AN ANALYSIS OF

MARGARET SUTHERLAND'S SONATA

FOR CLARINET AND PIANO (1947)

by

IAN McKEON MORGAN

This thesis is presented in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the Master of Music degree.

Faculty of Music
University of Melbourne. December, 1984
## CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Formal Considerations</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Concerds and Discords</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>&quot;Points of Crisis&quot;</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 1</td>
<td>Score Discrepancies (1)</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix 2</td>
<td>Score Discrepancies (2)</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bibliography</td>
<td></td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER 1.  INTRODUCTION

The sonata for clarinet and piano by Margaret Sutherland has been selected as the subject of this thesis from a substantial list of sonatas by Australian composers. This choice was for two reasons: the sonata is the earliest surviving work for the combination and while not a major work, it is at least a substantial work by one of Australia's most important composers. The work is written in a contemporary musical style, typical of this composer, so that it sounds fresh and musically challenging even in today's musical environment.

The complete list of sonatas for clarinet and piano by Australian composers is as follows:

Margaret Sutherland  Sonata (n.d.) (Haydn arrangement)
                     Sonata (1944) (Mozart arrangement)
                     Sonata (1947)
Miriam Hyde          Sonata in F minor Op. 34 (1949)
William Lovelock    Sonatina (1960)
Peter Tahourdin      Sonata (1962)
Meta Overman         Sonata (1966)
Leslie Howard        Sonata (1968)
Peter Webb           Sonata (1981)
Colin Brumby         Sonata (1982)
Felix Werder         Sonata op. 36 (1960)
Paul Pavoir          Sonata (n.d.)
These works have all been performed publicly at least once. Manuscript copies of the last two mentioned works were lost or destroyed after their first performance. The sonatas by Meta Overman and William Lovelock are the only ones which have been published (by Allan and Co., Melbourne, and Chappel, respectively). Manuscript copies of the remaining works were obtained either from the composers themselves or, in the case of the Margaret Sutherland works, from private music collections.

The list of sonatas includes three by Margaret Sutherland. The first is undated and omitted in the lists of works given in the various reference articles used. This particular work was brought to my attention by Miss Isobel Carter, clarinettist and long-time friend of the composer. She remembers performing a sonata which was an arrangement of an unidentified piano sonata of Haydn. All trace of this work seems to have vanished.

The sonata (1944) is an arrangement of the keyboard Sonata in B flat K. 498 a ¹ by Mozart. This is a spurious work for it is thought that only the first and third movements are original, the others being additions by a contemporary arranger. Of particular interest to a clarinettist is the catalogue number of this work for it is the companion to the trio, K. 498, for clarinet, viola and piano. Margaret Sutherland has shortened the two spurious movements in this arrangement and has shown a good deal of understanding in the re-voicing of melodic lines between the clarinet and piano and the addition of keyboard harmonies to fill any gaps thus created. There are, understandably, numerous octave displacements to suit the clarinet's range and tonal characteristics.
It is hardly surprising that Margaret Sutherland should have taken such an interest in creating works for the clarinet. She was a most prolific composer and a pragmatist who wrote works for which there was an opportunity for performance. The classical arrangements would have filled an obvious void in the clarinet repertoire in the 1940s, for it is only recently that the many classical works for the instrument have appeared in print. The large number of original works attests the personal involvement of two local clarinettists, the late Thomas White and Isobel Carter. They were at various times close friends of the composer and were always keen to perform with her. For her own part, Margaret Sutherland was a gifted pianist and an excellent accompanist with an insatiable appetite for exploring contemporary works.

Margaret Sutherland's complete contribution to the repertoire of the clarinet is listed below.

1934  Trio (clarinet, viola, piano)
1936  Argument (clarinet and strings)
1936  House Quartet (clarinet or violin, viola, horn or cello, piano)
1938  The Orange Tree (clarinet, soprano, piano)
n.d. Sonata (arrangement of unidentified piano sonata of Haydn for clarinet and piano)
1944  Sonata (arrangement of Mozart K. 498 a, for clarinet and piano)
1947  Sonata (clarinet and piano)
1947  Cradle Song (clarinet and piano)

September (clarinet and soprano)
1957  Little Suite for wind (flute, clarinet, bassoon)
1967  Quintet (clarinet and string quartet)

The sonata of 1947 belongs to the middle period of Margaret Sutherland's creative life, 1929-1949. The earlier years had produced one work of note, the violin sonata of 1925. This work, rich in romantic sensuousness, had greatly impressed her composition teacher in London, Sir Arnold Bax. The years after 1949 on the other hand produced most of the larger orchestral works and reflect the greater maturity and expertise which had developed over many years. In particular it is the clarity of texture and dynamic rhythmic sense which is a feature of these works. During the middle period of her life, a time of domesticity and child rearing, she found time to arrange and participate in many chamber music concerts. This is reflected in the concentration on smaller scale works during this time. The main musical characteristics were an inclination to experiment, lyricism and a good deal of introspection, the latter possibly the result of disappointment at the lack of understanding of her musical style by the Australian musical public.

Being a product of the late middle period, the Sonata of 1947 combines several characteristics of this and the third period. The interest in experimentation is reflected in some unusual harmonic devices while introspection and lyricism are both associated with the first theme which slowly and self-consciously develops from a three-note core. Characteristics associated with the third period already evident in this work are the maturity and skill with which complex musical form and tonality are handled and the dynamic rhythmic drive of the finale section.
It is not in the scope of this treatise to give a detailed biographical account of the composer as this can be readily obtained from the references listed in the Bibliography. There is one aspect of Margaret Sutherland's life, however, which is worth mentioning for the light it sheds on the composer's particular musical language. Throughout her life she demonstrated an independent spirit which resulted in her developing an individual musical style that was akin to contemporary European styles. It was certainly not as the result of her academic studies at the Melbourne University Conservatorium, for the harmonic and compositional techniques taught there in the earlier part of this century followed a curriculum known as 'English counterpoint' which long since had been abandoned by European conservatories. Contemporary compositional techniques were acquired during two years abroad, 1924 and 1925, in which she studied composition, orchestration and conducting in London, Paris and Vienna. The works of Debussy, Bax, Milhaud, Bartók, Hindemith and Stravinsky exerted the most obvious influence on her developing musical style. Margaret Sutherland was thus courageous and alone, for her colonial contemporaries chose to follow the more easily accepted mid-Romantic ideals exemplified in Australia by Alfred Hill.

As was her custom with sonatas and chamber music, this sonata was adapted by the composer for its string counterpart, the viola. Similarly the oboe sonatina was adapted for the viola and the saxophone sonata for the 'cello. The House Quartet and the Fantasy Quartet mentioned in the list of works on page 3 also have interchangeable wind and string parts.
Performances of this sonata have been somewhat limited. This has been due to the unavailability of the manuscript rather than for any musical reason. Thomas White, for many years principal clarinetist with the Melbourne Symphony Orchestra, played the work on many occasions with the composer. A commercial disk (Festival SFC 80025) was released some years ago and features the Perth musicians Jack Harrison (clarinet) and Stephen Dornan (piano). An ABC tape with the violist John Glickman and the composer at the piano also exists but has not been heard on radio for many years. In general, the performing clarinettists of Australia seem to be unaware of the existence of this work.

The technical demands of this piece will not particularly extend the experienced clarinettist. The first section of it is predominantly lyrical and slow moving but punctuated by the occasional arabesque-like passage. The vigorous finale contains several passages, especially near the very end, which should be treated with respect as the leaps over wide intervals can often result in the unfortunate noise known as a "squeak". Bars 174 and 175 may present some fingering difficulties but this writer found that the passage became much easier when the high F on the clarinet (i.e. E flat in concert pitch) was produced as an overblown A in the register below. Clarinettists will find that the first part of this sonata provides a wonderful opportunity to indulge in expressive playing both with varied tone colour and subtle use of rubato. There may be some problems of interpretation with this sonata for it is music with an often obscure message. A performer who has not made an analytical study of the score may be at a loss to understand at times what the composer is driving at.
In the research for this thesis, two copies of the manuscript have been used. One of these is from the music collection of the late Thomas White and is the copy he used in performances with the composer. The separate clarinet part is signed by the composer but the piano part has been copied by another hand and is unsigned. This has been photocopied on the rather glossy paper used in earlier photocopy processes and is rather difficult to read in places. Individual notes in complex chords in particular, can cause difficulties. There are some pencil corrections which are assumed by this writer to be those of the composer. For this reason, it is this piano copy which has been used as the main reference. There are some discrepancies in tempo and expression indications between the piano and clarinet scores but nothing which would make a significant difference to a performance, (see Appendix 1). A second piano score was obtained from Jack Harrison. This copy was used by him in his recording and was supplied to him by the Australian Broadcasting Commission. It is a most beautifully legible copy, signed by a D.B. Pendergrast, apparently a contracted copyist used by the ABC. There are numerous discrepancies between the two piano scores, but it is this latter score which has been used to provide the musical illustrations throughout this treatise due to the excellence of the copying. Corrections have been made to these musical illustrations to make them consistent with the original notes or pencilled alternatives of the previously mentioned edition. A complete list of these discrepancies appears as Appendix 1 and 2.

