

Minerva Access is the Institutional Repository of The University of Melbourne

Author/s:

Harries, AD;Schwoebel, V;Monedero-Recuero, I;Aung, TK;Chadha, S;Chiang, CY;Conradie, F;Dongo, JP;Heldal, E;Jensen, P;Nyengele, JPK;Koura, KG;Kumar, AMV;Lin, Y;Mlilo, N;Nakanwagi-Mukwaya, A;Ncube, RT;Nyinoburyo, R;Oo, NL;Patel, LN;Piubello, A;Rusen, ID;Sanda, T;Satyanarayana, S;Syed, I;Thu, AS;Tonsing, J;Trébucq, A;Zamora, V;Zishiri, C;Hinderaker, SG;Aït-Khaled, N;Roggi, A;Caminero Luna, J;Graham, SM;Dlodlo, RA;Fujiwara, PI

Title:

Challenges and opportunities to prevent tuberculosis in people living with HIV in low-income countries

Date:

2019-01-01

Citation:

Harries, A. D., Schwoebel, V., Monedero-Recuero, I., Aung, T. K., Chadha, S., Chiang, C. Y., Conradie, F., Dongo, J. P., Heldal, E., Jensen, P., Nyengele, J. P. K., Koura, K. G., Kumar, A. M. V., Lin, Y., Mlilo, N., Nakanwagi-Mukwaya, A., Ncube, R. T., Nyinoburyo, R., Oo, N. L., ... Fujiwara, P. I. (2019). Challenges and opportunities to prevent tuberculosis in people living with HIV in low-income countries. *International Journal of Tuberculosis and Lung Disease*, 23 (2), pp.241-251. <https://doi.org/10.5588/ijtld.18.0207>.

Persistent Link:

<https://hdl.handle.net/11343/224183>

Challenges and opportunities to prevent tuberculosis in people living with HIV in low income countries

Journal:	<i>The International Journal of Tuberculosis and Lung Disease</i>
Manuscript ID	IJTLD-03-18-0207.R2
Manuscript Type:	State of the Art - standalone
Date Submitted by the Author:	18-Aug-2018
Complete List of Authors:	Harries, Tony; International Union Against Tuberculosis and Lung Disease, Research Schwoebel, Valerie; The Union, Tuberculosis Monedero-Recuero, Ignacio; The Union, TB and LH Aung, Thet; The Union, TBHIV Chadha, Sarabjit; International Union Against Tuberculosis and Lung Diseases (The Union), Operations Research Chiang, Chen-Yuan; International Union Against Tuberculosis and Lung Disease, Lung Health; Conradie, Francesca; University of Witwatersrand, , Department of Medicine, Faculty of Health Sciences Dongo, John Paul; The International Union against Tuberculosis and Lung Disease , HIV Heldal, Einar; independent consultant, TB; Jensen, Paul; The Union, Tuberculosis Nyengele, Jean Pierre; The Union, TBHIV Koura, Kobto; International Union Against Tuberculosis and Lung Disease (The Union), Tuberculosis and VIH Kumar, Ajay; International Union Against TB and Lung Disease, Research Lin (GE), Yan; The Union China Office, None Mlilo, Ngobile; The International Union Against Tuberculosis and Lung Disease (The Union), Monitoring and Evaluation Nakanwagi-Mukwaya, Anna; International Union Against Tuberculosis and Lung Disease, TBHIV Ncube, Ronald; International Union Against Tuberculosis and Lung Disease Zimbabwe Office, TB HIV Nyinoburyo, Rodrigo; The Mildmay Uganda, HIV Oo, Nay; International Union Against Tuberculosis and Lung Disease, TBHIV Patel, Leena; Vital Strategies, Research Division Piubello, Alberto; The Union, Tuberculosis Rusen, ID; The Union, Tuberculosis; Sanda, Tatiana; International Union Against Tuberculosis and Lung Disease, TBHIV Satyanarayana, Srinath; Center for Operational Research, International Union against Tuberculosis and Lung Disease, New Delhi, India, Tuberculosis Syed, Imran; The Union, Tuberculosis

	Thu, Aung Si; International Union Against Tuberculosis and Lung Disease (The Union), Mandalay, Myanmar, MDR-TB Tonsing, Jamhoih; International Union Against Tuberculosis and Lung Disease, The Union South-East Asia Office Trebucq, Arnaud; The Union, Tuberculosis Division; Zamora, Victor; International Union Against Tuberculosis and Lung Disease, TBHIV Zishiri, Christopher; International Union Against Tuberculosis and Lung Disease Zimbabwe Office, TB-HIV Hinderaker, Sven Gudmund; University of Bergen, Center for International Health Ait-Khaled, Nadia; The Union, Asthma; Roggi, Alberto; The Union, TBHIV Caminero, Jose; Hospital de Gran Canaria, Department of Respiratory Medicine; The Union, Tuberculosis Graham, Stephen; Centre for International Child Health, Department of Paediatrics Dlodlo, Riitta; The Union, Department of TB and HIV Fujiwara, Paula; The Union, TB and HIV;
Key Words:	HIV/AIDS, tuberculosis, antiretroviral therapy, isoniazid preventive treatment, infection control

**Challenges and opportunities to prevent tuberculosis in people living with HIV
in low income countries**

An invited “State of the Art” paper for IJTLD – R2

Authors:

Anthony D Harries,^{1,2} Valerie Schwoebel,¹ Ignacio Monedero,¹ Thet Ko Aung,^{1,3}
Sarabjit Chadha,^{1,4} Chen-Yuan Chiang,^{1,5} Francesca Conradie,^{6,7}
John-Paul Dongo,^{1,8} Einar Heldal,¹ Paul Jensen,¹ Jean Pierre Kabuayi Nyengele,^{1,9}
Kobto Koura,^{1,10} Ajay MV Kumar,^{1,4} Yan Lin,^{1,11} Nqobile Mlilo,^{1,12} Anna
Nakanwagi-Mukwaya,^{1,8} Ronald Ncube,^{1,12} Rodrigo Nyinoburyo,^{1,8} Nay Lynn Oo,^{1,3}
Leena Patel,⁷ Alberto Piubello,^{1,13} ID Rusen,^{1,7} Tatiana Sanda,^{1,9} Srinath
Satyanarayana,^{1,4} Imran Syed,¹ Aung Si Thu,^{1,3} Jamie Tonsing,^{1,4} Arnaud Trébucq,¹
Victor Zamora,^{1,14} Christopher Zishiri,^{1,12} Sven Gudmund Hideraker,^{1,15} Nadia Aït-
Khaled,¹ Alberto Roggi,¹ Jose Caminero Luna,^{1,16} Stephen M Graham,^{1,17} Riitta A
Dlodlo,^{1,12} Paula I. Fujiwara.¹

Author Institutions:

¹ International Union Against Tuberculosis and Lung Disease, Paris, France
² London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine, Keppel Street, London, UK
³ International Union Against Tuberculosis and Lung Disease, Myanmar Office,
Mandalay, Myanmar
⁴ International Union Against Tuberculosis and Lung Disease, South-East Asia Office,
New Delhi, India
⁵ Division of Pulmonary Medicine, Department of Internal Medicine, Wan Fang
Hospital, Taipei Medical University, Taipei, Taiwan
⁶ University of Witwatersrand, Faculty of Health Sciences, South Africa

27 ⁷ Vital Strategies, New York, USA

28 ⁸ International Union Against Tuberculosis and Lung Disease, Uganda Office,

29 Kampala, Uganda

30 ⁹ International Union Against Tuberculosis and Lung Disease, DRC Office, Kinshasa,

31 Democratic Republic of Congo

32 ¹⁰ MERIT IRD, Université Paris 5, Sorbonne Paris Cité, Paris, France

33 ¹¹ International Union Against Tuberculosis and Lung Disease, China Office, Beijing,

34 China

35 ¹² International Union Against Tuberculosis and Lung Disease, Zimbabwe Office,

36 Harare, Zimbabwe

37 ¹³ Damien Foundation, Brussels, Belgium

38 ¹⁴ International Union Against Tuberculosis and Lung Disease, Peru Office, Lima,

39 Peru

40 ¹⁵ University of Bergen, Bergen, Norway

41 ¹⁶ Pneumology Department, General Hospital of Gran Canaria “Dr. Negrin”, Las

42 Palmas, Spain

43 ¹⁷ Centre for International Child Health, University of Melbourne Department of

