barrett. On 24th January 1915, when he arrived back in Melbourne, he told the local papers that the war had postponed his *Romeo and Juliet*, and that his latest work, *The Trojan Women*, would be given in March. Even worse, he tried to take advantage of the ignorance of the local community by making inflated claims for his friend Fischer Sobell, the 'discoverer' of the 'Principle of Relaxation' in vocal training. Sobell, a figure of little importance in London, could nevertheless have thrived on this recommendation in Melbourne. But for once the claims were ably refuted in the press by M. Hannagan, a singing teacher trained at the Royal Academy of Music, who had settled in Hobart.

Back at the University lectern, Marshall-Hall delivered an Inaugural Lecture entitled 'Ideal and real: Anarchy in music' which, according to *The Argus*:

...will maintain his reputation. It exhibited the same genuine and admirable artistic fervour, the same amiable and harmless truculence, and the same coruscating Aurora Australis of unsubstantiated rhetoric...

After his two years of complete failure in Europe, it is valuable to compare his ideas, as expressed in this lecture, with his previously-held theories. His statements on creativity and emotion in music may be summarised as below in Abstract 15.

---

1 Letter, Marshall-Hall to Barrett, 5th July, 1914, GM.
3 M. Hannagan "New discoveries" in music: Professor Marshall-Hall classified' *Daily Post* (Hobart) 27th April 1915
4 *The Argus* editorial, 20th May 1915. The lecture appears in the same issue.
ABSTRACT 15

MARSHALL-HALL'S .VIEWS ON : CREATIVITY AND EMOTION IN MUSIC AFTER 1911

1. Music expresses the world of subconscious life energy, the ideal beauty of the imagination.¹

2. Creation involves, not the use of known techniques, but communion with this ideal realm.²

3. Realism in British education caused the severance of British musicians from British life, and accounts for Britain's low musical achievement.³

¹ 'Music gives utterance to those strange sub-conscious powers those instinctive movements of the will, which lie behind and beyond processes of thought...music reveals to us the reality behind all phenomena...the form of ideal beauty which Nature endeavours vainly to produce, but bungles in her amateurish haste; the miracle of active energy'. 'Ideal and real', loc. cit.

² 'The life which art loves and ponders over and reproduces in her myriad forms of beauty is the life of the imagination...The type of mind which peers with indefeasible curiosity into the mystery beyond has always existed side by side with that of the other conventional type, which regards with holy horror all attempts to transcend traditional limitations' 'Ideal and real', loc. cit. When Parry writes: 'No doubt a primitive savage might be inspired with feelings very much like those of some modern composers; but the means and the knowledge how to express these feelings in terms of art would be lacking' (p. 250), Marshall-Hall replies: 'Not at all. The art would be different in complexity, etc., so would the emotions of the savage' Annotations in Parry's Evolution of the Art of Music, loc. cit.

³ 'It is chiefly owing to the realistic trend of our education and habits of thought that we British have accomplished so little in the most ideal of arts...The English folksong spirit...that beautiful, healthy, carefree life, which has become well nigh lost to us, thanks to the blighting curse of Puritanism...died out amid the degrading imbecilities of the Victorian Royalty ballad - that one sole link between the drawing-room and the slum. Then came the complete severance of the earnest English musician from English music, from English musical life and thought and feeling. He fled to Germany for consolation in his despair, and adopted German ways of thinking and German technique 'Ideal and real', loc. cit.'
These writings must be viewed in the light of the composer’s experience of the new currents in Europe at that time. He had heard Debussy’s *Pelléas et Mélisande*, and been deeply impressed,¹ he was similarly taken with Delius,² though he made no mention of Scriabin, Stravinsky, or Schoenberg, whose music was known to his English friend A.E.J. Lee.³ But his views of creativity and emotion in music had remained quite unaffected by the new music, while his old view of the poor state of British musical life and the education system’s supposed accountability for it had reappeared after a long absence. He had used this view in the 1880s as a justification for his failures in the London musical world at that time, and it was advanced, now in much the same role.

Marshall-Hall’s escape from the present reality into past idealism had a parallel when he spoke of society and music’s role in it. He had seen some of the war close at hand in 1914, and had been appalled.⁴ This experience, produced ideas which may be summarised as below, Abstract 16.

¹Letter, Marshall-Hall to Barrett, 13th June, 1913, GM.
²Letter, Marshall-Hall to Barrett, 5th July, 1914, GM.
³Letter, A.E.J. Lee to Barrett, 3rd June 1914, GM.
⁴Letter, Marshall-Hall to Divide (?) 20th August, 1914, GM.
ABSTRACT 16

MARSHALL-HALL'S 'VIEWS ON MUSIC'S ROLE IN SOCIETY AFTER 1914

1. The war is an atonement for society's lack of idealism. ¹
2. The present social upheaval will give rise to new outlooks and forms, of equal value with the old. ²

¹ 'European civilization bears on its brow the shameful brand of realism - and is not ashamed. And Europe today is atoning for her desertion of hope-crowned idealism for the cold cruel pitiless creed of the realist, by the wholesale slaughter of her youth, the destruction of her precious monuments, the massacre of entire populations... Do we everywhere see the honest man prosper in high positions, while the clever rascal is kept within bounds and forbidden any more to roam a beast of prey? And all this is the work of the happy despiser of idealism, of the realist...' 'Ideal and real' The Argus March 20, 1915. 'I believe the distress all over Europe will be so great that the starving working classes will combine against all militarism and uncontrolled capital... The war has killed all musical enterprises in this country.' Letter, Marshall-Hall to ?, 20th August, 1914, GM. Our whole system of education is tainted with over-realism, and we are letting its fatal poison instil into the minds of our children.' 'Ideal and Real', loc. cit.

² 'The vast social upheaval slowly taking place around us is giving rise to new outlooks and forms of art other than those which satisfied our fathers - not for that the less perfectly beautiful... surely the most atrocious cacophony of the future? Of futurists cannot be so dangerous to sanity as the weird result of the perspiring classicist's sonata-manufacture? Any form of death is preferable to that by boarding house hash.' 'Ideal and real', loc. cit.
As in his previous effusions on music and society, vide Abstract 6, his explanation of the causes of war is immature and far-fetched: on this part of his lecture, The Aragu was not far from the truth in its criticism. Especially in his last years, he seemed unable to reconcile the expansive art of his own youth and adulthood with the realities of depression, poverty, and the suffering of the mass of people that he felt somehow in need of ennoblement. Having passed quite close to real poverty himself in 1913-14, his ideas became not more practical, but more rhapsodic. Their irrationality suggests that his return to Europe from isolation was as great a crisis artistically as the isolation itself was at first. Shocked by failure, by war, and engulfed by the new ideas that had developed in his absence, it is no wonder he could not embrace the situation with the energetic enthusiasm of Henry Wood, Thomas Beecham or other progressive English musicians of the day.

In 1915, Marshall-Hall found Melbourne's musical problems little different from when he had left. The orchestral concert management and the musician's union were deadlocked, for four of his principal players would not join the union, and he felt obligated to stand by them. ¹ The two Conservatoriums could not be united, despite much discussion. Hart, now directing the Melbourne Conservatorium, was developing his own policies, introducing concerts of student compositions, and making plans to conduct his own operas. ² When Marshall-Hall's negotiations

¹Letter, Marshall-Hall to Barrett, 9th April 1915, GM.

²Diary, Melbourne Conservatorium, 1913-15, MC, lists programmes of a lighter character than those Marshall-Hall had arranged, together with Student Concert Programmes, including a student work of Margaret Sutherland. The Ms. scores of Hart's music, together with his papers and momentos are in the Australiana Wing, Latrobe Library, Melbourne.
with Hart failed, five of his old staff, including the principal singing teacher Mme. Wiedermann, and the principal piano teacher Edward Coll, left Hart and joined the University Conservatorium. This defection incensed Melba, who interpreted the move as a wartime attempt by enemy nations to injure an Englishman. It was one of the factors which finally led the diva to give her own services to Hart's Conservatorium. ¹

But Marshall-Hall's difficulties soon came to a sudden and unexpected end. In July 1915 he was taken gravely ill with appendicitis, and after surgery he contracted peritonitis. He died in Mount St. Evin's Private Hospital, Melbourne, on 18th July 1915, at the age of 53. At his death it seems likely that As you like it was in sketch form only, and with The Trojan Women, is not extant. The Tempest was never completed.

All that remains visible today of Marshall-Hall's work is a fine portrait of him by Tom Roberts (1900), hanging in the Grainger Museum at the University of Melbourne together with a bust of him given by an anonymous admirer; and a small plaque in the entrance foyer to the present University Music Faculty, noting that a wing of the building added in 1936 was dedicated in his honour. ² The fine portrait of him, painted by E. Phillips Fox only two weeks before he died, is lost (plate facing title

---


² Funded by Mrs. Herbert Brookes, a former pupil, vide James W. Barrett, Professor Marshall-Hall Melbourne, 1936.
A few friends provided funds after his death to publish the funeral oration of Herbert Brookes. His second wife, Catherine suffered a mental collapse in 1936 and died in 1940; Elsa, the daughter by his first wife, and Hubert, the son by his second, are still alive.

---

3 Len Fox E. Phillips Fox: notes and recollections N.S.W., 1969 p. 28. In the artist's own estimation, one of his finest.

4 In Memoriam G.W.L. Marshall-Hall. An elegy spoken at the graveside of the late Professor G.W.L. Marshall-Hall... Melbourne, 1915

5 Hubert Marshall-Hall to Grainger, June 4th 1936, LC; Inscription and records, Baptist Section, Brighton Cemetery, Melbourne.
CONCLUSION

Marshall-Hall is a highly interesting example of the response of a European composer of the late XIXth century to transplantation from Europe and isolation in a new society. Unable to find an artistic expression for the young Australian nation, he conceived his music in imitation of the styles of his parent civilization, as he saw it best represented by Wagner's and Puccini's operas. Cushioned by great distance from the turmoil of Europe in the first two decades of the XXth century, his scores - which were of undoubted merit - became increasingly irrelevant to European musical development.

The two operas of his student days, Leonard, pre-1883, and Dido, pre-1885, composed in England, had been consciously undertaken as exercises for later scores. Only the latter survives in a complete score, showing a half-understood attempt at imitation of Wagner's musico-dramatic style. The libretto polarises Vergil's story into a carnal conquest, and the whole is an assembly of separate numbers, superficially linked by transitions and a few recurring themes. The structure is tonally ill-considered and formally unbalanced.

As a young man, Marshall-Hall had joined the chorus of English musicians in the 1870s and 80s who believed Wagner's music dramas to be supreme amongst musical forms and who felt the creation of English equivalents to be of major importance for English music. Deeply moved by Wagner's portrayal of intense human passion and pain, Marshall-Hall imagined opera as a great moral teacher and social reformer, which would raise the common man to noble and heroic acts. Adopting Wagner's theories to suit himself, he developed in his own theoretical writings an extreme position in which composition involved communion with a sub-conscious world from which musical form emerged spontaneously, forcing itself on the composer. It was a convenient philosophy for one without much formal musical training, for it absolved him from
conscious consideration of musical form in his own music.

Not surprisingly, Harold, pre-1888, his first full-scale opera, shows a detailed attempt at imitating Wagner's leitmotiven technique, by relating the interplay of recurring themes to the interplay of ideas in the drama, but an arbitrary tonal design and little evidence of an attempt to integrate the leitmotiven network with the large-scale structure. Harold may be compared with Stanford's and Cowen's essays of the same period, in which episodes from English history or Romantic fiction were pressed into the service of creating English opera in Wagner's image. In all of them admirable material is spoilt by a stilted libretto and a lack of skill with large-scale musico-dramatic form.

In his first years in Australia, practical experience and much harsh criticism modified Marshall-Hall's view of music as a great social reformer. Art, it seemed, was an end in itself, and the common man was rarely in the audience anyway. A new direction appeared in his work under the influence of the local painters Arthur Streeton and Ernest Moffitt. The Heidelberg School of the late 1880s and early 90s in Melbourne convinced Marshall-Hall that the Australian country throbbed with a sunny mirth and lightheartedness which was as worthy of artistic representation as the intense passion and pain of Romantic love. But he soon discovered that musical and poetic equivalents of Streeton's canvases would not emerge from his sub-conscious and force themselves on him spontaneously as he felt sure they should. His first years in Australia were years of struggle and artistic crisis for him. His next two operas represented a return to his former Romantic ideas, but with a new-found maturity and originality.

Alcestis, 1898, the first of his operas composed in Australia, retreats from his earlier slavish imitation of Wagner, for the main characters each have signature themes, but there is no longer a rigourous leitmotiven fabric. It
has a considered musical design, a single key scheme, and
sections of material adopted from Harold - the first of
Marshall-Hall's operas with a consciously considered musical
form. Furthermore, Alcestis was an interesting experiment in
revival of the ancient stage, using Euripides' original Greek
text, and combining the spoken lines with sung choruses, all
set against an orchestral fabric. The dramatic highpoint
calls forth a single burst into solo song, an aria for
Alcestis on her deathbed. Despite its melodramatic format,
Alcestis may be regarded as operatic in the sense that the
music fundamentally affects the drama, polarising it into a
Romantic fable of heroic death and magical resurrection.

Aristodemus, 1902, was cast in the same mould as Alcestis,
but without solo song at all. It cannot be strictly considered
as opera, but rather as a rare hybrid form: eight choral
movements separated by melodramatic interludes. It has
better orchestral writing than before, a single key scheme and
a tonal design which divides the whole into four large sections
by key change and caesura. A small group of freely-recurring
themes underlie the interplay of the two chief dramatic
ideas. But the text is a bluntly moralistic piece, uniformly
bleak in mood, and the music fails to articulate or define
the miserable libretto in any effective way. Its bloody
dénouement, like the composer's controversial poems of the
same period, depends simply on shock for its impact - an
impact that has paled with time. It was an enduring flaw
in Marshall-Hall's art that he believed the portrayal of
extremes of human emotion, such as the agony of death or the
ecstasy of love-making, to be inherently profound.