The choice of a particular style of analysis in this thesis has been made to give emphasis to what Margaret Sutherland thought important in her writing. In so doing, the analysis has concentrated on such techniques as "hills and valleys", "points of crisis", chant intérieur and formal and
harmonic considerations, as well as some general aspects related to the conservatism or radicalism of her style.

The study has been organised under general headings, in which related material is discussed. Thus, Chapter 1 is a general introduction, Chapter 2 examines various aspects related to form, Chapter 3 contains a discussion of harmony and tonality, Chapter 4 examines various ways in which musical highlights are created, and Chapter 5 is the conclusion. References are made throughout the work to chant intérieur, this being an intrinsic part of the compositional process which affected every aspect of Margaret Sutherland's work. The appendices detail some problems encountered with the musical scores used.
CHAPTER 2. FORMAL CONSIDERATIONS

In choosing to write a 'Sonata', Margaret Sutherland has not entirely rejected the traditional structure of this musical form as did so many of her contemporaries. One would not, however, consider this a neo-classical work, for the traditional harmonic and structural elements are present in a form which is neither prominent nor easily recognisable. This is quite intentional for it was not in this composer's nature to follow slavishly a set routine and she had a declared dislike of anything that appeared contrived. She has, however, acknowledged in this work that a fundamental framework was necessary for the organisation of her musical thoughts.

Margaret Sutherland had fixed ideas about the use of sonata form in her music. They are recorded by her main biographer, J.D. Garretty:

She does not adhere to strict regulations when she uses the term, 'Sonata' for instance. To her, the design of a sonata may vary according to the number and contrast of themes, the main requirement being that the work be one of serious import and a certain weight with adequate development of themes.¹

It is easy to see how these ideas have influenced this particular work. Three main themes are used, incorporated into two standard musical forms. Two of these themes are wound into a 'sonata' form which takes up most of the work (bars 1-119). The third theme is in a ternary form finale (bars 120-176) which follows the first section without a break. There is a

strong contrast of thematic material between the two sections. The themes of the first section are of a fairly similar character, being contemplative and introspective, while the third is overtly exuberant and energetic, culminating in a brilliant climax in the final coda. It is, however, the 'adequate development of themes' which has had the most far-reaching effect on this work, for the sonata section is almost totally given over to the development of the important thematic elements. The traditional sonata format has been modified to allow for this disproportionate amount of development by reducing the exposition and recapitulation sections to a minimum - they are little more than a concise statement of the themes - and employing several development sections. The sectional proportion thus created is such that of the total number of bars in this section, eighteen per cent are allocated to the exposition, thirteen per cent to the recapitulations and sixty-nine per cent to the development sections.

The plan is as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1: Sonata Plan</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fairly Slowly.²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quicker, but</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>with breadth.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exposition of Theme A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exposition of Theme B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of Theme B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of Theme A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recapitulation of Theme B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recapitulation of Theme A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(A minor)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(A major)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(C major and G flat major are prominent)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(A major)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Roving tonality)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(C minor - B flat minor)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Allegro Vivace Ternary form section - Theme C Bars 120-176)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A minor and E minor)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

² These instructions are from the piano copy. Appendix 1 contains a list of discrepancies in the scores used.
This plan looks like a simple extension of the typical sonata format but, as with so many aspects of this work it is neither clear cut nor completely decisive. Tonality, for example, is deliberately ill-defined. The various tonalities shown on the plan (Table 1, page 10) while suggesting a conventional cycle of keys are but short glimpses of these particular keys before they are systematically diffused. This aspect of the work is dealt with in detail in Chapter 3.

Another aspect of the work which is not clearly defined is the recapitulation of theme A. This is deemed to be at bar 110 because this bar is the only time the embryo of this theme is heard in an exact transposition, even though it is presented in a shortened version. Bar 110 is near the end of a long development section and could quite easily be overlooked as being yet another re-shaping of the theme. A lengthier version of theme A commencing at bar 82 could be mistaken for the true recapitulation but it lacks the basic characteristic of the germ cell embryo of this theme, namely, the three successive ascending intervals of semitone, augmented fourth and semitone. The case for bar 110 being the true recapitulation of theme A is strengthened both harmonically and dramatically as it is the resolution of a dominant pedal (and thus a sense of anticipation) set up some bars earlier. This harmonic resolution is in the piano accompaniment when the F sharp pedal introduced at bar 107 is resolved on a minor ninth chord on B at bar 110. The melodic component of this bar (i.e. theme A) is, by analogy with bar 1, in E minor and this forms a bitonal relationship with the accompaniment. These two tonalities so combined are particularly significant. The melodic tonality, E minor is the dominant of the tonality of bar 1 where theme A was first heard. There is thus a tonic and dominant relationship between exposition and recapitulation. Obviously this could also be considered as a dominant minor ninth chord in E minor at bar 110,
but the force of the dominant F sharp in the previous three bars is such that this chord has an undeniable tonic status.

The B chord in the bass of the piano at bar 110 is but one in a series of dominant pedals for it resolves onto an E minor seventh chord at bar 114 and this in turn onto A minor at the beginning of the finale section (bar 120). In this way, the composer is able to introduce theme A in an atmosphere of harmonic anticipation and tension and preserve this atmosphere for some bars. By comparison, the case for the longer version of the theme at bar 82 being the true recapitulation is somewhat weaker. It lacks the harmonic anticipation, the intervallic structure is altered and there is a weaker tonal relationship with the exposition (tonic–mediant).

A further qualification to be added to the structural plan (Table 1, page 10) is that the section from bars 21 to 59 while designated development of theme B in fact contains a fleeting reference to theme A in bars 43-47. This is an interesting development of this theme for the characteristic interval of a tritone is reduced to a perfect fourth and thus the theme almost passes unnoticed in a section of the music where fourths are already prominent.

The structural plan (Table 1, page 10) shows how the composer has modified the tripartite boundaries of the traditional sonata form to suit the requirements of this particular work. It does not explain the preoccupation with thematic development that was obviously so important a part of this composer's musical outlook. This is the result of the phenomenon, chant intérieur, an inner voice which constantly haunted the composer's mind. Margaret Sutherland has described it with characteristic detail:
Many composers are almost at the mercy of incessant chant interieur. ... It is as if the composer who has developed the art of dealing with floating ideas (taking them, shaping them, giving them a home and an identity) has to pay the penalty for having them constantly at his door. They are like mendicants who have put a cross on his gate for others to follow in their footsteps. They come in scores, begging him to do for them what he has done for their forerunners, any time of day or night; they are no respecters of visiting hours ... they are rough-hewn crude and unfinished. The composer reverts to them as a French polisher will give a rub to his latest piece of work, or a gardener will pull out a few weeds. They are with him constantly jogging his elbow prodding him ... he is in fact their slave in a sense, and how they know it. ³

This aspect of the compositional process manifests itself in several ways. Most obvious is the emphasis on thematic development which results in a continual variation of melodic outlines, a new harmonic inflection, a rhythmic change or an alteration to the piano accompaniment. These are the basic aspects of Sutherland's technique and are discussed in the following chapters.

Another important compositional technique used in this work, for it was a favourite device of the composer, is a germ cell technique in which each theme of the work begins with several distinctive musical intervals. These several intervals of three or more notes form the basic units which are expanded into lengthy themes either by repetition, as in theme A; with the addition of unrelated material, as in theme B; or by a continuation of the intervallic structure of the germ cell as in theme C.

