1	
2	Article Type: Article
3	Running head: Controls on otolith chemistry
4	
5	Title: Coupling biogeochemical tracers with fish growth reveals physiological and
6	environmental controls on otolith chemistry
7	
8	Gretchen L. Grammer ^{1*} , John R. Morrongiello ² , Christopher Izzo ^{1,3} , Peter J. Hawthorne ⁴ ,
9	John F. Middleton ⁴ , and Bronwyn M. Gillanders ¹
10	
11	¹ Southern Seas Ecology Laboratories, School of Biological Sciences, The University of
12	Adelaide, SA 5005, Australia
13	² School of BioSciences, The University of Melbourne, VIC 3010, Australia
14	³ Fisheries Research and Development Corporation, Adelaide, SA 5000, Australia
15	⁴ South Australian Research and Development Institute (Aquatic Sciences), West Beach, SA
16	5024, Australia
17	
18	* Corresponding Author. Email: gretchen.grammer@sa.gov.au. Current affiliation: South
19	Australian Research and Development Institute (Aquatic Sciences), 2 Hamra Ave., West
20	Beach, SA 5024, Australia
21	
22	
23	Abstract:
24	Biogeochemical tracers found in the hard parts of organisms are frequently used to answer
25	key ecological questions by linking the organism with the environment. However, the
26	biogeochemical relationship between the environment and the biogenic structure becomes
27	less predictable in higher organisms as physiological processes become more complex. Here,
28	we use the simultaneous combination of biogeochemical tracers and fish growth analyzed
	This is the author manuscript accepted for publication and has undergone full peer review but
	has not been through the copyediting, typesetting, pagination and proofreading process, which
	may lead to differences between this version and the <u>Version of Record</u> . Please cite this article
	as doi: 10.1002/ecm.1264

29 with a novel modeling framework to describe physiological and environmental controls on 30 otolith chemistry in an upwelling zone. First, we develop increasingly complex univariate 31 mixed models to describe and partition intrinsic (age effects) and extrinsic (environmental 32 parameters) factors influencing fish growth and otolith element concentrations through time. 33 Second, we use a multivariate mixed model to investigate the directionality and strength 34 between element-to-element and growth relationships and test hypotheses regarding 35 physiological and environmental controls on element assimilation in otoliths. We apply these 36 models to continuous element (Na, Sr, Mg, Ba, Li) and growth increment profiles (monthly 37 resolution over 17 years) derived from otoliths of reef ocean perch (Helicolenus percoides), a 38 wild-caught, site-attached, fully marine fish. With a conceptual model, we hypothesize that 39 otolith traits (elements and growth) driven by environmental conditions will correlate both 40 within an otolith, reflecting the time dependency of growth and element assimilation, and 41 among individuals that experience a similar set of external conditions. We found some 42 elements (Sr:Ca and Na:Ca) are mainly controlled by physiological processes, while other 43 elements (Ba:Ca and Li:Ca) are more environmentally influenced. Within an individual fish, 44 the strength and direction of correlation varies among otolith traits, particularly those under 45 environmental control. Correlations among physiologically regulated elements tend to be 46 stronger than those primarily controlled by environmental drivers. Surprisingly, only Ba:Ca 47 and growth are significantly correlated among individuals. Failure to appropriately account 48 for intrinsic effects (e.g. age) led to inflated estimates of among individual correlations and a 49 depression of within individual correlations. Together, the lack of among-individual 50 correlations of otolith traits in properly formulated models and the biases that can be 51 introduced by not including appropriate intrinsic covariates suggest that caution is needed 52 when assuming multi-elemental signatures are reflective solely of shared environments.

- 53
- 54
- Key words: bioarchive, biogeochemical, growth, microchemistry, fish, otolith, physiology,
 sclerochronology, sclerochemistry, mixed effects modeling, upwelling, *Helicolenus*
- 57

58 Introduction:

59 How does environmental variation influence a species' biology? Can we use this insight to

60 hindcast past conditions and forecast future states? These are key ecological questions asked

61 by many researchers, but to answer them we need to address two fundamental points: 1) data 62 must be collected at the appropriate resolution and spatio-temporal scale; and 2) 63 measurements need to actually inform the question at hand. Biogeochemical tracers (e.g. 64 trace elements, stable isotopes, chemical pollutants, lipids) are commonly used to make the 65 link between an organism and the environment. There remain, however, a number of outstanding issues around their use in ecological studies because each tracer has a unique set 66 67 of properties, controls and assumptions (Rubenstein and Hobson 2004, Ramos and González-68 Solís 2012). Furthermore, different tracers reflect different biological/ecological processes. 69 Thus, it is desirable to simultaneously measure multiple biogeochemical tracers as well as the 70 effects of growth or other physiological factors to allow for synergistic interactions to be 71 explored and understood (Ethier et al. 2010, Ramos and González-Solís 2012, Cresson et al. 72 2015).

73

74 Elements are frequently used as biogeochemical tracers in biogenic structures to make 75 inferences about past environments (e.g. Montaggioni et al. 2006, Batenburg et al. 2011) or 76 organismal movement across environmental gradients (e.g. Parrish et al. 1983, Elsdon and 77 Gillanders 2003a, Ethier et al. 2014). Key assumptions underpinning these corollaries rely on 78 the predictability of element assimilation relative to the surrounding environment and 79 minimal or constant influence of biological effects ('vital effects'). However, the 80 biogeochemical relationship between the environment and the biogenic structure becomes 81 less predictable in higher organisms as physiological processes become more complex (Weiner and Dove 2003, Stanley 2006, Cusack and Freer 2008). 82

83

84 Understanding and accounting for physiological processes allow biological and 85 environmental influences on element assimilation to be disentangled and the tracer to become 86 ecologically useful. Early research on otoliths (fish earstones) from the 1980s and 1990s 87 focused on differentiating the effects of biological and environmental controls upon element 88 composition (Kalish 1989, 1991, Campana 1999). Recently, there has been renewed interest 89 in this area (e.g. Sturrock et al. 2014, Sturrock et al. 2015), as complex and conflicting results 90 have been revealed between otolith chemistry and ambient water (Thresher 1999, Elsdon et 91 al. 2008, Brown and Severin 2009). These issues need to be resolved if we are to have 92 confidence in the use of otolith chemistry as an environmental proxy. 93

94 Fish otoliths are biogenic structures readily accessible in almost every aquatic environment.

- 95 These structures contain growth increments that can be time resolved, making them one of
- 96 the most extensively studied calcified structures of a higher organism. Distinct

97 biogeochemical (here-after referred to as chemistry or chemical) profiles found in otoliths are

assumed to reflect the fish's ambient environment (e.g. Elsdon and Gillanders 2002, 2003b,

99 de Vries et al. 2005). Otolith chemical profiles are widely used as natural tags to examine

100 stock structure, population connectivity, and movement patterns through different aquatic

- 101 environments (e.g. Gillanders 2002, Elsdon and Gillanders 2003a, Reis-Santos et al. 2013).
- 102 They are also used as paleoproxies to infer past environments (Disspain et al. 2011, Disspain

103 et al. 2015, Izzo et al. 2016).

104

105 Otoliths are encapsulated in the fish's head, surrounded by endolymph, and are not in direct 106 contact with the environment (Campana 1999). This places a first order limit on the 107 responsiveness of otolith chemistry to variations in ambient water chemistry (Sturrock et al. 108 2014). Fluctuations in the physical environment (e.g. temperature, salinity, current strength) 109 directly affect fish physiology by altering metabolism, respiratory function, osmotic 110 processes, feeding behavior and/or diet (Brett and Groves 1979, Brown et al. 2004, Wootton 111 2011). Likewise, reproduction and growth affect fish physiology, and together these 112 processes can cause otolith chemistry to respond both directly or indirectly to changes in the 113 ambient environment (Walther et al. 2010, Sturrock et al. 2014, Sturrock et al. 2015). 114 Furthermore, the amount of physiological regulation varies between elements and 115 environments. For example, Ba, Mg, and Li in blood plasma of marine fish display the least 116 amount of biological fractionation compared to Sr (Sturrock et al. 2014), and concentrations 117 of Sr:Ca (Sr normalized to Ca) in otoliths are linked to reproductive processes (Kalish 1991, 118 Sturrock et al. 2015). A meta-analysis on Sr:Ca assimilation into otoliths revealed that Sr:Ca 119 incorporation in marine species is more likely to be physiological in nature, but physiological 120 factors have little to no effect on Sr:Ca incorporation in freshwater or diadromous fish species 121 (Brown and Severin 2009).

122

123 Most research examining physiological controls on otoliths is laboratory based and primarily

- 124 targets early life history stages for limited experimental durations (i.e. days to weeks; but see
- 125 Kalish 1991, Sturrock et al. 2014, Sturrock et al. 2015). These experiments likely do not
- 126 capture physiological processes unique to adults, such as reproduction. Moreover, laboratory
- 127 based results may not accurately represent the same responses in wild caught fish (Elsdon and This article is protected by copyright. All rights reserved

Gillanders 2005). Extensive field-based studies that naturally integrate environmental and
physiological processes are therefore required to understand the controls of tracers.

130

131 Here, we develop a conceptual model around element concentrations and growth correlations 132 within a fish's otolith and among different fish inhabiting the same marine environment (Figure 1). We consider the minor elements of Na, Sr and trace elements of Mg, Ba, and Li 133 134 (all normalized to Ca). We propose, underpinned by current understanding, that certain 135 elements assimilated into otoliths are primarily under physiological control, environmental 136 control or both. We hypothesize that Na:Ca and Sr:Ca will be predominantly influenced by 137 an individual's physiology, while Ba:Ca and Li:Ca would be primarily affected by 138 environmental parameters (Figure 1). We also predict growth rate and Mg:Ca would be 139 moderately influenced by both physiology and the environment. It is likely that there will be 140 stronger correlations within physiological or environmental variables (elements or growth), 141 but less so between the two groups due to the different controls on element assimilation or 142 growth. Furthermore, the level at which correlation occurs (within or among individuals) will 143 vary among physiologically and environmentally controlled variables. Those elements most 144 influenced by physiological processes, such as reproduction or metabolic processes, are 145 expected to be correlated within an otolith as they reflect processes intrinsic to the individual 146 ('vital effects'). Conversely, variables driven by environmental conditions will correlate both 147 within an otolith, reflecting the time dependency of growth and element assimilation, and 148 among individual fish that experience a similar set of external conditions (Figure 1).

149

150 We test these hypotheses using the reef ocean perch (Helicolenus percoides (Richardson, 151 1842); here after referred to as 'ocean perch'), a long-lived, benthic fish found in continental 152 marine waters of southern Australia and New Zealand. We focused on this species for both 153 biological (i.e. longevity, non-migratory, benthic, fully marine) and environmental reasons. 154 Ocean perch for this study were collected from a region dominated by seasonal upwelling 155 (Figure 2a). Upwelling is a wind-driven, oceanographic process that brings cold, nutrient-156 rich, deep-water masses to the ocean's surface (Botsford et al. 2003). Upwelled waters 157 typically leave distinctive elemental signatures in biological carbonates due to differences in 158 water mass chemistry and associated links to primary productivity (e.g. coral: Lea et al. 1989, 159 otoliths: Kingsford et al. 2009, mollusks: Hatch et al. 2013). For example, where sources of 160 upwelled water are enriched with Ba from deep water (e.g. Galapagos Island, outer Great 161 Barrier Reef, central California coast), coral skeletons (Lea et al. 1989, Walther et al. 2013) This article is protected by copyright. All rights reserved

and otoliths (Kingsford et al. 2009, Woodson et al. 2013) show spikes in concentrations of
Ba:Ca during upwelling periods. Coastal upwelling events along Australia's southern coast
are distinct, seasonal occurrences (austral summer: December to March; Middleton and Bye
2007) that provide much needed nutrients to the oligotrophic waters of this region (Nieblas et
al. 2009, van Ruth et al. 2010).

