Insights from Teacher Talk
at an
In-Service Program
on the
Kindergarten Music Curriculum

L. E. Hing
1993

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Education by course work and minor thesis in the University of Melbourne.
Acknowledgements

I wish to thank Christoph Maubach for his introduction to the German Music Program, "Musik und Tanz für Kinder". Our collaboration on the Lady Gowrie Program Trial raised my awareness and led me to question the problems and prospects of teaching music at the pre-school level.

I am indebted to my supervisor Dr Rod Fawns, for his patience, encouragement and counsel in all aspects of the work conducted in this study.

The interest, co-operation and enthusiasm of Robyn Bartlett, Merrin Butler, Catherine Cougan, Elizabeth Cumming and Kenneth Hartup, the teachers who participated in the study, is acknowledged with appreciation.

Others who have willingly given support, information and practical assistance include William Agar, June Epstein, O.A.M., Dr William Garland, Rosemary Grant and Helen King. I am thankful for their help and kindness.

Lorna Frick has prepared the presentation of this thesis with diligence and an attention to detail which is a pleasure to record.

The understanding and constant support shown by my family - my mother Maybelle Hing, my uncle Rupert Hing, my husband Ian Cook and my children Hugh and Phoebe - I record with my deepest gratitude.

Lauris E. Hing.
Abstract

Kindergarten teachers work in isolation. They have little opportunity or encouragement to work together to learn from each other and to improve their expertise as a community. What and how they teach is directly related to what they know.

This research project sought to use a translated German music program as a vehicle for examining the what and how of teaching music in Australian kindergartens. Teachers were drawn into an in-service program which explored what they knew, as well as to what extent and under what conditions they were willing to learn and become better professionals. The background of the study was provided through the theories and methodologies of Wise, Elbaz, Eisner, Geertz, Stenhouse and Shulman, utilising models for professional development advocated by Fullan, Guskey, Owen et al.

Five teachers were recruited to teach a series of eight music lessons to a group of ten children within their regular kindergarten setting. During this teaching phase, the teachers were brought out of their kindergartens to meet as a group and in pairs, to share professional dialogue about their teaching and about music education in early childhood.

The stories of these teachers were presented as reflections and retrospective accounts which were specific and action-oriented. Their thinking was studied to capture for a consultable record the continuous process of reflection which underpins skilled and thoughtful judgements about teaching, and which could lead to new insights and improvements in practice. This form of in-service was based on a model which offers teachers feedback through group discussion and support, provision of peer and consultant perspectives, in addition to opportunity for personal and performance appraisal. Through reflection, teachers were steered towards a review of their aims and purposes in the music program within the contexts of the total curriculum, and that of the historical, local and world view.
The results showed that music education at the kindergarten level is an ad hoc affair. It is plagued by a reluctance to teach music, lack of music curriculum and an absence of policy for music education. In the final chapter recommendations for developing a music education policy based on strategic analysis and the establishment of a steering group are put forward for discussion. A call for substantive music programs, consideration of specialisation as a possible scenario, and the need for more specialised training for teachers is issued. An infra-structure for further research into staff development and appraisal could be based upon an action frame for codifying teacher knowledge, like that which is laid down at the conclusion of this thesis.
Contents

CHAPTER 1 : SETTING UP THE IN-SERVICE PROGRAM 1
Introduction 2
The Current Study 3
The Participants and the Procedures 8
Evaluation of the German Material 14

CHAPTER 2 : STUDIES OF TEACHER THINKING ABOUT MUSIC EDUCATION IN EARLY CHILDHOOD 16
Research Approach 17

CHAPTER 3 : THINKING AGAIN ABOUT MY TEACHING 24

CHAPTER 4 : WHAT SHOULD MY AIDS BE IN MUSIC EDUCATION? 48

CHAPTER 5 : IF I CHANGE WHAT I AM DOING CAN I EXPECT ANY SUPPORT? 76
Views of Change 77
"We're On Our Own" 78
"Where Do I Go Now - How Do I Make It Work?" 80
"What Made This Study Work?" 83
"If I Change What I Am Doing Can I Expect Any More Support?" 88

CHAPTER 6 : PROBLEMS, PROSPECTS AND POLICY FOR EARLY CHILDHOOD MUSIC EDUCATION 90
Music in the Culture 91
Curriculum for Teacher Education 93
Elements of a Policy for Music Education 94
Developing Policy 96
Key Policy Issues - Specialisation, Professional Association and Certification 99
Cadre Groups of Exemplary Teachers - Supporting Kindergartens of the Future 102
Formal Teacher Education  103
Certification, Appraisal and Reward  104
Final Remarks  112
References  114
Appendices
Chapter 1

Setting up the In-Service Program

"If you would know if a people are well governed and if its laws are good or bad, examine the music it practises."

Confucius
Setting up the In-Service Program

INTRODUCTION

During 1989 the author collaborated with Christoph Maubach in a pilot study entitled *Music and Dance for Children* at the Lady Gowrie Child Centre in Melbourne. This centre was established by the Australian Government for the study and demonstration of early childhood development in conjunction with the Australian Pre-School Association. The 1989 study was an attempt to document the teaching of a sequential music program for children aged four-to-six years under Australian conditions. The combination of the expertise of the early childhood staff at the Lady Gowrie and music specialists (Hing and Maubach, 1989) made this pilot study unique.

*Music and Dance for Children* is a translation and adaptation of an early childhood music program entitled *Musik und Tanz für Kinder*. This program, written in German, was developed over two decades at the Orff Institute, University of the Performing Arts, in Salzburg, Austria, and is published by the Schott company in Mainz, Germany.

In the pilot study sixteen teaching sessions based on translations from *Musik und Tanz für Kinder* were tested with a group of twelve four-to-six-year-old children at the Lady Gowrie Kindergarten. Maubach, a music teacher trained at the Orff Institute, taught the sixteen sessions. During each session two generalist teachers from the Lady Gowrie staff acted as observers. After each session the author, Maubach and the observers met to discuss and collectively rate the teaching materials, the activities presented, and the children's responses. Recommendations for amendments and adaptations were made.

At the conclusion of the teaching trials, the author prepared a full written report of the project and the evaluation. One major question which emerged was
"How do generalist teachers view the program?" Underlying this question was the query, "How do generalist teachers feel about teaching this program?" It was recommended that this question be the focus of investigation in a further study.

**THE CURRENT STUDY**

Taking up the challenge of investigating the potential of *Music and Dance for Children* as a curriculum innovation worthy of consideration among practising kindergarten teachers, a new study was undertaken. This study aimed to use teaching units from *Music and Dance for Children* as a vehicle for an investigation into what teachers can tell us about teaching music, and music education at this level.

The design of this investigation was influenced by Schwab’s conception of curriculum theories being dependent upon the cultivation of two sets of arts, namely the arts of the practical (i.e. prudence and deliberation) and the arts of the eclectic. The former treats the need for localism of curriculum, and the latter treats the need for adaptation of theories to one another and to the educational problems on which they are brought to bear.

Curriculum, according to Schwab, is generated from and monitored by its consumers. It is responsive to differences in need, degree and location. He advocates curricular reflection which must take account of what teachers are ready to teach or ready to learn to teach, what materials are available or can be devised, what effects actually ensue from materials and methods chosen. It was the curriculum reflection, amongst kindergarten teachers, about music teaching, taken in a back and forth manner between means and ends that was to be closely observed.

The teachers in this study would be trying curriculum change, testing its effects and thus shaping a view of effectiveness. However, it was recognised that teachers normally work alone, and that in addition these particular teachers were working in a very complex and troubled industrial scene.
Kindergarten teachers find these to be difficult times. Massive structural changes have altered the service delivery of early childhood programs. As child care has assumed prominence, its funding and status have become a social, industrial and political issue. Kindergarten teachers have been embroiled in battles to defend their rôles and their programs, which Ebbeck and Clyde (1988, p.284) suggest are facing disintegration. The transfers in control and rights to the territories of education and care continue to shake up and divide the early childhood professional community at both the service and pre-service training levels.

Government rationalisations have resulted in 50% slashes to some kindergarten services. As a result professional networks are disintegrating, causing many teachers to work in near-total isolation. Professionals, asserts Stonehouse (1988), are vulnerable, acting like victims of change. Teachers are disillusioned and feeling dis-empowered.

Has it always been thus? In the past, issues of overcrowding, restructuring, battles for better conditions etc. have faced professionals. The dominant reality is that professional status is hard won.

Given the climate of the present time, a research proposal which focused upon a willingness to embark on a course of professional development may have seemed untimely. What was offered was a voluntary commitment to the project. This offered teachers a distraction from the political turmoil, a chance to re-focus on their central professional interest - the developing child - in this case the developing child's appreciation of music. The five professionals in this study took up the offer. Others may not have done so.

Teachers at this time as much as at any time in the past needed to have reaffirmed that they are valued as professionals, for what they do and for what they know.
Recent professional exchanges between teachers have focused on survival. "Change ... new meanings, new behaviour, new skills, depend(s) significantly on whether teachers are working as isolated individuals or exchanging ideas, support and positive feelings about their work," observed Fullan (cited in Owen et al, 1988, p.8). In undertaking to join this investigation, in trying new teaching materials, resources, and curriculum innovations, the teachers were brought out of their isolated kindergarten environments. They were drawn away from the troubled industrial scene and were asked to share and exchange ideas about support for their work.

Guskey (1986, p.7) claims that "the most significant changes in teacher attitudes and beliefs come after they begin using a new practice successfully and see changes in student learning." It was hoped that the teachers in this study would become agents of change. The testing of the Music and Dance for Children units involved them in curriculum development activities and processes which were concretely based on their teaching practices.

This author argued that the processes of curriculum development should proceed alongside the processes of professional development. In this study the personal-professional development of the teachers involved was a major objective. Owen et al (1988, p.7) point out that any effective professional development strategy is dependent upon assessing the needs of teachers, planning a program to meet those needs, and having the resources available which reflect existing good practice. During the six years preceding this study, the author was involved as a music specialist briefed to deliver in-service workshops and seminars to early childhood educators. The need for new direction and guidance in planning music programs had been expressed by numerous kindergarten teachers and child care workers over that time.
This study, which involved the use of the Music and Dance program, was also designed to offer an effective program for the teachers undertaking the trial. The resources, teaching units from Music and Dance for Children, are among the most current reflections of good teaching practice available to early childhood music educators. Teachers involved in this curriculum-based process attained a clarity of vision of new territory by trying teaching activities hitherto untried in kindergartens in the English-speaking world. The trials took place in the teachers' own kindergartens, and thus impinged on the existing music programs in early childhood education.

The teachers recruited for this study were drawn from a pool of teachers who had previously expressed to the author a willingness to explore new music programs and curriculum.

Following the model of Owen et al (1988, p.8), it was necessary for the participating teachers to be prepared to suspend judgement while being committed to exploring this new dimension of teaching, so that subsequent judgement could be based on realities of classroom experience rather than preconceived ideas. Further features of this study's design which followed the Owen et al model were:

1. **Ongoing Support**

Teachers undertaking the trial had the support of a consultant (the author) as well as their colleagues (the other participating teachers). The consultant acted as a provider of resources and information, a demonstrator of techniques, the organiser of meetings at which listening to teachers' reports, guiding teachers' discussions of practice as well as giving advice on strategies was the focus. In this sense the consultant, as facilitator, combined expertise in the subject matter of the program innovation with the knowledge and expertise of the change process.
2. **Inside/Outside Consultant**

Owen et al outline the advantages and disadvantages of using inside consultants. In taking on the consultant rôle in this study, the author could offer all of the advantages outlined and could avoid many of the purported disadvantages. The author was a practitioner, was familiar with kindergarten settings, and shared common purposes with the teachers involved.

3. **Shared Risk**

The fact that *Musik und Tanz für Kinder* came from Germany provided an advantage in that there could be a notion of 'estrangement' attached to the deliberations upon it. The consultant had no vested interest in the German program, nor did any professional person practising in this country at that time. Thus it could be viewed and assessed with a distance and an objectivity which would give credence to any considered opinion which emerged from the deliberative discussions. The teachers and the consultant could be involved in 'sharing the risk' of trying units from the program. In explaining the trial to teachers, the consultant encouraged them to take a risk by using new features of teaching in their own classrooms. In the experience of Owen et al "the overwhelming response from teachers is that the above strategy is an honest attempt to make pupils and teachers partners in the exploration" (p.9). In this case the teachers and the consultant were partners.

4. **Teachers as the Target Audience**

Where change occurs, assert Owen et al (1988, p.9), the individual teacher level is the target audience. The consultant spent time with teachers as individuals, in pairs and as a group of five, utilising skills associated with group processes and decision making. The consultant thus adopted the rôle of 'linker and facilitator of contact between users.'
It was hoped that the teachers in this study could become the agents-of-change. Their collective analysis of the teaching units may give new directions to program planning and curriculum change in early childhood music.

5. Building Networks

It was anticipated that this study could be the genesis of a network. The teachers involved took a change proposal through the initial testing stage, and with continued support via a five-strand network could be encouraged to move forward through stages of implementation and continuation.

THE PARTICIPANTS AND THE PROCEDURES

1. The Teachers

Five teachers were approached to join this study. They were drawn from a list of those who, in previous ‘one-shot’ music in-service programs, had indicated a willingness to commit themselves to a longer, more structured in-service activity. They were selected on the following criteria:

a) a keenness to be part of the trial
b) a willingness and ability to
   i) allocate a particular school term to teaching the selected units in their own kindergarten environments
   ii) keep records of results
   iii) attend several meetings during the trial (two briefing, two-three collegial, one de-briefing)

c) enough years of experience to be able to make comparative statements regarding children’s progress, programming issues in teaching and in music education
d) geographical situations which enabled them to form a reasonably localised network.

2. The Teaching 'Instances'

The five generalists were committed to undertake six consecutive and sequential music sessions over six set weeks in a term. Each session was considered as an 'instance' of music education. The sample of five teachers allowed a longitudinal study of teaching, producing thirty instances for consideration.

3. The Children

As far as possible the children selected were similar in that each session was conducted for:

i) a mixed group of boys and girls drawn from the regular kindergarten group

ii) an age span four to six years.

4. Briefing Meeting 1 and 2

Prior to and midway through the trial (henceforth referred to as 'the teaching phase'), briefing meetings were held. All participants (teachers and author-consultant) attended these meetings. At these meetings:

i) An overview (at the first) and an update (at the second) of the study was given.

ii) Teaching scripts (see Appendix 1) were discussed. When necessary, techniques, strategies etc. were demonstrated by the consultant. Resource materials were distributed. Teaching times were set, according to the schedule (see Appendix 2).

iii) Collegial Staff Self-Study meeting times were negotiated (see Appendix 2).
iv) Evaluation procedures were discussed. Initial evaluation schedules were distributed (see Appendix 3, Objectives Evaluation).

v) Questions and problems raised by the teachers were answered and discussed.

vi) At Briefing Meeting 2 goals and objectives for a music program were discussed.

5. Collegial Staff Self-Study Meetings

Teachers needed to be brought together to talk at a time which allowed the author to be a support as well as party to the conversations. Thus two kinds of meetings were set up. Briefing Meetings provided technical briefing in order to build confidence in the music program. Collegial Staff Self-Study Meetings provided opportunity for pairs of teachers to consult and to meet to talk.

Schon (cited in Glatthorn, 1987) had reported success in helping teachers to use a moderately structured approach which centred on reflection on actions to tap how teachers think as professionals. The important purpose of the dialogues was that they should have enough insight and coherence to make them professionally productive. This was the aim of the collegial meetings offered to teachers in this study.

Each teacher was required to attend at least two collegial meetings with another, and each time with a different talking partner. It was hoped that a feeling for how much the program could be personalised (i.e. how it could respond to individual teaching personalities and styles) would be gained. The mix and combinations of teachers aimed to create a healthy tension from which open dialogue across a wide range of professional opinion could flow.

Being aware that different contexts in which teachers met would produce different sorts of data, the author chose to remove them from their work
environments and to draw them into a highly professional context. This would elicit
data which would reflect general impressions etc. Meeting teachers one-to-one in
their own contexts would have led to conversations about what they do. The author
wanted to stimulate conversations about what they might do - conversations about
what resources they could bring to this music program.

6. The Schedule

A schematic overview of the discussion schedule is shown below. Sometimes
because of teachers’ commitments, the scheduled pairings had to be changed. These
changes are shown by the dotted line. Extra meetings needed to be scheduled,
however, to ensure the structure remained relatively the same as planned. The two
teachers (T1 and T5) who have become the Case Study and who speak for the others
in this project were scheduled to begin talking in Collegial Meeting 1. However,
through rescheduling they did not meet as talking partners until Collegial Meeting 6.
They met with a variety of other talking partners in the study. One had two talking
partners, the other had three. The study was designed so that all of the teachers met
with each of the others as a talking partner. At each of these collegial meetings,
conversations were taped, recorded in written notes and later transcribed more fully.
Figure 1: Scheduled Discussions

(Including those Planned and Substituted)

Key:
B1 = Briefing 1
B2 = Briefing 2
PB2 = Private Briefing 2
DB1 = Debriefing 1
DB2 = Debriefing 2
Planned Meetings
Rescheduled Meetings
Rescheduled Teachers

C1 = Collegial Meeting 1
C2 = Collegial Meeting 2
C3 = Collegial Meeting 3
C4 = Collegial Meeting 4
C5 = Collegial Meeting 5
C6 = Collegial Meeting 6
CA = Consultant Author
T1 = Teacher 1
T2 = Teacher 2
T3 = Teacher 3
T4 = Teacher 4
T5 = Teacher 5
7. **Debriefing Meeting**

This was held at the conclusion of the teaching phase. Due to the absence of two teachers a second debriefing meeting to include them was scheduled. Prior to the debriefing meeting written summaries of the discussions, group impressions and concerns were sent to participants with a covering letter (see Appendix 4). This allowed them the chance to over-view the broad aims, the objectives, the evaluation of objectives, and the objectives rating schedule in advance of the meeting.

At the debriefing meeting recommendations for amendments, collective action and the prospect of a final written comment from the teachers were discussed, agreed upon and recorded.

The participants were thanked for their contributions of time, effort and support for the study.

8. **Pre-Trial Preparation**

i) Teaching scripts were mailed to all participants in the term prior to the teaching phase. A willingness to answer queries and/or discuss concerns prior to the first briefing meeting was expressed by the author-consultant.

ii) A pilot run of the collegial meeting was undertaken by the author-consultant and two kindergarten teachers who were not part of the trial. At this meeting the wording of the instructions, the descriptors, the layout and format of the evaluation-objectives rating schedules were discussed, and where necessary adjusted to bring greater clarity and sharper focus. In addition question-prompts devised by the consultant to evoke discussion were tested. It was also possible to rehearse dialogue which required careful wording such as the introduction to the trial, explanation of rôles of the teachers and the
consultant etc. Two experienced teachers were selected to participate in this pilot-run.

**EVALUATION OF THE GERMAN MATERIAL**

Based on the broad aims in the German edition, each session outlined in *Music and Dance for Children* had specific objectives (see Appendix 3). It was to these objectives that this study turned to evaluate the effectiveness of the teaching units. After two of the sessions (sessions 1 and 5) the teachers were asked to evaluate each child's level of response along a five-point scale called The Objectives Rating Schedules (see Appendix 5(a) and (b)). These schedules, whilst giving important data regarding the children's responses, were used in the study as a vehicle for discussion in the collegial meetings.

Wise (1979, p.20) wrote of the need for retrospective accounts. "We rarely talk about the way it happened, we do not relate experiences in developmental projects that taught us a lesson about how things might have been done." Since we have no tradition, no archives of accounts of curriculum innovation in pre-school education, Wise (1979, p.25) suggests: "We ought to be reflecting on our experiences, recounting them to ourselves, analysing them and presenting accounts to our colleagues in a form that helps them understand the significance of the new knowledge gained."

The present study drew the teachers out of their teaching environments to recount their experiences with the German music program. The author was interested in what knowledge and skills the teachers felt they had and needed to teach the program. Faced with a challenge, such as the German music program, it was important to record and analyse what teachers said they needed to deliver high quality music teaching. A central question for the author was how far away are we from exploring the possibility of this German music program? The research
permitted the study of kindergarten teachers' practical reasoning removed from the interruptions and busyness of the kindergarten day. These teachers were volunteers, interested in improving their teaching in the music area. The study sought to explore what problems they encountered in attempting a new, sophisticated approach, but it also needed to give them opportunity to understand and develop their pedagogical knowledge in music.
Chapter 2

Studies of Teacher Thinking about Music Education in Early Childhood

"Music is not an acquired culture ... it is an active part of natural life."

Isaac Stern

"So long as the human spirit thrives on this planet, music in some living form will accompany and sustain it and give it expressive meaning.