³ See Chapter 5, p. 55.
The most extreme expression of the germ cell technique is when a single note is used to represent a particular theme. In the case of theme A this note is C natural and for theme B, C sharp. These two notes are the most representative notes in the main tonalities of these themes (i.e. A minor for theme A and A major for theme B). In bars 51 and 52 these two notes (C natural and C sharp) stand out as if in tonal conflict and thus represent musically a conflict in the composer's mind as to which of the themes will next be heard. Similarly, at bars 156 and 157 the notes G natural and G sharp represent two tonalities, E minor and A minor respectively. These two notes are highlighted in the chordal structure of these bars where they represent a conflict between the two tonalities in which theme C is heard.

Another, subtle but important aspect of the *chant intérieur* which is fundamental to this work is the interest in certain intervals. These can exist either throughout the work or in specific areas. The first of these intervals is that of the augmented fourth. It is prominent in the first five bars where it is an integral part of the germ cell of theme A. In bars 6 and 7 the interval of the perfect fourth is introduced in a short sequence. This prepares the way for theme B whose germ cell comprises several intervals of which a falling perfect fourth is a prominent one. In the passage from bars 10 to 27 which is concerned with theme B, there are numerous fourths featured in the accompaniment either in the arpeggio chordal construction as in bars 10, 16 and 17 where the highest note of the accompaniment falls a fourth or as in bars 12 and 13 where a quartal chord construction (*F#*–*B* flat–*E* flat) is used. The restatement of theme B at bar 59 brings a resurgence of interest in this interval. In the passage from bars 59 to 64, the theme follows a new melodic direction but the prominence of this interval assures the link with the earlier passage (i.e. the exposition at bar 10) and with the germ cell of this theme. An interesting extension of
the use of the intervals from the germ cell of theme B occurs in the short
canoncic episode from bars 67 to 70. Intervals of both major and minor
sixths (the major sixth is also part of the germ cell of theme B) are
answered by fourths to provide the main melodic interest.

It is, however, the interval of the third which exerts the greatest influence
in the first section of the work. By way of introduction, a short descending
passage in bars 35 and 36 combines both major and minor thirds with the
previously used intervals - augmented and perfect fourths. Another
important bar is bar 46 where a sequence of descending thirds is used. But
the interval is particularly prominent between bars 51 and 58. Because this
interval is so basic to any tonally-based work, some detailed examples are
given below to stress the particular importance of it in this work.

The first example is bar 51 where the arabesque-like flourish of the
clarinet part which is made of ascending and descending thirds appears to
have no harmonic significance other than to highlight a change of C sharp
to C natural. But, as previously discussed (page 14), this is of particular
significance in this work. In bars 52 and 53, melodic interest centres on
three sets of minor thirds. The first of these is the repeated note C in the
highest voice of the piano which rises to E flat in bar 53. This is answered
at the lower octave by an overlapping rising motive E flat to G flat while
the clarinet in bar 53 alternates between notes of another minor third, F to
A flat. In bar 54 this F to A flat motive is expanded, in the clarinet line,
into a longer passage initially dominated by thirds. This is then taken over
by the piano as a melodic fragment in bars 55, 56 and 57.
The interest in this particular interval is interrupted at bar 59 by the return of theme B and thus a resurgence of the interval of a fourth. Thirds become a prominent feature in the section from bar 88 to the beginning of the finale section at bar 120. At bar 88, thirds are used in an arpeggio-like construction in the clarinet line. The semitonal alteration (C sharp to C natural) resulting in minor and major thirds in the one tonality leads into an harmonically interesting passage between bars 90 and 95 in which the relationship of major and minor is highlighted in a passage of unsettled and dual modality. The unsettled modality results from the semitonal alteration of one note to produce alternately major and minor modes in the one melodic phrase. The dual modality occurs when both major and minor modes are present in the one chord (for example, bar 90, second chord, G, B natural, B flat, D; or bar 92, first chord, B flat, D natural, D flat, F).

Figure 1: Bars 90 – 92

At bar 100, a new melodic fragment is built from alternately rising and falling thirds. At bar 102 it is repeated as a sequence mostly a minor third higher. Some bars later, thirds are particularly prominent either in the arpeggio-like construction of bar 116 or in the bi-modal figure of bars 117-118 which was previously heard in bars 93 and 94, as described above.
The interest particularly in the minor third interval over the final bars of this first section of the work creates a good transition into the finale section at bar 120 for this interval is the first interval of theme C, the main theme of the new section. But the other intervals which have been prominent in this discussion have a similar relationship with this new theme for the minor third is followed by intervals of a perfect and augmented fourth (diminished fifth). In this way, the composer is able to embody in theme C the principal intervallic elements of themes A and B.

Figure 2: Bars 120 – 124

Whether a subconscious or deliberate influence of the chant intérieur, there is no denying the strong intervallic relationship between the three themes of this work. No doubt this is an example of the floating ideas which are 'constantly jogging his (the composer's) elbow prodding him', (see page 13).
Another aspect of the composer's philosophy of allowing the content to determine the form has resulted in some interesting implications when considering the overall structure of this work. The three main themes each have a distinctive character, owing to both mood and intervalllic structure. As they are treated mainly in individual sections, with a second section given to theme A, the work has acquired a four sectional aspect. This is similar to the individual movements one might expect in a four movement work, or in one with a short introduction and three main movements. The statement of theme A (bars 1-9) forms this introduction and was so indicated by the composer on the clarinet part - 'Solo introduction quite slowly' (see Appendix 1). At bar 10 there is a change of tempo for theme B - 'Quicker, but with breadth'. At bar 82, theme A reappears in its main section for development and thus another change of tempo, 'Slowly'. It is not only the tempo which suggests a slow movement here for the piano accompaniment is chordal with a slow harmonic articulation in contrast to the flowing accompaniment of the preceding section. The finale (allegro vivace) creates the fourth section and brings the work to a rousing conclusion.

Despite the multi-sectional aspect, this sonata has acquired the title, 'Sonata in one movement', and that it certainly is, for the various sections are connected and follow without breaks. The fundamental intervalllic relationships which traverse these sectional borders demonstrate the continuity of musical thought which was present in the compositional process.

CHAPTER 3. CONCORDS AND DISCORDS

The most striking feature of Margaret Sutherland's harmonic usage and the one which perplexed the contemporary audience is the apparent lack of tonal direction in the music. At times there are easily recognisable chords but they are separated by lengthy sections of intense harmonic complexity in which the tonality is ill-defined. This effect is deliberate, but the music of Margaret Sutherland is rarely atonal for she shared with Milhaud and Hindemith a way of camouflaging what can be shown to be a conventionally-derived harmonic framework. She has drawn from a wide range of contemporary harmonic thinking to create deliberate ambiguity and uncertainty. Chords which might clearly define a particular key are avoided and tonalities are subtly undermined with ambiguous or conflicting harmonies.

As with so many of Margaret Sutherland's works, there is no key signature used in this work. There can be no doubt, however, that there is a tonal centre of A. This is revealed in the exposition section where the two themes use A minor and A major respectively, the development where the related tonalities of C and G flat are prominent and the recapitulations where the themes are restated in E minor and A major respectively. The finale section of the work commences in A minor and finishes in E minor. The fundamental relationship of tonic and dominant is reinforced throughout the work, not only in several perfect cadences but in the setting up of dominant pedals in strategic places to create a strong sense of anticipating a new key. It can thus be shown that the harmonic infrastructure of this work ties into a traditionally-based cycle of keys.
The first of the numerous devices used to disguise the simplicity of this harmonic scheme is that of melodic tonal ambiguity. This is set up in the very first bar, for it contains the four-note germ cell from which the first theme is built. Harmonic ambiguity is suggested in this germ cell by two sets of leading notes (E and B), each of which rises a semitone, and, by the tritone, F to B. (Figure 3)

Figure 3: Bars 1–5

This germ cell is used in each of the first five bars and is not supported by any keyboard harmony. By the fifth bar successive melodic peaks have outlined an arpeggio of F major (C, F and A). The seventh bar uses F major and D minor arpeggios melodically and the piano chords of bars 8 and 9 are D minor also. In this way, that is, with the prominence of C in the germ cell and the chords of F major and D minor, A minor becomes the implied tonality. The note A stands out as the most important individual note as it is the highest note of the phrase (bar 5) and then prominent as a sustained note on the clarinet in bars 8 and 9. (Figure 4).
In bar 9, a C sharp is added to the D minor chord and voiced so that the 'major third A–C sharp stands out at the top of the chord. There are several implications of this new harmonic direction. One is to suggest a perfect cadence into D minor with the first beat of bar 9 suggesting the dominant and the second crotchet beat the tonic (in this case with an added sixth which does not alter the D minor sense). Another possible explanation for the C sharp is that it is a premature suggestion of A major for that is the very obvious tonality of bar 10. The combination of two harmonies in this way is a regular feature of the work. Whatever the composer's true intentions the numerous harmonic possibilities all have a strong relationship to a tonal centre of A.

