

Minerva Access is the Institutional Repository of The University of Melbourne

Author/s:

Pascoe, MC;Bailey, AP;Craike, M;Carter, T;Patten, RK;Stepto, NK;Parker, AG

Title:

Poor reporting of physical activity and exercise interventions in youth mental health trials: A brief report

Date:

2021-10-01

Citation:

Pascoe, M. C., Bailey, A. P., Craike, M., Carter, T., Patten, R. K., Stepto, N. K. & Parker, A. G. (2021). Poor reporting of physical activity and exercise interventions in youth mental health trials: A brief report. *Early Intervention in Psychiatry*, 15 (5), pp.1414-1422. <https://doi.org/10.1111/eip.13045>.

Persistent Link:

<https://hdl.handle.net/11343/252577>

License:

[CC BY](#)

BRIEF REPORT

WILEY

Poor reporting of physical activity and exercise interventions in youth mental health trials: A brief report

Michaela C. Pascoe^{1,2}  | Alan P. Bailey³ | Melinda Craike^{1,4} | Tim Carter⁵ |
Rhannon K. Patten¹ | Nigel K. Stepto¹ | Alexandra G. Parker^{1,3}

¹Institute for Health and Sport, Victoria University, Melbourne, Victoria, Australia

²Peter MacCallum Cancer Centre, Melbourne, Victoria, Australia

³Orygen, and Centre for Youth Mental Health, The University of Melbourne, Parkville, Victoria, Australia

⁴Mitchell Institute, Victoria University, Melbourne, Victoria, Australia

⁵Institute of Mental Health, School of Health Sciences, University of Nottingham, Nottingham, UK

Correspondence

Michaela C. Pascoe, Institute for Health and Sport, Victoria University, Melbourne VIC 3011, Australia.
Email: michaela.pascoe@vu.edu.au

Abstract

Aim: To describe the quality and completeness of the description and reporting of physical activity and exercise interventions delivered to young people to promote mental health or treat mental illness.

Methods: We conducted a series of scoping reviews identifying 64 controlled trials of physical activity and exercise interventions delivered to young people. We extracted: intervention characteristics, personnel and delivery format, the intensity, duration, frequency and type of physical activity or exercise.

Results: There was limited reporting of intervention details across studies; 52% did not provide information to confidently assess intervention intensity, 29% did not state who delivered the intervention, and 44% did not specify the intervention delivery format.

Conclusions: We recommend that authors adhere to the CONSORT reporting requirements and its intervention reporting extensions, (a) the Template for Intervention Description and Replication, (b) Consensus for Exercise Reporting Template and (c) as part of this, detail the frequency, intensity, time and type of physical activity recommendations and prescriptions. Without this, future trials are unable to replicate and extend previous work to support or disconfirm existing knowledge, leading to research waste and diminishing translation and implementation potential.

KEYWORDS

exercise, mental health, physical activity, reporting standards, youth

1 | INTRODUCTION

Youth mental disorders are a leading cause of morbidity and mortality in young people (Mokdad et al., 2016). Therefore, the promotion of mental health and the prevention of mental health disorders are paramount. Young people are often reluctant to seek help for mental health concerns, therefore interventions need to be youth-friendly, acceptable, feasible, non-stigmatizing (Rickwood, Deane, Wilson, &

Ciarrochi, 2005) and matched to their specific needs (McGorry, Goldstone, Parker, Rickwood, & Hickie, 2014). Access to effective interventions that are youth appropriate have the potential to rapidly improve the mental health and functioning of young people (McGorry et al., 2014). Physical activity/exercise is a non-stigmatizing intervention with few side-effects (Chu, Buckworth, Kirby, & Emery, 2009) and is viewed by young people as helpful in promoting mental health and treating mental health problems (Jorm & Wright, 2007). We

This is an open access article under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License, which permits use, distribution and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

© 2020 The Authors. *Early Intervention in Psychiatry* published by John Wiley & Sons Australia, Ltd.

recently conducted a series of scoping reviews (M. Pascoe et al., 2020; M. C. Pascoe et al., 2020a; M. C. Pascoe et al., Under Review) to examine the evidence for physical activity/exercise as a mental health promotion strategy and treatment approach for mental health disorders in young people (mean age 12-25.9 years). As part of this work, we extracted data from each included study for physical activity/exercise intensity and delivery format. Through this, we found a general paucity of clear specification and reporting of physical activity interventions for mental health promotion and treatment. The characteristics of descriptions and reporting are presented and discussed in the current brief report.

2 | METHODS

We conducted a series of three scoping reviews (M. Pascoe et al., 2020; M. C. Pascoe et al., 2020a; M. C. Pascoe et al., Under Review) in line with PRISMA-ScR guidelines (Tricco et al., 2018) and following the five stage framework outlined by Arksey and O'Malley (2005). To determine study eligibility, the following criteria were applied to the studies identified in the initial search: population mean age between 12 and 25.9 years; published from 1980 to 2017, included a physical activity or exercise intervention and a comparison or control condition; reported at least one mental health symptom outcome, such as depression symptoms (American College of Sports Medicine, 1998; Norton, Norton, & Sadgrove, 2010); study designs were randomized or non-randomized controlled trials and studies were published in English. Excluded studies were unpublished studies and non-intervention studies.

2.1 | Information sources

We conducted searches using 'Evidence Finder' (www.orygen.org.au), which is a comprehensive database of all available published controlled trials and systematic reviews of interventions in the youth mental health field (De Silva, Bailey, Parker, Montague, & Hetrick, 2018; Hetrick, Parker, Callahan, & Purcell, 2010). The searchable database is populated annually using comprehensive and systematic searches of the Embase, MEDLINE, PsycINFO and Cochrane Library databases, coupled with strict and reproducible inclusion criteria to identify studies. It includes research published from 1980 to 2017 and contains all available prevention, treatment and relapse-prevention studies in young people (mean age 6-25 years), across the following mental illnesses: anxiety, depression, bipolar, eating disorders, psychosis, substance use and suicide-self harm. It contains controlled trials (including randomized controlled trials and quasi-randomized studies), systematic reviews and meta-analyses, published in English. Unpublished trials are not included within the Evidence Finder. The following criteria were applied to the search engine (<https://www.orygen.org.au/Training/Evidence-Finder>): (a) mental health or substance use problem: 'all'; (b) stage of illness: 'all'; (c) treatment/intervention: 'complementary and alternative interventions', followed by 'Physical activity/exercise'; (d) publication date: 'all'.

