

## **Introduction: Gendered Violence in the Making of Modern Indonesia**

Katharine McGregor and Hannah Loney

Across time and space, through cycles of colonialism and exclusive forms of nationalism, Indonesian, Dutch, Indisch, Japanese and East Timorese people have been connected in different ways to the nation-state that is today known as the Republic of Indonesia. From the Dutch colonial period, the Japanese occupation during the Second World War (1942–45), the Indonesian National Revolution (1945–49), the 1965–66 mass violence, the occupation of East Timor (1975–99), the May 1998 violence, and waves of violence against minority groups, the degrees of inclusion or exclusion of persons by the nation-state—but also by local communities and families—have had direct bearings upon patterns of violence. Violence has furthermore been accentuated by structural inequalities of an economic, political, legal, gendered, racialised and social nature, which have made some people more vulnerable to violence than others. Gender is one of the key social constructs that has shaped an individual's experience of violence, and it is the intersections between gender, violence and power that this volume investigates.

Although scholars have offered many valuable examinations of gendered violence across the region, this is the first study to weave together an interdisciplinary approach. The study demonstrates how various forms of violence should not be seen as separate and isolated instances. Rather, we argue, they are embedded in structural inequalities brought about by layers of colonialism, occupation, state violence and discrimination, and cultures of patriarchy. In this collection, we move from examining cases of individual to group experiences of violence, paying attention to gender and multiple structures of power and domination. This approach considers structures of power that operate from the state down, as well as across communities and within families. Gendered violence is particularly important to consider in this region because of its complex history of colonialism, armed conflict and authoritarian rule, the diversity of people affected by violence, as well as the complex religious and cultural communities involved. Considering the political climate in Indonesia today, which includes decreased tolerance of ethnic, religious and sexual difference, it is important that we pause to reflect upon what we can learn from historical and contemporary cases of gendered violence. By extension, such an analysis may inform responses to such violence into the future.

In this volume, we place gender and power at the centre of our analysis of violence in modern Indonesian history and Indonesia-related diasporas. In so doing, we seek to incorporate critical discussions around how we might constructively reframe what historically has been termed gendered violence. What does the term ‘gendered violence’ mean? To what extent are these conceptualisations sufficient for the challenges with which historians, human rights activists, anthropologists, feminists and queer studies scholars are grappling? At the individual level, how do we critically analyse different ways of recording, narrating or keeping silent about cases of violence? More broadly, how might we adequately capture the influences of structural inequalities—economic, political, and racialised forms of marginalisation—within processes of violence? How might these examinations usefully inform the ways in which we remember, commemorate and reflect upon such violence?

The chapters in this collection reveal a nuanced understanding of the multiple factors that contribute to violence, the complexity of violence as a social and political phenomenon, as well as the centrality of gender to various experiences of state and non-state violence. Throughout the volume, there is a shared assumption that ‘the meaning of the violence depends on the gendered relationships in which it is embedded’ (Engle Merry 2009, p. 19). Each author uses a unique framework for understanding the nature of gendered violence within specific times and places. The chapters thus present situated analyses that are attentive to the broader social, political and cultural contexts in which violence occurs. This approach enables us to consider gendered violence in conflict and non-conflict settings (Heineman 2011, p. 2). That includes violence that is sometimes too discretely classified as either political, communal, private or individual violence, without sufficient attention to the overlap between these categories (Purdey 2004, p. 205). The chapters in this volume extend to analyses of the aftermath of gendered violence and the ongoing effects of such violence upon the lives of survivors (Das 2001). One important trend across the case studies explored is the lack of redress for past and contemporary cases of gendered violence, which reflects continuing ‘cycles of impunity’ in Indonesia today (Komnas Perempuan 2002 and 2009). Several chapters in this volume explore the local ways in which violence has been recognised, remembered and commemorated, and the way in which care is provided (see Dirgantoro and Hatley; Dragojlovic; Winarnita and Setiawan).

In this collection, we also showcase new methodological and analytical frameworks to examine gender, violence and power in Indonesia and Indonesia-related territories, including the Netherlands, Australia and Timor-Leste. Using a diverse array of sources such as written texts, photographs, performances and interviews, our contributors canvass the complex ways in which survivors, witnesses and activists have recorded, commented upon, or remained silent about cases of gendered violence. We offer rare insights into textual narratives of gendered violence, visualised violence, commemorations of violence, and more subtle forms of violence that accompany processes of care for victims or the ill. The chapters move the reader across time and space in modern Indonesian history: from women's writing about gendered violence in early twentieth century colonial West Sumatra, through to contemporary commemorations in Melbourne of violence against ethnic Chinese Indonesian women in 1998. Together, the contributors help readers to understand the plurality of the Indonesian archipelago and Indonesia-related diasporas.

### **Literature on Gendered Violence in Indonesia**

This collection covers just over one hundred years of historical and contemporary experiences of gendered violence. In the last century, people living in the territory now known as Indonesia have experienced colonial rule and foreign occupation, a war of independence, and as well as numerous periods of intense political and ethnic violence. One of the most violent periods was the 1965–66 genocide, in which the army and civilian vigilantes killed up to 500,000 people who were suspected of being affiliated with the Indonesian Communist Party (*Partai Komunis Indonesia*, PKI). This violence underpinned the rise of a military-dominated government led by General Suharto, which used state-sanctioned force to crush any form of dissent (Cribb 1990; McGregor, Melvin and Pohlman 2018). It was within this context that long-lasting and violent military operations against resistance groups and broader populations in Aceh, West Papua and East Timor took place (Siapno 2003; Tanter, van Klinken and Ball 2006). The eventual collapse of the New Order regime in May 1998 was accompanied by military shootings of student demonstrators and organised riots in Indonesia's major cities. During this period, ethnic Chinese people and their properties were targeted. Reflecting patterns in military-directed violence in Aceh, West Papua and East Timor under the New Order, ethnic Chinese women were singled out for sexual violence by those suspected of being soldiers or military-trained militia (Purdey 2006).

In addition to these examples of state-directed violence, Indonesian people have continued to experience other forms of violence as a result of structural inequalities.