Aaron Copland
Studies of Teacher Thinking about Music Education in Early Childhood

RESEARCH APPROACH

This thesis has its foundations in the ethnographic method of cultural description and study. Utilising a structured discussion technique, the author was able to offer five teachers the opportunity to reflect openly on their professional knowledge and on their practice as music teachers.

The teachers were given what Elbaz (1991, p.4) called their own "unadulterated voice". Episodes taken from longer conversations were used to draw narrative unities and then construct two teachers’ stories. The generalist teachers in the study offered the voice of the competent rather than expert teacher. In constructing their stories in the form of thick descriptions, utilising critical contrasts, the author was conscious of adding to the consultable record of what teachers have said, thus preserving ‘the said’ of the present in order for it to be rendered and available as part of the perusable anecdotal archives.

Through close observation and rendering of the practical reasoning and broader professional concerns of a group of teachers, the thesis aimed to offer a view of the current teaching culture.

There have been some influential theoretical perspectives. The first of these was Eisner (1977, p.345), who viewed curriculum as an aesthetic experience. He argued that improvement in arts education can only come by enabling teachers and others to improve their artistic sensibilities as connoisseurs of curriculum. This provided one perspective on the conversations with the teachers. The description with which this thesis was mainly concerned was an appraisal of the teachers’ aesthetic appreciation of Eisner’s somewhat detached intellectual perspective. The perspective was not how the teachers would have seen themselves in action, it was
not an observation of classroom behaviour. It was a study of the teachers’ pedagogical reasoning about the kindergarten music curriculum. It was hoped that the discussions at the meetings with the author would provide the participants and readers, with not only an initial aesthetic impression of the quality of the *Music and Dance for Children* materials, but also a view of how to adapt and realise these in their own teaching. Eisner (1977, p.349) warned of the dangers of "sheer description, unguided by value consideration".

The author sought to assist teachers to view and understand how and where their thinking and practice of music teaching fitted within the local and world view of music curriculum and education. Experienced teachers can often, because of their very familiarity and feelings of ease, become complacent and even oblivious to a large portion of their practice and environment. If they cannot see what ills need to be rectified, they cannot alter their behaviour and therefore are in no position to change. The study involved teachers with varying levels of experience. Nevertheless it sought to encourage the author and teachers alike to reflect on their teaching in a form of action research.

The teachers in the study had developed sufficient appreciation to detect that many things in music education were awry. The author confronted them with changes in the form of a new teaching paradigm. The music program itself provided a vehicle through which teachers were able to conceptualise the problems in music education. As a consequence of this study it was hoped that heightened levels of appreciation of music teaching would provide new subject matter for theoretical attention as well as further research.

The range, the richness and the complexity of educational phenomena cannot be measured so much as rendered. The description must show what was neglected or rejected as well as accepted in the teachers’ accounts. Competent criticism required a broad grasp of the teachers’ working context. The prior classroom experience of the author-critic was a major advantage.
Geertz (1978) contributed another important perspective to the writing. The thesis attempted to be interpretive rather than simply a record of teacher talk. An attempt was made at thick description characterised by Geertz. The author sought to present the densely textured facts which were used to support broad assumptions about the place and rôle of music at the pre-school level. The thick descriptions of teachers in this study sought to reveal their thinking about their knowledge, their practice and their views on curriculum evaluation for both student and teacher appraisal. These descriptions involve interpretations of teachers' responses to and perceptions of the opportunity for professional development offered via participation in the study.

The associations of teachers in this study revealed some of the substance of the teaching culture. The essential purpose of the research, however, was not to answer their deepest questions but to add to the consultable record.

The author tried to capture a third perspective, that of the contemporary historical perspective of Stenhouse (1978). He saw this as most important for highlighting instances or case studies of curriculum reform which can be utilised as a basis for generalisation. Case studies can be subject to verification and can accumulate, thus building a record of experience. This study has given both the teachers in the study and the observers of it, the chance to improve interpretations of how music teaching may or may not develop. Discussions with others enabled teachers to gain understandings of defective actions, and revisions of faulty interpretations became possible. This application of knowledge to interpretation of particular educational instances (in this case musical instances) leads to improved understanding of professional knowledge of kindergarten teachers. It leads also to the improvement of professional judgement about music education. The outcome, the teachers felt would be an extension and refinement of their teaching and skill in deliberation, reflection and evaluation which they would not have called connoisseurship.
Stenhouse (1978, p.29) argued for an educational research which accepts education as an eventful process through a contemporary study analogous to history. This embraces Eisner's perspective. Effective monitoring and feedback of educational instances such as this study involves responsive interpretations rather than predictions as in the psycho-statistical paradigm. However, the evaluation of program effectiveness, reassessment of goals and purposes, student appraisal and teachers' self-appraisal which leads to the planning for and guiding of professional development were all part of this study and thus open to responsive interpretation. It was clearly felt that the critical discussion of accessible sources was capable of providing at least for them an integrating framework of principles and practice for critique.

No attempt was made to observe the teachers at work or to write case studies of particular teachers at work. The form of disclosure chosen was that of narrative. This allowed for interpretive comments from the author whilst presenting the teachers' knowledge. The notion of narrative keeps the teachers, as the story-tellers, clearly in focus, thus underlining the author's view of the central importance of the teacher and teacher knowledge to the study.

The complex narrative sought to present in the retrospective account an historical document, and an educational analysis. The author utilised story fragments to unify the narrative and to present selectively episodes as illustrations of teacher pedagogical thinking, including aesthetic appreciation. The stories the teachers told were intended for an audience of sympathetic listeners within the educational community.

A wider public sharing of this discourse within informal networks of teachers and expert cum researcher is held to be important as a contribution to any resolution of the fundamental problem in arts education in Australia, as revealed in this account. An important issue raised by Elbaz is the fidelity of this research to the views of teachers. The study always needed to attend to the teachers' problems and perspectives.
Elbaz (1991, p.7) focused attention on the stories of the ordinary teacher as the subject of dialogue among teachers and researchers. Any study of this nature must attend to the teacher talk which reveals the teachers' theories. Strict attention must be paid to the teachers' stories so that the study remains true and attends continuously to the teachers' problems and perceptions. In contrast, Eisner's work informs criticism rather than practice. It can be argued that reactions to and interpretations of ordinary classroom experiences are grounded in understandings of psycho-pedagogical interventions within social settings. These reactions express values teachers believe should be fostered as well as traditions they believe should be preserved. The device of story allows teachers' work to be documented, viewed and utilised to illustrate how they bring their knowledge to bear in the social, cultural and historical contexts of their time.

In seeking to understand what is possible for music education both now and in the future, the author has recorded the concerns of teachers expressed in their own words. This has allowed the author to quote teachers' reasoned knowledge in its own terms.

Shulman (1987) expressed particular interest in the model teacher, whom he called 'the exemplar'. In his view, the exemplary teacher "provides us with a temporary pedagogical theory, a temporary scaffolding from which novices may learn to become more expert. Our interest in the exemplary teacher is one of replication." (pp.7-8) Shulman's interest lay in the knowledge base and how it emerges. The teachers in this study could be variously labelled 'exemplary' and 'novice' as generalist teachers in early childhood. However, in the role of music teachers they came to this study as ordinary teachers - representing the view of what is attainable.

Much research on teacher thinking stems from concern about teachers' pedagogical knowledge. This thesis sought to tap into this knowledge, which is embedded in the teaching culture, via the teachers' voice. The author expected to find that the teachers spoke in several registers at once, indicating that their
knowledge is not logically sequenced, but tends to address several concerns at the same time. The author also expected to find that teachers act like barometers, reading the emotions of children, the kindergarten situation and the educational climate very carefully moment by moment. It was of interest to note which dilemmas they selectively chose to respond to, as well as which teaching scripts and routines they chose to elaborate. The latter revealed which structures had meaning for them. The context within which they were currently working was important too, since readers need to be aware of this context as a backdrop, in order to interpret the teachers’ voice.

Both Sockett (1987) and Noddings (1987) argued that a teacher’s voice embodies moral expressions of caring, goals and ideas, and is as much a moral language as an educational language. The teacher’s voice in this sense, as a moral voice, becomes a critical one.

All of the above features were sought by the author to reveal something of the teaching culture in pre-school music education.

In choosing to narrate the stories of teachers involved in the current study, the resultant thick descriptions gave voice to general practitioners. People who could speak for and about teaching music in kindergarten. This allowed us to view teaching from the inside.

The setting up of structures to facilitate teacher dialogue have included considerations of what Leonard (1983) saw as features of a good discussion and what guides curriculum discourse. These structures, like Schwab’s commonplaces, suggest a framework such as Shulman’s codification of pedagogical knowledge for the detection of blindness or of relative neglect in the teacher’s knowledge.

The professional-industrial climate for teachers at the pre-school level at the time of this study was unsettled. Major restructuring of pre-school education was foreshadowed. It was the best time and the worst time to ask kindergarten teachers to consider their life’s work. Modes of working, which revealed to themselves, and
those who observed them, their thoughts about and knowledge of pre-school music education may have been greeted coolly. Instead they were welcomed as therapeutic. Asking teachers initially to share a common but foreign teaching experience which created a reason and opportunity for talking was part of the design of the study, but it was by no means sure that they would persevere with the task they voluntarily undertook. The study allowed the opening up of possibilities for shared concern and shared commitment which led to a 'democratic' evaluation of aims and purposes. Teachers were offered, in the German material, the opportunity to step both aside and outside their own work. This process of estrangement offered a way in - a chance to explore their own world by contrasting it with another.

The author was not in a position to choose the teachers in the study. She had to work with those available. Moreover this kind of research is problematic. One aims at getting the best quality of discussion possible, but cannot dictate what teachers will actually talk about. The author had to rely on the material being inherently interesting enough for them to want to talk about it.

In order to communicate the discussions powerfully and effectively, the author based the account upon the stories of just two of the teachers, drawing upon the others where necessary to clarify or substantiate their point of view.

The story fragments of Jenny and Bob have been interwoven with dialogue episodes of the other teachers to reveal something of the kindergarten music teaching culture.

The names Jenny and Bob are fictitious. During the study the Music and Dance for Children program was referred to as the Musicat program.
Chapter 3

Thinking Again about my Teaching

"Music has the power of producing a certain effect on the moral character of the soul and if it has the power to do this, it is clear that the young must be directed to music and must be educated in it."

Aristotle
Thinking Again about my Teaching

JENNY AND BOB

Both Jenny and Bob are teachers of many years experience.

Jenny currently heads the double unit kindergarten in an exclusive girls' school. This year, her first in this position, has brought many changes. Her teaching load has altered since she is now only responsible for one group of children in an extended hours program. The teacher in the adjoining unit is directly responsible to Jenny. The line of responsibility continues from Jenny through the head of the Junior School to the Principal. In this new situation Jenny enjoys the interaction with the Junior School staff, something she had not previously experienced. After years of professional isolation this was something she actively sought. For this she has forgone her autonomy as kindergarten directress - she is now part of a decision-making chain and thus inherits many new restrictions.

As a teacher Jenny could well be considered exemplary. She has a high reputation in the inner eastern suburbs. She has a bright, effervescent personality and whilst she articulates her thoughts with clarity and conviction she is open to new and contrary opinions. She is willing to share her experience and knowledge and is most eager to take the opportunity to learn from others. She is both a talker and a listener.

Bob, too, has taken up a new teaching position this year. He has moved from a lower socio-economic inner eastern suburb to a southern edge of the city location, populated by dual income professional families. Bob is responsible for two groups of children for four sessions per week - the regular kindergarten commitment. He has befriended the teacher in a neighbouring kindergarten. This friendship offers them professional companionship, contact and the opportunity to share resources.

Bob is very humble. He is quietly spoken, and offers his opinions somewhat hesitantly. His views, thoughtful and contemplative, reflect his years of practical
experience, his industriousness and his strong commitment to his professional rôle. Bob's interest in the Musicat program and the prospect of participating in the group study surpassed, he says, his confidence in his ability to teach it.

From the outset Jenny was very positive and expressed excitement at the anticipated challenge of participating in this research project. "I'm looking forward to fresh ideas ... to being in contact with other teachers. It will be a change from the relative isolation in which most of us work," she said. (Briefing Meeting 1, 26/7/91, Diary Entry p.9.) In the first collegial meeting Jenny was paired with the youngest participating teacher. She actively supported this young teacher and openly acknowledged differences in approach and outcome as legitimate. However, whilst commenting on the value of professional dialogue and the opportunity to share talk, she wanted more than that. She sought expert knowledge and professional recognition for kindergarten teachers. "We barely take a lunch hour and when we do we eat a sandwich sitting on a little chair ... we don't treat ourselves as professionals, so how can we expect anyone else to?" (Collegial Meeting 1, 2/8/91, Diary Entry p.16.)

The opportunity to meet with colleagues was welcomed by all teachers on this project. They viewed the author's rôle of 'resident music expert' as critical to the discussions. At the initial briefing session these teachers expressed a need for guidance and support. Tackling points needing clarification, potential trouble spots and possible obstructions to the teaching of the program head on, at the preliminary stage, seemed a decisive factor in securing the teachers' confidence in the trial from the outset.

At the initial briefing meeting Bob appeared the most neutral participant. He showed no obvious positive emotion about the tasks ahead. He took notes, checked strategies and points from the notes but asked no further questions. Shortly after this initial meeting Bob phoned to cancel his next appointed meeting date. Industrial issues had intervened and he had to attend a district teachers' meeting. When the
author suggested that this project was a luxury item in the current climate of unrest in the early childhood sphere, she was assured by Bob, "No, this will be just what we need. It will keep us sane." (Briefing Meeting 1, 26/7/91, Diary Entry p.12.)

The chance for these teachers to divert their attention from the current indutro-political problems and breathe other professional air seemed particularly timely. With increased numbers of working mothers, demand for child care facilities had grown. Child care facilities and the traditional kindergarten programs competed for government support through funding and professional recognition. This conflict had placed heavy demands upon kindergarten teachers, who were called upon to defend their position as educators in the face of insurgent claims by child care personnel seeking a place within the new order of service delivery for young children. Kindergarten teachers were fighting to maintain and preserve programs and positions. They felt that the very survival of their profession was at risk.

This study could be considered opportune because group support was built during the collegial meetings. The chance to acknowledge these teachers as valued professionals arose alongside the chance to spur their growth and development.

INITIAL RESPONSES TO THE GERMAN MUSIC PROGRAM

The German music program is based on Orff-Schulwerk, an approach to concepts-based exploratory learning, aimed at developing the whole personality. The developmental processes of learning are valued as highly as the musical product. The approach allows teachers creativity and freedom to improvise, but demands skills in goal-setting and developmentally processing exploratory stages to the musical end-point. It challenges teachers to provide open-ended musical experiences for children. In the German program the structuring of goals and purposes is laid down, but not in a step-wise prescriptive manner. As such it is a far cry from the aims and processes of the music and singing lessons found in many traditional music
programs. Thus the approach, which takes skill, practice and study to achieve, provided a substantial challenge to the teachers in this study - but one which, given support, was well within their realms of achievement.

The initial reports of teaching sessions indicated that the teachers felt positive about the Music and Dance for Children program from the outset. Jenny expressed initial hesitancy when the activities moved beyond anything she had attempted before, but expressed confidence boosts as she repeated and expanded activities which she felt added new richness to her teaching. She was impressed with being able to contribute her own individual interpretation and style to the program. Being told by a child during the very first music session, "I feel good when I do this" confirmed Jenny's confidence in the teaching process and the program's worth. Jenny was able to make suggestions regarding the sequencing of some activities which her children found more difficult.

Extract A - Teaching Script: Cat Music - Session 1, p.1.

SESSION 1:

CAT MUSIC

Goal: To develop a perception of movement.

Objectives:
1. To use body movement as a response.
2. To link vocal sounds to movement.
3. To link instrumental sounds to movement.
4. To respond to a poem through movement, vocal sounds, instrumental sounds - in any combination.

Resources Needed
Red Wool (thick)
Bright sounding instruments eg. glockenspiel, xylo, bells
Dark sounding instruments eg. drums, tambourine
Tape Recording TM 3 'Cat Music'
Tape Recorder.

Prep: Lay out the red wool as a pathway into the teaching space.
The pathway ends in a large circle.

Activity 1 "Let's be Artists .... the wool is a tight rope".

Teacher & children follow the pathway, walking round the circle before sitting around the circle to begin the session.
Teacher becomes the first artist. She/he shows how a tight rope walker can walk on the red wool without losing balance.
Possibilities might include:
walking, forwards, backwards, skipping, hopping along it,
balancing on one foot.
Then also try:
movements over as well as along the wool
lifting the wool with hands, fingers, foot etc
walking alongside it in many ways.

* All games need clear and animated expressions from the teacher.
The children will benefit from decisive imaginative actions from the teacher.
When the children have understood the task they are invited to develop their own activities with the wool.
The two teachers said they felt positive about the program because it was responsive to individual teaching styles. When embarking on new territory in curriculum and programming, teachers' confidence soars if pupil response is positive. Teachers are accepting of change where they see acceptance in their pupils.

Teachers tinker with new professional ideas to ensure a good fit between program strategies and activities and the children's motivation, capabilities and needs.

Jenny felt positive about the program since it allowed for her individual teaching style. "Little things keep coming back to me ... things I haven't thought about for ages. It's triggering new ideas, too." She related how she had set up a candle and camellias on the mat in one session. "The mat looked lovely, wonderful - quite different ... and the children responded so well. That was using a bit of you and a bit of me." For Jenny it was the ideas which she could offer her children through the German program which set it apart. "In the Magic Instrument Forest session they pleaded 'tell us again, tell us again'. I found that beautiful - it was a lovely content. I have never worked with other music programs like that. It's the ideas which flow out of it. There's a lovely structure to it." (Collegial Meeting 3, 16.8.91, Audiotape 2, Diary Entry p.66.)

Extract B - Story Script: Magic Instrument Forest - Session 2.

**Activity 5**

"Magic Forest of Instruments".

The teacher tells the story of a magic forest where instruments grow on trees:

"There was once a forest with trees - just as any forest. The trees had branches - just as any other trees and on the branches were twigs ... just as any other twigs. On the twigs grew leaves - just as on all trees. However, in this forest something was different. The trees were special. In the places where some trees grew fruit, these trees grew musical instruments. There were bells, triangles, rhythm sticks, tambourines (etc) and even a drum! When the wind blew ever so softly from the mountains one could hear the instruments sounding very softly. Sometimes, however, the wind was rough and wild and blew so strongly that the instruments sounded much louder."

The children and teacher work on ways to create a "movement" and "sound" picture of this magic forest.
Bob, on the other hand expressed initial hesitancy because the material appeared to be too structured. "It seemed so specific ... too particular" said Bob. "Its pre-design made me less confident in its ability to work." The program calls for very active teacher participation and was to Bob's mind "more demanding of teachers." He asked: "Is this how Germans would teach music?" "At first I thought the wool idea was a bit corny ... but the wool leads you forward ... it's really quite appropriate and clever. The wool is a particularly good symbol." Speaking of the illustrations in the children's booklet he added: "I now see them as more in tune with the nature of the program itself ... they have a freedom which is nice in a real way ... a nice arm of it [the program]." (Collegial Meeting 2, 7/8/91, Audiotape 1, Diary Entry p.34.)


An alienation effect or 'estrangement' from their own familiar practices enabled teachers to stand outside their own teaching and make comparisons with this
program from another culture. The specificity and structure of the Musicat program which initially surprised teachers, became a feature of their acceptance. They observed its somewhat surprising appropriateness for the children, the children's obvious enjoyment and its ability to trigger new and creative ideas in the teacher. "It has more content than any of our current programs," proffered one teacher.

THE GERMAN MUSIC PROGRAM IMPRESSES AS COMPREHENSIVE - TEACHERS BEGIN TO QUESTION THEIR SKILLS

The German program impressed teachers as being very comprehensive. "There's more content to it ... if you talk about the overall music program, there's more to it than I would normally plan on my own." ... "What I liked about it was that it incorporates the singing, the instrumental, the vocal, the movement in a nice way ... altogether. I've always tended to put these all in their own little boxes ..." were all typical comments. (Collegial Meeting 4, 6/9/91, Audiotape 4, Diary Entry p.132.) However, teachers also reported that its specificity was the feature which in particular coloured it as a music program different to any previously encountered.

Bob felt it was this specificity which gave him an initial negative impression of 'pre-design' and led to feelings of hesitancy. "I wasn't confident that it was going to work, even though I had seen it work with Christoph." (Bob had observed Maubach teaching parts of this program.) Consequently Bob suggested the need for a teaching video as an introduction for teachers. "The active participation is the difficult thing for teachers. To adapt to the specific nature of this program demands more of the teacher but once you do that it carries you along." (Collegial Meeting 2, 9/8/91, Audiotape 1, Diary Entry p.34.)

