

Minerva Access is the Institutional Repository of The University of Melbourne

Author/s:

Dadvand, Babak

Title:

Participation on the margins: young people's citizenship experiences in schools

Date:

2017

Persistent Link:

<https://hdl.handle.net/11343/129684>

Terms and Conditions:

Terms and Conditions: Copyright in works deposited in Minerva Access is retained by the copyright owner. The work may not be altered without permission from the copyright owner. Readers may only download, print and save electronic copies of whole works for their own personal non-commercial use. Any use that exceeds these limits requires permission from the copyright owner. Attribution is essential when quoting or paraphrasing from these works.

| Table of revisions |                  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |  |
|--------------------|------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|
| Previous page no.  | Current page no. | Suggested changes                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | Response                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |  |
| Examiner 1         |                  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |  |
|                    |                  | In many respects this is an excellent dissertation, full of intelligent theorising and revealing empirical research. It is full of insight and I have learnt a lot from reading it. I hope it will eventually be published in some form. The difficulty is that, in its present state, there is a tension between the two, leading to an apparent lack of coherence. | ✓Supervisors disagree. As examiner acknowledges, this tension is resolved in chapter 8. However, supervisors agree with Examiner 1 that making some of the changes, additions and corrections suggested below in this table, will contribute to bring theory and data together in a more fluent way.                                                                                                                |  |
|                    |                  | In chapter 1, Examiner 1 makes a few suggestions for grammatical corrections.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓p3 para 2 rephrased to acknowledge that this is a necessary 'first' step in a transformative political project.</li> <li>✓p4 para 2 'with opportunity' was changed to 'the opportunity'</li> <li>✓p6 line 7 'as' was changed to 'an'</li> <li>✓p9 line 5 'abandon one's positionality altogether' was changed to 'abandon everything to one's own positionality'</li> </ul> |  |
| p. 24              | p. 24            | para 2 Neale etc., you might give a thought to poor distribution including the lack of economic resources and other 'capitals' in the young people's lives generally, but also the resources of the classroom (e.g. the way in which teachers have all the voice in normal classroom transactions).                                                                  | ✓This paragraph has been modified to acknowledge the importance that access to resources and fair distribution can have on young people's participation within various spaces such as schools and classrooms.                                                                                                                                                                                                       |  |
|                    |                  | In chapter 2, Examiner 1 makes a few suggestions for grammatical corrections.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓p30 line 7 'critiques' was changed to 'critiqued'</li> <li>✓p31 near end of para 2 'civics' was changed to 'civic'</li> <li>✓p36 para 2. Sentence 1 was modified to acknowledge that accounting for actual experiences is a 'first', but not sufficient, step in the study of (youth) citizenship.</li> </ul>                                                               |  |
| p. 45              | p. 46            | Yes, very important to focus on citizenship-as-practice, but there are dangers in focusing only on the young person's present – without considering futures, this is not educative.                                                                                                                                                                                  | ✓P46 paragraph1 was modified to acknowledge that 'citizenship as practice' is not only concerned with the present, but also future and who young people 'become' as citizens through their everyday experiences.                                                                                                                                                                                                    |  |
| p. 47              | p. 49            | Neoliberal. Very important section. Might be worth adding                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | ✓A section is added to the bottom of page 49 to                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |  |