167

168 We first develop a series of increasingly complex, univariate mixed-effects models to partition variation in otolith elemental concentration or growth between intrinsic (e.g. 169 170 individual, age) and extrinsic (e.g. local upwelling, temperature) drivers (Weisberg et al. 171 2010, Morrongiello and Thresher 2015). We apply these models to continuous, multi-year, 172 otolith chemistry and otolith growth increment profiles derived from our test species, a wild-173 caught, site-attached, fully marine fish. We then develop a novel multivariate mixed-effect 174 model, based on the univariate models, to generate estimates of between element/growth 175 correlations within and among individuals and investigate the strength and directionality of 176 those relationships. These estimates are conditional on intrinsic effects. We use the strong, 177 local upwelling signal as an extrinsic cue to explore synergistic effects of age and 178 environment on chemical assimilation into the otolith and on fish growth.

179

180 Methods:

181 Oceanographic setting & study species

182 In the southeastern Indian Ocean, upwelling occurs along the Bonney Coast of southern 183 Australia in the austral summer as two to four upwelling events, each lasting three to ten days 184 in duration, interspersed by episodes of weak downwelling and surface water mixing (Kämpf 185 et al. 2004, Middleton and Bye 2007). These upwelling areas are wind-forced and influenced 186 by the Flinders Current flowing westward along the shelf-slope of southern Australia 187 (Middleton and Bye 2007). The Flinders Current results from wind curl stress and the 188 equatorward Sverdrup transport of water in the Southern Ocean; it is similar to larger western 189 boundary currents but is part of a northern boundary current system that produces upwelling 190 areas (Middleton and Cirano 2002, Middleton and Bye 2007). A reversal in current strength 191 occurs in the winter months of southern Australia where an eastward flowing current, the 192 Leeuwin Current, becomes dominant and produces downwelling. Both the Flinders and 193 Leeuwin Current systems are wind-dominated, which causes the seasonal strengthening or 194 weakening of either current system (Middleton and Bye 2007, James and Bone 2011). 195

- 196 Ocean perch were collected from the upwelling area along the Bonney Coast of southern
- Australia (near 37°40'S, 139°50'E; Figure 2a) at depths between 43 and 119 m (mean: 80 m).
- 198 Ocean perch are lecithotrophic (live bearing; Pavlov and Emel'yanova 2013) and demersal as
- both juveniles and adults (Park 1993, Smith et al. 2009). Juveniles and adults are
- 200 benthopelagic omnivores (Bulman et al. 2001) with ontogenetic diet shifts from smaller
- 201 crustaceans (mysids and galatheids) to larger crustaceans (scampi and two-spine crab; Horn
- et al. 2012). Benthic fish and salps (carcasses as food-fall; Henschke et al. 2013) are also
- 203 important dietary components for all ages (Bulman et al. 2001, Horn et al. 2012).
- 204

205 Otolith preparation

Ocean perch were caught from October 2011 to January 2013 and ranged in size from 160 to 344 mm total length (TL). Sagittal otoliths were removed from the fish, cleaned in ultrapure water and stored dry. One otolith from each fish was embedded in epoxy resin, transversely thin sectioned to include the primordium, polished with lapping film, and mounted on a microscope slide using thermoplastic cement (Figure 2b). Both the epoxy resin and thermoplastic cement were spiked with indium chloride as an indicator of those substances. Slides were cleaned in ultrapure water and air dried.

213

214 Analysis of elemental otolith chemistry

215 Concentrations of elements were measured in the otolith from the core to the proximal, dorsal edge (Figure 2b) using a Resonetics M-50-LR 193nm Excimer laser ablation system coupled 216 to an Agilent 7700cx quadrupole ICP-MS (housed at Adelaide Microscopy, The University 217 of Adelaide). The laser was operated at a scan speed of $4 \,\mu m \cdot s^{-1}$ with a frequency of 10 Hz 218 using a 33 µm diameter to produce continuous laser transects across the otoliths. Prior to each 219 220 ablation, background levels of elements in the ablation chamber were measured for 30 s and a 221 pre-ablation path 45 µm diameter was made. Instrument drift and precision was measured by 222 analyzing a reference standard (NIST 612) after about every 10 samples and a carbonate 223 standard (MACS 3; US Geological Survey) at the beginning and end of each laser session (≈5 224 hrs). Dual transects were ablated on each otolith to allow the laser to be optimized for higher 225 and lower concentration elements (Figure 2b). Higher concentration elements measured were 23 Na (dwell time: 50 ms), 88 Sr (100 ms), 24 Mg (100 ms) and 138 Ba (100 ms). 7 Li (150 ms) was 226 the only lower concentration element measured. For both transects, 43 Ca (5 ms), 44 Ca (5 ms) 227 and ¹¹⁵In (high concentration: 10 ms; low concentration: 5 ms) were also measured to 228

- 229 produce element:Ca ratios and confirm otolith material was constantly ablated. Precision,
- 230 calculated as the mean coefficients of variation (CV) of repeated measures, for all elements
- based on the NIST 612 standard was <1%. Precision for the higher concentration elements
- based on the MACS 3 standard was <3.1% and <1% for the lower concentration element, Li.
- Raw data were processed using GLITTER software (Griffin et al. 2008) and all elements
- were normalized to Ca and presented as element:Ca (mmol/mol).
- 235
- 236 Monthly resolution of growth increments and element: Ca profiles

237 Ablated otolith sections (n = 38) were viewed with a compound microscope and digital 238 camera system (\times 87.5 magnification; Leica DFC320 digital camera) for age interpretation 239 and growth increment measurement. Along each ablation path, the annual growth increments 240 were marked and measured (in mm; Image-Pro Plus v. 7.0, Media Cybernetics); then, the 241 hyaline and opaque zones were measured within each annual increment. The proportion of hyaline to opaque material within an annual growth increment was about 50%. We 242 243 designated the hyaline growth zone as forming from November to March (5 months) and the 244 opaque zones as being deposited from April to October (7 months). These timeframes are 245 based on ocean perch age data from age validations (Paul and Horn 2009), marginal 246 increment analysis (Park 1993), and the status of the otolith's marginal edge at the time of 247 capture in the current study. Ages of ocean perch have been validated and each annual growth 248 increment is comprised of one opaque growth zone and one hyaline growth zone (Paul and Horn 2009). Ocean perch from the Bonney Upwelling region were assigned a birthdate of 249 October 1 based on the peak spawning season (September to November) of ocean perch in 250 251 southeastern Australia (Park 1993).

252

253 We assigned each annual growth increment a year relative to the date of capture taking into 254 account the marginal increment. Then, starting at the outer edge of the opaque core region 255 (represents transition of growth at end of fish's first winter; Paul and Horn 2009) and 256 progressing towards the otolith's edge, the hyaline and opaque zones were resolved to 257 monthly increments by dividing the total measurement of each zone by its corresponding 258 number of months, e.g. hyaline measurement divided by five months or opaque measurement 259 divided by seven months. The element: Ca transect data were resolved in a similar fashion. 260 Since the laser was operated in a time resolved mode, we used the scan speed ($\mu m \cdot s^{-1}$) to 261 convert each time dated element: Ca data point (s) to a distance measurement (μ m). Next, we 262 aligned these data to the growth increment measurements using the otolith edge as the This article is protected by copyright. All rights reserved

263 reference point to assign appropriate years. Finally, we resolved the element: Ca data to monthly increments as above, starting at the outer edge of the opaque core region and 264 265 progressing outwards. The element: Ca transect data and growth measurements were trimmed 266 to only include years 2 to 7 (maximum). This allowed certainty of the starting point of the 267 data when resolving to monthly increments (year 2 begins at the edge of opaque core region) and provided at least two element: Ca data points for each month. Generally after year 7, the 268 width of the monthly growth increment decreased to the point where the laser scan speed, 269 270 coupled with the ablation diameter, was equal to or greater than that increment width. 271 Because growth was resolved to monthly increments on both the low concentration and high 272 concentration elemental transects, these measurements were averaged and combined into one 273 growth transect (Growth) for subsequent analyses. Data collected from at least five fish made 274 up each monthly time increment for all element: Ca and growth increment profiles (number of 275 fish contributing to a time increment: mean: 11, max: 17).

276

277 Univariate mixed modeling to estimate intrinsic and extrinsic variation

278 We developed six univariate mixed models for the monthly resolved element: Ca (Na:Ca, 279 Sr:Ca, Mg:Ca, Ba:Ca, Li:Ca) and growth (Growth) data extracted from the otoliths to 280 examine relationships with upwelling events. These models enabled us to partition monthly 281 variation of the response variables (Na:Ca, Sr:Ca, Mg:Ca, Ba:Ca, Li:Ca or Growth) between 282 intrinsic (e.g. age) and extrinsic (e.g. upwelling index) drivers (Weisberg et al. 2010, 283 Morrongiello et al. 2014). The intrinsic covariates were fish age in months (Age) and age in 284 months at capture (*age.month.cap*), whilst extrinsic variables describe monthly characteristics 285 of upwelling: an upwelling index (Bonney UI), bottom temperature (Bottom Temp) and levels 286 of chlorophyll a (Chl-a) (full descriptions in Table 1). As expected from upwelling physics, 287 the *Bonney UI* correlated negatively with *Bottom Temp* (r: -0.410, p<0.001) and positively 288 with Chl-a (r: 0.340, p<0.001); Chl-a was negatively correlated with Bottom Temp (r: -0.320, 289 *p*<0.001).

290

Following the two-stage procedure of Morrongiello and Thresher (2015), we first developed a series of linear mixed-effect models that combined fixed intrinsic variables (*Age*,

293 *age.month.cap*) with different random effect structures in a hierarchical manner to isolate

sources of variation in otolith element concentrations or fish growth (Table 2). Second, we

introduced extrinsic environmental variables into the resulting best models to relate the

296 observed variability to the environment. We used R 3.0.3 with the packages of 'lme4' ('lmer' This article is protected by copyright. All rights reserved 297 function; Bates et al. 2014), 'effects' (Fox et al. 2014), and 'AICcmodavg' (Mazerolle 2015) 298 to perform model analyses (R Development Core Team 2014), and the 'Hmisc' package 299 ('rcorr' function; Harrell 2014) to compare among upwelling variables with pairwise 300 Pearson's correlation coefficients. All response variables and Age were natural-log 301 transformed to meet model assumptions of normality and homogeneity of variance, and fixed 302 predictor variables were mean centered to assist model convergence (Morrongiello et al. 303 2014, Morrongiello and Thresher 2015). Akaike's Information Criterion (AIC) corrected for 304 small sample sizes (AICc) was used to test relative support for each model (Burnham and Anderson 2004). We also used marginal and conditional R^2 metrics for mixed effects models 305 (Nakagawa and Schielzeth 2013, Johnson 2014) to estimate the proportion of variance for 306 307 fixed effects alone and combined fixed and random effects, respectively.

308

309 The element: Ca and growth data were comprised of repeated monthly measures (element 310 concentrations or growth increment width) from each individual across multiple years. 311 Random effects structures (n = 4; Table 2) contained random intercepts for *FishID* and *Month* 312 (see Table 1 for descriptions) in combination with random slopes for Age. Random intercepts 313 for FishID and Month induce correlation among measurements within an individual and 314 correlation among element concentrations or growth increments assimilated in the same 315 month per year, respectively. Individual element concentration or growth was allowed to vary 316 in comparison to the model average by using a *FishID* random intercept. Likewise, a random 317 *Month* intercept gives temporally resolved (month per year) estimates of whether extrinsic 318 drivers provided good or poor conditions for element assimilation or growth relative to the 319 long term mean (Morrongiello et al. 2014, Morrongiello and Thresher 2015). Random slopes 320 for Age enabled the fixed effect Age - element: Ca or Growth relationship to vary among 321 individuals and among months per year. Random Age slopes for each fish permit a distinct 322 age-dependent element assimilation or growth trajectory while still inferring an age response 323 for the population. Similarly, a random Age slope for Month allows for age-dependent 324 responses to environmental effects through time (Morrongiello et al. 2014, Morrongiello and 325 Thresher 2015).