Literature on gender and gendered violence in the former colony of the Netherlands East Indies has evolved over time. From the 1980s, works on gender and the colonial state began to use intersectional approaches to investigate social relations. Scholars combined an analysis of race, class and gender to examine the position of previously understudied colonial subjects, such as the *babu* or house maid, or members of the Indisch (Indo-Dutch) community (Locher-Scholten 2000). Due in part to the limited availability of source material, these works have largely focused on colonial discourses *about* such persons, rather than their self-representation, or what could be discerned about their life experiences. More recently, Eric Jones (2010) has used surviving court records to piece together the views of what he calls the ‘female underclass’ of colonial society. Cases of gendered violence against Indonesian women, ranging from the sexual abuse of women in plantation work (Stoler 2002), within military barracks (Wietsma and Scagliola 2013), and within unequal relationships with Dutch men (Ming 1983), have also been documented in several studies of the former colony. Yet few scholars have provided focused empirical studies or reflections on narratives of gendered violence during or after colonial rule. This tendency is beginning to change with the work of scholars such as Susie Protschky (2018 and this volume) and Galuh Ambar (forthcoming) on gendered violence during the Indonesian National Revolution; and Ana Dragojlovic (2011, 2018 and this volume) and Inez Hollander (2008) on gender, violence, memory and intergenerational trauma among Indisch people.

Cases of state-directed or military violence in Indonesia and East Timor have been widely studied by scholars (see Anderson 2001; Coppel 2006; Cribb 1991; Robinson 1995; Taylor 1999). Yet the gendered dimensions of violence in these major cases are still often neglected. One reason for this paucity in the case of Dutch military violence, for example, was a tendency of scholars to document cases of resistance rather than victimhood throughout the colonial period, but especially during the Indonesian National Revolution (1945–49). This tendency is largely in accord with nationalist trends in Indonesian historiography more broadly (Rahayu 2007). Dutch colonial violence carried out during the Revolution and dating back to the Aceh War (1873–1904), for example, has only just begun to be critically re-

examined using approaches from genocide studies on colonial violence (Luttikhuis and Moses 2014). An oversight in this important new research, however, as Protschky points out in this volume, is that there has been insufficient attention to the gendered dimensions of this violence. One exception to this trend is the attention to sexual violence against women committed by soldiers during the Japanese occupation of the Netherlands East Indies. This case has received considerable scholarly attention, perhaps due to the fact that there are both surviving records of this violence and a global movement to address this case of historical injustice, which has encouraged some women to come forward and share their stories (see Horton 2010; Janssen 2010; Mariana 2015; McGregor 2016).

One of the most important studies of gendered violence in Indonesia more broadly is *Sexual Politics in Indonesia* (2002), in which Saskia Wieringa first charted the evolution of the progressive women's organisation, Gerwani (*Gerakan Wanita Indonesia*, Indonesian Women's Movement), its violent destruction, and associated attacks on women in the 1965–66 genocide. Her work, based on fieldwork conducted in the 1980s, was one of the first studies to place gendered violence at the centre of historical analysis in Indonesia. Wieringa focused on why women were attacked during this period and the long-term effects of this violence. Jacqueline Siapno's 2002 study of how Acehnese women negotiated and resisted the Indonesian military occupation within the context of a devout Muslim society similarly placed gender at the centre of analysis. More recent studies of women's experiences of historical cases of gendered violence committed by the Indonesian military throughout the New Order regime (1966–98) include the work of Annie Pohlman (2015), who used oral history interviews with survivors to document sexual violence by members of the Indonesian military and police during the genocide. Anna Mariana (2015) has compared this case of 'fascist' violence against women to that used by the Japanese military during the 1942–45 occupation. Hannah Loney (2018) has used oral history to follow the arc of East Timorese women's narratives of gendered violence during the Indonesian occupation of that territory (1975–99), as well as to reflect upon trauma, ongoing fears of retribution, the distance of time, and the politics of memory in post-conflict societies. Again, with gender at the centre of her analysis, Lia Kent (2014) has examined the intersections between gender, violence and social suffering in post-conflict Timor-Leste. Kent (2016) has also analysed how women actively use silence as a strategy of coping with the aftermath of violence. The use of silence is a theme that is similarly taken up in this volume (see Dragolovic; Samuels).

In the 1980s and 1990s, a number of domestic and international developments forced considerations of gendered violence onto the national political agenda in Indonesia, while also opening up the space for scholars and activists to study the phenomenon in a more comprehensive fashion. These international developments included the 1986 Convention for the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW) and associated conventions, which arose partly in response to revelations of mass rapes in the former Yugoslavia and rising activism around the so-called ‘comfort women’ issue (Coomaraswamy 1999b). This convention spelled out particular forms of gendered violence, including physical, sexual and psychological violence, occurring within the family or community or perpetrated by the state and its agents, as well as the trafficking and forced prostitution of women. The convention thus created a new discursive space to talk about gendered violence as a crime (see Mackie 2005). In Indonesia specifically, these developments had some important effects: several women’s rights groups, for example, turned their attention to issues such as domestic violence, providing services for affected women and lobbying for the inclusion of marital rape in the criminal code (Blackburn 2004; Jones, this volume; Katjasungkana 2004; Rinaldo 2013).

A major turning point in terms of greater attention to gendered violence in Indonesia was the sexual violence of May 1998, which took place within the context of the fall of the long-standing New Order regime. In response to women’s lobbying, the new Indonesian President B. J. Habibie created Komnas Perempuan (*Komisi Nasional Anti Kekerasan terhadap Perempuan*, National Commission on Violence Against Women), an organisation which monitors multiple forms of gendered violence in Indonesia (Anggraeni 2014; Budianta 2003). Public protests and debates arising from May 1998 that focused on gendered violence also led to critical engagement around sexual violence and violence against women in Indonesia more broadly (Siegel 1998; Purdey 2006; Strassler 2004; Wandita 1998; Winarnita 2012). As Galuh Wandita has pointed out, that many women were speaking out about violence in the aftermath of May 1998 ‘opened up the way’ for women from other areas of the archipelago ‘to raise their voices and to state what similar atrocities’ they had experienced (1998, 38). In an important volume edited by Nur Iman Subono (2000), Indonesian feminist scholars and activists analysed various forms of state violence against women that were being perpetrated

in different regions of Indonesia. These regions included Aceh, East Timor and West Papua, as well the case of the May 1998 rapes and violence against migrant workers.