Title/abstract and then full text screening were independently undertaken by at least two authors. Data charting (Arksey & O'Malley, 2005) was undertaken by a single author using a specifically designed extraction form and was checked by a second author. Reference lists of identified literature were searched for suitable primary research based on titles in the first instance, and if relevant abstracts and full text review.

Title/abstract screening was undertaken by two authors (Michaela C. Pascoe and Alan P. Bailey). Full texts were independently reviewed by two authors (Michaela C. Pascoe, Alan P. Bailey and Melinda Craike). There were no conflicts. Data charting (Arksey & O'Malley, 2005) was undertaken by a single author (Michaela C. Pascoe) using a specifically designed extraction form (Table 1) and extraction was checked by a second author (Tim Carter and Alan P. Bailey). Data were obtained directly and only from the published articles.

Two authors reviewed each study for objective (heart rates [HR], %maximal HR, %HR reserve, %1-repetition maximum, percent of maximal-oxygen-uptake [%VO_{2max}]) and subjective (ratings of perceived exertion) measures of exercise intensity, and classified intervention intensity for aerobic (Norton et al., 2010) and resistance exercise (Garber et al., 2011). Where interventions were poorly described, we attempted to estimate an exercise intensity based on the compendium of exercise energy expenditure (Ainsworth et al., 2000). A critical appraisal of individual sources of evidence was not conducted in the current scoping review.

3 | RESULTS

We identified a total of 64 controlled trials that investigated physical activity as a treatment for mental illness or mental health promotion strategy among young people. As shown in Table 1, we found a general paucity of reporting of the characteristics of the physical activity interventions. We found that only 31 (48%) provided sufficient information to accurately assess the intensity of the intervention with regards to objective (HR, %maximal HR, %HR reserve, %1-repetition maximum, %VO_{2max}) and subjective (ratings of perceived exertion) measures of exercise intensity (Garber et al., 2011; Norton et al., 2010). We were unable to determine the intervention intensity in 33 (52%) of the studies. Only 51 (80%) of studies stated the physical activity or exercise type (ie, aerobic/resistance and/or form, that is, yoga, tai chi).

The delivery format was also poorly described; 19 (29%) did not state who delivered the intervention; 28 (44%) did not specify if the intervention was delivered in a group or individual format; 9 (14%) did not report the intervention dose as defined by both duration and frequency.

4 | DISCUSSION

This report highlights an important limitation in the literature and a need for better specification and clearer reporting of physical activity interventions for mental health promotion and treatment for youth.

TABLE 1 Reporting of the characteristics of the physical activity interventions

Study	Was the physical activity or exercise intensity reported?	Was the physical activity or exercise type (ie, aerobic/ resistance and/or form, ie, yoga, taichi) adequately reported?	Was the personnel delivering intervention reported?	Was it stated if the intervention was delivered in an Individual or group format?	Was dosage (both duration and frequency) reported?
Aras and Ewert (2016)	×	✓	✓	×	✓
Baghurst and Kelley (2014)	×	×	✓	✓	✓
Balchin, Linde, Blackhurst, Rauch, and Schonbachler (2016)	✓	✓	×	×	✓
Balkin, Tietjen-Smith, Caldwell, and Shen (2007)	×	✓	×	×	×
Bao and Jin (2015)	×	✓	✓	✓	✓
Bartholomew (1999)	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Berger, Friedmann, and Eaton (1988)	✓	✓	×	✓	✓
Bonhauser et al. (2005)	×	×	✓	✓	✓
Broman-Fulks, Berman, Rabian, and Webster (2004)	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Broman-Fulks and Storey (2008)	✓	✓	✓	×	✓
Brown, Welsh, Labbe, Vitulli, and Kulkarni (1992)	×	×	×	×	Duration ns
Carei, Fyfe-Johnson, Breuner, and Brown (2010)	×	✓	✓	✓	✓
Carter et al. (2015)	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Cecchini-Estrada, Mendez-Gimenez, Cecchini, Moulton, and Rodriguez (2015)	×	×	✓	✓	✓
Curtis et al. (2016)	✓	✓	✓	✓	×
Daley, Copeland, Wright, Roalfe, and Wales (2006)	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
del Valle et al. (2010)	×	✓	✓	✓	✓
Fallon and Hausenblas (2005)	✓	✓	×	✓	✓
Focht, Koltyn, and Bouchard (2000)	✓	✓	×	×	✓
Gallego, Aguilar-Parra, Cangas, Langer, and Manas (2015)	×	×	✓	×	✓
Hemat-Far, Shahsavari, and Mousavi (2012)	✓	✓	✓	×	✓
M. P. Herring, Jacob, Suveg, Dishman, and O'Connor (2011); Matthew P. Herring, Jacob, Suveg, and O'Connor (2011)	✓	✓	✓	×	✓
Hilyer et al. (1982)	×	✓	✓	✓	✓
Hopkins (2012)	×	✓	×	×	✓
Hughes et al. (2013)	✓	✓	✓	×	✓
Jeong et al. (2005)	×	✓	×	×	✓
Julian (2012)	✓	✓	×	×	✓
Khalsa, Hickey-Schultz, Cohen, Steiner, and Cope (2012)	×	×	✓	✓	✓
Khorvash (2012)	×	✓	×	×	✓
Lindheimer, O'Connor, McCully, and Dishman (2017)	✓	✓	×	×	✓

(Continues)

TABLE 1 (Continued)

