1	
2	PROF. MICHAEL-SHAWN SHAWN FLETCHER (Orcid ID : 0000-0002-1854-5629)
3	DR. TEGAN LEE HALL (Orcid ID : 0000-0002-2072-241X)
4	
5	
6	Article type : Research Paper
7	$\overline{\mathbf{O}}$
8	
9	Corresponding author mail id : michael.fletcher@unimelb.edu.au
10	
11	Title: Centennial and millennial-scale dynamics in Araucaria-Nothofagus forests in the
12	southern Andes
13	Running title: Conifer-beech forest response to ashfall
14	
15	Dickson, Bianca ¹
16	Fletcher, Michael-Shawn ^{1,2*}
17	Hall, Tegan. L. ¹
18	Moreno, Patricio. I. ³
19	
20	¹ School of Geography, University of Melbourne, 221 Bouverie Street, Carlton, Victoria, 3053
21	² Indigenous Knowledge Institute, University of Melbourne, Parkville, Victoria, 3010
22	³ Department of Ecological Sciences, University of Chile, Las Palmeras 3425, Ñuñoa,
23	Santiago, Chile.

This is the author manuscript accepted for publication and has undergone full peer review but has not been through the copyediting, typesetting, pagination and proofreading process, which may lead to differences between this version and the <u>Version of Record</u>. Please cite this article as <u>doi: 10.1111/JBI.14017</u>

25 *Corresponding author: Michael-Shawn Fletcher

26

27 Acknowledgements

M.S.F. was funded by Fondecyt 3110180 and the Institute of Ecology and Biodiversity,
Chile, and P.I.M by Fondecyt 1191435, and the Millennium Science Initiative of the Ministry
of Economy, Development and Tourism, grant Núcleo Paleoclima. Our appreciation goes to
Oscar Pesce, William Henríquez, and Lucía Gonzalorena for help in the field.

32

Aim: To assess the relative roles of long-term (millennial-scale) climatic change, fire, and
volcanic disturbance on the dynamics of *Araucaria-Nothofagus* forests of south-central Chile.
Through this analysis we provide insight into how these iconic ecosystems may respond to
future ashfall events under anticipated changes to climate and burning regimes.

Location: Lago Cilantro is a small lake located in south-central Chile (38°51'36.72S,
71°17'14.52 W, 1400 masl), proximal to several active volcanos within the Southern
Volcanic Zone of the Andes Mountain range.

40 Methods: We developed a continuous 8700-year long pollen and charcoal record from Lago 41 Cilantro. We compared these results with proxies of regional climatic change and used a 42 combination of Principal Component Analysis and Superposed Epoch Analysis to test the 43 relationship between tephra deposition and pollen composition.

Results: We detect a shift in dominance from Araucaria araucana to Nothofagus species 44 between ~ 8.7 and ~ 5.5 ka (ka = 1000 years before present-1950 CE), in concert with 45 46 increasing regional precipitation and decreasing local-scale fire activity. A reversal in this trend occurred after ~4 ka, contemporaneous with a reduction in regional precipitation. 47 Centennial-scale increases in Araucaria araucana from ~0.2-0.9 ka, ~5.2-4.2 ka and ~8.6-7 48 ka are associated with reductions in fire-return intervals. We found 25 tephra layers in this 49 record; tephra >2 cm thickness are associated with short-term (<100 year) compositional 50 shifts in the pollen spectra, while a single large (255 cm) tephra at ~3 ka is associated with a 51 substantial reduction in Nothofagus and no change in Araucaria. 52

53 Main Conclusions: Climate change drove millennial-scale shifts in *Araucaria-Nothofagus*54 forests and fire regimes near Lago Cilantro. A shortening of the fire-return-interval is

associated with an increase in the importance of *Araucaria*, supporting the notion that recurrent fires are required to allow this tree species to compete with *Nothofagus*. Tephra deposition triggered short-term compositional responses in this system that appears to be overwhelmed by climate and fire at longer-timescales. *Araucaria araucana* can survive and potentially outcompete *Nothofagus* following the deposition of very thick tephra, thanks to its thick bark and tall canopy (>15 m).

61

Keywords: *Araucaria araucana*, climate, fire, *Nothofagus dombeyi*, *Nothofagus pumilio*,
palaeoecology, south-central Chile, tephra, volcanism

64 Introduction

Long-term vegetation dynamics are driven by a range of factors that include history, climate, 65 disturbance, soil type and hydrology (Attiwill, 1994). In the absence of a negating factor, 66 vegetation develops toward a dynamic equilibrium with climate (Webb, 1986). Factors such 67 as disturbance, soil type and hydrology can potentially cause a disequilibrium between 68 vegetation and climate (Attiwill, 1994). Disturbances are of particular interest as they are 69 often stochastic, short-lived and have severe consequences for ecosystem dynamics and 70 71 functioning (Folke et al., 2004). Much attention has focused on the impact and role of disturbances such as fire events on vegetation dynamics (Burns, 1993; Bowman, 2000; Bond 72 73 et al., 2005; Bowman et al., 2011), whereas the impact of volcanic disturbance on vegetation, while often catastrophic and highly unpredictable, has received comparatively less attention 74 (Tognetti et al., 2012). Here we use palaeoecological data to examine the contribution of 75 climate, fire, and explosive volcanism on vegetation dynamics in a temperate forest system in 76 south-central Chile over the last ~8700 years. 77

78

Fire is a key driver of ecosystem dynamics, with an estimated doubling of global forest cover in the absence of fire (Bond et al., 2005). The effects of fire vary among species, with factors such as physiology and regeneration strategy (e.g. resprouting versus obligate seeding) governing the response of terrestrial vegetation to fire disturbance (Scott et al., 2013). Fire regimes, i.e. the intensity, spatial and temporal structure of fires, vary in response to changes in climate, fuel and ignition types (Scott et al., 2013) and the regeneration dynamics of vegetation communities are often fine-tuned to, and can even dictate, specific fire regimes