326

327 The best random effect structures for the six response variables were selected by adding all

328 fixed intrinsic effects (*Age*, *age.month.cap*) to each possible random effects structure and

329 fitting the models using restricted maximum likelihood estimates of error (REML). The most

330 complex intrinsic effect model took the form:

331

$$y_{ijkl} = \alpha_0 + \alpha_i^F + \alpha_k^M + \beta_1 x_{ij} + b_{1i}^F x_{ij} + b_{1k}^M x_{jk} + \beta_2 x_l + \varepsilon_{ijk}$$
Eqn. 1
$$\begin{bmatrix} \alpha_i^F \\ b_{1i}^F \end{bmatrix} \sim N(0, \Sigma_i), \qquad \begin{bmatrix} \alpha_k^M \\ b_{1k}^M \end{bmatrix} \sim N(0, \Sigma_k), \qquad \varepsilon_{ijk} \sim N(0, \sigma^2)$$

332

333 where y_{ijkl} is a response variable measurement for fish *i* at age *j* from month *k*, caught at age 334 (*age.month.cap*) *l*. α_0 is the overall mean monthly response intercept, α_i^F is the random 335 intrinsic effect for fish *i*, and α_k^Y is the random extrinsic environmental effect for month *k*. β_1 336 is the fixed effect *Age* coefficient, β_2 is the fixed effect *age.month.cap* coefficient, and b_{1i}^F 337 and b_{1k}^M are random *Age* slopes for fish *i* and month *k* respectively.

338

Next, the fixed effect structures of either Age or Age + age.month.cap were fit to the best 339 340 random effects structure (from above) for each response variable with maximum likelihood 341 estimates of error (ML). Each candidate set of models were compared with $\Delta AICc$ values. 342 Then, unbiased parameter estimates were produced for each response variable by refitting the 343 best ranked models with REML (Zuur et al. 2009). We estimated the temporal synchrony of 344 element assimilation or growth across individuals by calculating the intraclass correlation 345 coefficient (ICC). The ICC model contained random intercepts for both FishID and Month, 346 but a random Age slope was only included for FishID to ensure interpretability of the Month 347 variance component (Morrongiello and Thresher 2015). Finally, we added the upwelling specific, environmental covariates (Bonney UI, Bottom Temp, Chl-a; Table 1) to each optimal 348 349 model to assess extrinsic effects within and among the response variables. We also tested for 350 Age specific responses of elements or growth for each environmental covariate by fitting 351 interaction terms.

352

353 Multivariate mixed modeling to estimate within and among individual correlations

Because the six response variables represent repeated measures of multiple elements and growth within the same otolith of each fish, it is of interest to estimate correlations among these otolith 'traits' both within and among individuals (response variables here after are referred to as traits). These relationships could be directional (i.e. changes in element x causes proportional changes in element y) or reflective of a common response to a physiological or environmental driver. Within and among otolith trait correlations therefore allows us to estimate the strength of relationships between the elements themselves, as well 361 as growth, and begin linking these to either physiology (intrinsic effects), the environment (extrinsic effects) or both. It is important to note that the six traits (elements: n = 5; growth: n 362 363 = 1) are dependent on the same intrinsic and extrinsic drivers at a given time and are not 364 independent of one another. Whilst among-individual correlations can be based on average 365 trait values for each individual derived from the series of univariate models outlined above, these values will be biased due to unaccounted-for within-individual variation and do not 366 367 properly account for uncertainty around element: Ca or growth estimates (Hadfield et al. 2010, Dingemanse and Dochtermann 2013). Furthermore, such an approach precludes 368 369 estimating trait correlation within otoliths (e.g. is an increase or decrease in a particular 370 element related to a period of high or low growth during a fish's lifetime). Multivariate 371 mixed-effects models avoid these limitations and allow for the concordant estimation of both 372 within- and among-individual trait variation across multiple traits (Dingemanse and 373 Dochtermann 2013).

374

375 We used a multivariate mixed effects linear model fitted in the 'MCMCglmm' package of R 376 (Hadfield 2010) which applies a Bayesian approach to estimate variance-covariance matrices 377 within individuals (I) and among individuals (R) for all six traits (bold font denotes 378 matrices). These matrices were then used to generate point estimates and 95% credible 379 intervals for each pair-wise within- and among-individual otolith trait correlation; credible 380 intervals that do not overlap zero indicate statistical 'significance'. Multivariate mixed 381 models fit with MCMCglmm can cope with missing response values, which was beneficial as 382 not all otolith traits were measured at each point along an otolith transect (e.g. Li could not be monthly resolved past age 7 due to decreasing otolith growth increment widths and 383 384 limitations of the laser ablation ICP-MS system).

385

386 Similar to univariate analyses, traits were natural log-transformed where necessary to meet 387 assumptions of multivariate normality. They were then standardized (observation-mean/SD) 388 to ensure similar scales, which aids model convergence and parameter interpretation. Our 389 first multivariate mixed model generated conditional correlation estimates (conditioned on 390 intrinsic effects) and included fixed effects for trait-specific Age (natural log-transformed) 391 and trait-specific age.month.cap terms to account for intrinsic effects on growth and element 392 assimilation into the otolith (Table 1). In all univariate models, a random effect structure 393 allowing for individual- and month-specific differences in the Age coefficient performed best 394 (Table 2). We therefore used this random effect structure here as well, adding the additional This article is protected by copyright. All rights reserved

- 395 complexity that these individual and month random slopes could vary across elements (e.g.
- an individual might have a steeper than average Na:Ca-age relationship but a shallower than
- 397 average growth-age relationship). We then developed a second multivariate mixed model to
- 398 explore the implications of ignoring intrinsic effects (i.e. *Age* and *age.month.cap* terms
- 399 excluded) when estimating within and among individual correlations amongst otolith traits.
- 400

We used parameter expanded priors (Hadfield 2010), ran our model for 110,000 iterations with a burn-in phase of 10,000 and a thinning interval of 25. This resulted in a well-mixed chain, no autocorrelation and a sample size of 4,000 values for each estimate. The assumption of multivariate normality was satisfied with visual inspection of the model's marginal residuals (A). We provide R code and data sets for the univariate and multivariate models in the Supplement.

407

408 **Results:**

409 Sources of element: Ca and growth variation

410 The most strongly supported random effects structure for all otolith traits included a random 411 Age slope on both FishID and Month (Table 2), which means the element: Ca - age and 412 Growth - age relationships vary among individual fish and months. For Sr:Ca, Ba:Ca and 413 Li:Ca, the best fixed effects structure included both Age and age.month.cap terms, while 414 Na:Ca, Mg:Ca and growth included Age only (Table 3). Growth, Ba:Ca, Na:Ca, Mg:Ca and 415 Li:Ca all decreased with age, while Sr:Ca increased with age (Table 3, Figure 3). Older fish 416 at capture had higher overall levels of Ba:Ca and Sr:Ca than younger fish (positive 417 age.month.cap slope), while the negative age.month.cap slope seen in Li:Ca indicated that 418 younger fish had overall higher Li:Ca levels than older fish (Table 3). These differences 419 suggest older fish most likely have experienced slightly different environmental/dietary 420 conditions during the earlier years of their lives than the younger fish have experienced 421 during that same portion of their own lives. Power functions fit to element: Ca - age and 422 Growth - age relationships (to facilitate comparison with other studies) estimated assimilation/growth rates (AR: µmol·mol⁻¹·month⁻¹; GR: µm/month) for ocean perch (Figure 423 424 3).

- 425
- 426 Random variability around mean *element: Ca* or *Growth* was greatest among fish (*FishID*)
- 427 followed by among months (*Month*) (Table 3). *Element: Ca* or *Growth Age* slopes had the
- 428 highest variation among individuals followed by variation among months. All *element:Ca* This article is protected by copyright. All rights reserved

429 data displayed negative correlations between the *Month* random intercept and *Age* slope, signifying that younger fish assimilate higher concentrations of elements compared to older 430 431 fish when conditions are favorable for element assimilation (older fish assimilate relatively 432 higher concentrations than younger fish when conditions are less favorable for element 433 assimilation; Table 3). A positive correlation between the *Month* random intercept and 434 *Growth* - Age slope (slopes are shallower at higher intercepts) indicates older fish are 435 growing proportionally better than younger fish during months of good growth (younger fish 436 grow better in poor times). Random Age slopes of the otolith traits were positively correlated 437 with FishID, meaning there is variation in growth or element assimilation across individuals 438 (larger FishID effects lead to greater growth variation across individuals). Element 439 assimilation of Na:Ca and Sr:Ca varied the least across individuals as they aged (corr: 0.470 440 and 0.330, respectively), whereas Ba:Ca and Li:Ca varied the most (corr: 0.220 and 0.200, 441 respectively). When compared to element assimilation, growth varied moderately across 442 individuals (corr: 0.310).

443

Patterns of temporal variation in all otolith traits (extracted from the *Month* random effect
term) were cyclical (Figure 4). Na:Ca and Sr:Ca varied the least through time, but displayed
clear periodicity. The amount of synchrony seen in each element among individuals in each
month ranged from a low ICC of 1.74% (Mg:Ca) to a high of 5.08% (Na:Ca) (Table 3).
Growth had the highest ICC of 8.50%, although these estimates are conservative as the best
intrinsic effects models included random age slopes for *FishID* and *Month*.

450

451 *Relating temporal variation of element: Ca and growth data to environmental parameters* 452 Upwelling-specific environmental covariates improved all intrinsic effect models (Table 4). 453 The upwelling index with an age interaction (Age * Bonney UI) best explained variation for 454 Na:Ca, Sr:Ca and growth (Table 4). The upwelling index alone (Bonney UI) best explained 455 variation for Ba:Ca and Mg:Ca, and chlorophyll-a (Chl-a) concentrations significantly 456 improved model fit for Li:Ca (Table 4). Na:Ca, Mg:Ca, and Ba:Ca concentrations were all 457 significantly and negatively related to the upwelling index; in contrast, Sr:Ca and growth 458 were significantly and positively related to the upwelling index (Table 4, Figures 5a-c, g, i). 459 Li:Ca was positively related to monthly chlorophyll-a concentrations (Figure 5h). 460

The elemental concentrations of younger fish showed a steeper rate of change over the range
 of environmental variables experienced by fish, suggesting younger fish increase or decrease
 This article is protected by copyright. All rights reserved

463 element assimilation more rapidly than older fish (Figure 5d-f, j, k). This pattern was
464 reversed when comparing growth at a given age with the upwelling index. Very young fish
465 grew consistently fast across all upwelling conditions, while older fish proportionally
466 increased their growth rate when upwelling increased (Figure 5l).

467

468 *Estimating within and among individual correlations with multivariate mixed models*

469 Within individual correlations of otolith traits revealed the strength and direction of

470 relationships between the otolith traits (Figure 6a; Appendix S1: Table S1). Growth was

471 weakly correlated with Na:Ca (0.130), Sr:Ca (-0.137), and Mg:Ca (0.128) (Figure 6a;

472 Appendix S1: Table S1), whereas no significant correlation existed between growth and

473 Ba:Ca or Li:Ca within an individual. A moderate, negative correlation was found between

474 Na:Ca and Sr:Ca (-0.396). Mg:Ca was moderately correlated with Ba:Ca (0.313) and weakly

475 correlated with Na:Ca (0.267). Very weak correlations existed between other pairs of traits

476 (Figure 6a; Appendix S1: Table S1).