Another teacher added: "Teachers would need to see someone experienced doing it first. Just talking to teachers today at my teachers meeting ... there are many who've hardly even used their instruments all year. If you're not going to do that it's
going to be fairly difficult to pick up a program like this!" (Collegial Meeting 2, 9/8/91, Audiotape 1, Diary Entry p.32.) This teacher later summed up her feelings. "This program requires action. It doesn’t require a teacher sitting quietly and singing with children. You’ve got to throw yourself into it ... and so I did that, and really enjoyed it ... but you’ve got to overcome your nervousness." (Collegial Meeting 2, 9/8/91, Audiotape 1, Diary Entry pp.43-44.)

Why is it that the active participation required for this music program is so difficult for teachers? Do teachers as a group reflect what many members of our community feel, i.e. music is a marginal area, it is difficult to manage to learn? It seems from these teachers’ reports that music is an area where many teachers feel insecure and incompetent. Whilst input from pre-service training was felt to be adequate by older teachers this was not the case for the younger teachers in this group.

The five teachers unanimously agreed that to provide in-service for programs such as the German program was not only vital, if it were to be taken up, but also a large task. "Teachers unsure of themselves would be swamped by a lot of what we did in that [the Musicat] program. We’ve had to do it bit by bit and we’re all experienced. Music teaching needs to be learned by doing it ... you can’t pick up a book and read about it and teach it...."

"Many teachers are struggling to teach music. They need curriculums, they need guidelines ... they need somewhere to go ... they need someone to tell them how to introduce their instruments and what to do with them when they have ... that’s what teachers at my teachers’ meeting were saying today." ... "Doing it would convince people ... like me - I had such a satisfying time and I didn’t even want to start."

"They [teachers in the field] would need a course to teach them how to teach it. What I liked about this as an in-service activity was that it was on-going and we had access to you - a music expert. When we came to meetings you always directed
us in the right way - that made a difference." (Debriefing Meeting 1, 18/10/91, Audiotape 6, Diary Entry p.234.)

Bob's earlier comments supported this view. "A section of teachers in the field would need lots of in-service ... just the idea of this program ... some people would be outside of. It's outside some people's idea of what music is - the structure - the high teacher involvement. An unconfident teacher would struggle. This sort of program we got into with June. [June Epstein - Music Lecturer - Melbourne Kindergarten Teachers' College 1960s-70s.] At College we had to do it, not talk about it! People would have to see it done." (Collegial Meeting 2, 2/8/91, Audiotape 1, Diary Entry p.32.)

The youngest teacher of this group (who trained three years ago) recounted her experience. She was one of twenty students who elected to do a music major but the only one who felt confident. When asked if her pre-service training had equipped her to teach music in the way the Musicat program requires she replied vehemently, "Certainly not" ... "fifty percent of the young teachers I know would not feel confident about teaching a music program at all. At all the music seminars I've done, teachers attend in order to pick up practical ideas - they need to see things done. Theory is no good for them. Demonstration is [of] most value."

This young teacher valued meeting with the consultant-author after teaching the sessions. She said, "Having you overlooking the situation kept me on track. I felt it forced me to challenge to do things I ordinarily wouldn't have. ... because of that I enjoyed it. ... to be forced into activities I'd not have chosen to do was very good for me. I felt compelled to do it but I knew it was my choice. Once you've achieved something you feel really good about it." (Debriefing Meeting 2, 27/10/91, Audiotape 7, Diary Entry p.241.)

It seems from these comments that there is a serious lack in teacher knowledge where music education is concerned. This may be rooted in lack of curriculum knowledge but the author suggests that the reluctance to teach music, the
uncertainty of teachers stems from a deep lack of what Shulman (1987) terms pedagogical content knowledge. This is the special fusion of content and pedagogy which gives teachers their own special form of professional knowledge. It comes from an understanding of how topics, problems and issues are organised, represented and adapted to the diverse interests of learners and presented for instruction. It cannot be learned from a book. It needs to be developed from the onset of teacher training and continued throughout a teacher's active professional life. It can only come from a context such as the one in this study.

DIFFERENCES IN THE GERMAN MUSIC PROGRAM AND AUSTRALIAN MUSIC PROGRAMS ARE EXAMINED

The Use of Vocal Play

An area of difficulty appeared in the first teaching session. Bob took it up in discussion immediately. The German program offers vocal play but this caused all of the teachers to express caution. Bob said: "I subscribe to the idea that singing is important. This sort of activity, I haven't actually done before but having to make the effort to do so is a good thing for teachers." (Collegial Meeting 2, 7/8/91, Audiotape 1, Diary Entry p.32.)

Extract D - Vocal Play Activity: Cat Music, Session 1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>&quot;Name Games for Vocal Play&quot;.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Children and Teacher sitting around the circle of red wool.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a)</td>
<td>Teacher says her/his name whilst lifting the wool off the floor carefully.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b)</td>
<td>One child is invited to lift up the wool and say his name. Others are invited to repeat the child's name aloud as they lift up the wool.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(c)</td>
<td>Teacher invites children to create other voice sounds to accompany the lifting movements. This needs to be done carefully and sensitively. It is important not to overtax the child's ability and also to draw upon the creative ideas which children offer naturally.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(d)</td>
<td>Voice &quot;tone curves&quot; can be made by manipulating the sounds of the children's names. The lifting of the wool can match the curve moving up and down from high to low-pitched voices.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Bob found that one of his most confident and competent children baulked at the early use of individual voice in the initial teaching session. Jenny, too, found this to be a problem. "I had some quite confident girls who were reluctant to participate." She agreed with Bob that the program could benefit from some tinkering since "many teachers and therefore children are unused to using their voices freely." Nevertheless Jenny endorsed the activity as highly desirable as she feels strongly committed to children's aesthetic development but she did comment that for many teachers this activity would prove difficult.

The German program called on teachers to enter new territory from the outset. Early vocal activities found both children and teachers feeling self-conscious about using their voices in a free manner. The problem of embarking on the unfamiliar was seen as a dual one. "It's something children could and should do ... the teacher needs to get into it early." One teacher compared American children whose education stresses verbal competency: "Those children's self-esteem in using their voices is much stronger."

Using their knowledge of the children's characteristics the teachers recommended that in a restructuring of the program, they would place these vocal activities later on. "Some children don't like being picked out too early." A more familiar and traditional use of voice (i.e. in song), would be more appropriate to a first session.

The teachers added that any program must have a very successful first session. It should proceed from the known to the unknown and gather the children's and teacher's confidence as it proceeds lest it "puts people off". "They will not persevere," warned one teacher. (Collegial Meeting 2, 7/8/91, Audiotape 1, Diary Entry p.31.)

In trying the Musicat program the five volunteers have in effect been finding out if and to what extent they are able to be music teachers. They felt unskilled and lacked confidence in vocal activities, which suggests that teachers in the field, who
are not as strongly committed to music programs as these are, would also, similarly, lack confidence. These days teachers are being asked to do things they are not trained to do. Training has not equipped them, it seems, to cope with the vocal aspect of the music program. Singing and chanting should be integral parts of any music program. The vocal development of the young child, the building of a vocal repertoire (songs, rhymes and chants) and the development of rhythm and tonal patterns must all be attended to.

To achieve goals in this area of the music program needs professional teaching skills as well as personal performance skills. The two are inter-related. To have this set of professional skills, a teacher needs to have a sense of performance skills for him/herself.

Even to strongly committed teachers such as Jenny and Bob, the Musicat program presents the challenge to move into areas previously untried and certainly uncommon. The development of the voice through vocal play is an area which challenges teachers’ and children’s confidence.

Traditionally singing is the cornerstone of kindergarten music programs. However, these strongly committed teachers, all confident of their singing abilities and satisfied with their program offerings in this area, were less than confident and unfamiliar with vocal play and voice development activities. This would suggest a lack of content knowledge. To rectify this lack teachers would need to commit themselves to in-service activities of the kind suggested earlier.

The Elemental Approach

One teacher reported "using the voice and then the body movements and adding the instrumental accompaniment to express a poem is something I would never have done in my previous music program." (Collegial Meeting 4, 6/9/91, Audiotape 4, Diary Entry p.132.)
Extract E - Cat Poem.

Activity 5  A Cat Poem

"Who's that?"
Just the cat!
Sneaking, purring, creeping
Then a jump!
She curls in a lump
Miaouuuuuuu

Christoph Maubach

The teacher gives a strongly animated recitation of the poem including some gestural movements.

cg.  One hand behind ear - 1st line
     Showing of cat's claws - 2nd line
     Hand gestures for sneaking and creeping - 3rd line
     Loud hand clap - 4th line
     Curling arm and tucking in head - 5th line
     Miaouuuuuuu - 6th line

The teacher stimulus aims to feed children some ideas for movement. Children are asked to create vocal sounds, movement responses and instrumental accompaniment to illustrate and enrich this poem.

The Musicat program offers a comprehensive and integrated approach to music activities. Deemed an elemental approach it seeks to draw upon many musical elements developed individually and then integrated into a holistic musical experience.

Like Jenny (reported earlier, p.29) who had discovered in the German program new ways to motivate the children and stimulate their curiosity, this teacher was led to experience and understand the integration of musical elements which is a strong feature of the Orff approach to teaching music.

The Use of Percussion Instruments

The use of percussion instruments - in particular tuned percussion (percussion instruments tuned to pitch) is a feature of the Musicat program. "Using tuned as well as untuned percussion ... many teachers would need in-service for this" commented one teacher.

Many teachers are familiar with and use untuned percussion instruments to accompany sing-alongs. However, experience as an in-service educator leads the author to believe that few generalist teachers feel confident in structuring the use of
instruments in any developmental way. Teachers who are aware of, let alone use, tuned percussion instruments in music programs are indeed scarce. The use of percussion instruments, both tuned and untuned, is an integral part of the Orff-Schulwerk approach and hence the Musicat program. In-service sessions in instrumental usage are offered by the Orff-Schulwerk Association of Victoria. The Melbourne University School of Early Childhood Studies has a Continuing Education program on a regular basis. However, relatively few teachers take advantage of these offers. Teachers seem unprepared to commit themselves to building professional skills through these channels. One wonders why. This formal upgrading of skills and retraining of competencies is a big undertaking. Bob and Jenny say it is something you build up to in a program area before you commit yourself materially and ideologically to this reconstruction of self. This is something that is serendipitous. This research group is an example.

In a later discussion a more experienced teacher shared with two younger teachers her experiences, strategies and techniques for using tuned percussion. She explained how in her kindergarten xylophones were introduced and made available to children. She talked of rules governing usage, the children’s responses and the skills children were developing.

This teacher’s understanding had been expanded by contact with the mother of a child attending her kindergarten. The mother, a music specialist pre-school teacher, had conducted regular music sessions at the kindergarten. This personalised in-service had led the teacher to seek money from the kindergarten committee to purchase xylophones.

Using music specialists as visiting teachers to kindergartens could be a useful form of in-service training, but would have limited impact on any wide-scale initiatives which may be necessary. A model for visiting teacher services is available through Special Education Services to primary education.
Jenny also commented on the use of instruments in the German program. It opened up ideas which to her were novel. "I'd never done anything like that before with a piece of music." Jenny was impressed when children suggested titles for the music heard; and made connections to other program areas featured that week. She reported that the variety of activities in this music session stimulated active participation from some children who had previously been slow to participate.

The teachers detected differences in the Musicat program. These were expressed in terms of the new ideas and approaches - principally the use of voice, the elemental approach, the use of percussion instruments and the integration of elemental parts into a holistic music experience. Bob was able to compare his experience of the program to his observations of a Kodály music program he had experienced. He was impressed by the rapidity with which a teacher could get a response from the children with the Kodály program, but was astute enough to comment: "but with those songs [the repertoire of the Kodály program] it's like getting up onto a vehicle which is already rolling." (Debriefing Meeting 2, 27/10/91, Audiotape 7, Diary Entry p.243.)

The Kodály music program is grounded on singing. Thus it is easier for teachers to adapt to it. Singing is central to musical education. However, it is not the only aspect. Other elements can and must be developed. For many teachers the singing program is the music program. Teachers, generally, feel more comfortable about this area than any other in a music program. It is to be expected that in undertaking change, searching for new solutions, new directions and new possibilities, teachers will have to move away from the familiar and into the unknown. They must risk new territories and seek new horizons.

The teachers, while discerning differences between the German and Australian programs, were unable to articulate these in general terms. Bob's mention of his teacher training under June Epstein in the early 1970s places him in an era when the influence of Orff-Schulwerk upon music education was strong in
Australia. Many of today's teachers have been trained in Kodály music programs. Originating in Hungary, these programs were translated into English and adapted. They have been in wide use and a prime focus for music education over the past two decades in Australia. It was not until the 1980s that the influence of Orff-Schulwerk became again evident through publications of music programs. In 1982 an American edition of an Orff-Schulwerk music program was published. Subsequent publications of music programs from the United States such as Haines and Gerber (1984) and Bayless and Ramsey (1987), evidence the influence of Orff-Schulwerk in music curricula. The 1980s also saw publication of a revised edition of Epstein's text (1986). This text has provided guidance for Australian teachers in music education for many decades. The Orff approach to music education was not consolidated into a comprehensive publication until Musik und Tanz für Kinder was published.

Teachers need to be conscious not only of increasing their knowledge of curricula which can serve as the 'tools for their trade,' but also be vigilant that the proven and valued materials and programs from the past remain in the eclectic gathering of resources for the present and future. As Shulman (1987) points out, they must take responsibility to ensure that their knowledge of educational ends, purposes and values, and the philosophical and historical grounds of this knowledge are continually updated.

Music educators in pre-service institutions have a special rôle to play in ensuring that teachers of the future enter the field with some understanding of their responsibility in this aspect of the practising teachers' pool of knowledge - the teachers' knowledge base.

THE GERMAN PROGRAM HIGHLIGHTS CURRICULAR NEEDS

The Importance of Listening Activities

One of the teachers commented: "In this program the children need to be able to listen, to comprehend and to respond ... for some children these days this
does not come as easily ... maybe they are not as ready for this program as they need to be." Jenny was also concerned that "children these days do not listen. ... this should be a major area of the work throughout the year." She also expressed a strong desire to see Yoga and Meditation as part of every school program. This concern at poor listening skills extended to shortened concentration spans when another teacher commented: "I have a friend and we feel that there is a whole section of books in our kinder libraries we cannot use these days. ... the children cannot sit still long enough for them. Working on concentration is one of the major areas of our work."

(Collegial Meeting 3, 16/8/91, Audiotape 2, Diary Entry p.73.)

Extract F - Listening Activity.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activity 3</th>
<th>The Story of A Special Bell</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(a)</td>
<td>The teacher tells</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>not far away from our house is a bell tower. In the bell tower are several bells. Often they ring together,</em> but <em>never do they start together or finish together</em>.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b)</td>
<td>Listen to the Tape TM 5 C and ask the children</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Which bell can you hear especially well?</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Show me how it moves.</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(c)</td>
<td>Repeat the listening example and encourage individual children to respond to a bell sound they feel closest to. This too creates a movement &quot;piece&quot;.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The activity could be repeated several times with children encouraged to choose a different bell to respond to each time.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Concern about poor listening skills, shortened attention spans and limited concentration and focusing skills is the subject of much teacher-talk, concerns which may be shared by teachers in Germany. These comments, coupled with the observations and comparisons previously made, may reflect the ethnocentricity of the German music program. They may be a reflection upon the cultural differences in regard to space (both geographical and personal), the use of recreation time, child-rearing patterns and other extraneous influences on children in Germany and in Australia.
The Importance of Aesthetic Arts Education

Bob had several very active boys in his group. They also presented as fairly aggressive. Bob reported, "That really active Cat session suited them ... they were asking for more. It was exactly what they need. These boys were quite wild cats, while another girl was a demure kitten. She was completely lost in herself. ... For some of these boys everything needs to be push and bash," said Bob, who feels this is a cultural statement of many of today's children - in particular boys. "This group of boys will go on to the best schools. They will succeed and achieve out there, but they will do so with an aggressive edge ... a lot will be lost along the way." Jenny endorsed this loss of the soul or culture: "absolutely, but they will succeed in one way - not necessarily in a fulfilling way. This sort of music program highlights the other extreme. Children need this sort of program now more than ever." (Collegial Meeting 5, 13/9/91, Audiotape 5, Diary Entry p.192.)

Bob's experience mirrored the findings of the Pilot Study at the Lady Gowrie in 1989, wherein very active movement-based sessions resulted in the children, especially the boys, being more eager to participate. Bob struck problems in teaching the more reflective-passive session of the program. This probably exposes what is seen by many educators as a problem for today's children. The boys Bob described may well represent a group most in need of experiences to promote social-emotional development.

Jenny continued: "The sorts of things we've been doing [in the Musicat program] will maybe help children ... to get that inner soul ... to explore that side of their personalities and to help them deal with themselves ... that will be the issue as these children grow up." At a later stage Jenny commented: "The key is trying to unlock what is inside each child, with this sort of program, and I think that's the opportunity which is really important and valuable." Another teacher added: "We need to consider where today's children are and where tomorrow's children will be. Supposedly they are going to have more time on their hands, in which to amuse
themselves. Then they are going to need inner resources to know how to live - how to use their recreation time. Programs like this and the art area, helping to develop creativity, will do this.” (Debriefing Meeting 1, 18/10/91, Audiotape 6, Diary Entry p.236.)

The Musicat program is valued by teachers because it develops children’s creativity and appeals to their aesthetic sensibilities. As such it provides a chance to offer balance in their lives, which are increasingly dominated by technology, computers, television and videos. These teachers agreed that it is now the rôle of educators to deliver this sort of program. Shulman and others comment on the value of research into children’s metacognition in mathematics and science - their naive logical frameworks. These are appreciated in high quality teaching. The same is true for musicality as it is for mathematical problem solving.

THE GERMAN PROGRAM DEMANDS ORGANISATIONAL CHANGES

In addition to leading teachers into new territories of music teaching, the Musicat program demanded of the teachers organisational changes. The Musicat program calls for small groups of ten to twelve. There are usually twenty-five children in a kindergarten group. Jenny agreed with the theoretical notions of small groups: "We need to aim to teach in small groups ... but reality is ... we don’t always get the opportunity to ... we do need to strive to do that ... there are some activities which are too difficult to use with a whole group."

However, in practice her reality was often less than the ideal: "With wet weather, there is nowhere else to go with the other half of the group. ... It was too difficult for my assistant to keep the other half of the group quiet enough for the music group to proceed." (Collegial Meeting 3, 16/8/91, Audiotape 2, Diary Entry p.65.) Bob also reported problems he had encountered and the solutions he had found. Group splitting had required the retraining of his assistant to accept new
working conditions. She was left in charge of the remaining children while Bob worked with the music group. Bob had also found it necessary to synchronise music and outdoor play to allow for a simple form of group splitting. However, on wet days Bob's assistant had to use the bathroom for a story group whilst Bob took the music group. Bob felt that these program changes and alternatives would be enough to cause all but highly motivated teachers to give up on adopting this program.

The organisational changes necessary to accommodate small group work, whether it be music or story group, is something which demands flexibility. Traditionally teachers have managed to achieve and maintain this flexibility to accommodate a story group. It should also be a possibility to accommodate a music group in this way. In kindergartens where teachers are committed to qualitative literature and music programs, synchronised split group organisation can accommodate these program demands quite effectively. In the summer months, outdoor play/story group and music group synchronisations would even leave the bathroom area free.

As with all new programs, once teachers have integrated the nature and flavour of the teaching activities into their teaching style, the activities can be more easily offered with ease and confidence. They may even come to resemble the seemingly incidental spontaneous music experiences which now form part of the music education programs in kindergartens. The song in the sand pit as the sole item of spontaneous music-making experiences could be expanded into a repertoire involving movement activities, listening games, instrumental activities and vocal plays.

The author asked the teachers: "Does this program lead you to organise small group times for music? Does it still allow you to attend to incidental opportunities on-the-run, for individuals and groups and large group times for music such as community singing [on the mat]?"] To these questions Bob replied: "Yes, ... and this program has shown me how valuable small group time can be." "But it is essential
to have an able assistant to attend to the other children if it is to go ahead."
(Debriefing Meeting 2, 27/10/91, Audiotape 7, Diary Entry p.241.)

FINAL RESPONSES TO THE GERMAN MUSIC PROGRAM

The Musicat program has used this small in-service setting to allow teachers to try curriculum changes. It has forced teachers to restructure and reorganise how music may be offered in their kindergartens. Some changes have caused problems. The testing of the program's use and the shaping of a view of its effectiveness has led them to find new meanings in music education. The change has called for new behaviours, and has demanded new skills.