(Bond & Midgley, 1995; Murphy et al., 2013). Volcanic disturbance, on the other hand, is an 86 entirely exogenous and stochastic disturbance type that can significantly impact vegetation 87 dynamics (Hennessy et al., 2005; Allen & Huntley, 2018). Outside of the immediate area of 88 volcanic eruptions, where lava and pyroclastic flow significantly impact vegetation, volcanic 89 ash fall (tephra) associated with explosive volcanism exerts the most spatially extensive 90 physical impact on vegetation systems. The impact of tephra on vegetation systems can be 91 extensive (>600 km from volcanic source) (Marti & Folch, 2005) and includes burial, 92 defoliation, altered hydrology (Foster et al., 1998; Jara & Moreno, 2012) and exposure to 93 94 toxic foliar and soil contaminants (Tognetti et al., 2012). Studies on long-term (centennial to millennial-scale) responses of vegetation dynamics indicate that repeated disturbance from 95 tephra can result in a long-term decoupling of vegetation from climate (Jara & Moreno, 2012) 96 and the emergence of alternate successional trajectories (Wilmshurst & McGlone, 1996). The 97 specific response of vegetation systems to tephra deposition can vary significantly, however, 98 depending on the vegetation type and species composition, and the thickness of the ash layer 99 (Allen & Huntley, 2018). 100

101

The iconic Araucaria-Nothofagus forests of southern Andes Cordillera are a fire-adapted 102 forest type that persists within one of the highest densities of active explosive volcanoes on 103 Earth (Veblen, 1982). A. araucana is a long-lived tree (>1000 years) that has thick insulating 104 bark and absence of foliage below the canopy (>15 m), traits that afford this species 105 resistance to fire. In contrast, Nothofagus species (principally N. pumilio and N. dombevi) are 106 short-lived obligate seeders that rapidly regenerate from seed post-fire. Considerable 107 attention has focussed on short-term (~300 years) response of these forests to fire (Gajardo, 108 1980; Veblen, 1982; Burns, 1993; Finckh & Paulsch, 1995; Rondanelli-Reyes, 2000; 109 Gonzalez, Veblen & Sibold, 2005; Fajardo & Gonzalez, 2009; González & Veblen, 2009; 110 Paulino, Godoy & Boeckx, 2009; Gonzalez, Veblen & Sibold, 2010; Muñoz et al., 2014), yet 111 only one study has investigated the longer term (supra-centennial) role of fire in this 112 community (Heusser et al., 1988). This has led to divergent views about the long-term 113 ecological role of fire in this system, with some contending that A. araucana out-lives and 114 dominates over Nothofagus in the absence of fire (Fajardo & Gonzalez, 2009), while others 115 116 argue that continued successful A. araucana recruitment is dependent on Nothofagus canopy gaps created by fires (Burns, 1991; Gonzalez et al., 2010). From the scant evidence for the 117 role of tephra deposition on Araucaria-Nothofagus forests dynamics (Veblen, 1982; Urrutia 118

et al., 2007), it is likely that the traits that protect *A. araucana* from fire also convey protection from this kind of disturbance (Veblen, 1982). Indeed, *A. araucaria* trees have been observed surviving burial by tephra between 0.5-1 m thick (Veblen, 1982) and the overall dominance of andisols under *Araucaria-Nothofagus* forests suggest an ability of this ecosystem to survive in the presence of repeated volcanic disturbance (Veblen, 1982).

124

Here we use palaeoecological data to assess the centennial to millennial-scale response of an 125 126 A. araucana-Nothofagus pumilio forest to changes in climate, fire activity and explosive volcanic events over the last ~8700 years, to elucidate the factors governing long-term 127 ecosystem dynamics in this system. We hypothesise that millennial-scale fire activity in this 128 forest community will be modulated by long-term climatic change and we anticipate that this 129 130 has driven changes in the relative dominance of A. araucana and Nothofagus. Further, we hypothesise that the morphological traits of thick bark, significant height and the 131 concentration of foliage in the crown of A. araucana (hereon Araucaria) will convey a 132 resistance to disturbance by thick tephra deposits, thus, conferring a competitive advantage 133 for this conifer over smaller and more susceptible angiosperm species, such as Nothofagus. 134

135

136 Study area

Our study focusses on Lago Cilantro in south-central Chile (38°51'36.72S, 71°17'14.52 W,
1400 masl), a small 8.4 m-deep flow-through lake located close to the Chile-Argentina
border, proximal to active volcanic centres. The site lies within the fallout zone of a known
thick (2-3 m) tephra deposited ~3000 years ago sourced from Volcán Sollipulli (Naranjo et
al., 1993) (Fig. 1).

142

The lake is surrounded by *Araucaria* forest with a floristically simple understorey dominated by *N. pumilio* and *Chusquea culeao*. The climate is highly seasonal, with an average annual rainfall at Paso Icalma (1390 masl) of 1077 mm (maximum in June of 176 mm; minimum in November of 40 mm). January is the warmest month, with an average temperature range of 30°C and 7°C, while July temperatures range between -3°C and -7°C. Lago Cilantro lies downwind of several active stratovolcanoes (Llaima, Lonquimay, Tolhuaca, and Sollipulli) (Fontijn et al., 2014). The most proximal of these is Volcán Sollipulli, the source of a largescale eruption event at ~3 ka that deposited the Alpehué Tephra, which blanketed the
landscape around Lago Cilantro with thicknesses between 2-3 metres (Fig. 1) (Naranjo et al.,
1993).

153

Araucaria is a tall (up to 20 m) tree with large, poorly dispersed seeds, very thick insulating 154 bark and a concentration of foliage at the crown, morphological traits that convey both poor 155 dispersal and considerable protection from even high intensity fires (Finckh & Paulsch, 156 1995). This species is a shade-tolerant, long-lived (>1000 years) pioneering species 157 considered to be an equilibrium strategist adapted to achieve a lasting dominance once 158 established (Veblen, 1982). Nothofagus species in this forest system, on the other hand, are 159 160 relatively short lived, shade-intolerant and are comprised of vigorous post-fire resprouters that produce sparse open canopies on xeric sites (N. antarctica) and obligate seeders that 161 rapidly establish post-fire, producing very dense canopies on mesic sites (N. pumilio and 162 *N.dombeyi*), such as at Lago Cilantro. 163

164



165

Figure 1. (a) A photo of Lago Cilantro; (b) Map of the world indicating the location of the
study area represented in (c); (c) Map of the study area modified from Veblen (1982)
showing the distribution of *Araucaria araucana* (black outline), the location of Lago Cilantro

(black circle), the location of Volcan Solli Pulli (red triangle) and the area covered by more
than 1 m thick Alpehué Tephra (pale grey) (Naranjo et al., 1993).