Despite the experience of these two operas, Marshall-Hall
continued to profess in his writings the belief that composition
was a spontaneous act, and to refuse to acknowledge the
possibility of intellectually-conceived musical form. He
justified his own flourish of abstract instrumental composition
in the 1900s by asserting that 'abstract' music as such did not exist, and trying to catalogue specific extra-musical equivalents for orchestral sounds to prove his point.

In the same years, he discovered in the operas of Puccini the musical mirth and intuitive freedom he had sought while striving to imitate Streeton's work a decade before. He saw that the quality he had been seeking could be achieved not by the spontaneous combination of ideas, but by intensification of a single melodic line into a fabric of constant tension, from which sudden explosive change was possible. *Stella*, 1910, conceived in imitation of Puccini's style, departed radically from the palette of his previous operas. Various styles are manipulated to dramatic effect, by sudden change of level of harmonic complexity. Few themes recur consistently. Structurally, a series of closed harmonic movements are separated by transitions which become progressively longer, turning the final scene into a single continuous movement.

Specific orchestral devices of Puccini may be seen. The piece has a bright Australian setting, but an icy social commentary at its deepest level, reflecting on the forces in Melbourne society which brought about the composer's own controversial dismissal from the University ten years before.

In *Romeo and Juliet*, 1912, the only one of his last three operatic projects to be finished, the composer arrives at an individual synthesis of Wagner's and Puccini's musico-dramatic styles, which is his major musical achievement. Condensing directly from the lines of Shakespeare's tragedy a libretto of four acts, making four expansive *tableaux* for the two lovers surrounded by a skeleton of action, Marshall-Hall wrote with a warmth and thematic strength that is the finest in his music. There are a few recurring motives, but most themes are local to the scene in which they first occur. There is no single key scheme, but drama is achieved through sudden elision of cadence, sudden prolongation or delay, and the
vitality produced by the working of a thematic structure of numbers against a continuous tonal pallette.

Returning to live in England in 1913, Marshall-Hall was confronted with new faces and ideas on the music scene which were quickly obliterating the world of Wagner and Puccini to which he was committed. On his earlier visits to Europe he had ignored new currents, convinced that traditional musical life was simply in the doldrums. Now he retreated further into past idealism, reiterating his younger ideas more irrationally than before. The artistic shock he experienced in his last years, suddenly overtaken by new European developments, brought his creative work to a standstill. He began work on three new operas, *As you like it*, *The Tempest*, and *The Trojan Women*, but none were completed. From the time he left for England, 1912, till his death in 1915, no work is known to have been finished.
APPENDIX I

CATALOGUE OF LITERARY WORKS

The following is an alphabetical catalogue of the published poetry, drama, lectures, letters, criticisms, and articles of G.W.L. Marshall-Hall, together with a list of the unpublished poems. Previous attempts to catalogue the literary works of the composer have been limited to his published drama and collections of poetry. ¹

For the published work, locations of exemplars in Australian, English, and North American libraries are given. Certain items of very slight length or where authorship is in doubt - and this includes most of the programme notes for the Marshall-Hall Orchestral Concerts - have been omitted.

In the unpublished work, the first line is given where no title is indicated in the Ms. Sigla for the GM Marshall-Hall collection were under compilation at the time of presentation of this thesis, so here Mss. are identified by brief descriptive note. It appears that a book of poems, containing at least twelve items not duplicated elsewhere, has been removed from the GM collection. For these poems, only titles from a secondary source could be given.


/Awake! awake! the spite of morn.../p.2
Corpus et Anima p.7-9
History p.6
/I have lost my strength/ loose sheet
/In the stainless tranquil sky/ p.12-13
On a Portrait p.14
/O that the heavy pain/that lies../p.1
To Night p.10-11
To Spring p.3
To the Pines on Asylum-Hill, Kew at Daybreak p.4-5

2. Unpublished verses from the music (i) GM _______ Manuscript song with music by Hubert Marshall-Hall and words by G.W.L. Marshall-Hall. Contents:

Lament of a Flower

(ii) GM _______ p.8 of the manuscript score of 2nd movement of the String Quartet /in C/
Contents:

When from the treetops

3. Lost unpublished poems. According to Percy Grainger 'Music in the Grainger Museum - from Mrs Marshall-Hall' Compositions by G.W.L. Marshall-Hall' typescript annotated in Grainger's hand, GM, a 'Book of Poems' was acquired, containing the following unica:

Chartersville
Chartersville Idyl
Cremorne,...
Elysium
In the Orchard
Lolage

Spring

Tempus fugit

Thyrsis

To the gods/'A canticle to the gods'? A book of canticles p.66/

To Helena

To Melancholy

To Rone

4. Published poems GM(i). Marshall-Hall's scrapbook of newspaper cuttings contains the following poems from unidentified published sources. Diplomatic factors would indicate they are from London newspapers or magazines prior to 1891.

The Beautiful (republished in A book of canticles p.63)

The Call of Genius

Courage then!

To Death (republished in A book of canticles p.38)

Loves spring

Persephone (republished in A book of canticles p.40)

Xenien

(ii). In The Bookfellow (Sydney) no.3, 25th March 1899 pp.13-15, with commentary by the composer:

From Cremorne Point

5. Published collections of poetry,drama

Aristodemus: a tragedy Melbourne: The Atlas Press /ca.1900/ 47pp, 4o,paper cover. Exemplars in GM,LL,ML,NL,BU. The GM and one of the two NL copies are proof copies, interleaved with blank pages.


autograph of the poem 'On the Mask of Mary by Michelagnolo /sic/ containing a stanza not in the published version, is in the ML Ah 102, (Stephens), together with an unidentified published cutting of the poem.

Extracts from the published works of Professor Marshall-Hall Carlton: Ford and Sons, 1900. 4pp, foolscap unbound pamphlet. Letter / Confidential to the Senate, University of Melbourne / from J. Redford Corr. Exemplar in LL.


6. Published articles, lectures, letters

'An appeal' letter to the editor The Musical World nov. 15th 1890, vol. 70, no. 46, p. 910

'Art in Australia: the place of the musician' The Age 18th May 1915. From a lecture 'The sensuous and poetic in music'

'The artist' The Argus 4th July 1891

'The artist and his critics' The Musical World 12th April 1890 vol. 70 no. 14 p.

'The Bayreuth performances. "Parsifal" its teaching and noble aim' Magazine of Music September 1888 vol. 5, no. 9, p. 218-20

'Beethoven's Mass in D at the last Richter concert' Magazine of Music August 1888 vol. 5 no. 8, p. 184-85


'Curiosity and music' address at Athenaeum Hall, Melbourne, undated. Exemplar in NL, Hince Collection.

'The essential in art' Alma mater May, June, July, August 1899, April, May, June, July 1900, vol. 4 nos. 3, 4, 5, 6, vol. 5 nos. 1, 2, 3, 4, pp. 24-28, 40-48, 9-13, 11, 13, vol. 5 pp. 9ff, 61f, 110-114, 161f.


'Ethics and bootblacking' The Argus 25th July 1908
'Form of a symphony' Programme notes, 104th and 105th Orchestral Subscription Concerts, Melbourne, 3rd June, 24th June 1911. Exemplars in MC.

'Genius' The Musical World 13 July 1889 vol. 69 no. 28, p. 446

'Ideal and real' The Argus 20th March 1915

'The letter and spirit of music' School...

'Madame Butterfly' review of performance in Sydney The Argus 7th October 1910?

'Music in Australia, present and future: a chat about artists, critics and public' Australia Today Special number of The Australasian Traveller 1st November 1910 p. 55-70

'Music in Berlin' The Argus 26th January, 9th February, 16th February, 23rd February, 9th March, 15th March, 30th March, 20th April, 27th April, 1907

'Music: a development of speech' The Musical World December 22nd 1888 vol. 68 no. 50 p. 978

'Music and man' School...

'Music in Paris' The Argus 18th May 1907

'The music of the people' The Star letter to the editor 31st May 1889

'Music: its place and work in our lives' Magazine of Music June 1888 vol. 5 no. 6 p. 137

'Music as a religious force' School...

'Music: some faults in our education system' Magazine of Music July 1888 vol. 5 no. 7 p. 154-55

'Music: tone-poetry' Magazine of Music August 1888 vol. 5 no. 8 p. 199-200

'National music' letter to the editor School...

'National opera' unidentified newspaper cutting

'The orchestra; its mystic voices' The Argus 9th April 1910 and Programme notes, 106th Orchestral Subscription Concert, Melbourne, 11th August 1910. Exemplars in NL, MC

'The professor, the student and Wagner' School...

/Programme notes/ 'Scene from Dido; a dramatic cantata' 2nd Orchestral Subscription Concert 1899/ Exemplar in MC.
Programme notes/ Eb Symphony 55th Orchestral Subscription Concert 28th May 1904.

Programme notes/ Mozart Commemoration Concert, 29th June 1907

Programme notes/ Eb Symphony Special Concert 10th July 1908

Programme notes/Orchestral Subscription concerts, 13th May, 24th June, 5th August 1911

Prospectus, Melbourne Conservatorium of Music, Melbourne, 1901, 1902, 03, 04, 05, 06, 07, 08, 09, 10, 11, 12.

Prospectus University of Melbourne Conservatorium of Music, Melbourne, 1895, 96, 97, 98, 99.

'Songs of thought and feeling' School... September, 1889

'The story of Parsifal/ arranged from the music drama of R. Wagner' Magazine of Music September 1888 vol.5 no.9 p.218-20

To the Chancellor and Council of Melbourne University Melbourne: W.H. Newlands, 1898 unbound pamphlet 8pp

'To the editor of The Argus' The Argus 4th July 1891

'To the editor of The Argus' The Argus 20th April 1908

'To the editor of The Musical World' The Musical World 6th February 1888 (signed Siegfried: IT'; identified as 'G.W.L.M-H' in composer's hand on cutting in his scrapbook, GM)

'What progress has England made in music during the last ten years?' School...
APPENDIX II

CATALOGUE OF MUSIC

The following catalogue is divided into two parts, the first giving a Chronology for all the music of Marshall-Hall, the second a Thematic Catalogue for the operas.

Many of the autograph Mss. are undated, and dates of composition often had to be deduced from diplomatic evidence or secondary sources, as indicated in the notes following the Chronology. The String Quartet in D, the operetta Leonard, and six of the eight Ms. vocal scores of Stella have not survived the passing of sixty years, and it is quite possible other works have vanished. Furthermore, attempts in the past to catalogue the music have all been inaccurate to some degree.\(^1\) Percy Grainger listed sources for the Overture to Giordano Bruno; the String Quartet in C, Alcestis, and some songs under more than one title;\(^2\) others have followed his example.\(^3\)

---


The Thematic Catalogue for the operas attempts to give a comprehensive picture of the extant sources, published and unpublished, and their locations in Australia, England, and the U.S.A. The incipits are taken from the autograph full scores, and where no full score exists from another source as indicated. Incipits are given for the opening measures, the opening notes of the vocal part, and each significant caesura in each opera, in their 'thematic' voices.

Sigla for the GM Marshall-Hall collection were under compilation at the time of presentation of this thesis. Where possible, the new sigla have been given, elsewhere Mss. are identified by brief descriptive note.

ABBREVIATIONS

e  excerpt
l  libretto
n.t.  no tempo indicated

(For library abbreviations see p.8 )
### I. CHRONOLOGY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Work</th>
<th>Completion</th>
<th>Publication</th>
<th>First Performance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Opera, operetta, music drama</td>
<td>ca. 1883(^1)</td>
<td></td>
<td>date unknown(^2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leonard</td>
<td>before 1885(^3)</td>
<td></td>
<td>1899(^4) 11th Oct.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dido</td>
<td>before 1888(^5)</td>
<td>1888(^6)(^e)</td>
<td>1888(^7) 2nd Feb.(^e)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harold</td>
<td>1898(^8)</td>
<td></td>
<td>1898(^9) 22nd June</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alcestis</td>
<td>1902(^10)</td>
<td>ca. 1900(^11)(^e)</td>
<td>1901(^12) 29th July (^e)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aristodemus</td>
<td>1910(^13)</td>
<td></td>
<td>1912(^14) 4th May</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stella</td>
<td>1912(^15)</td>
<td>1914(^16)</td>
<td>1912(^17) 14th Dec.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Romeo and Juliet</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>For orchestra</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A 'Harold' Overture</td>
<td>1888(^18)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overture to Giordano Bruno</td>
<td>1891(^19)</td>
<td></td>
<td>1893(^20) 4th Mar.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(=Dramatic Study=Overture in G minor/)</td>
<td>1892(^21)</td>
<td></td>
<td>date unknown(^22)(^e)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Symphony in C</td>
<td>before 1894(^24)</td>
<td></td>
<td>1394(^25) 31st Mar.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idyll(^23)</td>
<td>after 1891(^26)</td>
<td></td>
<td>date unknown(^27)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Melody</td>
<td>1903(^28)</td>
<td>1905(^29)</td>
<td>1904(^30) 28th May</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Symphony in E flat</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/ Alcestis/Divinite du Stix/</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/ doubtfulness authenticity(^31)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
For soloist and orchestra

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Composition</th>
<th>Publication</th>
<th>First Performance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>'Long after' a study on Tennyson's 'Maud'/tenor and orch/</td>
<td>before 1890</td>
<td>1900 18th July</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>La belle dame sans merci/Ballad for tenor voice and orch. (Keats)</td>
<td>1898-1902</td>
<td>ca. 1898</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>An Grabe Anselmo's /voice and orchestra/</td>
<td>1898-1902</td>
<td>date unknown</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phantasy for solo horn and orchestra</td>
<td>1905</td>
<td>1906 19th May</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Caprice pour violon et orchestre</td>
<td>1898-1902</td>
<td>1910 9th April</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

For choir and orchestra

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Composition</th>
<th>Publication</th>
<th>First Performance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>An Australian National Song /S.A.T.B. and orch./</td>
<td>1898-1902</td>
<td>1900</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

For chamber groups

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Composition</th>
<th>Publication</th>
<th>First Performance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Die Blumen/Flowers/sextet for voice, 2 violins, viola, violoncello, and double bass</td>
<td>1886</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>String Quartet/in C/</td>
<td>before 1895</td>
<td>1895</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/Allegro con brio/Untitled/bassoon and piano/</td>
<td>1898-1902</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>'In the Orchard, Chartersville'/bassoon and piano/</td>
<td>1898-1902</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deux Fantaisies pour violon et piano</td>
<td>before 1907</td>
<td>1907</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quartet for horn/or cello/, violin, viola, and piano</td>
<td>ca. 1910</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>String Quartet/in F/</td>
<td>ca. 1910</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>String Quartet in D minor</td>
<td>lost</td>
<td>1911 7th July</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Songs

Alas! alas!