44 Paediatrics and Murdoch Children’s Research Institute, Royal Children’s Hospital,

45 Melbourne, Australia.

52 *** Corresponding author:**

53 Professor AD Harries, Old Inn Cottage, Vears Lane,

54 Colden Common, Winchester SO21 1TQ, UK

55 Phone: +44 (0) 1962 714 297

56 Email: adharries@theunion.org

57

58 **Paper Content:**

59 **Abstract word count = 250**

60 **Narrative word count = 4500**

61 **References = 88**

62 **Tables = 4**

63

64 **Short running title:**

65 Preventing TB in people living with HIV

66

67 **Key words:**

68 HIV/AIDS; tuberculosis; antiretroviral therapy; isoniazid preventive treatment;

69 infection control

70

71

72 **ABSTRACT**

73 People living with HIV (PLHIV) are at high risk for TB, and TB is a major cause of
74 death in PLHIV. Preventing TB in PLHIV is therefore a key priority. Early initiation
75 of antiretroviral therapy (ART) in asymptomatic PLHIV has a potent TB preventive
76 effect, with even more benefits in those with advanced immunodeficiency. Applying
77 the most recent WHO recommendations that all PLHIV initiate ART regardless of
78 clinical stage or CD4 cell count could provide a large TB preventive benefit at the
79 population level in high HIV-prevalence settings. Preventive therapy can treat TB
80 infection and prevent new infections during the course of treatment. It is now
81 established that isoniazid preventive therapy (IPT) combined with ART amongst
82 PLHIV significantly reduces the risk of TB and decreases mortality compared with
83 ART alone, and therefore has huge potential benefits for millions. However, despite
84 the evidence, this intervention is not implemented in most low-income countries with
85 high burdens of HIV-associated TB. HIV and TB programme commitment,
86 integration of services, proper screening procedures for excluding active TB, reliable
87 drug supplies, patient-centred support to ensure adherence and well-organized follow-
88 up and monitoring that includes drug safety are needed for successful implementation
89 of IPT, and these would also be needed for future shorter preventive regimens. A
90 holistic approach to TB prevention in PLHIV should also include other important
91 preventive measures such as detection and treatment of active TB particularly among
92 contacts of PLHIV and TB infection control measures in health facilities, homes of
93 index patients and congregate settings.

94

95

96

97 **Introduction**

98

99

100

101

102

103

104

105

106

107

108

109

110

111

112

113

114

115

116

117

118

119

120

Since the emergence of the HIV/AIDS epidemic in the 1980s, infection with the human immunodeficiency virus (HIV) has remained the most important risk factor for the development of tuberculosis (TB). HIV targets the host cell-mediated immune response to *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* (MTB).¹ The resulting immunosuppression increases the risk of reactivation of TB infection,² as well as the risk of rapid progression of a recently acquired TB infection.³ Without treatment, people living with HIV (PLHIV) and with MTB infection have an annual risk of developing TB of approximately 10% per year compared to an estimated 10% lifelong risk in non HIV-infected individuals.^{4,5} Both mechanisms (reactivation and new infection) lead to an increase in TB incidence among PLHIV as well as increased MTB transmission in the community.

One third of PLHIV with TB die annually.⁶ The reasons include: i) failure to suspect or diagnose TB,⁷ ii) delays and challenges in diagnosing TB due to immunodeficiency-related presentations with smear-negative pulmonary disease or extra-pulmonary /disseminated disease,^{8,9} iii) non-provision or delayed treatment with antiretroviral therapy (ART) and cotrimoxazole preventive therapy in co-infected TB patients, and iv) missed opportunities to prevent TB in PLHIV.

The epidemiological impact of this deadly association remains high. In 2016 alone, over 1.0 million PLHIV worldwide were estimated to develop TB (10% of the total burden of incident TB), among whom 74% lived in Africa, and 374,000 PLHIV were estimated to have died from TB (22% of total TB deaths).⁶ The overall high mortality in HIV-associated TB and the generally inadequate medical and programmatic responses mean that it is far better to prevent TB than wait for it to

121 occur. TB prevention is now a vital component of the technical pillar of the World
122 Health Organization (WHO) End TB Strategy.^{6,10}

123 In 2009, Aït-Khaled and colleagues discussed the important challenges and
124 concerns regarding isoniazid preventive therapy (IPT).¹¹ A recent review of barriers to
125 IPT scale-up concluded that none should prove unsurmountable.¹² Yet, despite the
126 large consensus on the importance of TB prevention in PLHIV, worldwide
127 implementation appears heterogeneous and mainly restricted to countries with better
128 resources.¹³

129 After the Union World Lung Health Conference in Mexico in 2018, a group of
130 TB-HIV consultants at the International Union Against Tuberculosis and Lung
131 Disease (The Union) discussed key interventions that can be implemented by national
132 programmes to prevent TB among PLHIV in low income countries (LIC), based on
133 their field experience. This paper offers a review of the most important therapeutic
134 interventions: namely, ART (now recommended for all PLHIV regardless of their
135 CD4 cell count or WHO clinical stage of disease¹⁴) and IPT (with updated WHO
136 guidelines recently published¹⁵), focusing on the programmatic challenges and
137 opportunities around their implementation and putting them in the context of other
138 preventive interventions.

139

140 **The role of ART in TB prevention**

141 **Does ART reduce the individual risk of TB in people living with HIV?**

142 ART is associated with rapid recovery of mycobacteria-specific immune
143 responses resulting in increased capacity to limit mycobacterial growth.¹⁶ At the
144 clinical level, this translates into a potent TB preventive effect and a reduction in
145 individual risk of TB (**Table 1**).

146 A systematic review and meta-analysis from 2002 to 2011 showed that ART
 147 was associated with a 65% reduction in TB incidence across all baseline CD4 counts
 148 in PLHIV.¹⁷ Subsequent studies confirmed the preventive benefit of early ART
 149 initiated at higher CD4 cell counts, and also showed that delays in ART initiation can
 150 result in long-term immune dysfunction and persistent increased risk for TB.^{18,19} Two
 151 randomised controlled trials (RCTs) published in 2015 (INSIGHT START and
 152 TEMPRANO) further strengthened the evidence.^{20,21} The INSIGHT START trial
 153 showed that early ART initiation in asymptomatic HIV-positive patients with CD4
 154 counts > 500 cells/ μ L was associated with an almost 60% reduction in risk of death,
 155 serious AIDS-related events or serious non-AIDS-related events, including
 156 disseminated TB, compared with deferred initiation until the CD4 count had
 157 decreased to 350 cells/ μ L.²⁰ The 2-by-2 factorial design TEMPRANO trial, conducted
 158 in Cote d'Ivoire, enrolled PLHIV with CD4 cell counts < 800 cells/ μ L and not
 159 meeting criteria for starting ART according to the WHO guidelines available at the
 160 time.²¹ Patients were randomised to one of four groups: deferred ART (starting ART
 161 according to the most recent WHO guideline criteria); deferred ART plus six-months
 162 isoniazid preventive therapy (IPT); early ART – (starting ART immediately); and
 163 early ART plus six-months IPT. Early ART was associated with a 44% lower risk of
 164 death or severe HIV-related illness, including TB, compared with deferred ART, with
 165 IPT adding significantly to the individual benefit.²¹

166

167 **Can ART reduce TB incidence at the programmatic level?**

168 At the programme level, despite PLHIV routinely initiating ART at low CD4
 169 counts especially in sub-Saharan Africa,²² decreases in TB notification rates have
 170 been observed in countries such as Malawi, Swaziland, Zimbabwe and Kenya where

171 ART coverage in the HIV-infected populations has reached a high level.^{23–27}
172 Significant declines in TB cases in Malawi and Swaziland were observed in patients
173 with smear-negative pulmonary TB and in patients with recurrent TB, both of which
174 are strongly associated with HIV. In Kenya and Malawi, declines in case notifications
175 were also seen in HIV-negative TB, which might be due to overall decreases in HIV-
176 associated TB leading to reduced transmission of *MTB* in the community.^{23,27} It is
177 plausible that part of the decrease in TB incidence observed since 2008 in countries
178 mostly affected by the HIV epidemic could be attributable to the increase in ART
179 coverage, as evidenced by the parallel decrease in HIV prevalence in notified TB
180 cases in these countries.⁶

181 This positive news from the programmatic front is supported by mathematical
182 models predicting the enormous impact that immediate start of ART might have on
183 TB prevention at the population level.²⁸ The application of the 2016 WHO
184 Consolidated Guidelines on the use of ART recommending that ART be offered to all
185 PLHIV regardless of clinical stage or CD4 cell count¹⁴ opens the way for immediate
186 initiation of therapy for all those infected. It is crucial then to diagnose HIV early and
187 there are various initiatives now being implemented that facilitate this, including
188 community-based HIV testing, self-testing and partner notification services.
189 Randomised trials also point to better retention in care and decreased mortality in
190 those initiating ART on the same day that HIV infection is diagnosed.²⁹ These
191 innovative approaches are likely to provide large public health benefits by reducing
192 the incidence of TB and other HIV-related diseases as well as reducing HIV
193 transmission from infected to non-infected individuals.^{20, 21, 30} Comprehensive and
194 timely linkage of newly diagnosed PLHIV to HIV care and treatment is an essential
195 pre-requisite, however, if these benefits are to be realised.³¹

196

197 **Can ART alone optimally prevent TB?**

198 While these data on ART in preventing TB are encouraging, ART alone does not
 199 do the job adequately. Long-term recovery of TB-specific immune function is
 200 incomplete on ART.¹⁶ In the clinic, the TB preventive effects of ART increase with
 201 length of time on therapy and with ART-induced immune recovery, but the risk of TB
 202 never decreases to levels seen in patients without HIV infection in the same
 203 community.³² Optimization of TB prevention therefore requires additional
 204 interventions.