- 171
- 172

173 Materials and Methods

We retrieved sediment cores from the deepest part of Lago Cilantro (8.4 m water depth) from 174 an anchored coring rig equipped with a 7.5-cm diameter aluminium casing tube, using a 5-cm 175 diameter Wright piston corer and a 7.5-cm diameter sediment-water interface piston corer 176 with a transparent plastic chamber (Wright, 1991). We characterized the stratigraphy and 177 chronology of the Lago Cilantro record through textural descriptions and loss-on-ignition 178 (LOI) analysis (Heiri et al., 2001) (1-cm³ sediment samples at continuous 1-cm intervals 179 exposed to sequential burns at 550 °C for 2 h and 925 °C for 4 h), along with AMS 180 radiocarbon dating of bulk sediment samples. 181

182

The reconstruction of chronologies was based on radiocarbon dating and age-depth 183 modelling (Blaauw, 2010). Age-depth modelling of the radiocarbon ages (see Table 1) was 184 performed in *rbacon* for R (Blaauw and Christen, 2011) (see Fig. 3 and Supplementary 185 Information Fig. S2). Tephras were considered instantaneous depositions and were subtracted 186 from the sediment depth prior to age-depth modelling. Tephras were detected via visual 187 inspection and using the LOI data, with an inorganic content >97.5% selected as the 188 threshold inorganic content indicating a tephra layer (see Supplementary Information Fig. 189 S1). Radiocarbon dates were calibrated to calendar years before 1950 CE ('present') using 190 Southern Hemisphere calibration curve SHCal13.14C (Hogg et al., 2013) prior to age-depth 191 modelling. 192

193

We use sedimentary charcoal to reconstruct past fires and pollen for past vegetation change 194 since ~8.7 ka. We developed palynomorph and macroscopic (>125 µm) charcoal records 195 using standard techniques (Faegri & Iversen, 1989; Whitlock & Larsen, 2001). 196 Palynomorphs were identified at 400× magnification and a minimum of 300 pollen grains 197 from trees, shrubs and herbs (terrestrial pollen) was identified for each level. The percentage 198 of each terrestrial taxon was calculated in reference to this sum, whereas the percentages of 199 aquatics and pteridophytes were calculated in reference to the inclusion of these. We tallied 200 201 all macroscopic charcoal particles from 2-cm³ sediment samples retrieved from continuous-

202 contiguous 1-cm intervals throughout the cores. The charcoal data were converted to accumulation rates (fragments cm⁻² yr⁻¹) using the results of the age-depth modelling. We 203 computed pollen accumulation rates using pollen concentrations (estimated via the addition 204 of a marker spore (Lycopodium sp.) spike of known concentration) and the results of the age-205 depth model. Pollen accumulation rates have been shown to be linearly related to tree 206 biomass in some forest systems (Matthias & Giesecke, 2014) and we use this metric as a 207 208 broad indicator of trends in vegetation that are independent of the effects of the closed pollen sum on proportional data. 209

SNUS \geq Auth

210

								Original	Tephra-	Calibrated age	
								depth	free depth	range (yr BP)	Median age
S-ANU#	d ¹³ C	±	F ¹⁴ C	±	¹⁴ C age	±	Original core	(cm)	(cm)	(2σ)	(cal. yr BP)
50609	-28	1	0.8673	0.003	1143	30	MSF1203 SC1	35-36	35.5	937-1061	1044.5
50618	-30	1	0.8063	0.003	1729	36	MSF1203 SC1	43-44	43.5	1532-1701	1600
50610	-28	1	0.7047	0.002	2812	33	MSF1203 SC1	72-73	60.5	2779-2955	2927
50611	-24	1	0.6915	0.004	2963	49	MSF1203 AT1	43-44	61.5	2891-3214	3077
50612	-32	1	0.6751	0.002	3156	34	MSF1203 AT4	23-24	64.5	3216-3441	3299
50613	-30	1	0.5874	0.003	4274	40	MSF1203 AT4	66-67	99.5	4618-4867	4769
50614	-27	1	0.55	0.002	4803	38	MSF1203 AT4	87-88	116.5	5328-5591	5482
50615	-31	1	0.505	0.003	5489	45	MSF1203 AT5	24-25	129.5	6028-6392	6204
50616	-29	1	0.4513	0.003	6392	59	MSF1203 AT5	48-49	149.5	7170-7417	7232
50617	-31	1	0.3788	0.002	7798	42	MSF1203 AT5	90-91	170.5	8426-8604	8610

Table 1. Results of radiocarbon dating. Individual dates were calibrated to the southern hemisphere calibration curve (SHCal13) (Hogg et al.

2013) using *rbacon* software (Blaauw and Christen, 2011). Original depth refers to the initial depth measurements of each separate core. Tephrafree depth refers to the corrected depth of the composite core, following the removal of the tephra layers.

- 215
 216
 217
 218
- 219

Journal of Biogeography



C Author Manus

A cluster analysis constrained by depth (CONISS) was used to aid the division of the pollen 229 record into pollen zones (Grimm, 1987), with a broken-stick model used to determine the 230 number of significant zones (Bennett 1996). Principal component analysis (PCA) was used 231 to summarise the main trends in the multivariate terrestrial pollen dataset using PCOrd 232 (McCune & Mefford, 1999). The percent pollen data were square root transformed prior to 233 running the PCA and the PCA was run on a variance/covariance matrix. Superposed Epoch 234 Analysis (SEA) in *R v.3.0.3* (R Core Team, 2014) was used to identify consistent statistically 235 significant relationships (p = 0.1) between tephra layers and selected pollen taxa and the first 236 and second axes of the PCA (PCA1 and PCA2). This analysis assesses the significance of the 237 departure from the mean of a time-series for a given set of key event years (in our case -238 tephras) (Lough & Fritts, 1987). SEA is a particularly useful statistical tool for detecting 239 response signals in records with low signal-to-noise ratios (Adams et al. 2003) and where lag 240 effects may be significant (Lough & Fritts, 1987). It has been applied to test for responses in 241 regional temperatures (Lough & Fritts, 1987), El-Nino events (Adams et al., 2003), and 242 global streamflow patterns (Iles & Hegerl, 2015) to volcanic forcing, and in vegetation 243 systems to burning events (Fletcher et al., 2018; Dunnette et al., 2014). To satisfy the 244 requirements of even age steps and stationarity for the SEA, the pollen data and PCA1 data 245 246 were interpolated to 100-year age bins (the median age resolution of the record) and the timeseries data were differenced to remove the effects of stationarity (Diggle, 1990) prior to 247 running the SEA. Tephra events are instantaneous, allowing a clear definition of event years 248 for the SEA analysis. The depth of the tephra was used to ascertain the age of the event using 249 the interpolated ages from the age-depth model, with tephra ages assigned to the appropriate 250 100-year age bin. Prior to analysis, tephra events were binned into thickness categories (1-5): 251 1=1-2 cm; 2=3-4 cm; 3=4-6 cm; 4=6-8 cm; 5=>8 cm. 252