In East Timor, there were similar prompts for greater attention to gendered violence in the final years of the New Order regime, partially in response to the emergence of an international women's movement. The non-government organisation, Fokupers (*Forum Komunikasi Perempuan Lorosa'e*), began documenting instances of gendered violence and providing support to victims from 1997 (Wandita 1998; Winters 1999). Following the militia-army-directed violence in the aftermath of the 1999 vote for independence, Timor-Leste's Commission for Reception, Truth, and Reconciliation (*Comissão de Acolhimento, Verdade e Reconciliação de Timor-Leste*, CAVR) recorded various forms of violence against women that had been perpetrated during the Indonesian occupation, and pushed for post-conflict reconciliation and the implementation of official transitional justice mechanisms (2013). In this volume, Hannah Loney and Annie Pohlman delve further into the intersections between gender, torture, power and the visual dynamics of violence perpetrated by the Indonesian security forces in occupied East Timor.

Demonstrating the new global spotlight on violence against women, the United Nations Special Rapporteur on Violence Against Women, Radhika Coomaraswamy, visited Indonesia in 1998 and wrote a significant report on violence against women (1999a). In the following decade, an increasing number of NGOs and government agencies produced studies on historical and contemporary cases of gendered violence. Komnas Perempuan (2009), for example, documented four decades of state violence against Indonesian women, analysing the similarities between various cases. Working with survivors and oral history, Indonesia-based NGOs such as the Asia Justice and Rights (AJAR) and the Eastern Indonesian Women's Network for the Study of Women, Religion and Culture (*Jaringan Perempuan Indonesia Timur untuk Studi Perempuan, Agama, dan Budaya*, JPIT) have also recorded women's experiences of the 1965–66 violence, and have engaged in processes of working with victims towards recovery (Kolimon, Wetangterah and Campbell-Nelson 2015). Similar work narrating East Timorese women's experiences of violence and activism was undertaken in independent Timor-Leste by local human rights activists Laura Abrantes and Beba Sequeira (2010).

The general reform movement (*Reformasi*) that had underpinned the collapse of the New Order regime in Indonesia generated increased attention to equity and gender justice (Martyn 2005). This shift included advocacy for new laws related to gendered violence, but also brought about conservative responses to reform and encroachments on gender equity, as a result of a rise in conservative politics. Tracking those developments, Kathryn Robinson and Sharon Bessell's 2002 edited collection provides an overview of the political, social, cultural and economic positions of women in this transition period. Similarly, in her historical study of women and the state in modern Indonesia, Susan Blackburn charts Indonesian women's organising around key issues that continued to generate public controversy in the *Reformasi* era: polygamy, motherhood and violence (2004). Four of the chapters within Blackburn's collection on power and gender relations in Southeast Asia (2001) examine the relationship between religion, culture, the law and women's public and private lives in Indonesia. More recent and detailed studies of trends related to the effects of conservative interpretations of Islam on women include the work of Nina Nurmila (2009) on women's experiences of polygamous marriages, Rachel Rinaldo (2013) on how Muslim and secular women activists have mobilized piety to their advantage, and Dina Afrianty (2018) on women's negotiation of shariah law in Aceh.

In recent years, scholars have offered rich studies of gendered violence across the archipelago, canvassing issues that include domestic violence, child marriage and violence against female migrant workers. Kate O'Shaughnessy (2009), for example, has examined gender, state and social power in Indonesia, with a specific focus on marriage and divorce law (2009). Maria Platt (2017) has written on Muslim women's experiences of informal marriage, divorce and desire. Linda Rae Bennett (2005) has examined sexual and reproductive health in contemporary Indonesia. Finally, Nurul Ilmi Idrus and Linda Rae Bennett (2003) have analysed Bugis women's experiences of marital violence. These studies also consider the extent to which state policies, police workers or religious officials have contributed to or helped address such violence. Some examples here include the work of Sulistyowati Irianto (2016) and others on child marriage (Grijns, Horii, Irianto and Saptandari 2018), and Nina Hall's work on domestic violence in Timor-Leste (2009). Sri Wiyanti Eddyono's 2018 book explores women's empowerment and disempowerment in a



poor community in Jakarta, demonstrating how different groups of women have challenged oppressive authority. One form of gendered violence that we were unfortunately unable to cover in this volume is violence against and within LGBTQI communities. Here, we acknowledge the work of Benjamin Hegarty (2018) on *waria* or transgender people's experiences of violence, Matteo Carlo Alcano (2016) on violence and male sex work, and Sharyn Graham Davies (2010) on gender, gender diversity and sexuality.

Whereas other studies of gendered violence in Indonesia tend to take a state-centric or non-state-centric approach, our study is comprised of multiple case studies that span the archipelago and diaspora. This volume aims to deepen our understanding of gendered violence in Indonesia and related communities. The volume contributes to the broader established field of scholarship on gendered violence in modern Indonesian history, but is distinct due to its geographical breadth, historical depth and methodological diversity. Our collection is comprised of multiple case studies *across space*. Considering the diversity of the archipelago and diaspora communities, the collection sheds light upon the way in which local dynamics (including historical conditions, religion, ethnicity and class) structure and inform experiences of gendered violence. In addition to this geographical breadth, the volume engages with case studies *across time*. From the Dutch colonial period, through the Japanese occupation, decolonisation and the emergence of the modern nation-state, the chapters traverse a long timeframe, highlighting key moments and time periods within modern Indonesian history. The chapters draw upon a diverse range of methodological approaches, including textual and narrative analysis, visual analysis, memory studies, affect studies and hauntology, and anthropological examinations of state institutions and structures.