205

206 **The role of treatment for TB infection**

207 Until recently, IPT has been the most widely used treatment for the prevention of
 208 TB. It is an intervention which is immediately appealing for controlling an infectious
 209 disease such as TB. It is capable of eliminating *MTB* from the body by treating latent
 210 TB infection (LTBI) and may additionally prevent new infections during the course of
 211 treatment.

212

213 **1. Did IPT reduce the individual risk of TB in the pre-ART era?**

214 There have been three systematic reviews of the benefit of IPT in preventing TB
 215 in PLHIV, largely of studies from the pre-ART era.³³⁻³⁵ The last review, published in
 216 2010 (**Table 2**), suggested that IPT at a daily dose of 300 mg for 6 months reduced
 217 the overall risk of TB by 33%, with the protective effect increased to 64% when
 218 targeted at individuals with a positive tuberculin skin test (TST).³⁵ Because of no
 219 demonstrable reduction in TB incidence or mortality when IPT was given to PLHIV

220 whose TST was negative, TST before IPT was considered an essential component of
221 this policy.

222 However, the challenge of obtaining and storing tuberculin, then performing,
223 reading and interpreting the skin tests which may be falsely negative in anergic
224 PLHIV and finally implementing this screening in the context of busy HIV clinics
225 was one of the important limiting factors responsible for poor implementation of IPT
226 as recommended by the WHO and the joint United Nations Programme on HIV and
227 AIDS (UNAIDS) in 1998.³⁶

228

229 **2. What is the expected benefit of IPT in the ART era?**

230 In the current situation where ART is recommended for all PLHIV regardless of
231 the level of immunity,¹⁴ the important question is whether or not IPT provides
232 additional benefit to ART. Several recent studies highlighted in **Table 2** confirm an
233 affirmative response, further strengthened by observational data from Botswana,^{37, 38}
234 Brazil,³⁹ South Africa,⁴⁰ and Ethiopia⁴¹ showing lower incidence rates of TB in those
235 on ART plus IPT compared with those on ART alone (**Table 3**).

236 Two major RCTs provide strong evidence for the additional benefit of IPT. The
237 first, conducted in South Africa, showed that IPT given for 12 months to PLHIV on
238 ART significantly reduced the risk of active TB by 37%, with the greatest benefit
239 being observed in the first year.⁴² The effect of IPT was not significantly different
240 according to whether patients had a positive or a negative TST or interferon-gamma
241 release assay (IGRA). The second (TEMPRANO study) showed that 6 months of IPT
242 given in addition to ART resulted in a 35% reduction in HIV-related death or severe
243 illness, of which 42% was due to TB, at whatever CD4 cell count ART was
244 initiated.²¹

245 Long-term follow-up of patients enrolled in TEMPRANO showed that 6 months
 246 of IPT resulted in a 37% reduction in death that was independent of ART over an
 247 average of 4.9 years of follow-up.⁴³ This evidence from Cote d'Ivoire on reduced
 248 mortality with IPT was also confirmed in two previous studies –an observational
 249 design in South Africa and a stepped wedge, cluster-randomised design in Brazil.^{44,45}

250 In summary, ART plus IPT is more effective than ART alone in reducing
 251 mortality as the addition of IPT to ART further reduces the risk of TB in high TB
 252 endemic settings. Therefore, WHO now recommends that IPT should be given in
 253 combination with ART at the time HIV is diagnosed.¹⁴

254

255 **3. Which PLHIV benefit more from IPT in the ART era?**

256 The South African and TEMPRANO long-term follow-up studies showed that the
 257 benefits of IPT in reducing TB risk and mortality also occurred in patients with
 258 negative TST or IGRA results, but to a lesser extent.^{42,43} Because of this demonstrated
 259 benefit and given the difficulties and obstacles that TST poses for IPT scale-up, WHO
 260 revised guidelines in 2011 and again in 2018 recommending that IPT should be given
 261 to PLHIV with an unknown or positive TST who are unlikely to have active TB in
 262 resource-constrained settings.¹⁵

263 However, giving IPT to all PLHIV without prior TST or IGRA will result in an
 264 impact at the population level that will differ according to the level of TB
 265 transmission in the country. The impact is likely to be greater in high TB transmission
 266 settings, but lower in settings with moderate to low risk of TB infection because the
 267 number of PLHIV with prior TB infection will be fewer. WHO recommends that
 268 PLHIV be screened for LTBI, if resources permit, since those with a positive TST

269 benefit more from preventive therapy,¹⁵ and this is the standard approach in most
270 high-income countries.⁴⁶

271

272

273 **4. What is the role of IPT in children?**

274 The evidence of benefit of preventive therapy for all children living with HIV is
275 not as clear as with adults. While an early study in a high TB endemic setting in the
276 pre-ART era found that IPT improved early survival and reduced TB incidence in
277 children,⁴⁷ recent systematic reviews found no benefit of IPT in reducing TB
278 incidence and no additional benefit when isoniazid was given to children on
279 ART.^{48,49} As the prevalence of TB infection among children in close contact with a
280 TB case is high and as children living with HIV are at high risk of developing TB
281 disease following infection, IPT is always recommended for children living with HIV
282 of any age who are TB contacts provided they do not have active TB.^{15,50} By contrast,
283 young children who are not TB contacts have a low probability of being infected by
284 *MTB* – for example, this is less than 5% in children under 5 years of age where the
285 annual risk of TB infection is <1%, a situation observed in several LIC.⁵¹

286 While WHO recommends that all adults and adolescents living with HIV receive
287 preventive therapy, in children living with HIV who are considered unlikely to have
288 TB disease, there is a strong recommendation for 6 months of IPT for those aged ≥ 12
289 months only if living in settings with a high TB prevalence and for infants (<12
290 months) only if they are in contact with a case of TB.¹⁵

291

292 **5. For how long should IPT be given?**

293 The WHO recommends that the duration of IPT be at least 6 months with 36
 294 months (as a surrogate for life-long treatment) conditionally recommended in areas
 295 with high TB incidence and transmission.¹⁵ The question of how long to give IPT is
 296 context-specific. The TEMPRANO study in Cote d'Ivoire, West Africa, where TB
 297 incidence rates are estimated at about 160 per 100,000 people,⁶ suggested that 6-
 298 months IPT + ART has a durable effect on mortality for almost five years,
 299 presumably by combining the two complementary mechanisms of IPT (curing LTBI
 300 and preventing new infections during the course of the treatment) and ART (leading
 301 to immune recovery that decreases the risk of both new TB infection and
 302 reactivation).^{21, 43}

303 In high TB exposure environments, such as Botswana and South Africa where
 304 incidence rates are estimated to be about 350 and 830 per 100,000 respectively,⁶ six
 305 months of IPT may be insufficient. In Botswana, 36 months of IPT given to PLHIV,
 306 who were mostly on ART, reduced TB incidence by 43% compared with 6 months of
 307 IPT.³⁷ However, after cessation of IPT, TB incidence rebounded even in the presence
 308 of ART.³⁸ This suggests that in settings with a high TB burden and transmission,
 309 continuous IPT probably acts not only to cure LTBI but also to prevent new
 310 infections.⁵² In high transmission settings, continuous IPT may therefore be
 311 necessary. A systematic review and meta-analysis suggests that in high TB and HIV
 312 prevalence settings, continuous IPT in PLHIV for at least 36 months is beneficial and
 313 probably outweighs the risk of increased adverse effects as compared with IPT for 6
 314 months.⁵³ Based on the available evidence, this recommendation is now endorsed by
 315 the WHO in the 2018 guidelines.¹⁵ Thus, the choice of regimen duration should be
 316 based on the epidemiological situation, with long duration of IPT to be considered for
 317 countries with high TB transmission, such as in Southern and Eastern Africa, while

318 the 6-month regimen could be considered for other low and medium prevalence
319 countries.