- 253
- 254 Results

We retrieved a sediment core from Lago Cilantro with a spliced length of 525 cm (cores MSF1203 SC1 and MSF1203AT1 through 5). The sediments were overwhelmingly inorganic (>80%) with discrete tephra layers. Tephra layers were detected visually and using the inorganic density data. Using this criterion we detected 24 tephra layers which we classified in to the five thickness categories: 1: n=13; 2: n=3; 3: n=3; 4: n=3; 5: n=2. We also found a 255-cm thick tephra between 51-321 cm sediment length, comprised of large (>4 cm) pumice fragments and dated to ~3 ka, potentially corresponding to the Alpehué Tephra
described by Naranjo et al. (1993).

263

The results of the radiocarbon analyses are presented in Table 1 and show increasing sediment age with depth. The age model reveals a remarkably linear accumulation of sediment through time, with the record spanning the present (coring year: 2012 CE, -0.062 ka) to 8.67 ka (Fig. 3, see also Fig. S2).

268

We analysed macroscopic charcoal at 1-cm (~58 yr) intervals. Macroscopic charcoal content 269 is low throughout the record (Figs. 2,7D) with intermittent, discrete charcoal peaks at 8.5, 8, 270 6.5, 6.2, 4.2 and 0.4 ka. We observe relatively high and declining charcoal accumulation 271 rates (CHAR) between ~8.5 and ~4 ka, low or zero CHAR values between 4 and 2.3 ka, 272 increased values between ~2.3 and ~0.4 ka, when CHAR values reach the highest for the 273 entire record. CharAnalysis allowed the calculation of the fire-return interval (FRI) and fire 274 frequency (charcoal peaks per millennia) (Fig. 2). The average FRI for the record was 350 275 years, with notable reductions in the FRI occurring between ~ 8.5 and ~ 7.5 ka (250 years), ~ 5 276 277 and ~4.5 ka (260 years) and between ~1 and ~0.25 ka (270 years), and maximum FRI occurring between ~7 and ~5.5 ka (360 years). 278

279

Author



Figure 2. CHARanalysis results for the Lago Cilantro record showing (a) CHAR and CHAR
background; (b) inferred fire events; (c) fire episode frequency; (d) Fire return interval; (e)
charcoal peak magnitude.

280

285

A total of 115 pollen samples were analysed, with 36 terrestrial pollen types identified. The fossil pollen spectra were overwhelmingly dominated by *Nothofagus dombeyi* type (which includes *N. antarctica*, *N. pumilio* and *N. dombeyi*), with *Araucaria*, Poaceae and *Misodendrum* being important components. We identified 3 pollen zones with the aid of the CONISS cluster analysis and the following is a summary of the main trends (Fig. 3):



Figure 3. Percent pollen diagram showing trends in selected taxa through the Lago Cilantro pollen record, including the results of the CONISS cluster analysis and zonation of the pollen diagram. N.B. changes in x-scale. Modelled age-depth relationship presented on the left, with blue squares indicating radiocarbon-dated depths.

Zone 1 173-122 cm tephra-free depth (8.7-5.8 ka): Zone 1 is dominated by *N. dombeyi* type
pollen (86%). *N. dombeyi* type fluctuates throughout the zone but never declines below 65%.
There is a gradual increase to a peak of 86% at 6.8 ka and then a decrease to 70% as it
transitions into zone two. *Araucaria* pollen initially increases sharply in this zone from 5% to
20% at 8.5 ka followed by a gradual decrease ending at 3% at the end of the zone.

302 Zone 2 122-63 cm tephra-free depth (5.8-3.2 ka): N. dombeyi type again dominates zone 2 303 maintaining a presence between 70% to 90% throughout this period. There is a general 304 decrease in *Araucaria* pollen in this zone until it reaches 0 at 3.5 ka followed by a shallow 305 increase to 4% at the transition into zone 3. Poaceae peaks at 9% at 5.8 ka which is then 306 proceeded by a fluctuating decreasing trend ending at 3%.

Zone 3 63-0 cm tephra-free depth (3.2 ka – present): N. dombeyi type again dominates this
zone. There is a minor depression across the transition between zone 2 to 3 to *N. dombeyi*type lowest presence of 70% following a shallow increase to 85%. *Araucaria* fluctuates in
this zone after an initial increase in pollen to 20% at 3 ka and a sharp decrease down to 5%,
there are three more preceding shallow peaks. From 0.5 ka there is a decreasing trend with
frequent sharp short peaks ending at 7%.