Die alten Lieder /I/

Die alten Lieder /II/

As from thine eyes

Auf dem Meere

Caroline (Campbell)

Fart aus den Augen

I feel thy breath in sweetness /duet/

Ihr Bild

Life and love /I/

Mignon

O du leichter lose wind

Shall I compare thee to a summers day

Song of the Arab

To Constantia no.2

To Constantia no.3

Die Ruhe

Warum

What time the somber shades

/Wie lang ich auf seiner Gruss gehurt/
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Songs</th>
<th>Completion</th>
<th>Publication</th>
<th>First Performance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Foreboding /= By the Stream/</td>
<td>before 1890</td>
<td>1890</td>
<td>before 1890</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Life and love /II/</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Past/after Tennyson's Oriana</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A voice from Dreamland</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Lady Janet</td>
<td>unknown</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Little Miss Muffett</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>On a Picture (by Sandbys)</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To Constantia /No.3 text, new setting/</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tristesse (Melancholy)(Alfred de Mussette) /= J'ai perdu.../</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yearning</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>For piano</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sonata 26</td>
<td>ca.1883</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 untitled pieces, n.t.</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jubilum Amoris</td>
<td>after 1895</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>For the church</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deliver me/ anthem for soprano solo and trio /S.A.B., piano/</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lord I cry unto thee / solo voice and S.A.T.B./</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Magnificat /S.A.T.B., organ/</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Arrangements (?)

Quando miro (Mozart) for full orchestra
La Maunolette (Mozart) for full orchestra

Unfinished projects

Parting and meeting

O God the Lord; He that hath pity; Nunc Dimittus

3 untitled piano pieces

Lascia ch'io pianga

Untitled piece for piano and unnamed treble instrument

The Trojan Women

As you like it

The Tempest
NOTES

1. The surviving extract is in GM'Music'folio, a bound Ms. in which one song is dated 1883. The collection has the calligraphic features of a fair copy, perhaps from earlier Ms.
2. Appears amongst operettas 'which have been performed upon the public stage' listed in John Towers, *Dictionary-Catalogue of operas and operettas* London:1910 Part 1, vol.2 p.185-7. No other evidence for a performance has come to light.
3. Newspaper cuttings from *Garden Illustrated*, 1895-6, are pasted over the autograph vocal score.
4. 'Scene from Dido: a dramatic cantata' was given at the 2nd Subscription Concert, 1899, in Melbourne, under Marshall-Hall. Programme in GM.
6. As above.
8. Autograph full score dated 17th April 1898, GM.
9. Review in T.G.Tucker 'The Alcestis at Melbourne', *Hermanthus* vol.10, no.25 (Dublin: Dublin University)
10. Autograph full score dated 11th August 1902, GM
11. Libretto published 1900, according to P.Serle *Bibliography of Australasian poetry and verse, Australia and New Zealand* Melb: 1925; the published edition is undated.
12. 'The birth of Hercules' chorus was given at 271st Melbourne Liedertafel Concert, 1901, under Marshall-Hall. Programme in GM.
13. Autograph full score dated 12th May 1910, GM.
14. Given at Her Majesty's Theatre, Melbourne, on 4th and 11th May, 1912, under Marshall-Hall. Programmes in MC, NL, GM.
15. Manuscript full score dated 1912; letter, Marshall-Hall to Barrett, 28th October 1912, records the completion of the score.
17. The Balcony scene was given at 14th Annual Performance of Opera by Students, Her Majesty's Theatre, Melbourne, under Marshall-Hall, 1912. Programme, MC.
18 Autograph score dated 1888, GM
19 Autograph score entitled 'Dramatic Study' is dated 1891, GM. Undated letter, Marshall-Hall to Streeton, in Croll Smirke to Bulldog Sydney, 1946 p.59, refers to the composition in progress.
21 Autograph score dated December 1892, GM
22 Parts were made for the Adagio sostenuto movement (2nd), but other evidence of its performance is lacking.
23 Spelled Idyll in autograph score, Idyl in copy, GM.
24 Autograph score is undated; copy gives Melbourne University as an address; performance date is terminus post quem.
25 Notice in The Age 30th March 1894.
26 Exists in parts, undated, but of relatively recent appearance.
27 Parts were made for the work, GM; no other evidence of a performance has come to light.
28 Autograph score dated October 29th 1903, GM.
30 Given at 55th Orchestral Subscription Concert, Melbourne, 1904, under Marshall-Hall; programme in NL; review The Age 30th May 1904.
31 Not in the autograph hand, this work is stylistically dissimilar to the others. Its juvenile structure and brevity suggest it was the work of the young Hubert Marshall-Hall.
32 Published in its original piano version in A song-cycle of life and love London: Joseph Williams, 1890 no. 6 p. 30; arranged for orchestra for the 1900 performance.
33 As above.
34 Given at 266th Melbourne Liedertafel Concert, 1900, with Mme. Wiedermann as soloist; programme in GM
35 Manuscript paper with the imprint 'B.C.' does not appear in the dated autograph scores before Choral Ode 1898, save in the copy of the Overture to Giordano Bruno made by J.W. Grainger of Allans Music, also undated. It does not appear in the dated autograph scores after Aristodemus 1902.
Given with orchestra and Margaret Murdoch as soloist, according to letter, Hubert Marshall-Hall to Percy Grainger, 12th October 1938, LC; given 1897 according to Who was who: 1997-1915 London: 1929 p.476; no other evidence has come to light.

37 see note 35
38 parts were made, GM; no other evidence for a performance has come to light.
39 Autograph score dated 25th October 1905, GM
40 Given at 68th Orchestral Subscription Concert, Melbourne, under Marshall-Hall, with Hermann Kühr as soloist, 1906; programme in MC.
41 see note 35.
42 Given at 96th Orchestral Subscription Concert, Melbourne, under Marshall-Hall with Maurice le Plat as soloist, 1910; programme in MC.
43 Autograph score dated 1898, GM
44 Given at 263rd Melbourne Liedertafel Concert, under Marshall-Hall; programme in GM
45 see note 35.
46 Published in closed score in Federated Australia, 1900 p.3-6
47 Autograph full score dated 1886, GM
48 Performance date is terminus post quem. Queens Hall, London.
49 Letter, Marshall-Hall to Streeton, ca 1891 in Croll, op.cit refers to the composition of bassoon and piano pieces; the piece however belongs by its B.C. imprint to a later period. Its connection with the following piece 'In the Orchard, Chartersville', both diplomatically and idiomatically, suggest it came from the period in which the composer kept a room at Chartersville with the Lindsays, ca.1897 (vide Lionel Lindsay Comedy of life: an autobiography Melbourne: 1967 p.96)
50 as above.
51 Publication date is terminus post quem.
52 Published by Schott and Co., London, 1907
53 performance date is terminus post quem
54 Issued in black-line print, without publisher's imprint or date, exemplars in AB, GM.
55 The cello part was arranged for Hattenbach when Rühr was not available, according to letter, Hubert Marshall-Hall to Grainger loc.cit.; given 1911 according to Who was who, loc.cit.; no other
evidence for a performance has come to hand.

Manuscript paper with imprint 'Bell Brand' occurs elsewhere in Autograph sketches and osia for Stella.

This quartet, referred to in Hubert Marshall-Hall's letters to Grainger, LC, but not extant, was given at the Extra Chamber Music Concert, 1911, after having been scheduled for 6th May and 1st December 1910, and postponed both times; programmes in MC.

In GM 'Music' fo, a bound Ms., in which one song is dated 1883, see note 1.

Published, together with a song of A.H. Marshall-Hall and the piano version of 'Long after', as a song cycle of life and love London: Joseph Williams, 1890. as sung by Fischer Sobell.

These songs survive on manuscript without imprint or watermark, undated.

In GM 'Music' fo pp. 90, 103, 100, 77, 76, 67 respectively. see nt. 1

Dedicated to Mark Hambourg, who first visited Melbourne in 1895, then the two met again in 1903 and 1908; programmes MC.

In GM 'Music' fo pp. 87, 131, 117; see note 1.

Calligraphically mature; no other evidence for dating has come to light.

2 unfinished drafts, in GM 'Music' fo, p. 36-8, 39, see note 1.

Unfinished anthem, in GM 'Music' fo p. 122-119, 108, 107 (nt. 1)

In GM 'Music' fo p. 83, 74, 16-17. see note 1

Single leaf in GM, without siglum.

In GM /no sigla/

Advertised in 'Melbourne Music Matters' Theatre Magazine March 1st, 1915. 'Marshall-Hall's new Greek play The Trojan Women of Euripides is to be staged on 17th March'; no other evidence for a performance has come to hand.

Work had begun in 1912, according to letter Marshall-Hall to Barrett, 12th December 1912, GM; no evidence as to its completion has come to hand.

A sketch libretto, made of edited cuttings from an edition of Shakespeare's text, is found in NC JAF 111690: 55; an overture attributed to G. Hurst survives in the GM amongst the works of the Marshall-Hall estate; no other evidence as to further work is at hand.
II. THEMATIC CATALOGUE

1.1 LEONARD

(Incipit from GM 'Music' fo. p. 40, vocal score) /piano//voices/
/n.t./

Excerpt: GM 'Music' fo. p. 40-42. 3 pp of twelve-stave manuscript paper, high-format, 11" x 9.1/4", off-white, without watermark or imprint, part of a bound Ms. of 133 pp.

Inscription reads 'Duet from the operetta Leonard by G.W.L. Marshall-Hall'. Contents: Duet 'O let me press thee' in vocal score, composer's hand.

This duet, the only extant music from Leonard, is part of an autograph Ms. containing various early songs, duets, piano pieces, anthems, and sketches. Acquired, 1938, from the composer's estate.

1:2 DIDO

(Incipits from the Autograph vocal score, GM M-H 1/3-3)

Overture p. 1 Allegro con brio

Act 1, scene 1 p. 13 Lento

Chorus Hail god of light! p. 14 /Sop.Alto//Adagio/

Hail God of light! Hail God of light! oh radiant Phoebus Hail, ...
Dido: Maidens dispense yourselves p. 15 Recit.

Maidens dispense yourselves; I would converse alone with thee...

Aeneas: Once more united p. 23 /Recit./

One more, united, brothers, friendly earth invites our stay...

Aeneas: At last alone p. 25 Allegro Mod.

At last alone ye Gods, what fever burns within these veins...

A Herald: Sir Trojan p. 31 Recit.

Sir Trojan know you whither went the great Aeneas...

Act II, scene 1 Introduction p. 33 Vivace

Chorus of Trojans: Tenors: Here awhile we gladly rest p. 34 Tempo di Marcia

Here a-while, awhile we gladly rest.
Achates My chief this heaviness of mien p.43 Recit.

Chorus All hail great Queen p.46/Allegro /

Hail! Hail! Hail great Queen! the Gods a-love have blessed thee with thy people love...

/Pageant/ p.47 Allegro Vivace

Act III Introduction p.51 Allegretto assez Vivace

Juno The hour is come p.52 Molto Vivace

Aeneas Here in this friendly shelter p.56 Recit.
Act IV  Introduction  p.71  Adagio

1st Trojan  Achates, thou that knowest  p.73  Recit.

Aeneas  The sweet dream is o'er  p.76  /n.t./

Trojans: Tenors  Di  maris  p.80  Larghetto

Act IV, scene 3  Introduction  p.84  Allegretto  assez  Vivace  
//Chorus of Maidens/Sop./Sopr./p.84

Anna  Gracious Queen  p.87  Adagio
Act IV, scene 4 Aeneas Dear love in tears p.101 Lento

[Music notation]

Dear love in tears what sudden turn of ill faith clouded those bright eyes.

Quartet/ Ah! Leave me not (Dido) p.105 /n.t./

[Music notation]

Ah! leave me not in quiet alone my prayer in every heart.

Aeneas Farewell, my love p.108 /n.t./

[Music notation]

Farewell my love with broken heart shall evermore be filled with thee.

Act V Introduction p.111 Larghetto sostenuto //1st Tenor Once more upon the heaving waves p.112

[Music notation]

Once more upon the heaving waves

Achates Ah, cruel love p.120 Recit.

[Music notation]

Ah cruel love they very this is pain

Trojans: Tenors Di maris p.123 (as above, p.241)

Anna Achates! Is it thou p.131 Lento

[Music notation]

A child! is it thou whose mournful voice...
Act V. scene 3  Introduction p.142 Largo

Dido Anna, is all prepared p.143 Recit.

Dido Alone, ah yes! p.145 (n.t.)/


170 (blank); 171-177 / Appendix 1/; 178-183 / Appendix 2/; 184-200 / Appendix 3/. Pp.125, 135, 139, 150-153, 163, 165 are partially obliterated by cuttings pasted in from the Garden Illustrated (London) 1885-86.

Acquired, 1938, from the composer's estate.

Excerpt: Autograph full score: GM M-H 1/3-1. 24pp of thirty-stave manuscript paper, high-format, 19.3/4" x 14.3/4", without watermark or imprint, in 1 gathering, bound in board and green leather.