At bar 10 the second theme commences. It, too, uses a germ cell motive, in this case the notes of the chord of C sharp minor. (Figure 5)
Harmonic ambiguity is again present, this time as a conflict between tonic and mediant triads (i.e. A major and C sharp major). Both these chords are used in the first bar (bar 10) to support the melodic motive which has two notes in common with each triad. The motive is expanded into a twelve-bar statement in which frequent references to the germ cell are separated by melodic egressions to several unrelated or undefined tonalities. The first of these occurs at bar 12 where the ear anticipates a melodic note E and a cadence to A major. Instead, however, there is a melodic note F accompanied by the tonal indecisiveness of diminished and quartal harmonies. (Figure 6)
At bar 14, an arpeggio of C sharp minor and thus a reminder of the germ cell is used to lead into a rising phrase which melodically suggests B minor. This is unsupported harmonically as the chordal structure while not suggesting a definite tonality of its own avoids notes of B minor. A brief resolution of this harmonic conflict at bar 16 leads into the re-establishment of A as the tonal centre at bar 17, but rather weakly, as the melodic A of this bar is accompanied by distantly related chordal structures – a diminished chord D sharp, F sharp and C on the first beat, F major on the second and a chordal seventh structure A, C, E, G on the third and fourth beats.

Figure 7: Bars 14 - 17

From this point there is an obvious avoidance of tonalities related to A as a chromatically falling bass progression (A sharp, A natural, G sharp and G natural) in bars 18, 19 and 20 prepares for a perfect cadence into C major at bars 20 and 21. (Figure 8)
C major at bars 20 and 21. (Figure 8)

C natural) in bars 16, 19 and 20 prepares for a perfect cadence into chromatically falling bass progression (G minor, G sharp, and G natural). From this point there is an obvious evocation of tonalities related to A as a

Figure 7: Bars 14-17.

third and fourth beats.

P major on the second and a chordal seventh structure A, C, F, G on the structure - a diminished chord D minor, F sharp, and C on the first beat, method A of this bar is accompanied by distantly related chordal establishment of A as the tonal center at bar 17, but rather weekly as the brief resolution of this harmonic conflict at bar 16 leads into the Re.

not suggesting a definite tonality of its own avoids notes of b minor.
The mediant triad is so prominent both melodically and harmonically throughout this twelve-bar phrase that one might reasonably suspect that C sharp minor not A major was the intended overall tonality. Chords which contain the note A are generally avoided but there are a few which draw the listener back to the tonal centre in some interesting ways besides those already mentioned. There is only one chord of A major and that is the first chord of the passage (bar 10). At bar 11, A appears in the related chord of D minor. The next time A is used harmonically (bar 13), it is a fifth extension in a ninth chord on G (G, B, D-A).

Thus in a passage where one might expect a tonic tonality to be decisively established, especially after the vagueness of the introductory bars, one finds a preponderance of mediant chords resulting in an undermining of the tonic by the leading note (G sharp). The mediant chord does to some extent replace the tonic as there are two notes common to both. The composer has used this substitution frequently in this work to avoid strongly suggesting a tonic. The resultant tonal ambiguity is harmonically compounded by the use of diminished, quartal and extended chordal structures, bitonality and transitory modulations to unrelated keys.
In the third main theme of this work, (theme C), the composer reveals yet another aspect of this melodic tonal ambiguity. This particular theme is harmonised at the same pitch in two different tonalities. At bar 120 when it is heard for the first time it is accompanied by chords which, although chromatic, support a tonality of A minor. (Figure 9)

Figure 9: Bars 120 and 121

This tonality is particularly prominent in the piano bass line where chords of A minor are heard on the first and fourth crotchet beats for four successive bars. On the sixth beat of these bars there is a deliberate undermining of A minor with the introduction of A sharp in a seventh chord on the sub-median (that is, F sharp seventh) but this is itself weakened by a melodic A natural at the same pitch in the clarinet line.

This theme re-appears at bar 139 where the first chord of the bar remains as before (a minor ninth chord on A) but the chord on the sixth beat is altered to F, A, C sharp, E. (Figure 10) This is a slight change which if anything strengthens the importance of A as the tonal centre in that this note (A) remains unaltered in the sixth beat instead of rising a semitone as it did at bar 120.
At bars 162 and 164, theme C is heard for the last time. On this occasion the tonality has changed from A minor to a decisive E minor. (Figure 11)

E chords are used on the first beat of eight consecutive bars (162-170). The harmonic relationship of the chords on the first and sixth beats (that is tonic and sub-mediant respectively) is preserved although somewhat ambiguous as the C major chord (the sub-mediant of E minor) which is clearly defined in the piano bass is combined with B flat and A in the treble resulting in a ninth chord overall (A, C, E, G, B flat). The structure of this chord is such, however, that the C major chord in the bar dictates the harmonic implication.
The different tonalities to which this particular theme is adapted are significant for they are the main tonalities of this finale section. From bars 120 to 161 there is a prevailing tonal centre of A (more minor than major) while the remainder, bar 162 to the end, is convincingly in E minor.

It can thus be shown that the three themes which exert such an harmonic influence throughout this work share a common characteristic of harmonic ambivalence. In theme A this is due to the lack of a specific tonal direction in the intervallic structure of the germ cell, in theme B to the deliberate conflict of tonic and leading-note caused by the substitution of the mediant chord for the tonic, and in theme C to the use of a repeated note which adapts to two different tonalities by virtue of being the dominant of one and the tonic of the other.

The avoidance of chords which would anchor the music in a particular key was discussed in relation to the passage from bars 10–21 (pp. 22 and 23). Another aspect of avoiding chords which might tie the music to a particular key is the use of a tonal centre in a succession of unrelated chords each of which subtly undermines the tonal sense without actually conflicting with it. Such a case is seen in the passage starting at bar 82 (Figure 12) in which C minor appears at the main tonality.

Figure 12: Bars 82 – 85
This is established in bar 82 with a simple chord of C minor while the following harmonies emphasise C in the piano and G in the clarinet. In bar 83, C is contained a chord of A flat major to which an alien note D is added in the clarinet and uppermost piano voice. In bar 84, C is contained in a French augmented sixth chord (A flat, C, D, F sharp), while in bar 85 a quintal chord construction containing C (F, C, G, D, A flat) is used. C is thus common to four successive chords as an obvious tonal centre but the sense of C minor created at bar 82 is gradually undermined with successively more distantly related chords.

Vacillation between the major and minor modes within the same tonality is yet another aspect of harmonic complexity in this work. It is used in several different ways. Firstly, there are bi-modal chords in which the major and minor modes are heard simultaneously. (Figure 13)

Figure 13: Bars 92 and 93

A melodic extension of this principle is seen when the modality of the melodic phrase conflicts with the modality of the accompaniment (such as at bar 90, Figure 14), or when a single melodic phrase alternates between both modes (as at bar 91).
Semitonal alteration is applied to other notes of a chord to create some harmonically confusing passing notes. This particular technique has been used with theme A (Figure 15) where the semitonal movement of the melodic line is the root of a first inversion chord (as in bar 43, third and fourth beats and bar 45, first and second beats).