320

321 **6. What are the conditions to consider for the programmatic**
322 **implementation of IPT in the context of ART?**

323 As with any public health strategy, programmatic implementation of IPT
324 needs to meet acceptable conditions to guarantee effectiveness while limiting
325 potential risks and simultaneously considering resource constraints. First, the level of
326 TB transmission in the country should be assessed to determine the required duration
327 of IPT, the expected benefit to PLHIV if given without prior testing for TB infection,
328 and the respective benefits if given to adults and to children. Second, the expected
329 impact at a population level may be estimated by considering the prevalence of HIV
330 infection together with the level of TB transmission in the community. Third,
331 activities that are necessary to adequately apply the strategy must be considered and
332 resources required to conduct them should be evaluated. All these steps involve both
333 national HIV-AIDS and TB programmes: HIV programmes will be the implementers,
334 as management of PLHIV is mainly conducted in HIV clinics, and TB programmes
335 will play a crucial role in supporting the activity. Guidance for this evaluation is
336 proposed and presented in **Table 4**.

337

338 **7. How should programmes organize the initiation of IPT?**

339 A crucial principle is that IPT must not be given to PLHIV who may have
340 active TB, and IPT must be discontinued in any PLHIV who develops symptoms and
341 signs of active TB. If active TB is unrecognized, there is not only a risk of delayed
342 diagnosis and death for the patient, but also a risk of promoting isoniazid-resistant

disease which may be more difficult to treat, is associated with worse treatment outcomes,⁵⁴ and may be transmitted to others. A systematic review in the pre-ART era assessing the effect of IPT on the risk for isoniazid-resistant TB reported a summary relative risk of 1.45 (95% confidence interval 0.85 – 2.47).⁵⁵ While this result did not reach statistical significance, an increased risk for isoniazid-resistant TB after use of IPT could not be excluded. In a more recent study, the prevalence of isoniazid-resistance in patients diagnosed with TB during or after IPT was 16%.⁵⁶ In Botswana, after IPT implementation at the national level the overall prevalence of isoniazid-resistance increased from 1.7% in 1995 to 7.6% in 2007-2008.⁵⁷ Based on these observations, it is critical that i) active TB is excluded before starting IPT and ii) TB is diagnosed during IPT.

Symptomatic PLHIV who initiate ART may present with a constellation of weight loss, fever, night sweats and respiratory symptoms, due either to HIV-related disease or HIV-associated TB. Making the correct diagnosis is both difficult and prone to error.⁵⁸ Simple and clear diagnostic procedures accompanied by adequate training and supervision are needed, particularly since staff at HIV clinics are usually not fully trained to diagnose TB. The use of Xpert® MTB/RIF should be encouraged because of its increased sensitivity compared with sputum smear microscopy.⁵⁹ This is especially the case for immunosuppressed patients who present with non-specific symptoms of disseminated disease in whom the sputum smears can be negative and chest radiography normal. However, it is essential that there is stable and regular electricity, adequate maintenance, uninterrupted supplies of cartridges and close monitoring of the screening activities by the TB programme in order to ensure the effectiveness and added value of this tool.⁶⁰

367 The costs and organizational problems associated with chest x-ray led to the
368 abandonment of this diagnostic modality in providing IPT in Botswana,⁶¹ and the
369 systematic use of chest x-ray is currently not considered mandatory in resource-
370 limited settings with high HIV prevalence.¹⁵ However, if resources permit it is worth
371 considering. Indeed, WHO states that the combination of absence of any chest x-ray
372 abnormality and absence of symptoms suggestive of TB offers the highest sensitivity
373 and negative predictive value for ruling out TB.⁶²

374 Given these screening and diagnostic challenges, a prudent course of action is
375 to initiate ART and wait for the patient to stabilise and gain weight before starting IPT
376 so that patients with undiagnosed prevalent TB are not mistakenly placed on isoniazid
377 monotherapy. In the TEMPRANO study during a one-month waiting period before
378 initiating IPT, 1.6% of participants were diagnosed with active TB,⁶³ and in another
379 operational study amongst PLHIV starting ART in Malawi, TB was diagnosed
380 between 20-50 days after enrolment in about 10% of those with TB.⁶⁴ An intermediate
381 waiting period of up to 3 months after ART initiation, during which PLHIV are under
382 close surveillance would thus be sensible in the routine setting.

383 While in theory, asymptomatic PLHIV could be safely started on IPT much
384 earlier, a fixed waiting period would enable standardization across programmes and
385 would allow for the early “unmasking” of TB from immune reconstitution
386 inflammatory disease during the first few months of ART.^{65,66} Starting PLHIV on IPT
387 who are stable and asymptomatic allows for easier monitoring during ART follow-up.
388 Any individual who develops new symptoms or signs or starts to lose weight must be
389 suspected as having TB. IPT must be stopped and the patient investigated for TB and
390 other HIV-related disease.

391

392 **8. How should Programmes ensure safety and adherence?**

393 The most serious adverse event is isoniazid-induced hepatitis, which if
 394 unrecognised and unattended can lead to acute liver failure and death. The estimated
 395 rate of symptomatic isoniazid-related hepatitis can range from one to three per 1,000
 396 persons, with established risk factors being increasing age, pre-existing liver disease,
 397 chronic hepatitis C infection, concomitant use of other hepatotoxic medications such
 398 as ART non-nucleoside reverse transcriptase inhibitors and regular alcohol
 399 consumption.⁶⁷ In the Botswana studies, isoniazid-induced hepatitis was the main
 400 adverse effect, occurring in about 1% of patients and usually during the first nine
 401 months of treatment.^{37,38}

402 Given the absence of laboratory monitoring in most decentralised ART
 403 programmes, the approach should be to exclude anyone at higher risk of hepatitis
 404 (older people and those with a known history of liver disease or alcohol abuse).
 405 Patients and health care workers must all be educated about the importance of
 406 stopping IPT in the event of nausea, vomiting, confusion or jaundice with immediate
 407 reporting to a health facility for assessment. Isoniazid may also cause peripheral
 408 neuropathy although the addition of vitamin B 6 (pyridoxine) may provide some
 409 protection.¹⁵

410 An important prerequisite, frequently overlooked, is that a safe, secure and
 411 robust supply of isoniazid is ensured: drug shortages were the commonest reason for
 412 discontinuing IPT in an Ethiopian community-based study.⁶⁸ Adherence to medication
 413 is then critical for ensuring effectiveness of IPT, and it is well recognized that
 414 adherence to preventive treatment is more difficult to achieve than adherence to
 415 curative therapy. Many studies on IPT among PLHIV have reported low rates of
 416 treatment completion (e.g., 53% in Uganda in the pre-ART era and 64% in Ethiopia

417 more recently),^{69,70} and completion rates under programmatic rather than study
418 conditions are likely to be even lower. PLHIV already receive a high number of pills.
419 Thus, it is crucial to deliver proper information about the action of the drug, potential
420 side effects and the benefits of taking the full course of treatment. Programmes
421 implementing IPT should therefore ensure that health care workers are adequately
422 trained on how to educate patients, to follow-up the treatment, and to monitor and
423 manage any adverse events as well as completion or discontinuation of therapy. This
424 will require strong collaboration between HIV and TB programmes.

425

426 **9. Should other treatment regimens to prevent TB be considered?**

427 WHO has recently recommended alternative options to IPT for TB preventive
428 therapy in high TB incidence countries that include i) rifampicin and isoniazid daily
429 for 3 months (3HR) in children and adolescents aged <15 years and ii) rifapentine and
430 isoniazid weekly for 3 months (3HP) for both adults and children.¹⁵

431 The 3HR regimen has demonstrated at least equivalent effectiveness, better
432 adherence and fewer side effects than IPT (or 6H) among children, and its application
433 is facilitated by the availability of dispersible paediatric fixed-dose formulations
434 offering the right drug dosage.⁷¹ Much attention has been paid to weekly 3HP, which
435 appears to be effective in low- and high-incidence TB settings and is associated with
436 less hepatotoxicity and higher treatment completion rates than daily IPT given for at
437 least 6 months.⁷²⁻⁷⁷ In addition, a recently completed trial showed non-inferiority of
438 one month of daily isoniazid and rifapentine (1HP) compared with 9 months of IPT.⁷⁸

439 The problem with using rifamycin-containing regimens such as RH or HP in
440 PLHIV is the potential for drug-drug interactions with ART. Based on recent
441 evidence, rifamycins can be used effectively with efavirenz at 600 mg daily, but may

be problematic for PLHIV on ART regimens that include efavirenz 400 mg daily, protease inhibitors or dolutegravir (an integrase inhibitor) for first-line therapy.⁷⁹ Nonetheless, these shorter regimens of one to three months make these potentially useful TB preventive therapy options for PLHIV in resource-limited settings in the future, provided the costs of rifapentine can be reduced. Shorter regimens could also encourage countries to pursue the necessary TB preventive approaches. Despite their inherent advantages for patients, physicians and programs, however, shorter regimens will not completely offset the challenges for programmatic implementation, and a coordinated network and strengthening of programmes will still be needed. In the near foreseeable future, both IPT and shorter regimens will probably co-exist in national policies of preventive therapy.