Page 1 reads: 'Dido and Aeneas/Act I Scene IV/G.W.L.Marshall-
Hall'. Page (i) reads 'G.W.L.Marshall-Hall/Melbourne University/Victoria Australia'. Page (ii) blank. Hand:
Acquired,1938, from the composer's estate.

Excerpt: Manuscript parts: GM M-H 1/3-6:1-36. Inscribed 'Dido and Aeneas/Act I Scene IV' and titled as follows: 'Violino I /7 copies/, Violino II /8 copies/, Viola /3 copies/, Violoncello /73 copies/, Contrabasso /2 copies/, Flauto I + II, Oboi, Clarinetti, Clarinetto basso, Fagotti, Corno I + II in F, Corno III + IV in F, Trombe, Trombone I + II, Trombonyo basso, Contrabass Tuba, Timpani, Arpa. Hand:
Acquired,1938, from composer's estate.

Excerpt: Autograph vocal score: GM M-H 1/3-4. 14 pp of twelve-stave manuscript paper, high-format, 9.6/8" x 12.1/8", without watermark or imprint, in 1 gathering, unbound, with 1 loose leaf (p.11-12).
Page 1 reads 'Scene from "Dido"/a Dramatic Cantata/G.W.L. M.H.' Vocal line begins 'At last alone...'. Contents: pp.1-11 Dido act I scene 4, 12 blank.
The above excerpt scores were undoubtedly prepared for the performance of Aeneas aria 'At last alone' from Act I at the Orchestral Subscription Concert in Melbourne on 11th October 1899. Acquired, 1938, from the composer's estate.

Excerpt (?): Manuscript vocal score: GM M-H 1/3-5. 50pp of twelve-stave manuscript paper, high-format, 11.¼" x 9.¾", with imprint 'Acme Paper/2 staves (oblong) 12sh 7.¼' in 1 gathering, bound in Flyleaf reads 'Dido and Aeneas Act II by G.W.L.M.H./Patey & Willis/449 Marlborough St/London' Contents: pp.1-57 music commencing 'Hark how the shore groans'; p.58 blank. P.57 signed 'G.W.L.M.H.'
Contains a duet for Dido and Aeneas extraneous to the Autograph vocal score. Acquired,1938, from composer's estate.

1:3 HAROLD

/Introduction/ p.1 Vlns. Bold and spirited

/Prologue/ Chorus on the right/Tenors/p.5 /Bold and spirited/

All hail O noble hall of li-ber-ty
King Edward Subjects and liegen / Bold and spirited /

Subjects and liegen! I your king elect.

Earl Godwin My gracious liege / Alred p. 64-5 / Sweyn p. 70 / Rolf p. 94

Recit.

My gracious liege! And ye both foe and friend Will Sweyn,

Very Slow

O Alred! Thou went once as

Bold and spirited
dear to me By right of Saton wise I claim to speak!

Siward 'Tis fit that in this English hall / Bold and spirited /

'Tis fit that in this English hall judging on English Cause.

Chorus /on the right: tenors/The sun of justice for a-while eclipsed / Bold and spirited /

The sun of justice for a-while eclipsed...

Harold Greet thee father! p.131 Joyously but not hurried

Harold alone O no! I cannot p.155 Fast and agitated

Act I, scene 2 Norman Odo and Harold. Odo I come as was appointed p.163 /with an easy and graceful movement //Ditto and Githa and Wolnoth. Githa O Harold! heavy is my heart p.166 /with an easy... //Ditto and Haco. Haco Oft I've heard my father say p.174 Very sic:

I come as was appointed by your King O Harold! heavy is my heart; oft I've heard my father say, - his face grief-scored
Act I, scene 3 / Introduction/ Vlas. p. 182 Very fast and eager

Harold/Edith Edith! p. 185-6 Fast and joyous but not hurried/
Ditto and Hilda: Hilda Aye thine! p. 214-5 Very agitated

Act II, scene 1 / Introduction/ p. 234 B. asses/Very agitated

William and Odo. William 'Fore God! All things conspire p. 243
Somewhat faster

'Hole God! All things conspire, to aid my vent.

Harold and Haco. Harold O treach'rous tongue p. 255 / Marcato/

O treach'rous tongue, Thou hast undone me, living in my blood.
Harold alone O fearful strait! p.268 /n.t./ //Harold and Haco.
Haco Harold beware! p.280 Very fast/ /Ditto and Norman Lord.
1st Norman Lord Most noble Duke William p.282-3 With greater
deliberation

Act II, scene 2 Chorus of Monks: tenors O sacred tokens p.287-8
Very slow/ /Ditto and William, Odo, Harold, and Haco. William Earl
Harold! p.289 Measured and stately (with a firm accent)/ /Inter-
tlude p.301 tpts. Very fast

Act II, scene 3 Edith O do not press me p.320 Flowing gracefully

Edith alone O bitter fare p.336 Slow
Harold and Alfred. Harold But when my feet did press p. 342 /Past and hurried/

But when I set did press again old England's green clad strand,


Nay, Harold. That I abjureate Thou? even

Thou... Thou

Act II, scene 4 /Introduction//p. 427 C + B. Slow and laboured

The King Look!... Wife... p. 431 Edward etc. /Slow and laboured/

Look!... wife... Hail smile!

(The remaining incipits from the Autograph vocal score)

All hail King Har-... old! Hail!
Ditto and Monk. A Monk To thee is not my mission p.169 Gravely

Harold alone. pf. Slowly p.185//Harold O fearful tyranny p.185
/Slowly/

Act III, scene 2 p.192 Somewhat slow and laboured

Edith and Hilda. Edith O fountlet still p.198 Rather faster

Haco alone Ah! none to bid Haco farewell! p.213 Faster
Githa/Harold My son!/Sweet mother! p.217 Slowly with rather more movement

\begin{align*}
\text{My son!} \\
\text{Sweet mother!}
\end{align*}

Ditto and Hilda. Hilda Hail Harold! King of England p.228 Very Fast

\begin{align*}
\text{Hail Harold!} \\
\text{King of England Hail!}
\end{align*}

Githa and Hilda. Githa My sweet, sweet hero-boy p.238 Very slow

\begin{align*}
\text{My sweet, sweet hero-boy!} \\
\text{Must thou too go?}
\end{align*}

Hilda and Wicca. Wicca Ha, ha, ha! p.240 Fast

\begin{align*}
\text{Ha, ha, ha!} \\
\text{Hail Hilda, the most wyndhal! Hail!}
\end{align*}

Act IV, scene 1 p.248 (n.t.)

Edith enters. Githa, Alred p.249 (n.t.)
Act IV, scene 2 Ditto, William, and Normans also. Chorus of Normans: Tenors Trusty sword in gruesome liquor p. 253 Spirited but not too fast

William Senlac callst this field? p. 263 /Spirited but not too fast/

William and Alred. Alred Great conqueror p. 264 Very slow

Edith Who with dishonour couples Harold's name? p. 270 Distinct and firm

Autograph full score; GM M-H 1/4-1,2. Two volumes, 236pp and 223pp respectively, of twenty-four stave manuscript paper, choir-format, 10.5/8" x 13.3/4", with imprint 'Lard Esnault/Paris' in 115 gatherings arranged in double folios, 1-4, 5-8, 9-12, 13-16, 17-20, 21-24, 25-28, 29-32, and similar. Bound in board and red cloth with leather spines and corners.

Page (ii) reads 'Harold/Music Drama by G.W.L.Marshall-Hall/Sopranos.../founded upon Lytton's Historical Romance' Page (iii) reads 'Chorus of Saxons.../List of characters/. N.B. The various tempi are only partially indicated, their exact rendering being left to the discretion of the Conductor, who must be guided by his musical feeling. In many scenes such as Act II Scene III the utmost liberty is allowable...'. Page (i) and (iv) blank.
Page 1 reads 'Flutes/Hboys/Cin C/Bssns/Double Bssns/Hrns in F/Vlns/Vlas/Cellos & Basses'. Contents are: vol I, pp.1-112, 115-236 (numbered incorrectly 1-233) Harold Act I, Prologue; 113-114 blank; vol II, pp.1-223 Harold Act II (numbered incorrectly 234-457). Some stage instructions are in red ink; numerous errors have been erased.

Acquired, 1938, from composer's estate. In the present thesis the marked (incorrect) pagination is given.


Acquired, 1938, from composer's estate. As no full score exists for Acts III and IV, the Autograph vocal score is the principal source for these acts.

Excerpt: Autograph full scó ré; GM M-H 1/4-3. 48pp of twenty-four stave manuscript paper, high-format, 10.7/8" x 14.3/4", without watermark or imprint, in 12 gatherings, each of one double sheet, and sewn with string. Found in a board and green cloth cover, with leather spine and corners, choir-format, inscribed 'Hervar', but not bound to the cover.


Acquired

Excerpt: Manuscript parts: GM M-H 1/4-8.1-40. Inscribed 'Harold/ G.W.L. Marshall-Hall' and titled Viol 1o /7 copies/, Violino 2d /5 copies/, 2nd Violin /2 copies/, Viola /5 copies/, Cello e Basso /8 copies/, Flutes, Piccolo, Oboi, Clarinetti, Bassetons, Contra Fagotto, 1st + 2nd Horns in E, 3rd + 4th Horns in E, Trumpettes in E, 1st + 2nd Trombone, Tuba. Hand:

Acquired, 1938, from composer's estate. The above excerpts were undoubtedly prepared for the performance of Godwin's My gracious liege, at George Henschel's London Symphony Concert, 2nd February 1888, in London.
Excerpt: Autograph vocal score GM M-H 1/4-7. 4pp of twelve-stave manuscript paper, high-format, 12.1/8" x 9.3/4", without imprint or watermark, in a single folio, unbound.

Uttitled. The vocal part begins 'Harold "Oaths taken broke, Love sworn foresook, crowns gained and shook..."

Contents: p.1-4 Harold Act

Acquired


Examples: in GM, LL; listed but missing at B0.

1:4 ALCESTIS

Act I Introduction p.5 Vlns Solenne e sostenuto

Melodrama /Prologue/ p.13 1 + 2 Corni F Tranquillo

/Exit Apollo/p.18 /Flute/ Molto Solenne

Semi-Chorus I p.21 Celli/Bass 2 p.21 Lento

[Musical notations]
Chorus II/ p. 49 Coro I°/ Tenor I/ Grave con moto

Alcestis and Admetus enter/ p. 61/ Celli/ Molto Lento

Alcestis/ p. 63 Con moto lieto ma fluttuando

Finale /Chorus III/ p. 85 Ob. I//Tenor I Maestoso

Act II Introduction p. 93 Vls. Vivace (ma ponderoso e non troppo Allegro)

Admetus enters/ p. 98 Fagotti Grave
/Chorus IV/p.101 /Celli/ //Tenor I Moderato

/Chorus V/ p.117 /Vln.I/ Molto Lento

Act III Introduction p.129 /Vla/Con Larghezza Sostenuto

Melodrama p.132 Moderato fagotti

Scene II /Exit Heracles/p.133 /Vln.I/Moderato/

/Chorus VI/p.137 /Tenor I/Moderato cantabile
Melodrama p.161 Celli Grave

Heracles removes the veil p.163 Agitato Vivasi (quasi Presto) /Vln.I/

Finale p.166 /Tenor I/Molto tranquillo


Acquired, 1974, from Melbourne Liedertafel Library.

Excerpt: Manuscript piano reduction GM .8pp of twelve-stave manuscript paper, high-format, 12.5" x 9.3/4", without watermark, without imprint, 'Austral Nr.3.', in a single gathering, unbound.

Untitled. Contents: pp.1-3 Alcestis, Introduction, mm.1-44, in piano score; 4-8 blank.

Acquired, 1938, from composer's estate.

Autograph sketch vocal score: GM M-H 1/1-2:1-5. Three fragments, 4pp,16pp, and 8pp respectively, of twelve-stave manuscript paper, high-format, 12" x 9.5", without watermark, imprint 'Austral Nr. 2', arranged as 2 loose leaves, 4 single gatherings, and 1 gathering + 2 single leaves respectively, unbound; together with
two fragments, 2pp and 6pp respectively, on fifteen-stave manuscript paper, choir format, 9 1/4" x 14 7/8", without imprint or watermark, the latter arranged in a single gathering +1 leaf, unbound. Evidently cut to size from 30-stave paper.

All fragments are entitled. The opening words on each are respectively: "Oxyatos rushes in" (M-H 1/1-2:5); "Chorus I" (M-H 1/1-2:4); "VI Chorus" (M-H 1/1-2:3); "Alk/AA-i-E" (M-H 1/1-2:1). Contents: Alcestis Act I, scene 1, extracts from Thanatos' scene; Chorus I in close score, (corresponding to p.1-26 in the Autograph full score, ) followed by mm.1-7 of Chorus II, (corresponding to p.28-40); Chorus VI complete, (corresponding to p.137-159); 18 mm of unidentified material; Alcestis' aria complete, (corresponding to p.42-63).

Acquired, 1938, from composer's estate. Various pencil alterations and other calligraphic features identify these pages as the composer's working copy for the opera in its early stages.

Excerpt: Published chorus parts: Chorus I/Alcestis/Chorus II
Melbourne: /Black-line print/, 1898 pp
Exemplars: in TC - 3 copies of each chorus.

Published libretti: Alexander Leeper. The Alcestis of Euripides - English version Melbourne: Melville, Mullen and Slade, 1898
Unbound pamphlet. Choral passages from Way Euripides in English verse; Introductory note by Leeper.
Exemplar: in TC

1:5 ARISTODEMUS

/Introduction/ p.1 /Flutes/Lento e solenne

Artemis p.12 celli Lento

Scene II /Chorus I/ p.27 Cl.B. Andante Maestoso///Sop/ p.30
Scene III /Entrance of Aristodemus/ p.84 Vlns Maestoso

Scene IV /Enter Tisis/ p.37 Fag. All’o agitato

Scene V p.101 Hob. Grandoso

/Chorus II/ p.103 /Sop./ Marcato e ben tenuto

Scene VI Queen enters p.165 Hob. Lento

Scene VII p.167 Vlns. Grave
Scene VIII p.177 Celli Grave ('alla Marcia)

Scene IX Ophioneus p.200 Timpani//Corni F /n.t./

Tenors p.215 Lento

Scene X /Chorus III/ Poco Lento Sop.