Several previously mentioned techniques are combined in the passage starting at bar 37. Firstly, we catch but a glimpse of C major after a fairly lengthy passage of roving tonalities. This new key is sustained for two and a half bars — a relatively long time in this work — until E flat, already introduced into the clarinet melodic line, becomes established in the piano harmonies at the second half of bar 39. A semitonal movement from the C major chord produces notes of the dominant minor ninth chord in the
second half of bars 38, 39 and 41. Far from suggesting a movement from C, this evidences a shift to C minor with the introduction of A flat. A tonic pedal (C) affirms C as the tonal centre throughout this passage. The composer is thus able to create a complex situation in which bi-modal tonic, and dominant chords are heard simultaneously. (Figure 16)

Figure 16: Bars 37 - 41

An entire passage from bars 100 to 110 uses bitonality as a main feature. Firstly, F sharp major chords in the bass are combined with C major in the treble (bars 100 to 103). From bars 103 to 106, seventh chords on G and A are alternated. At bar 107, F sharp returns to the bass while elements of D minor, A major and G major triads are heard in succession in the upper piano voices. Bar 110 combines the harmonies of a ninth chord on B in the piano with the implied harmonies of E in the clarinet.¹

¹ There are numerous other examples of the use of bitonality often contained in an isolated bar as in bar 47 where D minor and C sharp are combined.
There are several bars (32, 53, 131, 154 for example) where there appear to be three independent musical lines each with a different harmonic inference. In such cases, the ear will make certain harmonic associations or alternatively the clarinet line or a particular voice in the piano will predominate. When, as in the bars mentioned above, the composer has used a mixture of flat and sharp accidentals to separate visually several distinct tonalities it would seem that she was thinking of a multiple tonal direction. To take one example, bar 154, one can find a strong suggestion of C major in the clarinet line. The harmonic direction of the two piano lines is not as obvious but one might discern a leaning towards D minor in the treble and G minor in the bass. The bars either side of this example do little to clarify the harmonies as this is an obvious passage of roving tonalities. (Figure 17)

Figure 17: Bar 154

A more subtle form of bitonality occurs when one or more of the melodic lines is temporarily out of vertical alignment with its harmonic accompaniment. Such a passage starts in the second half of bar 14 where the clarinet phrase is clearly headed for B minor while the piano continues a progression more closely related to the immediately preceding harmonies. It is not until the end of bar 16 that the two parts are harmonically reconciled. A similar example occurs several bars later. It is
rather more suggestive of an appoggiatura when the note E, clearly part of
the chordal structure A sharp, C sharp, E, G sharp, at the first half of
bar 18, is retained as an alien note to the chordal structure, B, D, F, A on
the second half of bar 18. E is thus suspended as a discord for half a bar
then resolved in bar 19.

Thus far, the various harmonic techniques which have been examined
demonstrate how the composer is able to create tonal ambiguity or
instability through isolated chords or in whole passages. At times several
individual techniques have been combined to create areas of even greater
complexity. Despite the tonal confusion which results, it has always been
possible to find a tonally-based explanation, no matter how distant it might
seem. It is clear that atonality plays little part in the harmonic scheme of
this work, except perhaps in one small section. This is a passage of five
bars starting at bar 65. The harmonic analysis reveals a whole tone series
(C sharp, D sharp, F, G, A, B). These notes, with the exception of A, are
all used in the piano lines of bars 65 to 70 and in the clarinet in bar 71. A
motive of a rising fourth (B flat to E flat) is introduced in bar 67 as a
melodic entity. Its tonal conflict with the series, particularly the
melodically prominent B natural, makes it stand out in bold relief against
the tonal anonymity of the whole tones. This short passage and an earlier
bar (61) where the piano accompaniment also employs this whole tone
series would seem to be the only instances where the music moves towards
atonality.
The harmonic vocabulary of Margaret Sutherland can thus be shown to be very wide indeed. This is a short sonata and most of the musical examples have been deliberately chosen from the first section of the work to emphasise the close proximity of the various ideas and their ephemeral nature. It should be mentioned in passing that the harmonic structure of the second part is rather less complicated with the basic tonalities (A minor and E minor) being more obviously sustained. The harmonic changes of the earlier part of the work are abrupt and mercurial but always controlled by the composer's agile mind so that occasional glimpses of clearly defined harmony, no matter how fleeting, constantly draw the listener back to the fundamental tonal scheme. When necessary, clear simple harmonies are used as in the final coda when repeated chords of E minor bring the work to a harmonically, as well as musically, satisfying conclusion.

In summary, it can be shown that the harmonic complexity of this work results from the use of several basic ideas, namely: the use of tonal centres, the avoidance of diatonic chordal structures when setting up a tonality, the use of bitonality and substitute chords to create subtle counter harmonies within an overall harmonic framework.
CHAPTER 4. 'POINTS OF CRISIS'

Another important aspect of Margaret Sutherland's musical technique which is particularly pertinent to this work is the creation of a series of climaxes at irregular places throughout the music. These climaxes are often slight, perhaps as the result of a peak in the melody, or some unexpected harmonic astringency. The composer regarded these climaxes as the 'hills and valleys'¹ in her music. These musical peaks are overshadowed by two climaxes of even greater magnitude whose foundations form an integral part of the structure of the music. These peaks seem to represent some sort of emotional crisis in the music and were regarded by the composer as 'points of crisis'.²

In this composition, these 'points of crisis' stand out as areas where the creative process has reached some sort of temporary nervous exhaustion. This is represented musically as a complete breaking down of the existing melodic, rhythmic and harmonic structures and the setting up, albeit temporarily, of new patterns. They occur at strategic places in the music, most importantly the bars preceding the recapitulation of the main themes.

The first 'point of crisis' occurs in the eight-bar section leading into the recapitulation of theme B at bar 59.(Figure 18)

¹ Garretty, op. cit., p. 59
² Ibid., p. 59
The clarinet arabesque figure in bar 51 stands out as an abrupt change to the tightly controlled melodic development of this movement which hitherto has been closely related to the principal themes. The series of thirds which make up this arabesque figure appear to have no harmonic purpose except to emphasise the notes C and C sharp (they are emphasised again in the next bar in a different way). At this point there is an harmonic conflict, the C natural and C sharp representing the tonalities of themes A and B, A minor and A major, respectively (see p.14). The chant intérieur has not decided which tonality and thus which theme, will follow. This question remains unresolved for some bars until theme B returns at bar 59.
The change of melodic direction noticed at bar 51 is continued in the following bars where there is no recognisably coherent melody. There is instead, a series of short motives derived from repeated notes in bar 52 and from intervallic structures of thirds and fourths used in short chromatic sequences (bars 53-58).

Harmonically, the first beat of bar 56 stands out as being the main feature of this section. Attention is drawn to it in several ways. Firstly, the clarinet sustains the note E an octave below the lowest element of the piano line thus adding a new and unusual colour to the registration of the lines. The note E thus highlighted is the bass note of a dominant minor ninth chord, the other notes being a doubling of the E to which are added B, G sharp (as A flat) and F. Secondly, attention is directed to this note by the contrary motion between the piano bass line and the clarinet line leading into it. The piano bass rises by step from E in bar 52 to the octave E in bar 56 while the clarinet falls chromatically from F, the second quaver in bar 54.

Table 2:
Contrary motion between piano bass and clarinet bars 52-57.
The remaining chords of this crisis area form a rather neutral extension of this chord as no new or conflicting harmonies are created. The dominant ninth chord is then re-formed at the end of bar 58 resolving into its tonic (A major) with the return of theme B at bar 59.

Finally, the rhythmic transformation during these bars must be considered for it plays no lesser role than the melodic and harmonic aspects already mentioned. The familiar triplet rhythmic pattern associated with theme B in much of this movement is re-introduced systematically at bar 48 with the re-appearance of the second theme in G flat major. In bar 50 a duple rhythm overlays the triple with the alternation of two notes within the three. This is intensified in bar 51 where the combined B flat and C sharp alternate with a solitary A. There is also considerable rhythmic complexity between the clarinet and piano parts. In bar 51 the clarinet has groups of seven semiquavers and eight demi-semiquavers against the triplet accompaniment. In bar 53 when both instruments have triplet figures, rhythmic suspensions are created in the clarinet part with the addition of ties thus adding a new element to the rhythmic complexity of the triplets. In bar 54 the clarinet has pairs of quavers against an offbeat triplet accompaniment while maximum complexity is created in bar 55 with a conflict of two duple patterns in quavers and semiquavers - with the triplet quaver figuration of the piano left hand. At the first beat in bar 56, this juxtaposition of rhythms is abandoned and the rhythmic pulse reverts to quavers grouped in pairs with crotchet accompaniment. In bars 57 and 58 the rhythmic simplicity is maintained but these bars are interesting for their change of metre from the existing \( \frac{4}{4} \) to \( \frac{5}{4} \) and \( \frac{3}{4} \) respectively. There is no change to the number of crotchet beats which would have occurred if the regular metre had been maintained, but there is a sensation of drawing out then contracting the rhythm of these bars. Conflicting with
the time signatures of these bars (56 and 57) is the implied rhythm of the six quaver sequence of the piano right hand so that the $\frac{4}{4}$ and $\frac{5}{4}$ have a natural motivic articulation of $\frac{3}{4}$-$\frac{3}{4}$-$\frac{3}{4}$ across them which resolves in the $\frac{3}{4}$ bar (58). It will be shown with the next crisis point that this setting up of small rhythmic units within larger ones is not an isolated example.