The capacity for scholars and activists to research violence has increased significantly in post-New Order Indonesia, yet the legacies of this violent past are still very much alive in Indonesian society and politics today. This volume presents a unique snapshot of several cases of past violence in different locations across the archipelago. Together, the chapters demonstrate the complex links between forms of structural inequality and state/non-state violence, as well as the various ways in which public, private and personal violence are all deeply connected. The chapters show the plurality of forms of gendered violence, and the diverse ways in which stories and experiences of violence can be told. The interdisciplinary

nature of the collection also reveals the range of research being conducted into gendered violence in Indonesia today, drawing upon various disciplines and areas of interest. In many ways, our approach compliments Sara Niner's 2017 edited collection on gender in post-conflict Timor-Leste, with a broader focus here on the dynamics and legacies of historical gendered violence in Indonesia and beyond.

The collection draws upon multilingual sources and different research methodologies. It showcases some of the possibilities for undertaking research on gendered violence within the Indonesian context, but also provides examples for studies of gendered violence more broadly. The volume includes several contributions by Indonesian scholars, demonstrating a shift from previous literature that has primarily stemmed from foreign countries (the Netherlands, the United States, Germany and Australia, among others). Most chapters in this volume also invoke the voices of Indonesian women, including in textual and embodied forms (see Beech Jones; Dirgantoro and Hatley; Winarnita and Setiawan). Building on the work of an emerging generation of young Indonesian feminist scholars, we hope that this volume will pave the way for further research that will remove gendered violence from 'the margins' of analyses of violence in Indonesian history and society (Purdey 2004, p. 204).

## **Overview of the Book**

The chapters in this volume are based on papers that were presented at a workshop, 'Gendered Violence Across Time and Space: The Netherlands East Indies, Indonesia, and Timor-Leste', which was held at the University of Melbourne from 9–11 May 2018.<sup>1</sup> In this volume, the chapters are arranged into four themes: textual narratives; visualising violence; commemorating violence; and the politics of care. The opening chapters chart different ways of narrating, witnessing, recording and visualising gendered violence across time and space. These chapters demonstrate the range of registers across which feminist postcolonial historians can trace views about, and locate evidence of, gendered violence. In the case of historical instances of violence, these registers include modes of indirect and culturally nuanced commentary, through to partial archival and written records. In the case of visualised violence, this ranges from unintended documentation through to deliberately staged photographs. As the chapters progress, the reader moves closer to the present, with the

chapters drawing upon approaches from cultural studies, memory studies, anthropology, and studies of law and society. The contributors consider the long aftermath of gendered violence, the use of different mediums to communicate intergenerational memories of past suffering, as well as the provision of care to those affected by gendered violence.

The opening chapters analyse textual narratives of gendered violence that took place in the first half of the twentieth century. The texts examined in Chapter One were written by ethnic Minangkabau women in the early twentieth century, and describe how they bore witness to the effects of intimate violence. The texts featured in Chapter Two include both archive records compiled during and shortly after the Japanese occupation, and one journalist's account from the early 1990s of what we would today classify as sexual violence committed by the Japanese military against Dutch and Indonesian women.

In Chapter One, 'Narrating Intimate Violence in Public Texts: Women's Writings in the West Sumatran Newspaper *Soenting Melajoe*', Bronwyn Beech Jones investigates how women wrote about experiences of family violence in the early Malay-language women's newspaper, *Soenting Melajoe*. Through close attention to language and tone, as well as an intimate awareness of her own temporal, geographic and cultural position, Beech Jones analyses how norms derived from Minangkabau *adat* (customary law and norms derived from local traditions) and interpretations of Islam are reflected in the texts. Moving beyond a simplistic view of Minangkabau women as enjoying more power in a matrifocal society, Beech Jones shows how contributors conceptualised their place in families and communities as both powerful and marginal. This chapter highlights the strong sense of solidarity between the writers and readers of the newspaper, and the emergence of an alternative network of communication which Beech Jones describes as 'a nation of women'. Through a close analysis of the women's writing styles, Beech Jones reflects upon the complexity of women's forms of self-expression. She argues that the contributors to *Soenting Melajoe* not only wrote about violence against women, but they also appealed to readers of the newspaper to join with them in lamenting and remembering women's suffering, and in advocating for systems of care to be reformed.

In Chapter Two, 'Living in a Conflict Zone: Gendered Violence during the Japanese Occupation of the Netherlands East Indies', Katharine McGregor reflects upon the partial evidence available to reconstruct a picture of experiences of sexual and gendered violence during the Japanese occupation of the Netherlands East Indies. McGregor suggests that although Indonesian women remain subaltern in surviving Dutch records of the occupation, historians can still piece together some of their experiences. She focuses in particular on Dutch, Eurasian and Indonesian women's experiences of forced prostitution or sexual slavery, forced marriage, as well as relationships based on some form of negotiation. In order to think critically about the breadth of sexual violence in this period, McGregor outlines the complex dynamics of power that existed between Japanese soldiers and civilians, Indonesian and Dutch women who were residents of the colony. The chapter highlights the need to pay constant attention to the conditions of the occupation that underpinned many instances of sexual violence, including cases of rape through to repeated abuse in so-called comfort stations, prison camps for Dutch people or within forced marriages. Throughout the chapter, McGregor reflects on how cases of sexual violence are reported and by whom, and the problems of neatly labelling women's experiences and awarding them agency. Expanding the frame of reference, she considers how other forms of gendered violence, including coercion by family members or communities, may have contributed to sexual violence.

The following chapters analyse visual evidence of gendered violence, as we move into the post-World War Two period. Chapter Three looks at implied violence against Indonesian women and children captured in the personal photographs of Dutch soldiers who fought against Indonesians during the Indonesian National Revolution (1945–49). Chapter Four, by contrast, critically deconstructs the violence behind photographs of very explicit torture committed by the Indonesian soldiers against East Timorese women during the occupation of that territory.