At the end of the teaching sessions Jenny summed up her reaction thus: "I liked it [the program] from the word go ... and I was stimulated by it. I've been thrilled with the ideas it's been giving me. I've always found the music area something I've loved, but I haven't been very good at creating ideas myself. This program has offered me many new ideas. Every year I like to do something to stimulate me because I think you need to keep working for yourself. So for me it has given me a big professional challenge. I've had to think about it quite a lot. It's also been good because the availability of instruments in the kindergarten was very poor, so it's given me a reason to say 'I need to spend money to build up the instrument collection'. I've been able to justify this to the School Council via this program."
(Collegial Meeting 5, 13/9/91, Audiotape 5, Diary Entry p.199.)

"For me," said Bob, "as far as this experience has taught me, I need to work at it more constantly ... but I like what I read." Bob acknowledged the problems he had encountered: "I've just needed another pair of hands to free me up to take the music group." ... but added that this problem was not insoluble. When asked if the program had stretched him professionally Bob replied: "Oh yes! ... it was a challenge ... but a good challenge ... one I want and need. At the end of the session I've wondered if
I’ve needed it, mind you ... but yes, in the mornings, I’ve wanted it! I found out a lot about myself by doing this ... and I’ve had a bit of a wrestle in terms of my own ego. For me, the spirit’s there ... the feeling is there ... but the practicality, the fluency may not have been. I wouldn’t want to throw this program out even though there were a few times when I felt shaky about it. I’ve wanted to chuck it a couple of times. But I think it’s worthwhile and worth working on. I can see that they are very good ideas and that it would open children up. I like the way this program starts from the child and opens out.” (Debriefing Meeting 1, 27/10/91, Audiotape 7, Diary Entry pp.243-244.)

Jenny was the teacher who offered Bob professional support when his confidence was battered by unsuccessful sessions. In discussion she acted as a ‘critical friend’ to Bob. She offered suggestions of alternative strategies and also recounted how she herself had undertaken a time management course to improve her organisational skills. "It has actually helped the organisation of my program day to day," she said. Bob, acknowledging her perception, replied: "Yes ... what I’m really saying is that I need organisational skills."

Not only does this incident confirm the value of the professional support given and received, it also draws attention to Jenny’s ability to improve her skills. In this way Jenny fits the bill of a self-motivated teacher. She is able to take charge of her own professional development. But are all teachers like Jenny? Fullan (1982) points out that change depends significantly upon whether teachers are isolated as individuals or can be drawn into groups whereby exchange of ideas and support of positive feelings can occur. These teachers have been drawn out of their isolated environments and brought into a group. They have shared and exchanged ideas, supported each other with positive feelings about their work. They could now represent what Guskey (1986) refers to as agents of change.

This study demonstrated the process of curriculum development proceeding alongside the process of professional development, as advocated by Owen et al
(1988). These teachers were offered sections of a music program to teach. In doing so their confidence in teaching music was increased. They were asked to judge their competence against the acknowledged competence of German educators. The results have been positive - even for Bob who achieved successes in an area he agreed to with trepidation. Through this exercise the teachers were ‘living’ the teaching experience - pitting their professionalism against the Germans. This led to acknowledgement of their own strengths. They felt empowered. It has led to explorations of statements of purpose. They were walking in new territory and challenging themselves professionally.
Chapter 4

What Should my Aims be in Music Education?

"My idea is that there is music in the air, music all around us, the world is full of it and you simply take as much as you require."

Edward Elgar

"There is nothing more difficult than talking about music."

Camille Saint-Saëns
What Should my Aims be in Music Education?

"I can foster a climate that approaches my ideals for the kindergarten program through art, music and the natural world"

Expressions of goals such as the above, for music education are framed within references to the general aims for pre-school education. The teachers were invited to write something of their beliefs about pre-school education. Jenny stressed the acknowledgement of the individual differences in children. She believes a program should develop "independence of attitude of self - the child in relation to a group and independence in learning ... communication of ideas, needs and feelings effectively ... - children's sense of self-worth, respect for themselves, of other people and of property." She feels the kindergarten teacher's rôle involves "creating a learning environment based on individual children's needs and interests. This is achieved by observing, recording and assessing their level of development." (Diary Entry p.258.)

It is important to note that despite this clear expression of their rôle, where music education is concerned, teachers gave no indication that any systematic or comprehensive observation, recording or assessment takes place in current curricula. In fact when given the opportunity to examine critically the aims of music education, the teachers reacted most strongly, citing the problems this presented. This reaction will be examined more fully later.

Bob expressed some of his beliefs about pre-school education in this way: "I feel that kindergarten can provide a major opportunity for children to find fulfilment, and develop in a carefully arranged and resourced environment. Interest, curiosity, the acquiring of knowledge and the expression of ideas and feelings, and a growing awareness of how they [the children] relate to the wider world are among aims that to my mind are worthwhile." He went on to write: "I endeavour to create an environment and atmosphere where children find a sense of fulfilment, through
contact with stimulating experiences - where they can see, hear, can feel and taste and can find confidence in meaningful self-expression. I more easily can foster a climate that approaches these ideals through areas of art, music and the natural world.” (Diary Entry p.258.)

Jenny expanded: "Kindergarten teachers believe that creativity plays an important rôle in a quality program. Appropriate learning environments must allow children to express their own ideas and feelings in an acceptable manner."

This group of five teachers expressed strongly their professional commitment to kindergarten as the foundation to the educative process. Achievement of aims for children in kindergarten Jenny felt provides the "excellent foundation upon which to build formal education. It is important for the community to understand that the years between 0-6 are extremely valuable ... kindergarten teachers can be instrumental in sending a child off to school confident, self-assured, positive and keen to join in all school can offer." (Diary Entry p.258.)

Another of the teachers wrote: "My main professional concern is to see our profession survive, now that our educative contribution is no longer being recognised by the government." (Diary Entry p.258.)

These comments reveal teachers' perceptions that their rôle and work is undervalued by the community and by the government. Such comments support Clyde's claim that the profession of the early childhood teacher is disintegrating. It is significant that among major professional concerns, survival and the need to be understood by those outside the professional community, are uppermost in teachers' minds. It is a reflection of how the current industrial climate impinges upon the very core of pre-school education - its aims for children.

"Music should be an integral part of the kindergarten program"

When asked where music fits within the kindergarten curriculum, this group of teachers unanimously agreed that music should hold a central place.
Jenny believed that music should have a very highly ranked place in the kindergarten program. "It is an area where everyone can join in and be equal. Music does not have any expectation of performance or perfection - it is for pure enjoyment."

Bob agreed: "Music can be an integral part of the program, and I feel it should be. To isolate music experiences both reduces the quality of the children's expression and prevents any growth through music. ... Careful presentation of different kinds of musical experiences can make for ongoing interest and development."

The other teachers supported these views. "Music has a place in the daily program and should not be reserved for special group times, but used incidentally throughout the day, e.g. singing songs relevant to activities both indoors and out, particularly accompanying movement, digging, swinging, walking, painting."

"I consider music an integral part of pre-school education. I will always put music as a top priority for each day. I do not consider music should be put in a special box for group time on the mat." ... "Music should be played during session time as background music. It should be sung - whenever. Music and movement should be everywhere, anytime." This teacher went on to acknowledge: "There is of course a place for structured music. This should be well-rehearsed, planned and carried out with personal enthusiasm, to encourage the children."

The fifth teacher in this group commented: "I believe that music should be given top priority ... it covers such a wide scope of skills e.g. listening, movement, creativity, socialisation, language etc. ... and also integrates so well with other curriculum areas." (Diary Entry p.260.)

However, whilst all teachers in this study stated their belief that music should occupy a central place in the curriculum, they held misgivings about this view being widespread amongst their colleagues. Bob said: "I feel that the reluctance on the part of teachers to allow a more continuous experience with music and instruments is sometimes based on a fear or lack of confidence." (Diary Entry p.260.)
Music is a curriculum area embarked on with reluctance by many teachers. It is often fragmented and confined to areas bounded by teachers' limited skills. Fear and lack of confidence to embrace wider, more expansive areas of music programming prevail in the field. It seems that there is a very big gap, perhaps in some instances a chasm, between what the teachers in this study espoused as their aims, and what common current teaching practice offers as reality. This leads to quite serious questions which must be addressed if music education is to be given a credible central place in early childhood education. Comparing a new and innovative music program such as the German program to current practice across a wider sample group than the five teaching instances above, could well prove an embarrassment.

"I found myself agreeing with the aims and purposes of the Musicat program"

In comparing and reflecting upon the Musicat program the teachers found that it generally expressed their own aims and purposes.

"The Musicat program brought all the musical disciplines together," said one. "There were plenty of opportunities to teach what I consider to be important for music." Another teacher added: "I felt that the aspects of music were given equal emphasis and was encouraged by this as I feel my music program to be a bit biased towards my stronger areas."

Bob said: "As one proceeds through the steps in each session a quite particularised and broad statement emerges. At first the procedure looked too particular but when sessions were presented well it became evident that the steps were carefully considered." ... "I found myself agreeing with the aims and purposes."
"I expected more emphasis on rhythm"

However, Bob also felt that "possibly more rhythm [activities] to carry the children through more effectively" was needed. He said: "A little too much was expected of the children’s ability to interpret or feel their way into the music."

The concern regarding rhythm may have been inherent in Jenny’s comment: "Another aim could be to play percussion instruments using the pulse beat. ... but I do not think you can do everything ... I think what we did was adequate." (Diary Entries p.259.)

The emphasis on rhythm and in particular the establishment of the pulse beat to which Jenny refers, is held as a central aim in the Kodály Pre-School Music program. The teachers noticed the lack of central focus for this aspect in the German program. Clapping and playing to the pulse beat of a song is an activity enjoyed by children and adults alike. The Orff approach to music accommodates this activity, although in the six sample teaching sessions there was no strong emphasis upon it. Exploration of the pulse beat was a component of Session 4: Bell Sounds. The Notes and Methodical Hints to teachers illuminate the Orff-perspective.

Extract G - Exploring Pulse Beat.

NOTE: Bells sway, they sound bright or dark and are swung at different speeds. The sound of bells can travel far so that many people hear them. Many bells sway calmly and regularly. The children may experience this through movement. The image above can be used to also help the children find a steady base pulse for the song and also to find an instrumental ostinato pattern for use with the song.

Methodical Hint:

1. The instruments closest to the sounds of bells which can be played by the children are chime bars. Ideally every teaching room should be equipped with a set of chime bars and several cymbals.

2. The terms high/low and bright/dark can be used synonymously. (To be exact the terms high/low describe differences in pitch whilst bright/dark describe differences in tone colour.) eg. of two sounds with the same pitch, one may sound brighter, one darker. Compare the sounds of identical notes on an alto metallophone (brighter) and an alto xylophone (darker).

3. For the meter-bound accompaniment of the song; it is most important that the teacher allows for differences in individual children’s abilities. The ability to sustain the meter-bound accompaniment which plays the pulse beat, will depend on past experiences of the children. It is not critical for every child to achieve it at this stage.
The Orff approach to music explores a-rhythmic as well as rhythmic responses to music by use of voice, movement, percussion playing and listening activities. The teachers in the study experienced this. For instance, they found the activities involving the free a-rhythmic use of a voice novel as well as challenging.

**Extract H - A-Rhythmic Exploration.**

**Activity 3**  "Free Melodic Accompaniment with Instruments"

Children bring an instrument back to the red wool circle.

(a) Teacher plays some small phrases on a melodic instrument (recorder, flute, piano, xylophone).
Children listen.
It is important for the teacher to focus on the learning process for the discovery of some elementary concepts in music-making : eg.
dynamics - loud/soft : fast/slow : music/how music.

(b) Children invited to "play along" with the teacher's music but must match the music's dynamics, stops/starts etc. When melody is finished children then put instruments down in the circle.

(c) The teacher changes to another signal eg. tremolo, glissando on xylo. Children are asked to be taken with this "wind of sound" through the room. When the wind stops they return to the circle and pick up another instrument. The activity is repeated several times to allow children opportunity to play on several instruments.

**NOTE:**
The small phrases or melodies of the teacher may be freely improvised or may consist of small phrases or parts of known songs/melodies.
Tempo, dynamics and rhythm should vary so that children feel enlivened to vary their creative musical accompaniment.
Additional verbal comments may bring out even more variety.
eg. "Can you make your instrument whisper?"

The listening example presented on the audiotape in the first session introduced the teachers and children to a-rhythmic exploration. Earlier comments reveal that the teachers certainly found this unusual, and outside the realm of music they would customarily present for children. However, they commented favourably on the children's responses.

"I would want to include community singing"

One of the teachers "missed community singing. The chance for teacher and children to sing through known songs."
The six teaching sessions of the German program gave no opportunity for this form of musical activity. However, the author was able to reassure the teachers that this does not indicate that community singing is missing in the entire program. On the contrary, the holistic approach of Orff-Schulwerk recognises the therapeutic value of the sing-along, which is being revived by music therapists of today. The pleasure and enjoyment gained from community singing are experiences foreign to many adults and children. In the past, this group activity was a recreational pursuit enjoyed within many families and communities.

"Is the movement component enough?"

"I felt more movement was required," reported one teacher. "The movement program is so important that it is considered as a whole area of our curriculum. It is more than just part of the music program," explained Jenny. "Yes, that's why I have difficulty in accepting 'Music and Movement' as a title; because of the importance of movement" added Bob. The importance of movement activities was highlighted in these comments: "I felt that where an outlet existed for more vigorous physical actions, the children in my group responded more positively," said Bob. (Diary Entry p.259.)

Jenny had also described children as "tight little balls of aggression" and consequently believes that the use of meditational aspects of a movement program is becoming even more essential. (Debriefing Meeting 1, 18/10/91, Audiotape 6, Diary Entry p.228.)

The movement program most certainly should provide the outlet for which both Bob and Jenny see a need. The teacher who felt that the German program required a greater movement component expresses a feeling which is reflected in current pre-school curricula in Australia. Movement is a program area in its own right. This acknowledges movement and dance as a related but separate discipline.
within the aesthetic arts. It is reflected in the training courses, and professional career paths accorded to it.

Whilst the author acknowledges the view of these teachers regarding the importance of movement, she does not accept their lack of confidence in the German program's full acknowledgement of it.

The author is mindful that Orff-Schulwerk has its genesis rooted firmly in the work of Dalcroze and Laban, two central figures who have influenced both artistic and educational circles in Europe and beyond since the 1920s. Many movement and dance education programs are founded on the principles of these two influential educators. These include the current Australian teacher training curriculum and the specialised training courses for teachers of movement and dance.

Furthermore, the therapeutic value of Orff-Schulwerk, singing notwithstanding, has been acknowledged world-wide in relevant journals. The teachers in this study have just discovered what other professionals have, in recent years, confirmed. Articles in local professional journals and newsletters can readily attest to this. (Victorian Orff-Schulwerk Association Newsletter, August 1991.) The teachers in this study appear unaware of the historical and philosophical grounds of Orff-Schulwerk as well as its importance in all therapeutic work.

"What are our broad goals?"

Aims for music at the pre-school level appear to be general, implicit rather than explicit, and underdeveloped. The German program poses a fundamental challenge to the way kindergarten teachers think about their rôle and function.

Major discussions on goals in music education grew out of more formalised structures set up by the author. Having considered and worked with the aims of the German program, these individual teachers had already been exposed to some expressed aims. In a 'brainstorming' session, teachers were invited to write down,
discuss and compare aims they individually held for the music program. This
discussion yielded consensus on a central aim, that of the development of a sense of
enjoyment and positive self-esteem in children and of a curiosity and desire to be
actively involved in musical activities.

The same session began a deliberative discussion process during which the
teachers' thoughts, both written and verbally expressed, were recorded. The author
acted as facilitator, and afterwards prepared written collations of the aims. The
teachers were asked to consider these collations as an expression of their shared aims
and purposes in music education. The author sought consensus over a statement of
broad goals and a set of specific objectives. The outcome of this deliberative process,
overviewed schematically below, was a set of four broad goals which emanated from
the central aim. Two further goals which overarch the others were stated thus:
i) to provide, via sensory experiences, opportunities for creativity and expression
of feelings through music;
ii) to offer varied musical experiences through which children may become
acquainted with other art forms and many cultures. (See Figure 2.)
Figure 2:
Mapping of Broad Aims of The Music Program Compiled by the Five Teachers and Author-Consultant in this Study

TO OFFER VARIOUS MUSICAL EXPERIENCES THROUGH WHICH CHILDREN MAY BECOME FAMILIAR WITH OTHER ART FORMS AND MANY CULTURES

1.0
TO DEVELOP CHILDREN'S INTERESTS AND SKILLS IN SINGING

2.0
TO PROVIDE MUSICAL ACTIVITIES WHICH DEVELOP MOVEMENT AND COORDINATION SKILLS

3.0
TO DEVELOP CHILDREN'S INTERESTS AND SKILLS IN PLAYING MUSICAL INSTRUMENTS

4.0
TO PROVIDE MUSICAL ACTIVITIES WHICH DEVELOP AURAL PERCEPTION, BUILDING SKILLS OF LISTENING AND OF CONCENTRATION

TO NURTURE IN CHILDREN A SENSE OF ENJOYMENT AND POSITIVE SELF-ESTEEM WHILE DEVELOPING A CURiosity AND DESIRE TO BE ACTIVELY INVOLVED IN MUSICAL ACTIVITIES

TO PROVIDE VIA SENSORY EXPERIENCES, OPPORTUNITIES FOR
The goal-setting session was novel for them. "I have never had the opportunity to sit with other teachers and discuss my goals," said Jenny. "We don’t even have a curriculum ... other teachers in primary and secondary schools do ... we have to make up our own - everything. ... That’s wonderful but it puts a huge onus on us. ... this project not only clarified my own ideas but it made me realise what I feel strongly about ... it made me look quite carefully at my goals for music." (Debriefing Meeting 1, 18/10/91, Audiotape 6, Diary Entry p.230.)

Asking teachers to evaluate the aims of a program, and thereby crystallise their thoughts regarding their own goals, forced them to sift through what in fact are two sets of goals. In group discussion teachers shared experiences from their days as novice teachers, and recounted how daunting the prospect of devising their own curriculum had been. The problems of inexperienced teachers setting unrealistic goals was a common theme. These teachers felt isolated and unsupported in this professional task - they recalled having no feedback, constructive criticism or assistance. The chance to be part of a group such as the one in this project was welcomed as a real solution.

With the current breakdown of the local professional networks in many regional areas, many teachers have little chance of experiencing support from colleagues at meetings, or the opportunity to share professional conversations.

This examination and testing of activities from the Musicat program has allowed curriculum reflection in the manner proposed by Schwab (1983). The shuttle to which Schwab refers, moving between the means and the ends in a back and forth manner, has become reality for these five teachers and the author. The teachers have thus been able to shape objectives for the curriculum from their practice. The curriculum in this way has been generated from and monitored by its consumers. Its shaping has been an actual experience. This stands in stark contrast to mandatory imposition of goals on teachers.
When teachers decry the lack of curriculum available to them, are they seeking a set program with mandatory goals, or are they seeking opportunities of the type available in this project? The teachers involved here have examined curriculum competencies as Wise (1979) proposes. They have exercised and made judgements about curriculum content and objectives, about learning activities and environments and about teaching resources and procedures. These have not only illuminated the nature of the learners but have illustrated for us, as observers, the capabilities of the teachers.

"What are our objectives?"

In addition to central aims and broad goals, a comprehensive list of objectives relating to the broad aims was compiled. (See Appendix 6.) Compilation of this list was straightforward, and the teachers readily found agreement. However, when faced with the task of evaluation of objectives, there was no consensus, and the pathway from trial to discussion was by no means smooth.

"Evaluating our aims and objectives"

The Objectives Rating Schedule offered to teachers as a model for evaluation of objectives was given a mixed reception initially. Problems centred around familiarisation with the language of the descriptors which tagged three focal points along the five-point scale. The first round of collegial discussions on the Objectives Rating Schedule concentrated on the language used, and teachers were happy to alter this until it described typical children at varying stages of development. The results of this fine-tuning exercise culminated in the form found in Appendix 8.
"The Musicat checklist was very new ... I didn't find it all that easy"

At first teachers did not find the rating schedule easy to administer. This was predictable. Jenny's early report was: "I didn't find the Musicat Checklist all that easy ... I suppose because it was very new ... and I don't evaluate these individual things a great deal. ... Other ratings we do on children are so general. ... I have checklists I use all the time but they're general. ... This is so specific!" When later asked about the specificity again Jenny replied: "No, it's not a bother ... because I think it's good to do occasionally ... but I honestly wouldn't have time to do it that often." (Collegial Meeting 5, 13/9/91, Audiotape 5, Diary Entry p.196.)

Extract I - Evaluation Objective 1.

EVALUATION

SESSION 1 : CAT MUSIC

Objective 1 : To use body movement as a response.