313

To interrogate the apparent positive impact of the 255-cm thick tephra deposited at ~3 ka on 314 Araucaria percentage data, we focus our analysis of pollen accumulation rates (PAR) on the 315 millennia preceding this event (presumed to be the Alpehué Tephra) (4-2 ka) (Fig. 4). The 316 full PAR record is provided in the Supplementary Information (Fig. S3). We observe a small 317 increase in Araucaria PAR ~3.2 ka from minimum values between ca. 4-3.3 ka, prior to the 318 deposition of the Alpehué Tephra. Importantly, we observe no immediate change in 319 Araucaria PAR following the Alpehué Tephra (in contrast to the sharp peak evident in the 320 Araucaria % data), with a sustained increase occurring between ca. 2.9-2 ka. Nothofagus 321 PARs are variable between ca. 4-3 ka, with a sharp decline to almost zero values immediately 322 following the Alpehué Tephra. This is followed by a rapid increase in Nothofagus PAR to 323 peak values at ca. 2.7 ka, with a resumption of varying values toward ca. 2 ka. 324

325

The first two axes of the PCA capture 60.3% of the variance within the dataset (PCA1-40.9%; PCA-19.4%). Fig. 5 shows the PCA ordination biplot for the Lago Cilantro fossil samples, grouped according to CONISS zones. *Araucaria* shows strong positive correlation with PCA1 ($r^2 = 0.96$), and *Nothofagus* shows strong negative correlation with PCA1 ($r^2 = 0.84$). *Misodendrum* (a parasite of *Nothofagus* species) shows strong negative association with PCA2 ($r^2 = 0.87$). There is good agreement between the pollen zones and the clustering of samples within the ordination biplot. The PCA biplot reveals a shift from an *Araucaria* dominant ecosystem in zone 1, to a *Nothofagus* dominated system in zone 2, with a shift toward zone 3 marked by a decrease in *Misodendrum* and an increase in *Araucaria*.

335

Author Manus



Figure 4. Summary plot of pollen accumulation rates (PAR) for *Araucaria* and *Nothofagus*between 4-2 ka plotted against relative values of these pollen taxa for the Lago Cilantro
record. Macroscopic CHAR is also shown. The location of the Alpehue Tephra is indicated
by the grey bar.

336



Figure 5. The PCA biplot, showing the position of fossil samples from the Lago Cilantro record in 2-dimensional ordination space. Samples are grouped as per the results of the CONISS cluster analysis. Values in parentheses indicate r^2 values between indicated taxa and PCA axes.

342

348

We ran the SEA between tephra events for selected pollen taxa, and PCA1 and PCA2 for all 349 tephra size categories independently and for combinations in hierarchical clusters (Category 350 1-5; Category 2-5; etc.) (see supplementary information for the full results). The only 351 significant relationship (p = 0.1) between tephra events and pollen composition was between 352 Category 2-5 tephras (i.e. >2 cm thickness) and PCA1 at 0 lag (between 0-100 years) (Fig. 6, 353 see also Supplementary Information (Fig. S4) for full results), indicating a significant shift in 354 the pollen composition in the 100 years following the tephra event (i.e. a single sample unit). 355 The absence of a significant relationship between individual pollen taxa and tephra in the 356 SEA indicates that the effect of tephra deposits >2 cm thick are not uniform with respect to 357 species specific effects, rather they affect the composition of pollen in a significant manner. 358

359



Figure 6. Results of the Superposed Epoch Analysis (SEA) for tephra events >2 cm (categories 2-5) and PCA1 from the Lago Cilantro record, showing a significant negative departure of PCA1 at 0-lag with tephra events >2 cm (i.e. 0-100 years following tephra deposition).

- 365
- 366

367 Discussion

368 Long-term climate-fire-vegetation dynamics

We observe a millennial-scale reduction in *Araucaria* at the expense of *Nothofagus* between ~8.7 and ~5.5 ka (Fig. 7B,E). This decline is concomitant with (1) a shift toward lower charcoal accumulation rates into Lago Cilantro and (2) a phase of decreasing regional charcoal influx in sediment cores across southern South America (>30°S) (Power et al., 2008) that reflects a millennial-scale increase in precipitation over the region (Fig. 7A) (Fletcher & Moreno, 2012). Our data suggest that a long-term increase in precipitation and a concomitant reduction in fire activity around Lago Cilantro favoured an increase in the relative abundance of *Nothofagus* species relative to *Araucaria*, culminating in the almost total exclusion of *Araucaria* in the absence of fire between ~4 and ~3.2 ka (Fig. 7B).

378

379 Modern ecological studies (Gonzalez et al., 2010) indicate that N. pumilio and N. dombeyi rapidly invade canopy gaps created by disturbance or treefall in mesic areas, limiting the 380 opportunity for successful Araucaria recruitment, which requires canopy gaps created by 381 relatively frequent moderate-intensity fires that leave live adult Araucaria trees as a seed 382 source (Burns, 1991). Indeed, N. pumilio currently forms pure self-replacing stands within 383 this forest system on mesic south-facing slopes where disturbance from moderate to high 384 intensity fires is infrequent (Veblen, 1982; Burns, 1991). The close correspondence between 385 decreased FRI (Fig. 7C) and increases in Araucaria around Lago Cilantro since ~8.5 ka (Fig. 386 387 7B), under both relatively mesic (~5.2-4.2 ka) and xeric (~8.3-7 ka) climate conditions inferred from the regional charcoal influx curve (Fig. 7A) highlights the importance of 388 recurrent moderate frequency fires in the regeneration dynamics of Araucaria-Nothofagus 389 forests (Veblen, 1982; Burns, 1993; Gonzalez et al., 2010). We, thus, support the model of 390 Burns (1991), which depicts a dependency of Araucaria recruitment on recurrent fire in 391 mesic Araucaria-Nothofagus forests such as those found in the Lago Cilantro region. 392

393

Author



Figure 7. Summary plot showing (a) Regional southern South American charcoal influx
(Power et al., 2008); (b) *Araucaria* pollen from Lago Cilantro; (c) fire return interval from
Lago Cilantro; (d) macroscopic CHAR from Lago Cilantro; (e) *Nothofagus* pollen from Lago
Cilantro; and (f) tephra events by category from Lago Cilantro.

- 399
- 400

401 *The long-term role of volcanic ash-fall*

We investigated the influence of volcanic ash-fall over *Araucaria-Nothofagus* ecosystem dynamics around Lago Cilantro over the past ~8700 years. We record a total of 24 tephra layers within the sedimentary sequence ranging from <1 to 255 cm in thickness. All but one of the tephras were <8 cm, indicating that the deposition of very thick tephras was rare at this

site over the last ~8700 years. The SEA revealed a significant shift in the pollen spectra in 406 the 100 years following tephras >2 cm in thickness (Fig. 6). This was manifest as a shift 407 toward lower/higher relative values of Araucaria/Nothofagus. Our results are consistent with 408 the study of Veblen (1982), who performed a detailed ecological analysis of Araucaria-409 *Nothofagus* forests that concluded that repeated small-scale disturbance from volcanic ashfall 410 favours the relatively fast growing *Nothofagus* relative to *Araucaria*, a result that is consistent 411 with our findings, and with long-term (palaeoecological) studies on the role of tephra of other 412 forest types, both within southern South America (Jara & Moreno, 2012; Henríquez et al., 413 414 2015) and further afield (Wilmshurst & McGlone, 1996).