Study	Was the physical activity or exercise intensity reported?	Was the physical activity or exercise type (ie, aerobic/ resistance and/or form, ie, yoga, taichi) adequately reported?	Was the personnel delivering intervention reported?	Was it stated if the intervention was delivered in an Individual or group format?	Was dosage (both duration and frequency) reported?
Loh, Abdullah, Abu Bakar, Thambu, and Nik Jaafar (2015)	×	✓	✓	✓	✓
MacMahon and Gross (1988)	×	×	✓	✓	✓
Mason and Asmundson (2018)	✓	✓	✓	×	✓
Medina et al. (2014); J. A. Smits et al. (2008)	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Melnyk et al. (2009)	×	×	×	✓	✓
Melnyk et al. (2013)	×	×	✓	✓	Duration ns
Mothes et al. (2017)	✓	✓	✓	×	✓
Nabkasorn et al. (2006)	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Noggle, Steiner, Minami, and Khalsa (2012)	×	×	✓	✓	✓
Noorbakhsh and Alijani (2013)	×	✓	×	×	✓
Norris, Carroll, and Cochrane (1992)	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
O'Dougherty, Hearst, Syed, Kurzer, and Schmitz (2012)	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Olson, Brush, Ehmann, and Alderman (2017)	✓	✓	✓	×	✓
Parker et al. (2016)	×	×	✓	✓	✓
Robledo-Colonia (2012)	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Roshan, Pourasghar, and Mohammadian (2011)	✓	✓	×	×	Duration ns
Roth and Holmes (1987)	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Roth (1989)	✓	✓	✓	×	✓
Roth, Bachtler, and Fillingim (1990)	×	✓	×	✓	✓
Rotheram-Borus et al. (2016)	×	✓	✓	✓	Duration ns
Sabourin, Watt, Krigolson, and Stewart (2016)	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Sadeghi et al. (2016)	×	✓	✓	×	Frequency ns
Smith, Greer, Sheets, and Watson (2011)	×	✓	✓	✓	✓
J. A. J. Smits, Meuret, Zvolensky, Rosenfield, and Seidel (2009)	✓	✓	×	×	✓
Sundgot-Borgen, Rosenvinge, Bahr, and Schneider (2002)	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Taspinar, Aslan, Agbuga, and Taspinar (2014)	×	✓	✓	×	✓
Ventura et al. (2013)	×	×	×	×	✓
Weinstock, Capizzi, Weber, Pescatello, and Petry (2014)	✓	✓	✓	×	✓
Weinstock, Petry, Pescatello, and Henderson (2016)	×	✓	✓	✓	Frequency ns
Wipfli (2011)	×	✓	✓	×	✓
Woolery, Myers, Sternlieb, and Zeltzer (2004)	×	✓	✓	✓	✓

TABLE 1 (Continued)

Study	Was the physical activity or exercise intensity reported?	Was the physical activity or exercise type (ie, aerobic/ resistance and/or form, ie, yoga, taichi) adequately reported?	Was the personnel delivering intervention reported?	Was it stated if the intervention was delivered in an Individual or group format?	Was dosage (both duration and frequency) reported?
Wunram et al. (2018)	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Yang, Zhai, Gao, and Zhang (2015)	×	×	×	✓	✓
Yavari (2008)	×	✓	×	×	Duration ns

Notes: In two instances, two studies reported different outcomes from the same trial in separate publications, and therefore we have combined them in our review (Medina et al., 2014; J. A. Smits et al., 2008) and (Herring, Jacob, Suveg, Dishman, and O'Connor (2011); Matthew P. Herring, Jacob, Suveg, and O'Connor (2011).

Abbreviations: ×, not reported; ✓, reported; ns, not stated.

Many existing studies have failed to specify intervention intensity and delivery format. This has limited the interpretation and application of the evidence base for physical activity/exercise as a treatment for mental illness or mental health promotion strategy. It is clear from our scoping reviews, and previous research, that a variety of modalities and intensities may produce positive effects, and that factors such as delivery in group or individual formats may potentially explain some of the positive effects seen in physical activity/exercise interventions. However, due to poor reporting, it remains unclear if the intensity and the type of activity are important for mental health benefits. Therefore, although different intensities and different physical activity/exercise modalities may produce different effects on mental health outcomes, current poor reporting likely hinders efforts to identify which of these components, if any, are driving change. Better reporting in future studies will shed light on the role each plays on mental health outcomes and facilitate implementation in practice.

Whether the type and intensity of the physical activity engaged in is prescribed or self-selected also should be specified. Autonomy is proposed as one of three basic psychological needs fundamental to positive mental health (Craft, Perna, Freund, & Culpepper, 2008; Ryan & Deci, 2000) and participants experience a greater psychological tolerance to higher intensity physical activity when intensity is self-selected, rather than imposed (Ekkekakis, Parfitt, & Petruzzello, 2011). The environment in which the intervention is delivered should also be clearly stated, given that there is evidence indicating that physical activity undertaken in natural environments may have a more positive mental health benefit compared to physical activity undertaken indoors (Coon et al., 2011). Finally, it is important to report who delivered the intervention, as our scoping reviews show that this varies greatly between studies and can include exercise physiologists, personal trainers, psychologists, researchers and school teachers (M. Pascoe et al., 2020; M. C. Pascoe et al., 2020a; M. C. Pascoe et al., Under Review). The person delivering the intervention may influence intervention fidelity, the cost of delivering the intervention, and external validity, or its potential to be delivered in practice.

4.1 | Reporting recommendations

We recommend that in addition to adhering to the minimum reporting requirements set out in the CONSORT statement (Moher et al., 2010; Schulz, Altman, Moher, & the CONSORT Group, 2010) that authors should follow its intervention reporting extensions, (a) the Template for Intervention Description and Replication (TIDieR) (T. Hoffmann et al., 2016) and (b) Consensus for Exercise Reporting Template (CERT) (Slade, Dionne, Underwood, & Buchbinder, 2016; Slade, Dionne, Underwood, Buchbinder, Beck, et al., 2016). We recommend trialists adhere to these established standards. As part of this reporting, we recommend that future studies better specify their intended intervention characteristics and delivery format, ensuring clear statements that detail the frequency, intensity, time and type (FITT) principles of physical activity recommendations and prescriptions. Studies should also measure and report participant engagement in intended physical activity/exercise and dose, ensuring that FITT principles are appropriately tracked and quantified using subjective and device-based measures (eg, perceived exertion, actigraphy, heart rate monitoring).