|        |        |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |  |
|--------|--------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|
|        |        | that neoliberalism appears to give people agency i.e. to determine their own pathways, become entrepreneurs of themselves, etc. but in reality, only one mode of success is imaginable, and most are denied real opportunities for aspirations to become real.                                                                                        | address the limits of choice as a primarily economic notion in relation to schools and education.                                                                                                                                                                     |  |
| p. 53  | p. 53  | One the one hand...On the other hand... (words missing)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               | ✓Correction was made                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |  |
| p. 59  | p. 61  | I began to get confused about how a focus on the alternative provision would tell us about the experience in mainstream. Later (from p76), I began to see you were using this as a site for enquiring about how the excluded young people had experienced and thought about the mainstream. You should have signalled this early in the chapter.      | ✓Clarification is made early in this section as to why the alternative education program of LTM was used 'as a background' to study young people's experiences in the mainstream school.                                                                              |  |
| p.67   | p. 67  | 'otherwise known as autism'. Isn't the term normally applied to milder forms of autism?                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               | ✓The phrase 'otherwise known as autism' was removed to address the reviewer's comment                                                                                                                                                                                 |  |
| p.75   | p. 75  | line 8 facilitate (not -ed)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | ✓'Facilitated' was changed to 'facilitate'                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |  |
| p. 80  | p. 81  | last para. Does this mean other mainstream teachers too? Were the students invited to a feedback?                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | ✓Clarification has been made in the paragraph about the participants who were invited to attend the completion seminar.                                                                                                                                               |  |
| p. 99  | p. 99  | being ignored... I think you should acknowledge that this may be the result of the teacher trying to be fair to all, but then classes might be too big for students with complex lives / needs, or perhaps there is over-reliance on whole-class teaching.                                                                                            | ✓A section is added to address how teachers' attempts to cater for <i>all</i> students often leads to practices that fail to recognize the more complex needs and backgrounds of some students.                                                                       |  |
| p. 111 | p. 111 | At this point, I'm left wondering how you're going to pull this together. The dissertation began with a focus on citizenship, then the middle was about exclusive processes within the school. You've now promised you will draw a connection. I think you will need to include citizenship as future civic agency, as well as current participation. | ✓The last paragraph in chapter 5 was modified to highlight the implications of school practices on young people's political agency and civic identities not only at present, but also into future.                                                                    |  |
| p. 115 | NA     | Citation Wrigley etc (and a few later cases eg p128, 135) Within the text I'd either say X et al or X, Y and Z, not X, Y et al. Of course, if there are more than 3 authors, it has to be X et al. I've only come across A, B, C, D, E et al in a final reference list where there is a large number of co-authors.                                   | ✓The reason for this is because I have 2 references with the same first author: 1) Wrigley, Thomson, & Lingard, 2012; 2) Wrigley, Lingard, & Thomson, 2012. To distinguish between them upon second or further citations, the APA format X, Y, et al. (year) is used. |  |

|          |            |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |  |
|----------|------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|
| p. 121   | p. 122     | I think you're onto something important here in saying that a different kind of care operates due to neoliberal reform. Normally we read about an absence of care, a neglect of individuals etc. but you're suggesting it's a different kind – eg instrumentalist 'care' to boost the results. It would be worth expanding a little. (also later p159 where you need to illustrate this neoliberal 'care')                                                                                              | ✓ A paragraph is added to page 122 to explain how a disjuncture between the practices of care and the more complex needs of some young people leads to a breakdown in caring relationships. This paragraph also highlights the role that young people's dispositions play in reciprocating the school's care work |  |
| p. 144   | p. 144     | 'compared to their more privileged peers' As I said before, you need to consider whether there are issues which restrict participation even for more privileged students. Young people are offered assimilation rather than integration in schools. More advantaged students' voices are frequently not heard either, they simply have the social and cultural capitals and the motivation to conform.                                                                                                  | ✓ Further clarification has been made at the bottom of page 144 to address the point raised by the examiner. This section now acknowledges that there are limits to student voice even for so-called average students in mainstream schools.                                                                      |  |
| p. 146-7 | p. 146-147 | James' comments show an interest but without the capacity to articulate sufficiently. This is why knowledge and skills are also important for citizenship. I think your phrase 'a deep understanding' is overdoing it, on the evidence of this quote. There is a deep concern. I would argue that everyday citizenship is a prerequisite, but students also need participatory and engaging pedagogies of inquiry (e.g. real-life problem-solving). You could develop that here and again in chapter 8. | ✓ The phrase 'deep understanding' has been changed to 'serious concern' in order to avoid overdoing the evidence present in the quote from James.                                                                                                                                                                 |  |
| p. 172   | p. 172     | end of para 2. This is correct, but the macro-political (nation-state, global realities) is also important for these young people, otherwise you're denying them the knowledge to fight back.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | ✓ The wording of the paragraph has been changed and a footnote has been added to acknowledge that everyday geographies of schools and classrooms are 'one' of the several geographies that young people inhabit in their lives.                                                                                   |  |
| p. 174   | p. 175     | para 2. I think you need to consider the implications of excluding consideration of 'citizens of and for the future'. Surely that is important too, otherwise what you're advocating is not education. I'm not however arguing that this can be done through transmission approaches to 'civics-related                                                                                                                                                                                                 | ✓ This has been addressed by adding clarification that young people's citizenship has both a 'present' and 'future' component which are mutually inclusive and cannot be reduced to each other.                                                                                                                   |  |