In Chapter Three, 'Home at the Front: Violence Against Indonesian Women and Children in Dutch Military Barracks during the Indonesian National Revolution', Susie Protschky focuses on a collection of Dutch soldiers' amateur photographs from the military operations of 1945–50. Applying a feminist focus to the larger context in which the images were produced, Protschky argues that the photographs offer valuable insights into 'how gendered

and racialised structures of colonial violence manifested' during this period. The chapter reflects on what the photographs tell us about soldiers' notions of masculinity and colonial discourses of humanitarian rule. Protschky analyses different forms of gendered violence revealed through both soldiers' photographs and other sources, including violence against children in the form of child labour, both in the barracks and through the recruitment of young Indonesian boys into soldiering for Dutch forces. These visual records capture a relatively neglected form of violence perpetrated by Dutch soldiers: that of the coerced concubinage of Indonesian women in Dutch military barracks. Through the innovative use of this partial archive, Protschky complicates our understanding of gendered and racialised violence at the end of the Dutch empire.

In Chapter Four, 'The Sexual and Visual Dynamics of Torture: Analysing Atrocity Photographs from Indonesian-Occupied East Timor', Hannah Loney and Annie Pohlman analyse the visual dynamics of violence perpetrated by the Indonesian security forces during the occupation of East Timor (1975–99). Drawing upon broader literature on atrocity images, Loney and Pohlman argue that despite the ethical challenges posed by the existence, circulation and uses of visual materials created by perpetrators, these sources should be considered evidence of crimes and can be critically analysed to tell us more about the nature and form of gendered violence. The authors carefully unpack a small selection of torture photographs that feature female victims, analysing what the perpetrators intentions may have been in producing such mementos of violence. Through such an analysis, the authors demonstrate that the highly gendered and sexualised forms of torture being perpetrated and displayed in the photographs were for the soldiers' essential components of performing, documenting and commemorating these horrific acts. Loney and Pohlman argue that these processes of production and consumption reveal an explicitly visual dimension to the gendered violence practiced by the Indonesian security forces in East Timor.

Continuing the theme of performance and the commemoration of gendered violence, Chapters Five and Six offer analyses of works produced by playwrights, novelists and artists long after violence has taken place. Chapter Five considers two different forms of theatre performance related to women survivors of the 1965–66 violence. Chapter Six analyses how violence against ethnic Chinese women in the May 1998 riots has been remembered twenty

years later, in a diaspora community in Melbourne, Australia.

In Chapter Five, ‘Memory on Stage: Affect, Gender and the Performative in 1965–66 Survivor Testimonies’, Wulan Dirgantoro and Barbara Hatley examine the representational complexities of memory in two Indonesian dramatic performances that engage with the state-sanctioned violence of the 1965–66 anti-communist killings. The two theatre performances considered are *Turmoil at the Sacred Grave* (2017), devised and produced by Agung Kurniawan, and *The Silent Song of Genjer Flowers* (2015), written and directed by Faiza Mardzuki. These works focus on different ways of narrating gendered violence against women. Drawing on Marianne Hirsch’s (2012) concept of ‘postmemory’, Dirgantoro and Hatley compare the artistic strategies and experiential impact of *Silent Song*, in which actors relay survivors’ testimonies, and *Turmoil*, in which real-life survivors perform and audience member participate. Both plays recall the gendered violence of 1965–66 in ways that celebrate the strength of the survivors and memorialise their legacy for future generations. By focusing on the family as a critical site for the intergenerational transmission of trauma, this discussion offers insights into broader discourses on gender, power and the aftermath of violence in post-New Order Indonesia.

In Chapter Six, ‘Commemorating Gendered Violence Two Decades On: Chinese Indonesian Women’s Voices in the Diaspora’, Monika Winarnita and Ken Setiawan analyse literary and artistic works which take up the theme of sexual violence against ethnic Chinese Indonesian women in the May 1998 riots, as well as the twentieth anniversary commemoration of this violence in Melbourne. As a consequence of the 1998 violence, many Chinese Indonesians—a small and often vulnerable minority—fled the country and resettled across the globe. Situated within the broader literature on memory, with insights from human rights studies, Winarnita and Setiawan examine how gendered and racialised violence is remembered and commemorated in a situation of both temporal and geographical distance. They analyse the work of Chinese Indonesian women artists and writers who seek to counter dominant narratives that silence the systematic gender-based violence towards ethnic minorities, and consider the particular challenges that these activists encounter in raising past injustices.

The final section of the book considers gendered violence and the politics of care, examining questions such as who is deemed worthy of and receives care in the aftermath of violence. Chapter Seven looks at the Indisch population in the Netherlands. Chapter Eight and Nine are case studies from Aceh, the northernmost province of Indonesia. Aceh has experienced three decades of armed conflict and, more recently, the implementation of strict interpretations of Islamic law that focus on policing morality (Srimulyani 2010; Afrianty 2015; Feener, Kloos and Samuels 2016). The combined effects of these processes are both heightened levels of suffering and trauma across family histories, and an increased focus on conservative interpretations of Islam. In this context, Chapter Eight focuses on the conditions surrounding local recognition of harm, including varied interpretations of the Quran and the related receipt of care in the context of domestic violence. Chapter Nine analyses how structural gendered violence limits the possibilities of care in the case of HIV positive women who face pressures to disguise their illness.

In Chapter Seven, ‘Caring for the Un-Speakable: Coercive Pedagogies, Shame, and the Structural Violence Continuum in Indisch Intergenerational Memory Work’, Ana Dragojlovic examines how varied forms of structural inequalities, both historical and contemporary, are central for the experience and management of intergenerational suffering. The chapter focuses on the personal and collective memory work of persons of Indisch background, whose families lived in the Netherlands from the 1940s to the 1950s, following the demise of the Dutch colonial empire. Dragojlovic uses the concept of a ‘structural violence continuum’ to argue against an easy compartmentalisation of silence as psychopathological numbness and a naturalised response to long histories of violence. Paying close attention to racialised, gendered and intergenerational memory work, Dragojlovic explores the various dynamics of violence, speech, shame and haunting. She analyses the lyrics of the Indisch pop musician Wouter Muller and the consumption of his music to chart how and why certain forms of violence, coercion and marginalisation are openly addressed while others remain ‘un-speakable’. Dragojlovic argues that Muller and those who consume his music are engaging in the *work of care*: a form of emotional labour that seeks to alleviate intergenerational suffering brought on by long histories of structural violence.