477

When comparing otolith traits among individuals, only Ba:Ca and growth were significantly correlated (-0.410; Figure 6a; Appendix S1: Table S2). This suggests that individuals with overall higher growth generally have lower Ba:Ca, but this relationship was not found between monthly increments measured within an individual otolith. All other otolith traits were not correlated among individuals (Figure 6a; Appendix S1: Table S2).

483

484 Within individual correlations from the model excluding *Age* and *age.month.cap* were 485 qualitatively similar to those from the more complex model (Figure 6b, Appendix S1: Table 486 S3). The biggest differences were evident among individuals where all 15 correlations were 487 atrenally significant (> +0.8. Figure 6a, Appendix S1: Table S4)

487 strongly significant (> \pm 0.8, Figure 6c, Appendix S1: Table S4).

488

489 **Discussion:**

Otolith chemistry and fish growth displayed clear cyclic seasonal signals over a 17 year period in a marine system. Age-dependent relationships existed in the element:Ca and growth profiles, and responses to the environment differed as the fish aged. Temporal signals were correlated with seasonal upwelling events. Since elemental concentrations and growth were measured simultaneously within the otolith, direct comparisons among otolith traits, both within and among individual fish, were made through time. Multivariate mixed modeling revealed the strength and direction of relationships between element:Ca and growth and This article is protected by copyright. All rights reserved

- 497 supported our conceptual model hypothesizing physiological-environmental controls on
- 498 otolith chemistry. We found that within-individual correlations among physiologically
- 499 regulated elements were generally stronger than those primarily controlled by environmental
- 500 drivers. We also showed that failing to account for intrinsic effects resulted in inflated and
- 501 biased estimates of among individual growth and element correlations.
- 502

503 Sources of intrinsic variation in element: Ca and growth

504 Age-related responses differed with each element: Ca and growth in ocean perch otoliths. The 505 rate of element assimilation decreased as the fish aged for four of the five elements (except 506 Sr:Ca), and growth rate also decreased with age, as is typical in most fish species. Age-507 related assimilation rates of elements should therefore be considered when reconstructing 508 migratory histories, and as we have demonstrated, this is easily done through the use of 509 univariate models that include age components as intrinsic effects to avoid the occurrence of 510 age-dependent biases. Age-related responses are evident for many biogeochemical tracers 511 and are quite valuable when aptly used. For example, to establish lifetime foraging patterns in 512 avian species, stable isotope values in the blood and feathers of chicks are used to validate 513 and interpret isotopic signatures found in immature and adult birds (Cherel and Hobson 2007, 514 Cherel et al. 2014, Weimerskirch et al. 2014). Similarly, ontogenetic growth patterns in 515 claws, hair, teeth, and bone of mammals allow stable isotopes or trace elements extracted 516 from these tissues to be used to examine patterns of migration or foraging behavior (e.g. van 517 der Merwe et al. 1990, Drucker et al. 2008, Ethier et al. 2014). Knowing metabolic turnover 518 rates or deposition rates of tissues and the rate of integration of the biogeochemical tracer 519 over an organism's life time are integral for framing ecological deductions within appropriate 520 time scales (Ethier et al. 2010, Hobson et al. 2010, Ramos and González-Solís 2012).

521

522 Comparable *element: Ca - age* responses have been reported for other marine fish (Kalish 523 1989, Proctor et al. 1995, Hughes et al. 2015) with very different life history strategies, which 524 suggests that these chemical patterns are a conserved and robust proxy for fish responses to 525 changing ontogeny or environmental conditions. These species (i.e. blue grenadier 526 (Macruronus novaezelandiae), Kalish 1989; Australian salmon (Arripis trutta), Hughes et al. 527 2015; and southern bluefin tuna (Thunnus maccovii), Proctor et al. 1995) inhabit different 528 marine environments (e.g. benthic/continental slope, coastal, or pelagic) and have varied 529 reproductive strategies (e.g. heterochronal or isochronal spawners) compared to ocean perch 530 (benthic/continental shelf and live-bearing) (e.g. Bruce et al. 2002).

531

532 Mg:Ca exhibited the least amount of synchrony between individuals through time. In marine 533 fish, Mg in otoliths is not correlated with either temperature or salinity (as reviewed by 534 Sturrock et al. 2012), but it is correlated with growth rate (Sturrock et al. 2015). Mg is 535 required in many major metabolic pathways (Kaim et al. 2013), and the lack of observed 536 synchrony could reflect individual metabolic processes and growth. Mg:Ca was most closely 537 correlated (negatively) with the upwelling index; therefore, any changes in metabolic rates 538 caused by the environmental fluctuations (e.g. temperature decreases, food resources change) 539 could cause alterations in element assimilation rates. If Mg:Ca incorporation is as 540 individualized as our data suggests, then we would expect the signal to be less synchronous 541 and not correlate as strongly with growth or other elements. Further research and empirical 542 data are needed define causal mechanisms.

543

544 Concentrations of Li:Ca and Ba:Ca showed moderate temporal synchrony compared to the 545 other elements and also displayed seasonal, cyclic signals. Both Li:Ca and Ba:Ca tend to 546 primarily correlate with environmental parameters as opposed to physiological processes, 547 such as reproduction (e.g. Sturrock et al. 2012, Sturrock et al. 2015). However, Ba:Ca has 548 been linked to diet (positive: Sanchez-Jerez et al. 2002, Buckel et al. 2004) and growth rate 549 (negative: Miller 2011, Sturrock et al. 2015). Indeed, dietary sources have been shown to 550 contribute up to 25% of otolith Ba in marine settings (Webb et al. 2012, Izzo et al. 2015).

551

Temporal patterns of element: Ca and growth displayed distinct seasonal trends. Na:Ca and 552 553 Sr:Ca were the most consistent through time and had the highest individual synchrony among 554 the element: Ca traits, but displayed an inverse relationship (i.e. Sr:Ca peaked in 555 spring/summer; Na:Ca peaks in autumn/winter). Na is a physiologically important element 556 (Kalish 1991, Thresher et al. 1994) and fluctuates not with the environment but with 557 osmoregulatory control (Campana 1999). Seasonal sinusoidal patterns in otolith Sr:Ca over 558 shorter time periods have been documented and are attributed to seasonal temperature 559 changes aliased by reproductive physiology or other biological processes (Radtke and Targett 560 1984, Thorrold and Shuttleworth 2000, Hughes et al. 2015). Otolith Sr:Ca levels in plaice 561 (*Pleuronectes platessa*) were highly correlated with physiological processes, particularly 562 reproduction (Sturrock et al. 2015). Ocean perch are live-bearing (Pavlov and Emel'yanova 563 2013) and have a winter reproductive period with fertilization occurring in May/June, 564 followed by gestation through the winter and parturition in October/November (Park 1993). This article is protected by copyright. All rights reserved

The timing of increases in otolith Sr:Ca corresponds with gestation and parturition, and it is possible the seasonal environmental signal (i.e. upwelling) aliases the underlying cause of Sr:Ca fluctuation in ocean perch otoliths. Additional research is required to conclusively define this relationship.

569

570 Environmental influences on element: Ca and growth

571 While age and individual variation accounted for most of the variability seen within the 572 otolith trait profiles, some variation was attributed to environmental parameters. Seasonal 573 upwelling is a key environmental driver of the local ecosystem, and we used this strong 574 environmental signal to examine the otolith elemental composition and growth relationships 575 experienced by a fully marine fish *in situ*. The upwelling process has a 'cascading' effect 576 where multiple changes occur in the environment due to increased wind stress. As deeper 577 water is brought to the surface, salinity and temperature change, and there is an influx of 578 nutrients. The amount of change within the local environment is dependent on the 579 characteristics of the water mass being upwelled in addition to the strength/duration of the 580 wind driving the upwelling event (Bigg 2003). During an upwelling event within the Bonney 581 upwelling system, both temperature and salinity decrease (e.g. temp: $\Delta \ge 4^{\circ}$ C; sal: 35.6 to 582 35.2‰) (Lewis 1981, Middleton and Bye 2007) and chlorophyll-a increases due to nutrient 583 influx (Nieblas et al. 2009, van Ruth et al. 2010). All elements and growth, except Li:Ca, 584 were correlated with the upwelling index as opposed to bottom temperature or chlorophyll-a. 585 There were different directional relationships among the otolith traits with the upwelling 586 index, and these persisted through time.

587

588 Otolith Ba:Ca was negatively related to the Bonney upwelling index and generally displayed 589 maxima during autumn/winter and minima during spring/summer. The opposite relationship, 590 a positive correlation, is seen in carbonate records from other upwelling systems (e.g. coral: 591 Lea et al. 1989, Montaggioni et al. 2006; otoliths: Kingsford et al. 2009). In strong upwelling 592 areas, usually dominated by large continental boundary currents or equatorial currents, waters 593 tend to be Ba enriched due to dissolution of barite in deep ocean water and marine sediments 594 (e.g. Lea and Boyle 1991, Shimmield 2015). Positive relationships between Ba:Ca 595 concentrations of ambient water and those measured in fish otoliths have been well 596 documented (as reviewed in Sturrock et al. 2012). Moreover, otolith Ba:Ca concentrations 597 increase in as little as three days following increased levels of Ba:Ca in seawater (Wheeler et

al. 2016). Therefore, the otolith Ba:Ca profile found in the Bonney upwelling region may
reflect reduced concentrations of Ba of the actual water mass being upwelled and alternative
(non-upwelled) sources of greater Ba input into southern Australian marine waters during the
autumn/winter months.

602

603 Source waters of the Flinders Current (the northern boundary current influencing the Bonney 604 upwelling) are primarily Tasmanian Subantarctic Mode Water (TSAMW) formed in surface 605 waters southwest of Tasmania at $\approx 47^{\circ}$ S and subducted to depths of 400 to 800 m as it flows northwest (Barker 2004, Middleton and Bye 2007). Since the water mass transported by the 606 607 Flinders Current and upwelled along the Bonney Coast has had very minimal contact with Ba 608 enriched bottom waters/sediments, it may not produce a 'typical' positive Ba:Ca signal in the 609 otoliths. In addition, while nutrient inputs and the productivity of the Bonney upwelling are well documented (e.g. Nieblas et al. 2009, van Ruth et al. 2010), sediment accumulation rates 610 611 of biogenic compounds (including Ba) in the upwelling areas of Africa (Benguela Current) 612 and South America (Peru Current) are 1 to 2 orders of magnitude higher compared to 613 southern Australia (Veeh et al. 1999). Lower regional Ba sediment concentrations reflect the 614 general oligotrophic nature of southern Australian waters. Alternative sources of Ba inputs may include wintertime strengthening of the eastward flowing Leeuwin Current (Middleton 615 616 and Bye 2007), seasonal riverine inputs (Moore 1997, Sinclair and McCulloch 2004), and/or 617 wintertime transport of coastal waters from the shelf to the deeper ocean (Kämpf et al. 2010).

618

Li:Ca in the otolith was most strongly correlated (positive) with chlorophyll-a levels in the 619 620 environment as opposed to either the upwelling index (positive correlation) or bottom 621 temperature (negative correlation). Interestingly, the negative relationship of otolith Li:Ca to 622 water temperature has also been found in another fully marine fish, European plaice 623 (*Pleuronectes platessa*) (Sturrock et al. 2015). In other biological carbonates, increased 624 concentrations of Li:Ca link to changes in dissolved inorganic carbon (DIC) of seawater 625 (foraminifera tests: Vigier et al. 2015) or to Li-rich phytoplankton diets (scallop shells: 626 Thébault and Chauvaud 2013). Given this, otolith Li:Ca could be a potential indicator of 627 productivity within the marine environment. Further, we recorded increased Li:Ca 628 concentrations from the hyaline component of the otolith (i.e. summer growth; Paul and Horn 629 2009) as opposed to the opaque portion. Conversely, Li:Ca concentrations were positively 630 correlated with opaque zones in plaice otoliths (Sturrock et al. 2015). This suggests that Li:Ca

631 is tied to environmental influences (e.g. temperature or primary productivity) rather than to632 specific features of the otolith.