We also acknowledge that self-selected and therefore variable physical activity interventions, as well as behaviour change interventions aimed to increase physical activity and exercise, may be unable to meet the recommended reporting requirements. Most of the current recommendations apply to prescribed exercise/physical activity interventions, however, self-selected variable physical activity interventions, as well as behaviour change interventions, could still measure changes in engagement in physical activity levels and report on this as an outcome (objective and subjective measures of physical activity).

Although this guidance is not new, poor intervention reporting has important implications for the field today and into the future (Glasziou et al., 2014; Glasziou, Meats, Heneghan, & Shepperd, 2008; T. C. Hoffmann, Erueti, & Glasziou, 2013). First, poor reporting hinders the identification of core components from potentially effective interventions, while preventing the comparison of components across

trials to identify 'best bets' for implementation (Glasziou et al., 2008). Poor reporting prevents replication and delays progress in the research field as replication of previous work is important to confirm or reject existing knowledge and is the building block to extending current knowledge by adding, subtracting and integrating new components in subsequent trials (T. C. Hoffmann et al., 2013). Poor reporting creates research waste either through inadequate trial replication and extension, or through lost opportunity to implement findings into practice (Glasziou et al., 2014; T. C. Hoffmann et al., 2013). Finally, poor reporting ultimately creates an implementation gap as practitioners and the young people they serve are unable to take timely advantage of potentially effective interventions (Deenik et al., 2019; T. C. Hoffmann et al., 2013).

The method of delivery also needs to be better reported, including detailed information regarding who delivered the intervention and their level of training, the environment in which the intervention was delivered, if the interventions were self-selected based on preference or prescribed, and delivered individually or in groups. Improved reporting of physical activity/exercise interventions could shed light on whether minimum dosages are required to improve mental health outcomes in young people, or whether interventions promoting messaging such as 'move more, sit less' and 'more is probably better' are sufficient (Teychenne et al., 2020). This will directly benefit both clinical prescriptions of physical activity/exercise and public health guidelines for mental health.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We would like to acknowledge our recently deceased co-author, Professor Nigel Stepto, who made a significant contribution to this work and to the field of physical activity, exercise and wellbeing, more generally. He will be remembered warmly.

AUTHOR CONTRIBUTIONS

Michaela Pascoe, Alex Parker, Melinda Craike conducted the literature search; Michaela Pascoe designed the figures and tables; all authors contributed to study design; Michaela Pascoe, Alex Parker, Alan Bailey, Nigel Stepto, Rhiannon Patten, Timothy Carter contributed to data collection; Michaela Pascoe, Alex Parker, Alan Bailey, Nigel Stepto, Rhiannon Patten, Timothy Carter contributed to data analysis and data interpretation; All authors contributed to writing and reviewing the manuscript. [Correction added on 28 September 2020, after first online publication: The author contributions section has been corrected.]

DATA AVAILABILITY STATEMENT

The data that support the findings of this study are available from the corresponding author upon reasonable request.

ORCID

Michaela C. Pascoe  <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-3831-5660>

REFERENCES

Ainsworth, B. E., Haskell, W. L., Whitt, M. C., Irwin, M. L., Swartz, A. M., Strath, S. J., ... Leon, A. S. (2000). Compendium of physical activities:

- An update of activity codes and MET intensities. *Medicine and Science in Sports and Exercise*, 32, 498–504.
- American College of Sports Medicine. (1998). American College of Sports Medicine Position Stand. The recommended quantity and quality of exercise for developing and maintaining cardiorespiratory and muscular fitness, and flexibility in healthy adults. *Medicine and Science in Sports and Exercise*, 30(6), 975–991.
- Aras, D., & Ewert, A. W. (2016). The effects of eight weeks sport rock climbing training on anxiety. *Acta Medica Mediterranea*, 32(1), 223–230.
- Arksey, H., & O'Malley, L. (2005). Scoping studies: Towards a methodological framework. *International Journal of Social Research Methodology*, 8(1), 19–32. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1364557032000119616>
- Baghurst, T., & Kelley, B. C. (2014). An examination of stress in college students over the course of a semester. *Health Promotion Practice*, 15(3), 438–447. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1524839913510316>
- Balchin, R., Linde, J., Blackhurst, D., Rauch, H. L., & Schonbachler, G. (2016). Sweating away depression? The impact of intensive exercise on depression. *Journal of Affective Disorders*, 200, 218–221. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jad.2016.04.030>
- Balkin, R. S., Tietjen-Smith, T., Caldwell, C., & Shen, Y.-P. (2007). The utilization of exercise to decrease depressive symptoms in young adult women. *Adultspan Journal*, 6(1), 30–35. <https://doi.org/10.1002/j.2161-0029.2007.tb00027.x>
- Bao, X., & Jin, K. (2015). The beneficial effect of tai chi on self-concept in adolescents. *International Journal of Psychology*, 50(2), 101–105. <https://doi.org/10.1002/ijop.12066>
- Bartholomew, J. B. (1999). The effect of resistance exercise on manipulated preexercise mood states for male exercisers. *Journal of Sport & Exercise Psychology*, 21(1), 39–51. <https://doi.org/10.1123/jsep.21.1.39>
- Berger, B. G., Friedmann, E., & Eaton, M. (1988). Comparison of jogging, the relaxation response, and group-interaction for stress reduction. *Journal of Sport & Exercise Psychology*, 10(4), 431–447. <https://doi.org/10.1123/jsep.10.4.431>
- Bonhauser, M., Fernandez, G., Puschel, K., Yanez, F., Montero, J., Thompson, B., & Coronado, G. (2005). Improving physical fitness and emotional well-being in adolescents of low socioeconomic status in Chile: Results of a school-based controlled trial. *Health Promotion International*, 20(2), 113–122. <https://doi.org/10.1093/heapro/dah603>
- Broman-Fulks, J. J., Berman, M. E., Rabian, B. A., & Webster, M. J. (2004). Effects of aerobic exercise on anxiety sensitivity. *Behaviour Research and Therapy*, 42(2), 125–136. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0005-7967\(03\)00103-7](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0005-7967(03)00103-7)
- Broman-Fulks, J. J., & Storey, K. M. (2008). Evaluation of a brief aerobic exercise intervention for high anxiety sensitivity. *Anxiety, Stress, and Coping*, 21(2), 117–128.
- Brown, S. W., Welsh, M. C., Labbe, E. E., Vitulli, W. F., & Kulkarni, P. (1992). Aerobic exercise in the psychological treatment of adolescents. *Perceptual and Motor Skills*, 74(2), 555–560. <https://doi.org/10.2466/pms.1992.74.2.555>
- Carei, T. R., Fyfe-Johnson, A. L., Breuner, C. C., & Brown, M. A. (2010). Randomized controlled clinical trial of yoga in the treatment of eating disorders. *The Journal of Adolescent Health*, 46(4), 346–351. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jadohealth.2009.08.007>
- Carter, T., Guo, B., Turner, D., Morres, I., Khalil, E., Brighton, E., ... Callaghan, P. (2015). Preferred intensity exercise for adolescents receiving treatment for depression: A pragmatic randomised controlled trial. *BMC Psychiatry*, 15, 247.
- Cecchini-Estrada, J. A., Mendez-Gimenez, A., Cecchini, C., Moulton, M., & Rodriguez, C. (2015). Exercise and Epstein's TARGET for treatment of depressive symptoms: A randomized study. *International Journal of Clinical and Health Psychology*, 15(3), 191–199. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijchp.2015.05.001>
- Chu, I. H., Buckworth, J., Kirby, T. E., & Emery, C. F. (2009). Effect of exercise intensity on depressive symptom in women. *Mental Health and Physical Activity*, 2, 37–43.