Instruction : Colour in how far along the five-point scale each child is for Objective 1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHILD'S NAME</th>
<th>Rarely uses body movement spontaneously. Seems to have no ideas of own.</th>
<th>Uses body movement spontaneously. Extends and adapts ideas given to him/her but cannot self start. Springboards from ideas of others. Makes additional suggestions.</th>
<th>Spontaneously initiates body movements and ideas which are novel, expressive and varied</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Another teacher reported: "I wonder if I would do it ... I'm too pessimistic ... the problem is timing ... the children are only with us 10 hours per week ... I can remember when we had them at least 15 hours per week ... now that has been cut by one third ... there is just not enough time." (Debriefing Meeting 1, 18/10/91, Audiotape 6, Diary Entry p.224.)

The problem of time concerned another teacher. "We must be practical ... to me music is a big part of the program but I also like science to be a big part ... and I also want story-time to be a big part ... the problem is the time factor on our current sessional allotment." (Debriefing Meeting 1, 18/10/91, Audiotape 6, Diary Entry p.224.) Funding cuts have reduced teachers' session times. This has left teachers feeling frustrated. They feel that serious inroads upon their time have rendered programs too demanding. Adjusting the quality and scope of programs deemed as ideal presents them with real dilemmas. Which areas of the program can and/or should be reduced? Can innovations such as this music rating schedule be included as well?

"I can't wear two hats"

For Jenny the problem of time was related to the teacher wearing two hats. "I find the problem with evaluating is that there is not enough time to step back and observe ... being the person who teaches as well as observes ... what happens for the children is that the teacher can't be there and not be involved." (Debriefing Meeting 1, 18/10/91, Audiotape 6, Diary Entry p.226.) Asked how teachers managed other observations deemed necessary in their rôle, Jenny's colleague replied "with difficulty." Jenny recounted how she had attempted to solve this problem by using a pocket note book in which to jot down observations 'on the run'. She re-stated her conviction that organisation was the key to solving the problem but her colleague was
still sceptical: "even then you need two heads - two sets of eyes." One teacher had attempted to overcome this by enlisting the help of her assistant. "It is difficult to be totally aware of all children... there's always one child you do not notice ... I tried giving one objective to my assistant ... that was unsuccessful ... she just did not understand what I wanted ... she wanted me to explain all the time ... she just wasn't confident." (Collegial Meeting 2, 9/8/91, Audiotape 1, Diary Entry p.42.)

Experience in working with rating schedules in general will obviously govern teachers' willingness to adopt this system in the music program. The teacher who had expressed scepticism had taught at the Lady Gowrie demonstration centre earlier in her career. She recounted her past experience and familiarity with scales and rating schedules. "If you don't feel good about it you don't do it." It seemed that teachers would need to receive substantial in-service training on the implementation of checklists, organisational strategies and planning for observations before they could adopt a music checklist such as the one presented in this study.

The Objectives Rating Schedule proved to be the controversial issue of the study. Opinion was divided and remained so. All teachers found it difficult to manage. For some these difficulties did not override their willingness to come to terms with using it in its original form.

"I don't need such a specific checklist"

Two of the teachers remained unconvinced about the schedule's practicality. It was too specific. It demanded too much time and caused problems for the teacher who had to play the dual rôle of teacher and rater. "When you have 10 or 12 children in a group and are trying to assess these objectives it is very difficult to assess every single child fully enough to be able to put them into a category," said one. "It's OK for some isolated children ... they stand out ... but it's the children around the
middle ... it's impossible." ... "I've tried to use a notebook beside me while I was
teaching but I couldn't even manage that." "It's too unwieldy ... too hard ... too
specialised." ... "As generalist teachers we do not have enough time for such detail. ...
It's OK for specialist music teachers, but we have to teach all the program. It all
comes back to the 10 hours." ... "We cannot fit everything in ... we need extended
hours ... I have decided that I cannot be superwoman!" (Collegial Meeting 4, 6/9/91,
Audiotape 4, Diary Entries pp.122-124.)

These comments came after the first attempts at using the Objectives Rating
Schedule. The issue of specificity seemed overwhelming to these teachers. "When
we discuss goals we didn't have all these nitty gritty things listed down ... pitch ...
bright and dark sounds ... it gives us more information than we really need. ... I'm not
sure that I really need to know if Dylan knows these things right now ... what I want
to know is that I'm offering the opportunity for Dylan to be exposed to these things
and that in time he will learn them, but not necessarily in his kindergarten year." ...
"Bright and dark sounds ... I found that impossible to assess but I still consider it a
worthwhile objective ... something I would want to do." (Collegial Meeting 4, 6/9/91,
Audiotape 4, Diary Entry p.124.)
**Extract J - Evaluation: Session 4 - Bell Sounds - Objective 2.**

**EVALUATION**

**SESSION 4**: BROTHER JOHN - BELL SOUNDS

**Objective 2**: To discriminate between high/low (bright/dark) sounds

**Instruction**: Colour in how far along the five-point scale each child is for Objective 2.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHILD'S NAME</th>
<th>Seems not to notice and is unable to discriminate differences in pitch and tone colour.</th>
<th>Notices and can discriminate some differences in pitch and tone colour. May need guidance to attend to all details.</th>
<th>Discriminates differences in pitch and tone colour. Where appropriate notices sequence and a variety of detail.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

"As it becomes more familiar, it becomes easier to administer"

After the second attempt at administering the Objectives Rating Schedule this same teacher commented: "We could get used to this sort of system ... I've found this one easier to do ... because I knew what was coming." And despite her initial protestations, at the final debriefing meeting this teacher cited an example of how the specificity of the rating schedule would have assisted her. In the third term she had observed a non-singer in her group. She felt a sense of failure. "I've failed ... I should have found this out earlier ... I should have realised that he wasn't singing ...
and it's all too late now," she reported thinking. She then conceded: "If I'd had something like this [rating schedule] I'd probably have picked it up sooner and worked more logically towards it." (Debriefing Meeting 1, 18/10/91, Audiotape 6, Diary Entry p.225.)

Any one of the methods for keeping records graphically could be used to keep cumulative records, so that progress can be seen. For example, this non-singer's progress may have shown up on the Objectives Rating Schedule thus:

**Extract K - Evaluation : Bell Sounds - Session 4 - Objective 4.**

**EVALUATION**

**SESSION 4** : BROTHER JOHN - BELL SOUNDS  
**Objective 4** : To learn a folk song  
**Instruction** : Colour in how far along the five-point scale each child is for Objective 4.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHILD'S NAME</th>
<th>Seems unable to remember or reproduce songs taught. → Reluctant singer.</th>
<th>Attempts to imitate songs taught. → May have inaccuracies in pitch and rhythm.</th>
<th>Remembers and reproduces songs taught with reasonable pitch and accuracy. Learns songs quickly. Will sing solo in group situation.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. John</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The progress of John from Summer 1992 to Autumn 1992 may have shown on a cumulative record thus:

**Figure 3: Sample Cumulative Record**

Progress of John Summer to Autumn 1992.

- **Summer 1992**
- **Autumn 1992**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Progress</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Singing</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Listening</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moving</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Playing</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This teacher found it easier to administer the unfamiliar Objectives Rating Schedule second time around. This was to be expected. She also found it easier to relate to items on the schedule with which she was familiar. (Singing was much more part of her teaching repertoire than the area of pitch discrimination inherent in the bright/dark sounds exercise. Singing is within this teacher’s realm of expertise - developing pitch skills, however, leads the teacher into unfamiliar territory. For some teachers this would be totally unknown territory, and hence they would feel quite unprepared and ill-equipped to handle it.) The author realised that teaching a
new music program as well as filling in the rating schedule would present a substantial challenge. She wanted the teachers to find out what they could do. The labour involved in making records for every child in the group was not underestimated, but it may be more than compensated for by the information it gives, not only about each individual, but about the patterns of progress in the group as a whole. The problems of administering the schedule forced teachers to grapple with under-developed skills and led them now to face a dilemma. Did they value music and its central place in the curriculum highly enough to attempt to come to grips with solving the problems of setting objectives and appraising them? To do so would force them to improve the administration of this schedule. Conversely, should they retreat back to current practice? Interestingly, two of the teachers who had the strongest misgivings about the Objectives Rating Schedule commented: "There's a lot of just drifting along." "Too much ... which is why I wanted to be involved in something like this ... but I want something I think I am prepared to use next year. I want to be able to do better than I have been with music ... and to have a plan of where I'm going." (Debriefing Meeting 1, 18/10/91, Audiotape 6, Diary Entry p.227.)

Under normal conditions, free of the time constraints imposed by the study, solutions to the problems could perhaps include using the rating schedule on sample children from the group - eg. an above average child, an average child, a below average child. In addition, teachers might familiarise themselves with the rating schedule by using it initially for one child only.

The experiences of the teachers who found the specificity of the Objectives Rating Schedule problematic are valuable as anecdotal evidence, and should be documented. These form the basis of Wise's (1979) valued retrospective accounts. The way things happened, the teachers' reactions in this developmental project, the shifts in their thinking over time, and in the light of subsequent experience, all provide grist to the mill. These illuminations offer insights into how teachers respond and react to curriculum proposals which challenge their current teaching practices.
"It leads to much more insightful appraisal"

Jenny valued the rating schedule as an aid to documenting student response from the outset. It was just the tool she needed to present to one child's parents, supportive evidence for her observations of his 'in-a-dream' behaviours which were of concern to her. (Collegial Meeting 1, Diary Entry p.18.) Across other areas of the curriculum, this child's progress was satisfactory, but the items on the Objectives Rating Schedule highlighted different skills. On the ratings in the Catmusic session this boy was consistently at a less mature stage of development than others in the group.

**Figure 4 : Evaluation**

Jenny's Group Catmusic Session 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Body Movement Response</th>
<th>Linking Vocal Sound and Movement</th>
<th>Linking Instrumental Sound and Movement</th>
<th>Response through Movt., Vocal Sound and Instrumental Sound</th>
<th>Recognition of Musical Sequence</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Phoebe</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Victoria</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phillippa</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edward</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Astrid</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oliver</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sophie</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stephanie B</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stephanie K</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charlotte</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A summary of Jenny's evaluations for Session 1 (Catmusic) illustrates Oliver's progress profile. The patterns of progress are obvious. More important than the patterns are the exceptions: e.g. Oliver is a child who might be assumed to be less advanced in musical development than others of his age in this group.
Bob's impression of the Objectives Rating Schedule was that it was "worth adapting to ... worth coming to terms with ... I'm not saying it's impossible ... it wasn't easy ... perhaps it's my thinking that would have to change in making observations. I think if you knew your objective so well and you'd done this program more than once you'd know what you were looking for." Bob saw value in this schedule as a running and cumulative record.

"Specificity increases the schedule's value"

"It is oriented towards quite a lot of specific data and the sooner you do it [in the year] the better. It's a bit like P.M.P. [Perceptual Motor Program which incorporates a highly specific rating schedule for perceptual motor skills.] It's quite specific and useful for collecting comparative data." In his first meeting with colleagues after he used the Objectives Rating Schedule, Bob said: "It leads to much more insightful appraisal. This exercise so far has given me some extra insight ... since I've had a much more specific aim. It certainly modifies a general statement I would like to make about a child." (Collegial Meeting 1, 9/8/91, Audiotape 1, Diary Entry pp.42-44.)

Thus Bob and Jenny accepted the specificity of the Objectives Rating Schedule. To Bob this increased its value. "I can see the value of it ... if you're going to evaluate ... the more accurate the better. ... I find the more particular your comments are in the evaluating process, the more meaning they will have for you ... to have to do a detailed check leads to retained value ... so I think the direction suggested here is a good one." (Collegial Meeting 5, 13/9/91, Audiotape 5, Diary Entry p.196.)

In a later discussion Bob added: "The reason for evaluating is to get an accurate idea ... unless you're specific you can't comment. Without this specificity it's not as valuable an exercise to us as teachers."
"You can paint a better picture"

Bob could see the value from the perspective of professional communication. "If you want to talk to a parent or another teacher about a child and you can be more specific ... it brings you into a whole new way of being able to express yourself about that child." ... "It gives you a way of giving a very accurate picture." Jenny observed: "And I think that is something we are poor at doing ... I think it's because we are generalist teachers and there are so many areas to teach ... I think that's why it has occurred ... without doing special training after we've been out a few years ... people slip into a very general way of teaching." (Collegial Meeting 5, 13/9/91, Audiotape 5, Diary Entry p.203.)

Both Bob and Jenny perceived the value of more specific evaluative comments, supported by documentation in their communications with parents, other colleagues and professionals. They recognised that the time taken to record observations and document supportive evidence was time well spent, since it gave them a desirable edge to their professionalism. The ability to speak with more accuracy and with more depth, to lend credibility to a picture of a child which was clearer and based on wider knowledge, was deemed highly valuable.

"You can paint a better picture ... you can make a more comprehensive statement by endeavouring to be more specific ... and people listen to you. The whole communication process is something which as a result is opened up," said Bob. (Collegial Meeting 5, 13/9/91, Audiotape 5, Diary Entry p.204.)

In a second round of discussions the three teachers who were initially opposed to the rating schedule suggested streamlining it by reducing the rating to a three-point scale, which recorded the "non-participating child", the "participating child" and the "leading-participating child". The group was unable to reach consensus on this issue, as Jenny and Bob still sought to retain the five-point scale. However, these
subsequent discussions did reveal that all teachers acknowledged the need for a rating schedule per se.

"It did get easier to use the schedule the second time ... I suppose I would get used to it," said one. "I would use a checklist to support my overall view of the child ... to build up a full picture of the child," said another. Whilst the other teacher initially objecting to it sought to retain the full range of objectives on the schedule saying: "I don't think it hurts to be specific because it helps to clarify your thinking ... it gives teachers a framework to work within. I agree that it doesn't matter if George doesn't attain 'that' by the age of 4.6 years but I don't think it hurts to have a framework that reminds me of what I could be working on." (Debriefing Meeting 1, 18/10/91, Audiotape 6, Diary Entry pp.223-226.)

In the final assessment of its worth, teachers valued the rating schedule as a tool which could give useful leads and pointers for program direction, as well as information regarding specific children. They valued it as a document providing evidence for reports on children and lauded the language descriptors as valuable for inexperienced teachers seeking cues for recognising and assessing student response.

"Sometimes we know general things about children but not specific things"

The challenge for teachers to try the rating schedule has forced them to face three aspects of their competencies. These are: their classroom performance in using the schedules, their interactive thoughts and decisions during the trial, and their theories and beliefs about the rôle of evaluation. These all have been under heavy personal-professional scrutiny. The collegial meetings have aimed to allow guided discussions to raise teachers' levels of consciousness across all of the three aspects. This, Glatthorn (1987) holds to be crucial since it "puts cognition at the centre of professional dialogue". The responses of the teachers strongly indicated that these
discussions provided enough direction and coherence to make the meetings professionally productive.

Discussion around the desirable frequency of use of such a rating schedule also took place. Jenny commented: "Ideally it would be good to do earlier in the year to establish where children are at ... and then again around now [September] to see how far they’d come ... you’d have some sort of measure. ... If you don’t know where you’re starting from it's difficult to know if you’ve had any input in their [the children’s] development. It would be good to have enough time to work on the areas you’d missed. ... Sometimes you know general things about children but not specific things. ... I think if you did it once early on and then once again, that wouldn’t be too much; otherwise it would be too much, ... you just wouldn’t do it."

In justifying this stance Jenny added: "a lot of the first half of the year I find I’m teaching the children about behaviour and learning to be part of a group ... and dealing with the problems which come up. ... So I don’t get the chance to observe. In the second half of the year there’s much more opportunity for more quality time with individual children." (Collegial Meeting 5, 13/9/91, Audiotape 5, Diary Entries pp.197-198.)

Such comments lead us to ask how much time teachers are prepared to allocate to the music program’s evaluation. Is it a question of technical aspects getting in the way of broader aspects? Does their lack of technical expertise in the administration of checklists impede their willingness and ability to adopt comprehensive evaluation procedures?

The only highly specific checklists kindergarten teachers currently use appear to be those relating to physical skills. There was conjecture in group discussion as to the possible reasons for this. Physical skills are easier to observe - they are the ones for which norms are available. These two factors could well be inter-related. It was noted that there are no checklists for the arts, music, science areas of the kindergarten curriculum.
Does this suggest that the teacher knowledge which Shulman (1987) maintains comes from the source of formal educational scholarship, and which encompasses the area of normative aspects of curriculum and learners, is lacking in kindergarten teachers? Certainly as far as music education is concerned this may be true.

"Teachers need to view this as being professional"

The Musicat program provides a view of what constitutes acknowledged good music education, and these teachers have embraced it as a new vision. The behavioural descriptors of the Objectives Rating Schedule (Appendix 7) offer guides for identifying what a pre-schooler, given access to a comprehensive music program, might 'look like' at varying stages of development. Access to such influences should contribute to enriched images, giving images of what is possible. Without access to such images how can teachers' goals, visions and dreams be formed?

Where does this place teachers in the wider field of pre-school education? Are their images of what is possible for music education sufficiently enriched?

The teachers in this study related checklists directly to issues of readiness for school entry. Thus physical and social skills receive priority, "It doesn't matter if they can't sing in tune ... it does matter if they can feel at home," said one.

Jenny added: "Physical things are the ones required before children go to school ... if those things aren't established well before ... children can often slip through and not be given individual attention required to learn those skills ... it is much easier to do these things earlier e.g. grip for holding a pencil." (Debriefing Meeting 1, 18/10/91, Audiotape 6, Diary Entry p.227.) Many primary teachers may read Jenny's comment as a reflection on their vigilance.

Despite these priorities, teachers also expressed the desire for a tool such as the Objectives Rating Schedule, since it gave them the opportunity to communicate
information on an area of the aesthetic arts. To be able to speak about the creative, innovative child was considered important. Teachers acknowledged the value of piecing together a total picture of a child - musical skills, mathematical, language, gross and fine motor as well as social skills form part of this picture. "Some people would not want to collect such evidence," suggested one. "Checklists such as this music one would help us ... we know we've thought about the objectives and planned the activities ... but we don't do that in every area ... that's why we get a bit scared sometimes ... getting into more complicated things makes it harder for us," said another. This was greeted with the rejoinder: "You can't behave like that any more. Teachers need to view this as being professional ... being able to speak and having something to back up your professional opinion." (Debriefing Meeting 1, 18/10/91, Audiotape 6, Diary Entry pp.231-232.)

Does the experience with the music rating schedule expose lack of self-esteem? Is it easier to avoid an area for which one is ill-prepared.

"What I am doing ... what I want to be doing"

This experience has required teachers to consider their objectives and to come to terms with the problems of evaluating them. It has thus crystallised their thoughts and assisted them to identify with and within the group, the problems raised about evaluation, its rôle and its relationship to the aims of the music program.

In some areas these teachers feel their skills are lacking - other areas demand organisational changes. Their experiences with the music Objectives Rating Schedule characterises their dilemma. They want it - but it takes too much time! They feel unskilled - can they be reskilled?

Teachers these days are being asked to do what they have not been trained to do. Challenges to their self-perception force them, and us, to ask: "Can they commit themselves to a new professional direction?"
Chapter 5

If I Change What I am Doing Can I Expect any Support?

"The current state of music presents a variety of solutions in search of a problem, the problem being to find somebody left to listen."

Ned Rorem

"Music must be supported by the king and the princes, for the maintenance of the arts is their duty no less than the maintenance of the laws."

Martin Luther
If I Change What I am Doing Can I Expect any Support?

VIEWS OF CHANGE

"The most significant changes in teacher attitudes and beliefs come after they begin using new practice successfully and see changes in student learning ..." (Guskey, 1985, p.57).

The five teachers involved in this study have experienced varying degrees of success, and reveal five differing views of teacher attitude towards change. Across this spectrum of opinion, Bob and Jenny’s reactions can be seen to fall at different ends of the range.

One teacher commented: "Well, I could do what this program requires, but there’s not enough time ... I’m not superwoman. There is so much we know we can do ... but maybe we set ourselves too high a standard. More recently I’ve come to accept that there are only twenty-four hours in a day and I’m only one person." (Collegial Meeting 3, 16/8/91, Audiotape 2, Diary Entry p.68.)

Bob said: "It’s what I’d like to do but haven’t been able to do it very well. ... This is a reflection of how I haven’t been able to isolate myself enough from the general goings on in the room. Immediately after a session I feel quite fatalistic about it ... I’ve had a sense of failure a couple of times and I didn’t like that too much ... my self-esteem suffered ... my training [pre-service] was solid ... I haven’t done it justice, I know ... It’s [the Musicat program] a most valuable document to have - you wouldn’t throw it away." (Debriefing Meeting 2, 27/10/91, Audiotape 7, Diary Entry p.242.)