There are two marks of expression which have been added to this passage by the composer to further intensify the musical ideas: firstly, the fortissimo (ff) indication at bar 55 to show that this, the most harmonically and rhythmically complex bar is to be the loudest and secondly, 'rit' over the last bar, to add to the natural unwinding which has been created in the music at this point.

In summary it can be shown how several simple musical ideas can be combined to create this crisis effect. There is a gradual shift of interest from the established melodic and rhythmic patterns to new short motives. A peak is created at bar 56 with a convergence from different directions on notes of a dominant minor ninth chord, which remains unresolved for several bars thus carrying the harmonic tension into the next section of the music.

The second main crisis point occurs in the finale section in the bars preceding the return of theme C at bar 162. (Figure 19)
Figure 19: Bars 156 - 162

The most prominent feature in this example is the abrupt change from the well established duple and triple metres (bars 146-148 are typical examples) to a time signature of $\frac{5}{4}$ with a basic crotchet pulse. This new passage (bars 156-162) comprises hammered piano chords for two bars followed by a downward rushing cadenza-like solo passage for the clarinet over four bars. Again the composer has reduced the penultimate bar (161) by one beat, from $\frac{5}{4}$ to $\frac{4}{4}$. Another feature in common with the previous example is the creation of rhythmic complexity when cross rhythms are set up within a larger rhythmic framework. In bars 156 and 157, a pulse of $3+3+3+1$ crotchets is created, with the use of rhythmic ties across the main beats. In the solo clarinet passage (bars 158-162), the three bars of $\frac{5}{4}$ and one of $\frac{4}{4}$ have a grouping of $3+3+3+2+2+3$ crotchets, owing to the natural motivic articulation of the semitonal sequence used in this passage.
The inclination towards chromatic melodic lines is rather more pronounced in this crisis area. It first becomes evident as early as bar 144 in a new motive based on chromatic intervallic alteration. (Figure 20) This motive,

![Figure 20: Bars 144 and 145](image)

and another introduced in the following bar are used several times each to make a short bridge section between the second appearance of the main melody (bars 139-142) and the crisis area (starting at bar 156). Chromaticism is complete in the clarinet cadenza (bars 158-162), which is nothing more than an interrupted chromatic scale of two octaves. The general harmonic framework is rather more difficult to define than in the previous example. This is certainly the area of greatest difference between the two crisis points. There is one feature which does stand out as being harmonically significant, however. This is the clash of G natural and G sharp in the piano chords of bars 156 and 157. The significance of the semitonal clash (C and C Sharp) which marked the start of the first crisis area has already been discussed (p.35). Here the same technique used to commence this second crisis area. The G natural and G sharp, cell representation of the tonalities of E minor and A minor respectively represent musically a conflict between the two different tonalities in which theme C is heard. A minor has been the principal tonality from the introduction of theme C at bar 120 to this point (bar 156) while E minor is
the principal tonality from the return of theme C at bar 162 to the end (bar 176). As with the first crisis area, the intrinsic elements of two tonalities are thrown together and the chant intérieur is temporarily unable to decide on an immediate musical path.

The established difference between these two crisis points is that the first relies on a strong harmonic framework to give anticipation of the return of the theme while the other creates tonal confusion in the piano chords and a loss of tonal direction with the greater use of chromaticism. In the first example, the music unwinds almost to a halt, while in the second, there is such momentum in the musical subject matter that the sudden change of time signature, the dissonance and then the tonal freedom of the chromaticism, heightened by the fortissimo marking of the clarinet cadenza, all increase the general sense of excitement and push the music into the return of the theme and the conclusion of the work.

The recapitulation of the remaining theme (theme A at bar 110) does not have the same dramatic impact on the music as the two previously discussed examples. For this reason, it can be regarded as an example of the 'hills and valleys', the lesser emotional peaks which the composer has created frequently yet irregularly throughout the work. The recapitulation of theme A occurs at bar 110, but as this area of the music is thematically closely linked to that which immediately precedes it (unlike the crisis points), it is appropriate to discuss an entire section of the music (bars 82–120) in terms of a series of hills and valleys. This section is tripartite and a variant of theme A begins each section. The harmonic plan uses C minor, B flat minor and B major/E minor as the tonality of each of these sections. The theme at bar 82 follows the original melodic outline

3 Garretty, op. cit., p. 59.
but not the intervallic structure. There is a melodic peak at bar 86, accented on this occasion by a sudden clash of harmony — the chant intérieur is trying a new emphasis at this point. The melodic note G which is the peak of this passage is not avoided in the immediately preceding bars as was the peak note (A) in the original theme (see p.20), but stands out as a feature of these bars. It is with this note (G) used melodically, and a tonal scheme in which the note C appears in a series of four consecutive chords (see pages 27 and 28), that the tonality of C, established in bar 82 in a C minor chord, is maintained. A point of tension is created in bar 86 when the clarinet and piano treble shift to D flat major harmonies leading into a G at the peak of the clarinet melodic phrase. This G is supported three octaves lower in the bass line of the piano, but it is the clarinet note which stands out as a most obvious harmonic conflict. The tension point thus created is quitted in bars 88 and 89 by a pattern of thirds and semitones not unlike those in bars 56 and 57 in the first crisis part.

A short passage which connects this musical 'hill' with the next, commencing at bar 96, contains two significant features. Firstly the valley or relaxation after the tension is created melodically in a small triadic motive played by both instruments. This small motive does not develop significantly and turns back on itself several times to use the same notes in reverse order. At the same time, there is an underlying disquiet in the music caused by the semitonal alteration of some notes. This is especially important at bar 92 where the alternation of D natural and D flat suggests a conflict between B flat major and B flat minor. The significance of these semitonal conflicts has already been mentioned in connection with the crisis areas. This particular conflict is resolved at bar 96 where B flat minor is established as the main tonality. As with the passage from bar 82,

4 E flats are absent from the chords in bars 83, 84 and 85.
this tonic is heard once in a diatonic chord and then suggested in a cycle of chords each containing B flat (bars 97 and 98). The next variant of theme A is introduced over these B flat harmonies. This time the second and fourth bars have been inverted in a new re-shaping of the melody. Tension is added in the fifth bar of this section with the hint of bitonality, F sharp major chords combined with C major (bar 100). Agitation is created with the introduction of a quicker pulse, then rapid oscillation between chords of F sharp ninth and B diminished over an F sharp pedal (bar 101). The music gathers momentum in this way and continues for ten bars until the F sharp pedal introduced at bar 100 finally resolves onto a chord of B major at bar 110. This bar is particularly significant. Not only is it the harmonic resolution of the ten bars of tension created by the bitonality but is also heralds the third time that theme A is used in this section of the music. This time, theme A, although shortened to two bars contains the only exact transposition of the motivic cell. For this reason it must be considered to be the recapitulation of this theme and it is in a closely related tonality – a perfect fifth higher than the original. (Figure 21)

Figure 21: Bars 1 and 110
Here, the B major chord mentioned above as the resolution of a ten-bar dominant pedal of F sharp is extended with A natural and C natural to form a dominant minor ninth chord. This bar (110) is in effect the setting up of yet another dominant harmony although it is not actually sustained in the following bars. It is resolved onto its tonic key, E minor in the second half of bar 113 and this in turn creates yet another dominant harmony for the A minor finale commencing at bar 120.