633

634 The addition of an age-environment interaction term allowed the response of the fish at a 635 given age to be examined from both the perspective of chemical assimilation in the otolith 636 and growth. Younger fish were more sensitive to upwelling and adjusted element assimilation 637 more rapidly to changing environmental conditions than older fish. For example, as 638 upwelling strengthened, the rate of Sr:Ca assimilation increased more quickly in younger fish 639 than older fish, while assimilation of Na:Ca decreased more rapidly. The best models for 640 Ba:Ca, Li:Ca and Mg:Ca did not include the age-environmental interaction term, indicating 641 that there was no difference in assimilation rates between younger and older fish. Whilst 642 overall there was a positive relationship between growth and upwelling, when explored 643 across ages, older fish grew proportionally better with increased upwelling. Younger fish 644 showed a negligible response. Because physical changes are happening at a rapid rate in an 645 upwelling system (e.g. drops in temperature/salinity, increased nutrients), metabolic 646 processes of a fish will adjust to cope (e.g. Brett and Groves 1979, Brown et al. 2004, Wootton 2011). Resulting changes to metabolic processes could potentially cause rapid 647 648 adjustment of element assimilation rates, especially in elements under greater physiological 649 influence (e.g. Na and Sr). Fish within an upwelling environment will experience drops in 650 metabolic rates as temperature decreases, regulation of ionic homeostasis with changing 651 salinity, and increased water movement. Growth rates are influenced by changes to metabolic 652 processes caused by interactions of multiple environmental parameters, including changes to 653 food resources, relative to fish size and age (Brett and Groves 1979, Wootton 2011).

654

655 *Physiological versus environmental influences*

656 The multivariate modeling results corroborated our hypotheses regarding physiological 657 controls on elements in otoliths and present the first instance where correlations between 658 elements within individual otoliths and among fish have been determined (Figure 6a). Our method provides 1) unbiased estimates of the strength and directionality of correlations, and 659 660 2) a clear methodological and statistical framework for future work. Within an individual 661 fish, Na:Ca and Sr:Ca were highly correlated with each other, and to a lesser extent, growth 662 and Mg:Ca, reflecting greater physiological influence (e.g. Thresher et al. 1994, Thorrold and 663 Shuttleworth 2000, Brown and Severin 2009, Sturrock et al. 2015). Ba:Ca and Li:Ca were 664 indeed less controlled by physiological processes and likely more reflective of extrinsic This article is protected by copyright. All rights reserved

665 influences based on the absence of a correlation with growth and weak correlations with Na:Ca and Sr:Ca. Mg:Ca correlated weakly to moderately with all otolith traits, corroborating 666 667 that Mg:Ca in the otolith is regulated simultaneously by physiological and environmental 668 factors. These findings support our hypotheses regarding otolith traits within an individual (Figure 1): 1) Na:Ca and Sr:Ca were predominantly influenced by an individual's physiology; 669 670 2) Ba:Ca and Li:Ca were primarily affected by environmental parameters; 3) growth rate and 671 Mg:Ca were moderately influenced by both physiology and the environment; 4) correlations 672 were stronger within groups of either physiologically or environmentally influenced otolith 673 traits, but less so between the two groups; and 5) the strength of correlation varied among the otolith traits, particularly those under environmental control. 674

675

676 Element: Ca and growth were also compared among individuals, and surprisingly only Ba:Ca 677 and growth were significantly correlated (negative). This means fish with overall higher 678 growth rates equated to overall lower Ba:Ca. Given that upwelled water had lower Ba 679 concentrations, but upwelling were times of higher average growth, a possible explanation is 680 that fish whose lives spanned periods with stronger upwelling events would have elevated 681 growth and reduced Ba; those inhabiting weaker upwelling periods would have the opposite. 682 We hypothesized that otolith traits driven by environmental conditions would correlate both 683 within an otolith, reflecting the time dependency of growth and element assimilation, and 684 among individual fish that experience a similar set of external conditions (Figure 1). Our 685 hypothesis is partially refuted since the only among-individual correlation was between 686 Ba:Ca and growth. Therefore, the lack of among-individual correlations in other elements 687 suggests that caution is needed when assuming multi-elemental signatures are reflective 688 solely of shared environments. These results potentially have major implications for the use 689 of biogeochemical proxies in a range of fish ecology studies.

690

691 Ignoring intrinsic effects in the multivariate mixed model resulted in elevated estimates of 692 among individual element and growth correlations (Figure 6c). These results are biased 693 because fish of similar ages have similar overall elemental concentrations due to intrinsic 694 processes, rather than any shared environmental conditions. For example, Sr:Ca ratios 695 decrease with increased growth during metamorphosis in Japanese eels (Anguilla japonica; 696 Arai et al. 1997), and seasonal variations of Sr and Na in otoliths are linked to changes in 697 growth rates or reproductive investment rather than shared environmental conditions (Kalish 698 1989, 1991). The qualitatively similar within individual correlations from both models are This article is protected by copyright. All rights reserved

expected because comparisons are made on the same scale (i.e. among measurements made atthe same otolith location).

701

702 Conclusions

703 The application of univariate and multivariate mixed-effects modeling to time resolved 704 element: Ca and growth profiles has provided a novel method to disentangle the effects of 705 physiology and the environment on otolith chemistry and fish growth. If changes to element 706 concentrations in otoliths driven by physiology are unaccounted for (e.g. age, reproductive 707 parameters, diet), then elemental data used to reconstruct lifetime movements or as 708 paleoproxies can be misinterpreted (Thresher 1999, Elsdon et al. 2008, Sturrock et al. 2012). 709 Our models accounted for age-related effects but did not include reproductive parameters or 710 diet as these data were unavailable. However, since both male and female fish were included 711 in the models, the element: Ca profiles and growth are integrated to reflect the response of all 712 fish, regardless of sex. The Sr:Ca temporal signal and its association with reproduction 713 should be explored, as this relationship has potential for use as a proxy to reconstruct 714 reproductive histories. This would be especially useful when examining exploited 715 populations for changes in reproductive characteristics through time, i.e. changes in age-at-716 maturity, shifts in spawning season with climate variability. Since both Ba:Ca and Li:Ca were 717 under limited physiological control, these elements are the most likely candidates for use as 718 environmental proxies. Otolith Li:Ca is particularly promising as an indicator of productivity 719 in the marine environment given its positive correlation with chlorophyll-a. Describing the assimilation mechanism of Li from the environment into the otolith will be an important first 720 721 step. In a similar vein, Ba:Ca seems to track presumed Ba concentrations within the ambient 722 water mass, if the Bonney upwelled water does indeed reflect a non-enriched Ba source. Of 723 all the elements examined, Ba was the only one that was correlated among individuals, which 724 suggests that population-level fluctuations in ambient Ba are simultaneously recorded by all 725 individuals. Therefore, fluctuations in Ba:Ca are likely to represent broad-scale 726 environmental change as opposed to individual-based differences in assimilation. Further 727 research directions should include quantifying physiological (e.g. metabolism, reproductive 728 condition) and environmental influences on element assimilation by focusing on all life 729 history stages, since element assimilation is inherently linked with age-based growth. Related 730 to this point is the need for the collection of targeted empirical data and detailed sensitivity 731 analyses to assess how temporal and spatial variation in ambient elemental concentrations 732 interacts with age-dependent assimilation.

733

734 Acknowledgements:

- 735 We acknowledge partial funding from the Dr Paris Goodsell Marine Ecology Research Grant,
- the Nature Foundation SA, the Ecological Society of Australia, CSIRO Wealth from Oceans
- Flagship and the Australian Research Council (FT100100767 and DP110100716 awarded to
- 738 BMG). We acknowledge Aoife McFadden and Benjamin Wade of Adelaide Microscopy for
- assistance with LA ICP-MS. Special thanks to Joel Redman and Scott Redman of Southend,
- 740 SA for help with specimen collection. G. L. Grammer was supported by a CSIRO Wealth
- 741 from Oceans Flagship Postgraduate Scholarship and an Adelaide Scholarship International
- 742 (University of Adelaide).

743 Literature Cited:

- Arai, T., T. Otake, and K. Tsukamoto. 1997. Drastic changes in otolith microstructure and
 microchemistry accompanying the onset of metamorphosis in the Japanese eel *Anguilla japonica*. Marine Ecology Progress Series 161:17-22.
- Batenburg, S. J., G.-J. Reichart, T. Jilbert, M. Janse, F. P. Wesselingh, and W. Renema. 2011.
 Interannual climate variability in the Miocene: High resolution trace element and stable
 isotope ratios in giant clams. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology
 306:75-81.
- Bates, D., M. Maechler, B. Bolker, and S. Walker. 2014. lme4: Linear mixed-effects models
 using Eigen and S4. R package version 1.1-7. http://cran.r-
- 753 project.org/web/packages/lme4/.
- 754 Botsford, L. W., C. A. Lawrence, E. P. Dever, A. Hastings, and J. Largier. 2003. Wind
- strength and biological productivity in upwelling systems: an idealized study. Fisheries
 Oceanography 12:245-259.
- 757 Brett, J. R., and T. D. D. Groves. 1979. Physiological energetics. Pages 279-352 in W. S.
- Hoar, D. J. Randall, and J. R. Brett, editors. Fish Physiology: Bioenergetics and Growth.
 Academic Press, London.
- Brown, J. H., J. F. Gillooly, A. P. Allen, V. M. Savage, and G. B. West. 2004. Toward a
 metabolic theory of ecology. Ecology 85:1771-1789.
- 762 Brown, R. J., and K. P. Severin. 2009. Otolith chemistry analyses indicate that water Sr:Ca is
- the primary factor influencing otolith Sr:Ca for freshwater and diadromous fish but not
- for marine fish. Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences **66**:1790-1808.

765 Bruce, B. D., R. Bradford, R. Daley, M. Green, and K. Phillips. 2002. Targeted review of 766 biological and ecological information from fisheries research in the South East Marine 767 Region National Oceans Office, CSIRO Marine Research, Hobart: 175. 768 Buckel, J. A., B. L. Sharack, and V. S. Zdanowicz. 2004. Effect of diet on otolith 769 composition in *Pomatomus saltatrix*, an estuarine piscivore. Journal of Fish Biology **64**:1469-1484. 770 771 Bulman, C., F. Althaus, X. He, N. Bax, and A. Williams. 2001. Diets and trophic guilds of 772 demersal fishes of the south-eastern Australian shelf. Marine and Freshwater Research 773 **52**:537-548. 774 Burnham, K. P., and D. R. Anderson. 2004. Multimodel inference: understanding AIC and 775 BIC in model selection. Sociological Methods & Research 33:261-304. 776 Campana, S. E. 1999. Chemistry and composition of fish otoliths: pathways, mechanisms and 777 applications. Marine Ecology Progress Series 188:263-297. 778 Cherel, Y., and K. A. Hobson. 2007. Geographical variation in carbon stable isotope signatures of marine predators: a tool to investigate their foraging areas in the Southern 779 780 Ocean. Marine Ecology Progress Series 329:281-287. 781 Cherel, Y., S. Jaquemet, A. Maglio, and A. Jaeger. 2014. Differences in 813C and 815N 782 values between feathers and blood of seabird chicks: implications for non-invasive 783 isotopic investigations. Marine Biology 161:229-237. 784 Cresson, P., M. Bouchoucha, F. Morat, F. Miralles, F. Chavanon, V. Loizeau, and D. Cossa. 785 2015. A multitracer approach to assess the spatial contamination pattern of hake (Merluccius merluccius) in the French Mediterranean. Science of the Total Environment 786 **532**:184-194. 787 788 Cusack, M., and A. Freer. 2008. Biomineralization: elemental and organic influence in 789 carbonate systems. Chemical Reviews 108:4433-4454. 790 de Vries, M. C., B. M. Gillanders, and T. S. Elsdon. 2005. Facilitation of barium uptake into 791 fish otoliths: Influence of strontium concentration and salinity. Geochimica et 792 Cosmochimica Acta 69:4061-4072. Dingemanse, N. J., and N. A. Dochtermann. 2013. Quantifying individual variation in 793 794 behaviour: mixed-effect modelling approaches. Journal of Animal Ecology 82:39-54. 795 Disspain, M., L. A. Wallis, and B. M. Gillanders. 2011. Developing baseline data to 796 understand environmental change: a geochemical study of archaeological otoliths from 797 the Coorong, South Australia. Journal of Archaeological Science 38:1842-1857.