A third teacher explained: "I want something practical I can use. I want to be able to do better than I have with music ... and have a plan of where I’m going. I’d like in-service like this, to be an on-going thing - more like a course in music-teaching." (Debriefing Meeting 1, 18/10/91, Audiotape 6, Diary Entry p.227.)
The fourth teacher, also the youngest, said: "I did a music major, but my pre-service training did not equip me to teach music in the way I've been asked to for the Musicat program. The Musicat program made me do things I wouldn't do. I felt it was a stretching exercise." (Debriefing Meeting 2, 27/10/91, Audiotape 7, Diary Entry p.244.)

Jenny commented: "I feel it is important to have new programs available ... and you grow into things. I think I've grown in my interests ... a few years ago I did a lot of work on Science because I felt that was my weakness and I needed to pick that up. I did a few in-services and I've grown in confidence ... this would be the same. Each year I like to try to do something to stimulate me, because I think you need to keep working for yourself. This has given me a big professional challenge." (Collegial Meeting 5, 13/9/91, Audiotape 5, Diary Entry p.199.)

The views expressed by these five teachers ranging from the 'realist' not superwoman, through Bob's lacking-in-confidence yet willing-to-try to Jenny's self-assured positivism, may well offer us as observers valuable cameos of the change potential within the wider early childhood professional community. These five cameos portray varying teacher-types described in the literature regarding processes of curriculum change. Attitudes to change, levels of uptake and strategies employed to influence change are all dealt with. If promoters of the Musicat program sought to move this initial trial on towards the stage of what Owen et al (1988) identify as implementation, then a study of the relevant background literature would be essential.

"We're on our own"

Any optimistic impression of prospects for widespread change should be tempered by Jenny's generally pessimistic view: "How many kinder teachers that we know would even take regular music groups? ... a minority! ... They do from time to time but it's generally in the too hard basket."
Another teacher added: "I think a lot of people want an instant response, something you don’t have to put much effort into ... I think we’re being infected as a profession ... I feel fairly depressed about it." (Collegial Meeting 3, 16/8/91, Audiotape 2, Diary Entry p.67.)

This teacher then speculated: "If this [the Musicat] was a music kit or program I could buy or borrow and have some in-service on, then it would give me some incentive to go back and try new ideas."

"Many teachers, especially those unsure of themselves, would feel swamped by a lot of what is included in this program," pointed out one of the group.

The comment which reflects a realistic outlook may well be: "We’ve had to do it bit by bit ... and we’re all experienced and already into music." (Debriefing Meeting 1, 18/10/91, Audiotape 6, Diary Entry p.234.)

Such comments reflect the impoverished scene across the early childhood music landscape. Further studies may reveal that the question regarding music education which begs the early childhood professional’s attention is not "Are you prepared to teach this innovative music program?" but rather "Are you prepared to commit yourself to teaching any music program?"

Regardless, the five teachers in this study have given us an indication of what they are ready and willing to attempt to teach. The challenge they have faced professionally was extended further since, in agreeing to be part of this research, they were placed in a group in which they encountered other teachers’ capacities and experience. Encountering other sensibilities is part of the group staff self-study process.

This had both positive and negative connotations for individual teachers. "Hearing how other teachers do it ... pooling ideas was helpful ... applying several minds to the one problem assisted ... being able to see what we do more clearly and keeping your outlook broad" were all comments relating to this group process. (Debriefing Meeting 2, 27/10/91, Audiotape 7, Diary Entry p.246.)
There was a certain professional accountability expressed also: "It forces us as teachers to be more honest," reflected one teacher.

Bob expanded: "I suppose in this position if you are in any way less than honest there's no point in being here. You have a certain image of yourself - then here you are at the coal-face - it forces you to see how you really are performing. You can sometimes get such a woolly idea about how you actually are. To be forced to talk about yourself gives a more truthful assessment ... this way you can get somewhere. It helps your self-esteem, helps your program and it helps the children, because your attitudes change. It's a wholly professional exercise - a positive one. (Debriefing Meeting 2, 27/10/91, Audiotape 7, Diary Entry p.246.)

"Where do I go now - how do I make it work?"

Organise Adequate Preparation Time

Bob's view of himself is quite clear. He can express it succinctly: "I need to close the gap between reality and ideals. I found myself agreeing with the aims and purposes [of the Musicat program] but in some instances I wasn't able to set aside enough time for preparation and consequently didn't do the sessions justice as an investigator or as a teacher. I would need more time to prepare. I find when I prepare I reach a stage when it becomes a bit mechanical ... then it flows. I haven't got to that stage, yet, with this program." (Debriefing Meeting 2, 27/10/91, Audiotape 7, Diary Entry p.242.)

Readiness for change is bound up in the teacher's willingness to set priorities in programming which allow new skills, procedures and approaches to be tried in a climate which is neutral - free of any restrictive influences, such as time constraints. Only in this way can the teacher truly suspend judgement on the validity and the potential of the change or innovation, thus shaping a view of its effectiveness.

Replanning and reorganising existing program structures extended beyond the provision of adequate preparation time.
Offer Split-Group Music Times

Bob said: "This program has shown me how valuable a small group music time can be ... but the need to have an assistant to attend to the other children is essential, if it is to go ahead." This sentiment was shared by other teachers: "We need to organise ourselves and aim to teach in small groups ... in reality we don't always get the opportunity but we need to strive to do that." (Collegial Meeting 3, 16/8/91, Audiotape 2, Diary Entry p.67.)

Reorganise Teaching Space

Reorganisation of the teaching space becomes an issue: "This program needs establishment of a special teaching area ... it requires intimacy - a space free of interruptions - aside from the general workspace."

Adjust Rôle of Assistant

Adjustments extended to personnel also: "We need to train our assistant to accept new working conditions for this program. The teacher needs to work with small groups of children and the assistant needs to attend to the remaining children." (Debriefing Meeting 1, 18/10/91, Audiotape 6, Diary Entry p.226.)

Adjust Working Patterns

Flexibility to adjust working patterns which accommodate group splitting, reorganisation of the teaching space to allow space for a small group to work uninterrupted, and retraining assistant personnel are all required of the teacher seeking to embrace and effect changes brought by the Musicat program. In discussing these aspects all five teachers in the research group demonstrated a willingness to attain the required levels of flexibility for reorganisation.
Upgrade Musicality

Specific aspects of the German program caused the five teachers to confront issues regarding their skills and knowledge as music educators. "For some teachers, even using tuned as well as untuned percussion instruments, would require additional in-service" observed one.

"Using poetry with voice, movement and instrumental responses was very new to me" said Jenny. Many activities will lead teachers into areas previously unknown, untried and uncommon.

Predictions that unfamiliar program areas such as vocal play would discourage many teachers were expressed: "Many teachers and children are unused to vocalising freely ... the vocal play activities might put people off ... they will not persevere." (Collegial Meeting 3, 16/8/91, Audiotape 2, Diary Entry p.70.)

The use of voice in vocal play tests teachers. It offers new possibilities for musical exploration and new directions for musical development. Some teachers will not find this easy. It demands elements of risk-taking on the part of teachers as well as children. It is to be expected that some will venture forth while others will not. All need to be offered, at least, the opportunity to proceed.

Using Schedules and Checklists

The Objectives Rating Schedule above all else was considered warily - most especially by the younger teachers with less experience. "Teachers would need in-service on how to administer the rating-scale." "An in-service on how to observe children and plan for them in subsequent weeks is essential," typified their comments. However, confidence that this could be resolved was also amply evidenced: "With practice the checklist would get easier to use. Within two years it would be in our minds ... just like everything else we do in teaching. You find as you get on in teaching that things get easier ... you are aware of things you've missed before - you hold things in your head better, you notice things more."
One of the veteran teachers expressed her reaction thus: "I feel very much at home using scales and checklists. At the Gowrie we had to use them all the time."
(Discussion, 30/8/91, Diary Entry p.101.)

This teacher, who had previously worked at the Lady Gowrie, Melbourne, and who felt competent and skilled, was able to offer advice and support to colleagues of limited experience. Solidarity was increased as these people were brought together in the common task of deliberation upon the Objectives Rating Schedule. They have shared ideas about their work while being involved in the development of a useful educational product.

"What made this study work?"

Having Something to Talk About

"What I liked about this experience was having you here ... a music expert on hand. You always directed us in the right way ... that made the difference," said one teacher. (Debriefing Meeting 1, 18/10/91, Audiotape 6, Diary Entry p.234.)

Bob viewed this as "... a challenging experience and an enriching one as well as a learning one ... your [the author] comments have been very valuable." (Debriefing Meeting 2, 27/10/91, Audiotape 7, Diary Entry p.246.)

Jenny summed it up this way: "As an in-service activity this has been most valuable - because we've got something to talk about. We've all done it, then come together and discussed how we've done it - picked up clues from each other, as well as offered different interpretations." (Debriefing Meeting 1, 18/10/91, Audiotape 6, Diary Entry p.233.)

"This has helped me clarify my own ideas ... made me realise what I feel quite strongly about ... made me look quite carefully at my own goals for music. I have enjoyed, thoroughly, the opportunity to meet together with other kindergarten teachers and you [the author]. I have enjoyed the opportunity to extend my own
knowledge and thinking." (Debriefing Meeting 1, 18/10/91, Audiotape 6, Diary Entry p.233.)

There was unanimous agreement that the continuing support of colleagues and a consultant was a strong feature of this useful model for in-service training.

Working With a Consultant

The inside/outside consultant role played by the author further facilitated the group dialogue process. Bob's grappling with the needs of his active and aggressive boys in the music group (reported earlier) was the focus of much discussion. The author was able to share with Bob and the others, anecdotes of sessions in the 1989 Lady Gowrie trial with Maubach. She drew parallels and suggested helpful strategies. The author's familiarity with the kindergarten setting, her role as a music teacher in early childhood, and her previous experience with the German music program lent credibility to her insights and guidance. Bob's reports and the ensuing discussion spurred professional dialogue about cultural reflections in 'today's child', current teaching practice and developments in education. The discussion flowed from wider issues to centre around the changing needs of 'today's children,' and the meeting of these needs with responsive programs, and as a consequence a changing role of educators. These discussions illuminated what Glatthorn (1987) described as teachers' interactive thoughts and decisions - taken whilst teaching - and reflective of the teachers' theories and beliefs.

Taking Risks in a Group

Group participation, sharing of experiences and self-reflection carries with it, for teachers, a measure of professional and personal risk-taking. Bob observed: "There is a real fear of being exposed. There needs to be more professional openness. This is a glaring fault with kindergarten teachers ... always has been." (Debriefing Meeting 2, 27/10/91, Audiotape 7, Diary Entry p.247.)
Bob himself displayed a large measure of professional openness as well as personal courage in the discussion sessions. In confronting his fear of being exposed he undertook quite considerable risk. His trust in the group stemmed from his respect for his colleagues and the sensitivity and support they offered him.

Watching a Specialist Demonstrate

"A workshop to demonstrate techniques should be added to this in-service format," reflected Bob, "... maybe not at the outset ... but somewhere along the way ... when everyone’s trying to do it. This would boost the confidence of those feeling unconfident with music teaching. This would be essential." (Debriefing Meeting 2, 27/10/91, Audiotape 7, Diary Entry p.247.)

The consultant could build in a teaching-demonstration session. A number of possibilities could be considered, amongst them - a video lesson of an actual class. As a consequence, this in-service training model could authentically claim the shared-risk factor it purports, and make the partnership between consultant and participating teachers more equal.

Overcoming Isolation

Access to collegial support has proved to be invaluable in this project. All participants have commented on its worth.

The supportive element was most significant for the younger people who said: "If you don’t feel good about it you don’t do it. Teachers need to have the skills to do what is required. Young teachers become very disillusioned because becoming skilled does not happen overnight." "Professional isolation is a real problem for us ... we should share more of our own ideas and experiences on a regular basis." (Debriefing Meeting 2, 27/10/91, Audiotape 7, Diary Entry p.252.)

Whilst Bob sought and was offered much group support, his prime focus was on "the cross-fertilisation which is most valuable." Jenny’s thoughts echoed: "The
opportunity to extend my own knowledge and thinking was wonderful ... it was good to hear other people's thoughts. I found it helpful to start building my resources in the music program ... particularly the movement area, which I've never felt confident about." (Debriefing Meeting 1, 18/10/91, Audiotape 6, Diary Entry p.233.)

Change depends significantly upon teachers being "brought out of their environments and asked to share, exchange ideas and encouraged to support their colleagues with feelings about their work," wrote Fullan (1982). This group has experienced aspects of the Owen et al model. They have a very strong notion of how change can happen.

Their experience of group sharing was overwhelmingly positive. The idea of teacher groups or clusters strongly appealed to them, and they were eager to point out how such groups should be constituted.

"Support groups ... to enable teachers to get together with others sharing a similar interest - not groups based merely on geographical location - would be advantageous."

The most common previous experience of groups was that of the regional meetings. As a forum for professional support and worthwhile dialogue, such meetings were viewed with considerable reservation.

Jenny explained: "What we have experienced here, is quite different from teachers' meetings. There I have found some keen [teachers] others not ... and I have found it to be terribly draining on those who are keen to contribute ... some people were just giving all the time."

"There is no structure to talk to other teachers professionally," lamented another ... "quite the opposite ... I was used to that at the Gowrie but I miss it terribly. We set aside one Friday per term but these days it's just a nag session - just a chat session." (Collegial Meeting 3, 16/8/91, Audiotape 2, Diary Entry p.71.)

One factor contributing to this demise is the diminished rôle and in some cases the removal of the pre-school adviser. Previously the professional network was
interconnected by the pre-school advisers in regions. In many areas these advisers and indeed the networks no longer exist. This places many kindergarten teachers at risk of working in total isolation. Professional isolation was continuously raised as an issue of concern by teachers in this study. "I feel more isolated in my current region than when I taught in the country," said a teacher from an outer-suburban region. "There, allowance was made for professional contact time, in-services were regular, specialist teachers visited the region and travelled around to all the kinders, the preschool adviser visited regularly and there was a regional teachers' newsletter." (Debriefing Meeting 2, 27/10/91, Audiotape 7, Diary Entry p.252.)

In the city, it seems such contact is never assured. It is often spasmodic and fragmented, if it exists at all. Some teachers feel the professional isolation so strongly that they are moving closer to seriously considering kindergartens attached to schools as an option.

"We would get support and contact which is missing [from] but a must to kindergarten teachers' lives," asserted one. (Collegial Meeting 3, 16/8/91, Audiotape 2, Diary Entry p.72.) This reflects a shift in kindergarten teachers' thinking. In the past, the kindergarten year has been viewed within the profession as a separate educational entity. An island, situated midway between home and school. Kindergartens annexed to primary schools offer their teachers collegial support, plus access to a wider range of educational opinion and perspective. In the face of increasingly isolated and unsupported professional situations, this option is becoming more attractive.

For Jenny this was central to her decision to take up her new position in a double unit kindergarten attached to a school. "I feel in my new situation that I have a great deal of support and professional backup - as a kindergarten teacher, but also as part of the school staff. I see my place at the beginning of the educational tree." (Collegial Meeting 3, 16/8/91, Audiotape 2, Diary Entry p.72.)
Strategies which build up and replace teachers' professional networks would seem to be critical, not only to ensure the prospects of curriculum change and professional growth and development, but to shore up what appears to be a disintegrating profession.

"If I change what I am doing can I expect any more support?"

"I have a friend and every holiday we plan together ... we get ideas from each other ... we bounce ideas off one another ... we just can't wait to get together," enthused Jenny. (Collegial Meeting 3, 16/8/91, Audiotape 2, Diary Entry p.71.)

It is often left to individual's initiatives to seek out professional contacts. In-service, too, is increasingly left to individual initiatives. Certainly in the realm of music education this is the case.

The Victorian Orff-Schulwerk Association conducts monthly evening workshops which teachers can attend for music in-service. This organisation has also sent specialist musicians to conduct regional in-services in country areas over the past three years. The funding for this has come from the Commonwealth Government. Teachers are given time-release to attend. Attendance at country in-service workshops is high. This is in stark contrast to attendance at workshop days organised by the same association in Melbourne. Proportionally, the per capita acceptance of such an offering is much lower in the city. The significant difference may be that city workshops offered out-of-working hours are voluntary. There is no time release, no incentive, no financial support to do so.

Teachers such as Jenny seek out their own professional contacts and maintain them out-of-working hours. To attend in-services a teacher more often than not gives up preparation time. To participate in the author's study Jenny gave up preparation time to attend the collegial meetings.
"Because Friday afternoon is my only prep. time and I've been at meetings on Friday afternoons with this project, I've had to go in at weekends to do my prep. This has been a drawback, and I wouldn't want to do it again next year for that reason. I'd want to give myself a break ... because of the timing. It has been worthwhile but at a cost." (Debriefing Meeting 1, 18/10/91, Audiotape 6, Diary Entry p.233.)

For a highly committed teacher such as Jenny, there is no question as to whether the lack of preparation time in working hours means no preparation time at all. She willingly sacrifices her free time. This draws attention to a comment from another of the teachers: "Maybe committees should give days off over a period of time, to allow teachers to do a course. Music teaching needs to be learned by doing it." (Debriefing Meeting 1, 18/10/91, Audiotape 6, Diary Entry p.234.)

Unlike their counterparts in primary and secondary education, early childhood teachers cannot expect regular time release for their professional growth and development pursuits. There is no incentive for them to attain the higher status of exemplary teachers, such as the Accreditation System offers AST 1 teachers. Professional contact is becoming less available as professional networks pivoting around the pre-school adviser are breaking down. Professional guidelines for curriculum and continuing professional growth and development seem non-existent. Can the early childhood teacher expect any support, therefore, in his/her pursuit of curriculum and professional development?

The answer, sadly, is overwhelmingly - very little!
Chapter 6

Problems, Prospects and Policy for Early Childhood Music Education

"To be concerned about the kindergarten and its music is not a minor pedagogical matter but the very building of a nation."

Zoltan Kodaly

"Everyone can learn elementary music, and to whom it is alien, cannot be teachers of the young since essential qualifications are missing."

Carl Orff

"Music is not the natural means of expression for the Englishman to the same extent as it is for the Italian. He regards it as something higher than a vehicle of the emotions and passions and this explains why in England music remained in a subordinate position to drama."

Albert Einstein
Problems, Prospects and Policy for Early Childhood Music Education

MUSIC IN THE CULTURE

The author's study permits a situational analysis of early childhood music education in Victoria.

Early childhood music education is not in a strong position. Currently the landscape looks rugged - dotted with peaks of enthusiasm rising from vast plains of indifference and empty horizons. Many teachers, it seems, are struggling to teach music. The struggle stems from reluctance. This seems to be rooted in weakness in what Shulman terms pedagogical content knowledge in music teaching. The optimistic spirit and intellectual pessimism articulated by the committed teachers in this study may be realistically extended across the field of current practice and into the future. They raise serious questions about the scope, nature and quality of both pre-service and continuing education programs available in music to kindergarten teachers.

Feelings of inadequacy are perpetuated by meagre musical experiences throughout teachers' own education. Music in the Australian educational context has long been treated as a luxury item - an optional extra tacked onto education's main menu. When funds and resources are under threat, the music area of the curriculum is at risk of perishing. The cultural roots may be very deep.

Anglo-Saxon education and culture does not seem to embrace music at its core. Dvořák (cited in Fraser and Crofton, 1988) said: "The English do not love music. They respect it."

Many Australian teachers may be culturally and intellectually impoverished when it comes to meeting the demands of teaching music. However, it is increasingly recognised that Australia is no longer predominantly Anglo-Saxon, and the inclusion
of music from many cultures in public performances and workshops taps enriched musical knowledge and skill. This change is not yet mirrored in Australian education, which needs to put music formally onto the teaching agenda at all levels - at the level of schooling, at the level of teacher training, and at the level of teachers in practice. To achieve this the performing arts would need to appear on the political agenda.

In this regard Davey (1992) commented: "It is a national disgrace that Australia is one of the very few nations in the world which has no Ministries of Culture and no national institutions dedicated to its traditional cultures."

The fact that Germany has produced the comprehensive teaching program *Music and Dance for Children* used in this study indicates not only a social pressure but a practical expectation of its teachers. German-speaking cultures have moved to equip their teachers to teach this program. Governments may not need to invest much economically in the music curriculum in order to significantly advance the status of music education.

However, setting a government-sponsored curriculum is equivalent to producing a set program, which means that teachers will pay more attention to it provided they are able to find assistance to make it work.

It is admirable, and does give some ground for optimism that those in this study feel strongly committed to music. They have their hearts in the right place, but where does that take them in terms of quality of teaching? There is no support for them, so there can be no development in this area. Improvement, therefore, is purely a matter of individual initiative. Single sessions at annual regional conferences is as much as the majority currently experience as music in-service. Such practice can and will do nothing to alleviate the lack of music curriculum, or significantly raise the quality of teaching. The limitations of current practice must be exposed if the potential accomplishments of new practice are to be assessed. This process of exposure and assessment challenges transcendence. It is essential if music is to be put seriously onto the teaching agenda.
CURRICULUM FOR TEACHER EDUCATION

Parents and kindergarten teachers want a rich education for their children. One of the key elements in this is the quality of music education. Anyone who has written about purposes and aims for pre-school education places music as a central core.