In Chapter Eight, 'The Politics of Care: A Case Study of Domestic Violence in Aceh', Balawyn Jones considers community understandings of domestic violence in Aceh and, in particular, how local cultural and religious constructs of gender inform or produce responses to domestic violence at the community level. Wary of essentialist constructions of 'Muslim' beliefs about domestic violence, Jones offers a complex analysis of diverse views of what is seen to constitute 'violence' or harm. She establishes that community constructions of these concepts are critically important to understanding the type of care that is made available to victims, as well as the politics of community recognition. Jones argues that despite the introduction of the Anti-Domestic Violence Law in 2004 that criminalised domestic violence, in practice, community actors often silence, ignore, minimise, normalise, justify or excuse violence in the household. Specifically, Jones suggests, many community members believe that interpretations of Islam permit some forms of physical violence as disciplinary or educative in relation to women's compliance or non-compliance with their *kodrat* ('God-given nature'). Yet, as Jones demonstrates, women still navigate these contexts by exercising agency in the face of victimisation.

In Chapter Nine, 'Gendered Violence, Gendered Care: Non-Intervention, Silence Work and the Politics of HIV in Aceh', Annemarie Samuels analyses how silence, in the case of HIV positive patients in Aceh, can limit, but sometimes also enable, the possibilities of care. Samuels demonstrates how silence is implicated in both gendered violence and women's responses to such violence. Drawing on two stories of HIV-positive women that illuminate the multiple forms of structural and intimate violence influencing their lives, Samuels suggests that political acts of *not* intervening in healthcare provisions for vulnerable groups may exacerbate the suffering caused by gendered violence. At the same time, women engage in what Samuels calls 'silence work' in response to conditions of violence and limited care, as they consciously navigate silence and speech to remake their everyday lives. Samuels argues that women's silence and the lack of healthcare interventions are intricately connected to layered experiences of gendered violence.

To conclude the book, the afterword by Ana Dragojlovic, 'Gender, Violence, Power: The Pervasiveness of Heteropatriarchal Moral Orders in Indonesia Across Time and Space' broadens our discussion to consider the larger overarching structural context of



heteropatriarchy that permeates multiple forms of gendered violence. Thinking with the eminent gender theorist Donna Haraway (2015), Dragojlovic reflects upon our collective insights and asks what we, as scholars working on violence, might do – not only write about, but also cultivate ‘the capacity to respond’ to multiple forms of violence. She also proposes further avenues for research on gendered violence in Indonesia and beyond.

Although all chapters in this volume focus on communities that have historically been connected to Indonesia, they are written in dialogue with research on gendered violence that extends across multiple contexts. As such, the volume offers new insights into the diverse ways in which gendered violence has been experienced, narrated and understood. More broadly, we hope that these reflections are of use to activists and carers seeking recognition and redress for past and contemporary cases of gendered violence in Indonesia today.

## Reference List

Abrantes, Laura Soares, and Beba Sequeira, eds. 2010. *Secrecy: The Key to Independence: It's Better to Have No Title Than to Have No Nation*. Dili: Blue Mountains East Timor Sisters.

Afrianty, Dina. 2015. *Women and Sharia Law in Northern Indonesia: Local Women's NGOs and the Reform of Islamic Law in Aceh*. London and New York: Routledge.

Afrianty, Dina. 2018. “Agents for Change: Local Women's Organizations and Domestic Violence in Indonesia.” *Journal of the Humanities and Social Sciences of Southeast Asia and Oceania* 174(1): 24–46.

Alcano, Matteo Carlo. 2016. *Masculine Identities and Male Sex Work between East Java and Bali: An Ethnography of Youth, Bodies, and Violence*. Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan.

Anderson, Benedict R O’G, ed. 2001. *Violence and the State in Suharto's Indonesia*. Ithaca: Southeast Asia Program Publications, Southeast Asia Program, Cornell University.

Anggraeni, Dewi. 2014. *Tragedi Mei 1998 dan Lahirnya Komnas Perempuan*. Jakarta: Penerbit Buku Kompas.

Bennett, Linda Rae. 2005. *Women, Islam and Modernity: Single Women, Sexuality, and Reproductive Health in Contemporary Indonesia*. New York: Routledge Curzon.

Blackburn, Susan, ed. 2002. *Love, Sex and Power: Women in Southeast Asia*. Clayton: Monash Asia Institute.

Blackburn, Susan. 2004. *Women and the State in Modern Indonesia*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Budianta, Melani. 2003. "The Blessed Tragedy: The Making of Women's Activism during the Reformasi Years." In *Challenging Authoritarianism in Southeast Asia*, edited by Ariel Heryanto and Sumit Mandal, 145–177. New York: Routledge and Curzon.

Commission for Reception, Truth and Reconciliation in East Timor (CAVR). 2013. *Chega! The Final Report of the Timor-Leste Commission for Reception, Truth and Reconciliation*, Vol. 1. Jakarta: KPG and STP-CAVR.

Coomaraswamy, Radhika. 1999a. *Integration of the Human Rights of Women and the Gender Perspective: Violence against Women*. Report of the Special Rapporteur on Violence against Women, Its Causes and Consequences, Addendum to Mission to Indonesia and East Timor on the Issue of Violence against Women. United Nations Economic and Social Council, E/CN.4/1999/68. 21 January.

Coomaraswamy, Radhika 1999b. "Reinventing International Law: Women's Rights as Human Rights in the International Community." In *Debating Human Rights: Critical Essays from the United States and Asia*, edited by Peter Van Ness, 167–183. London and New York: Routledge.

Coppell, Charles A, ed. 2006. *Violent Conflicts in Indonesia: Analysis, Representation and Resolution*. London and New York: Routledge.

Cribb, Robert. 1990. *The Indonesian Killings of 1965–1966: Studies from Java and Bali*. Clayton: Monash University Centre of Southeast Asian Studies.

Cribb, Robert. 1991. *Gangsters and Revolutionaries: The People's Militia in the Indonesian Revolution, 1945–49*. Hawaii: University of Hawaii Press.

Davies, Sharyn Graham. 2010. *Gender Diversity in Indonesia: Sexuality, Islam and Queer Selves*. London and New York: Routledge.