Scene XI p.233 Celli Molto Vivace

Scene XII p.249 Viole divisi Molto Vivace
Scene XIII p.251 Vlns. All. o. appassionato

In Memoriam/ Scene XIV /Chorus IV Lament/ Sop. P.264. Poco lento e con tenerezza

Scene XV p.288 Vlns. Molto Vivace

Scene XVI /Chorus V/ Viol./in/ Furioso // Sop. p.303-4

Scene XVII p.374 Celli Molto Lento
Scene XVIII p.375 2Fl. (n.t.)

(Scene XIX, Chorus VI/ p.394 /Sop/ Poco Adagio ma Cantabile

(Scene XX /Chorus VII/ p.443 /Sop/ Grazioso, Cantabile, e Affettuoso

(Scene XXI - nil

(Scene XXII p.488 Celli Molto vivace

(Scene XXIII p.489 Corn Inglese Allegro

(Scene XXIV /Chorus VIII/ p.506 Choir/Sop/ Molto Vivace

O tower and high places of Ilium, O vale of Cassium

Behold! Behold! the horsemen
Scene XXV p.518 Fl.1 + 2 Lento e Solenne

Autograph full score: GM M-H 1/2-1. 544pp of twenty-two stave manuscript paper, high-format, 13.5" x 10.5/8", with imprint 'B.C.No.7', without watermark, in 19 gatherings arranged as follows: pp.1-14;15-26;27-62;63-86;87-90;91-94;95-100;101-146;147-164;165-212;213-264;265-292;293-308;309-356;357-376;377-406;407-448;449-496;497-544. Bound in board and suede.

Flyleaf reads 'G.W.L.Marshall-Hall Melbourne c/o Fischer-Sobell/1 Harley Rd/Swiss Cottage N.W.'; title page (i) reads 'Aristodemus/A tragedy/ by G.W.L.Marshall-Hall/"Alle Schuld rächt sich auf Erden"-Goethe' (title page of published libretto pasted in); page (ii) reads 'Aristodemus/Characters...'; pages (iii)-(iv) blank; signed, p.528 'Aug.11th 1902 G.W.L.Marshall-Hall'. Page 1 reads '/--/--/Horns in E/Tpts C/2 Tenor Tromb./B. Tromb./C.B.Tuba/---/Arpa/Violini/Viole/Celli/Bassi'. Contents are:
p.1-528 Aristodemus; 529-544 blank.

Music is in black ink; scene and set instructions in red ink; text is in printed cuttings from the published libretto, pasted into the score.

Acquired, 1938, from composer's estate.

Autograph vocal score: GM M-H 1/2-2. 298pp of twelve-stave manuscript paper, high-format, 13" x 10.5/8", with imprint, 'A & Co M No.3a Bell Brand', without watermark, in 7 gatherings, arranged as follows: pp.1-68; 69-104; 105-152; 153-194; 195-218; 219-252; 253-298. Pp.13-54 are leaves of twelve-stave manuscript paper, high-format, 12.5" x 9.5/4". P.252-53 have been cut out.

Bound in board and white cloth.

Flyleaf reads 'G.W.L. Marshall-Hall/ Conservatorium of Music Melbourne Victoria.' Title page reads 'Aristodemus/A Tragedy/...' (title page of published libretto pasted in). Page (ii) reads 'Aristodemus/ Characters...'. Back flyleaf reads 'Index/...'


Acquired, 1938, from composer's estate.

Fair copy vocal score: GM M-H 1/2-3. 298pp of twelve-stave manuscript paper, high-format, 13.1/8" x 10.5/8", with imprint 'Bell Brand No.3a A & Co M', without watermark, in 7 gatherings arranged as follows: pp.1-68; 69-104; 105-152;153-192; 193-218; 219-254; 255-298. P.104-05 have been cut out. Bound in board and white cloth.

Title page reads 'Aristodemus/A Tragedy/...' (title page of published libretto pasted in); Page (ii) reads 'Aristodemus/ Characters/...'. A German translation, in pencil, appears in scenes 2,5,9 ('Meet it is...'), 10,11,14,16,18,20,23,24.

Acquired, 1938, from composer's estate,
Exemplars: in GM M-H 1/2-4; and multiple copies, no doubt those used in the performance at the 271st Liedertafel Concert, 29th July 1901, in Melbourne Liedertafel Collection. GM.

Autograph libretto, German translation: GM M-H 1/2-6. 188pp, twenty-seven lines per page, exercise-book, high-format, 10.4" x 8.3/4", with cardboard cover. Title page reads 'Aristodemus/ Ein Trauerspiel von G.W.L.Marshall-Hall/'Alle schuld rächt sich auf Erden' - Goethe'. Title-page verso reads 'Personen/....'. Written in black ink: pages numbered on verso only. Contents: recto p.3-63 Aristodemus in German; recto p.64-94 blank. No imprint.

Between p.20-21 are found two loose leaves of twenty-four lines, high-format, 9.4" x 7.3/8", without imprint or watermark, containing material in English.

Acquired, 1938, composer's estate.

Exemplars: in CM,UM, ML, NC (2 copies). The GM copy and one NC copy (see below) are proof copies, interleaved with blank pages.

Autograph sketch libretto NC Ferguson Collection, JAP 111600:55
A proof copy of the published libretto, as above, interleaved with blank pages.
Recto pages 6, 7, 8, 9, 11, 12, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19 are partially or wholly obliterated by cuttings from Shakespeare's The Tempest (edition unknown), which has various omissions marked in blue and black pencil, in the composer's hand. Facing pp.23-4 is 'Act 1/Scene 1 Prospero Miranda/....' (a plan for an opera based on The Tempest).
In the text of Aristodemus, alterations, omissions, and additions are made to the text on pp.7, 41, 27, 28, 29, 31, 33, 39, 41, 45, 47. Melodic sketches face recto p.17. Schemes of rhythmic metre and accent for the chorus sections face pp. recto 22, 28, 39, 40, 41, all in composer's hand.
Evidently the copy from which the composer worked while writing his opera in 1901.

1:6 STELLA

Scene I p.1 Oboe l.solo Andantino

Mrs. Chase and Noel. Mrs Chase My child be it good news or ill
p.1 Recit.

My child: - Be it good news or ill, give time - as it is
Scene II Stella and Noel p.8 /Vln.I/Andante grazioso

/Duet/ Stella and Noel Love glorious love p.20 /Solenne/

Scene III Stella and Chamley. Chamley Excuse me: is Mrs Chase in? p.26 Calando poco a poco

Scene IV Rector and Chamley. Rector I fear I'm late p.39 Vln// Rector Andante

Scene V /Trio: Mrs Chase, Rector, Chamley/ p.45 Ob. Sostenuto

Scene VI /Introduction/p.58 /Cor.E/Tranquillo
Noel ans Stella. Noel p. 65 Allegro appassionato  I saw you from my window

\( \text{I saw you from my window} \)

/Enter manservant/ p. 86 Fl.1 solo. Andante/ semplice

\( \text{dolce} \)

Scene VII p. 89 Cor. Sostenuto

\( \text{Tired nature sleeps: pure as the prayers of a little child} \)

Stella Tired nature sleeps p. 95 Sostenuto

Children la, la, la p. 101 Lento, ma meno che avanti

Scene 3 Rector, Chamley p. 112 Allegretto Fl./Chamley The ill you cause

\( \text{The ill you cause} \)
Quintet Noel O ye that forever inhabit you beautiful heaven p.117
Con moto

Stella and Chamley. Stella He has seen me? p.138 Molto Agitato

Scene IX Stella How can I live so wounded p.138 Poco sostenuto

(Scene X) Noel and Stella. Noel Stella! You are suffering p.144
Lento

(Duet) Stella and Noel. Stella O once again to hear thee say p.154
Adagio

Autograph full score: GM M-H 1/6-1. 176pp of thirty-stave manuscript paper, high-format, 19.8" x 15.1/8", without imprint or watermark, 6 gatherings arranged as follows: pp.(i)-(viii); 1-33, 33-64; 65-90; 91-122; 123-152; 153-176. Bound in board and white hessian.

Page (i) reads 'Stella/ Opera in three scenes by G.W.L. Marsh-
all-Hall'; (iii) reads 'Persons of the Drama/...'; (v) reads
'Place of Action/...'; pp.(ii),(iv),(vi)-(viii) blank; (v) includes
set and stage designs in the composer's hand; p.168 reads 'Finish-
ed in the tail of Halley's Comet May 12.1910.1.30 am/ G.W.L.
Acquired from Hubert Marshall-Hall.

Manuscript full score: GM M-H 1/6-2 358pp of 24-stave manuscript
paper, high-format, 14" x 10.7", with imprint 'B & H.Nr.14.c.'
without watermark, in 13 gatherings, arranged as follows: pp.1-40,
41-62,63-92; 93-118; 119-130; 131-170; 171-210; 211-238; 239-
276; 277-298; 299-322; 323-342; 343-358. Bound in soft leather.
Page (i) reads 'Stella/ Opera in one Act by G.W.L.Marshall-
Hall/Full score/Copyright'; (iii) reads 'Prof. Marshall-Hall/
Melbourne Victoria Australia/ London address: c/o Messrs Schulz
-Curtins + Powell/44 Regent St. London.W.England'; (xv) reads
'Persons of the Drama/...'; pp.(ii),(xvi),(iv)-(xvii) blank.
Flauto III e Piccolo/Obòi/Corno inglese/Clarinetto in Bb/
Clarinetto di Basso/ Fagotti/ Corno 1 + 2 in F/ Corno 3 + 4/
Trombe 1,2,3 in C/Trombone 1 + 2/ Trombone 3 + Tuba/ Tympani/
Arpa/Violino I,II/Viola/V.Celli/Bassi. Various omissions pasted
over. Hand:
Acquired,1938, from composer's estate.

Autograph vocal score:GM M-H 1/6-4. 200pp of twelve-stave manusc-
ipt paper, high-format, 13.3/4" x 10.7", without watermark or
imprint, in 5 gatherings arranged as follows: pp.1-60:61-84;
85-108:109-176; 177-200; 109-176 contains two sub-gatherings:
127-144 and 145-164. Bound in rough, off-white cloth.
Page (i) reads 'Stella/ Opera in one Act/ by/G.W.L.Marshall-
Hall/G.W.L.Marshall-Hall/1 Creswick St,/ Hawthorn/ Melbourne/
in the composer's hand/ and 'Mr.A.Levey/406 Humboldt Bank Bldn
Frisco,Cal,U.S.A.'; (iii) reads 'Scene I.II.III.IV.V...'
/set plan/; (v) reads 'Scene VI...' /set plan/ ; (ix) /List
of characters/; (x) reads 'N.B. The stage action is all changed.
Take no notice of pencillings.; (ii), (iv), (vi)-(viii) blank.
Contents: p.1-196 Stella vocal score; 197-200 blank.
Acquired, 1938, from composer's estate.

Manuscript vocal score: GM M-H 1/6-3. 266pp of twelve-stave
manuscript paper, high-format, 12.1/8" x 9.1/8", with imprint
'Musette No.1 Manuscript paper', without watermark, in 11 gather-
ings arranged as follows: pp.1-24;25-48; 49-72; 73-96; 97-
120; 121-144; 145-168; 169-192; 193-216; 217-240; 241-266. Bound
in pale red leather. Hand:
Page (i) reads 'Stella/Opera in One Act/ written and
composed by G.W.L.Marshall-Hall/ Melbourne Feb.1910/(1909:
Dec 23 - Feb 4: 1910'); (ii) /List of Characters/; p.265'Index...'
Contents : p.1-264 Stella vocal score; p.266 blank. German
translation in pencil (composer's hand); annotations in red and
blue pencil; omissions in pencil.
Acquired,1938, from composer's estate.

Autograph incomplete vocal score: GM M-H 1/6-5:10-1-6. Five
fragments of fifteen-stave manuscript paper, choir-format, 9.3/4"x
15.1/8", without watermark or imprint, of 8,12,12,12, and
22pp respectively, unbound.
The fragments are numbered p.1-8,9-20,19-29, 21- and 43-8,
un-numbered, respectively. Contents are: Scene 1, Scene 5 'Mrs
Chase Copy', Scene 8 Quintet, scene 9 Finale, Scene 8
(Chamley 'The ill you cause'), 'What comfort is there in all the world', and (Choir from next room) 'Mercy thou didst'.
Fragment 3 is signed 'GWIMU'.

Acquired, 1938, from composer's estate

Other vocal scores: According to Hubert Marshall-Hall (letter to Grainger, June 1st (?) 1936, LC) there were 8 vocal scores copied for Stella. Only the above three, one incomplete, are extant.

Manuscript parts: GM M-II 1/6-6,1-34 All heavily amended, entitled: 'Violino I/me/4 copies/, 2nd violin, Violino 2me, Violino II, Violino 2mo, Viola, Viole, Violoncello /2 copies/, CBasso /2 copies/, 1st and 2nd Flutes, Flute III/Piccolo, OB. I + II, Cor Ang, Clarinet I + II, Bass Clar.B., Fagotti I + II, Corno I + II, Corni 3 + 4, Trombe I + II, Tromboni I + II, Trombone 3 e Tuba, Harp, Timpani, Gran Casse etc etc, Trumpets 1 + 2 abridged version, Trombones 1 + 2 abridged version, Tuba abridged version, Percussion abridged.'

Acquired, 1938, from the composer's estate.