798	Disspain, M. C. F., S. Ulm, and B. M. Gillanders. 2015. Otoliths in archaeology: methods,
799	applications and future prospects. Journal of Archaeological Science: Reports.
800	Drucker, D. G., A. Bridault, K. A. Hobson, E. Szuma, and H. Bocherens. 2008. Can carbon-
801	13 in large herbivores reflect the canopy effect in temperate and boreal ecosystems?
802	Evidence from modern and ancient ungulates. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology,
803	Palaeoecology 266:69-82.
804	Elsdon, T. S., and B. M. Gillanders. 2002. Interactive effects of temperature and salinity on
805	otolith chemistry: challenges for determining environmental histories of fish. Canadian
806	Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences 59 :1796-1808.
807	Elsdon, T. S., and B. M. Gillanders. 2003a. Reconstructing migratory patterns of fish based
808	on environmental influences on otolith chemistry. Reviews in Fish Biology and Fisheries
809	13 :217-235.
810	Elsdon, T. S., and B. M. Gillanders. 2003b. Relationship between water and otolith elemental
811	concentrations in juvenile black bream Acanthopagrus butcheri. Marine Ecology
812	Progress Series 260:263-272.
813	Elsdon, T. S., and B. M. Gillanders. 2005. Consistency of patterns between laboratory
814	experiments and field collected fish in otolith chemistry: an example and applications for
815	salinity reconstructions. Marine and Freshwater Research 56:609-617.
816	Elsdon, T. S., B. K. Wells, S. E. Campana, B. M. Gillanders, C. M. Jones, K. E. Limburg, D.
817	H. Secor, S. R. Thorrold, and B. D. Walther. 2008. Otolith chemistry to describe
818	movements and life-history parameters of fishes: Hypotheses, assumptions, limitations
819	and inferences. Pages 297-+ in R. N. Gibson, R. J. A. Atkinson, and J. D. M. Gordon,
820	editors. Oceanography and Marine Biology: An Annual Review, Vol 46. Crc Press-
821	Taylor & Francis Group, Boca Raton.
822	Ethier, D. M., C. J. Kyle, T. K. Kyser, and J. J. Nocera. 2010. Variability in the growth
823	patterns of the cornified claw sheath among vertebrates: implications for using
824	biogeochemistry to study animal movement. Canadian Journal of Zoology 88:1043-
825	1051.
826	Ethier, D. M., C. J. Kyle, and J. J. Nocera. 2014. Tracking animal movement by comparing
827	trace element signatures in claws to spatial variability of elements in soils. Science of the
828	Total Environment 468–469 :699-705.
829	Fox, J., S. Weisberg, and J. Hong. 2014. effects: Effect displays for linear, generalized linear,
830	and other models. R package version 3.0-3. http://cran.r-
831	project.org/web/packages/effects/index.html.
	This article is protected by copyright. All rights reserved

- Gillanders, B. M. 2002. Temporal and spatial variability in elemental composition of otoliths:
 Implications for determining stock identity and connectivity of populations. Canadian
- Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences **59**:669-679.
- Griffin, W. L., W. J. Powell, N. J. Pearson, and S. Y. O'Reilly. 2008. GLITTER: data

reduction software for laser ablation ICP-MS. Pages 204-207 in P. Sylvester, editor.

- 837 Laser Ablation: ICP-MS in the Earth Sciences Mineralogical Association of Canada
- 838 Short Course Series.
- Hadfield, J. D. 2010. MCMC methods for multi-response generalised linear mixed models:
 the MCMCglmm R package. Journal of Statistical Software 33:1-22.
- Hadfield, J. D., A. J. Wilson, D. Garant, B. C. Sheldon, and L. E. B. Kruuk. 2010. The
 misuse of BLUP in ecology and evolution. American Naturalist 175:116-125.
- Harrell, F. E. J. 2014. Hmisc: Harrell Miscellaneous. R package version 3.14-5. http://cran.rproject.org/web/packages/Hmisc/.
- Hatch, M. B. A., S. A. Schellenberg, and M. L. Carter. 2013. Ba/Ca variations in the modern
 intertidal bean clam *Donax gouldii*: An upwelling proxy? Palaeogeography,
- 847 Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology **373**:98-107.
- 848 Henschke, N., D. A. Bowden, J. D. Everett, S. P. Holmes, R. J. Kloser, R. W. Lee, and I. M.
- 849 Suthers. 2013. Salp-falls in the Tasman Sea: a major food input to deep-sea benthos.
 850 Marine Ecology Progress Series 491:165-175.
- 851 Hobson, K. A., R. Barnett-Johnson, and T. Cerling. 2010. Using Isoscapes to Track Animal
- Migration. Pages 273-298 in B. J. West, J. G. Bowen, E. T. Dawson, and P. K. Tu,
- editors. Isoscapes: Understanding movement, pattern, and process on Earth throughisotope mapping. Springer Netherlands, Dordrecht.
- Horn, P. L., J. S. Forman, and M. R. Dunn. 2012. Dietary partitioning by two sympatric fish
- species, red cod (*Pseudophycis bachus*) and sea perch (*Helicolenus percoides*), on
- 857 Chatham Rise, New Zealand. Marine Biology Research **8**:624-634.
- Hughes, J. M., J. Stewart, B. M. Gillanders, D. Collins, and I. M. Suthers. 2015. Relationship
 between otolith chemistry and age in a widespread pelagic teleost *Arripis trutta*:
- 860 influence of adult movements on stock structure and implications for management.
- 861 Marine and Freshwater Research **67**:224-237.
- 862 Izzo, C., Z. A. Doubleday, G. L. Grammer, M. Disspain, Q. Ye, and B. M. Gillanders. 2016.
- 863 Seasonally resolved environmental reconstructions using fish otoliths. Canadian Journal
- of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences. DOI: 10.1139/cjfas-2016-0055.

- 865 Izzo, C., Z. A. Doubleday, A. G. Schultz, S. H. Woodcock, and B. M. Gillanders. 2015.
- 866 Contribution of water chemistry and fish condition to otolith chemistry: comparisons
 867 across salinity environments. Journal of Fish Biology 86:1680-1698.
- James, N. P., and Y. Bone. 2011. Neritic Carbonate Sediments in a Temperate Realm:
 Southern Australia. Springer, London.
- Johnson, P. C. D. 2014. Extension of Nakagawa & Schielzeth's R2GLMM to random slopes
 models. Methods in Ecology and Evolution 5:944-946.
- Kaim, W., B. Schwederski, and A. Klein. 2013. Bioinorganic Chemistry--Inorganic Elements
 in the Chemistry of Life: An Introduction and Guide. 2nd edition. John Wiley & Sons,
 United Kingdom.
- 875 Kalish, J. M. 1989. Otolith microchemistry: validation of the effects of physiology, age and
- environment on otolith composition. Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and
 Ecology 132:151-178.
- 878 Kalish, J. M. 1991. Determinants of otolith chemistry: seasonal variation in the composition
- of blood plasma, endolymph and otoliths of bearded rock cod *Pseudophycis barbatus*.
 Marine Ecology Progress Series **74**:137-159.
- Kämpf, J., M. Doubell, D. Griffin, R. L. Matthews, and T. M. Ward. 2004. Evidence of a
 large seasonal coastal upwelling system along the southern shelf of Australia.
- 883 Geophysical Research Letters **31**.
- Kämpf, J., N. Payne, and P. Malthouse. 2010. Marine connectivity in a large inverse estuary.
 Journal of Coastal Research 26:1047-1056.
- Kingsford, M. J., J. M. Hughes, and H. M. Patterson. 2009. Otolith chemistry of the non-
- dispersing reef fish *Acanthochromis polyacanthus*: cross-shelf patterns from the central
 Great Barrier Reef. Marine Ecology Progress Series **377**:279-288.
- Lea, D. W., and E. A. Boyle. 1991. Barium in planktonic foraminifera. Geochimica et
 Cosmochimica Acta 55:3321-3331.
- Lea, D. W., G. T. Shen, and E. A. Boyle. 1989. Coralline barium records temporal variability
 in equatorial pacific upwelling. Nature 340:373-373.
- Lewis, R. 1981. Seasonal upwelling along the south-eastern coastline of South Australia.
 Marine and Freshwater Research 32:843-854.
- 895 Mazerolle, M. J. 2015. Model selection and multimodel inference based on (Q)AIC(c). R
- package version 2.0-3. http://cran.r-project.org/web/packages/AICcmodavg/index.html.

- Middleton, J. F., and J. A. T. Bye. 2007. A review of the shelf-slope circulation along
 Australia's southern shelves: Cape Leeuwin to Portland. Progress in Oceanography 75:141.
- 900 Middleton, J. F., and M. Cirano. 2002. A northern boundary current along Australia's

southern shelves: The Flinders Current. Journal of Geophysical Research. C. Oceans
107:1-11.

- 903 Middleton, J. F., R. McGarvey, A. Linnane, S. M. Middleton, C. E. P. Teixeira, and P.
- Hawthorne. 2012. Using observations of bottom temperature to calibrate the output of an
 ocean model. Journal of Marine Systems 91:34-40.
- 906 Miller, J. A. 2011. Effects of water temperature and barium concentration on otolith
- 907 composition along a salinity gradient: Implications for migratory reconstructions. Journal

908 of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology **405**:42-52.

- 909 Montaggioni, L. F., F. Le Cornec, T. Correge, and G. Cabioch. 2006. Coral barium/calcium
- 910 record of mid-Holocene upwelling activity in New Caledonia, South-West Pacific.
- 911 Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology **237**:436-455.
- 912 Moore, W. S. 1997. High fluxes of radium and barium from the mouth of the Ganges-
- Brahmaputra River during low river discharge suggest a large groundwater source. Earth
 and Planetary Science Letters 150:141-150.

915 Morrongiello, J. R., and R. E. Thresher. 2015. A statistical framework to explore ontogenetic

- growth variation among individuals and populations: a marine fish example. Ecological
 Monographs 85:93-115.
- 918 Morrongiello, J. R., C. T. Walsh, C. A. Gray, J. R. Stocks, and D. A. Crook. 2014.
- Environmental change drives long-term recruitment and growth variation in an estuarine
 fish. Global Change Biology 20:1844-1860.
- Nakagawa, S., and H. Schielzeth. 2013. A general and simple method for obtaining R² from
 generalized linear mixed-effects models. Methods in Ecology and Evolution 4:133-142.

- Variability of biological production in low wind-forced regional upwelling systems: A
 case study off southeastern Australia. Limnology and Oceanography 54:1548-1558.
- 926 Park, T. J. 1993. A comparison of the morphology, growth and reproductive biology of two
- 927 colour forms of ocean perch (*Helicoleus percoides*), NSW, Australia. Masters.
- 928 University of Sydney, Sydney, Australia.
- Parrish, J. R., D. T. Rogers, and F. P. Ward. 1983. Identification of natal locales of peregrine
 falcons (*Falco peregrinus*) by trace-element analysis of feathers. The Auk 100:560-567.