Insight has come from this study through working with Jenny and Bob - both experienced teachers. Bob initially lacked confidence in his skills. He was supported by Jenny throughout. However, we need to ask if support is enough in such a situation. Here are people deeply committed to music education. Can they develop an adequate curriculum on their own, without the sort of in-service which was offered in this study?

At present kindergarten teachers are trying to be experts in all curriculum areas. Therefore quality of curriculum is very important. The potential for its future development is enormous. We need not only a program like the Musicat. We need whole generations of these programs, written and adapted locally in order to establish a tradition of teaching music well.

Australian governments do not necessarily have to adopt the translated Music and Dance for Children Curriculum, but they need to increase resources if they are to mandate music in early childhood education. There are many precedents for governments acting parsimoniously and pragmatically to adopt an overseas model, precisely to move skill levels forward. At other levels and in other areas of education, faced with cultural illiteracy, the solution has been to import a curricular package. It is a common strategy to get a program started. Evaluative research into these implementations offers stern warnings.

Critics say government curricular initiatives are often ignored by teachers, left at the classroom door or distorted beyond recognition in schools. As Fullan and Hargreaves (1991, p.13) point out: "However noble, sophisticated or enlightened
proposals for change and improvement might be, they come to nothing if teachers
don't adopt them in their own classrooms and if they don't translate them into
effective classroom practice."

However, it has also been argued that government initiatives in curriculum
give teachers something concrete to share. Such initiatives provide the only effective
vehicles for development of pedagogical skill in particular areas. They offer
relatively private and secure in-service where teacher needs can be recognised.

The picture of music education painted by the teachers in this study has
depressing structural elements: no published curriculum or other published
resources, inadequate training, no support structures, no funding. The situation is
disempowering, negative and cyclic. Bob and Jenny show that empowerment and
true professionalisation can only be achieved through the building of teacher
certainty, which is dependent upon the improvement of teachers' pedagogical
content knowledge. This professionalisation would involve:

(i) an awareness of standards - understanding of what is expected of competent
teachers world-wide.
(ii) access to resources for repertoire and skills.
(iii) an ability to represent the contents of music and dance and the general
curriculum, at whatever stage, to the parents.

ELEMENTS OF A POLICY FOR MUSIC EDUCATION

As Goodson and Ball (1984) show, any major system wide change of emphasis
in school curriculum would come with a public mandate, but public authority in the
curriculum has become dispersed and diffuse. The absence of public policy for music
education is in itself a major problem. Kindergarten teachers and music educators
could develop guidelines for action, and seek informal and formal endorsement from
policy makers in government.
The social histories of school subjects of Goodson (1992) suggest that successful campaigns are waged by cadres of teachers and their allies in the tertiary areas.

The challenge ahead for music education is indeed great. What is needed is a comprehensive package in which a music education policy, quality music programs, specialised training and certification, as well as appraisal and reward systems for teachers are all set in place. The elements of a comprehensive package could be listed thus:

1. A music education policy must be developed. This must produce a comprehensive mission statement which defines music as part of the work of all kindergarten teachers.

2. Substantive music programs must be developed. This can be achieved by recruiting gifted teachers into peer cadre groups (as described by Leatt and Schmuck, cited in Johnston, 1989) which include specialist music and curriculum experts. These lighthouse groups could develop and pilot program changes through action research in a manner similar to that modelled in this study.

3. Specialised training must be available not only for undergraduate teacher trainees, but also for teachers in the field who seek qualifications to teach specialised music programs. Co-operative efforts between tertiary institutions should ensure that provision of Arts with Music Major courses as well as continuing education in music are offered. Support for those teachers trained must come through membership of music teacher associations.

4. Certification, appraisal and reward systems must be introduced to hold the above three elements together. Teachers' knowledge must be assessed, accredited and rewarded.
DEVELOPING POLICY

How could a new music education policy be developed and what policy instruments could be used?

Two important steps must be taken. Both a strategic analysis of policy must be undertaken and a steering group must be established.

1. **A Strategic Analysis of Policy**

The key first step is to recognise that the normal situation for teachers is emotional as well as intellectual isolation. To develop a strategic policy, it would be necessary to target teachers' emotional and intellectual resources. The targeting procedure should determine a broad vision for music education and music educators. The criteria used must be related to overall objectives for professional growth and curriculum development, and not be subject to the desire to minimise long-term assistance.

A strategic analysis of policy must be multifaceted and sophisticated. It must lead to an array of incentives, implemented over the long-term. Such incentives must span pre-service, through novice to veteran teacher levels.

Strategic analysis could be summarised in three basic steps in time sequence:

(a) **Analysis of current practice**

This analysis should probe what and where music programs of worth are in place. It should reveal the scope and nature of the reluctance and apathy towards teaching music.

(b) **Determination of changes required**

This should include skill development, program expansion and enterprise structures needed to raise music curriculum and teacher awareness and competency to acceptable levels. Key curriculum and assessment reforms will require substantial investment in human resources, in time release, or volunteers in their own time or both.
A crucial step would be to seek volunteers - the teachers who will act as the agents-of-change. These teachers targeted for specialised initial assistance will lead any transformation that can occur.

From the existing incoherence and inertia a structure must emerge in which foci for teaching excellence and quality programming are created, strengthened and extended through the promotion of networks and affiliations with other existing groups such as music teachers groups. Advisers should be appointed to give long-term assistance.

(c) Consideration of how to assist change

What policy structures are needed, how they could be delivered and how their effects could be monitored are three questions which should be of profound interest to the employing authorities. Support for teachers in the form of time release, funding proposals and the creation of supportive infrastructure to drive curriculum developments all lie within the power and realm of the employing authorities.

If employing authorities were to apply such principles patiently and comprehensively, an influential and long-term approach to music education could be developed. The point is that such an approach will be believed if it works and work if it is believed.

Effective educational policy can never be a rarefied or eccentric view imposed from above.

2. Establishment of a Steering Group

Another key step is to establish a steering group. This ginger group should be charged with the responsibility of setting and overseeing the development of a lighthouse model of cadre groups. Three important aspects of this initiative are:

(a) The creation of cadre groups

These groups could be modelled on the group of teachers in this study. They would be expected to commit time and energy to trying program changes and
undergoing professional appraisal and assessment. Cadre groups in different locations should be interconnected by strategic human and structural networks. Specialists who could provide the kind of expertise offered by the consultant-author in this study, could fill the rôle of human linchpins. The creation and maintenance of supportive infrastructure to position these specialists, so that their knowledge can be transmitted, must be built into music education policy.

(b) Membership of cadre groups

Membership of the cadre groups should be by invitation. Teachers who have demonstrated high levels of interest and been identified as potential agents of change should be recruited.

(c) Authority of the steering group

The working party should be given authority. It should have the power to set up groups such as the one piloted in this study. Conversely, the working party itself must have an authoritative profile.

Membership of the steering group should include educationalists from the tertiary level, and experts in the field of music education, if it is to be given credibility. The expertise needed for a working party cannot come out of voluntary programs.

This is not a call for huge and risky public and professional outlays. It is a plea for greater discretion and sophistication and for an educational music policy that is in step with the changes afoot locally, and the aesthetic arts practices in other parts of the world.

The process of its development is crucial, given the importance of music and the aesthetic arts as an investment in the children of today and tomorrow. It is our children who can ensure our country’s cultural survival. It is time to take stock of kindergarten teaching. This study highlights several key policy issues. The first is specialisation.
KEY POLICY ISSUES - SPECIALISATION, PROFESSIONAL ASSOCIATION
AND CERTIFICATION

Specialisation may Spell Survival for Particular Kindergarten Teachers

If appraising teaching as practical pedagogical reasoning is to receive extensive support among the community of teachers, then they need to know more about the complex process of good teaching. In arguing for an active commitment by teachers to their own professional learning are we trying, in a sense, to suggest that all kindergarten teachers need to assess their knowledge and training as music teachers, and likewise as mathematics, language, science and art teachers? In secondary education in-depth knowledge in such areas is available through specialists.

Kindergarten teachers are not in a position to cry out and say that it is unrealistic to be competent in music, mathematics, language etc. To complain that they cannot cope is to be considered unprofessional. They are expected to be competent. Given the current industrial-political climate such calls for help could be perilous. Their survival-argument is based on offering high quality educational input, across all areas of the curriculum.

Jenny has taken opportunities to improve her levels of competence. She worked on her science program last year and her music program this year.

Bob has extended himself as a teacher to try to make the Musicat program work. Teachers are care givers - they will inevitably tend to give more and more to make programs work. One of the other teachers in this study has taken the area of music seriously. She has recently sought further formal training.

The issue of quality teaching and improvement of teachers' knowledge presents a major challenge. Do we maintain multifaceted generalist teachers or do we begin to establish specialists in particular areas? The multifaceted generalist teacher who by all reports in this study, struggles to maintain a music program, may well seek to survive by specialisation in music or in some other key area.
Does Specialisation mean Specialist Teachers?

In secondary education specialisation is built into the curriculum and timetable structure. In primary education specialisation can take the form of a specialist teacher on site, as is the case with art, music, physical education and language. Shared specialists between a cluster of schools provides a model of visiting teacher specialisation. Visiting music specialists could be viewed by some as the solution to early childhood music education's problems. However, such a scenario should be examined quite critically and carefully. What can be attained by a specialist teacher with a limited budget travelling from kindergarten to kindergarten? Such a weekly injection of music is not the best way it should be offered to young children. Writers on music and education generally argue that children need to be enculturated in music. Music needs to be part of the way they live and are nurtured. It needs to be an integral part of the educational environment in which children grow and develop. A kindergarten teacher who has been given the professional training, the resources and the structural support to provide and maintain a quality music program as a core of the curriculum offering is in the best position to provide a living musical environment for young children.

Would Specialisation mean Specialised Programs?

Teachers may need to provide higher profile specialised programs rather than watered down generalised ones when seeking roles in a new order of children's services provision. Their survival may well be inextricably linked with the credibility of their professional skills and program offerings in specialised areas of the curriculum. Provision and maintenance of high quality programs in specialty areas such as music, for example, may open doors into the future for them.

Music and the expressive arts in general are seen as central to personal development and psychological health in the early years of education. History
indicates that music has been used as a therapeutic tool in many cultures. Music is an external energy source which is powerful in affecting the internal rhythms of humans. The increasing use of music therapy in modern societies suggests a reawakening of consciousness regarding the use of sound and music as therapeutic tools. Many current specialist music programs both in educational and medical settings have been developed by music therapists.

These rôles for music challenge teachers to shake off their apathy and step out of and beyond the bondage of self-pity brought on by the current industrial unrest. Teachers will need to be proactive if they are to survive to build a new future for themselves in early childhood services.

Who will Teach the Specialised Programs?

There will be a proportion of teachers unsettled by the challenge of becoming a 'new professional'. Many will resent change because they may feel they cannot measure up to new expectations. All will need to develop a new self-image. This new persona will be shaped both individually and collectively by teachers' views of themselves-in-the-world, in the world of early childhood and in society at large. Thus current proposals for change will be as much tied in with emotional, intellectual and psychological factors as with curriculum.

Change is usually led by contemporaries. Contemporary teachers will develop new images of themselves and their programs. They are professionals who will shape early education's future. They are the ones who should be issued with the challenge of matching their own skills and programs with quality programs such as the Musicat. They are the agents of change. They are the teachers who should be recruited to teach specialist programs.

The second policy issue highlighted by the study is that of professional association, leadership and support.
CADRE GROUPS OF EXEMPLARY TEACHERS - SUPPORTING KINDERGARTENS OF THE FUTURE

In this study the stimulus came from the German music program around which was built a framework of action research in which an expert teacher was placed with a group of specially recruited teachers who could appraise their teacher knowledge, theory and practice against a 'model' which they could take on as a professional crutch. The approach was always considered to be more important than the implementation of this particular German music program.

If we observe the pathways taken by secondary and primary education over the years, we can see that courses of prescription can be misinterpreted by teachers who are left alone and do not understand. Furthermore, a packaged program which could be implemented and last for fifty years runs the risk of becoming dogmatic and pedantic. In the early 1970s the Australian Science Education Project was given a tiny one-off government grant (less than $20,000 nation wide) to implement major pedagogical reforms embedded in a curriculum package. It appeared to offer a solution, but more accurately resembled a flash of funds, albeit meagre, and, like lightning, never struck twice.

Despite these realities, it is also true that there are always some who do understand, who can hand on the torch of knowledge. These are likely to be the leaders in future years. We must equip and educate our leaders. The group in this study piloted an approach that could be developed into a lighthouse kindergarten of the future model. Each cadre group shows others the way to music education for young children. The groups would begin to build up theories and local program materials and resources which would become better and better with each generation. This approach would have many advantages over the implementation of an imported program. The future of music education in early childhood depends upon this sort of approach. The structures of the approach however could be equally applied across any area of curriculum enquiry.
FORMAL TEACHER EDUCATION

This proposal for cadre groups of teachers needs to be tied into a formal and continuing training model so that teachers can gain credentials. A system of approval needs to be set up, offering a music tagging for those who qualify as teachers of specialist programs. Those, identified as agents of change, would be the most likely candidates for specialist music tagging. In addition, specialists, qualified through an arts degree with a music major, would be suitable graduates to fill the rôle of human linchpins in the networks of cadre groups. Incentives for both appraisal for credentials and possession of music qualifications should be part of any arts-music policy which is established.

The solutions to music's current problems as set out in this thesis assume a government policy for music as a key strategy. A policy which would direct the way teachers work to develop a professional identity. It must be built into their school program, and must be formalised in terms of incentive arrangements and support structures. If such arrangements and structures were mandated, then perhaps a one year voluntary involvement in a cadre group framework could allow teachers to undergo professional appraisal, and lead to a certified specialist music tagging. Employing bodies seeking to appoint staff for kindergartens featuring specialised music programs, could advertise for specialists with music tags. In hard times, such as the present, when there is strong competition for jobs, such specialist tags could be viewed as desirable and could enhance job prospects. In better times, teachers would undoubtedly gain recompense for this status. A reward system would need to be built in to professional appraisal and accreditation.

The third policy issue in professionalisation of music education is teacher appraisal and certification.
CERTIFICATION, APPRAISAL AND REWARD

In order to understand the situation of music education, pedagogical knowledge was clearly the key. The author needed to capture teaching within an action frame to assess the quality of the teachers' knowledge. This frame needed not only to enable her to listen and record what teachers had to say but also to allow her (and them) to appraise the knowledge they have, need to have and would like to acquire. If this were possible, then, the author felt, they could be given a solid basis for adapting in order to develop their pedagogical knowledge.

The action research could lead to a scheme of professional appraisal such as that developed by Shulman (1987) from similar case study work, which codifies the processes by which exemplary teachers teach and reason. It would allow us to address the quality of teaching quite directly. Teachers must be able to explain why they do things in a certain way. This pedagogical reasoning would develop if they were given the opportunity to assess and test their ability to acquire professional knowledge which is grounded in purpose, content, method and strategy. The following scheme after Shulman (1987) codifies teachers' knowledge, and may provide a framework for research and development in the quality of music teaching. No order of priority is implied at this point amongst these pedagogical processes.

1. Understanding:

Teachers need to understand the purposes of music education. They must have a basic knowledge of musical ideas and relationships. They must understand concepts such as pitch, rhythm, tone quality, dynamics and structure if they are to develop in children the ability to perceive, respond, recognise, memorise and make judgements about music.

The teachers in this study showed limited understanding of the scope and nature of music programs available. They were unable to place their thinking and
practice within a local perspective which was characterised by any national or historic sense. Their world view of music curricula was unsophisticated.

Teachers reportedly reluctant to teach music, may have missed the general immersion in a music culture which is fundamental in laying the foundations for understandings of the purposes of music education. Such people may have little understanding of music’s place within the aesthetic arts, and may therefore lack appreciation of its relationship to other educational disciplines.

At present we can only safely assume that a four-year music-major graduate has the necessary credentials. The participants in this study found that skills they were expected to develop in their students were underdeveloped in themselves. The sensitivity to vocal-play activities and the self-consciousness in performance were examples of this.

Teachers felt inhibited when required to demonstrate vocal tone curves which would encourage children to explore the tonal qualities and pitch differences with their voices. The ability to produce oral slides and to model pitch matching were program pre-requisites.

Such understandings do not particularly distinguish a teacher from the laity. It is the interpretation of lay knowledge ... the pedagogical knowledge, involving the planning of schemes to impart this musical knowledge, which indicates quality teaching in this appraisal action frame.

2. Interpretation:

We can appraise a teacher’s repertoire of interpretation processes when we examine the overall plan and the set of strategies employed to present a lesson unit or course.

Our participants said they found it difficult to talk about aims, as they were unrehearsed in discussing aims for music education (likewise general education). This led the author to weigh up another aspect of teacher knowledge - which is
interpretation. Through interpretation, various processes admit the children’s interest to an understanding of teachers’ ideas. If kindergarten teachers are unaccustomed to discussing aims for music education and if, as they claim, they lack the confidence and support to set the music curriculum, then their interpretation of ideas which translate directly into teaching strategies, plans of approach, development of units, devising of lesson plans etc. would seem to be questionable.

3. Framing:

Framing is part of the interpretation of knowledge process. In their critical analysis of the instructional material in *Music and Dance for Children*, the teachers approved of its content coverage and purposes but questioned its sequencing. They wanted to adapt the material by re-sequencing some lessons so that the flow was more in line with their own understandings and purposes. This demonstration of framing of music in the whole program of kindergarten needs to be such a conscious process that teachers not only detect the program weakness, but can articulate it. For example: "That lesson was not very well framed. The unit sequence needs adjustment."

4. Portraying:

When Jenny devised examples and metaphors with the serene, mysterious ambience she created using flowers and candles on the mat after teaching the second session, "A Magic Instrument Forest," she demonstrated and drew analogies for the children which created the bridge for them to her understanding. She was able to portray to the children how music transports them into a world where creativity, excitement, reflection and inspiration play a rôle.

The catalyst for Jenny’s creative teaching was the children’s reactions of delight and fascination with the story of a magic instrument forest in Teaching Session 2. Jenny’s inspired portrayal with candles and camellias certainly equalled
the ignition of children's fantasies sparked by the magic instrument forest portrayal in the Musicat program. She used the candles and camellias on the mat to entice the children to join her magical mystery musical tour in the same way as the red wool graphically and symbolically threads its way through the Musicat program. At that stage she had taught two of the Musicat sessions. The ideas seeded by the Music and Dance for Children program in Jenny's receptive and fertile mind immediately flourished into teaching strategies.

However, not all teachers are Jenny. Her portrayal for the children was an isolated example. The other teachers repeatedly commented that the portrayal ideas presented in the Musicat program were unique and novel. Teachers were not used to generating such ideas within their own music programs.

5. Producing:

Producing an instructional method which will embody the portrayal is a further aspect of a teacher's pedagogical reasoning. Insight into this aspect was possible through the comments about difficulties teachers would find in working with the concepts of bright and dark sounds in Session 4. This session required the teachers to develop the children's understanding of pitch and tone colour using musical instruments. One of the participants lacked the instrumental resources for this session. It called for instruments which can give children an experience of tonal qualities across a pitch range from low to high (chime bars, suspended cymbals, various bells, tambours and woodblocks). To expect to teach a music program without such basic instruments is like expecting to teach an art program without paints in primary colours. For teachers and those employing bodies who appraise teachers and programs this revelation should cause alarm bells to ring. In such instances the expectations for teaching music are clearly absent. Many other teachers, it was reported, would have no skills or confidence in using musical instruments with the children. Considering these reports, the author was left with
little confidence that kindergarten teachers in general would have any expansive repertoire of instructional method from which to select one appropriate strategy to teach pitch and tone colour.

Teachers need to be aware of how large a gap in their knowledge such a lack of appropriate strategy represents. Pitch and tone colour are basic concepts in music education at this level. The inability to produce a strategy to teach them should cause teachers grave concern and should trigger firm resolve to examine this problem.

6. Staging:

When it came to staging - the process whereby teachers apply their knowledge of the learners’ age, ethnicity, gender, language and prior knowledge, all of which can influence the response to the portrayal and the instructional method, these kindergarten teachers were on secure ground. They exhibited confidence in their knowledge and depth of understanding of the young children with whom they work. The author felt quite confident that they were well trained and highly skilled when it came to preparing teaching materials, ideas, schemes and strategies for different audiences. This area of their pedagogical knowledge was highly developed.