There is another possible explanation for the harmonic structure of bar 110. The bitonal combination of the theme in E minor and the harmonies of B major have already been discussed (p.43). The notes A and C, in the piano part, which complete the harmonic structure of this bar could be considered as a cell representation, this time of the opening tonality of the theme, A minor. Given the use of cell representations of tonalities by the composer in this work, it is possible that the chant intérieur has been unable to separate the theme and its original tonality. In this case there would be a tritonal concept in this bar, with elements of A minor, E minor and B major.

This passage (bars 82 to 119) can thus be seen to be particularly significant in an overall emotional and tonal scheme. Each time attention is focussed on theme A there is an emotional peak created by a combination of melodic and harmonic elements while a succession of dominant pedals throughout the passage creates an ongoing harmonic interdependence which leads directly into the next musical section.
Most of the 'hills and valleys' are not of the complexity of the examples described above. A 'hill' might be as simple as the highest note of a musical phrase, as occurs at the fifth bar from the beginning. In this case the 'valley' is a simple falling away from high note using the familiar technique of a sequence based on fourths and semitones. The cadence at bars 8 and 9 which brings the music to a natural stop features another technique associated with cadence points, namely, the reduction in the number of beats in a bar – in this case from the established four beats to three in bar 7 and two beats in bar 8.

A technique which is used several times is the clash of a melodic 'foreign' note or notes with the harmonic accompaniment. This occurs for the first time at bar 14 where in the second half of the bar, a passage of passing notes beginning with F sharp is heard in the clarinet. The B minor tonality of this short passage is clearly in conflict with the accompanying harmonic structure peaking in bar 15 when the A sharp of the clarinet is sustained over the diminished structure B D F in the piano. At the end of bar 16, a resolution is achieved when the A sharp rises to a B natural over B minor harmonies in the piano.

A third peak is created at bar 27. This is an interesting example because in this bar there occurs a release of tension which has been mounting in the preceding bars. A tonal centre of C is established in bar 21 and maintained for several bars with a C pedal in the bass and a variety of related chords. The melodic line is clearly in A major so for some bars bitonality exists. At bar 27 the two parts are reconciled through a series of C sharp minor chords with the keynote A acknowledged melodically in the second half of bar 27.
The following table sets out a complete list of crisis points, hills, and where clearly defineable, the valleys. A brief description of the most important harmonic or rhythmic technique used to create each is included.

**Table 3: 'Hills and Valleys' and 'Crisis Points'

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Bar</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Highest note of phrase (Theme A)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Harmonic dissonance (Theme B)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>Harmonic reconciliation (after increasing harmonic tension from bar 21, development of Theme B)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>Rhythmic agitation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46</td>
<td>Highest note of phrase (Theme A)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>56</td>
<td>Point of crisis - melodic and rhythmic disintegration, harmonic tension</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>62</td>
<td>Highest note of phrase (Theme B)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>75</td>
<td>Peak of phrase, rhythmic complexity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>86</td>
<td>Harmonic dissonance (Theme A)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>98</td>
<td>Harmonic dissonance (Theme A)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>110</td>
<td>Harmonic resolution of previous bars and harmonic complexity (bi-tonality) (Theme A)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In the Allegro vivace section (commencing at bar 120) the music is of a far more homogeneous character with just two obvious peaks in the general excitement of this finale.

Bar 156  Point of crisis - melodic and rhythmic disintegration, harmonic tension

Bar 168  Faster tempo (a tempo, Allegro molto)

high tessitura, piano and clarinet in contrary motion.
The graph below gives a visual comparison of the magnitude of these peaks and their frequency. The points of crisis and the final codetta provide the highest peaks while the others are arranged according to their musical impact, as experienced by this writer.

Graph 1: Subjective Intensity Levels of 'Hills and Valleys' and 'Points of Crisis'

This graph must be considered as a subjective evaluation of these peaks for the composer, apart from mentioning their significance in a general sense, has given no formula for determining their impact. While the two crisis points and the final bars are obvious peaks of great magnitude, the lesser peaks will affect different listeners (and performers) in different ways. They will obviously give different weightings to them, and possibly perceive them to be in slightly different places in the music.

A further aspect of the intensification of certain areas of the music is the way the piano accompaniment is constantly varied to heighten the changing musical atmosphere. Much of the opening (sonata form) section of the work is thematically concerned with theme B which is nearly always accompanied by an open-textured triplet figuration. Bar 10, shown in Figure 22 is typical.

Garretty, op. cit., p. 54
work is thematically connected with theme D, which is never always
musically absent. Much of the opening (sonata form) section of the
way the piano accompaniment is consistently varied to heighten the
A further aspect of the intensification of certain areas of the music is the
them to be in slightly different places in the music,
They will obviously give different weightings to those, and possibly perceive
peaks will affect different listeners (and performances) in different ways.
points and the final bars are obvious peaks of great magnitude, the lesser
has given no formula for determining their impact. While the two criteria
the composer, apart from mentioning their significance in a general sense.
This graph must be considered as a subjective evaluation of these peaks for
Bar Numbers

Graph I: Subjective Intensity Levels of Hills and Valleys

Impact, as experienced by this writer.
Highest peaks while the others are arranged according to their musical
Figure 22: Bars 10 - 12

When this theme is developed and used to create one of the hills discussed above (bar 27) we find that this basic pattern is modified in three different ways in three successive bars. In bar 22 the triplet figure has a rhythmic suspension and covers a relatively small compass. In bar 23, the compass is extended upwards in arpeggio style while in bar 24 the compass is stretched to over three octaves (second half of bar 24). (Figure 23)

Figure 23: Bars 22 - 24

When the peak of the climax is reached at bar 27, the triplet figuration is abandoned for something more declamatory and hence a repeated note figure is used. (Figure 24)
Figure 24: Bar 27

In similar fashion we can follow the development of this repeated note figure. It becomes more syncopated when agitation is required to create the 'hill' at bar 34. Semiquavers are added in bar 37 to create a gentle rippling effect in the 'valley' which follows bar 34. (Figure 25)

Figure 25: Bars 34 - 37

At bar 48 the triplet figure is re-introduced after three bars of a different accompaniment figure. This time a duple articulation is applied within the triplet resulting in increased rhythmic complexity between the melodic and accompaniment lines after bar 49. The resultant musical tension leads into the crisis point at bar 56 (discussed on page 37). (Figure 26)
Figure 26: Bars 50 and 51

Theme A requires a different type of accompaniment in order to bring out both the gentle lyricism of the melodic line and the subtle intimacy created by the repeated use of the germ cell. For this reason the composer has used accompaniments of little rhythmic distinctiveness, which supply an harmonic background when required. At the very beginning of this work, when the theme is heard for the first time it is unaccompanied, which allows the clarinettist the utmost rhythmic elasticity. In the section from bars 82 to 119 when this theme appears on three occasions, it is mostly accompanied by sustained chords, in semibreves, which allows for some harmonic interplay between the parts but never creates any rhythmic restrictions.

Through the 'hills and valleys', the 'points of crisis' and the subtle accompanying techniques in the piano part, Margaret Sutherland has created a restless quality in the music characterised by an emotional fluctuation. At times these emotions are restrained, rising only to a small peak. Elsewhere an emotional outburst will eclipse all that has gone before and combine numerous musical techniques to surge to a new climax. Although the peaks occur at irregular intervals in the music, one feels that they belong to some overall scheme in which the smaller peaks form a cumulative concentration towards a 'point of crisis' and that the two 'points
of crisis' create their own momentum towards the final bars. It is clearly part of this scheme that the largest of the peaks (namely the two 'points of crisis' and the peak at bar 110), occur before the recapitulations of the main melodies thus giving a special significance to this aspect of the musical structures. The early 'hills' and 'points of crisis' rely for their effect on the creation of uncertainty - harmonic, melodic or rhythmic, but in the final coda (from bar 162) these aspects are all resolved.

The musical satisfaction created at the end of the work is very much due to tonal security and the tying up of musical 'loose ends'. The resultant rhythmic drive of the finale is unchecked, except for the penultimate bar which is reduced by one beat (from $\frac{3}{2}$ to $\frac{2}{2}$) to emphasise the final cadence. The tonality is firmly placed in E minor and stressed in tonic chords on the first beat of most bars after bar 162. The melodic aspect plays no lesser role for the last time theme C is heard (at bar 162) it is at a faster tempo - Allegro molto (previously Allegro vivace). Added excitement is created in the final bars with the use of crescendos, contrary directions of movement between clarinet and piano (bar 170) and constant quaver movement over a wide compass on both instruments.