Other measures for preventing TB in PLHIV

Other interventions are capable of contributing significantly to TB prevention in PLHIV. Early detection and treatment of active TB among contacts of PLHIV is important.⁸⁰ PLHIV should thus be informed about the necessity to report on signs/symptoms of TB in their close contacts, and HIV clinic staff should be trained to regularly monitor and link such persons to TB diagnosis, treatment and contact investigation.

Infection control is likely to play an important role, particularly in high HIV prevalence areas where PLHIV comprise a large proportion of hospital admissions and out-patient consultations and where the presence of patients with unrecognized TB can result in intense TB transmission.⁸¹⁻⁸³ Given the global rise in drug-resistant TB and the greater mortality observed in those co-infected with HIV,^{84,85} preventive interventions assume even greater importance. They should be given high priority in

467 health facilities, as well as in other high TB transmission settings such as homes of
468 index patients, prisons or refugee camps.⁸⁶

469 The TB and HIV-associated TB epidemic, however, will only be ended if the
470 other important social and behavioural determinants of the disease, such as poverty,
471 overcrowding, undernutrition, migration, tobacco and alcohol abuse,⁸⁷ are addressed
472 in parallel with these clinical and programmatic interventions.

473

474 **Conclusion**

475 TB can be significantly reduced in PLHIV by ensuring that all persons at risk
476 know their HIV status and those diagnosed with HIV infection are immediately
477 initiated and sustained on effective ART. Because the effectiveness of IPT combined
478 with early ART to prevent TB and reduce mortality is now well demonstrated,⁸⁸ LIC
479 must give serious thought to implementation and scale up.

480 Strong collaboration between HIV and TB programmes will be necessary.
481 Elements to consider for IPT implementation include i) the choice of treatment
482 duration, ii) a clear and applicable procedure to exclude active TB before starting IPT
483 using the best diagnostic tools that are available and including a three month waiting
484 period before IPT initiation, iii) a robust drug supply so that there are no drug
485 interruptions, iv) adequate patient support and well-organized patient follow-up to
486 ensure safety and adherence, and v) proper monitoring of this activity. Shorter
487 regimens are promising and may replace IPT in the future, although these will require
488 the same organizational elements for effective implementation. Other practical
489 interventions such as TB detection among close contacts and infection control should
490 also be seriously addressed.

491 TB prevention in PLHIV has been a neglected part of TB control, and while it
492 has huge potential benefit the challenges of implementation must be addressed. Yet,
493 since countries with the highest prevalence of both HIV and TB infection are also
494 those with the most under-funded programmes, additional resources will be needed.

For Review Only

495 **REFERENCES**

496

497 1. Lawn SD, Butera ST, Shinnick TM. Tuberculosis unleashed: the impact of
498 human immunodeficiency virus infection on the host granulomatous response to
499 *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. Microbes Infect 2002; 4: 635-646.

500 2. Selwyn P A, Hartel D, Lewis V A, et al. A prospective study of the risk of
501 tuberculosis among intravenous drug users with human immunodeficiency
502 virus infection. N Engl J Med 1989; 320: 545–550.

503 3. Daley C L, Small P M, Schechter G F, et al. An outbreak of tuberculosis with
504 accelerated progression among persons infected with the human
505 immunodeficiency virus. N Engl J Med 1992; 326: 231–235.

506 4. Lawn SD, Harries AD, Williams BG, et al. Antiretroviral therapy and the control
507 of HIV-associated tuberculosis. Will ART do it? Int J Tuberc Lung Dis 2011; 15:
508 571 – 581.

509 5. Corbett EL, Watt CJ, Walker N, et al. The growing burden of tuberculosis:
510 global trends and interactions with the HIV epidemic. Arch Intern Med 2003;
511 163: 1009-1021.

512 6. World Health Organization. Global Tuberculosis Report 2017. WHO, Geneva,
513 Switzerland. WHO/HTM/TB/2017.23

514 7. Gupta RK, Lucas SB, Fielding KL, Lawn SD. Prevalence of tuberculosis in post-
515 mortem studies of HIV-infected adults and children in resource-limited settings:
516 a systematic review and meta-analysis. AIDS 2015; 29: 1987-2002.

517 8. Chamie D, Abizaid A, Costa JR, et al. Significant variation in presentation of
518 pulmonary tuberculosis across a high resolution of CD4 strata. Int J Tuberc Lung
519 Dis 2010; 14: 1295-1302.

- 520 9. Guirado E, Schlesinger LS. Modeling the *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*
 521 Granuloma – the critical Battlefield in Host Immunity and Disease. *Front*
 522 *Immunol* 2013; 4: 98.
- 523 10. World Health Organization. The End TB Strategy. 2015. WHO, Geneva,
 524 Switzerland. Available: http://www.who.int/tb/post2015_TBstrategy.pdf
 525 (Accessed 27th June 2017).
- 526 11. Ait-Khaled N, Alarcon E, Bissell K, et al. Isoniazid preventive therapy for
 527 people living with HIV: public health challenges and implementation issues.
 528 *Int J Tuberc Lung Dis* 2009; 13: 927-935.
- 529 12. Pathmanathan I, Ahmedov S, Pevzner E, et al. TB preventive therapy for
 530 people living with HIV: key considerations for scale-up in resource-limited
 531 settings. *Int J Tuberc Lung Dis* 2018; 22: 596-605.
- 532 13. Gupta S, Granich R, Date A, et al. Review of policy and status of
 533 implementation of collaborative HIV-TB activities in 23 high-burden
 534 countries. *Int J Tuberc Lung Dis* 2014; 18: 1149-1158.
- 535 14. World Health Organization. Consolidated Guidelines on the Use of
 536 Antiretroviral drugs for treating and preventing HIV infection:
 537 Recommendations for a Public Health Approach. 2016. Second Edition.
 538 WHO, Geneva, Switzerland.
- 539 15. World Health Organization. Latent tuberculosis infection. Updated and
 540 consolidated guidelines for programmatic management. 2018. WHO, Geneva,
 541 Switzerland. WHO/CDS/TB/2018.4.
- 542 16. Lawn SD, Bekker LG, Wood R. How effectively does HAART restore immune
 543 responses to *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*? Implications for tuberculosis control.
 544 *AIDS* 2005; 19: 1113 – 1124.

- 545 17. Suthar AB, Lawn SD, del Amo J, et al. Antiretroviral therapy for prevention of
546 tuberculosis in adults with HIV: a systematic review and meta-analysis. PLoS
547 Med 2012; 9: e1001270.
- 548 18. Grinsztejn B, Hosseinipour MC, Ribaudo HJ, et al, and the NPTN 052-ACTG
549 Study Team. Effects of early versus delayed initiation of antiretroviral
550 treatment on clinical outcomes of HIV-1 infection: results from the phase 3
551 HPTN 052 randomised controlled trial. Lancet Infect Dis 2014; 14: 281 – 290.
- 552 19. Collins SE, Jean Juste MA, Koenig SP, et al. CD4 deficit and tuberculosis risk
553 persist with delayed antiretroviral therapy: 5-year data from CIPRA HT-001.
554 Int J Tuberc Lung Dis 2015; 19: 50 – 57.
- 555 20. The INSIGHT START Study Group. Initiation of antiretroviral therapy in early
556 asymptomatic HIV infection. N Engl J Med 2015; 373: 795 – 807.
- 557 21. The TEMPRANO ANRS 12136 Study Group. A trial of early antiretrovirals and
558 isoniazid preventive therapy in Africa. N Engl J Med 2015; 373: 808-822.
- 559 22. Siedner MJ, Ng CK, Bassett IV, Katz IT, Bangsberg DR, Tsai AC. Trends in
560 CD4 count at presentation to care and treatment initiation in sub-Saharan Africa,
561 2002 – 2013: a meta-analysis. Clin Infect Dis 2015; 60: 1120 – 1127.
- 562 23. Yuen CM, Weyenga HO, Kim AA, et al. Comparison of trends in tuberculosis
563 incidence among adults living with HIV and adults without HIV – Kenya,
564 1998 – 2012. PLoS ONE 2014; 9: e99880.
- 565 24. Haumba S, Dlamini T, Calnan M, et al. Declining tuberculosis notification
566 trend associated with strengthened and expanded HIV care in Swaziland.
567 Public Health Action 2015; 5: 103-105.