Autograph Ossia, sketches GM M-H 1/6-5:1-9 Ten fragments of manuscript as follows: 20pp of 12 stave manuscript paper, high-format, 12.4" x 9.3/4" in one gathering, with imprint 'Musetta no. 1, no Wm. /Scene 5: 'Rector enters...'/ Numerous pencil performance-directions and stage movements; 1 leaf of manuscript paper, high-format, 12.4" x 9.3/4", with imprint 'Musetta No.1 Manuscript paper', without watermark, in one ossia for Mrs Chase, filling out the above fragment. 4pp of manuscript paper, 12-stave, high-format, 12.4" x 9.3/4", without imprint or watermark, /Scene 6 Noel's Cavatina in 'Stella' before the last pause of the introduction, 'If she whom I love...' /alterations in ink p.3, 4pp of 12-stave manuscript paper, high-format, 10.4" x 13.3/8", /Scene 7 chorus of children 'La,la,la'/ with imprint, 'Bel Brand 'Jo.2a', 20pp of 12-stave manuscript paper, high-format, 9.7/3" x 12.1/4", without imprint and without watermark, in 3 gatherings arranged as follows: pp.1-8,9-16,17-20 /Scene 7, 'The verandah of Mrs Chase's house'/ Stage directions in pencil. 16pp of twelve-stave manuscript paper, high-format, 12.1/8" x 9.7/8", imprint 'Musetta No.1 Music Paper', without watermark, in 1 gathering /Scene 8 Quintett/ numbered p.27-42. 32pp of twelve-stave manuscript paper, high-format, 12.4" x 9.3/4", without watermark or imprint, /same paper as sc.7 verandah exc./, 3 gatherings, arranged as follows: pp.1-8,9-20,21-24,25-32, then a further 36pp unnumbered /1-8,9-16,17-24,25-32,33-36/. /Contents: 'Scene 8 Chamley 'The ill you cause...'/ Scene 9-end Stella 'How can I live...'/ 1 leaf of twelve-stave manuscript paper, high-format, 11.3/8" x 9.1/4", imprint 'Bell Brand no.3a' /2 systems of material only/. 8pp of twelve-stave manuscript paper, high-format, 13.3/8" x 10.5/8", in 2 gatherings of single sheets, /Scene 9 Stella 'How can I live...'/ 24pp of twelve-stave manuscript paper high-format, 12.4" x 9.3/4", imprint 'Musetta no.1 Music Paper', without watermark, in 1 gathering. /Scene 10 Noel (entering passionately) 'Stella! ...' to end of duet/. Single sheet of paper, ruled lines on one side, high-format, 10.1/8" x 8", red and black ink /lighting plot for Stella/. 6pp ruled-lines, high-format, 10.1/8" x 8", red and black ink /O & M sheet/.
Autograph libretto: GM 132pp Exercise-book, 24-lines per page, no watermark, cloth cover, high-format, 9½" x 7.1/4". Page 2 reads 'Stella/Persons of the drama/...'; p.1 blank; 82,132 blank. Libretto in ink on verso pages; stage directions in pencil on recto pages. Some omissions marked; directions in the text underlined in blue pencil.

Acquired, 1938, from composer's estate.


Acquired, 1938, from composer's estate.

1:7 ROMEO AND JULIET

Act 1 scene 1 p.1 flute 1 + 2, Molto vivace

Prince Rebellious subjects! p.10//Capulet Well Montague is bound p.15

Peter Find them whose names p.20//Romeo Good den, good fellow p.25

Mercutio O the I see Queen Mab p.35//Mercutio True I talk of dreams p.54
Act 1 scene 2 \l/Introduction/p.65 viole/\Ob. Poco Lento

Lady Capulet Nurse, where's my daughter? p.71/Juliet Who calls? p.76

Chorus Youth's the season made for joys p.95/\Dances/\Ob. p.102

Capulet Welcome gentlemen! p.119/Romeo What lady's that? p.124

Romeo If I profane p.140

Nurse Lady your mother craves a word p.154
Act 2 scene 1 / Introduction/ p.1 (Vol.2) Ob. poco lento

Romeo Can I go forward Vivace p.2//Benvolio Romeo! Cousin Romeo p.4

Romeo He jests at scars that never felt a wound p.13 Lento
Juliet Ah me! p.28 Grazioso

Act 2, scene 2 / Introduction/ p.95 Ob.1 + 2 unis Allegretto con vivacita

Nurse Peter! Anon! p.111 Nurse Now afore God p.125

Andante quasi allegretto Peter poco allarg.

Peter! (yawning) Anon. Now afore God, I am so vexed,

Capulet Sir Paris I will make a desperate tender p.135//Romeo
Good morrow father p.140

Recit Sir Paris, I will make a desperate tender Good morrow, father
Romeo Ah! Juliet, if the measure of thy joy p.152

Act 2, scene 3 //Introduction/ 3 Fl, l, 2, +3 unis. p.165 Vivace
//Mercutio I am hurt p.200

Tenors Which way ran he p.212 All o molto e furioso //Prince
Where are the vile beginners p.216-17

Act 3, scene 1 //Introduction/ Violns.I p.1 (vol.3) Molto lebto
e sostenuto//Juliet Wilt thou be gone? p.12

Lady Capulet Why how now Juliet p.39 Capulet How now wife p.50-1

Juliet Is there no pity p.62-3

Is there no pity, sitting in the clouds that sees into the bottom of my grief.
Juliet O shut the door p.73

O shut the door, and when thou hast done so, I have a faint cold fear

Act 4 scene 1 / Introduction/ p.121 Cl. B Andante, poco grave

Friar Who bear then my letter p.122

Who bear my letter then to Romeo, Sweet flower, with flowers thy bridal

Benvolio Her body sleeps in Capulets monument p.132

Her body sleeps in Capulet's monument, Mercutio's kinsman

Juliet O comfortable friar p.188

O comfortable Friar, Where's my lord?
Manuscript full score: GM M-H 1/5-1-3. 3 volumes, 172pp, 234pp, and 204pp respectively, of twenty-four stave manuscript paper, high-format, 14" x 10.5/8", with imprint 'B & H Nr.14. c.', without watermark, arranged in 8,10, and 9 gatherings respectively, as follows: vol.1, pp.1-22; 23-44; 45-64; 65-96; 97-120; 121-142; 143-160; 161-172; vol.2: pp.1-26; 27-50; 51-72; 73-96; 97-120; 121-146; 147-170; 171-200; 201-222; 223-234; vol.3: pp.1-20; 21-44; 45-72; 73-96; 97-120; 121-144; 145-164; 165-168; 169-192; 193-204. Bound in leather.

Title p. reads 'Romeo and Juliet/Opera in 4 Acts/after Shakespeare by G.W.L.Marshall-Hall/1912'; (ii) reads 'Romeo and Juliet/List of Characters/'; (iv) reads 'The action takes place in Verona...List of scenes/'; (vi) contains a sketch and poem by E.Scharf; (i), (iii), (v), (vii) blank. Page 1 reads 'Piccolo/Flute 1 + 2/Oboi/Eng.Horn/1 + 2 Clarin in B/Bass Cl/(1 + 2) Horns in F (3 + 4)/(1 + 2 Trumpets in C/(3)/(1 + 2) Trombo/(3) e Tuba/Kettledrums/Side Drum + Cymbals/Violins/Viola/...Basses/V.celli/Bass'. Contents: vol.1 Act 1; vol.2 Act 2; vol.3 Act 3,4. In vol.3 the separate acts have separate page numbers. Hand: Acquired, 1938, from composer's estate.

Autograph vocal score: GM M-H 1/5-4. 287pp of twelve-stave manuscript paper, high-format, 14" x 10.5/8", with imprint 'B & H Nr.11.c.10.10', with watermark BREITKOPF + HARTEL/LEIPZIG, sewn, bound in board and brown hessian (binding in disrepair).

Title page reads: 'Romeo and Juliet/Opera in 4 Acts by G.W.L.Marshall-Hall after the original text of Shakespeare. The German version is from the famous translation of Tieck + Schlegel'; flyleaf reads 'G.W.L.Marshall-Hall c/o Messrs Enoch + Sons/ Great Marlborough St., London WC'; (i) reads 'Dedicated to my Australian friends'; (iii) signed G.W.L.Marshall-Hall; (ii) blank; Back flyleaf: stage instructions (for the last scene) in German. Music and text in black ink; German in red ink; German stage instructions in pencil. Pasted-in insertions p.2,32; erasures p.28,30a,275, in ink, blue pencil, black pencil respectively; notes to the printer p.23.

Acquired, 1938, from composer's estate. Evidently the score from which the published vocal score was typeset.

Manuscript parts: GM M-H 1/5-10:1-35. For Act 2 scene 1, inscribed as follows: 'Violin 1st /7 copies/, violin 2 /4 copies/, viola /4 copies/, V/cello /2copies/, Crass, Double Bass 2., Flutes 1 + 2, Flute 3 (Piccolo), Oboi, Eng.Horn, Bass Clar., Clarinets 1 + 2, Bass Clar arranged for Vcello, Fagotti 1 + 2, Horns 1 + 2, Horns 3 + 4, Tpts 1 + 2, Trombones 1 + 2, Timpani, Trombone 3 + Tuba, Gr.Cassa/Platti/Triangle, Harp'.

Acquired, 1938, from composer's estate.

Manuscript parts:GM M-H 1/5-9:1-22. For Act 1 scene 1, evidently unfinished (un_titled, only one of each string part), inscribed as follows '1st Violin, 2nd Viol., Violin 2mo, Viola, Cello, Bass, Flutes 1-2,Piccolo/3rd Flute,Oboe, Engl.Horn, Clarionets, Bass Clar., Bassoons,Horns 1/2, Horns 3/4, Trumpets 1/2, Trombones 1/2, 3 Tuba, Kettle Drum, Cymbals and Side Drum e.t.c., Triangle'.

Evidently an un finished attempt to provide parts for the complete opera. Acquired (?)

Excerpt: Manuscript vocal score: GM M-H 1/5/5. 20pp of twelve-stave
manuscript paper, high-format, 12½" x 9.3/4" , without imprint or watermark, in l gathering.
Contents: Peter 'Rest you merry...' to Romeo 'Thou talkst of nothing...'/Act 1, scene 1/; p.11-20 blank
Acquired

Typescript libretto: GM M-H 1/5-11. 48pp of spirit-duplicated typescript, high-format, 10.½" x 8", sewn with a cloth spine.
Page (i) reads 'Romeo and Juliet/ Opera in 4 Acts after the play of Shakespeare by G.W.L.Marshall-Hall/Copyright;' (iii) reads 'Characters/...'.
Acquired,1938, from composer's estate

Proof copy of published vocal score: GM M-H 1/5-8 G.W.L.
Marshall-Hall Romeo and Juliet: an opera in four acts London:
Enoch and Sons,1914 272 pp. Unbound, secured with string; corrections in red ink.
Acquired,1938, from composer's estate

Published vocal score: G.W.L.Marshall-Hall Romeo and Juliet: an
Exemplary: in GM (2 copies, 1 from Hubert Marshall-Hall;
1 from the composer's estate), NC, LW, NY, That in NY bears an inscription on the cover (in the composer's hand) 'To "glorious John" (registered in the vulgar annals as John Coates) from one of his most enthusiastic admirers/ ll
Sterndale Rd/Brook Green, W.'
APPENDIX III
ICONOGRAPHY

The following is an alphabetical list of portraits, sketches, and photographs of G.W.L.Marshall-Hall and performances of his operas, listed by artist or photographer. Portraits of family and friends, cartoons, and other items survive in the Grainger Museum; concert posters and decorations for the published works are referred to in Chapter 3.

Anon. Photograph of Marshall-Hall standing, hands clasped. postcard size, in GM

Anon. Photograph of Marshall-Hall The Sydney Morning Herald 20th August 1932

Anon. Photograph, in Programme, Melbourne Music Festival 1911 p.9 in ML.


Anon. Photograph, Marshall-Hall with flower in lapel. 8" x 5.3/4" in GM

Anon. Photograph, Marshall-Hall Australia Magazine 1908 p.567

M.B. sketch of Marshall-Hall, signed 'M.B.' black ink, in GM

Broothorn. Photograph of Marshall-Hall, original and framed enlargement in GM; reproduced in Ernest Scott A history of the University of Melbourne Melbourne: Melbourne University Press, 1935 facing p.135; and in Music and the Teacher vol.12, no.2 June 1976, cover.


Humphrey, T., 264 Collins Street, Melbourne. Photograph of Marshall-Hall and his orchestra in the Melbourne Town Hall, 30.3/4" x 19", with separate key to players pictured. in GM
Johnstone, O'Shannessy and Co. Photograph of Marshall-Hall.
Reproduced in All about Australians vol.4, no.47 1st March 1902, p.122; Alma mater vol.3, no.6, 1899 p.62; The Gleam, vol.1, no.1, July 1900 p.22

Johnstone, O'Shannessy and Co. Frame containing 6 photographs of scenes and characters in the 1898 Melbourne Town Hall performance of Marshall-Hall's Alceste, inscribed 'Ever your loving pupil, Florence Towle 22.6.98' in GM

(Reproduced in this thesis)

McDonald, J.S. Sketch of Marshall-Hall, signed 'J.S. McDonald, 31st 3-1911' in Programme, Grand Matinee Performance in aid of the fund for Professor Marshall-Hall's Conservatorium Building. 7th September 1911. in ML.

Lindsay, Norman 'The New Patroclus' Alma mater July 1900, cartoon (reproduced in this thesis). vol.5, no.


_______. Portrait of Marshall-Hall, oil on canvas, 1900, in CM. Reproduced in Barbara and Findlay MacKenzie Singers of Australia from Melba to Sutherland Melbourne: Lansdowne, 1967 p.18


Yeaman and Co., Bourke Street, Melbourne. Photograph of Marshall-Hall holding a dog, postcard size, in GM.
APPENDIX IV

BIBLIOGRAPHY

In the following alphabetical lists, literature concerning Marshall-Hall by his contemporaries is defined as primary source-material, that by more recent authors as secondary source-material. A general list of works relevant to the study which do not mention Marshall-Hall is also included. Many items of minor significance referred to in the thesis have been omitted here.