Dragojlovic, Ana. 2011. “Did You Know My Father? The Zone of Unspeakability as Postcolonial Legacy.” *Australian Feminist Studies* 26 (69): 319–334.

Dragojlovic, Ana. 2018. “Politics of Negative Affect: Intergenerational Hauntings, Counter-Archival Practices and the Queer Memory Project.” *Subjectivity* 11 (4): 91–107.

Engle Merry, Sally. 2009. *Gender Violence: A Cultural Perspective*. Chichester: John Wiley and Sons Ltd.

Feener, Michael R, David Kloos and Annemarie Samuels, eds. 2016. *Islam and the Limits of the State: Reconfigurations of Practice, Community and Authority in Contemporary Aceh*. Leiden: Brill.

Grijns, Mies, Hoko Horii, Sulistyowati Irianto and Pinky Saptandari, eds. 2018. *Menikah Muda di Indonesia Suara, Hukum, dan Praktik*. Jakarta: Yayasan Pustaka Obor Indonesia.

Hall, Nina. 2009. “East Timorese Women Challenge Domestic Violence.” *Australian Journal of Political Science* 44 (2): 309–325.

Haraway, Donna. 2015. “Anthropocene, Capitalocene, Chthulhucene.” In *Art in the Anthropocene: Encounters among Aesthetics, Politics, Environments and Epistemologies*, edited by Heather Davis, Etienne Turpin, 255–269. London: Open Humanities Press.

Hegarty, Benjamin. 2018. "Under the Lights, Onto the Stage: Becoming Waria through National Glamour in New Order Indonesia." *TSQ: Transgender Studies Quarterly* 5 (3): 355–377.

Heineman, Elizabeth D. 2011. "Introduction: The History of Sexual Violence in Conflict Zones." In *Sexual Violence in Conflict Zones: From the Ancient World to the Era of Human Rights*, edited by Elizabeth D. Heineman, 1–24. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.

Hirsch, Marianne. 2012. *The Generation of Postmemory: Writing and Visual Culture after the Holocaust*. New York: Columbia University Press.

Hollander, Inez. 2008. *Silenced Voiced: Uncovering a Family's Colonial History in Indonesia*. Athens: Ohio University Press.

Horton, William Bradley. 2010. "Comfort Women." In *The Encyclopedia of Indonesia in the Pacific War*, edited by Peter Post, William H Frederick, Iris Heidebrink, Shigeru Sato, William Bradley Horton, and Didi Kwartanada, 184–195. Leiden and Boston: Brill.

Ilmi Idrus, Nurul and Linda Rae Bennett. 2003. "Presumed Consent: Marital Violence in Bugis Society." In *Violence Against Women in Asian Societies: Gender Inequalities and Technologies of Violence*, edited by Linda Rae Bennett and Lenore Manderson, 41–60. London and New York: Routledge Curzon.

Janssen, Hilde. 2010. *Schaamte en Onschuld: Het Verdrongen Oorlogsverleden van Troostmeisjes in Indonesië* [Shame and Innocence: The Repressed History of Comfort Women in Indonesia]. Amsterdam: Nieuw Amsterdam.

Katjasungkana, Nursyahbani. 2004. "Gender and Transformative Legal Aid." In Karen Mokate *Women's Participation in Social Development: Experiences from Asia, Latin America and the Caribbean*, Washington: Inter American Bank.

Kent, Lia. 2014. "Narratives of Suffering and Endurance: Coercive Sexual Relationships, Truth Commissions and Possibilities for Gender Justice in Timor-Leste." *International Journal of Transitional Justice* 8 (2): 289–313.

Kent, Lia. 2016. "Sounds of Silence: Everyday Strategies of Social Repair in Timor-Leste." *The Australian Feminist Law Journal* 42 (1): 31–50.

Kolimon, Mary, Liliya Wetangterah and Karen Campbell-Nelson. 2015. *Forbidden Memories: Women's Experiences of 1965 in Eastern Indonesia*. Clayton: Monash University Publishing.

Komnas Perempuan. 2002. *Failed Justice and Impunity: The Indonesian Judiciary's Track Record on Violence against Women; Report to the UN Special Rapporteur on Independence of the Judiciary: Mission to Indonesia*. Jakarta: Komnas Perempuan.

Komnas Perempuan. 2009. *Kita Bersikap. Empat Dasawarsa Kekerasan Terhadap Perempuan Dalam Perjalanan Berbangsa*. Jakarta: Komnas Perempuan.

Locher-Scholten, Elsbeth. 2000. *Women and the Colonial State: Essays on Gender and Modernity in the Netherlands Indies 1900–1942*. Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press.

Loney, Hannah. 2018. *In Women's Words: Violence and Everyday Life During the Indonesian Occupation of East Timor, 1975–1999*. Portland: Sussex Academic Press.

Luttikhuis, Bart W., and Dirk Moses. 2014. "Introduction." In *Colonial Counterinsurgency and Mass Violence: The Dutch Empire in Indonesia*, edited by Bart W. Luttikhuis and Dirk Moses, 1–24. London and New York: Routledge.

Mackie, Vera. 2005. "In Search of Innocence, Feminist Historians Debate the Legacy of Wartime Japan." *Australian Feminist Studies* 20 (47): 207–217.

Mariana, Anna. 2015. *Perbudakaan Seksual: Perbandingan Antara Masa Fasisme Jepang dan Neofasisme Orde Baru*, Yogyakarta: Marjin Kiri.

Martyn, Elizabeth M. 2005. *The Women's Movement in Post-Colonial Indonesia: Gender and Nation in a New Democracy*. Abingdon and New York: Routledge Curzon.

McGregor, Katharine. 2016. "Transnational and Japanese Activism on Behalf of Indonesian and Dutch Victims of Enforced Military Prostitution During World War Two." *Japan Focus: The Asia Pacific Journal*: <http://apjif.org/>.

McGregor, Katharine, Jess Melvin and Annie Pohlman, eds. 2018. *The Indonesian Genocide of 1965: Causes, Dynamics and Legacies*. Cham: Palgrave Macmillan.