- 568 25. Kanyerere H, Harries AD, Tayler-Smith K, et al. The rise and fall of
 569 tuberculosis in Malawi: associations with HIV infection and antiretroviral
 570 therapy. *Trop Med Int Health* 2016; 21: 101 – 107.
- 571 26. Takarinda KC, Harries AD, Sandy C, Mutasa-Apolo T, Zishiri C. Declining
 572 tuberculosis case notification rates with the scale-up of antiretroviral therapy
 573 in Zimbabwe. *Public Health Action* 2016; 6: 164-168.
- 574 27. Kanyerere H, Girma B, Mpunga J, et al. Scale-up of ART in Malawi has
 575 reduced case notification rates in HIV-positive and HIV-negative tuberculosis.
 576 *Public Health Action* 2016; 6: 247 – 251.
- 577 28. Williams BG, Granich R, De Cock KM, Glaziou P, Sharma A, Dye C.
 578 Antiretroviral therapy for tuberculosis control in nine African countries. *Proc*
 579 *Nat Acad Sci USA* 2010; 107: 19485-19489.
- 580 29. Ford N, Migone C, Calmy A, et al. Benefits and risks of rapid initiation of
 581 antiretroviral therapy. *AIDS* 2018; 32: 17-23.
- 582 30. Cohen MS, Chen YQ, McCauley M, et al. Prevention of HIV-1 infection with
 583 early antiretroviral therapy. *N Engl J Med* 2011; 365: 493-505.
- 584 31. Iwuji CC, Orne-Gliemann J, Larmarange J, et al. Universal test and treat and
 585 the HIV epidemic in rural South Africa: a phase 4, open-label, community
 586 cluster randomized trial. *Lancet HIV* 2018; 5: e116-e125.
- 587 32. Gupta A, Wood R, Kaplan R, Bekker L-G, Lawn SD. Tuberculosis incidence
 588 rates during 8 years of follow-up of an antiretroviral treatment cohort in South
 589 Africa: comparison with rates in the community. *PLoS ONE* 2012; 7: e34156.
- 590 33. Wilkinson D, Squire SB, Garner P. Effect of preventive treatment for
 591 tuberculosis in adults infected with HIV: systematic review of randomised
 592 placebo controlled trials. *BMJ* 1998; 317: 625-629.

- 593 34. Woldehanna S, Volmink J. Treatment of latent tuberculosis infection in HIV
594 infected persons. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev* 2004; (1): CD000171.
- 595 35. Akolo C, Adetifa I, Shepperd S, Volmink J. Treatment of latent tuberculosis
596 infection in HIV-infected persons. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev* 2010; (1):
597 CD000171.
- 598 36. WHO and UNAIDS. Policy statement on preventive therapy against
599 tuberculosis in people living with HIV. WHO/TB/98.255. UNAIDS/98.34.
600 Geneva, Switzerland: WHO, 1998.
- 601 37. Samandari T, Agizew TB, Nyirenda S, et al. 6-month versus 36-month
602 isoniazid preventive treatment for tuberculosis in adults with HIV infection in
603 Botswana: a randomised, double-blind, placebo-controlled trial. *Lancet* 2011;
604 377: 1588 – 98.
- 605 38. Samandari T, Agizew T, Nyirenda S, et al. Tuberculosis incidence after 36
606 months' isoniazid prophylaxis in HIV-infected adults in Botswana: a posttrial
607 observational analysis. *AIDS* 2015; 29: 351 – 359.
- 608 39. Golub JE, Saraceni V, Cavalcante SC, et al. The impact of antiretroviral
609 therapy and isoniazid preventive therapy on tuberculosis incidence in HIV-
610 infected patients in Rio de Janeiro, Brazil. *AIDS* 2007; 21: 1441 – 1448.
- 611 40. Golub JE, Pronyk P, Mohapi L, et al. Isoniazid preventive therapy, HAART
612 and tuberculosis risk in HIV-infected adults in South Africa: a prospective
613 cohort. *AIDS* 2009; 23: 631 – 636.
- 614 41. Yirdaw KD, Jerene D, Gashu Z, et al. Beneficial effect of isoniazid preventive
615 therapy and antiretroviral therapy on the incidence of tuberculosis in people
616 living with HIV in Ethiopia. *PLoS ONE* 2014; 9: e104557.

- 617 42. Rangaka MX, Wilkinson RJ, Boulle A, et al. Isoniazid plus antiretroviral
618 therapy to prevent tuberculosis: a randomised double-blind, placebo-controlled
619 trial. *Lancet* 2014; 384: 682 – 690.
- 620 43. Badje A, Moh R, Gabillard D, et al. Effect of isoniazid preventive therapy on
621 risk of death in west African, HIV-infected adults with high CD4 cell counts:
622 long-term follow-up of the TEMPRANO ANRS 12136 trial. *Lancet Glob*
623 *Health* 2017; 5: e1080-1089.
- 624 44. Charalambous S, Grant AD, Innes C, et al. Association of isoniazid preventive
625 therapy with lower early mortality in individuals on antiretroviral therapy in a
626 workplace programme. *AIDS* 2010; 24 (suppl 5): S5 – S13.
- 627 45. Durovni B, Saraceni V, Moulton LH, et al. Effect of improved tuberculosis
628 screening and isoniazid preventive therapy on incidence of tuberculosis and
629 death in patients with HIV in clinics in Rio de Janeiro, Brazil: a stepped
630 wedge, cluster-randomised trial. *Lancet Infect Dis* 2013; 13: 852-858.
- 631 46. U.S. Department of Health and Human Services. Guidelines for the prevention
632 and treatment of opportunistic infections in HIV-infected adults and
633 adolescents. *Mycobacterium tuberculosis infection and disease*. September
634 2017. Available: [https://aidsinfo.nih.gov/guidelines/html/4/adult-and-](https://aidsinfo.nih.gov/guidelines/html/4/adult-and-adolescent-oi-prevention-and-treatment-guidelines/325/tb)
635 [adolescent-oi-prevention-and-treatment-guidelines/325/tb](https://aidsinfo.nih.gov/guidelines/html/4/adult-and-adolescent-oi-prevention-and-treatment-guidelines/325/tb) (accessed 27th June
636 2018).
- 637 47. Zar HJ, Cotton MF, Strauss S, et al. Effect of isoniazid prophylaxis on
638 mortality and incidence of tuberculosis in children with HIV: randomised
639 controlled trial. *BMJ* 2007; 334: 136-139.
- 640 48. Charan J, Goyal JP, Reljic T, Emmanuel P, Patel A, Kumar A. Isoniazid for
641 the prevention of tuberculosis in HIV-infected children: a systematic review

- 642 and meta-analysis. *Pediatr Infect Dis* 2017; Dec 26: doi: 10.1097/INF.
643 0000000000001879.
- 644 49. Zunza M, Gray DM, Young T, Cotton M, Zar HJ. Isoniazid for preventing
645 tuberculosis in HIV-infected children. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev* 2017; 8:
646 CD006418.
- 647 50. World Health Organization. Guidance for National Tuberculosis Programmes
648 on the management of tuberculosis in children – Second edition. 2014. WHO,
649 Geneva, Switzerland. WHO/HTM/TB/2014.03.
- 650 51. Houben RM, Dodd PJ. The global burden of latent tuberculosis infection: a re-
651 estimation using mathematical modelling. *PLoS Med* 2016; 13: e1002152.
- 652 52. Ferebee SH. Controlled chemoprophylaxis trials in tuberculosis. A general
653 review. *Adv Tuberc Res* 1970; 17: 28-106.
- 654 53. Den Boon S, Matteelli A, Ford N, Getahun H. Continuous isoniazid for the
655 treatment of latent tuberculosis infection in people living with HIV: a
656 systematic review and meta-analysis. *AIDS* 2016; 30: 797-801.
- 657 54. Van der Hiejden YF, Karim F, Mufamadi G, et al. Isoniazid-monoresistant
658 tuberculosis is associated with poorer treatment outcomes in Durban, South
659 Africa. *Int J Tuberc Lung Dis* 2017; 21: 670 – 676.
- 660 55. Balcells ME, Thomas SL, Godfrey-Faussett P, Grant AD. Isoniazid preventive
661 therapy and risk for resistant tuberculosis. *Emerg Infect Dis* 2006; 12: 744-
662 751.
- 663 56. SibandaT, Tedla Z, Nyirenda S et al. Anti-tuberculosis treatment outcomes in
664 HIV-infected adults exposed to isoniazid preventive therapy in Botswana. *Int J*
665 *Tuberc Lung Dis* 2013; 17:178-185.