⁹²³ Nieblas, A. E., B. M. Sloyan, A. J. Hobday, R. Coleman, and A. J. Richardson. 2009.

- Paul, L. J., and P. L. Horn. 2009. Age and growth of sea perch (*Helicolenus percoides*) from
 two adjacent areas off the east coast of South Island, New Zealand. Fisheries Research
 933 95:169-180.
- Pavlov, D. A., and N. G. Emel'yanova. 2013. Transition to viviparity in the order
 Scorpaeniformes: Brief review. Journal of Ichthyology 53:52-69.
- Proctor, C. H., R. E. Thresher, J. S. Gunn, D. J. Mills, I. R. Harrowfield, and S. H. Sie. 1995.
 Stock structure of the southern bluefin tuna *Thunnus maccoyii:* an investigation based on
- 938 probe microanalysis of otolith composition. Marine Biology **122**:511-526.
- Radtke, R. L., and T. E. Targett. 1984. Rhythmic structural and chemical patterns in otoliths
 of the Antarctic fish *Notothenia larseni*: Their application to age determination. Polar
 Biology 3:203-210.
- 942 Ramos, R., and J. González-Solís. 2012. Trace me if you can: the use of intrinsic
- biogeochemical markers in marine top predators. Frontiers in Ecology and the
- 944 Environment **10**:258-266.
- Reis-Santos, P., S. E. Tanner, R. P. Vasconcelos, T. S. Elsdon, H. N. Cabral, and B. M.
- Gillanders. 2013. Connectivity between estuarine and coastal fish populations:
- 947 contributions of estuaries are not consistent over time. Marine Ecology Progress Series948 **491**:177-186.
- Rubenstein, D. R., and K. A. Hobson. 2004. From birds to butterflies: animal movement
 patterns and stable isotopes. Trends in Ecology & Evolution 19:256-263.
- Sanchez-Jerez, P., B. M. Gillanders, and M. J. Kingsford. 2002. Spatial variability of trace
 elements in fish otoliths: comparison with dietary items and habitat constituents in
 seagrass meadows. Journal of Fish Biology 61:801-821.
- 954 Shimmield, G. 2015. Biogenic barium. Pages 1-2 in J. Harff, M. Meschede, S. Petersen, and
- J. Thiede, editors. Encyclopedia of Marine Geosciences. Springer Netherlands.
- 956 Sinclair, D. J., and M. T. McCulloch. 2004. Corals record low mobile barium concentrations
- 957 in the Burdekin River during the 1974 flood: evidence for limited Ba supply to rivers?
- Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology **214**:155-174.
- Smith, P. J., C. D. Struthers, C. D. Paulin, S. M. McVeagh, and R. K. Daley. 2009. Shallow
 genetic and morphological divergence among seaperches in the South Pacific (family
- 961 Scorpaenidae; genus *Helicolenus*). Journal of Fish Biology **74**:1104-1128.
- 962 Stanley, S. M. 2006. Influence of seawater chemistry on biomineralization throughout
- 963 phanerozoic time: Paleontological and experimental evidence. Palaeogeography,
- 964 Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology **232**:214-236.

- 965 Sturrock, A. M., E. Hunter, J. A. Milton, E. Eimf, R. C. Johnson, C. P. Waring, and C. N.
- 966 Trueman. 2015. Quantifying physiological influences on otolith microchemistry.
 967 Methods in Ecology and Evolution 6:806-816.
- Sturrock, A. M., C. N. Trueman, A. M. Darnaude, and E. Hunter. 2012. Can otolith elemental
 chemistry retrospectively track migrations in fully marine fishes? Journal of Fish
 Biology 81:766-795.
- 971 Sturrock, A. M., C. N. Trueman, J. A. Milton, C. P. Waring, M. J. Cooper, and E. Hunter.
- 972 2014. Physiological influences can outweigh environmental signals in otolith
- 973 microchemistry research. Marine Ecology Progress Series **500**:245-264.
- 974 Thébault, J., and L. Chauvaud. 2013. Li/Ca enrichments in great scallop shells (Pecten
- 975 *maximus*) and their relationship with phytoplankton blooms. Palaeogeography,
- Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology **373**:108-122.
- 977 Thorrold, S. R., and S. Shuttleworth. 2000. In situ analysis of trace elements and isotope
- 978 ratios in fish otoliths using laser ablation sector field inductively coupled plasma mass
- 979 spectrometry. Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences **57**:1232-1242.
- 980 Thresher, R. E. 1999. Elemental composition of otoliths as a stock delineator in fishes.
 981 Fisheries Research 43:165-204.
- 982 Thresher, R. E., C. H. Proctor, J. S. Gunn, and I. R. Harrowfield. 1994. An evaluation of
- 983 electron-probe microanalysis of otoliths for stock delineation and identification of
- nursery areas in a southern temperate groundfish, *Nemadactylus macropterus*
- 985 (Cheilodactylidae). Fishery Bulletin **92**:817-840.
- van der Merwe, N. J., J. A. Lee-Thorp, J. F. Thackeray, A. Hall-Martin, F. J. Kruger, H.
- 987 Coetzee, R. H. V. Bell, and M. Lindeque. 1990. Source-area determination of elephant
 988 ivory by isotopic analysis. Nature 346:744-746.
- van Ruth, P. D., G. G. Ganf, and T. M. Ward. 2010. Hot-spots of primary productivity: an
 alternative interpretation to conventional upwelling models. Estuarine, Coastal and Shelf
 Science 90:142-158.
- Veeh, H. H., D. T. Heggie, and A. J. Crispe. 1999. Biogeochemistry of southern Australian
 continental slope sediments. Australian Journal of Earth Sciences 46:563-575.
- Vigier, N., C. Rollion-Bard, Y. Levenson, and J. Erez. 2015. Lithium isotopes in foraminifera
 shells as a novel proxy for the ocean dissolved inorganic carbon (DIC). Comptes Rendus
 Geoscience 347:43-51.

- Walther, B., M. Kingsford, M. O'Callaghan, and M. McCulloch. 2010. Interactive effects of
 ontogeny, food ration and temperature on elemental incorporation in otoliths of a coral
 reef fish. Environmental Biology of Fishes 89:441-451.
- Walther, B. D., M. J. Kingsford, and M. T. McCulloch. 2013. Environmental records from
 Great Barrier Reef corals: inshore versus offshore drivers. PLoS ONE 8:e77091.

1002 Webb, S. D., S. H. Woodcock, and B. M. Gillanders. 2012. Sources of otolith barium and

strontium in estuarine fish and the influence of salinity and temperature. Marine Ecology
Progress Series 453:189-199.

- 1005 Weimerskirch, H., Y. Cherel, K. Delord, A. Jaeger, S. C. Patrick, and L. Riotte-Lambert.
- 2014. Lifetime foraging patterns of the wandering albatross: Life on the move! Journal of
 Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology 450:68-78.
- Weiner, S., and P. M. Dove. 2003. An overview of biomineralization processes and the
 problem of the vital effect. Reviews in Mineralogy and Geochemistry 54:1-29.
- Weisberg, S., G. Spangler, and L. S. Richmond. 2010. Mixed effects models for fish growth.
 Canadian Journal of Fisheries & Aquatic Sciences 67:269-277.
- Wheeler, S. G., A. D. Russell, J. S. Fehrenbacher, and S. G. Morgan. 2016. Evaluating
 chemical signatures in a coastal upwelling region to reconstruct water mass associations
 of settlement-stage rockfishes. Marine Ecology Progress Series 550:191-206.
- 1015 Woodson, L. E., B. K. Wells, C. B. Grimes, R. P. Franks, J. A. Santora, and M. H. Carr.
- 1016 2013. Water and otolith chemistry identify exposure of juvenile rockfish to upwelled 1017 waters in an open coastal system. Marine Ecology Progress Series **473**:261-273.
- 1018 Wootton, R. J. 2011. Energy utilization in growth | Growth: environmental effects. Pages
- 1019 1629-1635 *in* A. P. Farrell, editor. Encyclopedia of Fish Physiology. Academic Press,
 1020 San Diego.
- Zuur, A., E. N. Ieno, N. Walker, A. A. Saveliev, and G. M. Smith. 2009. Mixed effects
 models and extensions in ecology with R. Springer, New York.
- 1023
- 1024

1025 Data Availability:

- 1026 Data associated with this paper are available in the Dryad Digital Repository:
- 1027 http://dx.doi.org/10.5061/dryad.cn55b
- 1028

1029 **Tables:**

- 1030 Table 1. Description of fixed (intrinsic and extrinsic) and random effects used in the analyses of trace elements and growth derived from the
- 1031 otoliths of ocean perch.

Variable	Description	Data Range
Intrinsic Fixed effects		
Age	Age when each monthly increment was formed.	14 - 85 mo
		(1.2 - 7.1 yrs)
age month can	Age of the fish in months at date of capture	37 - 223 mo
age.monin.cap	Age of the fish in months at tale of capture	(3.1 - 18.6 yrs)
Random Effects		
FishID	Unique identifier for each fish	n = 38
2	A code designating the specific month and year of each monthly resolved increment (i.e. $75 = Dec 1996$,	204 mo (17 yrs)
Month	76 = Jan 1997, etc.)	(Nov 1995 - Oct 2012)
		()
Extrinsic Fixed effects		
Ĕ	Monthly NOAA PFEL Global 1-degree Upwelling Index calculated for the Bonney Coast region of	
Bonney UI	South Australia (37.6°S, 139.8°E; coast angle: 144°)	1981 - 2014
Ħ	Source: http://www.pfeg.noaa.gov/products/las/docs/global_upwell.html	
	Corrected monthly Bluelink bottom temperature (°C) derived in Middleton et al. (2012) and extended	1002 2012
Bottom Temp	with bottom temperature logger data from Southend, SA	1993 - 2013

		MODIS Aqua Level 3 Global Monthly Mapped 4 km Chlorophyll a (mg·m ⁻³) for the Bonney Coast, SA	
	Chl-a	(37°S, 139°E)	2002 - 2013
		Source: http://thredds.jpl.nasa.gov/las/getUI.do	
1032	0		
	C		
	<u>S</u>		
	~		
	0		
	ţ		
	N		

1033 Table 2. Best random effect structure fitted with the full fixed effect structure of Age +

1034 *age.month.cap* for each element:Ca and growth.

1035

Model	df	AICc	ΔAICc	LL
Ba:Ca				
FishID	5	-1034.60	561.11	522.31
AgelFishID	7	-1470.50	125.21	742.27
Age FishID + Month	8	-1513.44	82.27	764.75
Age FishID +				
Age Month	10	-1595.71	0.00	807.90
Na:Ca				
FishID	5	-6180.57	483.68	3095.30
Age FishID	7	-6419.22	245.03	3216.64
Age FishID + Month	8	-6660.21	4.05	3338.13
Age FishID +	10	((()))	0.00	22/2 17
Age Month	10	-0004.25	0.00	3342.17
Sr:Ca				
FishID	5	-5681.03	462.22	2845.53
Age FishID	7	-5997.87	145.38	3005.96
Age FishID + Month	8	-6116.31	26.94	3066.18
Age FishID +	10	61/3 25	0.00	3081 67
Age Month	10	-0145.25	0.00	5001.07
Mg:Ca				
FishID	5	-2025.91	323.48	1017.97
Age FishID	7	-2291.68	57.71	1152.87
Age FishID + Month	8	-2321.44	27.96	1168.75
Age FishID +	10	2340 30	0.00	118/ 75
Age Month	10	-2349.39	0.00	1104.75
Li:Ca				
FishID	5	1889.82	813.49	-939.90
Age FishID	7	1225.35	149.01	-605.65
Age FishID + Month	8	1135.86	59.52	-559.90
Age FishID +	10	1076 34	0.00	-528 12
Age Month	10	10/0.54	0.00	-520,12
Growth				
	-			

FishID	5	-696.97	1099.2 4	353.50
Age FishID	7	-1182.57	613.64	598.31
Age FishID + Month	8	-1568.77	227.45	792.41
Age FishID + Age Month	10	-1796.22	0.00	908.15

1036

- 1037 *Notes:* Best random effect structure is highlighted in **bold.** Best model rankings were
- 1038 assessed using Akaike's information criterion corrected for small sample sizes (AICc). LL:
- 1039 Log Likelihood. Random slope term designated with A|B.