415

The work of Veblen (1982) also identified a competitive advantage for *Araucaria* following 416 the deposition of thick ca. 100 cm volcanic deposits, conveyed by the same morphological 417 characteristics that protect Araucaria from fire (thick bark and height). The 255 cm thick 418 tephra we encountered was dated at ~3 ka, and this event likely represents the Alpehué 419 Tephra from Volcan Sollipulli (21 km SE of Lago Cilantro), previously dated at ~2.9 ka 420 (Naranjo et al., 1993) and recorded within the sediments of Lago Icalma (5 km north of Lago 421 Cilantro) (Bertrand et al., 2008). Our data reveal a sharp increase/decrease in the proportion 422 of Araucaria/Nothofagus pollen immediately following the presumed Alpehué Tephra. 423 Importantly, calculation of pollen accumulation rates, which reveal trends in pollen taxa 424 independent of the effects of a closed pollen sum, reveals two critical factors about the 425 response of this system to the deposition of the 255 cm Alpehué Tephra: (1) that Nothofagus 426 decreases immediately after this tephra; and (2) Araucaria remains unchanged and 427 subsequently increases prior to the return of fire in the system (Fig. 4). 428

429

While we cannot constrain the source of the well-dispersed pollen from *Nothofagus*, the contemporaneity of the trends (large tephra followed immediately by a decline in *Nothofagus* PAR and no change in *Araucaria* PAR) is consistent with the survival of *Araucaria* through the Alpehué Tephra deposit and the destruction of the *Nothofagus* component of the forest vegetation. The subsequent increase in *Araucaria* PAR, then, likely reflects the successful recruitment of *Araucaria* in the absence of competition from *Nothofagus*, while the rapid increase in *Nothofagus* following the initial decline is consistent with the ability of

Nothofagus species to rapidly recolonise open areas of forest following disturbance (Veblen,1982).

439

440 Conclusion

Our interpretation of ecosystem dynamics of Araucaria-Nothofagus forest from lake 441 sediments in the south-central Andes Cordillera since ~8.7 ka represents the first study of its 442 kind in this system. We propose a key role of fire activity and regional climatic change in the 443 long-term dynamics of this system. We also report a positive response of Araucaria to 444 reductions in the charcoal-inferred fire-return-interval (FRI) implying that Araucaria are 445 favoured (relative to *Nothofagus*) by increased fire activity. Further, we identify a significant 446 short-term (≤ 100 years) influence of tephra events >2 cm in thickness over dynamics in 447 Araucaria-Nothofagus forests, manifest as a shift in compositional trends. Finally, we 448 observe a remarkable ability of Araucaria to survive and potentially capitalise on large-scale 449 ash-fall events (255 cm), likely resulting from its thick bark and concentration of foliar 450 material in the crown (which reaches heights of up to 20 m). 451

452

453 Data availability statement

used in this will be available for download 454 Data research made at 455 https://www.neotomadb.org/data following publication using the site name (Lago Cilantro and/or geographic coordinated provided in the text). The corresponding author can also be contacted for data 456

- 457 <u>access</u>.
- 458
- 459 References
- 460
- Adams, J. B., Mann, M. E. & Ammann, C. M. (2003). Proxy evidence for an El Nino-like
 response to volcanic forcing. *Nature*, 426, 274-278.
- Allen, J. R. M. & Huntley, B. (2018). Effects of tephra falls on vegetation: A LateQuaternary record from southern Italy. Journal of Ecology, 106, 2456-2472.
- Attiwill, P. M. (1994). Ecological disturbance and the conservative management of
 Eucalyptus forests in Australia. *Forest Ecology and Management*, 63, 301-346.

- 467 Bennett, K. D. (1996). Determination of the number of zones in a biostratigraphical sequence.
 468 *New Phytologist*, 132, 155-70.
- Bertrand, S., Charlet, F., Chapron, E., Fagel, N. & De Batist, M. (2008). Reconstruction of
 the Holocene seismotectonic activity of the Southern Andes from seismites recorded
 in Lago Icalma, Chile, 39 S. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology*,
 259, 301-322.
- Blaauw, M. (2010). Methods and code for 'classical' age-modelling of radiocarbon
 sequences. *Quaternary Geochronology*, 5, 512-518.
- Blaauw, M. & Christen, J. A. (2011). Flexible palaeoclimate age-depth models using an
 autoregressive gamma process. *Bayesian Analysis*, 6, 457-474.
- Bond, W. J. & Midgley, J. J. (1995). Kill thy neighbour: an individualistic argument for the
 evolution of flammability. *Oikos*, 73, 79-85.
- Bond, W. J., Woodward, F. I. & Midgley, G. F. (2005). The global distribution of ecosystems
 in a world without fire. *New Phytologist*, 165, 525-537.
- Bowman, D. M., Balch, J., Artaxo, P., Bond, W. J., Cochrane, M. A., D'Antonio, C. M.,
 DeFries, R., Johnston, F. H., Keeley, J. E. & Krawchuk, M. A. (2011). The human
 dimension of fire regimes on Earth. *Journal of Biogeography*, 38, 2223-2236.
- Bowman, D. M. J. S. (2000). *Australian rainforests: islands of green in a land of fire* (1st
 ed.), Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Burns, B. R. (1991). *The regeneration dynamics of Araucaria araucana*. Boulder, CO :
 University of Colorado.
- Burns, B. R. (1993). Fire-induced dynamics of *Araucaria araucana-Nothofagus antarctica*forest in the southern Andes. *Journal of Biogeography*, 20, 669-685.
- 490 Diggle, P. J. (1990). *Time series; a biostatistical introduction*. New York: Clarendon Press.
- 491 Dunnette, P. V., Higuera, P. E., McLauchlan, K. K., Derr, K. M., Briles, C. E. & Keefe, M.
- H. (2014). Biogeochemical impacts of wildfires over four millennia in a Rocky
 Mountain subalpine watershed. *New Phytologist*, 203, 900-912.
- 494 Faegri, K. & Iversen, J. (1989). *Textbook of pollen analysis*. New York: Wiley.