- 666 57. Menzies HJ, Moalosi G, Anisimova V et al. Increase in anti-tuberculosis drug
 667 resistance in Botswana: results from the fourth National Drug Resistance
 668 Survey. *Int J Tuberc Lung Dis* 2014; 18: 1026-1033.
- 669 58. Harries AD, Zachariah R, Corbett EL, et al. The HIV-associated tuberculosis
 670 epidemic – when will we act? *Lancet* 2010; 375: 1906 – 1919.
- 671 59. World Health Organization. Xpert MTB/RIF assay for diagnosis of pulmonary
 672 and extra-pulmonary TB in adults and children. 2013. Policy update.
 673 WHO/HTM/TB/2013.16. WHO, Geneva, Switzerland.
- 674 60. Trébucq A, Enarson DA, Chiang CY, et al. Xpert® MTB/RIF for national
 675 tuberculosis programmes in low-income countries: when, where and how? *Int*
 676 *J Tuberc Lung Dis* 2011; 15: 1567-1072.
- 677 61. Samandari T, Bishai D, Lutejin M, et al. Costs and consequences of additional
 678 chest X-ray in a tuberculosis prevention program in Botswana. *Am J Respir*
 679 *Crit Care Med* 2011; 183: 1103-1111
- 680 62. World Health Organization. Chest radiography in tuberculosis detection. 2016.
 681 WHO, Geneva, Switzerland. WHO/HTM/TB/2016.20
- 682 63. Moh R, Badjé A, N'takpé J-B, et al. Screening for active tuberculosis before
 683 isoniazid preventive therapy among HIV-infected West African adults. *Int J*
 684 *Tuberc Lung Dis* 2017; 21: 1237–1244.
- 685 64. Van Lettow M, Akesson A, Martiniuk ALC, et al. Six-month mortality among
 686 HIV-infected adults presenting for antiretroviral therapy with unexplained
 687 weight loss, chronic fever or chronic diarrhea in Malawi. *PLoS ONE* 2012; 7:
 688 e48856.

- 689 65. Lawn SD, Wilkinson RJ, Lipman MC, Wood R. Immune reconstitution and
690 “unmasking” of tuberculosis during antiretroviral therapy. *Am J Respir Crit*
691 *Care Med* 2008; 177: 680-685.
- 692 66. Manabe YC, Breen RA, Perti T, Girardi E, Sterling TR. Unmasked
693 tuberculosis and tuberculosis immune reconstitution inflammatory disease: a
694 disease spectrum after highly active antiretroviral therapy initiation. *J Infect*
695 *Dis* 2009; 199: 437 – 444.
- 696 67. Landry J, Menzies D. Preventive chemotherapy. Where has it got us? Where
697 to go next? *Int J Tuberc Lung Dis* 2008; 12: 1352 – 1364.
- 698 68. Datiko DG, Yassin MA, Theobald SJ, Cuevas LE. A community-based
699 isoniazid preventive therapy for the prevention of childhood tuberculosis in
700 Ethiopia. *Int J Tuberc Lung Dis* 2017; 21: 1002-1007.
- 701 69. Aisu T, Raviglione MC, van Praag E, et al. Preventive chemotherapy for HIV-
702 associated tuberculosis in Uganda: an operational assessment at a voluntary
703 counselling and testing centre. *AIDS* 1995; 9: 267-273.
- 704 70. Ayele HT, van Mourik MSM, Bonten MJM et al. Predictors of adherence to
705 isoniazid preventive therapy in people living with HIV in Ethiopia. *Int J*
706 *Tuberc Lung Dis*. 2016; 20: 1342-1347.
- 707 71. Graham SM. *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* in young children post-2015: an
708 opportunity to close the policy-practice gap. *Exp Rev Resp Med* 2017; 11:
709 41-49.
- 710 72. Bliven-Sizemore EE, Sterling TR, Shang N, et al. Three months of weekly
711 rifapentine plus isoniazid is less hepatotoxic than nine months of daily
712 isoniazid for LTBI. *Int J Tuberc Lung Dis* 2015; 19: 1039-1044.

- 713 73. Sterling TR, Scott NA, Miro JM, et al. Three months of weekly rifapentine
714 plus isoniazid for treatment of *M. tuberculosis* infection in HIV Co-infected
715 persons. AIDS 2016; 30: 1607-1615.
- 716 74. McClintock AH, Eastment M, McKinney CM, et al. Treatment completion for
717 latent tuberculosis infection: a retrospective cohort study comparing 9 months
718 of isoniazid, 4 months of rifampin and 3 months of isoniazid and rifapentine.
719 BMC Infect Dis 2017; 17: 146.
- 720 75. Sandul AL, Nwana N, Holcombe JM, et al. High rate of treatment completion
721 in program settings with 12-dose weekly isoniazid and rifapentine (3HP) for
722 latent Mycobacterium tuberculosis infection. Clin Infect Dis 2017; 65: 1085-
723 1093.
- 724 76. Belknap R, Holland D, Feng PJ, et al. Self-administered versus directly
725 observed once-weekly isoniazid and rifapentine treatment of latent
726 tuberculosis infection: a randomized trial. Ann Intern Med 2017; 167: 689-
727 697.
- 728 77. Johnson KT, Churchyard GJ, Sohn H, Dowdy DW. Cost-effectiveness of
729 preventive therapy for tuberculosis with isoniazid and rifapentine versus
730 isoniazid alone in high-burden settings. Clin Infect Dis 2018; doi.org/
731 10.1093/cid/ciy230.
- 732 78. Swindells S, Ramchandani R, Gupta A, et al. One month of
733 rifapentine/isoniazid to prevent TB in people with HIV: BRIEF-TB/A5279.
734 Conference on Retroviruses and Opportunistic Infections, 4-7 March 2018;
735 Boston, MA, USA. [Abstract number 37LB].

- 736 79. World Health Organization. HIV Treatment. Transition to new antiretrovirals in
737 HIV programmes. July 2017. Policy Brief. WHO, Geneva, Switzerland.
738 WHO/HIV/2017.20.
- 739 80. World Health Organization. Recommendations for investigating contacts of
740 persons with infectious tuberculosis in low- and middle-income countries.
741 WHO, Geneva, Switzerland. 2012. WHO/HTM/TB/2012.9.
- 742 81. Bock NN, Jensen PA, Miller B, Nardell E. Tuberculous infection control in
743 resource-limited settings in the era of expanding HIV care and treatment. *J*
744 *Infect Dis* 2007; 196 (Suppl 1): S108-S113.
- 745 82. Dheda K, Gumbo T, Maartens G, et al. The epidemiology, pathogenesis,
746 transmission, diagnosis, and management of multidrug-resistant, extensively
747 drug-resistant, and incurable tuberculosis. *Lancet Respir Med* 2017; 5: 291 –
748 360.
- 749 83. Shah NS, Auld SC, Brust JCM, et al. Transmission of extensively drug-
750 resistant tuberculosis in South Africa. *N Eng J Med* 2017; 376: 243-253.
- 751 84. Isaakidis PI, Casas EC, Das M, Tseretopoulou X, Ntzeni EE, Ford N.
752 Treatment outcomes for HIV and MDR-TB co-infected adults and children:
753 systematic review and meta-analysis. *Int J Tuberc Lung Dis* 2015; 19: 969-
754 978.
- 755 85. Isaakidis PI, Das M, Kumar AMV, et al. Alarming levels of drug-resistant
756 tuberculosis in HIV-infected patients in metropolitan Mumbai, India. *PLoS ONE*
757 2014; 9: e110461.
- 758 86. World Health Organization. WHO policy on TB infection control in health
759 facilities, congregate settings and households. 2009. WHO, Geneva,
760 Switzerland. WHO/HTM/TB/2009.419.

- 761 87. Duarte R, Lonnroth K, Carvalho C, et al. Tuberculosis, social determinants
762 and co-morbidities (including HIV). *Pulmonol* 2018; 24: 115-119.
- 763 88. Chaisson RE, Golub JE. Preventing tuberculosis in people living with HIV – no
764 more excuses. *Lancet Global Health* 2017; 5: e1048-1049.
- 765
- 766

For Review Only

767 **Table 1:** Key ART intervention studies with direct implications for preventing TB

First Author / Study Name / Year of Publication	Type of study and country	Key findings
Suthar AB (2012) ¹⁷	Systematic review and meta-analysis Multiple countries	ART was associated with a 65% reduction in TB incidence across all baseline CD4 counts in PLHIV.
Grinsztejn B HPTN 052 (2014) ¹⁸	RCT Multiple countries	Early ART (started at median CD4 count of 442 cells per uL) was associated with a 51% reduction of TB compared with deferred ART (started at median CD4 count of 230 cells per uL).
Collins SE CIPRA HT-001 (2015) ¹⁹	RCT Haiti	Deferred ART (started at CD4 count < 200 cells /uL) was associated with higher TB risk (hazard ratio 2.41) compared with early ART (started between 200-350 cells per uL) during five years of follow-up.
The INSIGHT START Study Group (2015) ²⁰	RCT Multiple countries	Early ART start in asymptomatic HIV-positive patients with a CD4 count > 500 cells/μL was associated with a 57% reduction in any serious AIDS-related event (including TB), serious non-AIDS-related event or death from any cause compared with deferred ART (CD4 count < 350 cells per uL or the development of AIDS)
TEMPRANO ANRS 12136 Study Group (2015) ²¹	RCT Cote d'Ivoire	Early ART (CD4 count <800 cells per uL and no WHO criteria for starting ART) was associated with a 44% lower risk of death or severe HIV-related illness, including TB, compared with deferred ART (ART started according to WHO criteria), with IPT adding significantly to the individual benefit