Ming, Hanneke. 1983. "Barracks Concubinage in the Indies, 1887–1920." *Indonesia* 35: 65–94.

Niner, Sara, ed. 2017. *Women and the Politics of Gender in Post-Conflict Timor-Leste: Between Heaven and Earth*. Oxfordshire and New York: Routledge.

Nurmila, Nina. 2009. *Women, Islam and Everyday Life: Renegotiating Polygamy in Indonesia*. Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon: Routledge.

O'Shaughnessy, Kate. 2009. *Gender, State and Social Power in Contemporary Indonesia: Divorce and Marriage Law*. London and New York: Routledge.

Platt, Maria. 2017. *Marriage, Gender and Islam in Indonesia: Women Negotiating Informal Marriage, Divorce and Desire*. New York: Routledge.

Pohlman, Annie. 2015. *Women, Sexual Violence and the Indonesian Killings of 1965–66*. New York: Routledge.

Protschky, Susie. 2018. "Soldiers as Humanitarians: Photographing War in Indonesia (1945–49)." In *Visualising Human Rights*, edited by Jane Lydon, 39–62. Perth: UWA Publishing.

Purdey, Jemma. 2004. "Describing Kekerasan: Some Observations on Writing About Violence in Indonesia After the New Order." *Bijdragen tot de Taal-, Land- en Volkenkunde* 160 (2/3): 189–225.

Purdey, Jemma. 2006. *Anti-Chinese Violence in Indonesia, 1996–1999*. Singapore: ASAA SEA Publications Series, Singapore University Press.

Rahayu, Ruth Indiah. 2007. “Kontruksi Historiografi Feminisme dari Tutar Perempuan”, *Indonesia Historiografi Indonesia: di Antara Historiografi Nasional dan Alternatif*, Pusat Studi Sosial Asia Tenggara and ARC, Hotel Yogya Plaza, 2-4 July 2007.

Rinaldo, Rachel. 2013. *Mobilizing Piety: Islam and Feminism in Indonesia*. London: Oxford University Press.

Robinson, Geoffrey. 1995. *The Dark Side of Paradise: Political Violence in Bali*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press.

Robinson, Kathryn and Sharon Bessell, eds. 2002. *Women in Indonesia: Gender, Equity and Development*. Singapore: Institute of Southeast Asian Studies.

Siapno, Jacqueline. 2002. *Gender, Islam, Nationalism and the State in Aceh*. London: Routledge Curzon.

Siapno, Jacqueline. 2003. “Notes of an Out-of-Place Widow.” In *Violence Against Women in Asian Societies: Gender Inequalities and Technologies of Violence*, edited by Linda Rae Bennett and Lenore Manderson, 150–158. London and New York: Routledge Curzon.

Siegel, J. 1998. “Early Thoughts On the Violence of May 13 and 14, 1998 in Jakarta.” *Indonesia* 66 (1): 75–109.

Srimulyani, Eka. 2010. “Islam, Adat and the State: Matrifocality in Aceh Revisited.” *Al-Jami’ah: Journal of Islamic Studies* 48 (2): 321–342.

Stoler, Ann Laura. 2002. *Carnal Knowledge and Imperial Power: Race and the Intimate in Colonial Rule*. Berkeley, Los Angeles, London: University of California Press.

Strassler, Karen. 2004. “Gendered Visibilities and the Dream of Transparency: the Chinese-

Indonesian Rape Debate in Post-Suharto Indonesia.” *Gender & History* 16 (3): 689–725.

Subono, Nur Iman. 2000. *Negara dan Kekerasan Terhadap Perempuan* [The State and Violence Against Women]. Jakarta: Yayasan Jurnal Perempuan and the Asia Foundation Indonesia.

Sulistiyowati, Irianto. 2016. “Pernikahan Anak: Status Anak Perempuan?” *Jurnal Perempuan* 88: <https://www.jurnalperempuan.org/pernikahan-anak-status-anak-perempuan.html>.

Tanter, Richard, Gerry van Klinken, and Desmond Ball, eds. 2006. *Masters of Terror. Indonesia's Military and Violence in East Timor*. Lanham: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc.

Taylor, John G. 1999. *Indonesia's Forgotten War: The Hidden History of East Timor*. London: Zed Books.

United Nations. 1993. Declaration on the Elimination of Violence Against Women. UN General Assembly, Resolution 48/104, 85th Plenary Meeting, 20 December: <http://www.un.org/documents/ga/res/48/a48r104.htm>.

Wandita, Galuh. 1998. “The Tears Have Not Stopped, the Violence Has Not Ended: Political Upheaval, Ethnicity, and Violence against Women in Indonesia.” *Gender and Development* 6 (3) [Violence against Women]: 34–41.

Weldon, S. Laurel. 2002. *Protest, Policy and the Problem of Violence against Women; A Cross-National Comparison*. Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press.

Wieringa, Saskia. 2003. *Sexual Politics in Indonesia*. Houndmills: Palgrave MacMillan.

Wietsma, Annegriet, and Stef Scagliola. 2013. *Liefde in Tijden van Oorlog*. Amsterdam: Boom.



Winarnita, Monika. 2012. "The Politics of Commemorating the May 1998 Mass Rapes." *RIMA: Review of Indonesian and Malaysian Affairs* 45 (1): 133–164.

Winters, Rebecca, ed. 1999. *Buibere: The Voice of East Timorese Women, Volume 1*. Darwin: East Timorese Support Centre.

\_\_\_\_\_ (a.k.a. Sally-Anne Watson), ed. 1999. *Buibere: Lian Feto Timór Lorosa'e Nian, Volume 2*. Darwin: East Timor Support Centre.

Wiyanti Eddyono, Sri. 2018. *Women's Empowerment in Indonesia: A Poor Community in Jakarta*. London: Routledge.

---

<sup>1</sup> We would like to thank the University of Melbourne's Hallmark funded Melbourne Research Alliance to End Violence against Women and their Children (MAEVe) and the Faculty of Arts for funding support to enable us to host the workshop and complete work on this volume, as well as the participants in the workshop for the stimulating discussions.