- Coon, J. T., Boddy, K., Stein, K., Whear, R., Barton, J., & Depledge, M. (2011). Does participating in physical activity in outdoor natural environments have a greater effect on physical and mental wellbeing than physical activity indoors? A systematic review. *Journal of Epidemiology and Community Health*, 65, A38–A38. <https://doi.org/10.1136/jech.2011.143586.85>
- Craft, L. L., Perna, F. M., Freund, K. M., & Culpepper, L. (2008). Psychosocial correlates of exercise in women with self-reported depressive symptoms. *Journal of Physical Activity and Health*, 5, 469–480.
- Curtis, J., Watkins, A., Rosenbaum, S., Teasdale, S., Kalucy, M., Samaras, K., & Ward, P. B. (2016). Evaluating an individualized lifestyle and life skills intervention to prevent antipsychotic-induced weight gain in first-episode psychosis. *Early Intervention in Psychiatry*, 10(3), 267–276. <https://doi.org/10.1111/eip.12230>
- Daley, A. J., Copeland, R. J., Wright, N. P., Roalfe, A., & Wales, J. K. H. (2006). Exercise therapy as a treatment for psychopathologic conditions in obese and morbidly obese adolescents: A randomized, controlled trial. *Pediatrics*, 118(5), 2126–2134. <https://doi.org/10.1542/peds.2006-1285>
- De Silva, S., Bailey, A. P., Parker, A. G., Montague, A. E., & Hetrick, S. E. (2018). Open-access evidence database of controlled trials and systematic reviews in youth mental health. *Early Intervention in Psychiatry*, 12(3), 474–477. <https://doi.org/10.1111/eip.12423>
- Deenik, J., Czosnek, L., Teasdale, S. B., Stubbs, B., Firth, J., Schuch, F. B., ... Lederman, O. (2019). From impact factors to real impact: Translating evidence on lifestyle interventions into routine mental health care. *Translational Behavioral Medicine*, 1–3.
- del Valle, M. F., Perez, M., Santana-Sosa, E., Fiuza-Luces, C., Bustamante-Ara, N., Gallardo, C., ... Lucia, A. (2010). Does resistance training improve the functional capacity and well being of very young anorexic patients? A randomized controlled trial. *The Journal of Adolescent Health*, 46(4), 352–358. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jadohealth.2009.09.001>
- Ekkekakis, P., Parfitt, G., & Petruzzello, S. J. (2011). The pleasure and displeasure people feel when they exercise at different intensities: decennial update and progress towards a tripartite rationale for exercise intensity prescription. *Sports Medicine*, 41(8), 641–671. <https://doi.org/10.2165/11590680-000000000-00000>
- Fallon, E. A., & Hausenblas, H. A. (2005). Media images of the "ideal" female body: Can acute exercise moderate their psychological impact? *Body Image*, 2(1), 62–73. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.bodyim.2004.12.001>
- Focht, B. C., Koltyn, K. F., & Bouchard, L. J. (2000). State anxiety and blood pressure responses following different resistance exercise sessions. *International Journal of Sport Psychology*, 31(3), 376–390.
- Gallego, J., Aguilar-Parra, J. M., Cangas, A. J., Langer, A. I., & Manas, I. (2015). Effect of a mindfulness program on stress, anxiety and depression in university students. *The Spanish Journal of Psychology*, 17, E109. <https://doi.org/10.1017/sjp.2014.102>
- Garber, C. E., Blissmer, B., Deschenes, M. R., Franklin, B. A., Lamonte, M. J., Lee, I. M., ... American College of Sports Medicine. (2011). American College of Sports Medicine position stand. Quantity and quality of exercise for developing and maintaining cardiorespiratory, musculoskeletal, and neuromotor fitness in apparently healthy adults: Guidance for prescribing exercise. *Medicine and Science in Sports and Exercise*, 43(7), 1334–1359. <https://doi.org/10.1249/MSS.0b013e318213feff>
- Glasziou, P., Altman, D. G., Bossuyt, P., Boutron, I., Clarke, M., Julious, S., ... Wager, E. (2014). Reducing waste from incomplete or unusable reports of biomedical research. *The Lancet*, 383(9913), 267–276.
- Glasziou, P., Meats, E., Heneghan, C., & Shepperd, S. (2008). What is missing from descriptions of treatment in trials and reviews? *BMJ*, 336(7659), 1472–1474.
- Hemat-Far, A., Shahsavari, A., & Mousavi, S. R. (2012). Effects of selected aerobic exercises on the depression and concentrations of plasma serotonin in the depressed female students aged 18 to 25. *Journal of Applied Research*, 12(1), 47–52.