7. Instruction:

Bob’s difficulties in teaching the Musicat program, he believed, stemmed from his lack of organisation. His rationalisation of practical-organisational skills is not the full answer to the problem. The practical skills of organising the kindergarten environment to accommodate teaching the Musicat program certainly form part, but only part, of a teacher’s knowledge and understanding. Organisational skills belong to the area of knowledge which encompasses acts of management, acts of explanation and discussion - all of which demonstrate a teacher’s skills of instruction.
Observation of how a teacher performs on the day provides the opportunity to appraise instructional skills.

If Bob does not have the necessary organisational skills to teach the Musicat program effectively, others will not have them. Younger people, with few years of experience, for instance, will be hampered like him. This gives a feel for the prospects of music education. Regardless of whether music education is seen as central to kindergarten education (as it is in Germany) the quality of the professional, in Australia, could be seen as in Bob’s case, to depend on the organisational skills of the teacher.

However, over the duration of the study Bob’s realisation of this weakness in his teaching led to his seeking of advice from Jenny and of the consultant-author. Bob was confronting fundamental issues of handling complex routines. This was evidence that his pedagogical reasoning was developing. His preparedness to actively commit himself to improve his professional practice was also demonstrated. After the conclusion of the study he enrolled in an in-service workshop on organisational and management skills.

8. Evaluation:

Evaluation is another process of pedagogical reasoning which can allow an understanding of the quality of teaching. This process involves the checking for understanding and misunderstanding. It is employed by a teacher during instruction as well as during more formal appraisal such as the Rating Schedule used in this study. The evaluation process calls upon all of the forms of pedagogical content knowledge previously mentioned. In this study, administration of the Rating Schedule Checklist was a problem for the teachers. They were unused to the specificity which featured in the schedule. While they valued the feedback on individual children and the group program within the music context, they found that
they struggled with the close detail of the Rating Schedule and the organisational demands for its administration.

However, they also found that with practice, guidance and close monitoring by the consultant, their skills and confidence in using the Rating Schedule Checklist improved. Teachers need to face the process of evaluation and ask themselves: "Can I plan and reason out how and what effective evaluation procedures I can use in the music program?" At present there are no formal evaluation processes, and informal processes are ad hoc and unsystematic.

9. Reflection:

Exposure of the problems in appraising the music program came with the opportunities for reflection offered in this study. The teachers were able to share stories of their experiences with their colleagues and the author. This reflection led to the exposure and appraisal which challenged them to transcend their current practice and understanding of assessment in the music area of the curriculum. The retrospective accounts of teachers’ stories, a feature of this thesis, is an important element in this model of professional practice.

The collegial meetings which could be considered as workshops, modelled the reflection process. The ability to reflect, a process of action research, has been shown to be more demanding for some than for others. The teachers improved their ability to reflect. They also developed a capacity to reflect about things which they would not have considered in the first session. This demonstrated skill development. Their reflections became more extensive. They were able to relate their difficulties to areas of technical appraisal, as illustrated in their experiences with the Rating Schedule Checklist. Reflection involves detecting weaknesses as well as feeling good. Self-appraisal involves not only teachers sharing and openness, but an ability to look consciously at strengths and weaknesses. It is also about planning and organising where to go next.
10. **New Understandings:**

Through acts of teaching and reflection, these teachers were able to achieve new understandings of the areas of their pedagogical reasoning. For them this should provide a new beginning.

There is no substitute for teacher knowledge and understanding. Substantial public investment is needed to develop kindergarten teachers' pedagogical knowledge in music teaching. The informal structures for music in-service available to teachers until now have not led to any great improvement in music education. Many are still in the dark. Programs struggle to exist. Teachers in this study have used the German *Musik und Tanz für Kinder* materials alongside the action frame for appraisal of their knowledge and understanding. This staff self-study exercise has led them to see their strengths and weaknesses. These key elements should be the elements which any comprehensive pre-service or continuing education in-service would need to embrace.

In the institutionalisation of music we need to move beyond the level of personal interest which led teachers to this study, but we must attend to their voice. We need to move to the level of policy to ensure that music is core in the pre-school curriculum, and that substantial programs are adopted or developed. However, we must ensure that adequate provision is made to develop teachers' practical reasoning and judgement so that they may offer informed and principled critiques of policy.

As Richard Kurin (1992) recently remarked: "Culture is now centre stage of political debate." Culture is that which we share ... that which unites us.

At a political level it is now widely understood that the arts and cultural policy generally are not only for the elite. They are the social cement in a potentially divisive period in early childhood education. Levels of funding for projects in the arts have been maintained and even increased despite the current recession. This is a testament to both continued pressure as well as progressive enlightenment.
FINAL REMARKS

In launching new initiatives for dance, Melbourne Chairperson of the Greenmill Dance Project for 1993, Shirley McKechnie wrote: "Discussion and lively debate are essential to the vitality of any art form. Without it we are in danger of not even knowing that there are any questions, let alone what those questions might be."

The Minister for the Arts, Haddon Storey added: "Melbourne, as a result of its considerable dance talent and resources, is proud to host this new focus of dance in Australia. The Greenmill Dance Project, an initiative of the Australian dance community, will help to reinforce Melbourne’s profile as a national and potentially international centre for dance. The Victorian Government is strongly supportive of the future development of this art form." The music community can learn much from the initiative seized by the dance community.

Culture should be very much part of the fabric of everyone’s lives. It should involve enormous participation. It should be lived through our country’s citizens and their pursuits, and through our educational policies and practices, thereby ensuring its survival in the future. Only when the arts and culture come to touch everyone will we be set upon the pathway towards fulfilment.

Music should echo not only in the concert halls of our land, but through the halls of learning and the training institutions. It should resound in the personal and professional lives of our teachers and ring out in the lives of our children.

Music can and should be an integral part of the way all people live. It is at the heart of our cultural activities, but is it at the heart of our educational policies and practices? Sadly it seems the answer is "No!"

Without music as an integral part of our children’s lives our cultural future is in jeopardy.
Policy-makers, educators, parents and citizens must all take heed. We must work to reverse this situation lest our children be deprived of the vital opportunities afforded by music to define their feelings and emotions, and lest they lose the chance to discover the rhythm and harmony of life - a discovery which helps them tap into the secret places of their souls.
References


Appendices

Appendix 1: Musik und Tanz für Kinder
                       Teaching Script (Translated)
                        Session 1: Cat Music

Appendix 2: Music and Dance for Children
                         Program Trial - Meetings Schedule

Appendix 3: Music and Dance for Children
                           Program Trial - Objectives Evaluation

Appendix 4: Letter to Teachers in Program Trial

Appendix 5: Music and Dance for Children
                       Program Trial
                        Example - Objectives Rating Schedules
                                (a) and (b)

Appendix 6: Objectives of the Music Program.
              Compiled by the five teachers and
               author consultant in this Study

Appendix 7: Music and Dance for Children
                        Amended Objectives Evaluation
APPENDIX 1: MUSIK UND TANZ FÜR KINDER

TEACHING SCRIPT

SESSION 1: CAT MUSIC

Goal: To develop perception of movement.
Objectives:
1. To use body movement as a response.
2. To link vocal sounds to movement.
3. To link instrumental sounds to movement.
4. To respond to a poem through movement, vocal sounds, instrumental sounds - in any combination.

Resources Needed

Red Wool (thick)
Bright sounding instruments eg. glockenspiel, xylos, bells
Dark sounding instruments eg. drums, tambours
Tape Recording TM 3 'Cat Music'.
Tape Recorder.

Prep: Lay out the red wool as a pathway into the teaching space.
The pathway ends in a large circle.

Activity 1: "Let's be Artists .... the wool is a tight rope".
Teacher and children follow the pathway, walking round the circle before sitting around the circle to begin the session.
Teacher becomes the first artist. She/he shows how a tight rope walker may walk on the red wool without losing balance.
Possibilities might include:
walking, forwards, backwards, skipping, hopping along it, balancing on one foot.
Then also try:
movements over as well as along the wool,
lifting the wool with hands, fingers, foot etc
walking alongside it in many ways.

* All games need clear and animated expressions from the teacher.
The children will benefit from decisive imaginative actions from the teacher.
When the children have understood the task they are invited to develop their own activities with the wool.
Activity 2: "Name Games for Vocal Play".

Children and Teacher sitting around the circle of red wool.

(a) Teacher says her/his name whilst lifting the wool off the floor carefully.

(b) One child is invited to lift up the wool and say his name. Others are invited to repeat the child’s name aloud as they lift up the wool.

(c) Teacher invites children to create other voice sounds to accompany the lifting movements. This needs to be done carefully and sensitively. It is important not to overtax the child’s ability and also to draw upon the creative ideas which children offer naturally.

(d) Voice "tone curves" can be made by manipulating the sounds of the children’s names. The lifting of the wool can match the curve moving up and down from high to low pitched voices.

Activity 3: "Bright Sounds and Dark Sounds".

Teacher introduces two contrasted sounding instruments eg. Glockenspiel, Xylophone, bells - brightly sounding
Drums, tambour - dark sounding.
When the brightly sounding instruments are played the children move, (dance etc.) inside the circle. When the dark sounds can be heard, the children move, dance outside the circle. The teacher needs to ensure that instruments are referred to by their names and tone colour. Individual children are invited to play the instruments for the group response. Exploration of sound possibilities on several instruments should be encouraged.

Activity 4: "Playing Cats" - in movement and with vocal sounds.

NOTE: This activity can be used to assist scoring Objective 1.

(a) The children are invited to -
first one, then a few, then all - move as cats do.
Possibilities might include:
- fast walking on all fours
- creeping
- upright like Puss-in-Boots
- showing the claws - then hiding them
- jumping then stopping suddenly
- waiting very still, patiently, for a mouse to come.

(b) "Cats love to sleep ... they roll themselves into a lump, put their heads onto their front paws and breathe calmly." The language is used to elicit vocal sounds of cats. Other word pictures may be used to explore additional cat sounds eg. meowing, cat wailing, cat hissing/spitting.
Activity 5:  A Cat Poem

"Who's that?"
Just the cat!
Sneaking, purring, creeping
Then a jump!
She curls in a lump
Miaouuuuuuu

Christoph Maubach

The teacher gives a strongly animated recitation of the poem including some gestural movements.

eg. One hand behind ear - 1st line
    Showing of cat's claws - 2nd line
    Hand gestures for sneaking and creeping - 3rd line
    Loud hand clap - 4th line
    Curling arm and tucking in head - 5th line
    Miaouuuuuuu - 6th line.

The teacher stimulus aims to give children some ideas for movement. Children are asked to create vocal sounds, movement responses and instrumental accompaniment to illustrate and enrich this poem.

Activity 6:  Cat Music

Teacher and children listen to the beginning of Tape TM3. The teacher interrupts the tape after a short while and briefly explains: "A composer is a person who writes music. When he wrote this cat music he thought of some things which cats might be doing".

eg. - 2 cats may get together and play
    - suddenly they hear a dog barking
    - they run away and accidentally push over a broom
    - slowly they meet again and start a happy cat's dance.

Children may recognize the characteristic changes in the music. Children are invited to respond to the music through movement and dance to illustrate the changing moods of the music.
### APPENDIX 2: MUSIC AND DANCE FOR CHILDREN

#### PROGRAM TRIAL

#### MEETINGS SCHEDULE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DATE</th>
<th>TYPE</th>
<th>TIME</th>
<th>TCHR 1</th>
<th>TCHR 2</th>
<th>TCHR 3</th>
<th>TCHR 4</th>
<th>TCHR 5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>26-7-91</td>
<td>BRIEFING</td>
<td>2.30</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2-8-91</td>
<td>COLLEGIAL</td>
<td>1.30</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9-8-91</td>
<td>COLLEGIAL</td>
<td>2.30</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16-8-91</td>
<td>COLLEGIAL</td>
<td>1.30</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23-8-91</td>
<td>BRIEFING</td>
<td>2.30</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30-8-91</td>
<td>COLLEGIAL</td>
<td>1.30</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-9-91</td>
<td>COLLEGIAL</td>
<td>2.30</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13-9-91</td>
<td>COLLEGIAL</td>
<td>1.30</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TERM 4</td>
<td>DE-BRIEFING</td>
<td>2.30</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX 3: MUSIC AND DANCE FOR CHILDREN
PROGRAM TRIAL
OBJECTIVES EVALUATION
SESSION 1: CAT MUSIC

Objective 1: To use body movement as a response

| Rarely uses body movement spontaneously. Seems to have no ideas of own. Wants to be told what to do. Imitates others when encouraged to participate. |
| Uses body movement spontaneously. Extends, adapts ideas given to him/her but cannot self-start. Springboards from ideas of others. Makes additional suggestions. |
| Spontaneously initiates body movements and ideas which are novel, expressive and varied. |

Objective 2: To link vocal sounds to movement

| Rarely uses vocal sound and movements as a response. May/may not offer vocal or instrumental sounds as a link to movement. |
| Uses vocal sound linked with movement in a spontaneous way. Responses somewhat limited. Cannot self-start. Accepts ideas offered by others, extends and adapts these...makes new suggestions. |
| Spontaneously initiates vocal sounds to accompany movements. Generates new ideas which are novel, expressive and varied. |
### Objective 3: To link instrumental sounds to movement

| Rarely uses instrumental sound and movement as a response. May/may not offer instrumental sounds as a link to movement. | Uses instrumental sound linked with movement in a spontaneous way. Responses somewhat limited. Cannot self-start. Accepts ideas offered by others, extends and adapts these...makes new suggestions. | Spontaneously initiates instrumental sounds to accompany movements. Generates new ideas which are novel, expressive and varied. |

### Objective 4: To respond to a poem through movement, vocal sounds, instrumental sounds in any combination

| Rarely uses body movement/vocal/instrumental sounds as a response. May/may not offer a response. | Relies on others to initiate changes in movement/vocal/instrumental response to reflect changes in poem. Follows others, adapts ideas given. Can make additional suggestions. | Spontaneously offers movement/vocal/instrumental sounds as a response reflecting mood and tempo changes in poem. Leads to change. Adjusts response using novel, expressive and varied ideas. |

### Objective 5: To recognise a particular musical sequence

| Rarely gives any indication of noticing the new or unusual aspect unless it is pointed out. | Shows that he/she notices some of the new/unusual aspects but, misses details which can be observed. | Notices particular sequence in music and a variety of its details with reasonable accuracy. |

**NOTE:** Collegial Discussions will amend, delete or add descriptors and/or new objectives as the group deems appropriate.
Dear

I trust the holidays have given you a well-earned break. I have spent some time on our work to date and am most excited at the prospects of a strong and worthwhile contribution to the fields of music and early childhood education as a result. Your consistent efforts over Term 3, have produced most fruitful discussions.

Please find enclosed some summaries [Sections A, B, C and D] and some questions which are a culmination of our work to date and which form the basis for our final meeting — scheduled for 1.30 pm Friday 18th October. I certainly appreciate any time you can spend on these summaries and questions before our next meeting. I am convinced that we will be able to come up with a statement of broad aims, a set of accompanying objectives and a means of appraising them on a Checklist-Rating Schedule.

This is an invaluable contribution to the field and our fellow teachers. It will represent our best thinking about the aims of pre-school music.

I look forward to seeing you on the 18th.

Yours sincerely,

Lauris Hing.

P.S. Please don’t hesitate to phone me if you need to discuss any of this further.
APPENDIX 5: MUSIC AND DANCE FOR CHILDREN

PROGRAM TRIAL

EVALUATION EXAMPLE (a) OBJECTIVES

RATING SCHEDULE

---

**EVALUATION**

**SESSION 1**: CAT MUSIC

Objective 1: To use body movement as a response.

Instruction: Colour in how far along the five-point scale each child is for Objective 1.

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHILD'S NAME</th>
<th>Rarely uses body movement spontaneously. Seeks to have no ideas of own. Wants to be told what to do. Imitates others when encouraged to participate.</th>
<th>Uses body movement spontaneously. Extends and adapts ideas given to him/her but cannot self start. Springboards from ideas of others. Makes additional suggestions.</th>
<th>Spontaneously initiates body movements and ideas which are novel, expressive and varied</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX 5: MUSIC AND DANCE FOR CHILDREN
PROGRAM TRIAL
EVALUATION EXAMPLE (b) OBJECTIVES
RATING SCHEDULE

EVALUATION

SESSION 4 : BROTHER JOHN - BELL SOUNDS

Objective 1 : To listen to and describe various bell sounds.

Instruction : Colour in how far along the five-point scale each child is for Objective 1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHILD'S NAME</th>
<th>Attention to sound is fleeting. Makes little attempt to interpret or describe what s/he hears.</th>
<th>Attends to sound and interprets it. Notices some details. Attempts to contribute to group discussion. Adds to ideas and suggestions given by others.</th>
<th>Listens attentively. Notices a variety of detail. Explains relevant features. Makes important connections. Spontaneously forms impressions and generates ideas.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX 6: OBJECTIVES OF THE MUSIC PROGRAM

COMPILED BY THE FIVE TEACHERS AND AUTHOR CONSULTANT IN THIS STUDY

Expressed under 4 BROAD AIMS for teachers with Objectives for children ranked in order of priority.

BROAD AIM 1:00: To develop children’s interests and skills in singing.

OBJECTIVES FOR CHILDREN:

1:01 To sing a variety of songs with reasonable pitch and rhythmic accuracy.
1:02 To recognise and recall a variety of known songs.
1:03 To develop the singing voice through vocal play, chants, spoken rhymes, poetry and song.
1:04 To develop modulations of volume, tempo and pitch in the singing voice.
1:05 To learn some simple singing games.

BROAD AIM 2:00: To provide musical activities which develop movement and co-ordination skills.

OBJECTIVES FOR CHILDREN:

2:01 To use body movement as a response to music.
2:02 To experience the pulse beat in music and respond to it with body movements.
2:03 To use body movements and music to express feelings and create ideas.
2:04 To link movement to instrumental and vocal sounds.
2:05 To use body movements, instrumental and vocal sounds as a response to music, poems and stories.
2:06 To express volume, tempo and pitch via movement.
2:07 To express basic rhythms via movement.
2:08 To learn some simple folk dances from various cultures of the world.
BROAD AIM 3:00 : To develop children's interests and skills in playing musical instruments.

OBJECTIVES FOR CHILDREN :

3:01 To experience and play a variety of untuned and tuned percussion instruments.
3:02 To respond and play both rhythmically and a-rhythmically.
3:03 To develop modulations of volume, tempo and pitch in playing.
3:04 To know by name and description various untuned and tuned percussion instruments.
3:05 To use instrumental sounds to express and accompany speech rhymes, chants and songs.
3:06 To use instrumental sounds to express feelings and create ideas.
3:07 To know by sight, sound and mode of playing a variety of musical instruments.
3:08 To experience making simple musical instruments.

BROAD AIM 4:00 : To provide musical activities which develop aural perception, building skills of listening and of concentration.

OBJECTIVES FOR CHILDREN :

4:01 To display reasonable attentiveness during listening activities.
4:02 To listen to a variety of musical sounds.
4:03 To discriminate changes of volume, tempo and pitch.
4:04 To discriminate basic rhythms.
4:05 To discriminate well known songs when hummed, lailed or played on a tuned instrument.
4:06 To discriminate the sounds of basic untuned and tuned percussion instruments.
4:07 To discriminate particular musical sequences.
APPENDIX 7: MUSIC AND DANCE FOR CHILDREN
PROGRAM TRIAL
OBJECTIVES EVALUATION - AMENDED
SESSION 1: CAT MUSIC

Objective 1: To use body movement as a response

| Rarely uses body movement spontaneously. | Uses body movement. | Spontaneously uses ideas which are novel, expressive and varied. |
| Seeks to have no ideas of own. Shy to participate. Lacks confidence to be spontaneous. Does not self-start. | Imitates and springboards from ideas of others. Makes additional suggestions. | |

Objective 2: To link vocal sounds to movement

| |
| | | |
Objective 3:  To link instrumental sounds to movement


Objective 4:  To respond to a poem through movement, vocal sounds, instrumental sounds in any combination


Objective 5:  To recognise a particular musical sequence

| Rarely gives any indication of noticing the new or unusual aspect unless it is pointed out. | Shows that he/she notices some of the new/unusual aspects but, misses details which can be observed. | Notices particular sequence in music and a variety of its details with reasonable accuracy. |
Author/s:
Hing, L. E.

Title:
Insights from teacher talk at an in-service program on the kindergarten music curriculum

Date:
1993

Citation:

Publication Status:
Unpublished

Persistent Link:
http://hdl.handle.net/11343/39528

File Description:
Insights from teacher talk at an in-service program on the kindergarten music curriculum

Terms and Conditions:
Terms and Conditions: Copyright in works deposited in Minerva Access is retained by the copyright owner. The work may not be altered without permission from the copyright owner. Readers may only download, print and save electronic copies of whole works for their own personal non-commercial use. Any use that exceeds these limits requires permission from the copyright owner. Attribution is essential when quoting or paraphrasing from these works.