1. PRIMARY SOURCES


Barrett, James W. Eighty eventful years Melbourne: J.C. Stephens Pty.Ltd., 1945 137pp

Braad, Ian Outline history of orchestral music in Melbourne Melbourne: J.C. Stephens Pty.Ltd, 1940 8pp


Braid, Ian The growth of the University Conservatorium Melbourne: unpublished typescript, 1938, GM 11pp

Brentnall, Thomas My memories, being the reminiscences of a non-generian Melbourne: Robertson and Mullens Ltd., 1938 p.127ff

British musician and musical news 'This splendid musician: G.W.L. Marshall-Hall' vol.12, nos.11-12, November, December 1935 p.253-56, 273-75.

Brookes, Herbert In Memoriam G.W.L. Marshall-Hall. An elegy spoken at the graveside of the late Professor G.W.L. Marshall-Hall... Melbourne: Sands and McDougall Pty.Ltd, 1915/ 12pp

Brown, James W. and Stratton, Stephen S. British musical biography a dictionary of musical artists, authors and composers born in Britain and its colonies... London: William Reeves, 1897


Croll, Robert Henderson Smike to Bulldog: letters from Sir Arthur Streeton to Tom Roberts Sydney: Ure Smith, 1946 144pp

Duncan, Edmondstoune 'Marshall-Hall: composer and poet, an appreciation' Musical Times vol.56, 1st September 1915 p.487

Elvins, Harold S. 'A historical sketch' Melba Con. Magazine no.1, 1934; quoted in no.11, 1944
Fox, Len E. Phillips Fox: notes and recollections N.S.W. Potts Point: the author, 1969 32pp
Laver, William /autobiography/typescript, NL
Lindsay, Lionel Comedy of life: an autobiography Melbourne: Angus and Robertson, 1967 272pp

A consideration of the art of Ernest Moffitt Melbourne: The Atlas Press, 1899
Melba, Nellie Melodies and memories London: Butterworth, 1925 335pp
Moresby, Isabelle Australia makes music... Melbourne: Longmans, Green, and Co., 1948 197pp
Murphy, Agnes G. Melba: a biography... New York: Doubleday, Page, 1909 p.198ff 348pp
Orchard, William Arundel Music in Australia: more than 150 years of development Melbourne: Georgian House, 1952 238pp

The distant view Sydney: Currawong, 1943 253pp
Parkinson, Violet C.F. 'Madame Wiedermann and the opera school' Melba Con. Magazine no.12, 1945 p.7-8
Runciman, John F. Old scores and new readings: discussions on musical subjects London: At the sign of the Unicorn, 1899 279pp


The Theatre Magazine 'Melbourne Musical Matters' 1st March 1915, p.18 (also published as Theatre, Sydney, Melbourne)
Tucker, T.G. 'The Alcestis at Melbourne' Hermathena vol.10 no.25 (Dublin: Dublin University)
The Victorian Artists Society 'Chords', 'Professor Marshall-Hall' in The V.A.S. Journal of the arts no.18, 1st December 1912, p.6-7; no.30 1st November 1913 p.7
2. Secondary sources

Bebbington, Warren A. 'Orpheus down under: Marshall-Hall's forgotten operas' Music and the Teacher (Melbourne) vol.12, no.2, June 1976 p.3-7

Blainey, Geoffrey The University of Melbourne: a centenary portrait Melbourne: Melbourne University Press, 1956 p.113-19


Galbally, Anne Arthur Streton Melbourne: Lansdowne, 1969 87pp


Hetherington, J. Melba: a biography Melbourne: Cheshire, 1967 312pp

Hince, Kenneth 'The case of the dismissed professor' Quadrant vol.3, no.1, Summer 1958 p.25-30


Scott, Ernest A history of the University of Melbourne Melbourne: Melbourne University Press, 1935 p.138-159

Serle, Geoffrey *From deserts the prophets come: the creative spirit in Australia* 1788-1972 Melbourne William Heinemann, 1973

Serle, Percival *Dictionary of Australian biography* Melbourne: Angus and Robertson, 1949 vol. 1, p. 393

Spate, Virginia *Tom Roberts* Melbourne: Lansdowne, 1972 161 pp


Wood, Elizabeth *Australian opera 1843-1970* PhD thesis in progress, University of Adelaide

__________ Australian operas: the search for a profile typescript, 22 pp, Paper delivered to Musicological Society of South Australia, 23rd April 1971 in NL.

__________. Index of Australian opera: an analytical source


3. General

Austin, William *Music in the twentieth century* New York: W.W. Norton,


Graf, Max *Composer and critic: two hundred years of music criticism* New York: W.W. Norton, 1946 331 pp


Hanslick, Eduard Vom Musikalisch-Schönen (1854); English translation by Gustave Cohen The beautiful in music New York: Bobbs-Merrill Co., 1957 127pp

Kennedy, Michael Portrait of Elgar London: Oxford University Press, 1968 324pp

Kerman, Joseph Opera as drama New York: Knopf, 1956 269pp


Newman; Ernest Wagner as man and artist (1914) London: Johnathan Cape, 1963 reissue 440pp

Parry, Hubert The evolution of the art of music London: (1893) Kegan, Paul, Trench, Trübner and Co., 1931 342pp

Santley, Charles Student and singer: the reminiscences of Charles Santley London: Edward Arnold, 1892 327pp


Tovey, Donald 'A note on opera' in Essays and lectures on music London: Oxford University Press, 1949 p. 30ff


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>INDEX</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Adagio</strong> (Roberts), 104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Albert, Eugen d'</strong> (1864-1932), 168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Alcestis</strong> (Euripides), 117-19, 122-23, 218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Alceste</strong> (Gluck), 119-21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Alceste</strong> (Handel), 119-21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Alceste</strong> (Lully), 119-21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Alma mater</strong> (Melbourne), 99, 107, 136-38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anonymous, bust of Marshall-Hall, 214</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Argus, The</strong>, 14, 28, 109-10, 135, 138, 140, 144, 166, 169, 184, 209, 213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Aristophanes, The Wasps</strong>, 160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Aristotle, Politics</strong>, 90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>art nouveau</strong>, 104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music (London), 11, 143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>As you like it</strong> (Shakespeare), 203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Australia</strong>, art 34-5, 102-03; artistic climate 18-19, 99-100, 22-3; opportunities for composers, 101-02; study of music in, 4; taste in, 35-6. See also Melbourne, Sydney</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Australian Grand Opera Company, 161, 187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Australian Music Examinations Board, 143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bach, Johann Sebastian</strong> (1685-1750), 29, 30, 33, 67, 68, 100, 114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Balaustion's Adventure</strong> (Browning), 123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Balfe, Michael William</strong> (1808-1870), 32; <strong>The rose of Castille</strong>, 59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bantock (Sir) Granville</strong> (1868-1949), 32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Barrett, (Sir) James</strong> (1862-1945), 15, 20, 28, 160-62, 184-85, 206, 208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bax, (Sir) Arnold Edward Trevor</strong> (1883-1953), 205</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Beecham, (Sir) Thomas</strong> (1879-1940), 207, 213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Beethoven, Ludwig van</strong> (1770-1827), 10, 65, 68, 91, 100, 104, 109; Choral Symphony, 161; <strong>Fidelio</strong>, 121, 165; Kreutzer sonata, 139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bellini, Vincenzo</strong> (1801-1835), 24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Benedict, (Sir) Julius</strong> (1804-85), 32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bennett, Joseph</strong> (1831-1911), 21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Berg, Alban</strong> (1885-1935), 26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Berlin, music in</strong>, 167-68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bismark, Otto, Fürst von</strong>, (1815-1898), 11, 135</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Boheme, La (Puccini), 33,169
Borwick, Leonard (1868-1925), 186
Brahms, Johann (1833-1897), 29,30,33,10,97,142
Brentnall, Thomas, 15,143
Bridge, Frank (1879-1941), 205
Bridge, (Sir) Frederick (1844-1924), 40
Brookes, Herbert, In memoriam, 215
Brookes, Mrs. Herbert, 18
Browning, Robert, Balaustion's Adventure, 123
Bülow, Hans von (1830-1894), 40
Bulwer, see Lytton
Bush Idyll (Streeton), 104

Caccini, Giulio (1545-1618), 24
Canterbury Pilgrims, The (Stanford), 59,86
Castieau, John Buckley, 140
Champion, M.H., 102
Champion, The, 115
Chanter, 187
Chappell, William, on English music, 21,29-36,59,90
Chartersville, 103
Cherniavski, Mishel (1893-19 ), 186
Chopin, Fryderyk (1810-1849), March funebre, 50
Choral Symphony (Beethoven), 161
Chords, 15
Clark, Rev. F. Scotson, 56
Coates, Albert (1882-1953), 207
Cocktail party, The (T.S. Eliot), 123
Columba (MacKenzie), 121
Corr, J. Redford, 140
Cowen, (Sir) Frederic Hymen, (1852-1935), 32,71,86,88,97,101, 216; Pauline, 59
Curwen, John, see Hullah-Curwen tonic sol-fa method

D'Albert, see Albert, Eugen d' 
Debussy, Claude (1862-1913), 19,97,168,200,206,208; Pélleas et Mélisande, 211
Delius, Frederick (1862-1934), 205,211
Devonshire, Newton College, 41
Dickson, F.J., embezzlement case, 43-4
Dido and Aeneas (Vergil), 43-4, 69
Dierich, Franz, 11
Douglas, George, 140
Dream of Juhal, The (MacKenzie), 121
Duncan, William Edmonstone (1866-1920), 15
Dvorak, Antonín (1841-1904), 30, 161

Elgar, (Sir) Edward W. (1857-1934), 36, 161, 205; The dream of
   Gerontius, 22
Eliot, T.S., The cocktail party, 123
Elvins, Harold, 16
England, influences on composers in, 29-30; Marshall-Hall on,
   58-9; music education in, 31; operatic life in, 21, 32; taste
   in, 32-3; changing climate after 1900 in, 205-08; see also
   Chappell, London
Enoch Arden (R. Strauss), 121
Esmeralda (A.G. Thomas), 59
Euripides, 119; Alcestis, 117-19, 122-23, 218; A.S. Way translation
   of, 117

Fasoli's Italian Restaurant (Melbourne), 102
Fox, E. Phillips, 102, 105, 162; Marshall-Hall, 214
Fidelio (Beethoven), 121, 165
Francillon, Rosamund, 88
Freischütz, Der, (Weber), 121

Gerontius, The dream of (Elgar), 22
Gluck, Christoph Willibald Ritter von (1714-1787), Alceste,
   119-21
Goldschmidt, Otto (1829-1907), 94
Goll, Edward, 214
Gounod, Charles François (1818-1893), 10
Grainger, Percy (Aldridge) (1882-1961), 4, 22-3, 98, 205, 208
Grieg, Edvard Hagerup (1843-1907), 30
Grout, Donald Jay, on opera, 24, 27
Grove, (Sir George) (1820-1900), 13,16,40,157,94
Guennett, T.N., 14

Hall, Marshall (1790-1857, grandfather of composer), 39
Hall, Marshall (father of composer), 39
Halle, (Sir) Charles (1819-1895), 94
Hambourg, Mark (1879-19 ), 186
Handel, George Frideric (1685-1759), Alcestes, 119-21
Hannagan, M., 209
Hanslick, Eduard (1825-1904), 61-2,64-5,71,90,138
Harold (Tennyson), 71
Harold, last of the Saxon kings (Lytton), 70-3, 75
Hart, Fritz (1874-1949), 205,206-07,213-14; Malvolio, 14
Hartung, E., 14
Hattenbach, Louis, 161
Haupt, Carl August (1810-1891), 39
Haydn, Franz Joseph (1732-1809), 142
Haydon, C.M., 160
Haydon, I.M., 160
Heidelberg school, 11,34-6,102-05,216
Henschel, (Sir) George (1850-1934), 32,57,86,94
Herald, The, 14
Holst, Gustav (1874-1934), 32,205
Hore, Catherine, see Marshall-Hall, Catherine
Horrocks, A.E., 88
Hiles, Henry (1826-1904), 71
Hullah, John (1816-1884), Hullah-Curwen sol-fah movement, 31
Hurst, G, 204

Ibsen, Heinrich, 11,174
In memoriam (Brookes), 215
International Centennial Exhibition (Melbourne), 97,101

Jung, Otto, 98

Kerman, Joseph, on opera, 26
Kotyolt, Herr, 39
Kreisler, Fritz (1875-19 ), 168
Kreutzer sonata (Beethoven), 139
Kubelik, Jan (1880-1940), 186
Kühn, Hermann, 103, 163
Kussevitsky, Sergey Alexandrovich (1874-1951), 12

Laver, William, 98
Lee, Archibald E.J. ('Neville d'Esterre'), 12, 16, 19, 20, 161, 185, 211
Leeper, Alexander (1848-1934), 116-17, 132-33, 139-40, 143, 160
Levey, A, 205, 207
Lindsay, Lionel, 102-04, 117, 140, 162
Lindsay, Norman, 35, 102, 162; 'The New Patroclus', 140
Liszt, Ferencz (1811-1886), 158
London Music School see London Organ School
London Organ School and College of Music, 56, 58
London Palladium, 184, 207-08
London, see also Royal Academy of Music, Royal College of Music
Lully, Jean-Baptiste (1632-1687), Alcesta, 119-21
Lytton, Edward George Earle Bulwer (1803-1873), Harold the last of the Saxon kings, 70-3, 75