- Fajardo, A. & Gonzalez, M. E. (2009). Replacement patterns and species coexistence in an
 Andean *Araucaria-Nothofagus* forest. *Journal of Vegetation Science*, 20, 1176-1190.
- 497 Finckh, M. & Paulsch, A. (1995). *Araucaria araucana*—Die ökologische Strategie einer
 498 Reliktkonifere: The ecological strategy of *Araucaria araucana. Flora*, 190, 365-382.
- Fletcher, M.-S. & Moreno, P. I. (2012). Have the Southern Westerlies changed in a zonally
 symmetric manner over the last 14,000 years? A hemisphere-wide take on a
 controversial problem. *Ouaternary International*, 253, 32–46.
- Fletcher, M.-S., Bowman, D. M. J. S., Whitlock, C., Mariani, M. & Stahle, L. (2018). The
 changing role of fire in conifer-dominated temperate rainforest through the last 14,000
 years. *Quaternary Science Reviews*, 182, 37-47.
- Folke, C., Carpenter, S., Walker, B., Scheffer, M., Elmqvist, T., Gunderson, L. & Holling, C.
 (2004). Regime shifts, resilience, and biodiversity in ecosystem management. *Annual Review of Ecology, Evolution, and Systematics*, 35, 557-581.
- Fontijn, K., Lachowycz, S. M., Rawson, H., Pyle, D. M., Mather, T. A., Naranjo, J. A. &
 Moreno-Roa, H. (2014). Late Quaternary tephrostratigraphy of southern Chile and
 Argentina. *Quaternary Science Reviews*, 89, 70-84.
- Foster, D. R., Knight, D. H. & Franklin, J. F. (1998). Landscape patterns and legacies
 resulting from large, infrequent forest disturbances. *Ecosystems*, 1, 497-510.
- 513 Gajardo, R. (1980). Vegetación del bosque de Araucaria araucana (Mol.) K. Koch en la
- 514 Cordillera de los Andes (Lonquimay prov. Malleco). Universidad de Chile, Facultad
 515 de Ciencias Forestales. *Boletín Técnico*, 57, 1-25.
- Gonzalez, M. E., Veblen, T. T. & Sibold, J. S. (2005). Fire history of *Araucaria-Nothofagus*forests in Villarrica National Park, Chile. *Journal of Biogeography*, 32, 1187-1202.
- 518 Gonzalez, M. E., Veblen, T. T. & Sibold, J. S. (2010). Influence of fire severity on stand
- 519development of Araucaria araucana–Nothofagus pumilio stands in the Andean520cordillera of south-central Chile. Austral Ecology, 35, 597-615.
- González, M. E. & Veblen, T. T. (2009). Climatic influences on fire in *Araucaria araucana– Nothofagus forests* in the Andean cordillera of south-central Chile. *Ecoscience*, 13,
 342-350.

- Grimm, E. C. (1987). CONISS: A FORTRAN 77 program for stratigraphically constrained
 cluster analysis by the method of incremental sum of squares. *Computers & Geosciences*, 13, 13-35.
- Heiri, O., Lotter, A. F. & Lemcke, G. (2001). Loss on ignition as a method for estimating
 organic and carbonate content in sediments: reproducibility and comparability of
 results. *Journal of Paleolimnology*, 25, 101-110.
- Hennessy, K., Lucas, C., Nicholls, N., Bathols, J., Suppiah, R. & Ricketts, J. (2005). *Climate change impacts on fire-weather in south-east Australia*. Climate Impacts Group,
 Report C/1061. CSIRO Atmospheric Research and the Australian Government
- 533 Bureau of Meteorology, Aspendale, Victoria.
- Henríquez, W., Moreno, P., Alloway, B. & Villarosa, G. (2015). Vegetation and climate
 change, fire-regime shifts and volcanic disturbance in Chiloé Continental (43 S)
 during the last 10,000 years. *Quaternary Science Reviews*, 123, 158-167.
- Heusser, C. J., Rabassa, J., Brandani, A. & Stuckenrath, R. (1988). Late-Holocene vegetation
 of the Andean Araucaria region, province of Neuquén, Argentina. *Mountain Research and Development*, 8, 53-63.
- Hogg, A. G., Hua, Q., Blackwell, P. G., Niu, M., Buck, C. E., Guilderson, T. P., Heaton, T.
 J., Palmer, J. G., Reimer, P. J. & Reimer, R. W. (2013). SHCal13 Southern
- 542 Hemisphere calibration, 0–50,000 years cal BP. *Radiocarbon*, 55, 1889-1903.
- 543 Iles, C. E. & Hegerl, G. C. (2015). Systematic change in global patterns of streamflow
 544 following volcanic eruptions. *Nature Geoscience*, 8, 838-842.
- Jara, I. A. & Moreno, P. I. (2012). Temperate rainforest response to climate change and
 disturbance agents in northwestern Patagonia (41° S) over the last 2600 years. *Quaternary Research*, 77, 235-244.
- Lough, J. M. & Fritts, H. (1987). An assessment of the possible effects of volcanic eruptions
 on North American climate using tree-ring data, 1602 to 1900 A.D. *Climatic Change*,
 10, 219-239.
- Marti, J. & Folch, A. (2005). *Anticipating volcanic eruptions. Volcanoes and environment*(pp. 90-120). Cambridge: Cambridge Univ Press.

- Matthias, I. & Giesecke, T. (2014). Insights into pollen source area, transport and deposition
 from modern pollen accumulation rates in lake sediments. *Quaternary Science Reviews*, 87, 12-23.
- 556 McCune, B. & Mefford, M. J. (1999). PC-Ord for Windows. MjM Software.
- Muñoz, A. A., Barichivich, J., Christie, D. A., Dorigo, W., Sauchyn, D., González-Reyes, Á.,
 Villalba, R., Lara, A., Riquelme, N. & González, M. E. (2014). Patterns and drivers of *Araucaria araucana* forest growth along a biophysical gradient in the northern
 Patagonian Andes: linking tree rings with satellite observations of soil moisture.
- 561

Austral Ecology, 39, 158-169.