By the use of such a variety of techniques the composer covers a wide range of emotions from the introspection of the unaccompanied opening with its tonal ambiguity and lack of rhythmic constraint to this exciting and conclusive ending.
The aim of this short thesis has been to give as detailed an account as possible of the various aspects which make this sonata distinctive, interesting and representative of Margaret Sutherland's work. In so doing, the study has specifically emphasised those aspects of the compositional process which the composer has mentioned as being important, while considering in more general terms some aspects of the radicalism or conservatism of her style. The main part of the discussion has, therefore, been centred around the three analytical chapters in which individual musical techniques have been examined under general headings associated with form, harmony and tonality, and the creation of musical highlights. Throughout these chapters there have been numerous references to chant intérieur, the musical phenomenon which has affected every part of this composer's creative process whether it be structural, harmonic, melodic or emotional.

The result of this enquiry has been to show how a musical work of considerable complexity can be analysed into basic components, to reveal a succession of conventionally-derived musical techniques. The tonality of the work, for example, is basically ill-defined and obscure yet it can be shown to follow closely a traditional cycle of related keys. Similarly, harmony which is often obtuse and complex could always be defined in terms of conventional musical language. Structurally, the multi-sectional aspect of this work could be viewed in different ways but this analysis has revealed if to be a simple extension of familiar sonata form, adapted to suit the composer's individual needs. The study has revealed some other interesting features which are not as obvious as those already mentioned,
but which give the work some of its distinctive character. The most important of these are the various devices used to create homogenity between (different) sections of the music, in particular the complex intervallic relationships between certain sections of the music and the three main themes used in the work. A listener will be conscious of a constant emotional fluctuation when hearing this sonata. Analysis has shown this to be the result of the creation and relaxation of tension in the music using one or more clearly definable techniques, depending on the complexity of the emotion involved. Finally, it was shown how the composer has used this wide range of musical devices to create in the music a cumulative drive towards the final coda in which the various tensions were resolved, the musical 'loose ends' were tied up, and a sense of completion was achieved.

The limitations of a short thesis have prevented a rather deeper analysis which would have resulted from a more rigid adherence to the methodology of Reti,¹ or Salzer,² or some of the modern computer-based techniques. These would undoubtedly have revealed other interesting features in this work. Similarly, some of the points which have been raised in the study are deserving of further investigation. The chant intérieur, for example, may well have exerted a similar influence over other works written at the time. Further researchers into the works of Margaret Sutherland may take this aspect of her compositional process as their theme and trace its influence through a succession of works. Similarly, the development of Margaret Sutherland's forward thinking harmonic preferences, so out of step with her Australian contemporaries, could be traced from the more


romantically-inspired harmonies of the violin sonata of 1925 to the pungency of the works of the late 1960s and 1970s.

A performer will greatly benefit from an analytical study of this work while preparing for a performance. The message often lies well below the music's surface. An insight into the structural and harmonic aspects will help the performer shape his own ideas along those of the composer in order that the performance can take account of some of the ideas which are not immediately obvious. In particular, there are numerous short passages contained in this work which 'look interesting', and one is easily tempted to give them undue emphasis in a performance. It is only after structural analysis that one may realise that these bars form part of some larger scheme and their relative importance must be subject to this. On an immediately practical level, a performer who is aware of Margaret Sutherland's harmonic outlook will carefully analyse the surrounding chords before correcting what appears to be a 'wrong' note, for there are many such cases. Appendix 2 bears witness to how easily one can be misled into not believing what appears to be on the paper and correcting it in accordance with more conventional harmonic rules.

Sadly, performances of this work have been rare in Australia. This is not so much due to any resistance on the part of performers as to their total lack of knowledge of its existence. The death of the composer in August 1984 is sure to rekindle interest in her music. Analysis of this type will thus be necessary if the music is to be better understood and a wide range of performers are to become interested in this, the earliest Australian clarinet sonata.
APPENDIX 1

SCORE DISCREPANCIES (1)

The following discrepancies between the musical instructions on the piano and clarinet scores have been noted. The Pendergrast edition uses the instructions from the original piano score (as below).

Bar 1
piano Fairly slowly
clarinet Solo introduction quite slowly

Bar 10
piano Quicker, but with breadth
clarinet More quickly ($\downarrow = 100$)

Bar 104
piano (no indications)
clarinet More quickly

Bar 114
piano More slowly
clarinet Gently

Bar 118
piano rit
clarinet Very slowly
Bar 120
piano Allegro vivace
clarinet Quickly $\dot{q} = 100$

Bar 162
piano Allegro molto
clarinet (no indication)
APPENDIX 2

SCORE DISCREPANCIES (2)

The following discrepancies of notation between the two piano scores and the separate clarinet score used in this research have been noted. It is assumed that the piano and clarinet scores used in performances by Margaret Sutherland and Thomas White contain the correct notes.

The scores are designated thus -

T.W. (p) - Piano score which belonged to the late Thomas White and was used by him in performances with the composer.

T.W. (c) - Separate clarinet part (transposed). Used with above.

P - Pendergrast score. Origin unknown. Supplied by A.B.C. (No separate clarinet copy, but concert pitch clarinet line above piano line).

The following designation of notes is used -

\[ \begin{align*}
\text{\textbf{C}} & \quad \text{c} & \quad \text{c'} & \quad \text{c''} \\
\end{align*} \]
Bar 19  Third crotchet beat (piano bass).
T.W. (p)  -  G sharp
P  -  F sharp

Bar 33  Penultimate note in clarinet.
T.W. (e)  -  d'' flat written (i.e. b'' natural in concert pitch)
T.W. (p)  -  d'' flat (concert pitch)
P  -  e'' sharp (concert pitch)

Bar 44  Third crotchet beat (piano treble lower part).
T.W. (p)  -  e' flat (pencil alteration)
P  -  d' natural

Bar 54  During third crotchet beat (piano treble lower part).
T.W. (p)  -  f' natural (pencil alteration)
P  -  f' sharp (sharp designated as accidental earlier in the bar and not cancelled)

Bar 63  Last note in piano treble.
T.W. (P)  -  f' sharp
P  -  g' natural

Bar 67  Last quaver in bar (piano left hand).
T.W. (p)  -  f' (a pencil correction)
P  -  e'
Bar 71
Eighth note in clarinet.
T.W. (c)  
- b natural (c sharp written for clarinet)
P (clarinet stave)  
- g natural

Bar 144
Fifth note in clarinet.
T.W. (c)  
- a" flat (b" flat written for clarinet)
P (clarinet stave)  
- a" natural

Bar 152
Bass clef in lower piano stave.
T.W. (p)  
- Treble clef in lower piano stave
P  
- Bass clef in lower piano stave

Bar 158
Fourth crotchet beat in clarinet, second quaver.
T.W. (c)  
- c" (d" written for clarinet)
T.W. (p)  
- b" natural (in clarinet stave)
P (clarinet stave)  
- b" natural

Bar 159
Sixth quaver in clarinet.
T.W. (c)  
- g' (a' written for clarinet)
T.W. (p)  
- g' (in clarinet stave)
P (clarinet stave)  
- a'

Bars 166 and 167
Repeated Es, clarinet part.
T.W. (c)  
- e" (f" sharp written for clarinet)
T.W. (p)  
- e' (in clarinet stave)
Bars 174 and 175

T.W. (c) - clarinet written in the range e' to e''
T.W. (♭) - clarinet written octave higher (e'' to e'''')
P (clarinet stave) - clarinet written e'' to e'''


Author/s:
Morgan, Ian McKeon

Title:
An analysis of Margaret Sutherland's sonata for clarinet and piano (1947)

Date:
1984-12

Citation:

Publication Status:
Unpublished

Persistent Link:
http://hdl.handle.net/11343/39090

File Description:
An analysis of Margaret Sutherland's Sonata for clarinet and piano (1947)

Terms and Conditions:
Terms and Conditions: Copyright in works deposited in Minerva Access is retained by the copyright owner. The work may not be altered without permission from the copyright owner. Readers may only download, print and save electronic copies of whole works for their own personal non-commercial use. Any use that exceeds these limits requires permission from the copyright owner. Attribution is essential when quoting or paraphrasing from these works.