McCubbin, Fred (1855-1917), 34, 102
MacCunn, Hamish (1868-1916), 32, 161, 172
MacDowell, Edward Alexander (1861-1908), 97
MacFarren, (Sir) George Alexander (1813-1887), 32, 100
MacKenzie, Barbara, on Australian singers, 35
MacKenzie, (Sir) Alexander Cambell, 32, 86, 94, 205, Columba, 59;
The dream of Jubal, 121
Macpherson, Carl Stewart (1865-1941), 57-8
Madame Butterfly (Puccini), 14, 33, 169-72, 174, 178, 181-83
Magazine of Music, 57, 86
Malvolio (Hart), 14
Manns, (Sir) August (1825-1907), 32-3, 87, 94
March Funèbre (Chopin), 50
Marshall-Hall (Anonymous), 214
Marshall-Hall (Fox), 214
Marshall-Hall (Roberts), 214
Marshall-Hall, Catherine, née More (second wife), 101, 144, 215
Marshall-Hall, Elsa (daughter by first wife), 93, 101, 215
Marshall-Hall, George Walter Lorenzo see Marshall-Hall, George
William Louis

Marshall-Hall, George William Louis (1862-1915), CAREER:
early life, education, 39-41, 56-7; early works, 41-2, 56;
public attention in London, 86-7; application for Ormond Chair
at University of Melbourne, 87, 93-5; early years in Australia,
97-115, contact with Melbourne artists, 102-07, crises, 101-
02, 106-13; poetry scandal, 133-36, 138-41; severance from
University, 142-43, 160; visit to Europe 1907, 165-69; disill-
usion with Melbourne, 134-88; return to England, 205-08; re-
appointment to University of Melbourne, 208-15.
VIEWS: on English music, 58-9; on creativity, 60-2; 136-38,
210-11; on emotion and music, 63-5, 108-10; on essential in
music, 63-5; on Wagner, 67-9; on society, 89-90, 212-13; on
criticism, 92-3; on Puccini, 169-71; 'The artist', 138, 109
IMPORTANCE OF: 4, 9-11, 184-85, 187, 202-03; success of works,
12, 36, 17, 18, 28; studies of, 12-17, 37.
LITERARY WORKS: (see also Catalogue of, Appendix I, 221-26),
Aristodemus, 136, 145; Bianca Capello, 163; A book of canticles,
112, 134, excerpt from, 3; The call of genius, excerpt from, 38;
Dramatic fragment, 87, 133; From Cromorne Point, 113; Hymns
ancient and modern, 2, 134-35; Hymn to Sydney, 104, 106-07, 110,
112, 113; On the Mask of Mary by Michelangelo (sic), excerpt
from, 96; To Irene, 44, 110-12.
MUSIC: (see also Catalogue of, Appendix II, 228-37)
OPERAS: (see also Thematic Catalogue of, Appendix II, 238-76)
Alcestis 17, 18, 23, 24, 87, 101, 103, 113, 115-133, 136, 147, 149, 150,
153, 159, 181, 204, 206, 217-18; adaptations from Harold, 129-32;
Aristodemus, 17, 23, 24, 101, 136, 145-60, 178, 182, 218; sketch-
libretto, 203-04;
Dido, 17, 23, 40, 41-56, 62, 69, 75, 84, 113, 121, 138, 147, 159, 178, 215
Harold 17, 23, 69-87, 94, 99, 113, 121, 125, 129, 138, 147, 152, 153, 159,
189, 216, 218; adaptations for Alcestis, 129-32;
Romeo and Juliet, 17, 18, 23, 185, 189-203, 205, 206, 207, 209, 219-20
Stella, 14, 17, 20, 23, 171-84, 185, 188, 200, 205, 207-07, 219
SYMPHONIC WORKS: Caprice, 17, 163; A Harold overture, 87;
Idyll, 17, 98; Melody, 17; Overture to Giordano Bruno, (= Dram-
atic Study, Overture in G minor), 17, 98, 106; Phantasy for horn and orchestra, 17, 163; Symphony in C, 17, 98; Symphony in Eb, 17, 18, 106-07, 118, 162, 171;
CHAMBER WORKS: (Un_titled) bassoon and piano piece, 98; Deux Fantaisies for violin and piano, 18, 163; Die Blumen, 56; Quartet for horn, violin, viola, and piano, 14, 17, 18, 163; String Quartet in C, 17, 98; String Quartet in D, 17, 163; String Quartet in F, 163;
CHORAL WORKS: Australian National Song, 18, 101, 136; Choral Ode on the Helena of Goethe, 17, 101, 133, 136;
SONGS: A song-cycle of life and love, 17, 18, 87-8; An Grabe Anselmos, 17, 136; La belle dame sans merci, 17, 136; Long After: a study on Tennyson's Maude (arr. for orchestra), 17, 101, 136, 162;
UNFINISHED WORKS: Parting and meeting, 41; The Tempest, 23, 148, 203-04, 214; As you like it 20, 23, 203, 208, 214;
LOST WORKS: The Trojan Women, 20, 23, 208, 209, 214; Leonard, 17, 23, 41, 215; others, 56
Marshall-Hall, Herrick (son by second wife), 144
Marshall-Hall, Hubert (son by second wife), 181, 215
Marshall-Hall, May (first wife), 93, 101, 144
Meissen, Saxony, Fürsten und Landes-Schule, 133, 206
Melba, (Dame) Nellie (1859-1931), 144, 186, 187, 214
Melba Memorial Conservatorium (Melbourne), 2, 9, 14, 142, 185-86, 187-88
Melbourne, artists, 11, 34-6, 102-05, 216; International Centennial Exhibition, 101; orchestral concerts in, 10, 97, 184-85; opportunities for composers in, 101-02; Ministry of Public Education, 187; Her Majesty's Theatre, 184, 203
Melbourne Conservatorium see Melba Memorial Conservatorium
Melbourne Liedertafel, 101-02, 117, 135, 136, 160
Melbourne, University of, Conservatorium, 2, 9-10, 97-8, 100-01, 113-15 142-43, 188, 213-14; Council of and Marshall-Hall scandal, 135-36, 138-41, 208-09; Professorial Board of, 139, 141; F.J. Dickson embezzlement case, 143-44; reflection of Marshall-Hall scandal in Stella, 183; Trinity College, 116, 132-33, 139
Mendelssohn, Felix (1809-1847), 10
'Military College' (Oxford), 40
Moffitt, Ernest, 102-04, 160, 216
Molinari, Bernardino (1880-1952), 12
Monteverdi, Claudio (1567-1643), Orfeo, 26
Moody, Manners and Co., 21,205,206
Moresby, Isabelle, 15
Moreton, Madame see Woolcock, Mabel
Mosman's Bay (Sydney), 106
Mozart, Wolfgang Amadeus (1756-1791), 10,68,114
Musgrove, George, 35
Musical News (London), 33
Musical Opinion, 33
Musical Standard, The, 33,39
Musical Times, The, 33,156
Musical World, The, 33,57,86

Nadeshda (A.G.Thomas), 59
Nápravník, Eduard (1839-1916), 71
'Neville d'Esterre' see Lee, Archibald E.J.
Newman, Ernest (1863-19 ), on Wagner, 90
New Patroclus, The (Lindsay), 140
Newton College (Devonshire), 41
Nicolai, Wilhelm F.G. (1829-1896), 10
Nietzsche, Friedrich W. (1844-1900), 62
Nikisch, Arthur (1855-1922), 12,169,185
Northcote, Lady, Permanent Orchestra Trust Fund, 161,185

Oblivion (Stroton), 104
Odalisque (Roberts), 104
Offenbach, Jacques (1819-1880), 10
opera, study of, 24-8
Orchard, William Arundel (1867-19 ), 14
Orfeo (Monteverdi), 26
Ousley, (Sir) Frederick A.G. (1825-1889), 94
Oxford, University of, 31,40

Parratt, (Sir) Walter (1841-1924), 40
Parry, (Sir) Charles Hubert Hastings (1848-1918), 12-2,16,40,57,86,94,205
Pascal, Florian, 88
Pauline (Cowen), 59
Pelléas et Mélisande (Debussy), 211
Perfect Wagnerite, The (Shaw), 69
Peri, Jacopo (1561-1633), 24
Peterson, Franklin, 140,142-43,208
Phrynis of Mythilene, 119
Pinchoff, Baron, 103
Pinchoff, Mme. Elise, née Wiedermann, 214
Plat, Maurice le, 163
Poeschel, Dr., 133
Politics (Aristotle), 90
Pretoria, war in, 135
Prout, Ebenezer (1835-1909), 100
Puccini, Giacomo Antonio Domenico Michele Secondo Maria (1858-1924), 168,169-71,200,203,205; Madame Butterfly, 14,33,169-71,172,174,178,181,182-83; La Bohème, 33,169; Traviata, 33; Tosca, 50,169,219,220
Purcell, Henry (?-1664), 69
Ravel, Maurice (1875-1937), 168
Revelation (Torrence), 129
Richter, Hans (1843-1916), 12,32,40,185-86
Pinsky-Korsakov, Nikolay Andreyevich (1844-1908), 97
Roberts, Tom, 34-5,102-05; Adagio, 104; Odalisque, 104; Marshall-Hall, 214
Robinson, (Sir) William, 94
Romeo and Juliet (Shakespeare), 189-93, 219
Rosa, Carl, 21
Rose of Castille, The (Balfe), 59
Rossini, Gioacchino Antonio (1792-1868), 24
Royal Academy of Music (London), 40,209
Royal College of Music (London), 13,15,40-1,57,205
Runciman, John F., 15,87,161
Sacre du printemps, Le (Stravinsky), 168,206
Santley, (Sir) Charles (1834-1922), 59,86,94,99
Saturday Revue, The, 15,161
Saint-Saëns, Camille (1835-1921), 97
Scharf, Eduard, 163,205
Schnabel, Artur, (1882-1931), 168
Schoenberg, Arnold, (1874-1951), 168,206,211
Schopenhauer, Arthur, (1788-1860) The world as will and idea, 107
School..., 33,57
Schubert, Franz Peter, (1797-1828), 10,33,39,103,142,162
Schumann, Robert, (1810-1856), 10,29,142,158
Scott, Cyril (1879-19 ), 205
Scott, Ernest, on Marshall-Hall, 14
Sere, Geoffrey, 18-9,22,34
Shakespeare, William, Romeo and Juliet, 20,189-93,219; The Tempest, 203-04; As you like it, 203
Shaw, George Bernard, 13,16,67,91,109; The perfect Wagnerite, 69
Siede, Julius, 33,129,161
Silver harmonies of evening, The (Streeton), 104
Skrjabin, Alexander Nikolayevitch (1872-1915), 211
Smith, Bernard, 104
Smyth, (Dame) Ethel Mary (1856-1944), 32
Sobell, Fischer, 208-09
Sommers, Joseph, 33
Sommervell, (Sir) Arthur (1863-1937), 11
Stanford, (Sir) Charles Villiers (1852-1924), 21,32,59,86,94, 205,216; The Canterbury Pilgrims, 59,86
Stenback, 168
Strauss, Richard (1864-1949), 97,169; Enoch Arden, 121
Stravinsky, Igor Feodorovich (1882-1971), 168,206
Streeton, (Sir) Arthur (1867-1943), 34-5,102-06,110,112,114,162, 171,216; Bush Idyll, 104; Oblivion, 104; The silver harmonies of evening, 104
Sugden, E.H., 14
Sullivan, (Sir) Arthur (1842-1900), 10,32,55
Sutton Crow, J., 16
Symbolist school, 62
Sydney, Conservatorium in, 14; Chair of Music at University of, 208; Symphony Orchestra, 169
Tate, Henry, 22-3
Tchaikovsky, Peter Ilyich (1840-1893), 19,30
Tempest, The (Shakespeare), 203-04
Tennyson, Alfred, 71
Thomas, Arthur Goring (1850-1892), 32,88; Esmeralda, 59; Nadezhda, 59
Timoteus of Milet, 119
Torrance, George William (1835-1907), 33; Revelation, 129
Tosca (Puccini), 50,169
Tovey, (Sir) Donald Francis (1875-1940), 24,27,159
Towers, John, 41
Towl, Florence, 132
Trades Hall Council (Melbourne), 184
Traviata, La (Puccini), 33

Union, Musicians', 184

Vaughan Williams, Ralph (1872-1958), 205
Verbruggen, Henri (1873-1934), 18
Vergil, Dido and Aeneas, 43-4,69
Victorian Artists' Society, 103,114

Wagner, Richard (1813-1883), 10,19,21,24,25,30,44,46,55,59,61-2, 71,90,93,97,104,109,110,114,133,158,169-71,215-16,219,220; leitmotiven technique, 76,84,171,216; tonal principles, 85; Marshall-Hall on, 67-9; Sprechgesang, 52; Oper und Drama, 64, 65,67,75; Die Fliegende Holländer, 53; Lohengrin,53,186,187; Parsifal, 39,69,138; Tannhäuser, 187; Tristan und Isolde, 49, 165; Die Walküre, 187
Wallace, William Vincent (1812-1865), 32
Wasps, The (Aristophanes), 160
Way, Arthur S., Euripides in English verse, 117
Weber, Carl Maria von (1786-1826) Der Freischütz, 121
Weingartner,Felix (1863-1942), 12,168
Wellessz, Egon (1885-19 ), 24
Wellings, Milton 13
Wellington College, 56
Weltner, 12
Wiedermann, Mme. Elise see Pichhoff, Mme. Elise
Williamson's, J.C., 35
Wood (Sir) Henry (1869–1944), 17, 33, 186, 213
Woolcock, Mabel (Madame Moreton), 187, 188
World, The, 13
Wozzeck (Berg), 26

Year Book of Australia, 97, 99

Zelman, Alberto, Jnr., 143
Author/s:
Bebbington, Warren Arthur

Title:
The operas of G. W. L. Marshall-Hall

Date:
1978

Citation:

Publication Status:
Unpublished

Persistent Link:
http://hdl.handle.net/11343/35446

File Description:
The operas of G. W. L. Marshall-Hall

Terms and Conditions:
Terms and Conditions: Copyright in works deposited in Minerva Access is retained by the copyright owner. The work may not be altered without permission from the copyright owner. Readers may only, download, print, and save electronic copies of whole works for their own personal non-commercial use. Any use that exceeds these limits requires permission from the copyright owner. Attribution is essential when quoting or paraphrasing from these works.