|            |             |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |  |
|------------|-------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|
|            |             | knowledge, skills and competences’.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |  |
| p. 178     | pp. 178-179 | Needs a little more on the kinds of pedagogies which are being squeezed. The quote from Smyth and McInerney does something to assist here. Some good examples in the Wrigley, Thomson and Lingard book.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | ✓A paragraph is added that further explains how schools can better serve their communities by providing socially-just and inclusive education for their students. This has been done by consulting some of the references mentioned by the examiner.                                                                                                |  |
| Examiner 2 |             |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |  |
| p. 79      | p. 79       | <p>The vignettes of the 12 students were helpful to better understand their circumstances and therefore the findings chapters. They do, however, raise an ethical question. The detail provided could be seen to undermine confidentiality – not for outsiders but for people familiar with the school and these students, despite the use of pseudonyms. On page 79 Mr Dadvand indicates awareness of this issue, as he states that he “removed all the information that might lead to identifying them from my discussion” and also that he “advised the participants that complete anonymity was difficult due to the case-study nature of this research”.</p> <p>Suggested Elaboration:<br/>I recommend some more explicit discussion of this issue either immediately before the presentation of the vignettes, or in the paragraph on p.79 from which I have quoted above. The intent would be to acknowledge the complexity of confidentiality for ‘insiders’ and to offer some more detail about what kind of potentially identifying information was and was not removed, and why; and about how participants were advised about the limitations to confidentiality and how they responded to that. I envisage this would amount to a short paragraph.</p> | ✓A paragraph is added to the ‘Ethical Consideration’ section on page 79 explaining in more detail how the participants were advised about the complexities of confidentiality, especially for ‘insiders’. This paragraph also addresses how the participants were informed about the limitations to confidentiality and how they responded to that. |  |
|            |             | In Chapter 5, the synthesis of the data with spatial theories and with the work of Bourdieu was particularly well done. The discussion of exclusion formed a powerful juxtaposition to the discussion of belonging. Similarly,                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | ✓The necessary modifications are made to the relevant sections of chapter 5 to make more explicit the use of ethnographic data from participant observations in the LTM program. Snippets                                                                                                                                                           |  |

|  |  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |  |
|--|--|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|
|  |  | <p>the discussion of experiences of not belonging in the school versus belonging in LTM provided a vivid contrast. To my mind, for the latter more use could have been made of participant observation data, for example in relation to the role of physical space (belonging 'looks' different in the LTM hut compared to a mainstream school classroom) and in relation to rituals and routines (for example of a day organised around working and eating together versus through a timetable of subjects).</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | <p>from the day-to-day working of the program are added to give depth to the analyses of space and belonging, and how everyday rituals created thick spaces in the LTM program in contrast to the mainstream school.</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |  |
|  |  | <p>P. 12: "(e.g. M. Mills, Thomson, Mills, &amp; McGregor, 2016)."</p> <p>p.22: (R. Lister, 2007a).<br/>The whole thesis needs to be checked to remove such unnecessary initials.</p> <p>5<br/>I have read for content, not for editing, but did notice a few typographical that need correcting. It would be useful for Mr Dadvand to proofread the thesis one more time himself, since there may well be other errors I did not notice.</p> <p>p.4, para 2, line 8 – delete 'with'</p> <p>p.21, para 1, line 4 – replace 'is' with 'are'</p> <p>p.76, para 1, line 4 – replace 'contest' with 'consent' p.92, para1, line 5 – insert 'with', ie. 'talk with him much'. p.106, block quote, line 7 &amp; 9 – replace 'razer' with 'razor'</p> <p>p.109, para 2, line 1 – replace 'intuitions' with 'institutions'</p> <p>p.172, para 3, line 4 – replace 'Bourdeau' with 'Bourdieu' and also replace for this source &amp; the next one in the reference list</p> <p>p.211, Parsons reference – replace 'exlcusion' with 'exclusion'</p> | <p>✓The thesis has been thoroughly checked for references. The reason for using initials for some in-text citations is to distinguish between different authors with the same last name, for example Ruth Lister (R. Lister) and Michael Lister (M. Lister). This is an APA format.</p> <p>✓The thesis has been proof-read carefully for typological mistakes. All the typographical errors in the text and the bibliography that examiner 2 has pointed to have been corrected.</p> |  |