768

769 *AIDS: acquired immunodeficiency syndrome; ART: antiretroviral therapy; IPT: isoniazid preventive*
770 *therapy; RCT: randomized controlled trial; PLHIV: people living with HIV; WHO: World Health*
771 *Organization*

772

773

774

775

776

777

778

779

780

781

782 **Table 2:** Key studies showing impact of IPT interventions in the pre-ART and ART era

First Author / Study Name / Year of Publication	Type of study and country	Key findings
IPT in the pre ART era		
Akolo C et al. / Cochrane Database Systematic Review (2010) ³⁵	Systematic review and meta-analysis Multiple countries	IPT given at a daily dose of 300 mg for 6 months reduced the overall risk of TB by 32%. Protective effect increased to 62% when targeted at those with a positive tuberculin skin test (TST), and was only 11% and not significant among those with a negative TST
IPT in the ART era (using both IPT and ART interventions)		
Golub JE / THRio (2007) ³⁹	Prospective cohort Brazil	Concurrent use of ART and IPT (for 6 months) showed 76% reduction in TB risk compared with no treatment
Golub JE (2009) ⁴⁰	Prospective cohort South Africa	Concurrent use of ART and IPT (for 6 months) showed 89% reduction in TB risk compared with no treatment
Samandari T (2011) ³⁷	RCT Botswana	Concurrent use of ART and IPT (for 6 months or 36 months) resulted in additive effects in reducing the risk of active TB
Yirdaw K. (2014) ⁴¹	Retrospective cohort Ethiopia	Concurrent use of ART and IPT (for 6 month either simultaneously or with IPT after ART) showed 65% and 78% reduction in TB risk compared with no treatment
Rangaka MX (2014) ⁴²	RCT South Africa	Concurrent use of ART and IPT (for 12 months) showed 37% reduction in risk of TB, irrespective of TST or IGRA
Charalambous S (2010) ⁴⁴	Prospective cohort South Africa	Concurrent use of ART and IPT (for 6 months) showed 49% reduction in risk of death after adjusting for key characteristics
Durovni B / THRio (2013) ⁴⁵	Stepped wedge, cluster-randomized trial Brazil	IPT for 6 months showed 31% reduction in risk of TB or death after adjusting for key characteristics and use of ART
The TEMPRANO ANRS 12136 Study Group (2015) ²¹	RCT Cote d'Ivoire	6-month IPT given in addition to ART resulted in a 35% reduction in HIV-related death or severe illness, of which 42% was due to TB, at whatever CD4 cell count the ART was started. Reduction in TB incidence in IPT-treated vs non IPT-treated patients was only significant among those with a positive IGRA test.
Badje A / TEMPRANO ANRS 12136 (2017) ⁴³	RCT long-term follow up Cote d'Ivoire	Concurrent use of ART and IPT (for 6 months) showed 37% reduction in risk of death after adjusting for early or deferred ART and other key characteristics

783

784 *ART: antiretroviral therapy; IGRA: interferon gamma release assay; IPT: isoniazid preventive*785 *therapy; RCT: randomized controlled trial; TST: tuberculin skin test*

786 **Table 3:** TB incidence rates per 100 person years for people living with HIV on ART alone or
787 on ART plus isoniazid preventive therapy (IPT)
788

First Author / Study Name / Year of Publication	Type of Study and Country	Key Findings: TB incidence rate per 100 person-years (95% CI)	
		ART alone	ART plus IPT
Golub JE / THRio (2007) ³⁹	Prospective cohort Brazil	1.9 (1.7-2.2)	0.8 (0.4-1.5)
Golub JE (2009) ⁴⁰	Prospective cohort South Africa	4.6 (3.4-6.2)	1.1 (0.02-7.6)
Yirdaw K. (2014) ⁴¹	Retrospective cohort Ethiopia	0.74 ^a	0.36 ^a
Rangaka MX (2014) ⁴²	RCT South Africa	3.6 (2.8 – 4.7)	2.3 (1.6-3.1)

789

790 ^a 95% Confidence intervals not provided
791 TB = tuberculosis; HIV = human immunodeficiency virus; ART = antiretroviral therapy; IPT =
792 isoniazid preventive therapy; 95% CI = 95% confidence intervals
793
794
795
796
797
798
799
800
801
802
803
804
805
806
807
808
809
810
811
812
813
814
815
816
817
818
819

820 **Table 4:** Issues to be considered by countries prior to the introduction of isoniazid preventive
 821 therapy alongside antiretroviral therapy as a national intervention policy

Question	Answer	Considerations, prerequisites and challenges
1 What benefit for PLHIV will be expected?	The benefit for PLHIV is expected to be highest in countries with the highest levels of TB transmission.	Estimates of TB incidence rates can be used to evaluate TB transmission levels. Level is considered to be high if TB incidence rate is greater than 150 and very high if greater than 300 per 100 000.⁶ In settings with high TB transmission, applying IPT to treat LTBI in PLHIV without prior screening is warranted.¹⁵ Screening with TST or IGRA* should be considered in lower TB transmission settings, but will necessitate considerable resources and organization. Provision of IPT to PLHIV who are contacts of patients with active TB and are not considered to have active TB is recommended without prior screening for LTBI whatever the level of TB transmission, particularly for HIV-infected child contacts of any age.^{15,80} Duration of IPT should be 36 months or lifelong in settings with very high TB transmission.
2 What impact will be expected at the community level?	The impact of a nationwide implementation of this preventive intervention is expected to be the highest in countries with highest TB burden associated with HIV. High impact may be expected only if intervention is of high quality	The burden of HIV-associated TB in the general population will depend on both TB incidence and HIV prevalence. It can be evaluated with the estimated HIV-positive TB incidence rate per 100,000.** It may be considered high if >30 and very high if >100 per 100,000. Because estimates of HIV-positive TB incidence rates are provided with a considerable uncertainty, the burden of HIV-associated TB can also be evaluated through the combination of the two following indicators: • TB notification rate per 100,000 (high if > 80 per 100 000); • HIV prevalence among TB patients (high if > 20%).
2 Are countries prepared?	Very few countries are currently implementing IPT to scale under field conditions. Countries with a high burden of HIV-associated TB are often low- and middle-income countries, not always prepared for IPT implementation. Engaging in implementation of nationwide IPT requires a good level of preparation to maximize the effectiveness and minimize the risks. Stepwise introduction may be considered. Additional resources will be needed. By no means should IPT implementation divert resources and staff from the priority activity of detection and treatment of TB patients.	High quality implementation requires: 1. <i>Political commitment</i> : national policy, effective collaboration between HIV and TB programs, social mobilization 2. <i>Capacity to screen for and rule out active TB disease</i> • Symptoms: clinical algorithm • Chest x-ray wherever possible • Sputum smear microscopy • Xpert MTB/RIF wherever possible • Waiting period (3 months on ART) before IPT initiation *** 3. <i>Robust and uninterrupted supply of isoniazid</i> 4. <i>Human resources</i> • In sufficient number (the capacity to carry out other clinical or public health tasks should not be decreased) • Trained to provide patient-centered care and follow-up • Adequately supervised 5. <i>Monitoring and evaluation of the intervention</i> • Simple standardized tools (registers and information system) • Real time data analysis activities • Consider technical assistance

822 *ART: antiretroviral therapy; IGRA: interferon gamma release assay; IPT: isoniazid preventive*
823 *therapy; LTBI: latent tuberculosis infection; TST: tuberculin skin test*

824 ** Supply and storage of tuberculin along with performance and interpretation of TST in PLHIV are*
825 *challenging, especially in the context of busy HIV clinics. The high price of IGRA and the need for*
826 *laboratory performance limit the capacity for it to be decentralized*
827

828 *** Estimates of TB incidence rate per 100,000 PLHIV are provided annually in the WHO Global TB*
829 *report.*

830 ****A waiting period of 3 months after ART initiation will allow the unmasking of TB from immune*
831 *reconstitution inflammatory disease during the first few months of ART. Close clinical surveillance of*
832 *the PLHIV should be conducted during this period in order to conduct all necessary examinations to*
833 *eliminate active TB and to ensure that they are stable and asymptomatic for the initiation of IPT.*

For Review Only