Author Manus

1040 Table 3. Variance components, parameter estimates and test statistics for the optimal model of each

1041 element:Ca and growth.

1042

		R	andom eff	Fixed effect				
Statistic	FishID	Age FishID	Month	Age Month	Residual	Intercept	Age	Age.month.cap
Mg:Ca								
Variance	0.026	0.015	0.001	0.004	0.017			
SD	0.160	0.122	0.032	0.060	0.131			
Corr.		0.300		-0.890				
Estimate						3.903	-0.188	
SE						0.027	0.022	
t						142.70	-8.390	
Li:Ca	U							
Variance	0.077	0.197	0.008	0.026	0.076			
SD	0.277	0.443	0.088	0.160	0.275			
Corr.		0.200		-0.810				
Estimate						2.212	-0.344	-0.002
SE		5				0.046	0.075	0.001
t						47.830	-4.550	-2.650
Ba:Ca								
Variance	0.020	0.033	0.002	0.010	0.024			
SD	0.142	0.180	0.048	0.100	0.155			
Corr.		0.220		-0.800				
Estimate						0.492	-0.187	0.001
SE						0.024	0.032	0.000
t						20.491	-5.830	1.684
Na:Ca								
Variance	0.005	0.003	0.001	0.000	0.003			
SD	0.074	0.053	0.026	0.008	0.053			
Corr.		0.470		-1.000				
Estimate						9.338	-0.189	
SE	N					0.012	0.009	
t						754.100	-20.400	
Sr:Ca								
Variance	0.002	0.005	0.001	0.001	0.004			
SD	0.047	0.068	0.024	0.022	0.060			

Corr.		0.330		-0.840				
Estimate						8.082	0.143	0.000
SE						0.008	0.012	0.000
t						991.400	12.100	2.300
Growth								
Variance	0.032	0.060	0.008	0.019	0.020			
SD	0.178	0.245	0.091	0.138	0.140			
Corr.		0.310		0.710				
Estimate						2.137	-0.883	
SE						0.030	0.042	
t						71.570	-20.930	•••

1043

1044 *Notes:* Intraclass correlation coefficients (ICC) of the six otolith traits for *Month* are: Mg:Ca, 1.74;

1045 Li:Ca, 3.30; Growth, 8.50; Ba:Ca, 2.05; Na:Ca, 5.08; Sr:Ca, 5.02. Optimal models were fitted using

1046 restricted maximum likelihood (REML). Random slope term designated with A|B.

Author Sab

	Response	Environmental Variables				Log					
	Variable		df	AICc	ΔAICc	Likelihood	$\mathbf{R}^2\mathbf{m}$	R^2c	Estimate	±SE	t-statistic
	Ba:Ca	+ Growth	10	-1620.3	4.7	820.2	0.127	0.626			
		+ Bonney UI	11	-1625.0	0.0	823.5	0.128	0.626	-0.0002	0.0001	-2.616
()		+ Bottom Temp	11	-1618.7	6.3	820.4	0.127	0.627			
		+ Chl-a	11	-1047.0	577.9	534.6	0.123	0.603			
U)		+ Age * Bonney UI	12	-1623.4	1.5	823.8	0.128	0.626	0.0001	0.0002	0.710
		+ Age * Bottom Temp	12	-1619.4	5.5	821.8	0.128	0.627			
2		+ Age * Chl-a	12	-1045.2	579.7	534.7	0.123	0.603			
	Na:Ca	+ Growth	9	-6696.2	95.0	3357.1	0.461	0.842			
Ω		+ Bonney UI	10	-6778.9	12.3	3399.5	0.469	0.839	-0.0003	0.0000	-10.600
		+ Bottom Temp	10	-6720.4	70.8	3370.2	0.464	0.840			
		+ Chl-a	10	-4111.2	2680.0	2065.7	0.443	0.839			
		+ Age * Bonney UI	11	-6791.2	0.0	3406.7	0.470	0.839	0.0001	0.0000	3.800
		+ Age * Bottom Temp	11	-6724.7	66.5	3373.4	0.465	0.840			
		+ Age * Chl-a	11	-4113.4	2677.8	2067.8	0.444	0.840			
$\mathbf{\nabla}$	Sr:Ca	+ Growth	10	-6174.2	75.5	3097.1	0.416	0.724			
		+ Bonney UI	11	-6225.4	24.3	3123.7	0.438	0.719	0.0002	0.0000	8.600
+		+ Bottom Temp	11	-6197.8	51.9	3110.0	0.425	0.721			
		+ Chl-a	11	-3851.3	2398.4	1936.7	0.383	0.740			
		+ Age * Bonney UI	12	-6249.7	0.0	3136.9	0.440	0.717	-0.0003	0.0000	-5.400
		+ Age * Bottom Temp	12	-6199.0	50.6	3111.6	0.426	0.721			
		+ Age * Chl-a	12	-3854.6	2395.1	1939.4	0.385	0.739			

1047 Table 4. Model selection for environmental variables fitted to each optimal model.

This article is protected by copyright. All rights reserved

1048

	Response	Environmental Variables				Log					
O	Variable		df	AICc	ΔAICc	Likelihood	$\mathbf{R}^2\mathbf{m}$	R^2c	Estimate	±SE	t-statistic
	Mg:Ca	+ Growth	9	-2376.1	16.9	1197.1	0.145	0.695			
		+ Bonney UI	10	-2393.0	0.0	1206.6	0.147	0.695	-0.0002	0.0000	-4.430
()		+ Bottom Temp	10	-2375.6	17.4	1197.9	0.146	0.695			
		+ Chl-a	10	-1531.2	861.9	775.7	0.152	0.672			
U)		+ Age * Bonney UI	11	-2392.2	0.8	1207.2	0.147	0.696	0.0001	0.0001	1.080
		+ Age * Bottom Temp	11	-2377.7	15.3	1199.9	0.147	0.696			
2		+ Age * Chl-a	11	-1541.1	851.9	781.7	0.154	0.673			
	Li:Ca	+ Growth	10	1056.1	198.5	-518.0	0.184	0.706			
Ω		+ Bonney UI	11	1047.3	189.6	-512.6	0.191	0.709			
		+ Bottom Temp	11	1055.5	197.9	-516.7	0.186	0.706			
		+ Chl-a	11	857.7	0.0	-417.7	0.204	0.693	0.1416	0.0324	4.373
		+ Age * Bonney UI	12	1043.0	185.4	-509.4	0.197	0.709			
		+ Age * Bottom Temp	12	1053.2	195.5	-514.5	0.188	0.706			
$\overline{\mathbf{O}}$		+ Age * Chl-a	12	859.4	1.7	-417.6	0.207	0.693	-0.0424	0.0795	-0.534
9	Growth	+ Growth	9	-1821.4	63.2	919.7	0.699	0.924			
		+ Bonney UI	10	-1849.2	35.3	934.7	0.710	0.924	0.0006	0.0001	6.350
+		+ Bottom Temp	10	-1839.4	45.2	929.7	0.703	0.925			
		+ Chl-a	10	-1018.5	866.1	519.3	0.698	0.928			
		+ Age * Bonney UI	11	-1884.6	0.0	953.3	0.713	0.925	0.0011	0.0002	6.480
		+ Age * Bottom Temp	11	-1837.5	47.1	929.8	0.703	0.925			
		+ Age * Chl-a	11	-1020.2	864.3	521.2	0.698	0.928			

1050

- 1051 Notes: Environmental variables were fitted to each optimal model with maximum likelihood (ML). Best explanatory variable or combination of
- 1052 variables is highlighted in **bold**, and were assessed using Akaike's information criterion corrected for small sample sizes (AICc). The second
- 1053 ranked variable(s) is *italicized*. Marginal (m) and conditional (c) R^2 values were calculated after models were refit with restricted maximum
- 1054 likelihood (REML). Parameter estimates and test statistics are displayed for the top and second ranked models. Interactions are designated with
- 1055 an asterisk (*).

Author Manus

1056 Figure Legends:

- 1057 Figure 1. Hypothesized correlations between age-corrected element: Ca ratios and estimated
- 1058 growth within otoliths and among individuals. Some otolith traits are correlated via
- 1059 physiological or environmental pathways. Solid arrows: within individual correlations;
- 1060 Dashed arrows: among individual correlations.
- 1061

1062 Figure 2. a) Map of the southeastern coast of South Australia during an upwelling event in January 2014. The strongest area of upwelling occurs off the Bonney Coast region where 1063 1064 ocean perch otoliths were collected (dashed white line). Sea surface temperatures range from 1065 14°C (dark blue) to 25°C (red). b) Ventral lobe of a thin-sectioned ocean perch otolith with 1066 dual laser transects (highlighted in blue) from low element concentration (LC) and high 1067 element concentration (HC) scans. Transects run from the otolith's core to the proximal edge. 1068 This fish was 5+ years old when collected in 2011 (tics on blue lines mark each annual 1069 growth increment). [SST image credit: Data were sourced from the Integrated Marine 1070 Observing System (IMOS) - IMOS is a national collaborative research infrastructure, 1071 supported by Australian Government]

1072

1073 Figure 3. Predicted monthly variation in otolith trace elements (element:Ca; μ mol/mol) and 1074 average growth (Growth; μ m) of ocean perch from the Bonney upwelling region. Power 1075 functions shown describe element:Ca assimilation rate (AR; μ mol·mol⁻¹·month⁻¹) or growth 1076 rate (GR; μ m/month). Note: scale of y-axis varies among panels. Data back-transformed to 1077 the original scale to aid interpretation.

1078

Figure 4. Monthly resolved otolith trace elements (ratioed to calcium) and average growth
predicted for ocean perch in the Bonney upwelling region off South Australia. Chronologies
(solid lines) are produced from the *Month* random effect term (best linear unbiased predictors
'BLUPs'), with positive (negative) values indicating months of above (below) average
assimilation/growth. The regional upwelling index (dotted line) is plotted on the secondary Y
axis for reference.

1085

- 1086Figure 5. Predicted effects for each element: Ca and average growth resulting from the best1087additive environmental effect model (a-c, g-h: left panels; dotted lines: \pm SE) and the best
- 1088 environmental interaction with Age model (d-f, k-l: right panels). An asterisk in the upper

- 1089 right corner indicates the top ranked model as selected by AICc values ($\Delta AICc = 0$; shown in
- 1090 Table 4). Data back-transformed to original scale to aid interpretation.
- 1091
- 1092 Figure 6: a) Supported correlations within (solid lines) and among (dashed lines) individuals
- 1093 (point estimate credible intervals not spanning zero) from Figure 1 based on the multivariate
- 1094 model. Full correlation matrices are found in Tables S1 and S2. b) Within individual
- 1095 correlations as in (a) but with intrinsic variables removed from the multivariate model (full
- 1096 correlation matrix: Table S3). c) Among individual correlations when intrinsic variables
- 1097 removed from the multivariate model (full correlation matrix: Table S4). Correlation
- 1098 direction denoted by + or and correlation strength by line color. Note correlation strength is
- 1099 much greater in (c) than in (a) or (b).

Author Manus





ecm_1264_f2.pdf



© IMOS 20-Apr-2017 15:43 Hobart Time



ecm_1264_f4.pdf







anus -



ecm_1264_f6.tif