- Herring, M. P., Jacob, M. L., Suveg, C., Dishman, R. K., & O'Connor, P. J. (2011). Feasibility of exercise training for the short-term treatment of generalized anxiety disorder: A randomized controlled trial. *Psychotherapy & Psychosomatics*, 81(1), 21–28. <https://doi.org/10.1159/000327898>
- Herring, M. P., Jacob, M. L., Suveg, C., & O'Connor, P. J. (2011). Effects of short-term exercise training on signs and symptoms of generalized anxiety disorder. *Mental Health and Physical Activity*, 4(2), 71–77. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.mhpa.2011.07.002>
- Hetrick, S. E., Parker, A. G., Callahan, P., & Purcell, R. (2010). Evidence mapping: Illustrating an emerging methodology to improve evidence-based practice in youth mental health. *Journal of Evaluation in Clinical Practice*, 16(6), 1025–1030. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2753.2008.01112.x>
- Hilyer, J. C., Wilson, D. G., Dillon, C., Caro, L., Jenkins, C., Spencer, W. A., ... Booker, W. (1982). Physical-fitness training and counseling as treatment for youthful offenders. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, 29(3), 292–303. <https://doi.org/10.1037//0022-0167.29.3.292>
- Hoffmann, T., Glasziou, P., Boutron, I., Milne, R., Perera, R., Moher, D., ... Johnston, M. (2016). Better reporting of interventions: Template for intervention description and replication (TIDieR) checklist and guide. *Gesundheitswesen*, 78(3), 175–188.
- Hoffmann, T. C., Eructi, C., & Glasziou, P. P. (2013). Poor description of non-pharmacological interventions: Analysis of consecutive sample of randomised trials. *BMJ*, 347, f3755.
- Hopkins, M. E., Davis, F. C., VanTieghem, M. R., Whalen, P. J., & Bucci, D. J. (2012). Differential effects of acute and regular physical exercise on cognition and affect. *Neuroscience*, 215, 59–68.
- Hughes, C. W., Barnes, S., Barnes, C., DeFina, L. E., Nakonezny, P., & Emslie, G. J. (2013). Depressed adolescents treated with exercise (DATE): A pilot randomized controlled trial to test feasibility and establish preliminary effect sizes. *Mental Health and Physical Activity*, 6(2), 119–131. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.mhpa.2013.06.006>
- Jeong, Y. J., Hong, S. C., Lee, M. S., Park, M. C., Kim, Y. K., & Suh, C. M. (2005). Dance movement therapy improves emotional responses and modulates neurohormones in adolescents with mild depression. *International Journal of Neuroscience*, 115(12), 1711–1720. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00207450590958574>
- Jorm, A. F., & Wright, A. (2007). Beliefs of young people and their parents about the effectiveness of interventions for mental disorders. *Australian and New Zealand Journal of Psychiatry*, 41, 656–666.
- Julian, K. B., Beard, C., Schmidt, N. B., Powers, M. B., & Smits, J. A. J. (2012). Attention training to reduce attention bias and social stressor reactivity: An attempt to replicate and extend previous findings. *Behaviour Research & Therapy*, 50(5), 350–358.
- Khalsa, S. B. S., Hickey-Schultz, L., Cohen, D., Steiner, N., & Cope, S. (2012). Evaluation of the mental health benefits of yoga in a secondary school: A preliminary randomized controlled trial. *Journal of Behavioral Health Services and Research*, 39(1), 80–90. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11414-011-9249-8>
- Khorvash, M. A., Askari, A., Rafiemanzelat, F., Botshekan, M., & Khorvash, F. (2012). An investigation on the effect of strength and endurance training on depression, anxiety, and C-reactive protein's inflammatory biomarker changes. *Journal of Research in Medical Sciences*, 17(11), 1072–1076.
- Lindheimer, J. B., O'Connor, P. J., McCully, K. K., & Dishman, R. K. (2017). The effect of light-intensity cycling on mood and working memory in response to a randomized, placebo-controlled design. *Psychosomatic Medicine*, 79(2), 243–253. <https://doi.org/10.1097/PSY.0000000000000381>
- Loh, S. Y., Abdullah, A., Abu Bakar, A. K., Thambu, M., & Nik Jaafar, N. R. (2015). Structured walking and chronic institutionalized schizophrenia inmates: A pilot RCT study on quality of life. *Global Journal of Health Science*, 8(1), 238–248. <https://doi.org/10.5539/gjhs.v8n1p238>