- Murphy, B. P., Bradstock, R. A., Boer, M. M., Carter, J., Cary, G. J., Cochrane, M. A.,
 Fensham, R. J., Russell-Smith, J., Williamson, G. J. & Bowman, D. M. (2013). Fire
 regimes of Australia: a pyrogeographic model system. *Journal of Biogeography*, 40,
 1048-1058,
- Naranjo, J., Moreno, H., Emparan, C. & Murphy, M. (1993). Recent explosive volcanism at
 Sollipulli Volcano, Southern Andes (39-degrees-S). *Revista Geologica de Chile*, 20,
 167-191.
- Paulino, L., Godoy, R. & Boeckx, P. (2009). Ecosystem responses of Andean *Araucaria- Nothofagus* communities after a wildfire. In N. Verhoest, P. Boeckx, C. Orayzun and
 R. Godoy (Eds.), *Ecological advances on Chilean temperate rainforests* (p. 117).
- 572 Belgium: Academia Press.
- Power, M. J., Marlon, J., Ortiz, N., Bartlein, P. J., Harrison, S. P., Mayle, F. E., Ballouche,
 A., Bradshaw, R. H. W., Carcaillet, C., Cordova, C., Mooney, S., Moreno, P. I.,
- 575 Prentice, I. C., Thonicke, K., Tinner, W., Whitlock, C., Zhang, Y., Zhao, Y., Ali, A.
- 576 A., Anderson, R. S., Beer, R., Behling, H., Briles, C., Brown, K. J., Brunelle, A.,
- 577 Bush, M., Camill, P., Chu, G. Q., Clark, J., Colombaroli, D., Connor, S., Daniau, A.
- 578 L., Daniels, M., Dodson, J., Doughty, E., Edwards, M. E., Finsinger, W., Foster, D.,
- 579 Frechette, J., Gaillard, M. J., Gavin, D. G., Gobet, E., Haberle, S., Hallett, D. J.,
- 580 Higuera, P., Hope, G., Horn, S., Inoue, J., Kaltenrieder, P., Kennedy, L., Kong, Z. C.,
- 581 Larsen, C., Long, C. J., Lynch, J., Lynch, E. A., McGlone, M., Meeks, S., Mensing,
- 582 S., Meyer, G., Minckley, T., Mohr, J., Nelson, D. M., New, J., Newnham, R., Noti,
- 583 R., Oswald, W., Pierce, J., Richard, P. J. H., Rowe, C., Goni, M. F. S., Shuman, B. N.,

584	Takahara, H., Toney, J., Turney, C., Urrego-Sanchez, D. H., Umbanhowar, C.,
585	Vandergoes, M., Vanniere, B., Vescovi, E., Walsh, M., Wang, X., Williams, N.,
586	Wilmshurst, J. & Zhang, J. H. (2008). Changes in fire regimes since the Last Glacial
587	Maximum: an assessment based on a global synthesis and analysis of charcoal data.
588	Climate Dynamics, 30, 887-907.
589 590	R Core Team (2014). R: A language and environment for statistical computing. R Foundation for Statistical Computing, Vienna, Austria. https://www.R-project.org/.
591	Rondanelli-Reyes, M. J. (2000). Historia vegetacional del bosque andino de Araucaria
592	araucana (Molina) K. Koch, en la cuenca del Alto Valle del río Biobío, Provincia de
593	Lonquimay, Chile centro-sur, durante el Holoceno. Análisis palinológico del perfil
594	Miraflores2. Zentralblatt für Geologie und Paläontologie, 1, 1041-1051.
595	Scott, A. C., Bowman, D. M., Bond, W. J., Pyne, S. J. & Alexander, M. E. (2013). Fire on
596	earth: an introduction. West Sussux, UK: John Wiley & Sons.
597	Tognetti, R., Lombardi, F., Lasserre, B., Battipaglia, G., Saurer, M., Cherubini, P. &
598	Marchetti, M. (2012). Tree-ring responses in Araucaria araucana to two major
599	eruptions of Lonquimay Volcano (Chile). Trees, 26, 1805-1819.
600	Urrutia, R., Araneda, A., Cruces, F., Torres, L., Chirinos, L., Treutler, H.C., Fagel, N.,
601	Bertrand, S., Alvial, I. & Barra, R. (2007). Changes in diatom, pollen, and chironomid
602	assemblages in response to a recent volcanic event in Lake Galletué (Chilean Andes).
603	Limnologica-Ecology and Management of Inland Waters, 37, 49-62.
604	Veblen, T. T. (1982). Regeneration patterns in Araucaria araucana forests in Chile. Journal
605	of Biogeography, 9, 11-28.
606	Webb III, T. (1986). Is vegetation in equalibrium with climate? How to interpret late-
607	Quaternary pollen data. Vegetatio, 67, 75–91.
608	Whitlock, C. & Larsen, C. (2001). Charcoal as a fire proxy. In J. P. Smol, H. J. B. Birks, &
609	W. M. Last (Eds.), Tracking environmental change using lake sediments Vol. 3,
610	Terrestrial, algal, and Siliceous Indicators(pp. 75-97). Dordrecht: Kluwer Academic
611	Publishers
612	Wilmshurst, J. M. & McGlone, M. S. (1996). Forest disturbance in the central North Island,
613	New Zealand, following the 1850 BP Taupo eruption. The Holocene, 6, 399-411.

Wright, H. E. Jr. (1991). Coring tips. Journal of Palaeolimnology, 6, 37-49. 614

615

623

Biosketch: 616

- B. Dickson is a palaeoecologist interested in understanding long-term vegetation dynamics in 617
- floristically diverse environments. She specialises in analysing palaeorecords preserved in 618
- speleothems and lacustrine sediments. She is currently completing her PhD research. 619
- 620 Author contributions: M.-S.F and B.D conceived ideas for this research; B.D. and M.-S.F collected and analysed data; M.-S.F. led the writing of the manuscript; T.L.H. contributed to 621
- manuscript writing, editing and supplementary data analysis; P.I.M. contributed to 622 manuscript editing and the formation of the project.
 - Author Man









Axis 1 (40.87% variance explained)