- MacMahon, J. R., & Gross, R. T. (1988). Physical and psychological effects of aerobic exercise in delinquent adolescent males. *American Journal of Diseases of Children*, 142(12), 1361–1366.
- Mason, J. E., & Asmundson, G. J. G. (2018). A single bout of either sprint interval training or moderate intensity continuous training reduces anxiety sensitivity: A randomized controlled trial. *Mental Health and Physical Activity*, 14, 103–112. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.mhpa.2018.02.006>
- McGorry, P. D., Goldstone, S., Parker, A. G., Rickwood, D., & Hickie, I. M. (2014). Cultures for mental health care of young people: An Australian blueprint for reform. *Lancet Psychiatry*, 1(7), 559–568.
- Medina, J. L., DeBoer, L. B., Davis, M. L., Rosenfield, D., Powers, M. B., Otto, M. W., & Smits, J. A. (2014). Gender moderates the effect of exercise on anxiety sensitivity. *Mental Health and Physical Activity*, 7(3), 147–151. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.mhpa.2014.08.002>
- Melnik, B. M., Jacobson, D., Kelly, S., Belyea, M., Shaibi, G., Small, L., ... Marsiglia, F. F. (2013). Promoting healthy lifestyles in high school adolescents: A randomized controlled trial. *American Journal of Preventive Medicine*, 45(4), 407–415. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.amepre.2013.05.013>
- Melnik, B. M., Jacobson, D., Kelly, S., O'Haver, J., Small, L., & Mays, M. Z. (2009). Improving the mental health, healthy lifestyle choices, and physical health of Hispanic adolescents: A randomized controlled pilot study. *The Journal of School Health*, 79(12), 575–584. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1746-1561.2009.00451.x>
- Moher, D., Hopewell, S., Schulz, K. F., Montori, V., Gotzsche, P. C., Devereaux, P. J., ... Consolidated Standards of Reporting Trials Group. (2010). CONSORT 2010 explanation and elaboration: Updated guidelines for reporting parallel group randomised trials. *Journal of Clinical Epidemiology*, 63(8), e1–e37. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclinepi.2010.03.004>
- Mokdad, A. H., Forouzanfar, M. H., Daoud, F., Mokdad, A. A., El Bcheraoui, C., Moradi-Lakeh, M., ... Cercy, K. (2016). Global burden of diseases, injuries, and risk factors for young people's health during 1990–2013: A systematic analysis for the Global Burden of Disease Study 2013. *The Lancet*, 387(10036), 2383–2401.
- Mothes, H., Leukel, C., Jo, H. G., Seelig, H., Schmidt, S., & Fuchs, R. (2017). Expectations affect psychological and neurophysiological benefits even after a single bout of exercise. *Journal of Behavioral Medicine*, 40(2), 293–306. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10865-016-9781-3>
- Nabkasorn, C., Miyai, N., Sootmongkol, A., Junprasert, S., Yamamoto, H., Arita, M., & Miyashita, K. (2006). Effects of physical exercise on depression, neuroendocrine stress hormones and physiological fitness in adolescent females with depressive symptoms. *European Journal of Public Health*, 16(2), 179–184.
- Noggle, J. J., Steiner, N. J., Minami, T., & Khalsa, S. B. S. (2012). Benefits of yoga for psychosocial well-being in a us high school curriculum: A preliminary randomized controlled trial. *Journal of Developmental and Behavioral Pediatrics*, 33(3), 193–201. <https://doi.org/10.1097/DBP.0b013e31824afdc4>
- Noorbakhsh, M., & Alijani, E. (2013). The effects of physical activity on the level of depression in university female students. *Annals of Biological Research*, 4(8), 196–200.
- Norris, R., Carroll, D., & Cochrane, R. (1992). The effects of physical activity and exercise training on psychological stress and well-being in an adolescent population. *Journal of Psychosomatic Research*, 36(1), 55–65.
- Norton, K., Norton, L., & Sadgrove, D. (2010). Position statement on physical activity and exercise intensity terminology. *Journal of Science and Medicine in Sport*, 13(5), 496–502. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jsams.2009.09.008>
- O'Dougherty, M., Hearst, M. O., Syed, M., Kurzer, M. S., & Schmitz, K. H. (2012). Life events, perceived stress and depressive symptoms in a physical activity intervention with young adult women. *Mental Health and Physical Activity*, 5(2), 148–154. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.mhpa.2012.05.001>
- Olson, R. L., Brush, C. J., Ehmann, P. J., & Alderman, B. L. (2017). A randomized trial of aerobic exercise on cognitive control in major depression. *Clinical Neurophysiology*, 128(6), 903–913. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.clinph.2017.01.023>
- Parker, A. G., Hetrick, S. E., Jorm, A. F., Mackinnon, A. J., McGorry, P. D., Yung, A. R., ... Purcell, R. (2016). The effectiveness of simple psychological and physical activity interventions for high prevalence mental health problems in young people: A factorial randomised controlled trial. *Journal of Affective Disorders*, 196, 200–209. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jad.2016.02.043>
- Pascoe, M., Bailey, A. P., Craike, M., Carter, T., Patten, R., Stepto, N., & Parker, A. (2020). Physical activity and exercise in youth mental health promotion: A scoping review. *BMJ Open Sport & Exercise Medicine*, 6(1), e000677. <https://doi.org/10.1136/bmjsem-2019-000677>
- Pascoe, M. C., Bailey, A. P., Craike, M., Carter, T., Patten, R., Stepto, N., & Parker, A. (2020a). Exercise interventions for mental disorders in young people: A scoping review. *BMJ Open Sport & Exercise Medicine*, 6(1), e000678.
- Pascoe, M. C., Bailey, A. P., Craike, M., Carter, T., Patten, R., Stepto, N., & Parker, A. (Under Review). Single session and short term exercise for mental wellbeing in tertiary students: A scoping review. *Frontiers In Psychiatry* Under review.
- Rickwood, D., Deane, F. P., Wilson, C. J., & Ciarrochi, J. (2005). Young people's help-seeking for mental health problems. *Australian e-Journal for the Advancement of Mental Health*, 4, 1–34.
- Robledo-Colonia, A. F., Sandoval-Restrepo, N., Mosquera-Valderrama, Y. F., Escobar-Hurtado, C., & Ramirez-Velez, R. (2012). Aerobic exercise training during pregnancy reduces depressive symptoms in nulliparous women: A randomised trial. *Journal of Physiotherapy*, 58(1), 9–15.
- Roshan, V. D., Pourasghar, M., & Mohammadian, Z. (2011). The efficacy of intermittent walking in water on the rate of MHPG sulfate and the severity of depression. *Iranian Journal of Psychiatry and Behavioural Science*, 5(2), 26–31.
- Roth, D. L. (1989). Acute emotional and psychophysiological effects of aerobic exercise. *Psychophysiology*, 26(5), 593–602.
- Roth, D. L., Bachtler, S. D., & Fillingim, R. B. (1990). Acute emotional and cardiovascular effects of stressful mental work during aerobic exercise. *Psychophysiology*, 27(6), 694–701.
- Roth, D. L., & Holmes, D. S. (1987). Influence of aerobic exercise training and relaxation training on physical and psychologic health following stressful life events. *Psychosomatic Medicine*, 49(4), 355–365.
- Rotheram-Borus, M. J., Tomlinson, M., Durkin, A., Baird, K., DeCelles, J., & Swendeman, D. (2016). Feasibility of using soccer and job training to prevent drug abuse and HIV. *AIDS and Behavior*, 20(9), 1841–1850. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10461-015-1262-0>
- Ryan, R. M., & Deci, E. L. (2000). Self-determination theory and the facilitation of intrinsic motivation, social development, and well-being. *American Psychologist*, 55(1), 68–78.
- Sabourin, B. C., Watt, M. C., Krigolson, O. E., & Stewart, S. H. (2016). Two interventions decrease anxiety sensitivity among high anxiety sensitive women: Could physical exercise be the key? *Journal of Cognitive Psychotherapy*, 30(2), 131–146. <https://doi.org/10.1891/0889-8391.30.2.131>
- Sadeghi, K., Ahmadi, S. M., Ahmadi, S. M., Rezaei, M., Miri, J., Abdi, A., ... Jamshidi, K. (2016). A comparative study of the efficacy of cognitive group therapy and aerobic exercise in the treatment of depression among the students. *Global Journal of Health Science*, 8(10), 54171. <https://doi.org/10.5539/gjhs.v8n10p1>
- Schulz, K. F., Altman, D. G., Moher, D., & the CONSORT Group. (2010). CONSORT 2010 statement: Updated guidelines for reporting parallel group randomised trials. *BMC Medicine*, 8, 18. <https://doi.org/10.1186/1741-7015-8-18>
- Slade, S. C., Dionne, C. E., Underwood, M., & Buchbinder, R. (2016). Consensus on exercise reporting template (CERT): Explanation and

- elaboration statement. *British Journal of Sports Medicine*, 50(23), 1428–1437.
- Slade, S. C., Dionne, C. E., Underwood, M., Buchbinder, R., Beck, B., Bennell, K., ... Cup, E. (2016). Consensus on exercise reporting template (CERT): Modified Delphi study. *Physical Therapy*, 96(10), 1514–1524.
- Smith, J. A., Greer, T., Sheets, T., & Watson, S. (2011). Is there more to yoga than exercise? *Alternative Therapies in Health and Medicine*, 17(3), 22–29.
- Smits, J. A., Berry, A. C., Rosenfield, D., Powers, M. B., Behar, E., & Otto, M. W. (2008). Reducing anxiety sensitivity with exercise. *Depression and Anxiety*, 25(8), 689–699. <https://doi.org/10.1002/da.20411>
- Smits, J. A. J., Meuret, A. E., Zvolensky, M. J., Rosenfield, D., & Seidel, A. (2009). The effects of acute exercise on CO₂ challenge reactivity. *Journal of Psychiatric Research*, 43(4), 446–454. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpsychires.2008.05.009>
- Sundgot-Borgen, J., Rosenvinge, J. H., Bahr, R., & Schneider, L. S. (2002). The effect of exercise, cognitive therapy, and nutritional counseling in treating bulimia nervosa. *Medicine and Science in Sports and Exercise*, 34(2), 190–195. <https://doi.org/10.1097/00005768-200202000-00002>
- Taspinar, B., Aslan, U. B., Agbuga, B., & Taspinar, F. (2014). A comparison of the effects of hatha yoga and resistance exercise on mental health and well-being in sedentary adults: A pilot study. *Complementary Therapies in Medicine*, 22(3), 433–440. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ctim.2014.03.007>
- Teychenne, M., White, R. L., Richards, J., Schuch, F. B., Rosenbaum, S., & Bennie, J. A. (2020). Do we need physical activity guidelines for mental health: What does the evidence tell us? *Mental Health and Physical Activity*, 18, 100315.
- Tricco, A. C., Lillie, E., Zarin, W., O'Brien, K. K., Colquhoun, H., Levac, D., ... Straus, S. E. (2018). PRISMA extension for scoping reviews (PRISMA-ScR): Checklist and explanation. *Annals of Internal Medicine*, 169(7), 467–473. <https://doi.org/10.7326/M18-0850>
- Ventura, J., Gretchen-Doorly, D., Subotnik, K. L., Vinogradov, S., Nahum, M., & Nuechterlein, K. H. (2013). *Combining cognitive training and exercise to improve cognition and functional outcomes in the early course of schizophrenia: A pilot study*. Paper presented at the Abstracts for the 14th International Congress on Schizophrenia Research (ICOSR). <https://doi.org/10.1093/schbul/sbt011>
- Weinstock, J., Capizzi, J., Weber, S. M., Pescatello, L. S., & Petry, N. M. (2014). Exercise as an intervention for sedentary hazardous drinking college students: A pilot study. *Mental Health and Physical Activity*, 7(1), 55–62. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.mhpa.2014.02.002>
- Weinstock, J., Petry, N. M., Pescatello, L. S., & Henderson, C. E. (2016). Sedentary college student drinkers can start exercising and reduce drinking after intervention. *Psychology of Addictive Behaviors*, 30(8), 791–801. <https://doi.org/10.1037/adb0000207>
- Wipfli, B., Landers, D., Nagoshi, C., & Ringenbach, S. (2011). An examination of serotonin and psychological variables in the relationship between exercise and mental health. *Scandinavian Journal of Medicine & Science in Sports*, 21(3), 474–481. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1600-0838.2009.01049.x>
- Woolery, A., Myers, H., Sternlieb, B., & Zeltzer, L. (2004). A yoga intervention for young adults with elevated symptoms of depression. *Alternative Therapies in Health and Medicine*, 10(2), 60–63.
- Wunram, H. L., Hamacher, S., Hellmich, M., Volk, M., Janicke, F., Reinhard, F., ... Fricke, O. (2018). Whole body vibration added to treatment as usual is effective in adolescents with depression: A partly randomized, three-armed clinical trial in inpatients. *European Child & Adolescent Psychiatry*, 27(5), 645–662. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00787-017-1071-2>
- Yang, W. L., Zhai, F., Gao, Y. M., & Zhang, Q. H. (2015). Collective rehabilitation training conducive to improve psychotherapy of college students with anxiety disorder. *International Journal of Clinical and Experimental Medicine*, 8(6), 9949–9954.
- Yavari, A. (2008). The effect of swimming in reduction of depression in university male students. *Research Journal of Biological Sciences*, 3(6), 543–545.

How to cite this article: Pascoe MC, Bailey AP, Craike M, et al. Poor reporting of physical activity and exercise interventions in youth mental health trials: A brief report. *Early Intervention in Psychiatry*. 2020;1–9. <https://doi.org/10.1111/eip.13045>